AN OBJECT THAT INCLUDES ALL: ART OF MUSIC AS A SYNTHOME

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO
GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
OF MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY

BY

NELI GAGUA

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR
THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
IN
THE DEPARTMENT OF PSYCHOLOGY

SEPTEMBER 2023
Approval of the thesis:

AN OBJECT THAT INCLUDES ALL: ART OF MUSIC AS A SINTHOME

submitted by NELI GAGUA in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
degree of Doctor of Philosophy of Psychology, the Graduate School of Social
Sciences of Middle East Technical University by,

Prof. Dr. Sadettin KİRAZCI
Dean
Graduate School of Social Sciences

Prof. Dr. Mine MISIRLISOY
Head of Department
Department of Psychology

Prof. Dr. Faruk GENÇÖZ
Supervisor
Department of Psychology

Examing Committee Members:

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Bahat ÖZ (Head of the Examining Committee)
Middle East Technical University
Department of Psychology

Prof. Dr. Faruk GENÇÖZ (Supervisor)
Middle East Technical University
Department of Psychology

Assist. Prof. Dr. Yağmur AR KARCI
TED University
Department of Psychology

Assist. Prof. Dr. Derya ÖZBEK ŞİMŞEK
Nevşehir Hacı Bektaş University
Department of Psychology

Assist. Prof. Dr. Ayşen MARAŞ
Muğla Sıtkı Koçman University
Department of Psychology
I hereby declare that all information in this document has been obtained and presented in accordance with academic rules and ethical conduct. I also declare that, as required by these rules and conduct, I have fully cited and referenced all material and results that are not original to this work.

Name, Last Name: Neli GAGUA

Signature:
**ABSTRACT**

AN OBJECT THAT INCLUDES ALL: ART OF MUSIC AS A SINTHOME

GAGUA, Neli

The Department of Psychology
Supervisor: Prof. Dr. Faruk GENÇÖZ

September 2023, 167 pages

The most fundamental factor in a subject’s structuration is the relationship between the subject and the Other. All of the psychic mechanisms of an individual, the mirror stage, language, defence mechanisms, identification, organization of partial drives, experiences of lack, and sinthome is structured via the fundamental relationship. In order to study this dynamic comprehensively, the narrative analyses of professional musicians, pianists and violinists who began their education at an early age were conducted. The reasons behind selecting this population are (1) music’s inherent nature of containing a language-like structure that is also rich in the imaginary aspect, (2) the voice being an invocatory drive, (3) music and the instrument being a condensed object and relationship between the teacher and the student being intense, and (4) inclusion of the experiences of the stage. These qualities are considered a suitable representation of the relationship between the subject and the Other with various mechanisms. At the end of the analysis that was conducted in alliance with Polkinghorne’s analysis of narratives, five main sections emerged: (1) They Were Always There, (2) Encounter, (3) That Precious Other, (4) The Dark Side / The Object That Takes It All, and (5) The Reward / The Object That Gives You All.
Keywords: Psychoanalysis, Music, Narrative Analysis, The Subject, The Other
ÖZ

HER ŞEYİ İÇEREN NESNE: BİR SİNTHOM OLARAK MÜZİK SANATI

GAGUA, Neli
Psikoloji Bölümü
Tez Yöneticisi: Prof. Dr. Faruk GENÇÖZ

Eylül 2023, 167 sayfa

Öznenin yapılanmasındaki en temel mevzu özne ile Başka arasındaki ilişkidir. Kişinin tüm psikik mekanizmaları, ayna evresi, dil, savunma mekanizmaları, özdeşleşme, kısmi dürtülerin düzenlenmesi, eksiği deneyimleme biçimleri ve sinthom; özne ve Başka arasındaki bu temel ilişki ile şekillenmektedir. Bu dinamiği kapsamlı bir şekilde çalışmak amacıyla küçük yaşta itibaren profesyonel müziğin doğası gereği dil gibi bir yapıya sahip olması ve aynı zamanda imgesel anlamda zenginliği, sesin işitsel dürtünün nesnesi olması, müziğin ve enstrümanın yoğunlaşmış nesne ve öğrenci-öğretmen arasındaki ilişkinin de yoğunluğu ve sahne deneyimlerinin içerildiği düşünülmiştir. Bu özelliklerin özne ve Başka ilişkisinin; dolayısıyla da psikik birçok mekanizmayı çalışmaya elverişli olduğunu düşünülmüştür. Anlatılar Polkinghorne'nin anlatı analizi yönergesine uygun olarak analiz edilmiş ve beş ana bölüm ortaya çıkmıştır: (1) O Hep Vardı, (2) Karşılaşma, (3) Kıymeti Bir Başka, (4) Karanlık Taraf / Her Şeyi Kaplayan Nesne ve (5) Ödül / Her Şeyi Kapsayan Nesne.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Psikanaliz, Müzik, Anlatı Analizi, Özne, Başka
To Music...
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First of all, I would like to present my appreciation to Prof. Dr. Faruk Gençöz. The fall semester of 2015-2016, my last year as an undergraduate student, was the first time I took his lesson which included psychoanalytic analysis of selected films. After that point, my interest in the human mind irreversibly shifted and anchored on Lacanian psychoanalytic orientation. Since then, his innovative, initiative, creative, and courageous perspective shed light on my journey not only professionally but also personally. I am greatly thankful for your guidance and mentorship.

I would like to express my gratitude to Prof. Dr. Tülin Gençöz as well. My appreciation of her power to transfer her knowledge dates back to my first years of undergraduate education. Especially since my graduate studies, her influence on my identity as a Lacanian psychotherapist and my clinical practice is immensely priceless. I appreciate her wisdom and comprehensiveness deeply. I am grateful for your effect not only on my professional approach but on my perspective in my personal life as well. Her presence in my life is priceless.

I would also like to thank Assoc. Prof. Dr. Bahar Öz and Assist. Dr. Yağmur Ar Karcı for their priceless contributions and guidance for the whole writing process of this thesis. I would like to praise Assist. Dr. Derya Özbek Şimşek and Assist. Dr. Ayşen Maraş for their invaluable beneficence and comments on my work. These members of my committee not only greatly contributed to my thesis but also to my approach throughout my graduate studies.

I am thankful to all of my participants who made this work possible in the first place. Thank you for your willingness to share your experiences and efforts.

I am grateful for my parents, Nino Skhvitaridze and Shalva Gagua, who gave me everything they could throughout my whole life: They are loving enough to transfer everything they have and strong enough to let go at a certain point. I acknowledge your struggle in life and appreciate every gift you gave me. I am also grateful to my godparents, Nana Valishvili, Revaz Kotrikadze, and their daughter
Sophia Kotrikadze, who were always there when I needed them and always lovingly accepted me as I am. You are the best possible godparents anyone can wish for. I am also immensely thankful to my grandmother, my namesake, Neli Chekurishvili, who taught me to always follow my desires and work hard for them. You passed away days before seeing your granddaughter become a Doctor of Philosophy, something that I am sure would make you happy. You are the person who taught me the Georgian alphabet at a very young age; it is an award that I appreciate more and more as I age. Rest in peace.

I would like to express my appreciation to Dr. Derya Gürsel. You are the foremost guide in my practice as a psychoanalyst. Since the first time I entered your room saying, “Everything is well I just want to become a psychoanalyst.” almost everything turned upside down in my life. I thank you for that and your priceless ability to encourage desire.

I am lucky to be part of the Freud-Lacan Psychoanalytic Association and the community of the Psychoanalytic Track in METU. These platforms provide an invaluable opportunity to prosper psychoanalytic thought in the community.

I am especially thankful to Çiğdem Vaizoğlu Şengünler and Aylin Özkan with whom we endured the challenging process of writing a Ph.D. thesis. You are great companions and unimaginably valuable friends in life. I am grateful for your presence in my life, thank you. Çiğdem, our friendship effortlessly withstood us being in different cities. I cannot thank you enough for your compassion, unconditional support, anxious but lighthearted humour, and of course the moments of “Hocam, ben ve Çiğdem...”. Aylin, we began this journey together and we have been through inexplicably challenging experiences where I always felt encompassed with love and accepted as I am. I am thankful for your presence, willingness to engage in adventures together, and your precious delicate love.

I do not even know how to thank the priceless group of people that I am lucky enough to have: Gizem Minçê, Sezin Aydoğ, Ayça Korkmaz, and Kemal Özkul. These people have always been there and not only loved and accepted me as I am but also encouraged me to embrace “me” even more. Gizem, you cannot possibly know how a precious friend you are. Your vigorous but kind love sheds every possible light on even the darkest moments in my life. Somehow, even mysteriously,
you have been there in my most severe losses and gains in life since we became close. I see a possibility of a lifetime “Anka kuşu özütii” drinking situation. Sezin, since we met in 2012 when we both had decided to follow different paths in our lives, we have been through enormous transformations together: I can neither summarize them nor appraise them enough. We are partners not only in work but in life. Ayça, my invaluable friend, your capacity to be there in need is inexplicable. We have been through many adventures together. I appreciate your immense capacity to become in sync with my experiences. I am very lucky to be a member of your chosen family, thank you for your presence. Kemal, I appreciate your power to encourage me to follow my desire. Regardless of the situation, your capacity to encompass and support is immense. Thank you for your courage and love.

My oldest childhood friend, Ayça Akünal, I cannot appreciate your presence enough in my life as well. Since 1998, we composed music, gone into running competitions, read “Hayvan Çiftliği”’s, made music together, and whatnot. We have been there for each other always; via always loving each other and finding a common ground. Your presence is precious, thank you.

Thank you, Ulya and Kama. You were always there since we met. We have been together through uncountable adventures. I cannot imagine my childhood without you. Thank you for your friendship. Many more adventures await us.

I would like to thank Georgia, the country of music, water, and wine. You are my root; I somehow always end up coming back and prospering in you. Thank you for teaching me the importance of music and language. Turkey, my host home, I would like to thank you for your hospitality, the amazing people that I am surrounded with and guided by, and the vision you have provided me with.

I am thankful to Bilkent, where I gained my first conceptualization of the world; to ODTÜ where I matured; and to Anadolu State Conservatory where I am gaining precious vision about music and life. I am thankful to have Prof. Dr. Serla Balkarlı as a mentor. Our relationship is yet a sprout, but I feel like is going to become a deeply rooted tree. I am lucky to have such a devoted, knowledgeable, colourful, and loving mentor as you are. I am also thankful to Prof. Dr. Gülnara Aziz, who has always been there for me and believed in me. I can never possibly express my appreciation for the wisdom, devotion, and faith that you have provided to me.
I would like to thank everyone and everything that I was not capable of mentioning here. Without you all, I would not be “me” as I am today. And finally, thank you music and the piano: You are a place where I am most capable of loving, fearing, sharing, seeing, and listening. Without you, I would most definitely not be “me”.

xi
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PLAGIARISM</th>
<th>iii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ÖZ</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEDICATION</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>xvi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTERS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1. General Overview</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2. Psychoanalytic Conceptual Framework</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.1. Need, Demand, Desire</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.2. The Mirror Stage</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.3. Lalangue and Language</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.4. Identification</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.5. The Three Types of Lack</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.5.1. Privation</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.5.2. Frustration</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.5.3. Castration</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.6. The Partial Objects</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.7. Das Ding</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.8. The Death Drive</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.9. Unheimlich</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.10. The Anxiety</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.11. The Sublimation</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.12. The Sinthome</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.13. The Borromean Knot</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A. APPROVAL OF THE METU HUMAN SUBJECTS ETHICS COMMITTEE. 130
B. INFORMED CONSENT FORM. ................................................................. 131
C. THE GENERATIVE NARRATIVE QUESTION AND NARRATIVE
   ENQUIRIES .......................................................................................... 132
D. TURKISH VERSION OF THE GENERATIVE NARRATIVE QUESTION
   AND NARRATIVE ENQUIRIES .................................................................. 133
E. CURRICULUM VITAE .............................................................................. 134
F. TURKISH SUMMARY / TÜRKÇE ÖZET ...................................................... 137
G. THESIS PERMISSION FORM / TEZ İZİN FORMU ..................................... 167
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. *Three Types of Lack* (Lacan, 1956-1957/2020) .................................................. 8
Table 2. Demographic Information of Participants............................................................. 37
Table 3. Table of Sections and Subsections....................................................................... 43
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. The Borromean Knot ................................................................. 21
Figure 2. Sinthome .................................................................................. 22
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1. General Overview

The present study is a Narrative Analysis of professional musicians concerning music and their instruments in the light of Lacanian Psychoanalysis. In this chapter of the study, first related Freudian and Lacanian psychoanalytic conceptual framework, then existing literature about music and musicians in general psychology research and psychoanalytic studies are provided. Lastly, the current study's scope, rationale and aim are presented.

1.2. Psychoanalytic Conceptual Framework

1.2.1. Need, Demand, Desire

Around 1958, Lacan put forwards a differentiation between the terms need, demand and desire. Lacan places the concept of need in a solely biological realm (Evans, 2006).

The basis of this distinction, accordingly, lies in the fact that in order for an infant’s need to be met, it should be articulated since an infant is not capable of meeting its specific needs. Thus, an infant must articulate these needs in a vocal form or demand so that another person can perform these actions instead. This articulation, which takes place in the speech, takes the form of demand; for needs to be met, an infant must demand it. Lacan (1956-1957/2020) gave an example of a baby’s cry to the mother. He said that the cry is not solely a pulse and is involved in the structure of language; thus, an infant is capable of articulating long before the articulation of words as such.

Moreover, the process of demanding a need to be satisfied introduces a new equation into the psychic system: since demand is directed to another person, or the Other, for fulfilling the need, the demand for a need exceeds the limits of the need
and includes demand for love as well (Lacan, 1960/2006). Thus, demand has two folded functions: an articulation of a need and a request for unconditional love. Even though the Other, as a recipient of the demand, might address specific needs, the Other does not have the capacity to answer the demand for love since they are also divided.

This double-sided function of demand has many connotations. The object that provides the satisfaction of a need is eclipsed by its function as evidence of love (Evans, 2006). Thus, demand’s function as a request for love overshadows its actual function: cry for the satisfaction of need.

The double-dimensional quality of demand gives rise to desire: One’s articulation of need can be addressed, but demand for love cannot be totally satisfied. Whereas need is an episodic and transient tension, request for love is insistent and unsatisfiable. Thus, leftover or surplus of satisfied needs constitutes the foreground of desire: “Desire is neither the appetite for satisfaction, nor demand for love, but the difference that results from the subtraction of the first from the second” (Lacan, 1958b/2006). Thus, desire is the surplus of the need articulated in the demand.

It is important to emphasize that these elements, need, demand and desire, function simultaneously and constitute a structure (Evans, 2006). Since articulation of need only exists during the action of articulation, it is not possible to separate these elements and determine purely a subject’s need as such. It means that, for instance, one’s experience of hunger cannot be addressed as a sole need and separated from the demand for love.

Since demand for love is unsatisfiable, desire is a continuous potency. Lacan’s term is not translated to English as “wish”, which would have connotations to Freud’s Wunsch, because the word desire connotes both sexuality and a continuous force that are crucial components that the term conveys (Evans, 2006). Desire is one of the most fundamental Lacanian concepts. Lacan (1955/2006) emphasized that by mentioning it, he referred to the unconscious desire and denoted it as being entirely sexual and fundamental to psychoanalysis. Accordingly, it is crucial in psychoanalysis to render the subject articulate, put a name to, and bring desire into being (Lacan, 1954-1955/1991). Nevertheless, since desire is unconscious, there is fundamental incapability of its articulation in its entirety, and
this feature renders unconscious to remain out of reach of total understanding (Lacan, 1958a/2006). Thus, even though it is impossible to gather all truth about desire due to its nature, its remnants are present in each speech as a leftover.

Since desire is a leftover or surplus of a need articulated in demand, it is always placed in a recipient of it. Thus, desire is always a desire for the Other. This famous formula, “man’s desire is the desire of the Other” (Lacan, 1964/1998), can be interpreted in various ways. In its essentiality, it means that desire is the desire of the Other’s desire referring to being desired or recognized by the Other. Further, it means that the subject desires from the perspective of the Other (Lacan, 1960/2006). This reading emphasizes that for a subject, the object of another’s desire becomes desirable: No object has an intrinsic value whatsoever, but its desirability is provided by others who desire it. Furthermore, the formula also refers to the desire being desire for something else (Lacan, 1957/2006). The object of desire is always deferred; thus, desire is fundamentally a metonymy. Finally, desire is a desire for the mother that is primordially prohibited, where the fundamental desire is the incestuous desire for the mother; both as a result and product of it, desire only emerges in the unconscious (Lacan, 1959-1960/1997).

Concerning these characteristics of it, desire is always a social product and emerges in alliance with relationships and one’s perception of desired objects of people in these relationships (Evans, 2006).

1.2.2. The Mirror Stage

“How sad it is! I shall grow old, and horrible, and dreadful. But this picture will remain always young. It will never be older than this particular day of June…. If it were only the other way! If it were I who was to be always young, and the picture that was to grow old! For that—for that—I would give everything! Yes, there is nothing in the whole world I would not give! I would give my soul for that!”

Dorian Gray from “The Picture of Dorian Gray by Oscar Wilde

Since Lacan introduced the mirror stage in 1936, his first formal addition to psychoanalytical theory, he continuously used the concept as a point of reference, which developed during his studies (Evans, 2006).

The concept takes its roots from the French psychologist Henri Wallon’s “mirror test”, in which a six months old human infant was discovered to be differing
from a chimpanzee of the same age in the sense that a human infant perceives its reflection in the mirror as its own whereas a chimpanzee does not recognise itself (Evans, 2006). Lacan advanced from this point on to render the mirror stage one of the fundamental concepts of human subjectivity. In the early period of his work, Lacan limited the mirror stage into a certain period, the sixth months of age, of human development, where an infant jubilantly comes to recognise itself in the mirror. However, later on, Lacan conceptualised it to represent an enduring structure of subjectivity where an individual is permanently preoccupied with their own image, that is, of the imaginary order. Thus, the mirror stage is a constant in the imaginary representation of one’s subjectivity throughout their life: “The mirror stage is far from a mere phenomenon which occurs in the development of the child. It illustrates the conflictual nature of the dual relationship” (Lacan, 1956-1957/2020).

This mechanism constitutes the evolvement of the ego in an individual. Ego formation lays its roots when an individual identifies with their reflection in the mirror, that is, the specular image. This image is both one’s own and of the other as well: An infant’s visual capacities develop prior to the development of coordination; thus, whereas a specular image represents a totality, the experience of bodily coordination points to a fragmental capacity. For this contrast to be resolved, one identifies with this specular image. Lacan described (1953-1954/1991) the moment of this identification as an experience of jubilation of proficiency. The incompatibility between the image and the body’s ability is eclipsed by identifying with the image.

As defined above, the mirror stage is the foundation of an individual’s imaginary sphere. Moreover, it also has another crucial function: An adult who introduces the reflection for an infant constitutes a symbolic dimension of the mirror stage. After a child glances at its own image, it turns its gaze to the adult who functions there as the Other, and it is the Other who approves and confirms the image (Lacan, 1962-1963/2014). The symbolic dimension of the mirror stage constitutes one’s recognition by the Other. The recognised image, as such, creates the base for the identified image to function as a promised future wholeness, that is, the ideal ego.
1.2.3. Language and Language

Language occupies a central position in Lacanian understanding. First of all, it must be emphasized that the English word language has two correspondents in French, “langue” and “langage” (Evans, 2006). In French, “langue” refers to a particular language, like Turkish and English. However, the word “langage” denotes not a specific language but a general operation or system of languages: Lacan concentrated on this latter meaning when referring to the human psyche concerning language.

First, language is a function of mediating the relationship with the Other and the source of recognition as such (Lacan, 1948/2006). As a social product, it conveys social norms, laws, and limitations (Lacan, 1953-1954/1991). However, there is much more ascribed to language about the human psyche.

Lacan dwelled on F. Saussure’s theory, where language is regarded as a structure consisting of certain elements, namely sign, signified and signifier (Evans, 2006). Accordingly, the sign is a basic unit of language that conveys meaning via its inseparable elements: 1) signifier is a physical representation of a word, such as a sound or a written form; 2) signified is a mental representation or the concept that signifier represents (Saussure, 1916/2011). For instance, the meaning conveyed by the word “cat” would be a sign, the sound and the letters that constitute “cat” would be a signifier, and the mental image or idea of a “cat” would be signified.

Saussurian conceptualisation has an essential impact on Lacan’s formulation of language’s impact on the human psyche. However, Lacan differs from Saussure in critical points (Evans, 2006). First, in Saussurian understanding, signified and signifiers are generally fixed together while denoting a sign (Saussure, 1916/2011). In comparison, Lacan argues that there is no such fixed relation; furthermore, instead of placing a sign as a basic unit of language where the meaning is conveyed, Lacan emphasized that the signifier occupies such a central element in language.

Hereupon, Lacan (1964/1998) stated, “The unconscious is structured like a language”. According to this famous quote, the unconscious functions through a system of signified and signifiers, as language does. Moreover, two linguistic features also have similar functions in the sphere of the unconscious, namely metonymy and metaphor (Lacan, 1954-1955/1991): Metonymy operates in the form
of association and substitution of signifiers, whereas metaphor refers to condensation of signifiers into another signifier.

It is important to emphasize that language has an inherent ambiguity of meanings; there is no one-to-one harmony between signified and signifier (Evans, 2006). With this property, any discourse inherently involves uncertainty and thus, speech always includes multiple interpretations and meanings, that is, equivocality. Moreover, even though language has a symbolic function, it is not limited to symbolic order and involves imaginary order as well: Accordingly, the imaginary role played in the symbolic function of the language should not be eliminated (Lacan, 1954-1955/1991).

As the ambiguous nature of language is put forward, it is also important to point out a relevant term: lalangue. Lalangue is coined to portray non-communicative aspects of language (Lacan, 1972-1973/1999). This non-communicative aspect is ambiguous and partly involves jouissance as well. Lalangue is a component of language as such that language is actually made of lalangue. For instance, when a native Turkish speaker hears one speaking Uzbek, s/he might not understand it but feel familiar. In this instance, non-communicative aspects of lalangue would be felt, but no semantic meaning would be conveyed. Thus, lalangue is any property of a language outside of semantic meaning.

1.2.4. Identification

Identification is considered one of the central elements in psychoanalysis since the identification process denotes a crucial component of a subject’s constitution (Laplanche & Pontalis, 1967/1973). According to Freud (1921/1949), the term refers to a process in which an individual embraces and interiorizes at least one aspect and characteristic of another individual. These adopted qualities construct layer-by-layer components of both ego and superego: An individual internalizes specific attributes as their own without necessarily having awareness.


Imaginary identification takes its roots in the mirror stage and is specular (Lacan, 1948/2006). According to Lacan, in the identification process, one goes
through a particular transformation by assuming an image as their own and, as such, comes to recognize itself through the image. This point also marks the basis of one’s misrecognition of itself: The subject can only recognize itself through an image outside of itself and naturally excludes some aspects of the subject. Thus, ironically, recognition is misrecognition at the same time. This ironical component leads to tension. As a result, identification with the image contains alienation of one and aggressivity as well. Imaginary identification also provides the basis for the ideal ego, an individual’s internalized, subjective, and idealized self-image, which is sought after with fantasies of self-perfection.

The secondary identification, the symbolic identification, is identification with the symbolic father through the real father (Lacan, 1948/2006). Even though it also includes an imaginary realm, it is denoted as symbolic as it refers to the introduction of the symbolic in the system of a subject. This identification also transforms the inherent aggressivity of the imaginary identification. The second identification lays the roots of the ego ideal, a set of internalized values, norms, standards, and rules that one ought to have and is associated with guilt.

Symbolic identification also includes identification with the signifier (Lacan, 1960-1961/2015). Throughout the process of subjective formation, individuals identify with specific signifiers ascribed to them. Accordingly, the subject not only identifies with the qualities of another person as such but with the signifiers that denote the association. As such, the signifiers have the quality of denoting a subject for another one. Thus, language plays a crucial role in shaping one’s understanding of themselves with the associations that signifiers contain.

Finally, there is a particular type of identification where an individual identifies with their unique symptom (Lacan, 1975-1976/2016). This form of identification is called sinthome and will be discussed in detail in the following parts of this thesis.

1.2.5. The Three Types of Lack

Lacan, in his seminar of 1956-1957, differentiated between three types of lack: privation, frustration, and castration. The differentiation is conceptualised by positioning lack in different orders, distinguishing lacking objects, and separating the
agents causing the lack (Lacan, 1956-1957/2020). These different types of lack are presented in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AGENT</th>
<th>LACK</th>
<th>OBJECT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Real Father</td>
<td>Symbolic Castration</td>
<td>Imaginary Phallus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symbolic Mother</td>
<td>Imaginary Frustration</td>
<td>Real Breast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imaginary Father</td>
<td>Real Privation</td>
<td>Symbolic Phallus</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 1.2.5.1. Privation

The concept of privation takes its roots in Freud’s (1924/1961) understanding of female castration. Accordingly, the moment when children come to understand that some of them do not possess a penis, they are traumatized. The trauma they experience differs depending on their sexes: Boys enroot a fear of the possibility of their penis being cut, whereas girls develop envy of a desirable organ that boys have. Moreover, girls initially blame their mothers for the lack and then turn to their fathers, hoping that they will compensate for this lack by giving them a child (Freud, 1924/1961).

Lacan approached the issue differently. Accordingly, a girl’s lack of a penis is a lack in real; however, the real as such could not lack. Thus, something perceived in real to be lacking requires the lack to be symbolized as an object (Lacan, 1956-1957/2020). For a child to perceive an organ as missing, the child must understand the absent thing. It means that to conceive something as not being there; the symbolic must have been inserted into the real. Thus, a lacking object is not a biological entity as such but a symbolic one.

### 1.2.5.2. Frustration

Frustration is fundamentally centred between the mother and child’s primary relationship. Accordingly, frustration concerns the articulation of a demand for love. Frustration primarily includes a real object, such as a breast, being lacking: When an infant’s need is not met, it is a lack of providing the infant’s demand for love that foregrounds frustration (Lacan, 1956-1957/2020). Since the real function of an
object, for instance, receiving nutrients from a breast, is eclipsed by its symbolic object, that is an indicator of being loved; when lack of the real object occurs, it is the symbolic love of a mother that is denied. Frustration occurs when an infant perceives that the demand is not met for which the infant had a legitimate claim and senses as their rights are being taken away. Even when the real object is provided, the sense of wrongdoing continues in the infant since providing the real object is incapable of ameliorating frustration or being deprived of love itself.

1.2.5.3. Castration

In Freud’s (1924/1961) conceptualization, the castration complex is closely related to the Oedipus complex. Accordingly, castration function differently on the sexes: For boys, the castration complex functions as a termination point of the Oedipus complex as such that due to fear of their penises being cut off, boys give up their desire toward their mothers and enter into a latent phase. Girls, conversely, enter into the Oedipus complex due to the castration complex, where they resent their mothers for their lack of penis and move on to their fathers in the hope of receiving a baby as compensation. Thus, unlike boys, girls do not experience the Oedipus complex as a terminal point (Freud, 1924/1961).

Freud’s definition of castration is based on biology (Evans, 2006). However, Lacan grounded castration on a symbolic lack of an imaginary object, the phallus, where the castrating figure is the real father. Thus, for Lacan (1958b/2006), as a form of lack, castration cannot be reduced to basic anatomy or biology. Moreover, in differentiating from Freud, Lacan argued that castration is experienced as a terminal point of the Oedipus complex for both sexes and divides into three parts. First, a child perceives that the mother desires something other than the child itself, the imaginary phallus. The child then attempts to be that phallus for their mother. Second, the imaginary father intervenes in the dyadic relationship of the mother and the child, thus instating the incest taboo. The third and fundamental intervention is the one that operates as castration, that would be the real father possessing the phallus and, as a result, the child stepping back from the efforts of being the phallus for the mother (Lacan, 1956-1957/2020). Whereas the first and the second instances require the child to give up phantasm about the mother being omnipotent and
acknowledge the lack in the Other, the third and fundamental intervention necessitates accepting their own lack and giving up efforts towards being the phallus for the mother. Moreover, even though the stepwise definition suggests a developmental, definitive and terminal process, it is essential to highlight that the function of castration is structural. It means that the process, as mentioned above, introduces castration into the structure of the individual; however, castration as a form of lack is also experienced throughout adulthood.

In the castration of the subject, one gives up efforts of being the object of the mother’s desire. By doing so, the individual surrenders a particular portion of jouissance that the individual will, regardless, seek after in failed fashion. Thus, castration refers to the refusal of certain jouissance so that it could be sought after under the rule of the symbolic order (Lacan, 1958b/2006). As a result, castration is linked to the symbolic debt of giving up the jouissance for the desire to emerge.

These three types of lack are interlinked in human life. Regardless of the type of loss an individual experiences, it is the position the subject takes that points to what kind of lack is experienced in the psyche. The most radically different positions regarding lack are castration and privation, whereas frustration occupies more of a middle road between privation and castration. Depending on which position one takes, frustration could lead to privation and castration concerning the subject’s choice of operating with the symbolic debt (Fidaner, 2021). Thus, the only way of assessing an individual’s loss experience is to observe the discourse of the experience and where the agent, lack, and object of the loss are located.

1.2.6. The Partial Objects

There are four partial drives and corresponding partial objects: Oral drive, anal drive, scopic drive, and invocatory drive, respectively corresponding to breast, faeces, gaze and voice as partial objects (Evans, 2006). According to Lacan (1964/1998), these drives aim not to achieve satisfaction but to circle around the objects. As a result, the individual aims to return to a circular path and enjoyment is in this repetitive circuit of partial drives. Moreover, partial drives are not parts of a whole genital drive, but these drives represent sexuality or enjoyment in a partial
sense. These drives are closely connected with desire since they originated in the subject with relation to the Other (Lacan, 1964/1998).

Among the four drives, the first two are associated with demand (Evans, 2006). In the case of the oral drive that represents one’s demand to be fed, it is the subject who produces the demand. On the other hand, the second drive, the anal drive, is constituted by the demand of the Other, where the child is expected to develop a certain kind of potty training, for instance. (Lacan, 1960-1961/2015).

The remaining two drives are associated with desire (Evans, 2006). The scopic drive corresponds to the gaze as an object. According to Lacan (1964/1998), the gaze is the object of the action of looking, meaning that the looking eye is on the side of the subject, whereas the gaze is that of the object, and there is no concurrence between the two. For this phenomenon, Lacan (1964/1998) said, “You never look at me from the place at which I see you”. Thus, when a subject glances at an object, the object is, in fact, looking at the subject, but in a manner that the subject cannot see the gaze. It occurs due to the subject already being split. As a consequence, looking is inseparable from being looked at.

Lastly, the invocatory drive, where the object is the voice, is directed to the Other by making oneself heard (Lacan, 1964/1998). At the centre, voice as an object functions as the origin of articulation and signification of the real. Thus, the voice functions as the fundamental base of the lalangue. For an infant, when a mother speaks to the infant, it signals a question about the Other, as a questioning of what the Other wants from them. When the mother speaks to the infant and receives any sound as an answer, it becomes a source of investment; the answer is not just a noise but something involving a particular meaning (Couvert, 2021).

These partial drives and partial objects create the basis for the desire, but it is essential to distinguish the drives and the desire (Evans, 2006). These partial drives and objects are in abundance, whereas desire is one. The object that represents desire in totality is object petit a; it is not a real object as such but a representation of lack. Thus, the object petit a is not an object towards where the desire directs but is the cause of desire.
1.2.7. Das Ding

According to Freud (1911/1958), pleasure and reality principles are two essential operations of mental functioning. The primary regulatory system of the psyche is the pleasure principle, which operates as a mechanism to obtain dreamlike, delusional satisfaction. Accordingly, an individual discovers that this phantasmagoric strategy is not useful in satisfaction; as a result, the individual is forced to develop a mechanism which would have a conception of the external world and its necessities, which is the reality principle. This secondary principle regulates the pleasure principle so that pleasure would be attainable at least partially (Freud, 1911/1958).

Taking its basis on Freud’s conceptualization, Lacan (1954-1955/1991) associated the pleasure principle with homeostasis, where the aim is to sustain the stimulation at the lowest possible economic level. He drew attention to the contrast between pleasure and jouissance. Jouissance is an excessive excitation or agitation that consequently includes pain as well. According to Lacan, it is jouissance that the pleasure principle tries to eliminate from the system: Thus, pleasure aims to maintain homeostasis, whereas jouissance threatens it (Evans, 2006).

In other words, the pleasure principle stems from the incest prohibition and sustains the law. Whereas the pleasure principle functions in the symbolic order, jouissance dominantly resists the language and remains in the real. Thus, the pleasure principle is safeguarding the subject from das Ding by providing a distance among them.

Das Ding (German term for the Thing), the primary object of desire, is the long-lost object which drives a subject to continuously re-found this prehistoric (occurring before language), lasting and monumental object of unforgettable Other or mother that has already been forbidden (Lacan, 1959-1960/1997). Das Ding is the concept which impregnates Lacan with the notion of the objet petit a (Evans, 2006). As the objet petit a is the cause of the desire, Das Ding is the cause of fundamental human passion (Lacan, 1959-1960/1997). Whereas the objet petit a includes imaginary notions, Das Ding is strictly in the realm of the real. Moreover, since Das Ding is prehistoric and placed in the real, it contains elements that resist and suffer from the signifier. For this reason, this lost object is consistently maintained at a
certain distance by the pleasure principle, making it impossible to attain: It makes it possible for the subject to circle it continuously without getting too closer.

Thus, Das Ding is to be accessible to the subject only as their Sovereign Good, a great ideal to constant effort to attain. If a subject transgresses the limit of the pleasure principle and gets too close to Das Ding, then this Sovereign Good is to become the source of evil and suffering because a subject cannot host the extreme good that emerges from Das Ding (Lacan, 1959-1960/1997). As a result, Das Ding is usually kept inaccessible since accessing it means the end of the desire or death. Since the drives make it possible for one to get too close to Das Ding, every drive is partially a death drive.

1.2.8. The Death Drive

Freud’s (1930/1961) concept of the death drive was one of the most disputed ones of his time. Apart from the Lacanian psychoanalytic circle, only the Kleinian school considers the concept necessary (Evans, 2006). Freud drew a contrasting line between the drives of life and death. Accordingly, life drives gravitate towards harmony, integrity, and cohesion within the human psyche and between individuals and society. On the other hand, death drives function towards undoing unity and destruction. However, these opposite drives tend to be in fusion rather than existing in a purified manner (Freud, 1930/1961).

Alongside life and death drives dominating human lives, Freud (1930/1961) proposed that inclination towards aggression is only an external and apparent representation of the death drive. It suggests that external aggression is a type of aggression where the death drive is channelled to an external object or a person. Similarly, when the energy of the death drive is directed inwards, a person engages in self-destructive behaviour. These behaviours could fall into a wide array of self-destructs, from simple self-sabotages to suicides where people seem to shoot themselves in their feet (Comer & Comer, 2019).

In the Lacanian perspective, the death drive is fundamental for psychoanalysis and neglecting it is a product of misunderstanding psychoanalysis. Lacan (1960/2006) associated the death drives with a subject’s longing for a lost paradise, stemming from an effort to retreat to the preoedipal unity with the mother’s
breast; thus, the death drives function as an effort of undoing the castration. In alliance with that, Lacan (1954-1955/1991) further emphasized that the death drive yields repetition in the symbolic order. Repetition is a demonstration of the unconscious and is the return of jouissance that transgresses the pleasure principle to reach a point of death (Lacan, 1969-1970/2007). In this understanding, the death drive aims to return to an inorganic or homeostatic state by seeking destruction.

Moreover, unlike Freud, Lacan (1964/2006) did not address the death drive as a compilation of distinct drives: Rather, he emphasized that every drive is a death drive simultaneously. Each drive aims at its own extinction; thus, every drive pursues to go beyond the pleasure principle to jouissance. It is the reason behind the death drive producing repetition.

1.2.9. Unheimlich

The Freudian term “unheimlich” is translated as “uncanny” in English. In German, “unheimlich” specifies a certain sense of discomfort, unrest, and emotions of fright and terror (Collins, n.d.) There are two possible etymological roots of the word. In the first explanation, the root of the word is thought to be “das Heim” which means “home”. When “home” is taken as the root, the suffix “un” adds opposition in German and “-lich” functions as the English equivalent of “-ly”. When approached as such, the raw translation to English would be “not homely”, and the meaning would emphasize unfamiliarity, strangeness, eeriness etc. The second approach situates “Heimlich”, which means both “homely” and “secret” in German, as the root and “un”, the opposition suffix, as an addition. Thus, in this sense, the word’s meaning stresses something secretive to surface or unravel. These approaches regarding the etymological root of the word are discussed by Freud and Lacan concerning its reference to the terminological use (Freud, 1919/2003; Lacan, 1962-1963/2014).

In order to debunk the mainstream understanding of the time that the word “unheimlich” refers to fer towards novelty, Freud (1919/2003) not only emphasized the twofold etymological roots of the word in German but also analyses the equivalent term in various languages. He emphasizes that a novel thing cannot cause fear for the sole reason it is a novelty: This novelty must have an added component
to unravel uncanniness. According to Freud, this component is not only disguised from the public eye but also, more importantly, from the individual itself. Further, the component is disguised because it is mainly forbidden, and its existence causes threats. Thus, something is uncanny if it unconsciously reminds an individual of what is repressed and forbidden. During the encounter with an uncanny thing, one projects their internal tension to a specific external element, and this element becomes the source of the threat. As a result, something uncanny is a novelty capable of bearing a specific secretive element which functions as a reminiscence of something long ago repressed; in other words, something uncanny functions as a return of the repressed for an individual.

In his seminar, Lacan (1962-1963/2014) conceptualized “unheimlich” concerning anxiety. Lacan emphasized that a thing, an image that causes seduction or narcissistic captivation, might also, at the same time, suddenly reveal a hidden object. To elaborate, Lacan demonstrated a paradigm. In the paradigm, a man is in a position to see his own back in the mirror. However, it appears as a strange object until the man feels it to be his own. That is a moment where the distinction between familiar and unfamiliar becomes blurred. In this manner, the distinction between good and evil, pleasure and pain, becomes non-permeable. This blur becomes a signal of anxiety since an element’s irreducibility to a signifier diminishes.

1.2.10. The Anxiety

Throughout Lacan’s studies, the concept of anxiety has undergone various changes (Evans, 2006). In his early works, anxiety is primarily linked with the threat of body fragmentation. Later, Lacan linked anxiety to the horror of being engulfed by the mother. This latter approach constitutes the root of his conceptualisation of the concept. It draws a definitive cutting point between Freud’s and Lacan’s attribution to anxiety: While Freud put separation from the mother as a basis for anxiety, Lacan, on the contrary, argued that it is precisely the lack of such separation that lays the foundation for anxiety.

Further, Lacan associated anxiety with the concept of the real, where a certain traumatic experience remains outside the realm of the language or symbolisation. As such, something external to language slips away to become an object and resists
explanation (Lacan, 1954-1955/1991). Accordingly, anxiety is associated with the imaginary, where he differentiates it from guilt, which is positioned in the symbolic (Lacan & Granoff, 1956). Here, anxiety is experienced in a two-sided encounter not mediated by a third agent. Thus, there is an uncanny gaze that is not limited by language and cannot be faced without vertigo. In this manner, seeing a modification in one’s reflection causes unfamiliarity and strangeness: One gazes upon an uncanny strangeness in a sphere that was assumed to be safe and familiar.

Furthermore, Lacan (1956-1957/2020) also discussed anxiety in relation to phobia and drew a distinction between them. Accordingly, anxiety posits extreme danger in various subjective positions, and phobia is an unconscious strategy for avoiding anxiety. In his seminar titled “Anxiety”, Lacan (1962-1963/2014) emphasized that anxiety does not inherently have an object as such and revolves around an absence. However, in the case of phobia, the object of anxiety seems apparent. Lacan argued that in the case of a phobia, precisely this fixation on an object protects one from anxiety and the particularity of the object and makes it possible to work through it symbolically.

Since anxiety remains outside the symbolic order and has no concrete object, it is not an emotion but an affect (Lacan, 1962-1963/2014). It is in this regard that anxiety is corresponded to bodily reactions. Lacan, while drawing a critical difference to fear where the object is concrete, did not simply state that anxiety lacks an object in any form: It has an object; however, it is an object of special status, that is, objet petit a. Objet petit a is a special kind of object because it does not denote any presence, but on the contrary, it corresponds to an absence, a place, an empty space that makes it possible to desire to have a potential to fill. However, it is crucial to emphasise this “potential” quality since objet petit a is all about an empty space to provide the illusion of potential fulfilment. When Lacan stated that objet petit a is the object of anxiety, he means that anxiety is experienced when a concrete, perceptible object occupies this position of objet petit a. This is actually a technical explanation of the lack of lack: desire is always in the sphere of the Other, and when the sole object of the desire fits into a certain concrete shape, the distance between the subject and the Other vanishes and the separation among them abolishes. The threat of lack of separation actually means eradication of the subject: As it is not the breast itself
but lack of it that causes an infant to want it (or as wanting a breast comes to an end by the presence of it), similarly unconscious impossible quest of “What does the Other want from me?” that gives rise to all human creativity and longing ends when a concrete object is placed upon this ambivalent never-ending puzzle. Thus, the more the subject ascribes an object the value of the objet petit a, the more anxiety it would propagate.

Since anxiety is a threat of an object occupying the position of the objet petit a, it occupies space between jouissance and castration (Lacan, 1962-1963/2014). Anxiety occupies a position of tension; it both resists jouissance via avoiding the lack of the lack of an object and sustaining castration, the lack of the object. Since a subject wants both to achieve the object of desire and to conserve the desire simultaneously, anxiety emerges due to the impossibility of sustaining both, namely having the imaginary object and giving it up.

Nevertheless, putting aside the differences, both Freud and Lacan agree that it is the presence or acceptance of castration that distances an individual from anxiety: In Freud’s conceptualisation, it is acceptance of the agent of castration who threatens one and makes them give up the phantasy of the unity with the mother; in Lacan’s understanding, anxiety having a position of mediation between jouissance and castration, as well as resistance to language and a third party in dual relationship.

1.2.11. The Sublimation

According to Freud (1930/1961), sublimation is a defence mechanism in which a surplus of sexual energy is transferred into a socially acceptable form. Here, it is crucial to point out that socially acceptable form refers to seemingly non-sexual activities in a form that does not exceed the threshold of perceived perversive activities. Moreover, such energy is not only transferred in a socially acceptable form but is also potentially applauded. Lacan (1959-1960/1997) also emphasized that social recognition and regard are central elements in sublimation. Even though Freud believed that complete sublimation is possible for specific cultured individuals, Lacan, on the contrary, argued that there is no possibility of such absolute discharge.

Agreeing with Freud, Lacan (1956-1957/2020) also linked the concept of sublimation with art creation. Both Lacan and Freud have discussed particular works
of art; Freud mainly discussed written art, whereas Lacan was generally interpreting visual art. Both authors focused more or less on the unattainability of the unconscious dynamic rendering such a defence mechanism. Moreover, Lacan (1958c/2006) emphasized that even if it is desirable for a psychoanalyst to say anything about the artist based on the works of art, it is impossible unless the analysis is based on the artist’s speech.

In Lacanian understanding, the mechanism of sublimation directly involves the relation between drive and object (Evans, 2006). In sublimation, the drive is not directed to a different object. On the contrary, change occurs in the nature of the object to which the drive is already being directed. Namely, change occurs in a subject’s relation to the object itself, and the drive is already tightly imprinted by the articulation of the signifier (Lacan, 1959-1960/1997). Thus, the sublime essence of an object is not because of specific properties of the object but the object’s relation to the subject in the position of the symbolic structure. In other words, sublimation relocates an object for a subject in the position of Das Ding. Lacan (1959-1960/1997) stated that the mechanism of sublimation “raises an object (…) to the dignity of Das Ding.”.

Further, by placing the sublimation in the field of creativity and art, Freud distanced it from the death drive (Lacan, 1956-1957/2020). However, in Lacanian conceptualization, the death drive is also permanently present in this creative energy: By positioning the death drive not only to a position of destruction in itself but also to a will of exerting creation from the zero (Lacan, 1959-1960/1997). This will is a representation of an apparent effort of the subject’s reorganization. Furthermore, since the sublimed object comes to occupy a dignified position, the subject unconsciously elevates the object’s position to Das Ding. Such an elevation is a threat in itself since it calls for fascination that, in the end, inherently results in either the metaphorical death of the representational idealized object or metonymical escape, in the form of unwilling shelter from the burden of the Other.

1.2.12. The Sinthome

The term “sindhome”, coined by Lacan in reference to “symptom”, was introduced in 1975 as an extension of topological elaboration, namely the Borromean Knot (Evans, 2006). By doing so, Lacan redefined symptoms in psychoanalysis.
Before the term sinthome, Lacan conceptualised symptoms in various ways. First of all, it is essential to emphasise that symptoms are differentiated from clinical structures (psychosis, perversion, and neurosis; with fundamental operations of foreclosure, disavow, and repression, respectively), and psychoanalysis does not aim at curing or eliminating symptoms but operates in structural terms (Evans, 2006). Thus, in psychoanalysis, rather than eliminating the symptoms, the focus is on deciphering their function and position for the structure of the individual.

In this regard, Lacan followed Freud by conforming that neurotic symptoms are always a kind of concession or a compromise among two incompatible desires. Lacan’s (1953/2006) distinction on the topic lay in his linguistic understanding in which a neurotic symptom is based on language analysis and conceptualised as being structured like a language.

Further, by positioning symptoms in language, Lacan (1953/2006) argued that the symptom functions as a signifier. This approach is distinguished radically from mainstream diagnostic indexes, where the compilation of the symptom leads to diagnosis. Instead, Lacan argued that certain symptoms are not associated with clinical symptoms and that diagnosis could only be reached by analysing the subject’s position regarding signifiers. Furthermore, a symptom also functions like a metaphor where the body or a function takes a condensed signifying role. As such, symptom contains a message addressing the subject to others (Lacan, 1960-1961/2015). In this respect, a symptom is an ambiguous message: A subject experiences it as a blurred thing emerging from the real and therefore misrecognises their own message. Therefore, a symptom also contains elements of jouissance that escape any interpretation (Lacan, 1962-1963/2014). In this regard, the symptom does not call the interpretation and is not a call for the Other. With its components resisting symbolisation, the symptom is also a place where a subject enjoys unconsciousness.

Such a dual understanding of the symptom, which is both a message to the Other and a private place for enjoyment, calls for a topological approach (Lacan, 1975-1976/2016). This comprehensive approach led Lacan to the concept of sinthome: Sinthome designates this dual nature of symptom and refers to the signification of enjoyment that is also, at the same time, immune to signification.
(Evans, 2006). Thus, apart from the dissolution of a symptom, sinthome refers to a particular reorganisation of jouissance as such that both signification and enjoyment are maintained. However, this maintenance is realised in such a way that it becomes a thing that keeps the structure itself intact. Thus, the complex dynamic of a symptom is not eliminated, but the mechanism is shifted in such a way that what was previously disturbing later becomes the sole thing that protects from disruption. In other words, transformation concerning the organisation of a symptom indicates identification with sinthome, that is, identification with the symptom one has in a particular way: This unique way of identification is thought to be one of the marks of termination of psychoanalysis as well (Evans, 2006).

The function of the sinthome is best described in topological terms: Lacan (1975-1976/2016) added the sinthome as a fourth ring to the Borromean Knot, which initially had three rings of real, imaginary, and symbolic. With such an approach, the sinthome radically differs from sublimation, where sublimation is a certain defence mechanism, and the sinthome is a fourth ring that keeps the structure of an individual from dissolving.

1.2.13. The Borromean Knot

The Borromean knot is a topological expression of human structure where the interrelation of the symbolic, the imaginary, and the real is demonstrated (Lacan, 1972-1973/1999). Topological explanation marks a unique explanation because it is a non-metaphorical account of a subject’s structure. The non-metaphorical account refers to a particular type of explanation that is devoid of or has a quality of being above the terminological definition. In this manner, rather than representing the structure, it could be said that the topology is itself a structure.

The Borromean knot is a special type of topology since it marks the departure of the study of surfaces to interrelated knots or chains (Evans, 2006). The structure of the knot contains the three orders so that if any of the rings that represent each order dissolves, the whole chain of the organisation falls apart (Lacan, 1972-1973/1999). In this topology, thus, both independence and interdependence or the orders are demonstrated. As it is demonstrated in Figure 1, each order has its independent areas,
dual intersections, and ternary intersection. Each of these intersections denotes specific structural realms.

![Borromean Knot](image)

**Figure 1.** The Borromean Knot


One of the intersections lies between imaginary (the top ring in Figure 1) and symbolic (the right ring in Figure 1) rings. This intersection denotes meaning: It illustrates how any meaning that individuals arrive at necessarily includes both symbolic and imaginary orders. The algebraic symbol that is used to mark the intersection between the symbolic and the real (the left ring in Figure 1) rings is $J\varphi$ which denotes phallic (Evans, 2006). Phallic jouissance refers to a type of jouissance where the surplus of enjoyment is obtained through the mastering of the body in the face of the symbolic order, where the joy is obtained through power, authority, and pursuit of the idealized phallic signifier (Lacan, 1972-1973/1999). The dual intersection between imaginary and real orders refers to the jouissance of the Other and is marked with $JA$ as the algebraic symbol (Evans, 2006). This type of enjoyment is located between the imaginary and the real since the desire of the Other is never accessible to an individual, and the enjoyment is marked by both surrender to the Other and frustration simultaneously (Lacan, 1969-1970/2007). This type of jouissance is unattainable by masculine position and is marked by resistance to symbolization. These qualities of the Other’s jouissance, namely resisting symbolization and being unattained by the masculine position where the phallus or
the symbolic power is rooted, is well demonstrated by its topological position where symbolic order, which would provide the basis for symbolization and power, does not enter into the sphere. Finally, the only position of the tertiary intersection is occupied by objet petit a: the object that is the cause of the desire (Lacan, 1975-1976/2016). This position has several indications. First of all, structurally the objet petit a occupies a central position for the psyche: It has such a fundamental role that merges all of the three orders. Secondly, this position of the objet petit a suggests that the role occupied by this unique object triggers all of the orders: This means that this object occupies such a position that it has a correspondence in crude enjoyment of the body, jubilation of phantasy, and powerful legitimacy of phallus at the same time.

Even though structurally, at least three rings are required for a Borromean knot to exist, there is no limit to the possible addition of other rings. A special type of ring, the sinthome, could be added to the knot (Lacan, 1975-1976/2016). As mentioned previously, sinthome represents a unique reorganization of the subject’s position towards their symptom and denotes identification with the symptom. This type of reorganization topologically refers to the addition of the fourth ring to the Borromean knot. Additions of the rings occur in individually differing manners; however, one example of such addition is represented in Figure 2.

![Figure 2. Sinthome](image)

*Note. J. Lacan, from The Seminar “Sinthome”, edited by J.A.Miller*
1.3. Music and Musicians in Literature

1.3.1. The Psychological Literature on Music and Musicians

In general, mainstream psychological research on music focused on music’s effect on cognitive skills, its neuroscientific correspondence, its therapeutic properties of alleviating pain and anxiety, and its effect on general well-being. The results of these studies are numerous and controversial as well.

There are mounting studies examining the relationship between cognition and music. In one study, classical music significantly increased working memory compared to no-music condition and discussed this effect on working memory functioning in ageing (Mammarella et al., 2007). In another study, researchers found that listening to music increases a variety of cognitive skills when the music they listen to increases their arousal levels and concluded that an enhanced level of cognitive performance is a product of elevated arousal and mood (Schellenberg, 2005). In a different study, researchers concluded that music evoked more vivid autobiographical memories than famous faces (Belfi et al., 2015). In another study, researchers examined different aspects of cognition, that are episodic memory, working memory, executive functioning, attention, and processing speed, of musicians and non-musicians: They concluded that music training is associated with higher fluid cognition (Meyet et al., 2018). However, in another study, researchers examined cross-sectional evidence and concluded that engagement in music does not affect non-music cognitive skills: They argue that optimism about music training is empirically not justified and stems from confirmation bias (Sala & Gobet, 2020).

Another work included a collection of studies across different fields, music, neuroscience, psychology, and neurology, to explore brain functioning and cognition in relation to music (Peretz & Zatorre, 2003).

In addition to cognition, neuroscientific research about music is prevalent as well. In one study, researchers examined the dopaminergic system concerning pleasure from listening to music. They concluded that pleasure stems from the interaction between cortical loops that regulate predictions and expectations about sound patterns and subcortical systems that mediate reward sensation (Zatorre & Salimpoor, 2013). Another study found that processing applied to music stimuli differs regarding brain hemisphere domination: The left hemisphere has a role in
internal stimulus analysis, whereas the right hemisphere specializes in holistic processing (Bever & Chiarello, 2009). A different study found that grey matter differences in motor, auditory, and visual-spatial brain differentiate between professional musicians, amateur musicians, and non-musicians: These differences are attributed to brain adaptations of long-term skill acquisition and repetition (Gaser & Schlaug, 2003). In some other studies, neurological functions, such as auditory cortical representation and corpus callosum sizes, are also examined (Pantev et al., 1998; Schlaug et al., 1995).

Some other studies focused on music’s effect on alleviating certain negative experiences, such as pain and anxiety and increasing general well-being. In a study, listening to music had a decreasing effect on pain and stress (Linnemann et al., 2015). In another study, exposure to music decreased levels of anxiety, and the researchers suggested that music could be used as an alternative to sedative and anti-anxiety drugs when the aim is to reduce preoperative anxiety (Bradt et al., 2013). A different study suggested that music engagement positively impacts children and young people's intellectual, social, and personal development when the engagement is rewarding and enjoyable (Hallam, 2010). Another study suggested that music practice and participation could positively affect general well-being by influencing engagement, relationships, emotions, accomplishment, and meaning (Croom, 2015).

Overall, these studies indicate a wide variety of research about music, interest in its effect, and controversial findings on the subject of study.

1.3.2. The Psychoanalytic Literature on Music and Musicians

It is genuinely peculiar, said Sterba (1965), that while psychoanalysis has contributed immense literature about the mechanism of art, it has not produced much to understanding the mechanism of a particular art form which occupies a more significant role in people’s lives, namely music.

Lacan and Freud have discussed particular works of art in relation to sublimation: Freud mainly discussed written art, whereas Lacan generally interpreted visual art alongside literature (Evans, 2006). However, both have not dwelled on the subject of music.
Freud (1901/2003) addressed that memory of music can make an individual recall and recognise some aspects of their psyche; however, he does not develop the idea further. His prevailing reluctance towards music is well-known (Smethurst, 2017). Even though he lived in the cultural capital of music of the time, it is said that he was anything but a music enthusiast (Roth, 1986).

Régnaut (2002) also commented on silence in psychoanalysis about music and remarks that there is nothing regarding music in Freud’s works and almost none in Lacan’s works. In Lacan’s work “Metaphor of the Subject” (1961/2006), it is noted that he gives reference to one of the pieces of French composer C. Debussy, that is titled “The Sunken Cathedral” (*La Cathédrale Engloutie*) and includes a depiction of ringing bells on the piano. In 1971, Lacan resembled the sound of thunder as being associated with divine authority, mentioned birdsongs, observed that singing parallels the phallus, and exemplified drums in association with the non-existence of sexual relationships: These comments do not amplify the study of music, but invoke specific ancient musical topics concerning sound, myth, and mathematics (Smethurst, 2017). Even though in his seminar Lacan (1972-1973/1999) stated that he should talk about music sometime, it looks like he did not enter such a river.

There have been some discussions about applying psychoanalysis to art. Bal and Bryson (1991) consider three approaches: the analogical model, the specification model, and the hermeneutic model. In the analogical model, the analogy is drawn between the creation and practice of psychoanalysis with art itself. Accordingly, this approach can readily lead one to arbitrary interpretations. In the second approach, the specification model, tools of psychoanalysis is used to highlight properties so that specific art features can be illuminated. Here, the point is that elements of art are not used for theoretical confirmation but for elaboration of certain features. Lastly, the hermeneutic model does not use tools of psychoanalysis to illuminate the work but traces unconscious about how disruptions occur in a seemingly coherent material.

Epstein emphasised that music, with its affective connotations on people, provides a form of representation of their inner states. This suggests that since music conveys certain emotions, it can represent human emotions decoded individually (Meelberg, 2006). In this line of thought, Meelberg (2006) argued that music can be psychoanalytically analysed due to its certain aspects. The author said that music
does not really move; the sequence of sounds presents the movement. Thus it is a representation. This representation is manifested via interpretation, tensions, and resolutions, thus, the narrations. The author argued that some theorists reject music’s psychoanalytical interpretation due to the denial of the possibility of musical narration having content. However, it is argued that musical narrations differ from verbal narrations, where the meaning is conveyed semantically and has content through various properties such as its form, structure, texture etc.

Reichardt (1987) also studied the narrative aspect of music. Accordingly, there is a paradox about music being both the most nondiscursive form of art and also containing the totality of human experience through the expression of musical materials. The author explains an isomorphism (resemblance in form, crystalline structure) between psychic events and musical language: This is thought to exist between the earliest infantile experiences disclosed via psychoanalysis and the experiences of music.

In another work, where the author psychoanalytically analysed musical compositions of the Romantic and contemporary era, suggests that psychoanalysis has much to offer to music analysis, that music can be psychoanalytically analysed in terms of broad socio-cultural representations, and that music could be regarded and analysed as a means of subjectivity (Välimäki, 2005).

Some other studies focused on music’s psychic functions in individuals. Sabbeth (1979) elaborated on Freud’s discussion about jokes’ psychic mechanism, including primary process transforming techniques of displacement, condensation, and substitute formation. Freud also demonstrated that non-comic productions could include such processes. In this light, the author argued that jokes and music have these processes, and both are socially accepted pleasure procedures. Moreover, it is stated that through particular analysis, it is possible to discover various latent integrative techniques in musical composition and discuss how the source of these musical practices in the through processes associated with the early developmental phases of childhood (Sabbeth, 1979).

In another work, Kohut (1957) also studied the psychological functions of music. According to the author, the function of music for structuralised psyche can be explained by the three parts of the structure: id, ego, and superego (Freudian
topology referring to the impulsive part that is driven by pleasure and avoids pain, conscious part of the psyche that deals with reality, and the morally correct component of the psyche, respectively). Accordingly, the function of music could be summarised through id, ego, and superego as the emotional discharge of repressed wishes that the individual might not be aware of, playful mastery over the hazards of trauma, and gratifying submission to laws and rules. These three functions are realised through a non-verbal intermediary medium, thus, through a socially acceptable sphere outside of many structurally possible conflicts. Moreover, it is suggested that music contributes to relieving some primitive and preverbal tensions that otherwise have no psychological representation and, thus, provides discharge of archaic, repressed material through emotional, non-verbal communication.

In a different study, Reik questioned why some melodies and tunes repeatedly occur to a person so that it becomes “the haunting melody” (Kohut, 1978/2011). One of the answers provided is that music might result in an association that does not correspond to a text. Freud enlarged the question by implying: 1) the repetition must have an unconscious connotation, 2) the tune could have extramusical meaning that leads to obsessional importance, and 3) questions if an intrinsic musical factor could account for an immediate emergence of a tune. Reik’s discussion described that while human speech denotes material reality, the language of music expresses psychic reality. Accordingly, the tune provides the immediate feature of experience: The type of emotional experience is much more definite than spoken words. Reik mentioned that when singing a melody that haunts him, he expresses emotions: Other than the “haunting” quality, this experience is similar to laughing or crying.

Another author elaborated on reasons for a sudden reappearance of a song that had been long forgotten (Rosenberg, 2013). The author’s reflection dwelled on the complex interaction between affect, memory, experiences and music. The question of the work points to underlying mechanisms about the phenomenon of an intrusion of a melody in seemingly unrelated rational thoughts. The conclusion is that the emerging memories through such sudden melodic intrusions are not coincidental: The author argues that these melodies are “our forgotten selves singing to us.”
According to another author, artworks have properties of substituting a lost object at least partially: They can heal the grief and represent the experience (Armstrong, 2000). Similarly, Haesler stated that music functions as an object that could fill a gap that has emerged from being separated from a person (Meelberg, 2006).

Moreover, a study focused on the creative aspect of art, stated that during the creation, tension arises between maintaining the situation by freezing tendency that stems from the psyche’s effort of repetition and attempts of reorganisation and finding new solutions (Noy, 1979). In another study, the meaning of musical experience is attributed to facilitating the re-emergence of less structured, enigmatic psychic states and their concurrent organisations of a drive (Nass, 1971). Accordingly, the mechanism is thought to resemble hearing and listening experiences in a psychoanalytical setting.

In some other approaches, the musical effect on an individual is accounted for by taking the phenomenon of sound as a basis. French psychoanalyst D. Anzieu (1985/2016) elaborated on the significance of the world of sound on the psyche of an individual. Accordingly, along with images, taste, and smell, the introjection of sounds plays a significant role in the development of the self, incorporating the dimensions of space and time. The author argued that as in Lacan’s mirror stage and Winnicott’s accounts, the emphasis is on visual signals; however, Anzieu argued that auditory signal is as important as visual input in terms of acquisition of the ability to signify, symbolise the language and connecting to their parents. Further, Anzieu emphasised that apart from bodily noises such as digestion or coughing, the most prominent noise made by a baby after birth is crying. In his work, Anzieu (1985/2016) gave reference to Wolff, who distinguishes four types of crying of an infant: 1) a cry for hunger, 2) a cry of anger, 3) a cry of pain, and 4) a cry stemming from frustration. Accordingly, these are the earliest communications directed to the primary caregiver who, via interpreting the sounds of crying, tries to eliminate the disturbance of an infant. According to Anzieu, the most effective way to bring an end to an infant’s crying is the mother’s, or the primary caregiver’s, voice. The voice plays such an essential role for an infant that, after various phases of voice imitation
and experiments such as babbling, the semantic comprehension of speech begins a few months later.

According to Anzieu (1985/2016), hearing the sounds of others, and getting responses to auditory cries and responses to it, wraps the self in harmony. Anzieu described this relationship as musical, where sounds made by an infant are met by a response and, through its echoes in others, stimulating them. These echoes and stimulations create a space for relational illusions. What Anzieu called “the bath of melody” is the mother’s voice, the songs that she sings, and the music that is present first mirrors of sounds to an infant in relation to the mother’s reactions, such as soothing, towards the infant. Anzieu gave an example to support this stance through schizophrenic mothers whose voices might be monotonous or metallic, lacking rhythm or melody. In such cases, the sound bath becomes disruptive rather than constitutive.

In another work, Anzieu (1979) provided a case study where the author demonstrates the importance of the bath of melody. In this work, Anzieu presented a patient suffering from language problems whose ego functions had been inhibited by the stiffness in the mother’s noise. He emphasises that a world of sound is critical for developing the child’s narcissistic integrity.

In alliance with Anziou, another author regarded sound as crucial for the psyche. The author illustrates the importance of sound from daily depiction: Walking through a small village or a quiet city during the summer and encountering noises from open windows of houses and hearing voices of families such as sounds of low pitches of men, medium pitches of women, and high pitches of children; laughs, singings, cries, coughs, calls, TV sounds, kitchen voices etc. These voices, alongside the smells, and the images, constitute a prime point of experience for the vast majority of individuals, providing an account for the subjective association when encountering (Grassi, 2021). According to Grassi, the analytical couch-chair setting eliminates restrictions of the mutual gaze and opens gates for more prosperous sound-related verbal association in the psychoanalytical practice.

Moreover, since sound waves travel through space, it amplifies the separateness of a self from a non-self (Grassi, 2021). As such, space is also an element between self and non-self. Thus, voice separates two agents and adds a third
variable to the relationship. This property differentiates sound from vision, where light propagation is bi-dimensional. In this regard, the voice, where distance, rhythm, and intonation are crucial, provides the fundamental basis for a language.

Further, it is suggested that musical notes produce an extended cultural selection of sounds where various perceptible sounds for the human ear are accumulated (Grassi, 2021). For instance, the term interval denotes the relationship between two sounds that occur sequentially and/or together. Through indefinite combinations of sounds, music is produced. As such, music has exceptional features encompassing structure and body itself; each piece of music is composed of a specific combination of sounds and rhythms.

Furthermore, music’s structure could be regarded as an expression of the complex and simultaneous nature of relationships and experiences and unconscious of an individual: The musical interval, which includes merging as well as separation, could be interpreted the basis of human relationality with each other and absent sound of a chord (for instance, when three notes are present instead of four but still the general effect of the chord is present) could point to existing but not materialised properties of the unconscious (Grassi, 2021).

1.4. The Subject of this Study: Theoretical Relevance and the Aim

Music has been widely studied in general psychology studies. The foci have been mainly on limited topics: 1) cognition of either the listener and the performer, 2) musicians’ and listeners’ neuroscientific functioning or mechanism, 3) its properties in terms of reducing stress and pain on individuals, and 4) its effect on general well-being. Further, Freud and Lacan have almost no direct studies on music, even though their widely encompassing approaches to the human psyche provide excellent tools. Furthermore, psychoanalytic literature about music provides prosperous insights where themes of study include topics such as examination of systematisation or possibilities of psychoanalytically analysing music pieces and musicians, discussion concerning music not conveying concrete semantic meaning but having possibilities of expressing nonverbal psychic material, providing explanations regarding music’s ability for cathartic discharge of otherwise nonverbal material and psychic mechanisms behind such experiences, music’s ability to provide
a tool for various sources of remembrance through complex mechanisms, and in
general mechanism behind sound being crucial part of a subject’s structuration.
However, no study dwells on the broad effects of music on the comprehensive
experiences of professional musicians to thoroughly analyse an individual’s relation
with others, with the object of central importance to them and the formation of
complex and interrelated psychic mechanisms through language. It is thought that
widely encompassing tools such as Lacanian, Freudian, and some other
psychoanalytic approaches would be useful for such analysis. For studying these
complex but interrelated psychoanalytic mechanisms, selecting a specific population,
professional classical musicians who started their education in early childhood could
provide broad insight. The reasons behind it are provided below under the titles: 1)
Language and Lalangue, 2) The Other and the Condensed, 3) Object Invocatory
Drive and Bodily Experiences, and 4) The Stage.

1.4.1. Language and Lalangue

First of all, (especially classical tonal) music includes elements such as
intervals, chords, and cadences that are written with specific rules and are transmitted
through generations, which make up sentences and a wide variety of expressions in
music and therefore have a certain effect on people (Kostka et al., 2013). It could be
useful to elaborate on the structure briefly. Notes are distinct, individual sounds that
have certain vibrations. The standard measure of a vibration that makes a sound is
called Hertz (Hz), where one Hz equals one vibration, or wave, in a second. A
parallel could be drawn to a semantic language such that a note could be regarded as
a parallel to a note in music. Two notes are denoted as an interval when they come
together sequentially or concurrently. An interval could be taken as a syllable in a
language. When three or more notes are of a certain distance, they are named as a
chord. A chord is an identifiable unit of harmony that is the constitution of a system
of notes, allowing specific tensions and resolutions to be possible. As such, a chord
could be regarded as a word in a language, and harmony could be considered
grammar.

Further, through the system of harmony, cadences mark punctuations in a
musical sentence, such that a particular type of cadence denotes a tension to arise,
some other denotes the end of such tension etc. These cadences could resemble punctuation marks in language, such as a question mark, exclamation mark, or a point. Furthermore, in terms of reading the function of a chord or a cadence, there is always an ambivalence; this could be regarded as the Lacanian concept of equivocality in language (Evans, 2006). Furthermore, other than this basic “linguistic” structure, a musical piece has broader structures, such as form, texture, etc., compared to literary forms in literature. Briefly explaining these qualities could be an elaboration of why music could be regarded as a language. Finally, as a semantic language goes through structural changes over time, music language also undergoes various structural changes over centuries.

On the other hand, since this language of music is more abstract than any other spoken language, it is also rich in the imaginary level in the sense that the semantic meaning it conveys would differ drastically for different individuals. Music in itself does not convey meaning as a semantic language does unless it contains extramusical connotations. In other words, as unconscious is, it is structured like a language, not like a specific language that conveys semantic meaning (Lacan, 1964/1998). In this regard, ambiguously and abstractly, music also resembles “lalangue,” a non-communicative aspect of a language that gives rise to a certain level of jouissance (Lacan, 1972-1973/1999). In this regard, music has the potential to function as a remindful and suggestive of something that lies beyond semantic understanding and even of something that remains outside of language or something that escapes in a semantic sense from language.

In light of the above discussion, music, as a language that is rich in its lalange properties, could be a fruitful source for dwelling on the unconscious material.

1.4.2. The Invocatory Drive and the Body

Further, music results from the invocatory drive, and the object is the voice or the sound. As demonstrated before, sound is regarded as one of the primary objects of subjective structuration: The infant makes sounds, cries, screams etc., and receives certain types of reaction from the Other. It is both a way of primordial expression and a proof of the Other’s presence. With this basis, the sound and music, which is a
systematized way of sound production, can be reminiscent of something long lost. As such, music has the potential to be the object of sublimation.

In order to illuminate such a function, some examples could be given. For instance, Polish composer F. Chopin wrote a piece (op.10 no.3) when he moved to Paris that he describes as the best melody he has ever written. In one of the classes where Chopin taught the piece, he exclaimed, “O, my fatherland!” (Eigeldinger, 1986). In another example, F. Chopin wrote a letter to a woman he loved saying, “I tell my piano the things I used to tell you (…) to unlock unsaid thoughts, the music I dream” (Trochimczyk, 2012). In these two examples, music and the instrument become an object communicating otherwise incommunicable and a consolation of something lost. These examples are thought to point to the organization of jouissance in a way that becomes suitable and adaptable for these individuals, in other words, be an object for sublimation.

1.4.3. The Professional Music Students

Furthermore, for classically trained professional musicians who start their education early in their lives (around five years old), music becomes a significant way of communication and their instruments a condensed and unique object (Gagua, Mutko Akça & Gençöz, 2019). Since they began their training very early and the training requires extensive investment (long hours, expensive materials), libidinal gravitation is directed towards that specific object and that source of communication. Also, since this extensive investment is mediated by a teacher, with whom a student trains excessively in a one-to-one manner, the teacher's role in the discourses of music students is prevalent.

In the mentioned study, a pianist said that becoming a pianist was always a dream of her mother; another pianist described how their parents were involved in their studies in childhood; another violinist narrated how their parents invested materially in their studies and shaped their lives accordingly (Gagua, Mutko Akça & Gençöz, 2019). This dynamic could be interpreted as demonstrative of a subject’s relationship to the Other: Thus, analysing the discourses of professional musicians concerning their teachers could provide a resourceful tool for studying a subject’s relationship to the Other.
1.4.4. The Stage

Lastly, during the training, classical musicians try to achieve perfection in their interpretation and dream of a perfect performance while on stage (Gagua, Mutko Akça & Gençöz, 2019). In a sense, perfection, while being in a condition where an observation or someone else’s gaze is present, could be regarded with the Lacanian mirror stage and the thrive for narcissistic jubilation.

In this direction, it is worth giving a quote from a famous classical pianist V. Horowitz, who cyclically abandons and returns to music several times for various reasons, about performing on stage “When I am on the stage, I feel I am a king. I have something to do; I have to bring the best which is in me” (Farrel & Spector, 2018). The importance of perfection, completeness, or wholeness concerning the stage is thought to be indicated in the quote, and such a dynamic associated with the stage could be a fruitful source of analysing mechanisms of the mirror stage and the Other’s gaze in a subject’s psyche.

1.4.5. The Aim of the Study

In light of the above-presented chain of progression, my research aim is to thoroughly analyse a subject’s relation to the Other by scrutinising individuals’ discourses about their experiences concerning a condensed object that is signed by a signifier. I intend to do so by analysing narrations of professional musicians about their experiences with music in general. By doing so, I intend to analyse subjects’ position in relation to their object and the Other; and various psychic mechanisms, such as defence mechanisms, symptoms, the three types of lack, Das Ding, sublimation, and la langue, that stem from the organisation of psyche. For this purpose, I have conducted detailed interviews with classically trained professional pianists and violinists who started their education at an early age and then analysed their narrations in the light of psychoanalytical literature.
CHAPTER 2

METHOD

2.1. The Background: Qualitative Research and the Narrative Analysis

For this study, qualitative research methodology was used. Qualitative research grounds itself on a relativist stance; it is acknowledged that there is no absolute truth, the reality is constructed, and there are as many realities as individuals (Scotland, 2012). It means that contrary to quantitative research, which is grounded on positivism and thus seeks absolute truth via eliminating subjectivity, in qualitative research researcher’s subjectivity and social position occupy a crucial part in the study’s outcome. In this manner, the researcher also participates in the study (Willig, 2013). This logic revolves around the idea that there could be no possibility of knowledge as such without the presence of the knower.

In qualitative research, the researcher takes the social constructivist stance, which focuses on the participants’ language while they convey their experiences and rejects the notion that a single objective truth could describe the experience (Willig, 2013). In this manner, the truths of each individual’s narration are considered unique. Thus, in qualitative research, rather than gathering numeric data, the aim is to understand the experiences of individuals in depth. In this sense, qualitative research is idiographic.

In this research, narrative analysis was used. The narrative analysis focuses on the participants’ stories (Grbich, 2007). The underlying presumption of the narrative analysis is that much communication between people is mediated through stories, and these narrations reveal individuals’ experiences, explanations, interpretations, priorities and expectations. Accordingly, people narrate stories about themselves and their surroundings in a constantly shaped and reshaped manner. Thus, in narrative analysis, the focus is not only on the content of the speech but the motivation behind the narration as well (Arkonaç, 2014). These narrations are
thought to be in the centre of social life since people are born into certain narratives and convey them as well.

To not limit the narrations of the participants, in narrative analysis, a generative narrative question was asked (Flick, 1998). In this manner, the aim was to go beyond the question-answer structure so that participants would limit their narrations. Thus, narrative analysis makes it possible to approach the interviewee more comprehensively (Flick, 1998).

There are phases of a narrative interview (Flick, 1998). First, a generative narrative question is asked. It is an extensive question encompassing the subject of study and generates a comprehensive narration. Second, specific narrative enquiries concerning the study subject are directed to the participants, and this step aims at detailing narrative fragments. Finally, after the generative question reaches to certain saturation, the interview ends with a coda when a participant reaches a specific coda with the feeling that they have nothing else to say on the subject matter.

To analyse narrative data, Polkinghorne’s analysis of narratives was used. Analysis of narratives is based on paradigmatic thinking in which a network of concepts is formulated based on common elements participants repeatedly use while constructing their experiences (Polkinghorne, 1995). The paradigmatic analysis of narratives can be conducted in two ways: Incorporating concepts derived from a previous theory or deriving concepts from the data inductively (Kim, 2016). For the purpose of this study, the first way of paradigmatic analysis is applied. Through incorporating Polkinghorne’s analysis of narratives, it would be possible to describe specific content of the data while emphasising the relationship among them, reveal the commonalities among the various data, and produce knowledge from particular components of the narrations.

2.2. Participants and the Sampling Method

In this research, the aim is to study the experiences or the narrations of the participants thoroughly. Purposive sampling is used for the study. The sample is homogenous in the sense that the participants are: (1) above 18 years old, (2) started their professional classical music education at an early age, and (3) have been playing the piano or the violin. Both undergraduate students and famous classical
musicians are included in the study so that a wide variety of narrations about the topic would be reached.

In the narrative analysis, the number of participants is not limited (Czarniawska, 1998). It is advised that the research can end when the study’s topic reaches a certain saturation level. Similarly, each interview ends when a participant has a sense that there is nothing more left to say (Flick, 1998). For the current study, one interview is conducted with each of the 11 participants.

All participants met the criteria: they were older than 18, started their professional classical music education early on, and played either the piano or the violin. The age range of the participants was between 29 and 48. Six of the participants were violinists, and five were pianists. Among the participants, the oldest onset age of professional music education was 12, and the youngest was 5. Two participants were soloists, two were academicians, five were orchestra players, and the remaining two were free-lancers. The demographic information of the participants is presented in Table 2. All of the participants are given pseudonyms to account for confidentiality.

### Table 2. Demographic Information of Participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code Name</th>
<th>Age and Gender</th>
<th>Profession</th>
<th>Application</th>
<th>Duration of Interview</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adile</td>
<td>29, Female</td>
<td>Musician, Violinist</td>
<td>Personal Contact, Purposive Sampling</td>
<td>72 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erkin</td>
<td>48, Male</td>
<td>Musician, Pianist</td>
<td>Personal Contact, Purposive Sampling</td>
<td>62 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Güven</td>
<td>36, Male</td>
<td>Musician, Pianist</td>
<td>Personal Contact, Purposive Sampling</td>
<td>48 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Damla</td>
<td>35, Female</td>
<td>Musician, Violinist</td>
<td>Personal Contact, Purposive Sampling</td>
<td>39 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kemal</td>
<td>31, Male</td>
<td>Musician, Violinist</td>
<td>Personal Contact, Purposive Sampling</td>
<td>46 minutes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.3. Procedure

Ethical approval was taken from Middle East Technical University (METU) Human Research Ethics Committee for the current study.

The data was collected through a total of 11 interviews. For the study, the data was obtained via online interviews. Even though the researcher and the participants were in the same city in some instances, the online platform was still preferable due to the regulations and restrictions of the Covid-19 pandemic. The participants were recruited via personal contact and social media announcements. All of the interviews were conducted in Turkish: 9 participants were residing in different cities in Turkey, one in England, and another in Holland.

All of the participants were notified about the research and audio recording, and their informed consent was orally obtained at the beginning of the recordings. They were notified about confidentiality and the nature of voluntary participation, meaning that they could end the interview at any point without being obliged to provide an explanation. After this procedure, the generative narrative question was aligned with the narrative analysis, and later narrative enquiries were tailored (Appendix A).
The duration range of the interviews was between 35 and 72 minutes. Each interview was terminated when the participants had a sense of “I have nothing else to add”. The interviews were audio recorded and then transcribed verbatim.

2.4. Data Analysis

In order to thoroughly analyse the experiences of professionally trained classical musicians, a generative narrative question was asked in interviews:

"I would like you to tell me about your relationship with your instrument and music. Please feel free to tell from the beginning and in detail."

The question in Turkish would be:
“Sizden enstrümanınız ve müzikle olan ilişkinizi anlatmanızı istiyorum. Müziğin hayatınızda rolünü en baştan itibaren tüm ayrıntılarıyla anlatabilirsiniz.”

Narrative enquiries were asked to elaborate on the speech in alignment with narrative analysis. These narrative enquiries were tailored depending on the participants' narrations during the interview. Examples of possible narrative enquiries are listed below.

- Relationship with instrument teachers
- Experiences of stage
- Experiences during preparation
- Distinctive pieces
- Particular composers
- Feelings and thoughts associated with sounds
- Stories behind certain pieces and their associations
- Practice routines
- Favourite pieces in details (chords, intervals etc.)
- Praxis of technique
- Requires investment (time, material, social etc.)
- Wishes related to music/instrument about future
- Self-related dreams/plans about music/instrument
- Experiences related to pain or suffering in relation to music
- Most joyful moments related to music
The interviews of this paper were audio recorded and verbatim transcribed, and the analyses were conducted in alignment with the guidelines of Polkinghorne’s analysis of narratives (Polkinghorne, 1995; Kim, 2016). In this analysis, common elements of participants’ narrations were aggregated, and a network of concepts was formulated by incorporating each interview. The analysis procedure involved an iterative process, meaning that aggregated networks of concepts were adjusted inclusively after the incorporation of each interview. The research culminated when the study topic reached a certain saturation level meaning that the researcher thought that no further novice information was stemming from the study material concerning the topic.

2.5. Trustworthiness of the Study

Since qualitative research also acknowledges the researcher as a participant in the study, it is crucial to address the trustworthiness of a qualitative study (Willig, 2013). The researcher in qualitative research is involved in every step of the study (Finlay, 2002). Each individual inevitably occupies a particular social position that has an indispensable effect on the study topic: The same question asked by different researchers would lead to different answers since every individual occupies a specific social position, which invariably affects the relationship between people.

For the study’s trustworthiness, the qualitative researcher must have specific awareness about their involvement in the study (Finlay, 2002). In this manner, it is crucial for the researcher to understand and discuss their position concerning the study. The trustworthiness of qualitative research allows readers to gain a clearer vision and understanding of a researcher’s participation in the subject of study.

There are various ways of adopting reflexivity in a qualitative study. A researcher can employ bracketing by temporarily putting one’s certain aspects of subjectivity in parenthesis to gain a clearer vision (Fisher, 2009). Bracketing has two forms: (1) bracketing in relation to data means temporarily setting aside the researcher’s assumptions, and (2) bracketing of evolving findings means itinerantly revisiting the data and gaining evolving comprehension of the research topic. This approach does not assume getting an objective position in a void concerning subject:
It means suspending understanding to make room for participants’ unique stances to emerge.

For reflexivity, discussing data and findings with advisors and colleagues and keeping a diary are also advised (Fischer, 2009; Willig, 2013). In this research, there have been discussions regarding the research topic, question, findings, and process with my thesis advisor, thesis committee, clinicians and academicians with a broad understanding of the qualitative approach. Furthermore, concerning data collection, clinical experience was handy in terms of bracketing experience. Furthermore, in every research process, I kept a diary: During data collection, data analysis, formulation of results etc., to gain a clearer understanding of my involvement.

Also, during the research process, the research questions and data analysis have been discussed with peers consisting of doctoral students, clinical psychologists, and academicians with extensive experience in conducting qualitative studies. In the reflexive diary that I kept since the beginning of the research process to detect my own experiences, feelings, and thoughts about which I talked with my supervisors when needed. Taking notes after each interview also helped me to work on the research question and narrative inquiries and add new ones if a new concept came up with that participant.

I am myself a classically trained pianist who started studying extensively at an early age. I dropped out of the conservatory and then studied psychology. I am a psychoanalytically oriented psychotherapist with seven years of experience, a doctoral student at Middle East Technical University and a professional pianist. Both of my parents are classical musicians, and until I started studying psychology, my whole environment and life consisted of music. After ten years of professional interval, I returned to the conservatoire to pursue a second career in music.

Throughout the research, I felt both familiarity and curiosity. After the interviews, specific phrases kept circling my head, and I was amazed by certain expressions of experiences. I thought much about this amazement since it must stem from its resonance with me. Moreover, I realized that particular narrations surprised me because they exceeded my expectation about the depth of information I could get in the interviews. In this sense, my curiosity about the study had increased.
Further, during the initial analysis, I struggled to organize them because the material seemed very interrelated. The more interviews I conducted, the more difficult it became for me to categorize and organize them. Almost all the time, it felt like there were overlapping experiences throughout the categorization. I constantly thought that I could reorganize them or include more data from the transcriptions and search for a more suitable narrative data analysis method. In this regard, various shifts were made in categorization in the process of writing.

While conducting the study, I also felt that this topic makes it possible to study psychoanalytic concepts. Professional musicians who started their extensive studies at an early age have a condensed relationship with their instruments. Their instrument teachers become significant people in their lives since the lessons are on a one-to-one basis, and due to music becoming a passionate mutual object, the stage experience also becomes a condensed one as it is the place to demonstrate all the hard work and be in the centre of gaze, music as an object itself including speech-like aspects and also has a language, and the bodily aspect of being an instrumentalist etc. All of these aspects, in my opinion, create the object to be condensed and allow closer inspection of the Other’s role, mirror stage, jubilation, frustration, castration etc., for a subject. In this manner, I sense that the study’s subject is a good match for psychoanalytic reasoning.

Finally, I was both an insider and an outsider for the participants. The role of being an insider might have manifested itself in narrations where specific processes of practising, technical details, and profession-related terms were portrayed in a manner where they assumed that I knew them automatically, not providing elaborations on them. Further, this inclusion, I think, also manifested itself when participants used inclusive speech such as “like all of us experience” or “you know”. Furthermore, the effect of me being a clinical psychologist on the interviews might have materialized in some participants’ narrating their dreams and difficulties. Being both a clinical psychologist and a musician could have met with resistance or willingness to elaborate more. Still, at this point, there is no concrete ground to discuss such an effect.
CHAPTER 3

RESULTS

At the end of the data analysis, common elements of data were grouped in alignment with the Polkinghorne’s (1995) analysis of narratives. The elements are: (1) They Were Always There, (2) Encounter, (3) That Precious Other, (4) The Dark Side / The Object That Takes It All, and (5) The Reward / The Object That Gives You All. These sections and subsections are provided in Table 3.

In the following section, quotations are first provided in English, then in Turkish.

Table 3. Table of Sections and Subsections

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1) They Were Always There</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) As Long as I Remember</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) As Long as I Was Made to Remember</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Encounter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Contesting the Imagination / Frustration and Privation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Confronting the Reality / Frustration and Castration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) That Precious Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) One Who Makes It All Possible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) One Who Thwarts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) The Dark Side / The Object That Takes It All</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) One Cannot Not Practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) (Passive) Resistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Encapsulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Going Back and Forth / Fort Da</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e) Uncanny Me: What Will Leak from Me on the Stage?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3. (continued)

5) The Reward / The Object That Gives You All
   a) Passionate Devotion
   b) Jubilation
   c) Shining and Sharing / The Stage
   d) Universal Unification
   e) Lalangue and the Body

3.1. They Were Always There

   This title indicates participants’ narrations about music and their instruments to be involved in their lives for as long as their memoirs go back. It is important to note that this object is characterised to be inseparable from their personal recollection of life. For this reason, the title is formulated as “They Were Always There”. In the study, this title has two subtitles: a) “As Long as I Remember” and b) “As Long as I Was Made to Remember”.

   a) As Long as I Remember

   Participants’ statements about the object being always in their lives are included in this subsection. In alignment with the descriptions, it was named “As Long as I Remember” and originally stated as “kendimi bildim bileli”.

   When directed with the generative narrative question, the most common starting clause emphasised music and their instruments being present in their lives for as long as they remember; this phenomenon could indicate the object’s inseparability of participants’ descriptions/narrations of their history and subjectivity. The object is narrated to be always present in their lives:

   (Damla) music is there as long as I remember I do not know other way around

   Original
   (Damla) müzik bildim bileli orada olan bi şey benim için başka türlü bi şey galiba bilmiyorum
(Yaren) in fact I always loved to sing I even sung in a loud rolling manner in a minibus vehicle

Original
(Yaren) zaten şarkı söyleyemeyi hep çok severdim kendimi bildim bileli dolmuşta bile giderken bağıra bağıra şarkı söylerdim

In the following example, Nilay described music to be a way of connecting to “life”. She illustrated each sound as music and exemplified the sounds of birds, the speech of a family etc. In this quotation, it is vital to how the participant placed music as having a central role in life in her narrative.

(Nilay) actually each sound is music our family’s speech birds’ chirping sounds of nature from the moment of our birth we are nested with music for me relationship with music resembles relationship with life

Original
(Nilay) her türlü ses müzik aslında içeride ailemizin konuşmaları kuş sesleri doğada olan sesler doğduğumuz andan itibaren aslında muzikle iç içe olyoruz müzikle olan bağ biraz hayatla olan bağ gibi benim için

Below in the excerpt, Esra also emphasises that music is to be there as long as she remembers. She describes how the music made her feel even when she was very little. Here, the word “soul to overflow” (ruhumun taşıdığını hissederdim) depicts the intensity of her experience and emphasis it in the narration as well.

(Esra) I think music was always in my life even when I was a very little even before playing any instrument music that I have listened (…) cartoon music like I had felt my soul to overflow

Original
(Esra) müzik bence benim hayatında hep vardı çok küçükken de dinlediğim hani daha enstrupanı çalıdakan dinlediğim her müzıkte (...) çizgi film müziklerinde hani böyle bütün ruhumun taşıdığını hissederdim gerçekten

While stressing music to be his primary orientation in life from early on, one of the participants also points out the necessity to be so. Kemal emphasises how music should be introduced in a person’s life from very early if one is to pursue music as a profession. While describing their relationship to music, it is interesting
that it also feels the need to emphasise “from very early on” necessity in their narration.

(Kemal) music of course is (…) a way of life my perspective to life since very young age (…) in order to acquire music as a profession one must begin at a very early age so that both physical adaptation and broader conceptualization could be possible (…) one must begin very very early for their joints to be adjusted um for entering into music in general

Original
(Kemal) tabii ki (…) bir hayat biçimi hayata bakış açıım çok küçük yaşlardan itibaren (…) müziği meslek edinmek için çok küçük yaşta başlamak gerekiyor hem fiziksel açıdan ona uyum sağlamak hem de kapsamlı bir şekilde kavrayabilmek için (…) çok çok küçük yaşlarda başlamak gerekiyor eklemeler açısından (…) müziği müziğe giriş açısından

Meriç also emphasized how “hard” it is to have a profession in which education starts from early on and requires stability throughout adulthood as well. After emphasizing its difficulty, she ends this section of narration as being “nevertheless” very lucky.

(Meriç) so elementary school we enrolled in conservatoire in the beginning of the middle school throughout high school and university our is unique in this manner since the very first day until the end I always knew how hard it is and how much stability it requires nevertheless I always enjoyed and said how fortunate I am to have music as my profession

Original
(Meriç) yani ilkokul biz konservatuvara orta 1de başladık lise üniversite boyunca mesleğini okuyan yegane meslek gruplarıyz daha ilk günden son güne kadar ne kadar zor olduğunun ve istikrarı olması gerektiğiinin bilincinde olsun da her zaman keyif aldığım ve her gün iyi ki dedim meslek müzik benim için

b) As Long as I was Made to Remember

In this subsection, narrations also include starting music education early on; however, participants emphasised that this should not be their choice. Unlike quotations mentioned in the above section, these narrations emphasise their passive role and not their subjective experiences about music and their instruments.
In the following quotation, Güliz, who no longer practices as a professional pianist, stresses her mother’s role in both encountering music and switching to professional education. She also emphasises not being at an appropriate age to make such a career decision. In this narration or the reconstruction of history, the participant lays weight on the decision outside her will and puts herself in a passive position.

(Güliz) I started music with the piano when I was 5-6 years old via my mother first I studied with my mom I mean my mother was first person to teach me the piano (…) I do not know how aware or considerate I was it was her wish or forwarding for me to enter the examination anyway (…) I was not at an age to make such decisions for myself

Original
(Güliz) piyano ile müziğe başladım 5-6 yaşında başladım annem aracılığıyla başladım önce kısa bir süre annemle çalıştım yani annem bana piyanoyu öğreten ilk kişişiydi (…) ne kadar farkındaydım veya önemsiyordum bunları bilmiyorum o sınava da annemin istediğile ya da annemin yönlendirmesiydi o sınava girmek zaten (…) çok fazla kendim karar verebilecek bu konularda bi yaşta değildim

Yaren, who criticizes the educational system in the conservatoire and describes negative first memoirs with her instrument teacher, also emphasizes beginning the music career without choosing it herself. She also generalized this position by saying “no child at that age has any awareness or resolution” (yani sonuç olarak o yaştaki çocuğun hiçbir farkındalığı ben bünü istiyorum gibi bi emin olduğu durum yok). She also made a sequential specification of her teacher being very disciplined and her being a timid introvert child.

(Yaren) I didn’t start playing the piano consciously I was 9 years old an older relative suggested for me to take a music course (…) incidentally I entered the examination (…) from the middle school on somehow I entered into this profession however eventually no child at that age has any awareness or resolution such as yes I want this then we began working with my instrument teacher who was a very disciplined one and I remember I was a timid child an introvert child a child with low self-esteem

Original
(Yaren) ya ben piyanoya bilinçli başlamadım piyano çalmaya başladığım zaman 9 yaşında bir aile büyüğüymüz (…) bi içte kursa götüyüor beni
Another participant, Hande, who describes starting her musical education via her father’s force, states that musical education for her to be very difficult. It is here noteworthy how she consequently describes beginning being not her choice but the force of the father and then experiencing tough times in school.

(Hande) my relationship with music started at a very age with a little bit of my father’s force at first I did not understand anything about the music when I first began the conservatoire was very hard for me

Original
(Hande) müziğle ilişkim çok küçük yaşlarda başladı hatta babamın biraz zoruya başlamıştı ilk başta müzikin m sinden hiçbir şey anlamıyorum okula başladığım zaman konservatuvara çok zordu benim için

Another participant, Meriç, also stresses that entering the music profession should not be her choice. It is interesting how she uses passive language when describing how she started her career with using words such as “brought to conservatoire” (konservatuvara getirilmiş) and “was made to acquire as a profession” (meslek edindirilmiş) but then just after when describing it to be a right choice uses active language by “I chose the correct thing by accident” (kazara doğru şeyi seçmişim).

(Meriç) it is my subjective story but music was not my choice of profession I am a person who purely was discovered in a talent examination brought to conservatoire and was made to acquire it as a profession I did not choose this profession which is conducted fondly by everyone but as I always say I chose the correct thing by accident

Original
(Meriç) öznel bi hikayemdir ama müzik benim seçmiş olduğum bi meslek dali değildir tamamen bi yetenek sınavı kapsamında keşfedilip konservatuvara getirilmiş ve meslek edindirilmiş bi insanım ben herkesin çok severek yaptığı mesleği aslında ben kendi tercihimle seçmedim ama kazara hep öyle derim kazara doğru şeyi seçmişim diye
3.2. Encounter

In this section, narrations about two types of encounters are established. Participants’ narrations about their encounters with others or perceptions outside the world are included in this title. Two main distinctions are made in this study in relation to the section: a) Contesting the Imagination / Frustration and Privation and b) Confronting the Reality / Frustration and Castration.

a) Contesting the Imagination / Frustration and Privation

The first type of encounter, titled “Contesting the Imagination / Frustration and Privation”, includes experiences of encounters where one’s imagination or perception of a wholesome image is shattered and includes descriptions of frustration accordingly. Moreover, experiences narrated in this section are not stories where one is taking account of their positions and shifting accordingly. Thus, the accounts in this subsection include experiences of disappointments and functions of these narrations through language usage.

The first two quotations include expectations about the conservatoire environment directly. However, both statements include participants’ shattered images of themselves in a less direct manner. Moreover, participants’ feelings of not meeting the expectation or criteria of the conservatoire are also thought to be suggested.

(Damla) I suppose I came across with a much more disciplined atmosphere than I expected (…) I guess at that age I had a thing about it being more beer and skittles (…) that we would play have fun whereas it is a much more disciplined thing (…) even the cat would run away from me due to me playing creakily I remember clearly it being a very big disappointment for me

Original
(Damla) ya zannedersem beklemediğim kadar disiplinli bi ortamla karşılaştım (…) böyle laylaylay geçecek gibi bi şeyim vardı anlaşılan o yaşta (…) çalıcaz eğlenicex filan halbuki çok daha disiplinli bi şey (…) kedi bile kaçıyordu benden yani gacır gicur ses çıktığı için onu çok net hatırlıyorum yani çok büyük bi hayal kırıklığıydı benim için

In the above quotation, where Damla talked about the conservatoire being disciplined, she also described a cat running away because she made a “creaky”
(gacır gucur) voice. It could indicate how she perceives herself in relation to her encounter with the “conservatoire atmosphere”.

(Esra) I was excited about the idea of conservatoire we would have free clothes setting full of music maybe even dancers (…) however it was not like TV series (…) in the series there was a beer and skittles image but it turned out to be different requiring very big labour very long hours was to put in and that teachers do not get happy easily (…) at that moment I grew away from the piano since responsibility was too burdensome when compared to my joy

Original
(Esra) konservatuar fikrine çok sıcakım gidicez serbest kıyafet giyicez müzikli ortam olucak dansçalar belki olucak (…) hani geçtikten sonra pek dizi gibi olmamı ama (…) şöyle tabii ki dizide daha laylaylom görünen bi görüntü var hiç öyle olmadı bu işin çok uzun emek istediği çok uzun saatler verilmesi gerektiğini ve hocalarımızın öyle kolay kolay mutlu olmadığı (…) o arada tabii ki piyanodan soğudum çünkü sorumluluğum keyifimden ağır geldi

Above, Esra talks about the conservatoire environment as well, and she said, “Teachers do not get happy easily” (hocalarımızın öyle kolay kolay mutlu olmadığını) prior to accounting for her growing away from the piano. It could indicate that in this narration of the encounter that results in her growing away from the piano, discipline is culminated and associated with teachers’ expectations and disappointments.

Kemal described his experience of encountering his peers’ performance in a conservatoire below. He narrated his perception of himself as “one of any” (her kişiden biri) where he lacks a feature that would make him a particular.

(Kemal) when you go there you become one of any you need to find a feature to make yourself a particular for this you need to work a lot

Original
(Kemal) oraya gittiğiniz zaman aslında her kişiden biri oluyorsunuz sizi ayırt edecek bir özellik bulmanız gerekiyor çok çalışmanız gerekiyor

In the following excerpt, Yaren talks about some of her peers receiving special treatment that was denied to her and, as a result experiencing disappointment. Here, it is essential to note that she uses passive expressions such as “forbidden for them” (yasak olmadiğimi) and “were provided with unlimited opportunities” (sinirsız
imkan tanındığını) for actually denoting part that was responsible for the unfairness. Thus, the agent to whom these expressions are passively directed is responsible for her disappointing experience in the direction even though the language is passive.

(Yaren) 3 prodigy children were brought one of them was in my class it was very weird for me how unfair was everything because they were seen as geniuses nothing was forbidden for them and were provided with unlimited opportunities including exemption from classes I was truly disappointed

Original
(Yaren) 3 tane harika çocuk getirilmişti birisi de bizim sınıftaydı bana şey çok garip geldişi her şeyin ne kadar adaletsiz olduğu için onların dahe görüldüğü için ona yasak olmadığı ve ona sınırsız imkan tanındığını hiçbir derslere girmek zorunda olmadığı orada hakkaten çok hayal kırıklığına uğradım

In the following quotation, Güliz once dreamed of becoming a concert pianist due to the dream being “pumped” (pompaladiği) by the conservatoire system. While her past dreams are narrated to be provided by outside, she also emphasizes that the dreams were pretty standard for a conservatoire student, and later she describes abandoning those dreams due to being unrealistic. She described this perception of dreams being unrealistic and shaped in the process of unsuccessful performances. It is interesting how she placed dreams she had outside of her subjectivity in the sphere of the system and described them as the only types of dream possible to have in the conservatoire. In this narration, the only possibility provided to a student is unrealistic. In this manner, in this narration, this passive language usage could be interpreted as blame put towards the system in which the subject is only given an unrealistic promise which is not kept later. Thus the system narrated here deceives.

(Güliz) when I was in the conservatoire I had pretty standard dreams about music very typical in the sense that every conservatoire student has it like winning a competition attending to a good school being studying with a good teacher etc. so being successful so being a star and these are the dreams pumped by conservatoire’s educational system I mean these are only dreams presented to a student (…) after finishing the school I noticed those to be unrealistic I mean being a concert pianist was no longer my reality and I was already directed to a different field (…) being a concert pianist was truly a dream only (…) (this realization happened with) not a particular event but the fears and worries I had playing in an exam or a concert (…) unsuccessful
experiences such as not receiving a degree in a competition or not performing well

Original
(Güliz) konservatuvarında olduğum zamanlarda (...) hayallerim yani piyanoyla ilgili müzıkle ilgili hayallerim çok standart şu açıdan standart her konservatuvar öğrencisinin sahip olduğu hayaller işte yarışma kazanmak işte iyi bi okula gitmek iyi bi iyi bi hocayla çalışmak vs vs yani işte başarılı olmak yani bi star olmak fahal ki bu da ordaki eğitim sisteminin pompaladığı bi şey yani öğrenciye sunulan tek hayal (...) işte okul bittikten sonra işte çok gerçekçi olmadığını fark ettim yani işte konser piyanisti olmak işte işte işte o anki konser piyanisti olabilecek yani şeydi gerçekten bi bi çok şey yani hayaldi (hayal olduğu anlamak) tek bi event değil bu işte yaşadığım korkular endişeler sınavda çalmak konserde çalmak (...) başarısızlıklar işte işte yavaş maya girip orda değil bi derece almamak veya güzel bi performans sergileyememek gibi

In the below, Nilay describes the general fear effect that she had due to multiple encounters with the conservatoire environment. It is noteworthy how she generalizes these negative experiences to all musicians while narrating.

(Nilay) unfortunately the conservatoire environment wears us all off these resulted as negative feelings in unconsciousness of us all for instance I had dreams about the instrument changing shape the violin shrinks all of a sudden fears come to front line (...) irrational dreams about going to a stage last minute with no memorization etc. I thinks these are common experiences of all musicians

Original
(Nilay) maalesef konservatuvar ortamı hepimizin yıprandığı bir ortam onlar bilinçaltına bir şekilde olumsuz duygular olarak yansıdı hepimizde olduğu gibi u enstrümanın şekil değiştirmesiyle ilgili rüyalar örneğin tezahür ediyor bende birden biri gürülüyor keman rüyamda farklı şekiller alıyor kırmızı olarak görüyorum hani konsere girmek ön planda çıkıyor (...) irrasyonel rüyaları işte son daki kada konsere çıkamam lazım ama ezberim yok fahal hani tüm müzisyenlerin sanırım ortak deneyimleri bunlar

b) Confronting the Reality / Frustration and Castration

The second type of encounter is named “Confronting the Reality / Frustration and Castration”. This type of encounter includes experiences where one is confronted with their inadequacies by some form of encounter with another or a situation. In these encounters, even if one is expected to go through difficult experiences such as
working long hours etc., participants described experiencing a positive turning point in their lives. Interestingly, in contrast to encounters described in the previous subsection, here experiences are narrated in active language and embracing subjectivity where consequences of actions are attributed to themselves.

Below, Damla describes her instrument teacher’s speech to her, where the teacher confronts her about not practising and gives options to either just graduate from high school and then pursue another path or invest in her studies in music. Damla describes this speech as a turning point followed by intense work and starting to love music again.

(Damla) it changed everything I remember again I was not minding lessons and one day she (instrument teacher) sat with me and said I see you (…) of course you have talent and all but I see that you aren’t taking it seriously (…) I am endeavouring as well (…) if you do not wish to go on (…) then we’ll just try to graduate you but if you say that you want it you need to practice properly (…) this speech was a turning point for me (…) and I remember that period to be a camp (…) coming to school at 8am practising until 10:50 pm bus (…) then I started loving again

Original
(Damla) bütün her şeyi değiştiren o oldu aslında yani şeyi hatırlıyorum yine böyle sallamadığımı dersleri filan ve bi gün çok net oturdu benle konuştu dedi ki ben görüyorum senin (…) tabii ki yeteneğin var şu var bu var ama hani üstünde hiç durmadığını görüyorum (…) ben de çok çabaliyorum (…) eğer dedi sen devam etmek istemiyorsan (…) seni sadece mezun etmeye uğraşılm ama yok istiyorum diyorsan doğru düzgün çalışan lazım (…) konuşma bende böyle bi milat gibi oldu (…) ve o dönemi şey hatırlıyorum kamp (…) sabah 8de okula gel ondan sonra akşam 10:50 servisine kadar çalış (…) sonra sevmeye tekrar başladı

Another participant, Esra, describes her relationship with the piano as evolving into a question-and-answer dialogue through her instrument teacher. Here, she emphasizes that even though the process was burdensome, it was made possible by a teacher who wanted to transfer everything he had to the student.

(Esra) he taught me how the piano will respond to you when you touch it I mean he made me to form a relationship with the piano (…) we started to have question-answer relationship thanks to the teacher but the process was quite challenging it was not psychologically easy in masters to be scolded and running out cryingly from the lesson but I experienced this via a teacher who
was transferring everything he has with his whole soul with whole body at a
cost of depleting himself who wanted to give me all he has intravenously

(Original)

(Original) piyanoya dokunduğun zaman onun sana nasıl cevap verdiğini yani
piyanoya ilişkide bana (...) biz onunla doğal bir soru-cevap ilişkisine
girmeye başladık bu hoca sayesinde o da çok zorlu bir süreç masterda
azarlar yiyp ağlayarak dersten çıkmak kolay değil psikolojik olarak
değildi ama bütün ruhuyla bedeniyle bana kendisindekini tamamen aktaran
ve bunu kendini bitirme pahasına içindekini bana damardan vermeyi isteyen
bi hoca sayesinde deneyimledim

Both narrations mentioned above describe a turning point experience
regarding music. In both descriptions, the process required challenging experiences
but was made possible by their teacher’s effort and initiative.

Below, Hande also described a turning point in her relationship with music
and her instrument. Hande, who started her musical professional education via her
father’s “force” (zoruyla), stated that musical education was hard for her initially and
that she was practising mainly with her father’s initiation. However, she narrated that
at one point when she was in the 6th grade, she failed an ear training class and had to
take a make-up examination and that this experience shifted her entire relationship
with music via her studying on her own very hard and later receiving a high grade.
She narrated this event to increase her self-confidence since she managed to do it
independently, made her believe in herself and restored her relationship with music.
In this narration, it could be said that this negative encounter of failing a class where
all of her peers had passed initiated a process within her, made her study very hard
and later led her to take a more subjective stance in relation to music as she was
previously studying due to his father but then by her own.

(Hande) grades were announced in June and I was to take make up exam at
that moment I had a few experiences first I could not make my family happy I
failed classes second my friends are ahead of me I am less talented or have
trouble in comprehension it cannot be true maybe I can fix it I became
ambitious frankly (...) I passed with scores of 99 and something like 98
instead of failing with 60 previously and no jury member believed it (...) in
1.5 month how did you improve this much and then music was easier for me
in every respect it was a turning point actually (...) up until the 6th grade it
was my father’s force but then I had to take the make-up exam like slap in the
face (...) later on I thought if I can achieve this on my own and as a result
experience such joy there must be something and later yes I started to love music

Original
(Hande) haziranda notlar açıklandı ve bütünlemeye kaldığımı gördüm o anda yaşadığım birkaç şey vardı bir ailemi mutlu edemedim derslerden kaldığım düşüncesi iki arkadaşlarının benenden daha ileride ben daha yetenekszim ya da anlaşma konusunda sıkıntı çekiyorum neden bu böyle bir şey olamaz düzeltelim belki bir hırsına bırakıyorum böyle (...) baya 60 la kaldığım notlardan bir tanesinden 99 bi tanesinden 98le mi ne geçmiştim ve hiçbir jüri üyesi inanmadı buna (...) 1,5 ay boyunca uı nası gelişirdirin kendini bu kadar diye ondan sonra da müzik hayatı her türlü daha rahat benim için dönüm noktası diyebilirim açıktırı (...) 6. sınıfa kadar bu bana zorlamasına gözyinde sonra bütünlemeye kalıyoruz resmen tokat yemmiş gibi oldum (...) ondan sonrasında şey olduğum ben bu bunu tek başına başarabiliyorsam ve başarmaktan bu kadar mutluluk duyuyorsam burda kesin bi şey var diyip böyle etvet müziği sevmeye başladım

Below, another participant, Meriç portrays the process and sequence of learning to produce correct sounds from her instrument, playing the piece as it is written in notes by the composer and putting forward her self-expression to the piece only after taking these steps. The first process, learning how to produce the correct sounds, takes long years to achieve, then learning the correct style of the piece etc. These are the processes that require extended periods of practising and many lessons. Interestingly, only after such labour can she “step in” (devreye girmek) and place her own expressions into the work.

(Meriç) we were taught to produce accurate and clean and punctual sound after all of these are achieved aesthetics and beauty the correct way of the correct note emerges already then I step in first goal is to produce what is there we are laborers actually first that beautiful work of art that composition of that mind of that person’s heart is to be put in me my instrument my effort and labour should be put in only after that I can step in

Original
(Meriç) bize o sesi doğru ve temiz ve zamanında çıkarmamız gerektiği öğretiyor bunların hepsi sağlandıktan sonra ortaya zaten estetik ve güzel o işin doğrusu o notun doğrusu çıkıyor ondan sonra ben geliyorum devreye ilk amacımız olanı çıkarabilmek içiyiz aslında önce o güzel sanat eseri o beste o zihinden çıkmış olan kişinin kalbinden zihinden çıkmış olan şeyi ben kendimden enstrümanından çıkarmaya uğraşıp emek verdikten sonra ben devreye girebiliyorum
3.3. That Precious Other

In this section, participants’ narrations about their instrument teachers are portrayed. In the narrations of all participants, their instrument teachers occupied gravitational positions about their relationship with music, either constructively or destructively. In alignment, this title includes two subsections: a) One Who Makes It All Possible and b) One Who Thwarts.

a) One Who Makes It All Possible

The first type of portrayal of the teacher is titled “One Who Makes It All Possible”. Participants’ narrations included their instrument teacher having a central role in widespread aspects of their story with music: instrument choice, motivation to practice, relationship with the instrument, stage experiences etc. Here, teachers’ contributions are narrated positively with strong adjectives.

Below, Kemal describes how his “love for violin” (keman aşkım) began. While illustrating the process of choosing instruments in the conservatoire, he portrays a teacher’s role and quotes the teacher’s statement about making him a violinist. Here, he uses terms such as catching eyes and, in the quotation, uses expressions such as must and making a violinist, thus, placing the role of the teacher in his subjectivity. In the narration, such an encounter is directly related to his falling in love with the violin.

(Kemal) my love for violin (…) I met a dear teacher after enrolling into the conservatoire the teacher was much much older but at that moment we caught each other’s eye (…) which instrument you are physically suitable for is checked by many teachers (…) violin the teacher said you see you must play the violin come let’s make you a violinist

Original
(Kemal) keman aşkım (…) konservatuara girdikten sonra da çok değerli bir hocayla tanıştım kendisi yaşça çok büyük斧 fakat o böyle hani o an göz göze geldik (…) fiziken hangi enstrümana uygun olduğunuz birçok hoca tarafından kontrol ediliyor (…) keman işle senin keman çalmanız lazım gel seni kemancı yapalm dedi

Esra, beneath, narrates how her relationship with the instrument changed drastically with the role of her teacher. She describes a transition from playing it out
of “duty” (görev) to “love” (aşk). She emphasizes the efforts put forward by her teacher.

(Esra) up until my teacher taught me how an extraordinary thing is the piano and taught me how wrong I was approaching to it and taught me how whole technique musicality and everything should be it was like a duty but then I really fell in love with the piano and that is when I really hugged the piano for the first time

Original
(Esra) hocam bana bu piyanonun ne kadar olağan üstü bi şey ve nası yanlış yaklaştığımı öğretip de bütün tekniniğini müzikalitemi her şeyi nası düşünmem gerektiğini öğretinceye kadar görev gibi gitti ondan sonra piyanoya geçeniken aşık oldum ve ül ilk defa o zaman gerçek anlamda sarıldım piyanoya

Below, Nilay described how much she loved practising the violin. She emphasized that even though sort of practising was unusual for generally her age, it was like “life” (hayat) in itself for her. She accentuated her teacher’s role in terms of her loving the practice so much. Via practising the same hours, she said feeling like having a “master-apprentice” (usta çırak) relationship and that exemplifying him was a source of motivation. In this description, one could think that Nilay parallels her narration and points to her identification with the teacher.

(Nilay) for me it was like living itself that is how much I loved practising the violin I would practice 6-8 hours a day by giving breaks such as taking a walk or drink a cup of tea reading a book for me actually for people in my age for a teenager it is very unusual but mmm for me it was life in itself I loved practicing the violin very much and of course my teacher’s role is big here as well (...) practicing at same hours with him was like master-apprentice like as if I was taking an example of him was a big source of motivation for me

Original
(Nilay) benim için aslında yaşamakla bir olurdu o kadar çok severdim keman çalışmayı 6-8 saat çalışırdımgründe o arada yaptığım bir yürüşü ya da çay molası bi kitap okuyarak benim için aslında yaşatımlarına çok ters bir ergen için çok ters bir durum oluşturmuyordu ama ül hayatın ta kendisi olurdu çalışmayı çok severdim tabii ki hocamin etkisi büyük burada da (...) aynı saatlerde onunla çalışıyor olmak hani usta çırak gibi bir nevi hani onu örnekliyor olmak çok bir motivasyon olurdu benim için
Yaren describes how her motivation towards the instrument changed with the teacher’s influence. With the teacher’s support, she narrates developing self-confidence towards her abilities. It is of note that this support made her feel like “the best pianist” (en iyi pianist) even though she was “unable to play” (çalamayan halimle). In this emphasis, it is thought that the described support of the teacher played a sort of recognition role in her narration.

(Yaren) (the teacher) when explaining a piece the approach was very different the wine and food of the era and was so very supportive I would feel like the best pianist even though I was not able to play it and it would give me motivation for studying (…) this time I started to feel like hmm I can do some stuff

Original
(Yaren) (hoca) bi eseri anlatırken yani o dönemin kültüründen şarabına yemeğine çok farklı yaklaştırdı her şeye ve o kadar destekleyici bi hali vardı ki ben o piyano çalamayan halimle en iyi piyanist gibi hissetdim ve bu bana çalışma motivasyonu verirdi (…) bu sefer aa ben bi şeyleri yapabiliyorum gibi hissetmeye başlamışım

Moreover, below, Güven describes how his confidence on stage grew concerning being recognized as one of his teacher's “good students” (iyi öğrencileri). It is interesting how this recognition is capable of diminishing anxiousness on the stage.

(Güven) I was getting excited in all of those class concerts (…) well I started to get used to it at a certain then as it happens in a way that is called good students of (the teacher) well (…) my confidence grew better

Original
(Güven) her o sınıf konserlerinde hep heyecanlandım ben (…) hani alışmaya başladım bi noktada sonra işle bi şekilde hani böyle olur ya (hocann) iyi öğrencileri falan öyle (…) daha biraz kendime güvenim geldi

Similarly, Erkin described his teacher’s effect on him being on stage. After being without a teacher, his excitement changed on stage, whereas previously, his teacher’s mounting as him being “a lion a tiger” (aslansın koçsun), for instance, would make him feel like there is no “threat” (tehdit) on the stage.
(Erkin) after being without a teacher my excitement thing changed a little it’s more like there is no one behind me like he would say you’re a lion a tiger (…) and you would go up to the stage like there is no threat for you

Original
(Erkin) hocasıздан sonra heyecanlanma şeyim biraz daha değişti daha bi arkamda biri yok yani aslansın koç (…) filan diyordu ve he he he diye çıkıyorsun (sahneye) yani hani bi tehdit olmuyordu senin için

Hande, beneath, resembled her teacher to his father. She previously described that at the beginning of her musical education, her father was widely involved in violin practising and classes. In this sense, the resemblance in the narration is thought to point out her transference to the teacher.

(Hande) I was continuing to the lessons with my teacher he is like a father to me we are still in touch with him

Original
(Hande) hocamla da hala derslere devam ediyordum o zaten babam gibidir benim hala da iletişimdeyiz kendisiyle

Further, in the following quotation, Nilay also described her violin teacher as “my violin father” (keman babam). Nilay lost her father when she was 11 years old, and at that time, “beyond just a coincidence” (tesadüfiün ötesinde), her teacher became across neighbour. In her narration, where her loss and teacher becoming spatially close is beyond coincidence, it is thought how that presence and the teacher’s role are constructed as a substitution for her loss.

(Nilay) my teacher then became our neighbour across miracle the biggest miracle of my life we started working together immediately and mm really I believe to be among the luckiest people in this regard for this I even believe it is a bond beyond just a coincidence (…) when I was 11 I lost my father immediately after losing him my teacher became our neighbour across (…) in a sense my teacher took his (father) place like my violin father

Original
(Nilay) hocam sonra karşıımız oldu mucize hayatımızda en büyük mucize hemen onunla çalışmaya başladıım ve u gerçekten dünyamın en şanslı insanlarından biri olduğunu inaniyorum bu açıdan da onun için tesadüfiün ötesinde bir bağ olduğuna da inaniyorum aslında (…) 11 yaşındayken
b) One Who Thwarts

In contrast with the above subsection, the instrument teachers are described as thwarting. In the narrations, the teachers still maintain a crucial role but in a hindering manner. In these descriptions, the teachers are imposing, thwarting one’s experience on stage, aggressive, traumatizing, negatively impacting the characters, etc. In the narrations of this subsection, teachers were described as impeding one’s relationship with music and instruments.

Below, Yaren talks about how a teacher needs to perceive the student as a separate individual. If not, she described that the teacher uses students to prove themselves and impose certain education. Her emphasis on “separate individual” (bambaşka bir birey) is considered necessary in this one-to-one teacher-student relationship: In the narration, when this separation of the teacher is not present, there is imposition perceived by the student.

(Yaren) like psychologically perceiving me as a separate individual a teacher is trully crucial (…) imposing teachers use their students as a means of proving themselves and apart from the awareness that they are separate individuals they provide imposing education

Original
(Yaren) hakkaten hoca çok önemli hem psikolojik olarak beni bambaşka bir birey olarak görmesi (…) dayatmacı hocaların kendilerini kanıtlamak için öğrencileri sürekli bir araç olarak kullandıkları ve karşısındakinin başka bir birey olduğu farkındalığından uzak dayatmacı bir eğitim verildiğini düşünüyorum

Erkin described how the teacher’s comments made him demoralized. Negative feedback made him feel like he has to “justify” (hesabını vermek) each note he plays. Moreover, he associated this feedback with forgetting a piece he had memorized on the stage. Thus, in the narration, the teacher’s attitude results in a diminished stage performance.

(Erkin) you play a little diffident you do not find bottom of the keys more articulation is necessary said the teacher (…) I was truly demoralized how
hard it is you need to pay attention to each notes before I had been playing haphazardly and it was working out somehow but now it was as if I needed to justify each note like it hurt inside so much that I forgot what I played

Original
(Erkin) biraz pisırık çalıyorsun dedi tuşların dibini bulmuşursun dedi daha artikülasyon lazım dedi (...) çok demoralize oldum ne kadar zor bi işlem her notaya dikkat etmem gerekiyor ben öyle gelişi güzel çalmıyorum ve bi şekilde oltuordu ama şimdi her notanın hesabını vermem gerekiyor gibi böyle bi içim ağrıldı o kadar ki çalacağım şeyi unuttum

Below, Adile imparted her experience of participating in a violin competition. She narrated that when she was in middle school, she attended a competition in the summer in which she was not feeling ready to participate. After her performance in the competition, she did not win any awards and described a phone conversation with her teacher where she was crying, and the teacher was remarking on her not getting a reward. She narrated that after the occurrence, her excessive excitement and tremors began on the stage that previously was not present. It is noteworthy that in the narration, the teacher’s perceived attitude plays a mediatory role between the result in the competition and the stage anxiety.

(Adile) I had already knew that I won’t get the award so it ended the results were announced I called my teacher and he said so you did not get the award I was crying crying so much what he said is so you did not get the award after that this stage stress thing begin actually from then on before I did not have tremors of hand or arm or excessive excitement at the stage

Original
(Adile) zaten hani ödül alamayacağımı açıkçası anlamıştım filan mı keza bitti İşte sonuçlar açıklandığı öğretnenini aradım ve mi ödül alamadım mı dedi filan ben ağlıyorum ama nasıl ağlıyorum filan adımı söylediği İşte hani ödül alamadım mı bunu sor sordu filan mı ve ondan sonra da bu sahne stresi şeyim aslında orada başladı daha önce böyle bi sahnedede titremesi el kol titremesi vesaire gibi bi şeyler aşırı bi heyecan açıkçası hiç olmuyordu

Yaren illustrated her teacher’s behaviour towards her, such as not being calm or patient and expecting her to know everything already and yelling at her. She narrated that she was already a shy and timid child, and such behaviour made her even more frightened. In this narration, the teacher’s attitude impacted her character.
such that she became “a child unable to express” herself (kendini ifade edemeyen çocuk).

(Yaren) well the teacher did not have calm and patient understanding of a child not knowing something it was as if you needed to know everything and not knowing was a big problem and that is it and it really made me more and more timid (...) she started yelling saying you misunderstand etc. and these made me a child unable to express herself even more like okey I would do what I was told so that no problem would arise

Original
(Yaren) işte sakin ve sabırlı bi şekilde karşısındaki çocuğun bu bilgiye sahip olmaya bileceği yaklaşıımı yoktu sanki her şeyi bilmen gerekiyor ve bilmemen büyük bi problem ve orda olay kopuyordu zaten yani ve hakkaten bu beni giderek daha çok ürkeleştirmeye başlamış (...), yanlış anlıyorsun diye bu sefer böyle bağırmaya başladığı falan yani şey o beni iyice kendini ifade edemeyen çocuğa dönüştürmeye başladı hani tamam verileni yapayım ondan sonra da olay çıkmasın problem çıkmasın falan

Güliz, whose first piano teacher was her mother, described her mother’s attitude as harsh and that she would engage in “little violence” (minik şiddetler) when she made a mistake. Subsequently, she mentioned that her mother would attend her private lessons and maintain her authority. In this narration, it is noteworthy how the mother’s harsh attitude and her authority remaining, even after taking lessons from a piano teacher, came subsequently.

(Güliz) I remember my mother’s harsh attitude while practising with me while teaching something she would apply little violences when I made a mistake then when I started attending private lessons my mother’s authority still was there she would attend to my lessons

Original
(Güliz) annemin umum tavırlarım hatırlıyorum sert bi tavr vardı bana beni çalıştırırken bana bi şey öğretirken işte arada böyle bi minik şiddetler falan da uygulardı bi hata yaptığında daha sonra özel derslere başladığımda annemin yine işte bi şekilde otoritesi ii yani söz konusuşdu diyelim bi otorite bi otorite olarak ordaydı işte ben ders alırken o benim derslerimi izlerdi

Below, Güliz also described how weekly lessons felt like exams where she sought her teacher’s approval. She said the practising process was arduous, and she put her energy into gaining the teacher’s approval. In this narration, it could be
thought that the lessons for her become a place for the constant exam for approval, which is emphasized with the adjectives “tough” and “each week” to gain approval. In this matter, her relationship with the music and the instrument is hindered by the approval of the teacher.

(Güliz) process of practicing was a tough process for me (...) the weekly lesson with my teacher was a kind kind of exams for me because well those demonstrations of weekly studies and well expectations of teacher’s approval (...) each week I would put my energy and studies forward in order to gain teacher’s admiration and approval

Original

(Güliz) çalışma süreci ıı de zorlu bi süreçti benim için (...) her hafta yapılan öğretmenle yapılan işte dersler de bi tu şekilde o bi şekilde o sınav gibi geçerdi benim için çünkü işte yani evet haftalık yapılan çalışmaların hocaya sergilenmesi ve işte hocadan beklenen işte onay (…) her hafta kendimi işte hocanın işte beğeninini kazanmak onayını kazanmaya yönelik um enerjimi çalışmalarımı buña sanırım şey yapardım bu beğeniyi ve onayı kazanmak üzerinde ortaya koyardım

Further, Meriç mentioned a teacher’s comment about her starting violin practice at a late age and that she should extensively study to achieve. The expression “horribly traumatizing” (korkunç travmatik) might indicate the participant’s perception of a teacher’s statement’s effect on a student.

(Meriç) a teacher said well you started too late already at 12 age if you do not practice 10 hours a day no way you will go anywhere when I heard this I was 13 it is a horribly traumatizing thing

Original

(Meriç) bi hoca oo siz çok geç başladınız zaten 12 yaşında başladın günde 10 saat çalışmasan hayatta bi yerlere gelemezsin ben bunu duydüğumda 13 yaşındaydim korkunç travmatik bi şey bu yani

The same participant described her experience with her teacher, where the teacher drew parallels between sexual relations and being on stage. She emphasized the possibility of a teacher engaging in such corruption via the misuse of lesson settings (one-to-one lessons behind closed doors), and music is an abstract art. This narration depicts the participant’s perception of a student’s vulnerability concerning a teacher.
(Meriç) above all we are practicing one-to-one behind closed doors it is an abstract art going on stage requires a lot of courage well my teacher would claim a parallel between being on stage and sexual relation he said even preferring a slow or fast sex could be equivalent of playing slow or fast on the stage as such I came across with how much this abstract art could be corrupted

Original
(Meriç) bi kere biz bire bir kapalı odalarda çalışıyoruz soyut bir şey sanat sahneye çıkmak çok büyük cesaret gerektiriyor İşte benim hocam sahneye çıkmamanın cinsel birliktelikle çok yakın olduğunu iddia ederdi cinsellikde yavaş veya hızlı tercih ediyor olmanın senin çalışındaki yavaş veya hızlı bile denk düşebileceğini söylerdi gibi gibi bu soyut aktarım bu sanatsal aktarım tamamen yozlaştırılıp vurulabildiğini gördüm ben

3.4. The Dark Side / The Object That Takes It All

This research section portrays the participants’ narrations about their adverse experiences regarding music and their instruments. Adversities in these experiences are described intensely. There are five subsections in this section: a) One Cannot Not Practice, b) (Passive) Resistance, c) Encapsulation, d) Going Back and Fort / Fort Da, and e) Uncanny Me: What Will Leak from Me on Stage? / Bad experiences on stage.

a) One Cannot Not Practice

In this subsection, participants’ narrations about necessity of practising their instruments are described. Among narrations, it was very common to articulate duty of practising their instruments and feelings of guilt when the duty is not fulfilled. Accordingly, practising for long hours is a norm and indispensable part of the profession.

Below, Güliz mentioned her perception about practising and her attitude towards it. She described this as a form of “ethics” (etik).

(Güliz) everyday regardless of me wanting or not I always thought and felt that I should or hmm similarly would not skip a lesson at my sweet will I mean there was an ethic for me you go to lesson it is a must you must practice

Original
(Güliz) ben hergün istesem de istemesem de çalışmanın gerektiğini düşünürdüm öyle hissederdım veya İşte imm yine keyfine estığınde de böyle
Similarly, Adile described the way of her practising when she was a conservatoire student. She mentioned that in her routine, she would study until she “runs out of breath” (nefessiz kalana kadar). This expression in the narration might suggest that the perceived practice would only get a limit that emerges from the body, meaning that practising until all bodily energy is present.

(Adile) I remember I would not give a break for long times in a room I would practice until run out of a breath

Original
(Adile) ara vermiyordum onu hatırlıyorum çok uzun süreler bir odanın içinde nefessiz kalana kadar çalışıyordu

Nilay, below, described times when she would take breaks from practising violin in the summer. She compared herself with a friend who was not a professional musician and said that whereas her friend could sit on the seaside, she would be feeling guilty about not practising. She explained that this guilt stemmed from the principle of “if you do not use, you lose” (kullanmazsanız kaybedersiniz). More, she gave the example of softening calluses when not practising: The violin players develop calluses on their fingertips due to constantly applying pressure to strings. Thus, losing also includes physical loss. Moreover, while describing going back to practising, she mentioned it to be a painful process and requires a certain effort to get back into shape. Thus, in the narration, the breaks from the practising full of remorse require compensation for the loss.

(Nilay) particularly in summers (…) at times I would not practice for a long time then I would start again how softened my calluses would be there were times when I would leave off for 20 days 1 month of course it would come with remorse of course unfortunately the hardest part of our profession is this a friend of mine who was in college they could sit in seaside just doing nothing but I was always sitting with guilt because I know I would lose principle of if you do not use you lose applies to our profession unfortunately (…) (going back to practising) of course it would be very painfully well in 5-6 days I would begin to pick up and then compensate again like in a camp
Down, Damla described a similar experience of giving breaks from practising the violin in the summers. While describing going back to practising, she mentioned the cycle to be vicious as not practising results in diminished likeness of the sound and vice versa and that it requires “remembering” (hatırlamak) that she takes pleasure from the music. It is also worth remarking that in the narration, she emphasized those times of not practising as the “courage of an ignorant” (cahil cesareti). Thus, it could be thought that within the discourse, not practising, is placed in the past time of ignorance.

(Damla) in summers for instance there were times when I would not touch my violin for a month now as I think I am myself a professional musician and well how could such thing be possible (...) it is courage of an ignorant (...) it is vicious cycle I do not practise as I do not practice I fall back and then of course not being able to do it (...) I do not like the sound that I make (...) then in the process of practising seeing some progress well I mean remembering again taking pleasure from making music

In the following quotation, Meriç mentioned how she would transfer her advice to her future students by emphasizing importance of “devotion” (adanmışlık) and “discipline” (disiplin). Furthermore, she mentioned that if a person cannot really practice that they should use make a good use of it via stressing “spend this right of
yours wisely” (bu hakkı iyi kulan). This expression of “right” (hak) is thought to emphasize that it should happen rarely as a last resource of not being able to practice.

(Meriç) it requires a great deal of devotion (…) one day when I become a real academician I would say yes you might not want it today you might not like it every time everything but sometimes just sitting to the work is well done for discipline for stability or if you really are not at that practising really do go to a good movie spend time with friends that day and not think of the violin once but spend this right of yours wisely

Original
(Meriç) çok büyük adanmışlık gerektiriyo (…) bi gün gerçekten akademisyen olduğumda bunu böyle dicide bugün içinden gelmeyebilir her zaman her şey severek çalışmak zorunda değilsin ama bazen sadece o işin başına oturmak bile çok büyük bi çalışma disiplin için istikrar için sadece orda olmaya çalışmak ya da gerçekten orda o çalışmada değilsen git gerçekten güzel bi sinemaya izle arkadaşlarınıla gez o gün o ızni kullan bi kere aklına kemamı getirme ama bu hakkı iyi kullan

b) (Passive) Resistance
This subsection describes narrations of resistance towards practising, achieving or getting an outcome. In these narrations, the participants describe some sort of investment in the task but are hindered in specific ways.

Below, Yaren mentioned taking joy from playing the piece that is set but having a hard time in prior states when practising is required. She said that she would procrastinate to begin practising, especially when beginning is new.

(Yaren) I remember playing a piece in a state of flow joy relief with unification of my inner world with the music when the piece is set that part is really joyful but practising was very hard still when I learn a new piece weell I would start later I would start tomorrow always in procrastination

Original
(Yaren) eser oturduktan sonra eseri çalarken bi akış psikolojisinde keyfinde rahatsızlığında iç dünyamla müzikal olarak bir birleşme yaşadığımı hatırlıyorum o kısmını hakkaten çok keyifli olduğunu hatırlıyorum ama çalışma hep sıkıcı ve çok zordu hala yeni bi eser öğreneceğim zaman aa başladım başlacam aayarin başlarım diye hep ertelediğim bi şey oluyor

In the following quotation, Güliz described getting obsessed about a passage of a piece while practising. While mentioning that the obsession starts via not seeing
achievement, she narrated practising 5 hours and getting into a “charmless place” (sevimsiz yer). In totality, she describes this experience as leading to unproductive practising and drifting apart from the music and the instrument. It could be emphasized that in this narration, the participant is in action very much involved with the practising; however, not only these efforts brought no achievements but also rendered her alienated from the music itself.

(Güliz) somehow you would not achieve a passage because of that by seeing not achieving it becomes an obsession for you that that brings you to a strange place a charmless place I mean trying to make it (…) practising for 5 hours just for the sake of practising meaningless and not goal oriented not knowing why to play in a very unproductive way blindly going on to practicing that is something that alienates from the piano alienates from the music

Original
(Güliz) bi pasaji bi şekilde aşamıyorsun o yüzden uyu aşamadığını gördükçe de şey bi takıntı olmaya başlıyorsun senin için o o garip bi yere götürüyor yanı sevimsiz bi yere götürüyor hani öldürmaya çalışmak bi şeyleri (…) surf çalışmanız gerekiyor 5 saat gerekiyor diye anlamışsiz ve hedef odaklı olmadan niye çaldığını bilmemek neden çaldığını bilmemek çok üreteknsiz bi şekilde nereye gittiğini bilmeden kör bi şekilde yapılan çalışma o o da şey piyanodan soğutulan müzikten soğutulan bi şey

Below, Esra mentioned obsessing over a particular part of a piece and observing various interpretations while trying to achieve it. She added that this process becomes a long one, and in the end, she tests herself through those interpretations, and as a result, she does not perform. In this narration, it could be said that although much effort is put into the task, the result is withheld.

(Esra) trying to get better by fighting myself well I obsess on the piano to a particular part of a piece this will be done well I watch certain interpretations think of how can I achieve that point well of course when it expands to a wide range of time it becomes a huge addiction because I test myself through it and not performing

Original
(Esra) kendimle savaşarak daha iyi noktaya getirme şu şimdi piyanoda bi eserin belli bi yeri takıyoruz kafaya bu olacak yapılacak işte çeşitli yorumlar seyrediyorum bunu bu noktaya kadar.nasa getirebilirim e tabi bu büyük bi
sürece yayıldığı zaman çok büyük bir bağımlılık haline geliyor çünkü kendimi onun üzerinden aslında test ediyorum ve sahneye alıyorum

c) Encapsulation

This subsection gathers narrations about the practising or conservatoire environment being rigid and unidirectional. Due to the context being described as inflexible, this subsection is titled “Encapsulation”.

In the following quotation, Meriç described the expectation of practising 8-10 hours daily in the conservatoire as obsessive, stiff and one-sided.

(Meriç) practising this looong hours of 8-10 in our profession is very risky a little stiff and also one sided and maybe obsession and one sidedness is required for just becoming a soloist or winning a competition

Original
(Meriç) bizim mesleğimizde enstrüman çalışmak bu kadaaar böyle 8-10 saatlere varması çok riskli biraz katı ve tek yönü de belki sadece solist olmak için yarışma kazanmak için tek yönü olunca öyle bi obsesyon gerekiyor

Below, Güliz commented about obsessively trying to solve a section of a piece. While trying to bring it to a certain standard, she described the process as “trying to put yourself in a small box” (küçük şeylere kutulara sokmak kendini).

(Güliz) trying to make it I mean obsessively trying it yes it is bitter and charmless situation as if there is no other option as if again trying to put yourself in a small box

Original
(Güliz) onu öldürmaya çalışmak hani obsesif bi şekilde öldürmaya çalışmak o o evet tatsız ve sevimsiz bi durum sanki başka bi seçenek yokmuş gibi hani yine o küçük şeylere kutulara sokmak kendini

In the following quotation, Nilay described the constant need for practising to be a source of pressure. She mentioned that certain violin-related dreams occur due to it and that practising is also an obligation besides loving the instrument. She emphasized that a person sometimes wants something else as well. It is thought to be important how she indicated that she loves it in the narration. Further, when describing the negative side of its obligation, she also generalized it to other people.
Furthermore, the emphasis that she might want other things besides the violin also implies the perception of encapsulation itself.

(Nilay) (constant need of practising) is a sort of pressure as a result these violin themed dreams (violin becoming smaller and changing colour etc.) emerge I mean as I say I love it very much but secretly it is an obligation for all of us I mean we all love out instrument but after a while one want to have something else as well let it be but let other things be as well

Original
(Nilay) (sürekli çalışma gerekliği) bir nevi bir başka bunların da etkisiyle o keman temalı rüyalar ortaya çıkıyor (kemanın küçülmesi şekil değiştirilmesi gibi) hani çok seviyorum diyorum ama gizilden gizliye bir zorunluluk da var hepimizde olduğunu gibi yani hepimiz seviyoruz enstrümanımızı ama bi yerden sonra başka şeyler de olsun da istiyor insan o olsun ama başka şeyler de olsun

Below, Yaren described the conservatoire environment where students practice alone in rooms for long hours, being isolated, children in there spending their whole development in a single space with the same people and her feeling like an alien after graduation. She stresses that music education should include other fields besides music. In this narration, it is thought that the conservatoire environment is described as encapsulating a person’s life in wide aspects.

(Yaren) we would study on our own in the until late nights (…) barren deaf wearing horse glasses away from everything and isolated because for a kid to be for 10 years for whole developmental processes in a single place with the same teacher in the same environment is ridiculous and when I graduated I really felt like an alien (…) it should be an holistic education with history of music and art philosophy psychology sociology only then actually a person could be filled with the love of music in my opinion

Original
(Yaren) biz gece saatlerine kadar odada tek başına enstrümanımızı çalışıyordu (…) kısır sağır at gözlüğü takmış her şeyden bu kadar uzak ve izole çünkü bi çocuğun 10 yıl boyunca tüm gelişimsel süreci içerisinde tek bi yerde aynı hocayla aynı çevreye çalışıyor olması kadar saçma bi şey olamaz ve hakkaten mezun olduğum zaman uzaylı gibi hissediyordum kendimi (…) bütünleşen bir eğitim olması gereken bi şey iste müzik tarihiyle sanat tarihiyle felsefeye psikolojiyle sosyolojiyle bütünleştiği zaman aslında insanın içindeki müzik aşkına tutuşacağına inandığım bi alan olduğunu düşünüyorum
**d) Going Back and Forth / Fort Da**

In this subsection, participants’ narrations about cycles of getting away from and returning to practising their instruments are included.

Below, Esra described the reasons behind her getting away from time to time practising the piano. She mentioned that from time to time, she would not get the answer she awaited from the instrument; she commented that she might not have conveyed it to the instrument either. In these instances, Esra said, she would think it is meaningless to force and goes away; eventually, she would miss and return to it. It is noteworthy how her description of this cycle could resemble a certain relationship between people; she talked about dialogue, not receiving a desired answer, not conveying it properly, getting away and eventually missing.

(Original)
(Esra) (insan niye uzaklaşmak istiyo) bazen istediğim cevabı alamadığında ara vermeyi tercih edebiliyorum u çok üstüne gittiğimi veya o srada istediğim hızda o cevabı alamadığında mola verme ihtiyacı hissediyorum (...) bazen o cevabı alamıyorum çünkü ben de istediğim gibi iletemiyorum o zaman diyorum bugün zorlamamın bir manası yok hani çünkü hani boş boş sesler u duycağıma demek ki bugün modda değilim (...) fakat eninde sonunda özlüyorum dönüyorum

Yaren, beneath, also talked about her time to time getting away from the piano. In one of those times, she was participating in a political protest where she mentioned thinking about different life struggles, and she could not make sense of entering a room and practising the piano. She described that after this experience, she underwent an adaptation period of practising. Similarly, at the interview, she mentioned that she was not in a practising period of her life. She described questioning her relationship with the music, needing to get to know the music anew by adding, “we’ve broken up with it right now” *(su an bi koptuk endostyle)*. Here as well, the expressions are thought to be resembling human interactions.
(Yaren) (in times of gezi protests) there are completely different life struggles we enter into a room and practice how absurd I entered into a state where I could not make sense and again for not practising the piano I was into adaptation process then started to practice a lot (…) (now) I question whether I have a deep relationship with the music I think I need to get to know the music anew as if I do not know it at all I need a new bond (…) we’ve broken up with it right now

Original
(Yaren) (gezi döneminde) bambaşka yaşam mücadeleleri var biz bir odaya girmişiz piyano çalışiyoruz ne kadar saçma ne kadar kopuk ne kadar anlamlandıramadığım dediğim süreçte yine bir süre piyano çalışmadığım için orada uyumlama sürecine girmiştim çok çalışmaya başlamıştım (…) (şimdi) müzikle o kadar derin ilişkim yok mu onu anlamaya çalıştım galiba benim baştan tanıştam gerekiyor müzikle sıfırdan sanki hiç bilmiyormuşum gibi yeni bir baş kurma ihtiyacı içerisindeyim (…) şu an bi koptuk kendisiyle

e) Uncanny Me: What Will Leak from Me on the Stage?

In this subsection, participants’ narrations about negative preconceptions, anticipation, and experiences of being on the stage are portrayed. The stage appeared to be a central imperative in the descriptions in general, and its negative experiences were narrated to be blight effect.

Below, Esra described that after taking the music seriously, her stage fright increased, and the more professional one is, the more one tends to be ruthless towards themselves on the stage.

(Esra) as I started to understand how serious and magnificent it is my stage fright increased and also when I was a child I would forgive myself more easily the more professional one gets ruthlessness towards one’s self increases on stage

Original
(Esra) işin ciddiyetini ve muazzamlığını anlamışca bende açıkçası şey yükselmeye başladı sahne korkusu bi de kendi daha kolay affederdim iıı çocukken iıı profesyonelleştirince iıı yani şey acımasızlık artıyor insanın kendisine karşı sahnede

Similarly, Damla described her stage experiences as getting more complicated as she took it more seriously. According to her, more care is put into the work by taking it more seriously.
(Damla) after starting to take it seriously it became harder because previously I did not care so it was not a problem (...) the more one takes it seriously the more care is put in

Original
(Damla) bu işi ciddiye başladığımdan beri zorluyor ondan önce çünkü zaten umurumda olmadığından dolayı o kadar problem olmayordu (...) ciddiye almayı başladıkça daha fazla özen gösteriyor insan

In the quotation below, Güliz narrated how compelling instrument exams were for her. She mentioned that such long and tedious preparations of the repertoire that lasts for months are put forward in the exams and that, as a result, it becomes the moment for one to demonstrate all of their work, capacity etc. She emphasized that the probability of not adequately demonstrating all the work was the source of anxiety, fear, stress and tension.

(Güliz) every exam I took was psychologically mentally compelling (...) before the exams preparation period is very long and crucial thus in a sense exams are the aims the results of such long months of practising of labouring thus the whole attention is there the aim is to play good or demonstrate capacities there thus the question of how much of it I can show was source of anxiety and fear I think it is the core of my tension stress and fear

Original
(Güliz) hayatımda girdiğim her sınav benim için psikolojik olarak şey ruhsal olarak zorluydu (...) çok önemli ve uzun bi hazırlama süreci ıt olur işte bu sınavlardan önce dolayısıyla yani ıt o sınav hani bi tür çalışmaların amacıdır yani onca ay yapılan işte çalışmaların verilen emeğin bi sonucudur o yüzden yani bütün dikkat ordadır amaç orda güzel çalmaktır veya yapılanların yapılabilenlerin gösterildiği yerdir o yüzden onların ne kadar gösterilep gösterilemeyeceğiyle ilgili bi endişe ve korku yaşadım ben de sanırım yani orda yaşadığım ıt gerginliğin stresin ve korkunun şeyi buydu ızı buydu

Down, Güven has described sensations he experienced on the stage. He emphasized that anything could happen at the stage regardless of how much one works. In this manner, the stage is portrayed to be a highly unpredictable place. The sensations he mentioned, including heartbeat, cold hands, and stomach discomfort, are bodily reactions.
(Güven) there I faced with the fact that regardless of how much you work in the concert there is totally different sensation (...) that sensation the heartbeat ice cold hands hmm like something in the stomach feelings of discomfort

Original
(Güven) ne kadar çalışırsanız çalışın konserde bambaşka bir hissiyat olduğu gerçeğiyle orda karşılaştım (...) o hissiyat olarak o yani kalp çarpıntısı buz gibi el üt şey böyle karında bi karında bir şey hissi rahatsızlık hissi

Below, Esra also commented on the stage being unpredictable by saying that performance on the stage varies daily. She further emphasized that this feature of the stage is the most beautiful aspect but the most fearsome part of it as well.

(Esra) performances on the stage varies day to day basis I mean not everyone can do it in their peeks maybe it is the reason why it is beautiful varying I mean instantaneous feelings are involved but it is the most fearsome part of it as well

Original
(Esra) konser performansları da gününe göre değişebiliyor yani her an her dakika herkes en peekte yapamıyor bunu belki güzelliği de burada değişik yanı ve anlık duygular içeren bi şey olması ama korkutucu olan kısımı da tam orası

In the following quotation, Esra described how she viciously escaped from being on the stage due to waiting to be ready. She mentioned her concern about sabotaging herself on the stage by not playing in a flow or forgetting the piece. Moreover, she emphasized that possible comments are a source of tremendous pressure as well. She also described the worst possible comments, in which people say that she makes wrong music, lacks certain qualities, and should not be on the stage. It is noteworthy how this unrealized reality makes her stay away from the stage; in the narration, the contents of her possible self-sabotage of the stage also come from the comments of the others in the worst scenario; however, all of these remains in the constant state of unrealized realities.

(Esra) it is a vicious cycle I do not feel ready for the concert (...) I escape being on stage this time stage experience does not develop (being ready) is a above human thing (...) I guess I fear that I would sabotage myself (...) I won’t like it it won’t be in a flow would forget etc. (...) what would people say is a huge pressure as well (...) she studied and studied but did not achieve
(...) she anyway does wrong music for instance her agility also lacks and forgot a lot I think she should not go into stage I mean for a musician these would be the worst possible comments

Original
(Esra) o bi döngü mesela konsere hazırlanmış yeteneğim hazır olduğumu hissetmediğim için (…) kaçıyorum konserden bu sefer de sahne deneyimi gelişmiyor (inessiz olma hali) ay o oyle bi insanın üstü bi şey tabii (…) korkuyorum herhalde kendimi sabote edicem (…) beğenmemicem istedigim yer istedigim akılcıla yapamaycam işte ezber unutucam ondan sonra (…) insanlar ne der o da o da çok büyük bi baskı (…) ay bu da çalşıtçı çalşıt ama bi yere de gelemedi (…) işte bu zaten de yanlış müzik yapıyo mesela işte atıkları de kötü ve bi sürü de ezber unuttu bence çıkmasın sahneye filan hani olabilecek en kötü şeyler bi müzisyen için herhalde bu yorumlar olur

Below, Adile described her experience during a perceived lousy performance on the stage. She remarked on certain bodily reactions, such as uncontrollable trembling of the whole body and the bow bouncing while playing the violin. She emphasized that her musical expression was inadequate since she was in “a state of war” (savaşma halindeyim).

(Adile) I remember unstoppable trembling from my toes to hairs and I strugglingly managed to come to the end of the piece now my bow was bouncing (…) there was no musical expressions already because I am in a state of war

Original
(Adile) bacaklarının ayak parmağından saçının teline kadar titrememi durduramadığımı hatırlıyorum ve eserin başından sonuna sonunu zor getirdim sadece arşem artık zıplıyordu (…) müzikal şeylerin hiçbiri de çıkıyor ortaya çıktı ben bir savaşma halindeyim

Erkin mentioned that after what he thought to be a bad performance, he did not believe appraise that he received and thought that they were comforting him. It is thought to be noteworthy that in this narration, a positive encounter would not combat with one’s imagination about the situation.

(Erkin) they were shouting bravo and I thought they were ridiculing I really disgraced and everyone is pity bravo ing was what I thought I mean I did not believe in those bravos
3.5. The Reward / The Object That Gives You All

Participants’ narrations about rewarding aspects of the music and their instruments are included in this section. In the narrations, these rewarding aspects emerge concerning a certain completion and being on the stage.

a) Passionate Devotion

In this subsection, participants’ experiences of devotion are included. Participants described passionate descriptions of their relationship with their instrument and music here. Moreover, this passionate attitude comes along with particular devotion to practice and achieve

Below, Esra mentioned the piano to be true love itself. She emphasized the piano being able to be a means of her ambition and experience romance.

(Esra) loving the piano is the true love I mean it is a great chance because the instrument in front of you being one’s both hobby and life and also world is an extraordinary indescribable feeling (…) everything stays outside sometimes you can take out all of your ambitions out of it sometimes you just experience romance well the piano is the love itself

Kemal, below, described that his passion towards his profession leads him to practice and dwell into ways of improving in search of certain saturation.

(Kemal) due to the passion to my profession this passion already makes you to practice and somehow you want to be saturated what else can I add what else can I do what else
Beneath, Erkin narrated attending an orchestra concert with a piano soloist. While he was impressed with the pianist’s abilities and the sounds produced in general, Erkin described feeling “overflowing” (taşıyamayacağım kadar çok şey) and “horny” (azdırdı) about being involved in the profession and possibility of playing that well in the future. He emphasized that it was total love and that, for him, nothing else rather than achieving it mattered.

(Original) (Kemal) mesleğime olan tutkudan dolayı da o tutku sizi sürekli zaten çalışmaya teşvik ediyor ve bi şekilde doymak istiyosumuz yani hani daha ne katabilirim daha ne katabilirim daha ne yapabilirim

(Güven), below, described his state when he wanted to play a piece very much. He mentioned the experience in that nothing else would make him as happy as being able to play that piece. He emphasized that this love of music and the piano is a constant in his life, and he is ready to make any sacrifices for it.

(Güven) that piece (...) I means I wanted to play it and at that moment nothing else would make me as happy (...) nothing else would make me that happy
(...)

Love of the music love of the piano increasingly continued to exist throughout my life I was ready to make any sacrifices

**Original**

(Güven) o eseri (...) yani onu istedim çalmayı ve o anda beni hiçbir şey o kadar mutlu etmiycek (...) bunların hiçbirisini beni o kadar mutlu etmiycek (...) müzik sevgisi piyano aşk durmadan çok daha yükselerek devam etti hayatım boyunca her türlü fedakarlığı yapabilecek noktadaydım yani

Similarly, Erkin elaborated on his state of practising the piano. He said that he practised in a manner where he neither thought about eating nor sleeping. While describing it as “beyond passion an obsession” *(tutku ötesi bi obsesyon)*, he emphasized being thrilled about moving into the next step.

(Erkin) I was not thinking about about eating at all well luckily I did not have a digital piano otherwise I would continue at midnight from sleep I mean to practicing to much of a passion beyond passion an obsession (...) not sleeping eating or drinking I was in front of the piano well I was thrilled to go to the next stage

**Original**

(Erkin) hiç yemek filan düşünmüyordum ıı ne biliyim dijital piyano yoktu allahtan yoksa gece yarısı herhalde devam ederdim ben uykundan yani çalışmaya yani o kadar bi tutku tutku ötesi bi obsesyonu yani (...) yani uyumuyor yemiyor içmiyor piyanonun başında i şey çok heyecanlandiriyordu beni yani bi sonrası aşamaya geçmek

Yaren, below, described a period in her life when she needed to practice a lot. She mentioned bringing a blanket and pillow to a practising room in the school and staying there day and night in order to practice efficiently.

(Yaren) I needed to practice a lot now it was snowing I could go to home for instance I would go there (the practising room at the school) with a blanket a pillow and 4 days like I stayed in that room I’d lock myself from the inside at nights and wake up then practice and it went on

**Original**

(Yaren) çok çalışmam gerekiyordu artık kar yağıyordu eve gidemiyordum mesela ben oraya (okulda çalışma odası) böyle şey gitmiştir okula battaniye yastık falan getirmiştim ve 4 gün falan ben o odada kalmıştım ben böyle gece kendimi içeriden kilitleyip yatıp kalkıp çalışıp sonra gece tekrar kilitleyip falan
b) Jubilation

In this subsection, jubilatory experiences regarding the practising are included. These moments occur when a piece is forming together: The preparation process of a piece includes months of practice that requires many hours daily. At the end of the process, many fragments come into a single total formation: myriad notes, lengthy technical passages, melodic structure, stylistic requirements etc. At the end of such a period, many participants described feeling glad, content, and jubiloso for them being able to perform the end product.

Below Güliz described how good she feels when she sees herself being able to perform a piece. She mentioned this state by stressing “seeing your fingers do those certain passages” (parmakların o çeşitli pasajları yapabiliyo olduğu). In this narration, specific acquired bodily capacity is emphasized.

(Güliz) seeing myself being able to do or feel like so I mean there is a piece in front of you and you can perform it hmm you can put it into a framework mould it I mean there are your fingers your body (...) seeing that you can do it is I guess a big part of this work I mean seeing your fingers moving seeing that your fingers do those certain passages seeing that you realize it it in itself comes with a good feeling

Original
(Güliz) kendimi bi şeyi iıı yapabiliyo görmek veya hissetmek yani bi eser var karşısında ve onu icra edebiliyosun onu iıı onu iıı bi çerçeveye koyabiliyoşun bi şekil verebiliyoşun yanı ise parmakların iıı ise vücudun (...) yapabildiğini görebilmek bu için büyük bi parçası gibi yani o sırada hani ellerinin hareket ediyo olduğu görmek parmakların o çeşitli pasajları yapabiliyo olduğuunu gerçekleştirebildiğini görüyor olmak bi bi iıı onun kendi başına güzel bi hissi var

In the following quotation, Nilay narrated how she enjoyed getting clearer and more beautiful sounds from the violin as she practised. She emphasized that she enjoyed tiresome practice and formation of the calluses as well since they are “evidence” (kanıt) of her achieving.

(Nilay) actually I sort of liked the tiredness of it (practising) the sounds becoming clearer observing the flow gained by practicing I mean reaching to the goal hmm and formation of calluses with tiredness the sounds getting beautiful these all gave me pleasure (...) these were evidences of getting it me achieving I mean a way of saying to myself well done

79
Below Meriç mentioned feeling proud about being able to present the outcome of her practising on the stage during a performance.

(Meriç) I had a very beautiful moment I said glad I’m here and felt a little pride in being able to present everything I practice on the stage

In the quotation below, Esra emphasized experiencing emotions at the heights when she can perform well in front of the people as they become “witnesses” (şahit) of her peaking on the stage. She mentioned this being self-satisfactory to be able to do so. In the last two quotations, it is narrated that on top of mastering the piece itself, it is fulfilling to be able to perform it as such on the stage.

(Esra) it is an emotion at its peak when some people witness it in there (at the stage) that satisfaction (…) I’ve peaked and a lot of people saw it (…) I practiced I am sharing and thank god I am doing it well (…) it is self-satisfaction that is shared there

The phenomenon of the stage was foremost and extensive in all of the participants’ narrations. In this subsection, narrations regarding favourable
experiences of the stage are included. Here, the stage experiences are described mainly as sharing with the audience and shining on the stage.

Below, Nilay mentioned that being on the stage is satisfactory in the sense that one is there at the centre of attention, and it includes sharing something that only belongs to her.

(Nilay) of course being on the centre of attention perhaps feeding the ego a little and sharing there something that belong only to you

Original
(Nilay) tabii ki odak noktası olmak belki de bir parça egoyu beslemek orada ve sadece kendime ait olan bi şeyi paylaşmak

In the following quotation, Hande said that in contrast to playing with an orchestra or an ensemble, her contact with the audience is more manageable when she plays solo since she is then at the centre of attention. She also mentioned certain strategies that she uses, such as surprising them, in order to keep the attention and be “dominant” (dominant).

(Hande) when I play solo I think my communication is easier because then people are already watching me you’re already on the centre of gaze thus sometimes with admiration sometimes with a wonder I seek some little thinks by which I can surprise them (an audience) (…) for instance if I see some one yawn instead of playing piano I would play sforzando instead for instance I mean like listen to me how they say I try to be dominant

Original
(Hande) solo çalarken iletişiminin daha rahat olduğunu düşünüyorum çünkü o sırada zaten insanlar beni izliyo sen bi şekilde göz önünde oluyosun böyle olunca bazen hayranlıkla bazen napiyo gibisinden de oluyo onları şaşırtabileceğim ufak tefek şeyler de artıyorum (…) mesela birinin esnediğini gördüğüm zaman atyorum piyanoyken sforzando yapıp hani dinleyin beni hani ne derler dominant olmaya çalışıyorum

Below, Hande also explained that at the moments of the performance, either a concert or an exam, she is more prone to shine. While her lessons are not so good, Hande said the opposite is true for the stage. She narrated that the reason behind this pattern might be that the more she appears “dim” (sönük) beforehand, the more she can “shine” (parlamak) afterwards.
(Hande) no matter how bad the lessons were I my violin exams would be oppositely good it is still the case hmm I’m thinking I mean I always remember and feel I mean yes it is the right time there is no better time to show what you did (…) when I think of why I waited the exams to show myself and not in the lessons (…) lately I started to see it clearer with the help of therapy that the more dim I would appear the easier it would be to shine later that is it

Original (Hande) hala öyle mesela hani dersler ne kadar kötü geçse de keman sınavlarım bi o kadar güzel geçerdi u düşüneyim yani hep şeyi hatırlarım hissederim daha doğruşu evet şu an ne yaptıysan onu gösterme zamanı şu andan daha güzel zaman yok hep (…) düşündüğümde neden hep sınavları bekledin kendini göstermek için neden derlerde kendimi o kadar göstermedim (…) bunu son zamanlarda terapi yardımıyla çok fazla görmeye başladım hani ne kadar daha sönü görünürsem sonra parlamak daha rahat oluyor bu hani aynen öyle

Beneath, Kemal mentioned that behind his excitement of the stage is an excitement of “meeting” (buluşmak) with the audience.

(Kemal) (the stage) is an excitement I mean consistence of excitement of course it is the excitement of meeting

Original (Kemal) (sahne) bir heyecan yani heyecan kıvamında diyebilirim ben tabii ki o buluşmanın heyecanı o

While elaborating on her stage experience, Nilay emphasized the role of sharing. She said that it is what makes her the happiest.

(Nilay) as if sharing something that I experienced with the outside with the audience sharing again I think sharing is the thing that makes me happiest in there

Original (Nilay) adeta yaşadığım bi olayı dışarıyla paylaşmak izleyicilerle paylaşmak paylaşım gene de bence paylaşmak ordaki en çok mutlu eden durum beni

Beneath, Meriç mentioned that it is her aim at the end to manage to form contact with the audience.
(Meriç) if you manage to flow on the top of it if you can also establish a contact with the audience it becomes priceless for me it is my aim

*Original*
(Meriç) akttabiliyorsan bir de üzerine seyirciyle de bir kontakt kurabiliyorsan bu benim için paha biçilmez bir şey oluyor budur amacım

Below, Esra also emphasized that sharing is the foremost thing about the stage. She further elaborated that satisfaction does not emerge when alone and that a unification element occurs while sharing with the audience.

(Esra) it is also very beautiful nice moments shared together enjoying the music together (…) instantly you become whole there experiencing that moment satisfaction emerges it does not emerge when alone but with the audience I mean sharing

*Original*
(Esra) şey de çok güzel tabii ki birlikte geçirilen güzel anlar o müziğin tadını hep birlikte çıkarma yani (…) bi bakmışsınız bi bütün olmuşsunuz orda o an deneyimleriysınız o zaman zaten o tatmin daygusu çıkıyor ortaya kendi başına tatmin çıkmıyor seyirciyle beraber çıkıyor yine paylaşma yani

In the following quotation, Adile elaborated on her experience on the stage while playing in an orchestra. She described that in the finale part of a piece, orchestra members experienced something similar, and it also spread to the audience. She mentioned it becoming a meeting point for everyone there and that concentration on music was the key point that made it possible. In the narration, it is worthy to note the way conceptualised the experience with the expressions of “spiritual consciousness” (*ruhsal bi bilinç*) and “miraculous” (*mucizevi*) as if she is describing a certain transcendental unification.

(Adile) instantly either everyone felt it too much or had similar imagination or or or I don’t know in my opinion the whole orchestra felt something similar when playing the end of the piece (…) audience also was effected from it I suppose and everyone got effected by each other and something happened there everyone hugged each other clinked the beers (…) it was not only meeting point for the orchestra but the audience as well as if the audience also got into it (…) what a mentality (…) spiritual consciousness (…) may be that miraculous thing is being concentrated on music
Original
(Adile) bi anda herkes ya fazla hissetti çalan herkes ya benzer bi şeyi ııı
benzer bi imageleme şey oldu sahip oldu veya da ya da ya da bilmiyorum
bence benzer bi şey hissetti bütün orkestra o eserin sonunu çalarken (...) seyirci de bundan çok etkilendi aniyorum ve orda herkes etkilendi
birbirinden ve orada bi bi şey督办 falan çıkınca herke
sanki seyircinin de buluşma noktasına sanki seyirci de çok içine girdi (...) ruhsal bi bilinç (...) adanmışlık vardı (...) müziğe olan konsantrasyon olabilir o mucizevi gelen şey

Below, Yaren narrated the unification she experienced with the audience while performing on the stage. She described this to be a state of unification in which “solidness” (katılık) vanishes, and everything becomes “permeable” (geçirgen).

(Yaren) at that moment at the stage you become unified with the piece the person you play with the audience that unification state of oneness emerges I mean as if solidness disappears there is no solid matter everything is permeable something like that

In the following quotation, Erkin elaborated on his experience of performing on the stage and the effect of the audience listening. While describing that his perception of a passage changes and becomes more “fabulous” (efsane), he emphasized the reason behind this to be mysterious and that it might stem from him listening through the ears of the audience.

(Erkin) I am entering into a mood as if being in trance your mind is between working and not working how should I know maybe due to hundreds of people listening the passage that I play becomes even more fabulous maybe I am listening from their perspective (...) does it becomes more joyful for me while it being listened by hundreds of people I still do not know it is a mystery (...) not only the voice the melody the sound (...) it changes because everything I change I am no longer I the music I play becomes no longer mine etc. a mystery
d) Universal Unification

In this subsection, participants’ sense of unification via the music and their instruments that go beyond the stage and the audience are included. In these quotations, participants described their sense of connectedness with a poet or a composer that lived hundreds of years ago, with the universe, everyone etc. In this manner, the unification goes beyond the audience to the universe and even the borders of death.

Below, Erkin narrated some “enchanting” (büyüleyici) experiences he had during his piano lessons with his teacher. He explained times when the teacher gave particular feedback and the teacher’s face lidding when the sounds refined. While explaining those moments as being a cocreation and matching with the composer who lived hundreds of years ago, he emphasized the experience to be both very “very private” (çok mahrem) and “universal” (evrensel). Thus, he mentioned the experience to be very subjective while being inclusive.

(Erkin) there were some lessons so enchanting for me I mean the teacher notices something then tells me then I try to make it then his face lids up when it turns out to be good so we create something together in that expression that we together are matching up with the composer’s feeling (…) the two of us as if become confidants witnessing something that is both very private and universal me being after something that that stems from man’s many centuries ago and my teachers makes it easier for me to achieve it

Original
(Erkin) bazı ders anıları vardı çok büyüleyici geliyordu bana yani hoca bi şeyi fark ediyor sonra bana söylüyor sonra ben onu yapmaya çalışıyorum sonra onun yüzü aydınlanıyor böyle güzel olunca e beraber bi şey yaratıyoruz gibi böyle o ifade o şeyin bestecinin bıraktığı duyguya tam örtüşüyoruz ikimiz birden (…) iki kişi arasında böyle garip bi şey ortamu gibi sırdaş mı diyim
In the following quotation, Yaren mentioned a lesson in which they elaborate on a poem that the piece is based on. While narrating that everyone understood something different from the poem, she emphasized that she understood the significance of music at that moment. She said to be enchanted by the fact that a poet's poem is recreated by a composer and then discussed by them: So that an interaction occurs between people of different centuries.

(Yaren) in the singing lesson the teacher asked what the poem in the song says I said what I understood then the singer said what he understood those were totally different and then teacher put forward a totally different contents that day for me was the day when I understood the meaning of the music oh god how magical enchanting it is I mean a poet from centuries ago wrote a poem then Faurre took it and put forward something new I understand something else the singer understands something else and there emerges abstract interaction among people beyond centuries and this is fascinating

Original
(Yaren) şan dersinde çalışıyordu hoca sordu bana sence şiirde ne diyor ne demek istiyorsun ben de dedim ki ben ne anladığımı söyledi sonra şancı çocuk dedi bambaşka şey anlamiyor hoca bambaşka içerik söyledi derken o gün benim için müziğin anlamı oturmuştu oha bu ne kadar büyülü stihirli bi şey ya hani 100 yıldır öncesinde şair bi şiir yazmış sonra Faure almış ondan yeyeni bi şey koymuş ortaya ben başka bi anlam çıkıyorlar şancı başka bi anlam çıkıyor seyirci başka anlam çıkarıyor ve 100 yıldır arasında insanların soyt olarak bi şekilde etkileşim yaşadıkları bi an oluşuyor ve bu hakkaten çok heyecan verici

While describing the sound of music and the piano, Erkin elaborated that the voice is not a voice of an instrument nor even a human but a voice of humanity. He emphasized that it has something to say for everyone, that there remains no separation between people, and that he perceived it impossible for people not to unite there..

(Erkin) as if not the sound of the instrument people invented those string but then not just a voice emerged not like a human’s voice as well it is humanity’s voice (...) the existence the universe like self-creted melody it
tells something for all of us (...) something very real emerges (...) there are no longer persons (...) I think it is impossible for everyone to not meet there

*Original*

*(Erkin)* enstrüman sesi gibi değil sanki o telleri insanlar icat etmiş de bilmem ondan sonra tu diye bir ses çıkmış gibi değil de böyle insan sesi de değil insanlığın sesi (...) varoluşun evrenin filan böyle sesi kendi kendine oluşan bi melodii hepimiz için bi şey anlatıyor (...) çok gerçek bir şey çıkıyor (...) birleri diye bi şey kalıyor (...) herkesin orda birleşmemesi mümkün değil diye düşünüyorsun

e) Lalangue and the Body

This subsection includes narrations about bodily experiences, sensation-like expressions, and subjective associations regarding the music and the instruments. Participants had difficulty finding words describing the experience in these narrations and frequently used expressions of bodily sensations for narratives.

Below, Hande described the sensations that music creates in her while playing her instrument. She mentioned the experience to be bodily such as syncing with the rhythm, maybe resembling sexuality.

*(Hande)* it is a bodily experience I guess mm compared to mmm maybe it could be hard for some people to understand but more like feeling the rhythm your heartbeat syncing with it more of bodily should I say like sexuality is it something bodily happens there

*Original*

*(Hande)* vücutsal bi deneyim sanırım u yeni anlaması belki zor olabılır bazı insanlar için ama daha böyle ritmi hissettğiðin kalp atışının da ona ayak uydurması daha bedensel bi şey cinsellik desem tam cinselliğe girer mi bi bodyli bi şey dönüyö

Erkin, beneath addressed his positive experiences concerning playing the piano. He emphasized that even the cells inside the human body might be regenerating in the mood..

*(Erkin)* it is an inexplicable feeling really getting into the mood maybe even cells inside a person regenerates that that moment

*Original*

*(Erkin)* tarîfsiz bi duygû yani o hakikaten bazen modu yakalamak insanın içinde belki hücreler falan yenileniyo o sırada
In the following quotation, Hande narrated her feelings that she has on the stage after not performing publicly for two years due to the Covid-19 pandemic. She resembled the sensations she has to be in love in high school: She described bodily sensations such as feeling “like my heart is going to explode” (kalbim ağzımdan çıkacak gibi olurdu).

(Hande) when I was in high school I deeply fell in love with a boy (…) there were couple of days when I don’t see him I would get sad when I’d see him suddenly it felt like my heart is going to explode now after the pandemics I have this sensation with the audience because of not giving public concert for 2 years I forgot the feeling

Original
(Hande) lisedeyken ben bi çocuğa aşık olmuşum böyle baya bi (…) birkaç gün görmediğim olurdu o zaman da üzüldüm bi gördüğüm zaman da kalbim ağzımdan çıkacak gibi olurdu şimdi o hissiyat pandemi sonrasında İİII audience a olmaya başladı çünkü 2 senedir halka konser vermeyip bu duyguyu unutmuşum

Below, Damla narrated a pleasurable moment during a performance. While describing feeling lucky for doing this profession during the performance, she mentioned experiencing goosebumps. She resembled the experience as “a beloved person hugging me” (çok sevdiğim bir insan bana sarılıyor).

(Damla) during the performance of la boheme I said to myself luckily I am doing this how lucky I am (…) we played enigma variations there then as well I felt goose bumps beginning from here in back of my neck (…) as if a beloved person hugging me like sometimes like I am becoming full of love

Original
(Damla) la boheme temsilinde demiştim ki ben iyi ki bu işi yapıyorum ya ne kadar şanslıym (…) enigma varyasyonları çalmıştık burada o zaman da böyle şeyi hissetmiştim böyle sürdən ensenin arkasından gelen böyle bi tüylerin diken diken olması (…) böyle sanki böyle çok sevdiğim bi insan bana sarılıyor gibi filan bazen hissediyorum yani böyle çok sanki içim sevgi doluyor gibi

Beneath, Adile described her feelings concerning impressions and sensations she gets when she plays a piece she loves. She resembled the musical sound to a
voice of a person full of love. Moreover, she emphasized feeling the vibrations of a nicely produced sound on her legs.

(Adile) it is like warmth like warm like voice of a person full of love it is like full of love not exactly romantic love but like love compassion (…) when producing a good sound then like it is inside you like your legs would vibrate

(Adile) sıcaklık sıcak bi şey sıcak bi sevgi dolu bir insan sesi gibi mesela onda şey teması ilk iyi sevgi dolu böyle aşk da diyemem sevgi şefkat (…) güzel tvlattığın zaman böyle o senin şeyinde içinde bacaklarında şey olur tıtreşir böyle hani

Ay Esra, below, mentioned a particular phase of mastering a piece. She narrated the emergence of a piece’s melodic line after the sight reading phase finalizes; she used the word “apetite” (iştah) to describe her experience concerning the piece.

(Esra) after sight reading is finished there is a really sweet moment when the piece sweetly starts to sound at those moments I my appetite really increases

(Esra) deşifre kısmı bittikten sonra çok tatlı bi zamanı var eserin artık tatlı tatlı bi kulağa gelmeye başladığı öyle zamanlarda çok iştahlanıyorum

Below, Meriç described sounds as the most authentic and powerful things in the world. She further emphasized that musicians speak more melodically due to being involved in the profession.

(Meriç) voice and frequency in the first place in the first place person’s sayings talks are sounds in fact musicians speak more melodically because we are involved with it and sound is in my opinion one of the truest and the most powerful things in the world

(Meriç) ses ve frekans bi kere en başta insanın da dediği konuşma da bi ses hatta müzisyenler daha melodik konuşuyo çok ilişkide olduğumuz için ve ses bence dünyadaki en gerçek ve en güçlü şeylerden birisi

89
In the following quotation, Erkin narrated a certain time while practising the piano in which he lets himself go and feels like someone else is playing the instrument. He described these moments to occur when he is alone, tired and hungry more likely: “it would arrive when I would get tired and hungry” (yorulduğum ve acıktığım zamanlarda geliyordu).

(Erkin) sometimes while playing alone there were times when I would get hungry it went on for years perhaps my blood sugar levels drop at I would not be really much cognitive at those times like I am letting myself go then wait a moment was this like that as if someone else is playing and I am encountering it like sometimes it would happen while practicing on my own it would arrive when I would get tired and hungry after practising so much as if someone else is filling me inside

Original

(Entes) bazen de tek başına çalarken acıktığım zamanlar olayordu uzun yıllar böyle gitti kan şekerim düşüyor herhalde çok böyle kognitif olamıyorum o zamanlarda kendimi biraz bırakırım öyle bir dakka öyle bir şey miymiş bu filan diye başka biri çalıyor da ben onla karşılaşıyormuşum gibi onlar bazen de kendim çalışırken olayordu çok uzun süredir çalışıp yorulduğum ve acıktığım zamanlarda geliyordu o içimde başka biri doluyor gibi böyle

Below, Nilay, whose mother is a violinist, described how she became convinced that the violin is her instrument. While mentioning that her mother gave it to her, she emphasized the importance of touching sensation in terms of feeling the instrument belonging to her. As a result, she said feeling “completion” (bütünleşme) with the instrument instantly after her mother gave it to her.

(Nilay) when my mom handed me the violin and that moment of holding it that feeling sense of touching maybe even though hearing is the foreground in music like since we do this with our body touching I guess that I felt completion when I took the violin I convinced me that violin is totally my instrument

Original

(Nilay) annem kemanı elime verdiğinde ve ilk o enstrümanı kavradığumda his dokunma duyuğu belki de aslında müzikte işitme duyuğu en baş ilk planda olmasına karşın hani dokunmayla bedeninizle yaptığımız bir şey olduğu için
zannediyorum elime aldığımdaki o bütünleşme tamamen onun benim enstrümanı olduğunu inanma yol açtı

In the following quotation, Erkin described his experience regarding two passages of a particular piece. While resembling the experience of those passages to a perfume reminding the oldest memories, he emphasized that he does not know what those two passages remind him of. He elaborated that he knows that the reminiscent thing is his and it touches him; however, the content is out of reach for him in the narration.

(Erkin) in the 8th nocture there are two passages well these always make sob there is this feeling hmm what feeling like you would go to a very past moment with smelling a perfume like that as if it is reminding something but I don’t understand what it reminds me of this reminds me of something that is mine that touches me and like it was like that right kind of feeling emerges inside me but what was is that it does not have a beginning very strange we experienced it right but where when etc. like feeling of remembrance

Original
(Erkin) 8. noctürnde iki tane pasaj var şey hüngür hüngür ağlatır böyle her zaman şey hissi oluyor o pasajlarda ii ne hissi oluyor böyle parfüümle filan çok geçmişe gidersin ya kokuyu duyup ii onun gibi böyle bi şeyi hatırlatıyor gibi his oluyor ama neyi hatırlattığını ben anlamıyorum o hatırlattığı şey benim bana çok dokunuyor ve ya böyledi di mi diye bi his oluyor içimde ama böyledi de mi ne onun şeyi yok başi yok yani çok garip bunu yaşamıştık di mi nerde ne zaman filan bi şeyi hatırlama hissi gibi
CHAPTER 4

DISCUSSION

This research aims to analyse a subject’s position concerning the object and the Other; and various psychic mechanisms stemming from the organisation. For this purpose, detailed interviews are conducted with classically trained professional pianists and violinists (since these two instruments have high connotations of virtuosity), and their discourses are analysed. The reasons behind selecting this specific population are: (1) music’s inherent features that contain elements of both language and lalangue, (2) the object being voice and involvement of the body, (3) the condensed relationship between the subject in relation to the object and the other since conservatoire education involves extensive investment on the instrument and music, and includes one-to-one lessons with the teacher, and (4) involvement of performing on the stage. At the end of analysing these interviews, data elements are grouped in alliance with Polkinghorne’s (1995) analysis of narratives. The emerged main sections of the analysis are: (1) They Were Always There, (2) Encounter, (3) That Precious Other, (4) The Dark Side / The Object That Takes It All, and (5) The Reward / The Object That Gives You All.

4.1. They Were Always There

This section is formulated around participants’ narrations about the ever-presence of music and their instruments throughout their lives. Here, the emphasis is that music and instrument are narrated in a way that goes as back as their recollection of their lives goes itself. It is important to note that the object they refer to seems inseparable from their first memories in their lives. According to Lacan (1960-1961/2015), the subject is structured via language through imaginary and symbolic identifications. In these identifications, the subject identifies with the signifier
through the Other. The ever-presence in the narrations suggests that music and instruments are significant signifiers for the participants.

The music and their instruments were always there. However, the reality of the presence is expressed differently in two ways: 1) The content or meaning they include differs in terms of positive or negative connotations, and 2) The language usage changes in terms of grammar as well in the sense that either active or passive tense is used in the description of the music’s ever-presence in their lives.

In the first case, “As Long as I Remember”, the ever-presence of music is described with positive, pleasant connotations, and the tense used is active. In this subsection, quotes include elements such as music beginning at the moment of birth, a relationship to music resembling a relationship to life itself, recalling the experience of soul overflowing when encountering music in a cartoon during childhood, and being very fortunate for now having such a profession.

In the second, “As Long as I Was Made to Remember”, unlike the previous subsection, the ever-presence of music is referred to be a negative, disturbing phenomenon, and the grammar used when denoting this is passive. In the subsection, it is emphasized that entering into conservatoire during childhood is not a type of decision that the child could make, that entering into professional education is a wish of their mother, that their father forced it, and the grammar used to denote these experiences tend to be passive. Meriç, while describing that entering into conservatoire and acquiring a profession was not her choice, used expressions “brought to conservatoire” (konseratuvara getirilmiş) and “was made to acquire as a profession” (meslek edindirilmiş) and subsequently when describing that the decision was right after all, the participant said, “I chose the correct thing by accident” (kazara doğru şeyi seçmişim).

Subjectification is a state where a subject attributes itself as an agent concerning an object or a situation (Fink, 1995). The passive and active grammar usage suggests participants’ subjectification regarding their objects. Active usage was more associated with positive associations, whereas passive usage was attributed to adverse situations. It suggests an individual’s tendency to attribute positive sides to themselves while leaving out negativity outside of their subjective area. Moreover, as Lacan (1959-1960/1997) suggested with his term “extimacy”, which is formed
with the combination of exterior and intimacy, where the opposition between interior and exterior is problematized not only in psychic reality but intersubjectively as well. The object, the fact that the signifier is already present in the discourse, indicates that it is already in the interior even though the subject places it in the exterior area.

4.2. Encounter

This second section presents participants’ narrations about their former imaginations and realities that emerged through encounters with others and the outside world. In other words, these are types of experiences that do not meet individuals’ expectations; thus, some sort of loss or disappointment is experienced. Thus, through these encounters, certain types of lack are experienced. Lacan (1956-1957/2020) differentiates between three types of lack: Privation, frustration and castration. These lack are explained through different agents and objects concerning the three registers: Real, Imaginary, and Symbolic. The lacks are interlinked in human life (Fidaner, 2021). Rather than a lack of concrete object or a specific agent who caused it, lacks are experienced in a psychic trajectory where an individual takes a position in relation to others and situations.

Regarding their function, the two radically different positions are privation and castration (Fidaner, 2021). Similarly, in this research, encounters appear to function differently for subjects: 1) Contesting the Imagination / Frustration and Privation, and 2) Confronting the Reality / Frustration and Castration. This study shows that the lack that occurs from these encounters is processed and experienced differently.

Frustration is centred on the dyadic relationship between an infant and mother (Lacan, 1956-1957/2020). When the real object, the breast, is denied, the mother’s symbolic love is also denied. Even when the object is later provided, it does not eliminate the wound of being deprived of love. In this sense, frustration is a primary way of experiencing a lack. As such, frustration occupies a middle road between privation and castration (Fidaner, 2021).

In the first way, narrations regarding frustrations are more prominent. Subjective positions in these narrations are more passive than the following subsection, and language usage also reflects this passivity. This passivity is thought
to be inherent in frustration and privation, where lack is caused by exterior agents of situations where such lack is not or could not be eliminated by subjects in their discourses. Here, participants’ narrations include elements such as coming across with a much more disciplined atmosphere than expected and being disappointed, growing away from the instrument since responsibility was too burdensome and that teachers do not quickly get satisfied, feeling like becoming “one of any” (her kişiden biri) and that to stand out one must really study hard etc.

Nilay mentioned accumulated general fear that results from the conservatoire atmosphere that affects everyone by saying, “negative feelings in the unconsciousness of us all” (bilinçaltına bi şekilde olumsuz duygular olarak yansıdı hepimizde olduğu) while giving an example of her dreams where the violin changes its shape and other irrational dreams in which the participant is about to play on stage but is not ready at all. Here, the negative consequences the subject denoted are attributed to an environment and the emphasis of “us all” could be thought to function as an amplifier of the agent’s role while diminishing the subject’s particularity in the lack described.

In one of the narrations, Yaren described a situation where some students were brought to the conservatoire and received special treatment because they were considered as prodigies. These unique treatments are narrated to be certain exemptions from particular classes, and they were allowed to do things that were not for others. While describing it, she used expressions such as “not forbidden for them” (yasak olmadığını) and “were provided with unlimited opportunities” (sınırsız imkan tanındığını). Here, the lack takes such a position where symbolic phallus is denied to the narrator, and it would not be possible to denote if it was not present in symbolic order for others. Moreover, the passive language usage is thought to denote an abstracted agent capable of such segregation, that is, an imaginary father. Thus, the lack is experienced as a privation of something real.

In another narration, Güliz narrated unrealistic dreams provided to students in the conservatoire, such as winning a competition, being successful, and eventually becoming a star and that after only graduation, it became clear that there is no such reality. Here, the lack is concentrated dyadically: she was denied something that she was promised as a conservatoire student. While conveying these, the participant used
the word “being pumped” (pompalanmak) of such dreams and said that, in reality, becoming a concert pianist was “truly a dream” (çok şey yani hayaldi). It could also be interpreted equivocally as both emphasizing a dream and conveying it as unrealistic. Here, a symbolic mother “pumps” the subject with false promises that she worked for so much, but then she was denied the real breast. Here, the focus is still on an outside agent who is not only responsible for her having a “dream” but also capable of depriving it of her. However, it is unclear in the discourse how such an object is denied; thus, the lack is a frustration of something imagined to be not provided. I think it is a technical difference from privation, where the real lack of an object has a place in the symbolic.

The second interrelated position of the subject when dealing with a lack is “Confronting the Reality / Frustration and Castration”. Here, the narrations include unpleasant encounters as well; however, there is a radical difference in terms of the subject positioning themselves in the narrations concerning the encounter: First of all, there is an active agent, a teacher, who promotes this; further, there is a sort of hard work involved, investment in the instrument or music pays off, and the language usage includes active tenses.

Castration includes the child stepping back from the efforts of being the phallus for the mother, and acceptance of a real father who possesses the phallus, thus accepting the lack (Lacan, 1956-1957/2020). Apart from solely depicting a moment in human life, castration, in essence, means refusal of certain jouissance and thus creating a space in the symbolic where it could be sought. Apart from the other two lacks, only in castration an individual transforms or operates in its lack via the symbolic debt.

A participant described a turning point in their relationship with their instrument and music. Accordingly, Damla was not taking it seriously until their teacher encountered her. The participant described this incidence as “(the instrument teacher) sat with me and said I see your (…) you aren’t taking it seriously (…) if you do not wish to go on (…) then we’ll just try to graduate you but if you say that you want it you need to practice properly” (çok net oturdu benle konuştu dedi ki ben görürüm senin (…) ama hani üstünde hiç durmadığını görüürüm (…) eğer dedi sen devam etmek istemiyorsan (…) seni sadece mezun etmeye uğraşalım ama yok
After this, Damla described entering into a strict practising regime and, in the end, starting to love their instrument and music again. Here, a real agent brings a sort of limitation or a concrete stance and provides a law: She must either pay the symbolic debt or symbolic castration or leave the system. With the limitation put forward, the subject gives up imaginary phallus. It is worth noting that she emphasizes this moment as a turning point after which she starts to love music.

Another participant, Esra, described how her relationship with the piano evolved into a relational dynamic and came to involve a question-answer manner thanks to her teacher. Accordingly, she learned that the piano could be responsive by saying, “the piano will respond to you when you touch it” (piyanoya okunduğun zaman onun sana nasıl cevap verdiği) thanks to her teacher where the process was challenging that included being scolded and her cryingly running, but where the teacher was “transferring everything he has with his whole soul with the whole body at the cost of depleting himself who wanted to give me all he has intravenously” (bütün ruhuyla bedeniyle bana kendisindekini tamamen aktaran ve bunu kendini bitirme pahasına içindekini bana damardan vermeyi isteyen bi hoca) who made it possible for her. Here, the castrating agent is described as a crucial agent for her concerning relating to the object. Symbolic debt is also emphasized here; even though the agent is challenging in the end, the agent is considered as someone who tries their best to convey the object to them.

A different participant, Hande, emphasized that his father forced the beginning of her journey in music. She describes a moment when she was in 6th grade that functioned as a turning point. At that time, she failed an exam and recalled two main thoughts: Disappointing her family and falling behind her peers. Afterwards, she described studying hard and taking a make-up exam. She emphasized that up until then, she was practising with her father’s force, but at that point, she did it all on her own. While pointing out the teacher’s amazement towards her developing so much on such short notice, she narrated that such feelings of achievement and contentment about it directed her to love music. Here, the object is subjectivized only after paying the symbolic debt. The failing, then putting effort into it, freed the object as being the other’s desire and positioned it as her desire.
Another participant, Meriç, described the general process of interpretation of a piece: producing clear sounds and fitting into the required structure as is expected regarding a composer’s approach. She elaborated that producing correct sounds takes long years to master, and then learning to play a piece in the correct style etc. After emphasizing that these processes require long hours of practising for an extended period of time, she then mentioned that after meeting these requirements, she, as an interpreter, can “step in” (devreye girmek). As in the case of alienation, where the subject’s body is limited by language, there is a forced choice as well in separation in desire. In case of alienation, the subject is provided with limitation, but without such limitation, there would have been no subject (Fink, 1995). Similarly, to be able to desire, a subject must separate from the Other. For this separation to occur, one must pay the symbolic debt: It is only through castration that an object can become a desired object; otherwise, the individual remains in the Other’s desire only.

This study revealed that subjects only position themselves as active agents through castration. This active position affects the usage of grammar as well. It is thought that, in other types of lacks, privation and castration, the subject occupies a position of victimhood via centring themselves in the area of the Other.

4.3. That Precious Other

The third section, “That Precious Other”, includes participants’ narrations regarding their instrument teachers. In participants’ narrations, their instrument teachers occupy a gravitational role, and the teachers appear to be definitive of their relationship with their instrument and music. The Other plays a constitutive role of the subject: Desire is the surplus of a need articulated in demand; thus, a subject’s desire is always the desire for the Other (Lacan, 1964/1998). As such, it means that desire is to be desired or recognized by the Other and that a subject desires from the perspective of the Other (Lacan, 1960/2006). The desired object also plays a crucial role here as no object has desirability on its own: It has desirability only through the Other.

This definitive role of the Other appears in two broad ways in the discourses: a) One Who Makes It All Possible, and b) One Who Thwarts.
In the first position, participants described their teachers as occupying central roles in various aspects of their lives: Love for the instrument, choice of instrument, motivation for practicing, experiences of the stage etc. Further, the participants described their teachers positively with vigorous adjectives. Here the object of desire is narrated in a connected manner through the individual and the teacher.

One participant, Hande, whose father played a vital role in entering the conservatoire and practicing when she was a child, described her violin teacher as “like a father” (babam gigidir) to her. Another participant, Nilay, lost her father when she was 11, and her violin teacher became her neighbour simultaneously. She described this as “the biggest miracle of my life (...) a bond beyond just a concidence” (hayatımdaki en büyük mucize (...) tesadüfün ötesinde bir bağ) and that “in a sense my teacher took his (father) place like my violin father” (onun (babamin) yerini bi nevi hocam aldı benim keman babam gibi). Lacan (1960-1961/2015) referred to transference as a love relationship where the person puts another one in a position where the Other was positioned. In this regard, the instrument teacher’s position occupies the role of the Other to whom love is transferred as well as the position of “the subject supposed to know”, which denotes a position where self-knowledge is attributed to another person.

A participant, Yaren, described how the approach of her teacher made her feel like “the best pianist” (en iyi piyanist) when she was “unable to play” (çalamayan halimle) and further, this motivated her to practice and as a result, she felt like capable of achieving. Here, the subject’s desire is supported, recognized, or in other words, supported by the Other’s desire which in turn simultaneously renders one’s own investment in it and internalization of achievement as a result. Another participant, Erkin, described a shift in his excitement state on the stage after being without a teacher as “there is no one behind me” (arkamda biri yok) and stated his teacher’s effect on him as “he would say you are a lion a tiger (...) would go up (to the stage) like there is no threat” (aslansın koç (...) filan diyordu ve he he he diye çıkyorsun (sahneye) yani hani bi tehdit olmuyordu). In both narrations, there is identification through the Other as well: Identification, one of the most critical concepts in psychoanalysis, denotes the complicated nature of subjective construction (Laplanche & Pontalis, 1967/1973). Primary identification refers to
identifying with the specular image that one has, whereas secondary identification refers to one’s identification with specific signifiers through the Other (Lacan, 1948/2006). Even though related, the primary identification refers more to the jubilation of becoming whole concerning the image, whereas the second one refers to the identification with an image through language. In participants’ descriptions of their teachers’ quotes denoting their qualities, they gain recognition and a certain sense of validation that affect their relationship with their objects.

A different participant, Nilay, described that during childhood, practicing the violin “was like living itself (...)” (yaşamakla bir olurdu). She would practice six to eight hours a day: She emphasized her teacher’s role in it as “practicing at same hours with him was like master-apprentice (...) taking an example of him was a big source of motivation” (aynı saatlerde onuna çalışıyor olmak hani ustça çıkar gibi (...) onu örneklıyor olmak çok bir motivasyon olurdu). Freud (1921/1949) described identification as embracement and internalization of certain aspects of others. Accordingly, these adopted qualities constitute layers of ego and superego. Another participant, Güven, stated that he had become more and more comfortable on the stage during his education as a result of being known as one of the “good students of (the teacher)” ((hocanın) iyi öğrencileri), which made his confidence grew. Güven’s experience denotes secondary identification, where he became more confident through identifying with a signifier. According to Lacan (1948/2006), identification with a signifier also transforms aggressivity inherent in the imaginary identification, where the identification with the image alone provides misrecognition itself. Thus, becoming more confident on the stage could be accounted for by identifying with the signifier.

A different participant, Esra, narrated how her relationship with the piano drastically changed concerning her teacher. She described this shift as “up until my teacher taught me how an extraordinary thing is the piano and taught me how wrong I was approaching to it and taught me how whole technique musicality and everything should be it was like a duty but then I really fell in love with the piano and that is when I really hugged the piano for the first time” (hocam bana bu piyanonun ne kadar olağan üstü bi şey ve nası yanlış yaklaştığımı öğretip de bütün tekniğini müzikalitemi her şeyi nası düşünmem gerektiğini öğretinceye kadar görev
gibi gitti ondan sonra piyanoya gerçekten aşık oldum ve ııı ilk defa o zaman gerçek anlamda sarıldım piyanoya). Here, the Other occupies such a role that it makes it possible for a subject to desire an object. There is a description where duty becomes love: There is a shift in an object for a subject. So how can the Other’s presence for the subject make this shift possible? Here, the Other for the subject is capable of such shift via investing: The Other is involved in such a way with the subject, or desires, that shifts “everything” (*her şeyi*). Thus, the Other’s desire becomes sublimed through the object. It is thought that through such triangulation, where the object is a mutual desire, the love is experienced in a metaphorical sense where condensation happens.

In the way of relating the Other, “One Who Thwarts, in contrast to the previous one, the teachers are described as hindering or thwarting. In these narrations, the teachers are imposing, hindering one’s relationship with music and their instruments, impeding their experiences on the stage, aggressive, traumatizing, abusive, having adverse effects even on their characters etc. The Other is still of central importance but in a totally different position.

One participant, Yaren, described that some teachers impose a particular way of education and use their students to prove themselves, thus disregarding students’ personalities. In this regard, Yaren said teachers should be aware that a student is “a separate individual” (*bambaşka biri*). In another quote, Yaren also described how she became even more “timid” (*ürkek*) during childhood due to her teacher’s expectations and yelling. Another participant, Adile, described her experience of participating in a violin competition during middle school in which she did not feel ready and yet participated due to her teacher’s guidance. Already knowing that she did not win, she described a phone call between her and her teacher where she was crying a lot, but all the teacher said was, “so you did not get the award” (*ödül alamadın mı*). She emphasized that her tremors and excessive excitement began on the stage after this incident. In these narrations, the relationship between the Other and the subject is not possible since there is no common object: The Other is perceived as an omnipotent agent with no consideration for a subjective being and where the subject perceives themselves as their objects, extremities of the Other where they are reduced to the specific individual interest of the Other in which their
subjective beings are not taken into account. Thus, when the Other is engulfing, it hinders the subject’s relationship with the object or desire.

A participant, Erkin, described a comment from his teacher about him playing “a little diffident” (biraz pisürük) and that he needed to develop further his playing, which demoralized him. While saying that he needed to pay attention as if he must “justify” (hesap vermek) each note, Erkin described feeling so hurt that he forgot what he was playing. Another participant, Güliz, narrated that she began her piano studies with her mother, who was “harsh” (sert) and would apply “a little violence” (minik şiddetler): She described that her mother’s authority was ever-present. In a different quote, Güliz described that practicing the piano was difficult since she felt that each weekly piano lesson was “an exam” (sinav) where she strived to gain the admiration and approval of her teacher. In these narrations, the Other occupies a role where the subjects feel they need to “justify” something or are in a constant state of “exam” ination. As such, there is no room for one’s desire; it is all about approval.

In these narrations, the subjective positions are encompassed by the presence of the Other: there is no desire as such, no recognition or communication, yet the Other occupies dimensions of subjectivity for the subjects where they do not approach the object without the thwarts of the Other.

4.4. The Dark Side / The Object That Takes It All

This section refers to participants’ narrations about adverse experiences concerning music and their instruments, in other words, regarding their objects. In other words, here, the subjects’ relations to their symptoms concerning objects are clustered. Both Lacan and Freud regarded the emergence of a symptom as a compromise between clashing distinct motivations (Evans 2006; Lacan, 1953/2006). Further, Lacan (1960-1961/2015) positioned symptoms in language as a function of the signifier. Furthermore, since it functions as a signifier, it is also a metaphor where the body or a function attains a condensed signifying role. As a result, the symptom, even though hidden, contains a message that addresses the subject for others.

Even though this section has five subcategories, in terms of the object’s function for the subject, it has been divided into three parts for discussion. In the first part, the subcategories “One Cannot Not Practice”, “(Passive) Resistance”, and
“Encapsulation” revolve around the instrument being the object of obsession accompanied by feelings of guilt, isolation, a sense of duty, pain, and obligation. The first part directly includes participants’ narrations concerning the negative sides of their relation to the objects. In this sense, symptom emerges in relation to the object in the way that the message’s recipient is hidden in the discourse. As such, the recipient of symptoms is ambiguous.

In “One Cannot Not Practice”, the narrations include an obligation to study long hours and feeling guilty if it is not fulfilled. Concerning practicing, Güliz stated, “every day regardless of me wanting or not (...) it is a must you must practice” (her gün istese de istemesem de (...) gerekir çalışmak gerekir) and Meriç said that since this profession requires “devotion” (adanmışlık), one must always practice and if practicing is really not possible that day one should use one day as a right (hak) to not practice but chose that day wisely. Here, the function of identification with the signifier is thought to be present. Accordingly, a subject internalizes specific values, norms, and rules that one ought to do; if not, then it is associated with guilt (Lacan, 1960-1961/2015). The associated guilt’s rigidness is a function of the metaphoric condensation of the signifier. Another participant, Nilay, described childhood times during summer when she would not practice the violin for 20 days or one month while feeling guilty all the time while her nonmusician friend would be enjoying the seaside. After such a period, she would begin to practice again would be “very painful” (çok acı verici) and require compensation. Adile described practicing in a room without getting a brake until she runs “out of breath” (nefessiz kalana kadar). In both of these narrations, these practices involving bodily pain and limitations include an element of phallic jouissance. Phallic jouissance is a type of jouissance where a surplus of enjoyment is achieved through mastering the body through the symbolic, where limitation is brought to the body for the purposes of attaining an idealized phallic signifier (Lacan, 1972-1973/1999). Due to these characteristics, the phallic jouissance is located in the convergence of the symbolic and the real chains of the Borromean Knot.

Moreover, in “(Passive) Resistance”, Yaren mentioned that beginning to practice a new piece is tough and that she always procrastinates. Procrastination functions as a way of delaying castration or limitation (Gherovici & Webster, 2014).
In this sense, a jouissance is experienced as an effort to delay or resist a constraint that is about to occur. Esra described becoming fixated over a part of a piece and that this becomes “a huge addiction” (çok büyük bi bağımlılık) and hinders her from performing that piece on stage. Here, going on the stage is constrained via fixating on a part of a piece. Going on the stage could resemble presenting a subject through an object for the audience or others. Thus, by avoiding it, the encounter is also avoided. In this sense, there is resistance towards a possible lack that could occur during an encounter. Another participant, Güliz, described her experience of obsessing about a passage of a piece. While somehow not achieving a passage of a piece and obsessing over it, which brings her to a “strange (…) charmless place” (garip (…) sevimsiz bi yer), she narrated practising five hours just for the sake of practicing in a very unproductive manner which involved “blindly going on” (kör bi şekilde yapılan) practicing and makes her feel alienated both from the piano and music. Here, through ego-ideal, there is a must in practicing; however, somehow, an error occurs, and the passage does not happen to resolve. Even though she puts in hours and does the work, some other mechanism prevents her from achieving that passage. In this sense, it could be said that there is resistance to the identified signifier. Since the symptom is an ambiguous message, it could be thought that there is resistance to the Other, the agent of symbolic identification via signifier.

Moreover, in “Encapsulation”, Yaren referred to the profession and the conservatoire environment, where people study in a room the whole day, be in the same environment with the same people for long years wearing “horse glasses” (at gözlüğü), be “isolated” (izole), and then emphasizing that a person could be filled with the love of music only when approaches to it holistically (including history, philosophy, psychology, sociology etc.). Here, the same space and isolation could be regarded as a lack of separation in desire from the Other. Only when something else, a holistic approach, functions as a third agent that would protect the subject from immersing into the Other’s desire. Güliz mentioned an obsessive effort in trying to accomplish, "trying to make it happen" (oldurmaya çalışmak) and described this as “as if there is no other option (…) putting yourself in a small box” (sanki başka bi seçenek yokmuş gibi (…) küçük şeylere kutulara sokmak kendini). So, what is it that the subject puts into a small box, and what is this small box? Since identification
with a signifier denotes certain limitations, the box could represent the signifier that she both tries to put herself but at the same time resisting to it as well. Thus, again, the recipient of the message here is also the Other, who seems to be limiting the subject and encompassing subjectivity with their desire.

Austrian film director M. Haneke, in his movie titled “The White Ribbon”, depicted the childhoods of the obedient German generation of the Nazi period (Gagua, 2016). In the movie, the characters are under the strict regime of their parents. Even though the children seemed to be obedient, they were engaging in certain aggression, acting out from time to time. The confrontation or communication would never happen; However, the messages were delivered in a symptomatic manner. In the above narrations, where practicing goes on, and a person obsessively tries to make it happen could be seen as following the necessary rules from the outside.

Moreover, not seeming to achieve it regardless of obsessive practice could indicate resistance to the Other via the object. In this sense, as in the movie, the obedient might be following the rules blindly, and the Other who carries these laws eliminates the subject’s subjectivity. The emergence of symptoms, in this sense, is a subjective strategy of resisting that encapsulation.

While describing having negative experiences due to a certain pressure for practicing the violin, Nilay added, “I mean I love it very much but” (hani çok seviyorum) and “I mean we all love” (yani hepimiz seviyoruz ama) before saying “let it be but let other things be as well” (o olsun ama başka şeyler de olsun). Here, the emphasis on loving it before adding the “but” part could be interpreted as a function of the ego ideal: Not loving could have components triggering guilt. Moreover, the narration indicates the existence of a condensed object where the presence of other things is limited.

The following section, “Uncanny Me: What Will Leak from Me on the Stage”, includes analyses of negative stage experiences. Both the past adverse past experiences and frightful anticipations concerning the stage are one of the most prevalent and gravitational themes in the participants’ narrations. Güliz described the importance of playing on the stage as it represents labour for long months. While emphasizing that she wished it to be a good representation, this wish itself would be
the source of her anxiety and fear. While Freud positioned anxiety in separation from the mother, Lacan (1962-1963/2014), on the contrary, argued that the source of anxiety is precisely the threat of not separating from the mother. Accordingly, anxiety has an object that is of special status: objet petit a. This object does not denote a particular object but a particular emptiness where the desire can be directed. Thus, the more an unconscious question of “What the Other wants” gets a clearer answer; the more an object becomes the bearer of such an answer, the more anxiety would occur. Similarly, Damla emphasized that after taking music and the instrument more seriously, it became harder for her, and Esra stated that the more she ascribed the importance, the more ruthless she became in her performance.

And what happens during performing on the stage when things go in an unwanted direction? Participants commonly described bodily reactions such as perceived heartbeat, cold hands, and trembling during bad performances on the stage; for example, Güven described “that sensation the heartbeat ice cold hands hmm like something in the stomach” (kalp çarpıntısı buz gibi el ııı şey böyle karında bi karında bir şey). Lacan (1962-1963/2014) described anxiety as an affect rather than an emotion since it is placed outside of symbolic order. In this regard, bodily reactions are high since there is resistance to symbolization. During such a performance on stage, Adile described experiencing unstoppable trembling from her toes to her hair, where she managed to come to the end of the piece where her bow bounced. She emphasized that there were no musical expressions and that she was “in a state of war” (savaşma halindeyim). Lacan (1962-1963/2014) positioned anxiety between jouissance and castration because an object becomes a threat of occupying the position of objet petit a. Adile stated that her anxiety in relation to the stage began after losing a competition, in which she did not feel ready but participated due to her teacher wanting. Regardless of the crying, the teacher only commented on her losing the competition. In this regard, the “state of war” could be considered a war against the Other to not lose the desire: A resistance to an object that is so crucial for the desire of the Other.

Further, while narrating a lousy performance, Güven emphasized that no matter how much one prepares beforehand, there is a different state during a performance. This unpredictability is also described by Esra, who says that
performance on the stage varies in a daily manner since simultaneity is involved, and she emphasized that this quality is the reason why it is so beautiful and also renders it to be the most fearsome thing as well. According to Freud (1919/2003), something is uncanny (unheimlich) when it appears both as a novelty and a reminder of something being not only disguised from the public but also from the individual. During an encounter, a particular component of internal tension is projected into an external element. Lacan (1962-1963/2014) also referred to the concept and linked it with anxiety. Accordingly, a seducing image, in other words, a narcissistic captivation, can suddenly reveal a hidden element. Similarly, something surprising might emerge on the stage, regardless of the preparation. It is thought that when things go unexpectedly bad on stage, and various physical symptoms accompany it, a certain encounter with a hidden element occurs. In this manner, it is always possible to suddenly encounter an uncanny self on the stage.

In another quote, Esra elaborated on her hesitation regarding the stage. She described a vicious cycle of not getting on the stage because she does not feel ready and, due to not getting on the stage, not developing the experience necessary for performing well. While describing being ready as “above human thing” (insan üstü bi şey), she described being afraid of self-sabotaging, such as not being in the flow or forgetting the fragments of a piece. She said that perceptions of listeners play a huge role for her, where she fears that they would make the worst possible comments. This quote sums up uncanniness suddenly appearing on the surface, protecting one from becoming an “above human thing” and not going on the stage, also protecting from not becoming above human thing by projections of various fears of her from an imaginary audience.

After a performance on stage, when he believed to have played shamefully, Erkin described how he did not believe in clapping, “bravo”s, and comments of the audience thinking that they must have been mocking him. Here, the inherent ambiguity of meanings in language and communication is thought to be demonstrated. Lacan (1954-1955/1991) indicated that in communication, words pass through the wall of imagination of individuals. While not believing in little others’ comments but taking seriously his teacher’s “you’re a lion a tiger” (aslansın kaplansın) remarks, Erkin’s quotes indicate how definitive the subject’s ascribed
roles to others are. Signifiers, when coming from the Other, have totally different signification than those coming from others.

Throughout the interviews, another common emerging theme was not having a passion for music and the instrument all the time, not wanting to practice sometimes, or getting away from the instrument periodically. Here, “Going Back and Forth / Fort Da” narrations of getting away and returning are analyzed. Lacan (1964/1998) referred to Freud’s Fort-Da, a game with a wooden toy being attached to a string that he came to observe through his grandson, where the child says “gone” (fort) while throwing the toy and “back” (da) when the toy is retrieved. Accordingly, this game demonstrates the process of wanting something: An object must be held at a certain distance to become desirable. A subject’s relation with an object occupies such a role where putting distance and then getting close again is experienced in a repetitious manner. Similarly, the moment when the imagination begins is when the breast is not present for the baby (Lacan, 1964/1998).

One participant, Yaren, described several times when she got away and returned to the piano. During a time of getting away, she described thinking there were many different life struggles and finding it absurd to sit in a room and practice the piano. While describing her relationship with the music at the time of the interview, she said “I question whether I have a deep relationship with the music or not I think I need to get to know the music anew as if I do not know it at all I need a new bond (…) we’ve broken up with it right now” (müzikle o kadar derin ilişkim yok mu onu anlamaya çalışıyorum galiba benim baştan tanışmam gerekiyor müzikle sıfırdan sanki hiç bilmiyormuşum gibi yeni bir bağ kurma ihtiyacı içerisindeyim (…) şu an bi koptuk kendisiyle). Here, the terms used for relating the object are thought to be associated with expressions that could be used in a relationship with a human. She describes questioning her relationship, a need to renew it, and a wish to rebounding with it.

Another participant, Esra elaborated on her cycles of getting away and coming back to the piano as such “sometimes when I do not get the answer I want (…) jew at it or when I do not get it fast enough (…) sometimes (…) I do not convey properly then I say instead of hearing nonsense sound there is no sense in forcing today (…) but eventually I miss and I return” (bazen istedigiin cevabi alamadığında...
According to Freud (1930/1961), life drives gravitate towards harmony, unity, and cohesion both within the psyche and between the individual and its environment. Death drives function in opposite directions, towards destruction and undoing the unit: These drives do not exist in purified forms but in a manner of fusion. Lacan distinguished pleasure and jouissance, where pleasure maintains homeostasis and jouissance threatens it (Evans, 2016). Das Ding, the cause of fundamental passion in the human psyche, is the primary object of desire and is sought after by individuals throughout their lives (Lacan, 1959-1960/1997). Das Ding includes strictly real elements since it is prehistoric and resists signification. For this reason, this prehistoric and lost object is maintained at a certain distance so that instead of attaining it, the subject circles around it. In this manner, homeostasis is maintained in the psyche. Similarly, anxiety experiences concerning the stage might be thought to protect one from jouissance or getting too close to Das Ding. Getting away from the object, instrument and/or music could also be interpreted as a strategy for homeostasis. In this sense, when the subject experiences too much encapsulation by the object or the Other, drawing a distance makes it possible for individuals to re-find it and reform the relationship. In this manner, circling around the object without getting too close is maintained in the psyche.

Finally, Lacan (1959-1960/1997) conceptualized that the death drive is permanently present in creative energy as well; in this manner, the death drive is actually a will for creating again from the ashes. It, in fact, further elaborates the function of the Fort / Da game, where going away is accompanied by rebonding or rejoining the object.

4.5. The Reward / The Object That Gives You All

In “Passionate Devotion”, generally rewarding aspects of music and instruments are included; here, the object gives everything to the subject. It has five
dimensions: (a) Passionate Devotion, (b) Jubilation, (c) Shining and Sharing / The Stage, (d) Universal Unification, and (e) Lalangue and the Body. Each of these dimensions defines distinct but interrelated aspects of the rewarding object. In the Borromean Knot, a topological representation of the structure, objet petit a is situated in the merge of the real, the imaginary and the symbolic registers (Lacan, 1975-1976/2016). In this sense, it is such a position that it includes the elements of real, imaginary, and symbolic aspects.

In “Passionate Devotion”, clusters of the narrations of the participants’ passion towards their instruments and music are combined. This passion is parallel with their devotion as well. A participant, Esra, described that while playing the piano, everything else could remain outside; one can take out all of their ambitions, sometimes just experiencing romance and emphasized that “the piano is the love itself” (kendi başına bi aşk piyano). Here, the emotion of love in combination with communication denotes combinations of the imaginary and the symbolic, which topologically includes emotions and meanings. Further, Kemal said that the violin is their passion, and this makes him dwell on it more and described it as “you want to be saturated (...) what else can I add what else can I do” (doymak istiyorsunuz (...) daha ne katabilirim daha ne yapabilirim) In this quote, the emphasis of adding something else denotes desire’s function as a metonymy, which leads to an endless chain of a signifier referring to another. Furthermore, during listening to a concert, Erkin described feeling “overflowing” (taşıyamayacağım kadar çok şey) and “horny” (azgın) and emphasized that he wanted to do it since it was “a total love I mean nothing else matters” (aşk yani başka hiçbir şeyin önemi yok). Here, the bodily sensations and sexuality include elements of real and sexual component that denotes one of the irreplaceable quality of the desire. In another quote, Erkin stated practicing the piano while not eating or not sleeping and just being thrilled to go on. Here, phallic jouissance, which limits the body in the pursuit of the phallus, which is situated between the real and the symbolic, is accompanied by the imaginary elements, emotion and meaning. Güven emphasized his devotion to the piano as being “ready to make any sacrifices” (her türlü fedakarlığı yapabilecek) since feeling like “nothing else would make me that happy” (anda beni hiçbir şey o kadar mutlu
etmiycek). In this last quote, the symbolic function of objet petit a, that is, symbolic debt, is accompanied by an imaginary aspect: an urge for and meaning of happiness.

It is useful to draw the difference between the object of passion and obsession (described above in “The Dark Side: The Object that Takes It All”). Concerning the object of obsession, the subject’s subjectivity is encompassed by the Other. The subject is limited through obsessed objects and put in “boxes”; the subject is isolated. Regarding the object of passion, on the other hand, the subject receives “everything” through it, is in love with it, and desires to achieve it. Thus, even though from the outside, both objects are of investment for the subject (such as long hours of practicing), the nature of these objects and the subjects’ experiences concerning the object are polar opposites.

In “Jubilation”, the narrations about the moment a piece begins to form together after long practice periods are included. The moment is usually depicted as a point where myriad notes, difficult technical passages, melodic structure, and stylistic requirements finally come together: Finally, the fragments unite into wholeness. These descriptions are accompanied by gladness, content, jubilioso etc.

Güliz described a state of becoming able to play a piece after many processes of practising. She explained that this state is on its own a source of feeling good, as “seeing myself being able to (...) you can perform it (...) seeing your fingers do those certain passages” (kendimi bi şeyi u yapabiliyo görmek (...) icra edebilyosun (...) parmakların o çeşitli pasajları yapabiliyo). Lacan (1956-1957/2020) conceptualized the mirror stage as a constant representation of the structure of subjectivity of individuals throughout their lives. Here, Güliz’s denotation of seeing her fingers play and the pieces of a musical piece coming together in the form of being able to play represents the jubilation of the body part coming together on the mirror stage.

Nilay also described this process of a piece starting to form together where sounds become clearer, calluses form, and get tired as well are “evidence” (kanıt) of her achieving it and thus a way of “saying to myself well done” (kendime aferin demenin yolu). Here, the achievement of the ego-ideal, a product of identifying with the signifier, is narrated: These evidences function as proof of her doing it well, as the signifier necessitated it.
On top of this moment of a piece forming together, when the piece is well demonstrated on the stage, it becomes satisfactory even more. Meriç stated feeling “a little pride” (ufak bi gurur) as she could present everything she practiced on the stage. Esra also described this as “an emotion at its peak” (zirvede bi duygũ) to be able to peak on the stage and that everyone witnessed it. Here, it is indicated that on the top of meeting the criteria for jubilation, it is witnessed by others, which becomes a source of pride: As if one seeing its reflection in the mirror is acknowledged by others who see it as well.

“Shining and Sharing / The Stage” denotes experiences of the foremost and extensive themes in the narrations: the stage. Here, the favourable aspects are included, including the communication of non-verbal things with the listeners. Here, by entering into the communication of otherwise non-communicable aspects, the mechanism of sublimation is considered.

Nilay mentioned one of the satisfactory things about being on a stage as being at the centre of attention and sharing something that only belongs to the player. Hande also emphasized a similar aspect of being at the centre of the gaze and everyone listening. Moreover, Kemal stated that the source of excitement about the stage is the excitement of meeting with the audience. Nilay also stressed that the thing that makes her happiest when being on the stage is sharing. Meriç, mentioned satisfaction via merging her ability and sharing as “if you manage to flow on the top of it if you can also establish a contact with the audience it becomes priceless for me” (akatabiliyorsan bir de üzerine seyirciyle de bir kontakt kurabilıyorsan bu benim için paha biçilmez bir şey). It is interesting that after (partial) jubilation of the ideal ego and meeting the fulfilments of (elements of) the ego-ideal are met, the “best” part of the stage experience emerges, that is, communication.

According to Lacan (1959-1960/1997), sublimation does not mean for a drive to be directed in a socially accepted way: On the contrary, change occurs in the subject’s relation to the object because the drive is already imprinted to the subject through the signifier. In one concert, Adile described playing a piece’s finale part where the orchestra felt something similar, and the audience also got affected by it. The words she used to describe this are “spiritual consciousness” (ruhsal bi bilינç) and “miraculous” (mucizevî), and she said that this miraculous was made possible by
being concentrated on music. Another participant, Erkin, narrated a similar state where while playing to hundreds of listeners, at a particular moment, everything changes; he himself, the sounds that he makes, which he denotes as “mystery” (gizem (...) mystery). Yaren also described a state on a stage when one “unifies” (bütünleşme) with the piece, with the person with whom it is played together, and with the audience as well: She likened this moment to vanishing “solidness” (katılık) and everything becoming “permeable” (geçirgen). Here, the participants talk about complete unification. According to Lacan (1969-1970/2007), due to the inherent nature of language, communication always goes through various barriers and “sexual relation is not possible” since total conveyance of an experience is both never attainable to a subject and even more impossible among individuals. In this sense, an impossibility is attained through a specific positioning of an individual via the object: That is, sublimation.

In “universal unification”, participants’ sense of unification through the music and their instrument goes beyond the stage and the audience present at that moment. In the narrations cluster under this subsection, participants convey their sense of connectedness with a poet or a composer that lived many hundred years ago, their teachers, the universe etc. Here, a sense of sharing goes well beyond the audience and their capacity for perfection in others’ presence or meeting requirements. Here, the impossibility of communication is not only eliminated between the immediate audience and the artist but also beyond the borders of death.

One participant, Erkin, narrated some “enchanting” (büyüleyici) moments during his piano lessons: While his teacher would notice something and direct him towards that Erkin would do, the teacher’s face would lid up. At those moments, Erkin described feeling like becoming confidants with the teacher of something both “very private” (çok mahrem) and also “universal” (evrensel), and together cocreating and matching with a composer who lived centuries ago. Another participant, Yaren, described a similar experience where in a lesson, they were discussing a poem on which the musical piece was based on. While saying that she understood the meaning of music at that point, she elaborated that it was “magical enchanting” (büyülü sihirli) that a poet, a composer, and they themselves could interact across centuries in an abstract fashion where each of them has their own unique understanding as well.
In another quote, while talking about the sound of the piano, he said: “as if not the sound of the instrument people invented those string but then not just a voice emerged not like a human’s voice as well it is humanity’s voice” (enstrüman sesi gibi değil sanki o telleri insanlar icat etmiş de hâlinde o ses çıkmış gibi değil de böyle insan sesi de değil insanlığın sesi) and that as if the melody created itself and has something to tell for everyone. While emphasizing that in front of the melody, the boundary between people disappears, he said, “it is impossible for everyone not to meet there” (herkesin orda birleşmemesi mümkün değil). In these examples, it is crucial to note that the impossibility of unification is nevertheless eliminated through symbolic function where the poet, the composer, the artist, the teacher or humanity, in general, are merged via the work at hand. Here, it is thought to function beyond the mirror stage, where the function of ego via an object and signifier is channelled through a mechanism, sublimation: Something that is “very private” is also “universal”. According to Lacan, through the mechanism of sublimation, a subject “raises an object (...) to the dignity of Das Ding” (Lacan, 1959-1960/1997). It means that an object becomes so dense in terms of drives that it functions as a condensed object where long-lost unity is partially to be addressed.

In the last subsection, “Lalangue and the Body”, narrations regarding instruments and music, which include sensation-like expressions, bodily reactions, and subjective associations, are included. Here, participants had difficulty in terms of finding corresponding words to the experiences they wanted to convey.

While describing the bodily effect of music, Hande said, “heartbeat syncing with the music (...) should I say like sexuality” (kalp atışının da ona ayak uydurması (...) bedensel bi şey cinselliğ). Further, Adile described “when producing a good sound then like it is inside you like your legs would vibrate” (güzellik tınıttığın zaman böyle o senin şeyinde içinde bacaklarında şey olur titreşir böyle hani). In this regard, Erkin said music’s effect of being an “inexplicable feeling (...) even cells inside a person regenerates that that moment” (tarıfsız bi duygulu (...) hücreler fahan yenileniyo o sıradan). In these narrations, experience is likened to bodily sensations that are in the area of the real. Difficulty in terms of finding corresponding words to the experiences is also concerning the real being resistant to the language. In this regard,
where the pleasure is located in the real, the object is thought to represent the prelinguistic area of Das Ding, which is also resistant to language.

When describing the effect of playing a beloved piece, Adile also said “it is like warmth like warm like voice of a person full of love it is like full of love not exactly romantic love but like love compassion” (sicaklık sıcak bi şey sıcak bi sevgi dolu bir insan sesi gibi mesela onda şey teması ilk iyi sevgi dolu böyle aşk da diyemem sevgi şefkat). According to Lacan (1954-1955/1991), the role of the imaginary role occupied by language should never be eliminated since all of the signification is dependent on ambiguity. Moreover, the most semantically undeciphered part of language is lalangue (Lacan, 1972-1973/1999). Music, rich in its symbolic properties, is also a densely non-semantical way of communication. In this sense, music can convey a meaning that is both not understandable but rich in the sense of providing familiarity and imagination. When conveying a pleasurable moment regarding music, Damla similarly described a moment while playing in an orchestra where she thought to be very lucky. For denoting her experiences at that moment, she said “I felt goose bumps beginning from here in back of my neck (…) as if a beloved person hugs me like sometimes like I am becoming full of love” (ensenin arkasından gelen böyle bi tüylerin diken diken olması (…) böyle sanki böyle çok sevgiğim bi insan bana sarılıyor gibi). Voice is one of the most fundamental ways a subject relates to the Other: The voice denotes an answer to the demand, the answers to the demand to the Other, and the Other’s response to it (Anzieu, 1985/2016). In this sense, music, as a highly refined form of voice organization, could be thought to trigger the fundamental dynamic of the relationship between the subject and the Other.

A participant, Esra, denoted a moment when the piece she plays starts sounding sweet and said that at those moments, her “appetite increases a lot” (çok istahlanıyorum). Lacan (1964/1998) described the invocatory drive as a call to the Other to be heard. In this sense, its object, the voice, functions as a primary form of articulation and signification. Thus, voice is the primary means of a demand to be addressed. Being fed, for instance, oral drive, can be communicated via the infant’s and the Other’s vocal interaction. Here, the association of “sweet voice” and “appetite” exemplifies the function of invocatory drive that is associated in narration
with hunger and appetite. Erkin described a certain sense of getting pleasurable surprising sounds from the piano as if someone else is playing when he practices alone: He said that “it would arrive when I would get tired and hungry after practising so much as if someone else is filling me inside” (çok uzun süredir çalışıp yoruldüğüm ve açığım zamanlarda geliyordu o içimde başka biri doluyor gibi). In this quotation, being hungry and tired is even further associated with the arrival of others through voice. More, the quote of getting filled by someone else could be thought prehistoric unification with the Other, or Das Ding.

Sound functions as a reminder of something that is long lost since it is one of the fundamental aspects of a subject’s structural formation (Anziou, 1985/2016; Grassi, 2021). In the following quotation, Erkin described his experience concerning two passages of a particular piece. While resembling the experience of those passages to a perfume reminding the oldest memories, he emphasized that he does not know what those two passages remind him of. He elaborated on knowing the reminiscent thing to be “his” or “him” (benim o) and that it touches him; however, the content of that thing is out of reach for him in the narration. The content is both familiar, but not it is not something concrete; it suggests an unconscious material that is not so much out of reach as well. This familiarity could be placed in a prelinguistic or prehistoric area that is recalled through lalangue.

Since music and instrument is a condensed object for participants, meaning that it includes many partial objects, it comes close to representing desire and posit themselves as objet petit that represents the lack. Moreover, since this object includes bodily experiences and is sublimed, the subjects elevate this object to the position of Das Ding. Since this elevation itself is a threat to the subject due to getting too close to eliminating the gap between the desire of the Other, it results in the metaphorical death of this idealized object or getting away from it in the metonymical sense in order to escape from the encompassing gulp of the Other (Lacan, 1959-1960/1997). It explains the function of “the dark side” of the object that was discussed previously: The symptoms, resistance, and getting away allow subjects to get rescued from being swallowed by the Other and maintain their desire. By doing so, the subject maintains the homeostasis between jouissance and pleasure: Between libido and the death drive. Thus, “the dark side” of the object actually allows the subject to maintain lack
and reassign to the object the quality of its “reward”; in other words, to create it from
the ashes. Moreover, an object can be of such importance via the subject placing it in
a position that was “always there” throughout their lives. When the distance is
maintained, or the subject is not engulfed by the Other, desire is possible for the
subject.

4.6. Conclusions and Clinical Implications

The current study aims to analyse the subject’s relationship with the Other
through the object. By doing so, various mechanisms, the significance of signifier,
subjective positioning towards the three types of lack, identification, symptoms,
separation in desire, functions of partial objects and objet petit a, sublimation, and
positioning towards Das Ding were discussed through categories of the results: (1)
They Were Always There, (2) Encounter, (3) That Precious Other, (4) The Dark Side
/ The Object That Takes It All, and (5) The Reward / The Object That Gives You
All.

The title of the thesis includes the term sinthome. Sinthome has connotations
to symptoms (Lacan, 1975-1976/2016). It is a topological representation in which
symptom is redefined. The dual function of symptom, which is both an enigmatic
message to the Other and jouissance which does not call the deciphering as such, led
Lacan to come up with such a topological representation. Accordingly, in sinthome,
the complex dynamic of symptoms is not eliminated: Rather, the mechanism that
made it possible for symptoms to emerge is shifted in such a way that what
previously was the source of pain and suffering becomes the sole source of
something that protects one from experiencing such disruption.

This study demonstrated that a condensed signifier plays a crucial role for a
subject in various ways: it occupies central importance in the relationship with the
Other, symptoms, and sublimation. Here, the same object with a condensed signifier
is both source of symptoms and sublimation as well: Symptoms function as a defence
against engulfing the Other where there is both a message and jouissance and in
sublimation, the object becomes a source of jubilation and unification with the Other.
Thus, the complex dynamic of the symptom concerning the subject is not eliminated
but instead shifted in such a way that its function somehow ends up in a state where
the constructive effect is experienced. Moreover, sublimation is a mechanism where the subject’s relation to an object, where the subject is already signed by the signifier to it, is altered. This alteration is made possible by a shift in the subject’s mechanism of symptoms. Sinthome structurally explains how symptomatic material is rendered to sublimation. Taking all of this into account, sublimation could be thought to be a function of sinthome.

Further, since sublimation reorganises the subject’s relation to an object that is already tightly imprinted by the signifier, its function is related to objet petit a, the object of desire. With the mechanism, the object is raised to the position of Das Ding. In this sense, it could be argued that the mechanism of sublimation necessitates repression, that is neurotic structure, due to the imprint of signifier and desire. However, the reorganisation of symptoms, that is, sinthome, is a structural formation, where the complex dynamic of symptoms is not eliminated but reprocessed in the form of a fourth ring into the structure, the Borromean Knot. As a result, the sinthome is accessible to all three clinical structures. Freud, who came up with the concept of sublimation, mostly worked with neurotics, whereas Lacan, the originator of sinthome, had extensive experience with psychotics (Evans, 2006). It could be thought that his extensive encounter with psychosis could have led Lacan to come up with the concept of the sinthome. Considering all of these, it could be said that every sublimation includes a sinthome; however, not each sinthome is related to sublimation.

Furthermore, the relationship between the subject and the Other is analysed in this research. The Other occupies a central position in the subject’s experiences regarding desire and symptoms via playing a mediating role through the object. According to Lacan (1964/2006), the moment when a subject attributes to someone the position of “subject supposed to know”, the relationship via the Other is established; that is transference. First of all, what is it that is supposed to be known? The answers concerning their position, purpose, solutions to their problems etc. In short, the position of “the subject supposed to know” is directed to someone who is supposedly capable of answering the lack inherent in the subject. In child-parent, student-teacher, or patient-doctor etc., settings, the Other’s position of “the subject supposed to know” is realised through the agent occupying the role and function
depends on it as well. However, the core of dysfunction, suffering, and symptoms are also structured through the unconscious product of the relationship between the subject and the Other. Further, in order for the desire to be accessible for a subject, separation must occur from the desire of the Other. In this conjuncture, a subject’s experience regarding a person to whom “the subject supposed to know” is attributed is prone to repetition of the dynamic that already exists in the subject’s psyche.

In this alliance, psychotherapy approaches that offer direct solutions to problems or symptoms of patients occupy the position of “the subject supposed to know”. Structured psychotherapies, such as interpersonal psychotherapy, cognitive analytic therapy, dialectic behaviour therapy, cognitive behaviour therapy etc., are considered to be “evidence-based” therapies even though their effectiveness or outcome in real-life settings lacks sufficient examination (Robertson, 2003). In these therapies, goals, focus, limitations etc., are structured and manualised. It means that patients do not talk freely, and the psychotherapist directs them to a particular path. As such, the psychotherapist “knows” the lack inherent in the subject and provides knowledge for the patients to follow. The relational dynamic between a psychotherapist and a patient in these settings is prone to remain in the repetition of a relationship where the subject is not separated in the desire of the Other. Since it is not about rational knowledge about a particular symptom as such that the dynamic of the subject and the Other is based on, thus, the subject could enter into a familiar strategy concerning the Other’s desire.

What about the setting in psychoanalysis? As said before, one of the conditions of transference is ascribing the “subject supposed to know” to a person of perceived authority. It means that, regardless of the other person occupying that role, the subject would ascribe it anyway. Such ascription is accompanied by the subject asking the unconscious question, “what does the Other want?”. When this unconscious question is answered by demand, as it is in structured psychotherapies or other subjective desires of others, then the subject can enter a vicious cycle that s/he takes in relation to the Other’s desire already present in their psyche. However, when the position of “subject supposed to know” is not occupied by a psychoanalyst, then the subject has a possibility to explore their own ways of relating to the unconscious question of “what does the Other want from me?”. As such,
psychoanalysis is one of the ways of providing freedom, or space for the subject, to get distance from the burden of the Other’s desire and finds ways to engage in their desire without engulfing with the Other. In other words, this space could be one of the means to provide a subject to separate from the desire of the Other.

Further, Lacan’s (1956/2006) famous quote about the end of psychoanalysis, “The subject (…) begins the analysis by speaking of himself without speaking to you, or by speaking to you without speaking of himself. When he can speak to you about himself, the analysis will be finished.” this suggests an alteration in the subject’s relation to the Other. While speaking to another about themselves, the subject’s burden of the imaginary correspondent of the Other is lessened, and the relationship is less occupied by a wall of communication. This sort of relief in a relationship suggests separation in desire. Furthermore, this relief in communication is thought to be a function of sinthome where one identifies with their symptoms that are generated as a product of one’s relationship with the Other.

4.7. Strengths and Limitations of the Current Study and Suggestions for Future Studies

The current study has several strengths. First of all, although music has been widely studied in general psychology literature, the studies focus on cognition, neuroscience, and its effects on general well-being, decreasing pain and stress of either listeners or musicians. In these studies, the relationship between sound and the individual has not been elaborated in depth. Secondly, psychoanalytic literature focuses on music concerning expressiveness as a source of discharge, its ability to communicate otherwise incommunicable, and its function as a tool of remembrance. Alongside being insightful, these studies do not comprehensively dwell on musicians’ experiences of sound as an object, signifier, and the stage; and the mechanism through which the relationship with the Other is mediated. The strength of this study is that it analyses the relationship between the subject and the object through the Other via analysing an object that is ascribed to subjects with a signifier by the Other. By doing so, various mechanisms that mediate the relation between the subject and the object is analysed: Lack, identification, symptoms, sublimation, and
sinthome. Also, via analysing the partial object of sound, the current study incorporates the role of lalangue and semantically prelinguistic notions.

There are several limitations of the study as well. As explained previously, the aim of the study is to analyse a subject’s relation to the Other via the object inscribed by a signifier. First of all, this study lacks a more detailed analysis of the mechanism of sinthome since it is a structural and subjective alteration. Apart from sublimation, which is a modification of the subject’s relation to the object that could be analysed through one’s narration of an object, sinthome is thought to be better explained by case studies via examining one’s experience of symptoms. Further, to better analyse the mechanisms such as defences, symptoms, experiences of lack, identification, sinthome, and the role of the Other for the subject, studying them concerning the Lacanian clinical structures would provide insightful knowledge. In general, case studies could be useful to explain several mechanisms that are analysed in this study. Furthermore, smell was one of the themes associated with the oldest memories one has: Olfactory sense could be analysed as a partial drive in future studies. Finally, studying how other objects of partial drives function as a means of sublimation could provide an inspirational insight into the psyche of humans. As a mechanism, sublimation is peculiar since it provides the structured, symbolic experience of individuals where an object is raised to the long-lost prehistoric dignity of Das Ding.
REFERENCES


APPENDICES

A. APPROVAL OF THE METU HUMAN SUBJECTS ETHICS COMMITTEE

Sayı: 28620816 / 02 KASIM 2020

Konusu: Değerlendirme Sonucu

Gönderen: ODTÜ İnsan Araştırmaları Etkik Kurulu (IAEK)

İlgi: İnsan Araştırmaları Etkik Kurulu Başvurusu

Sayın Prof. Dr. Faruk GENÇÖZ


Saygılarımızla bilgilerinize sunarız,

Prof. Dr. Mine MISIRLIŞOY
IAEK Başkanı
B. INFORMED CONSENT FORM

GÖNÜLLÜ KATILIM FORMU


Çalışmaya olan katkılarınız için teşekkürler.

Bu çalışmaya tamamen gönüllü olarak katılmışım ve istediğim zaman yarında kesip çabaleceğimi biliyorum. Verdiğim bilgilerin bilimsel amaçlarla kullanılamasını kabul ediyorum. (Formu doldurup imzaladktan sonra uygulayıcıya geri veriniz).

İsim Soyadı         Tarih         İmza

----/----/-----
C. THE GENERATIVE NARRATIVE QUESTION AND NARRATIVE ENQUIRIES

1. The Generative Narrative Question
   a. "I would like you to tell me about your relationship with your instrument and music. Please feel free to tell from the beginning and in detail."

2. Possible Narrative Enquiries
   a. Relationship with instrument teachers
   b. Experiences of stage
   c. Experiences during preparation
   d. Distinctive pieces
   e. Particular composers
   f. Feelings and thoughts associated with sounds
   g. Stories behind certain pieces and their associations
   h. Practice routines
   i. Favourite pieces in details (chords, intervals etc.)
   j. Praxis of technique
   k. Required investment (time, material, social etc.)
   l. Wishes related to music/instrument about future
   m. Experiences related to pain or suffering in relation to music
   n. Most joyful moments related to music
D. TURKISH VERSION OF THE GENERATIVE NARRATIVE QUESTION AND NARRATIVE ENQUIRIES

3. The Generative Narrative Question
   a. "Sizden enstrümanınızı ve müzike olan ilişkinizi anlatmanızı istiyorum. Müziğin hayatınızda rolünü en baştan itibaren tüm ayrıntılarıyla anlatabilirsiniz”

4. Possible Narrative Enquiries
   a. Enstrüman hocalarıyla ilişkiler
   b. Sahne deneyimleri
   c. Hazırlanma deneyimleri
   d. Öne çıkan parçalar
   e. Belirli besteciler
   f. Seslere ilişkin duygular ve düşünceler
   g. Belirli eserlerle ilgili hikayeler ve çağrımlar
   h. Çalışma rutinleri
   i. Sevilen parçaların detayları (akorlar, aralıklar, cümleler, pasajlar vb.)
   j. Teknik çalışmalar
   k. Yatırımlar (maddi, manevi, sosyal vb.)
   l. Müzik ve enstrümana yönelik istekler ve hayaller
   m. Müzikle ilgili yaşanan zorluk ve acılar
   n. Müzikle olan en zevkli anlar
E. CURRICULUM VITAE

Neli Gagua

Education

Middle East Technical University, Faculty of Arts and Sciences, Ankara, Turkey
Bachelor of Science in Psychology, June 2016

Middle East Technical University, Faculty of Arts and Sciences, Ankara, Turkey
Bachelor of Science in Sociology, August 2017

Middle East Technical University, Faculty of Arts and Sciences, Ankara, Turkey
Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in Clinical Psychology, September 2023

Anadolu University State Conservatoire, Piano Department, Eskişehir, Turkey
2021- Present

Publications


Work Experience

Middle East Technical University, Psychology Department, AYNA Clinical Psychology

Intervention Unit
Psychotherapist, 2017-2021

Middle East Technical University, Psychology Department, AYNA Clinical Psychology

Intervention Unit
Supervisor, 2019-2021

Middle East Technical University, Psychology Department, AYNA Clinical Psychology Peer-Reviewed Journal (AYNA Klinik Psikoloji Dergisi)

Editorial Board Member, 2019-2020

Middle East Technical University, Psychology Department, AYNA Clinical Psychology Peer-Reviewed Journal (AYNA Klinik Psikoloji Dergisi)

Journal Reviewer, 2019-Present

Freud-Lacan Psychoanalysis Association, Ankara, Turkey

Broad of Directors Member, Accountant, 2021-Present

Freud-Lacan Psychoanalysis Association, Ankara, Turkey
Psychoanalyst, 2019-Present

Languages
Georgian (Native), Turkish (Native), English (Advanced), Russian (Intermediate),
German (Elementary)
BÖLÜM 1

GİRİŞ

1.1. Genel Bakış

Mevcut çalışmada, profesyonel klasik müzisyenlerin müzik ve enstrümanları ile olan ilişkileri Lacanyen Psikanaliz ışığında Anlatı Analizi kullanılarak incelenmektedir. Çalışmanın bu ilk bölümünde, öncelikle ilgili Lacanyen ve Freuddyen Psikanalitik kavramlar, ardından müzik ve müzisyenlerin psikoloji ve psikanaliz literatüründe nasıl yer aldığı ele alınmaktadır. Son olarak ise mevcut çalışmanın kapsamı, mantıksal zemini ve amacı belirtilmektedir.

1.2. Psikanalitik Kavrumsal Çerçeve

1.2.1. İhtiyaç, Talep, Arzu


1.2.2. Ayna Evresi


1.2.3. Lalangue ve Dil


1.2.4. Özdeşleşme


1.2.5. **Eksiğin Üç Biçimi**


1.2.5.1. **Privasyon**


1.2.5.2. **Frustrasyon**


1.2.5.3. **Kastrasyon**


1.2.6. **Kısmi Nesneler**

Lacan, dört kısmi dürtü ve nesneden söz etmiştir: oral, anal, görsel ve işitsel dürtü; ve bunlara sırasıyla denk gelen meme, dışktı, bakış ve ses nesnesi (Evans, 2016). Bunların ilk ikisi daha çok talep alanveyorken son ikisi daha çok arzunun
alanlarındadır. Bu kısmi nesneler, tekrarlayan bir biçimde kısmi dürtüler etrafında döner.


1.2.7. Das Ding


1.2.8. Ölüm Dürtüsü


1.2.9. Unheimlich

Almanca orijinali unheimlich olup Türkçeye tekinsiz olarak çevrilen bu Freudyen terim, dışarıdan yeni gibi görülen bir şeyin tekinsizlik, dehşet ve korku gibi duygular eşliğinde gizemli bir tanı شكرا işaret etmesi durumunu ifade etmektedir.

1.2.10. Anksiyete


1.2.11. Süblimasyon


1.2.12. Sinthome


1.2.13. Borromeo Düğüümü

gerçek ve imgeselin, ikincisi imgesel ve simgeselin, üçüncüü ise simgesel ve 
gerçeğin kesişim alanıdır. Üçünün kesişim alanı ise nesne a’dır: Tüm halkalara 
erişi olan tek alanlar. Semptom mekanizmasının düzenlenmesiyle eklenen bir yeni 
halka ise sinthome’dür: Bu halkanın hangi konumda yerleseceği kişinin özgün 
septom yapısına bağlı olarak değişmektedir.

1.3. **Literatürde Müzik ve Müzisyenler**

1.3.1. **Psikoloji Literatüründe Müzik ve Müzisyenler**

Psikoloji literatüründe müzik ve müzisyenlerle yapılan araştırmalar yaygın 
şekilde bilişsel, nörobilimsel ve ağrı, stres ve genel iyı-oluşla alakalı konularda 
gerçekteştirilmiştir. Bilişsel alandaki çalışmalar, müzikin işleyen bellek üzerine etkisi 
(Mammarella ve ark., 2007), uyarılma ve ruh halini yükseltmeyi aracı eden 
konumundan dolayı müzikin bilişsel işlevi arttırışı (Schellenberg, 2005), müzikin 
canlı otobiyografik hafıza tetkikleyici rolü (Belfi ve ark., 2015), müzik eğitiminin 
dağa yüksek bilişsel akılcılık üzerine etkisi (Meyet ve ark., 2018) ve bu konular 
etrafında dönen tartışmalı bulgular üzerine (Sala ve Gobet, 2020; Peretz ve Zatorre, 
2003) odaklanmıştır.

Müzik ve müzisyenler hakkında nörobilimsel yapılan çalışmalardaki odak ise 
bein işleviyle alakalı olmuştur: Müziğin korteks alt sistemdeki ödül duyusuna olan 
etkisi (Zatorre ve Salimpoor, 2013), sağ ve sol beyin yarımküresinin müzikteki rolü 
(Bever ve Chiarello, 2009), müziğin işitsel kortikal temsili ve korpus kallosum 
boytundaki yansımalari (Pantev ve ark., 1998; Schlaug ve ark., 1995) gibi beyindeki 
işleyişler ele alınmıştır.

Müziğin genel olarak iyi oluş, ağrı ve stres üzerindeki etkileri de ağrı ve 
stresin azalmasında rolü (Linnemann ve ark., 2015), yatıştırıcı ve kaygı azaltıcı 
ilaclara alternatif olarak bireylerin ameliyat öncesindeki kayglarına olan etkisi 
(Bradt ve ark., 2013) ve genel iyi-oluştaki yansıması (Croom, 2015) incelenmiştir.

1.3.2. **Psikanalitik Literatürde Müzik ve Müzisyenler**

Psikanalitik literatürde müzik ve müzisyenler çeşitli şekillerde ele alınmıştır. 
Freud ve Lacan’ın müziği neredeyse hiç ele almamışlardır (Smethurst, 2017; 
Régnaut, 2002).


1.4. Bu Çalışmanın Konusu: Teorik Bağlam ve Amaç

Çalışmanın bu kısmı nesnede ve ditle dolayımılan özne ve Başka ilişkisini ele almak adına profesyonel müziklerin müzik ve enstrümanlarıyla kurdukları ilişkinin ne sebeple seçildiğini ve bu konunun yukarıda bahsi geçen literatürde işlenmemiş haliyle ele aldığını içermektedir.
1.4.1. Lalangue ve Dil

Müzik, bir semantik dil gibi tarihsel olarak gelişmiş düzenlemeyle öülü yapıya sahiptir: Ses dalgasını tanımlayan Hertz ile belirlenen notalar, aralıklar, akorlar, armoni, kadanslar ve cümleler gibi (Kostka ve ark., 2013). Bu bağlandaki çerçeveye rağmen bir dile kıyaslara semantik anlamda aynı işleve sahip olmayıp imgesel yönü kuvvetli olmakta ve dolayısıyla lanague’a işaret etmektedir.

1.4.2. İşitsel Dürtü ve Beden

Yukarıda da ifade edildiği gibi özne için ses, Başka’nın varlığının ve sevgisinin işareti olarak işlev görmekteyiz. Bu bağlamda müziğin, yapılandırılmış sesler bütünü olarak süblimasyon mekanizmasını nesnesi olabileceğini düşünülmektedir. Fransa’da yaşamışına rağmen öldüğünde kalbinin memlekete Polonya’ya gömülmesini isteyen ünlü besteci F. Chopin’in Paris’e taşındığında bestelediği op. 10 nu. 3 eserini öğrencisine çalıştırırken “Of, memleketim” diye serzenişin (Eigeldinger, 1986) ve eserin alt yapısının süblimasyon mekanizmasını işaret ettiği düşünülmektedir.

1.4.3. Profesyonel Müzik Öğrencileri

Daha önceki bir çalışmanın bulgularından birisi erken yaşta profesyonel müzik eğitmine başlayan müzik öğrencileri için müzik anlamlı bir ifade biçimi olmakta, bu kişiler için müzik ve enstrümanları yüksek yatırım alanı haline gelmekte ve bire bir gerçekleştirilen derslerle beraber enstrüman öğretmenleriyle kurulan ilişkiler bireylerin Lacanyen anlamda Başka ile kurdukları ilişkiye işaret etmektedir (Gagua, Mutko Akça ve Gençöz, 2019).

1.4.4. Sahne

Profesyonel müzik eğitimi içerisinde geçen müzisyenler, sahnede mükemmeliğe ulaşmayı anlamlı bulmaktadırlar (Gagua, Mutko Akça ve Gençöz, 2019). Bu sahnedeği mükemmellik arayışının ayna evresinin temelini oluşturan narsisistik zafer hayalini ve gösterenle özdeşleşmenin getirdiği gereklilikler zincirini içerdiği düşünülmektedir. Bu karmaşık mekanizma için ünlü piyanist V. Horowitz’in sahnede icra etmeye dair deneyimini tarifleyişini örneklemektedir: “Sahnedeyken
kral gibi hissediyorum. Yapacak bir şeyim var: Bendeki en iyiyi ortaya çıkarmalıyım” (Farrel & Spector, 2018).

1.4.5. Çalışmanın Amacı

Yukarıda belirtilenen akışın doğrultusunda bu çalışmadaki amaç özenin Başka ile ilişkisini, kişinin gösterenle imzalanmış nesnesi üzerinden incelemektir. Bu doğrultuda amaç, özenin konumunu nesne ve Başka ilişkisi bağlamında incelemek; bu vasıtayla savunma mekanizmalarını, semptomları, üç eksik türünü, Das Ding’i, süblimasyonu ve lalangue’ı başta olmak üzere birçok psikik oluşumu derinlemesine ele almaktır. Bu sebeple profesyonel klasik müzik eğitimlerine erken yaşta başlamış olan piyanist ve kemancılarla ayrıntılı görüşmeler yapılmış ve anlatılar psikanalitik literatür ışığında incelenmiştir.

BÖLÜM 2

YÖNTEM

2.1. Nitel Araştırma ve Anlatı Analizi


Mevcut araştırmada anlatı analizi yapılmıştır. Anlatı analizinde katılımcıların öykülerine odaklanmaktadır: İnsanların ilişkileri birbirlerine yönelttikleri anlatılarla şekillenmektedir (Grbich, 2007). İnsanların yaşantlarına ilişkin anlamlandırımları anlatılarla beraber sürekli olarak şekillenmektedir. Dolayısıyla anlatı analizinde odak yalnızca konuşma içeriği değil aynı zamanda anlatılarla şekillendirdikleri gerçekliğin


2.2. Katılımcılar ve Örneklem Yöntemi

Çalışmada amaca uygun örnekleme yöntemi kullanılmıştır. Toplam 11 katımcının homojen yönleri: (1) 18 yaşından büyük olmaları, (2) profesyonel klasik müzik eğitimlerine küçük yaşta başlamaları ve (3) piyano veya keman çalmalarıdır. Görüşmelerin uzunluğu 35 ile 72 dakika arasındadır. Gizlilik amacıyla çalışmada takma isimler kullanılmıştır.

2.3. Prosedür


2.4. Veri Analizi

Katımcılara geniş bir anlatı üretici soru sorulmuş ve çalışmanın kapsamdında konuşmalarında eğer gerekipse ayrıntılandırlanmalar için çeşitli konular belirlenmiştir. Geniş soru aşağıdaki gibidir:
“Sizden enstrümanınız ve müzike olan ilişkinizi anlatmanızı istiyorum. Müziğin hayatınızda rolünü en baştan itibaren tüm ayrıntılarıyla anlatabilirsiniz.”

Eğer gereksiz konuşmada ayrıntılandırmak için belirlenen noktalar ise şunlardır: Enstrüman hocalaryla ilişkiler, sahne deneyimleri, hazırlanma deneyimleri, öne çıkan parçalar, belirlili besteciler, seslere ilişkin duygu ve düşünceler, belirlili parçalara yönelik çağrışmalar ve öyküler, çalışma rutinleri, sevilen parçaların detayları (akorlar, aralıklar, cümleler, pasajlar vb.), teknik çalışmalar, yatırımlar (maddi, manevi, sosyal vb.), müzik ve enstrümana yönelik istekler ve hayaller, müzikle ilişkili yaşanılan zorluk ve acılar, müzikle olan en zevkli anlar.


2.5. Çalışmanın Güvenilirliği

Mevcut çalışmada güvenirliği sağlamak adına askıya alma, günlük tutma ve çalışmanın her sürecinde meslektâşlarla, danışmanla ve jüri üyeleriyle görüşme yöntemleri kullanılmış; araştırmacının hem iç grup hem de dış gruptan oluşundan kaynaklanan etkilerin çalışmaya olan yansıması ele alınmıştır.

BÖLÜM 3

BULGULAR


3.1. O Hep Vardı

Bu bölümde katılımcıların müzik ve enstrümanlarının kendilerinin bildikleri bileli hayatlarında yer aldığına ilişkin anlatıları toplanmıştır. Bu bağlamda müzik ve enstrümanla ilişkileri anlarının en eski mecralarında yer almaktadır. Bu bölümün iki alt kısımdır: (a) Hatırladığım Kadarıyla ve (b) Hatırlatıldığım Kadarıyla. İlkinde müzik ve enstrümanın süregelen varlığı olumlu ve hoşnut bir anlam taşımaktadır ve ifadelerde aktif bir dil kullanımı içermektedir; ikincisinde ise bu süregelen varlık olumsuz bir anlamla dile gelirken kullanılan dil de pasiftir.

3.2. Karşılaşma

Bu bölümdeki anlatılarla katılımcıların diğer kişilerde veya durumlarda beklenmedikleri durumları içeren karşışmaları ele alınmaktadır. Bu bölümde, dış değişkenlerde birtakım şeylerin umdükleri gibi gitmediği yaşantlarını dile getiren katılımcıların bu beklenmedik durumlarda aldıkları konum değerlendirilmiştir. Mevcut bölümün iki alt kısmı vardır: (a) Hayaldekiyle Mücadele / Frustrasyon ve Privasyon ve (b) Gerçeklikle Yüzleşme / Frustrasyon ve Kastrasyon. İlk kısımdaki karşılaşma biçimleri yoksunluk ve hayal kırıklığı içermekte ve kişinin konumu pasif
olmaktadır; ikincisinde ise karşılaşılma belirli bir zorlukla gelse de olumlu neticelenmekte ve öznel konum aktif olarak ifade edilmektedir.

3.3. Kıyımetli Bir Başka

Mevcut bölüm, katılımcıların enstrüman hocalarının ilişkin anlatıları etrafında oluşturulmuştur. Hemen hemen her katılımcının anlatısında müzik ve enstrümanla kurdukları ilişkide enstrüman hocalarının merkezi bir rolde olduğu ifade edilmiştir. Bu anlatılar iki kısımda kümelenmiştir: (a) Her Şeyi Mümkün Kılın ve (b) Engelleyen. İlk kısımdaki anlatılar hocaların etkileri enstrüman seçimi, çalışma motivasyonu, enstrümanla kurulan ilişki, sahne deneyimleri gibi alanlardaki olumlu etkisi kuvvetli sıfatlarla dile getirilmiştir. İkinci kısımda ise hocaların etkisi gene merkezi bir role sahip olmakla beraber bu sefer engelleyici, dayatmacı ve travmatize edici olup müzik ve enstrümanları ile kurdukları ilişkiyi ve sahne deneyimlerini köstekleyici konumları almaktadırlar.

3.4. Karanhık Taraf / Her Şeyi Kaplayan Nesne

Bu bölümde katılımcıların müzik ve enstrümanla ilişkin yaşadıkları olumsuz deneyimleri ele alınmaktadır. Bu olumsuzluklar yoğun bir dille ifade edilmekte ve kaplayıcı bir özelliği barındırmaktadır. Bu bölüm beş kısımdan oluşmaktadır: (a) Çalışmamak Olmaz, (b) Pasif Direnç, (c) Kaplanma, (d) Bir İleri Bir Geri / Fort Da, ve (e) Tekinsiz Ben: Sahnede Benden Ne Sızacak?. İlk kısımda katılımcıların enstrümanlarını çalışma ilişkin ifade ettikleri zorunluluk algılarını ve suçluluk hislerini ele almaktadır. İkinci kısımda ise görevlerini yapmaya ilişkin yatırmalarına rağmen bir şekilde niyetlendikleri gibi sonuçların alınamamasına ilişkin söylemeler ele alınmaktadır. Üçüncü kısımda ise konservatuvar ortamının ve gerekliklerinin oldukça katı ve tek yönlü olduğunu ve dolayısıyla kişiyi kaplayıcı bir yara olduğuna ilişkin anlatılar etrafında kümelenmiştir. Dördüncü kısımda ise katılımcıların zaman zaman müzik ve enstrümanlarından uzaklaştıkları ve daha sonra geri döndüklerini anladıkları ifadeleri ele almıştır. Son kısımda ise katılımcıların olumsuz sahne deneyimlerine ilişkin anlatılarından oluşmaktadır.
3.5. Ödül / Her Şeyi Kapsayan Nesne


BÖLÜM 4

TARTIŞMA

4.1. O Hep Vardı


4.2. Karşılaşma


4.3. Kıyımetli Bir Başka

arzu dönüştürülmüş, nesne yükseltmiştir: Başka’ya dair olan arzu nesne üzerinden yoğunlaşabilmiştir.

Mevcut bölümün ikinci kısmında ise enstrüman hocaları yine merkezi fakat yukarıdakının zıttı bir role sahiptir: Kaplayan, agresif, kişinin nesneyle kurduğu ilişkiye engelleyen şekilde tarif edilmişlerdir. Enstrüman hocalarının rolünü anlatan Yaren, “hoca çok önemli (...) beni bambaşa bi birey olarak görmesi (...) dayatmacı hocaların kendilerini kanıtlamak için öğrencileri sürekli araç olarak kullandıkları ve karşısındakinin başka bi birey olduğu farkındalığından uzak (olmaları)” demiştir. Katıldığını ve ödül alamadığı bir yarışmanın ardından hocasiyla konuşmasını anlatan Adile, “işte sonuçlar açıklandığı öğretmenimi aradım ve üdül alamadım mı dedi fila ben ağlıyorum ama nasıl ağlıyorum fila adamın söyledişi ise hani üdül alamadım mı bunu sor sordu fila ve ondan sonra da bu sahne stresi şeyim aslında orada başladı daha önce böyle bi sahlı söyle bi sahnedeye titremek el kol titremesi vesaire gibi bi şeyler aşırı bi heyecan açıktası hiç olmuyodu” ifadelerini kullanmıştır. Bu iki alıntıda da Başka, tümçü bir fail olarak katılımcıları kendilerinin uzantıları gibi algilayıp nesne konumuna indirgemiş şekilde tarif edilmiştir. Böyle bir dinamikte öznelğe yer kalmamakta, dolayısıyla ortak bir nesne üzerinden arzulamak mümkün olmamaktadır. Bir başka katılımcı, Erkin, hocasının piyano çalışındaki etkisi üzerine “pisilık çalıyorsun dedi (...) çok demoralize oldum ne kadar zor bi işmiş (...) ben böyle gelişi güzel çalıyordu ve bi şekilde oluyordu ama şimdi her notanın hesabını vermem gerekiyor gibi böyle bi içim ağrıdı o kadar ki çalışçağım şeyi unuttum” demiştir. Bir diğer katılımcı, Güliz ise hocasıyla olan dersleri için “her hafta yapılan öğretmenle yapılan İşte dersler de bi üdül bi şekilde o bi şekilde o sınav gibi geçerdi benim için çünkü İşte yani (...) her hafta kendimi İşte hocalının ve beğenisini kazanmak onayımı kazanmaya yönelik um enerjimi çalışmalaram (…) bu beğeniyi ve onayı kazanmak üzere ortaya koyardım” sözlerini kullanmıştır. Bu iki alıntıda da Başka, hesap verilecek veya sınavacak bir şekilde yer almaktadır: Bu bağlamda arzuya yer kalmamakta, tüm alanı onay arayışı kaplamaktadır.

4.4. Karanlık Taraf / Her Şeyi Kaplayan Nesne

Bu bölüm, katılımcıların müzik ve enstrümanları ile ilgili negatif, istenmeyen ve acı çektiğleri anlatıları üzerine oluşturulmuştur. Bir başka deyişle bu bölümde


İkinci kısımdaki bir alıntıda Yaren, erteleme davranışı için “yeni bi eser öğreneceğim zaman aa başladım başlamam aa yarın başlarım diye hep ertelediğim bi şey oluyor” demiştir. Erteleme, kastrasyon veya limitlenmenin ertelenmesi olarak işlev görmektedir (Gherovici & Webster, 2014). Bu bağlamda erteleme, kastrasyonu geçiktirmenin jouissance’ı barındırır. Bir diğer alıntıda, bir eseri sahneye almaya dair direncini konuşan Esra, “bu noktaya kadar nasi getirebilirim e tabi bu büyük bi sürece yayıldığı zaman çok büyük bi bağımızlık haline geliyor çünkü kendimi onun üzerinden aslında test ediyorum ve sahneye almyorum” demiştir. Konsere çıkmak, bir bağlamda bir çalışmayı gözler önüne sormak adına son hale getirilmeye


4.5. Ödül / Her Şeyi Kapsayan Nesne


görülse de deneyimsel olarak takıntı nesnesi özneyi kapatınsan, kaplayan ve dirence iten özellikler içermekteken tutku nesnesi özneyi “her şeye” açılımayı içeren, özne kapan bir niteliğe sahiptir.

biçimiyle süblimasyon mekanizması ile bu imkânsızlık kısmi olarak bertaraf edilebilmektedir.


Katılımcıların müzik ve enstrümanlarıyla dille ifade etmekte zorlanıp yaşadıklarını bedensel deneyimlere benzettikleri deneyimlerinin toplandığı bu son kısımda Hande “vücutsal bi deneyim sanırım (...) anlaması belki zor olabilir bazı insanlar için (...) ritmi hissettğiğin kalp atışının da ona ayak uydurmasının daha bedensel bi şey cinsellik” demiştir. Bir başka katılımcı Adile ise müzikle ilgili bazı aldığını bir anı ilişkin “güzel tınlattığın zaman böyle o senin şeyinde içinde bacaklarında şey olur titreşir böyle hani” sözlerini kullanmıştır. Bir başka katılımcı, Erkin ise “tarıfsiz bi duyu (...) hücreler faal yenileniyor o surada” demiştir. Bu albümlerde yaşantıların dile aktarıldığı biçim, gerçekteki yaşantının dile dirençli olup aktarılan anlamlandırma ve nesnenin Das Ding mertebesine

4.6. Sonuçlar ve Klinik Çıkarımlar

Sinthome kavramı semptomda göndermede bulunanak ortaya çıkmış bir kavramdır (Evans, 2006). Semptomun hem Başka’ya adrese gizemli bir mesaj taşıma özelliği hem de deşifre edilmeye kapalı niteliği topolojik bir açıklama olarak çıkarılmıştır. Sinthome, kişinin semptomlarına yol açan karmaşık mekanizmayı ortadan kaldırma yaklaşımından radikal bir şekilde farklı olarak belirtilen özel mekanizmanın kişiye
acı verip yapısını dağıtcı yönünün buna zıt olarak kişinin sistemini bir arada tutulabilmesini mümkün kılacak bir şekilde yeniden düzenlenmesini ifade etmektedir. Bu çalışma, kişiye aynı zamanda acı veren, gösterenle kazınmış bir nesnenin aynı zamanda jübilesyon ve süblimasyon mekanizmasyyla Başka ile birleşme aracını olabildiğini göstermiştir. Öznedeki bu nesneye ilişkin tutumun farklılıkları, semptomların düzenlenmesi ile beraber, bedenlerine halihazırda kazınmış, bir gösterenle işaretlenmiş bir nesneye olan ilişkideki olasılık ve süblimasyon mekanizması her Lacanyen yapının erişiminde de bulunur. Freud çoğunlukla orta sınıf histerik kadınlara çalışan Lacan’ın psikotik bireylerle bir hayalini gerçekleştirmektedir (Evans, 2006). Bu bağlamda ele alındığında psikotik bireyin de deneyimini ele alan sinthome, yanı yapı toplojisi olan Borromean düğümüne eklenip öne çeken semptomatik düzenlenmeye içeren dördüncü halına, genel olarak her yapının öne çeken semptom düzenlenmesini içerebilmektedir. Öte yandan süblimasyon, dilin ve yasanan bedene, gösterenle imzalanmış nevrotiklere has bir semptom düzenlenmesi biçimidir. Dolayısıyla her süblimasyon bir sinthome işlevi iken, her sinthome bir süblimasyon değildir.

psikanalizin sonuna ilişkin söylediğinde “Özne analize ya karşıında konuşmadan kendisini anlatır ya da karşısında konuşurken kendisini anlatmaz. Ne zaman ki karşısında konuşurken kendisini anlatabilirse analiz o zaman sonlanır.” ifadeleri bir nevi öznenin arzuda ayrışmasını, dolayısıyla kendi aktarım zincirlerinin dışında çıkabilmesini mümkün kılar bir sürec psikanaliz olabileceğine işaret etmektedir.

4.7. Mevcut Çalışmanın Güçlü Yönterleri, Şmrhlıkları ve Gelecekteki Çalışmalar için Öneriler

Bu çalışmada öznenin Başka ile nesne üzerinden kurduğu ilişki detaylıca çalışılmıştır. Çalışmanın güçlü yanı daha önce derinlikli ele alınmamış bir konunun, profesyonel müzisyenlerin ses ve temas temelli nesneleri aracılığıyla Başka ile kurdukları ilişkiyi, derinlemesine incelenmesidir. Bu bağlamda öznenin gerçekleş克莱nde kuvvetli bir gösterenin, semptomların, savunma mekanizmalarının ve eksiki deneyimleme biçimlerinin Başka ile kurduğu ilişki çerçevesinde mekanizmaları çalışılmıştır. Bu doğrultuda semptomların işlevleri, süblimasyon mekanizması ve sinthome yapısı tartışılmıştır.


166
G. THESIS PERMISSION FORM / TEZ İZİN FORMU

(Please fill out this form on computer. Double click on the boxes to fill them)

**ENSTİTÜ / INSTITUTE**

- Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Natural and Applied Sciences
  - [ ]
- Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Social Sciences
  - [x]
- Uygulamalı Matematik Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Applied Mathematics
  - [ ]
- Enformatik Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Informatics
  - [ ]
- Deniz Bilimleri Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Marine Sciences
  - [ ]

**YAZARIN / AUTHOR**

- Soyadı / Surname: Gagua
- Adı / Name: Neli
- Bölümü / Department: Psikoloji / Psychology

**TEZİN ADI / TITLE OF THE THESIS (İngilizce / English):**

**TEZİN TÜRÜ / DEGREE:** Yüksek Lisans / Master [ ] Doktora / PhD [x]

1. **Tezin tamamı dünya çapında erişime açılacaktır.** / Release the entire work immediately for access worldwide. [x]
2. **Tez iki yıl süreyle erişime kapalı olacak.** / Secure the entire work for patent and/or proprietary purposes for a period of two years. * [ ]
3. **Tez altı ay süreyle erişime kapalı olacak.** / Secure the entire work for period of six months. * [ ]

* Enstitü Yönetimi Kurulu kararının basılı kopyası tezle birlikte kütüphaneye teslim edilecektir. / A copy of the decision of the Institute Administrative Committee will be delivered to the library together with the printed thesis.

Yazarın imzası / Signature: ............................ Tarih / Date: ............................

(Kütüphaneye teslim ettiğiniz tarih. Elle döndürülecektir.)

(Library submission date. Please fill out by hand.)

Tezin son sayfasıdır. / This is the last page of the thesis/dissertation.