IMMIGRANT DOMESTIC WOMEN WORKERS IN ANKARA AND ISTANBUL

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO
THE GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
OF
MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY

BY

NİHAL ÇELİK

IN PARTIAL FULLFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF SCIENCE
IN
SOCIOLOGY

JULY 2005

Approval of the Graduate School of Social Sciences

Prof. Dr. Sencer Ayata
Director

I certify that this thesis satisfies all the requirements as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science.

Assoc. Prof. Sibel Kalaycıoğlu
Head of Department

This is to certify that we have read this thesis and that in our opinion it is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science.

Prof. Dr. Yıldız Ecevit
Supervisor

Examining Committee Members

Prof. Dr. Yıldız Ecevit (METU, SOC) _____

Assoc. Prof. Helga Rittersberger-Tılıç (METU, SOC) _____

Assist. Prof. Fulya Kip-Barnard (METU, IR) _____

I hereby declare that all information in this document has been obtained and presented in accordance with academic rules and ethical conduct. I also declare that, as required by these rules and conduct, I have fully cited and referenced all material and results that are not original to this work.

Name, Last name:

Signature:

ABSTRACT

IMMIGRANT DOMESTIC WOMEN WORKERS IN ANKARA AND ISTANBUL

Çelik, Nihal

M.S., Department of Sociology

Supervisor: Prof. Dr. Yıldız Ecevit

July, 2005, 217 pages

This study focuses on the relationship between global economy and women's labor within a feminist standpoint by examining the personal and occupational experiences of immigrant women doing domestic work in Turkey. The main concern of this study is to investigate how working and living experiences of immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey are shaped by their illegal worker and immigrant status. The aim of this study is to listen to the personal experiences of immigrant domestic women workers from themselves, and understand their working conditions and social life experiences in Turkey.

There emerged a trend in trading domestic workers between the poor and rich countries since 1990s where many parties, including governments, illegal recruitment agencies, and individual employers benefited. The high unemployment, poverty, shortfalls in living standards, and loss of government-sponsored public

services due to the IMF policies implemented by the governments of developing countries severely affected poor and women. For their family survival, women of developing countries forced to migrate in order to seek domestic work in richer countries, where there is a high demand of middle class women for domestic workers. On the other hand, since domestic work is devalued as informal work, policy-makers do not pay sufficient attention, and provide a legal framework regulating the recruitment process and protecting the rights of immigrant domestic women workers. Therefore, immigrant domestic women workers are in a vulnerable position and open to exploitation due to their illegal and immigrant status.

Turkey has been one of the domestic worker exporting countries since early 1990s mostly from post-Soviet countries. However, she neither has bilateral agreements with the sending countries nor a legal framework protecting the rights of immigrant domestic women workers. Hence, immigrant women are subject to arbitrary treatment and exploitation both in their workplace and outside, and remained invisible.

Keywords: Immigrant women, waged domestic work, international migration of female labor, global restructuring, feminization of survival, Turkey, Ankara, Istanbul.

ÖZ

ANKARA VE ISTANBUL'DA ÇALIŞAN GÖÇMEN KADIN EV İŞÇİLERİ

Çelik, Nihal

Yüksek Lisans, Sosyoloji Bölümü
Tez Yöneticisi: Prof. Dr. Yıldız Ecevit

Temmuz 2005, 217 Sayfa

Bu çalışma, Türkiye'de çalışan göçmen kadın ev işçilerinin kişisel ve iş deneyimlerinin ışığında, küresel ekonomi ile kadın emeği arasındaki ilişkiyi feminist bir yaklaşım ile sorgulamaktadır. Çalışmanın asıl amacı illegal işçi ve göçmen statülerinin Türkiye'de çalışan göçmen kadın ev işçilerinin yaşam ve çalışma deneyimlerini nasıl etkilediğini tartışmaktır. Hedef, göçmen kadın ev işçilerinin kişisel deneyimlerini onlardan dinlemek ve onların çalışma şartlarını ve sosyal hayatlarını anlamaktır.

Hükümetler, illegal istihdam acentelerin ve işverenlerin de dahil olduğu birçok taraf, 1990'lı yıllardan itibaren zengin ve fakir ülkeler arasında gerçekleşen ev işçilerinin ticaretinden yararlanmaktadır. Gelişmekte olan ülkelerin hükümetlerinin kabul ettiği IMF politikaları sonucunda bu ülkelerde meydana çıkan yüksek işsizlik oranı, fakirlik, yaşam standartlarındaki düşüş ve hükümet destekli kamu hizmetlerinin kaybı, fakirleri ve kadınları ciddi bir şekilde etkilemiştir. Bu şartlar altında ailelerinin ayakta kalması için bu kadınlar, daha zengin ülkelerdeki orta sınıf

kadınların ev işçilerine olan yüksek talebini karşılamak üzere bu ülkelerde iş bulmak amacıyla göç etmek zorunda kalmışlardır. Diğer yandan, ev işi enformal sektörde yer aldığı için değersiz görülmüş, bu yüzden de otoriteler tarafından yeterli ilgiyi görmemiş ve dolayısıyla göçmen kadın ev işçilerinin istihdamı için düzenleme yapılması ve haklarının korunması için bir yasal çerceve hazırlanmamıştır. Bu nedenle, göçmen kadın ev işçileri illegal işçi ve göçmen statülerinden dolayı çalışmakta oldukları yabancı ülkelerde savunmasız ve sömürüye açık bir konumdadırlar.

Türkiye, 1990'lı yıllardan beri başta post-Sovyet ülkelerinden olmak üzere göçmen kadın ev işçisi göçü alan ülkelerden biri haline gelmiştir. Bununla birlikte, ne göçmen kadın ev işçisi gönderen ülkeler ile ikili anlaşma ne de göçmen kadın ev işçilerinin haklarını koruyan yasal bir düzenleme yapılmıştır. Bunun sonucunda da Türkiye'de çalışan göçmen kadın ev işçileri çalıştıkları evlerin içinde ve dışarıda keyfi muamele ve sömürüye maruz kalmışlardır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Göçmen kadınlar, ücretli ev işçiliği, kadın emeğinin uluslararası göçü, küresel yeniden yapılanma, ayakta kalmanın kadınsılaşması, Türkiye, Ankara, Istanbul.

Anneme ve Babama

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First of all, I would like start with expressing my indebtfullness to my advisor Professor Yıldız Ecevit, who made my two years in METU a very worthwhile and special experience. I am also grateful for her continuous support, great care and invaluable suggestions while reading my work, and providing me critical comments during the production of this study. I also have a special debt to Professor Ahmet İçduygu, Professor Selmin Kaska, and Marielle Sander-Lindstrom to their advice and help to me for my research. I would also like to thank to the members of the thesis jury, Professor Helga Rittersberger-Tılıç and Professor Fulya Kip-Barnard for their critics and suggestions.

I have very special thanks to the dearest Çağatay Emre Doğan for his indispensable emotional support and company, sharing my excitement about the research that kept me working into the early hours of the morning, his positive comments with the whole process, and for his technical support.

My single greatest debt is to my parents Fatma and İhsan Çelik for their great patience, continuous encouragement, and support throughout my academic life. This study is dedicated to their invaluable trust and belief in me all during my life.

This study would not be materialized without the participation of immigrant domestic women workers, that I can not give their names, into my research. I am particularly grateful to them for their cordiality, openness, and sharing their life stories with me.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES

TABLES

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Today, women in third world/non-Western countries are highly exploited as immigrant domestic workers in host countries where there is high demand for domestic servants by middle class women. One of the determining factors of this demand is the increasing participation of middle/upper class women into the new service sector since 1970s. These women want to ease their double burden by hiring domestic servants, thus enabling themselves to pursue their career goals. On the other hand, the supply of third world/non-Western domestic workers is mainly a result of the wage differential between the host and home countries. However, beyond wage differentials, the cultural, social, and economic conditions of the sending countries are factors underlying the international migration of women as domestic workers. It is not a coincidence that Philippines, Latin America, Mexico, Sri Lanka, Malaysia, and post-Soviet countries are the major countries in exporting women domestic workers. These are the countries that took the International Monetary Fund's (IMF's) packages to pay their international debts, and had to adopt IMF prescriptions, which meant cutting back on the social service budgets of the governments. Thus, with the loss of earning power and the rise in the cost of living in their home countries, women in these countries had to migrate as domestic servants in order to earn higher wages.

The trade in domestic servants has become a transnational business wherein many parties are involved and profit from. Governments of receiving countries benefit from the fulfillment of the middle classes' domestic service needs by the immigrant

women workers in two ways. Firstly and foremost, they want to unburden from the provision of social services for their citizens. Secondly, participation of their own native women workers in service sector prevents the collapse of their national economies. On the other hand, governments of sending countries benefit from the migrant remittances, and provide immigrations programs for supporting the migration of women workers as domestic workers abroad.

Yet, immigrant domestic women servants are disadvantaged from doing women's work that is conventionally unpaid work. Since employment in domestic service is devalued as informal work, policy-makers do not take this work seriously and also can not give a proper name to it and put a legal protection for domestic service work. As a result, immigrant domestic women workers remain in a vulnerable position in the receiving countries, since neither sending nor the receiving countries provide legal protection for them in terms of their working and living conditions.

Additionally, migrant agencies profit from recruiting domestic service workers. Since this is an illegal business, the recruitment agencies receive huge amounts of money both from the prospective employers and from the employees they support required documents for travel and recruitment. Indeed, trade in domestic servants has become an institutionalized business with the growing numbers of illegal recruitment agencies.

In this study, I will investigate the migration experiences and the working and living experiences of immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey. I think Turkey is a very appropriate venue upon which to base my study for many reasons. Firstly, the international migration of women as domestic workers is not only a very prevalent issue, but one that has also remained extremely invisible in the labor studies in Turkey, since it is embodied in the informal sector. Thus, immigrant women workers are very fragile and open to exploitation as a result of lack of attention and protection in both economic and legal terms. Secondly, there have not been many researches done on this prevalent phenomenon in Turkey, so doing a comprehensive

study on the migration, working, and living experiences of immigrant domestic women workers in two big cities, Ankara and Istanbul, would be an important contribution to this somehow overlooked field.

My interest in this topic originated when I was working as a baby-sitter during my undergraduate years and thus had the chance to observe immigrant domestic women workers. Hiring women domestic servants who have migrated from post-Soviet Republics and East Asian countries has been very prevalent especially among Turkish upper-class families in the large cities throughout the 1990s. I had the chance to interview some of these women and was very astonished to see that well-educated foreign women were migrating to Turkey to work in domestic service, which is a low-prestigious, low-paid, and devalued work. Considering the downward mobility these women have been having and harsh living conditions they have been experiencing, I wanted to shed light upon this untouched issue with a feminist approach.

This study has a particular concern on feminist perspective. The methodological approach of this study is feminist. The aim of this study is to give the opportunity to the immigrant domestic women workers to speak about their migration, working and living experiences in Turkey.

At the most abstract level, the central question of this study is "Why do the forces of supply and demand in the global economy systematically work to the detriment of women?", which inquires into the relationship between local and global analysis. International migration approaches have a gender-blind perspective in evaluating the international migration of labor, and also reduce their explanations merely to structural or individualistic analysis. However, international migration of women as domestic servants consisted of a very complex process wherein both local and global forces are intertwined. Therefore, in order to have a comprehensive analysis of the internationalization of female domestic labor, both micro and macro level of analyses are inquired. Some of the components of the micro level analysis are the

recruitment process, the financing of the worker's immigration, the protective mechanisms operating in both sending and receiving countries, and the modes of transferring remittances. Macro level analysis includes the uneven economic and social developmental processes occurring in different countries; the gender division of labor in formal and informal sectors of the society; the impact of particular development processes on gender roles, family life, and household organization; the emergence of waged domestic service as an economic demand that is supplied through a international transfer of genderized labor; political structures and relations at national, regional, and international levels affecting the flow of this trade, and the role and the benefits of the major parties involved in this trade.

Firstly, the main concerns for doing a study on the immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey are explained in chapter one. In chapter two, the explanations of major international migration approaches for the international migration of female labor are presented. At the macro level of analysis, World System Approach, Dual Labor Market Approach, and Equilibrium Approach; at the micro level of analysis, Neoclassical Economics approach; and at the meso level of analysis, The New Economics Approach, Network Approach, Institutional Approach, Migration Systems Approach are discussed in relation to immigrant domestic women workers.

In chapter three, macro level of analysis on the international migration of women is furthered in terms of global restructuring. In order to understand how global economy lead to the international flow of women immigrant workers from developing to more developed countries, a discussion of changes in the economies of developing countries and subsequent increase in the international migration of women from these countries are provided with statistics of major female labor-exporting countries.

In chapter four, approaches to paid domestic work and immigrant domestic women workers are portrayed. Starting with the history of paid domestic work, the fluctuations in the demand for domestic workers by middle-class women since

eighteen century Europe is discussed, and the current portraits of immigrant domestic women workers in different cities of wealthy countries are presented.

In chapter five, the studies on the illegal migration of foreigners to Turkey are displayed and the institutional and legal framework related to the working conditions of illegal immigrant workers in Turkey are evaluated. Consequently, the available studies on the immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey are reviewed.

In chapter six, the methodology of the study is explained. The in-depth interviews with sixteen immigrant domestic women workers, the interviews with two embassies and a specialist in Turkish Ministry of Labor and Social Security on illegal immigrant workers in Turkey are presented. In addition, the research questions and population bias and limitations of the study are explained.

The findings of the study are presented and interpreted in chapter seven and eight. In chapter seven, migration experiences of immigrant domestic women workers; and in chapter eight, the working and living experiences of immigrant domestic women workers are presented and discussed.

In the last chapter, conclusions are tried to be drawn regarding the discussion of the previous eight chapters. Considering these discussion together with the narratives of sixteen immigrant domestic women workers in the research group, what are the global and local determinants of making Turkey a destination country for the international migration of women domestic workers and forcing well-educated foreign women to seek domestic employment overseas through temporary migration are discussed, and how the immigrant status of women domestic workers influences their working and living experiences in Turkey are concluded.

CHAPTER II

APPROACHES TO INTERNATIONAL MIGRATION OF LABOR

2.1. Introduction

The purpose of this chapter is to explicate and integrate the leading international migration approaches in order to introduce a theoretical framework for understanding the international movement of women to work as domestic servants overseas. Although none of these approaches directly proposes to explain the international migration of women labor, each approach ultimately seek to elucidate the major causes, mechanisms, and dynamics behind the labor to move across borders. Macro approaches, namely the World Systems approach, Dual Labor Market approach, and Equilibrium approach focus on the structural factors leading to migration of labor. On the other hand, neoclassical economics approach evaluates this phenomenon with a micro level of analysis and conceives this phenomenon as an individual decision for income maximization. Additionally, I presented current alternative analysis of international migration as meso level of analysis, which are new economics approach, network approach, institutional approach, and migration systems approach.

There is no single, coherent theory of international migration. Nonetheless, an articulation of macro, micro, and meso level of analysis to international migration can give insight for a comprehensive understanding of the nature of international migration of women in the proceeding chapters.

2.1.1. Macro Level of Analysis

World System Approach explains the tendency of labor to move across the border in terms of dynamics of market creation and the structure of the global economy. According to World Systems approach, international migration of labor is a very natural consequence of the exploitative political-economic relationship between sending and receiving countries, and this relationship is forced by the developed countries through the penetration of capitalist market formation in the developing world. In other words, international migration of labor is conceptualized as a 'class phenomenon' by the world systems theorists (Goss & Lindquist, 1995; Brochmann, 1993). In the world economy, the status of a country is classified as a core (center), periphery or semi-periphery country. Highly industrialized nation-states with diverse economic production are the core countries, whereas the periphery countries are weak nation-states specializing in the export of primary goods and are the location of surplus labor which functions 'a reserve army of labor'. Since the colonial regimes, the core countries penetrated into the periphery in the search of land, raw material, labor and new consumer markets. Today, with the shifting of manufacturing production overseas, the world economy is managed from a small number of urban centers of the core countries. These 'global cities' are the centers wherein banking, finance, administration, professional services, service sector, and high-tech production are concentrated and occupied by well-trained and highly educated native or foreign workforce. Consequently, the demand for lowly-paid services requiring unskilled workforce such as busboys, domestic servants, gardeners, hotel workers, waiters, etc. created demand for immigrants.

Dual Labor Market Approach argues that international migration arises from a permanent demand for migrant labor due to the economic structure of developed countries. Piore, who is the strongest proponent of this approach, states that it is not the individual decisions leading people to migrate but "international migration stems from the intrinsic labor demands of modern industrial societies" (Piore,

1979:35). According to him, migration of labor can not be explained in terms of the push factors in sending countries such as low wages or high unemployment, but by pull factors in the receiving countries, which is an inevitable need for immigrant workers. According to dual labor market approach, jobs are characterized as primary sector jobs and secondary sector jobs. Capital-intensive methods are used in the primary sector jobs, and these jobs are occupied by unionized and highly professionalized workers with contracts. Since employers invest in these workers to provide them specialized training and education, these workers become like a capital, kept stable, and costly to idle. On the other hand, labor-intensive methods are used in the secondary sector jobs, which are seasonal, temporary, or part-time. When compared with the primary sector jobs, secondary sector jobs are insecure, unstable, lowly-paid and requiring unskilled labor. Additionally, in comparison the primary sector workers, secondary sector workers are easy to idle in that they are not unionized and having contracts with their employers. Massey et al. (1993) pronounces that low-wages, unstable conditions, and the lack of reasonable prospects for mobility in the secondary sector make does not attract native workers, and the labor shortage in the secondary sector is thus occupied by immigrants, who do not care the occupational status of the job but view these jobs as transient jobs to better off their living standards in the country of origin. In addition, they state that historically secondary sector jobs are occupied by women and teenagers, who are not primary breadwinners of the household but, seek to earn supplemental income for themselves and their families.

Equilibrium Approach derives from neo-classical economics theory and explains that migration of labor essentially stems from wage-rate differentials between the countries. The unit of analysis is the individual, and Broachmann states that according to the equilibrium approach migration, flows are assumed to be "the cumulative result of individual decisions based on rational calculations concerning costs and benefits" (1993:15). International migration is based on the "economic law of supply and demand" functioning to eliminate the "disequilibrium" through the redistribution of human capital from the countries of low equilibrium market

wage to the countries of high equilibrium market wage (in other words, it is the labor markets as the primary mechanisms by which international migration of labor are induced). As a result, by eradicating the existing "disequilibrium" between supply and demand in the international or national labor market; migration results with development, and remove rural-urban, interurban and interregional imbalances in an economy (Broachmann, 1993:15). Finally, Massey et al. (1993) state that in this scheme, equilibrium approach suggests that the elimination of wage differentials through the migration flows will end the migration of labor.

2.1.2. Micro Level of Analysis

Neoclassical economics approach argues that individuals as rational actors make a cost-benefit calculation and decide to migrate in the case that movement will bring positive monetary returns. One of the leading neoclassical economists, Michael P. Todaro, asserts that income differential factor has primary importance on the individual's decision to migrate. According to Todaro's version of migration model, "…members of the labor force, both actual and potential, compare their expected incomes for a given time horizon in the urban sector (the difference between returns and costs of migration) with prevailing average rural incomes and migrate if the former exceeds latter" (Todaro & Smith, 2003: 339). Hence, if the income differential between host and sending country is as large as considerable, then individuals would decide to migrate in order to work in better paid jobs. Additionally, Massey et al. articulate that individuals also assume other important dimensions of the migration such as material costs of maintenance while moving and looking for work, the effort involved in learning a new language and culture, the difficulty experienced in adapting to a new labor market, and the psychological costs of cutting old ties and building new ones (Massey et al., 1993). To sum up, the cause behind international migration of individuals to seek work is the wage differentials between the countries.

2.1.3. Meso Level of Analysis

Challenging the assumption of neoclassical theory, *The New Economics Approach* completely rejects the statement that migration decisions are held by isolated or autonomous actors due to the wage differentials between countries, and also the conclusion that international migration will end when the wage differentials will be eliminated across national boundaries. Rather, it enunciates that families, households, or other culturally defined units of production and consumption are the appropriate units of analysis for understanding the nature of international migration. Focusing exclusively on the household as the unit in which "people act collectively not only to maximize expected income, but also to minimize risks and to loosen constrains associated with a variety of market failures, apart from those in the labor market" (Massey et al., 1993), the new economics approach is based on the assumption that international migration is a way of controlling the economic well-being of households through the allocation of family labor. For instance, Faist (2000) states that in patriarchal societies, the male head of the family is in a position of deciding on the bahalf of the female and younger members of the family. Therefore, if local economic conditions deteriorate and household income becomes insufficient for the maintenance of family living, then migrant remittances supposedly provide a new source of income for the household.

Network Approach is systematized by Douglas S. Massey in order to emphasize that international migration is institutionalized through the formation and elaboration of migrant networks. He defines migrant networks as "sets of interpersonal ties that connect migrants, former migrants, and nonmigrants in origin and destination areas through the ties of kinship, friendship, and shared community origin" (Massey et al., 1993). He argues that network connections constitute a form of social capital in which people can gain access to foreign employment. He finally conceptualizes migration as a self-sustaining diffusion process independent of individual or structural factors:

> When the number of migrants reaches a critical threshold, the expansion of networks reduces the costs and risks of movement, which causes the probability of migration to rise, which causes additional movement, which further expands the network, and so on. (Massey et al., 1993)

Developed by Goss and Lindquist, *Institutional Approach* emphasize that international migration is simply neither the result of articulation of supply and demand in an international labor market, nor the effect of emergence of a global capitalist system and uneven development. Therefore, explaining the recent expansion in the international migration can not be reduced merely individual motivations or structural determinations. Rather, increasing number of international migrants is primarily connected with the international and national institutions linking employers with the individuals in Third World. Goss and Lindquist (1995) suggest that since international migration has begun, private institutions and voluntary organizations started to fulfill the demand of migrants who seek to enter into capital-rich countries. Consequently, the barriers to the immigrants in these countries created a new black market in migration. These international and national institutions perform legal or illegal services for migrants such as surreptitious smuggling across borders; clandestine transport to international destinations; labor contracting between employers and migrant; counterfeit documents and visas; arranged marriages between migrants and legal residents or citizens of the destination country; and lodging, credit, and other assistance in countries of destination (Goss & Lindquist, 1995). As soon as individuals, firms, and organizations in this informal business become well-known to immigrants and institutionally stable, they become like a social capital that migrants gain access to foreign employment.

Migration Systems Approach has an integrative position among the macro and micro level international migration theories, and suggests that international labor migration can be viewed as a unified social process in which individual decision and actions are conditioned by contextual factors (Goss & Lindquist, 1995). James T. Fawcett developed this approach for a comprehensive understanding of international migration trends since 1990s based on the assumption that political,

cultural, and social linkages engender migration system. As the conceptual framework in a migration system, he builds up four categories and three types of linkages ending up with a matrix of twelve cells. The four categories are State-to-State Relations; Mass Culture Connections; Family and Personal Networks; and Migrant Agency Activities. The three types are Tangible Linkages; Regulatory Linkages; and Relational Linkages.

- *Tangible/State-to-State linkages* consist of the trade and financial flows and bilateral economic and technical assistance.
- *Tangible/Mass Culture Connections* comprised of mass communication products such as newspapers, films, television shows, etc. that are regarded as serving for making other spaces attractive and thus creates an incentive for people to move.
- *Tangible/Family and Personal Networks* refers to monetary remittances, gifts and written communications among network members that flow between origin and destination.
- *Tangible/Migrant Agency Activities* refers to flows of materials attributable to migrant agencies, including for recruiting purposes, remittances sent through agencies, which are specifically designed to influence migration behavior.
- *Regulatory/State-to-State linkages* refer to immigration and emigration policies, temporary worker policies, and policies affecting other kind of movements.
- *Regulatory/Mass Culture Connections* are primary consist of societal norms, specifically which governs outmigration and community acceptance of immigrants.
- *Regulatory/Family and Personal Networks* include person-to-person obligations among relatives, friends, fellow ethnics, etc. whose expressions results in family or chain migration.
- *Regulatory/Migrant Agency Activities* are the rules and procedures promulgated by agencies in contact with migrants to carry out their recruiting or assistance functions, which are assumed to have direct affects on the size and characteristics of a migrant flow.

- *Relational/State-to-State linkages* include economic or political dependency relations, the complementarity of labor supply and demand and disparities in level of development-an array of macro variables that play a major role in many models of international migration flows.
- *Relational Mass Culture Connections* includes variables such as comparisons as the degree of similarity between cultures, the compatibility of value systems and commonalities in language and educational system.
- *Relational/Family and Personal Network* linkages involve the socioeconomic status of out-migrants and returned migrants. Whereas successful emigrants serve as role models for aspiring emigrants, failed return migrants man diminish flow or redirect it to alternative locations.
- *Relational/Migrant Agency Activities* refers to the extent to which activities at origin and destination are complementary, such as the information about living facilities in the destination.

Although Fawcett states that this framework is not a theoretical framework in that it does not specify the relationships between various concepts, he intends to emphasize the political, cultural, and social linkages producing and keeping up the international migration of labor (Fawcett, 1989).

2.2. Evaluation of Approaches on the International Migration of Labor and Concluding Remarks

All of the international migration theories presented in this chapter have different positions when explaining the origins and persistence of international migration of labor. While macro theories propose the structural determinants, micro theories deny their assumptions and reduce international migration to an individual calculation for better-paid foreign employment. However, each has considerable implications for a coherent theoretical framework for international migration, and

meso level of analysis partly fulfill the need for a unified theory. Nonetheless, the most significant deficiency of these approaches is that they all have gender-neutral position in explicating the international migration of labor, and ignore political, cultural, and social factors differing in the migration processes of women and men. Historically, it had been men who migrated for income as breadwinners to support their households. But since 1990s, migration of women as domestic servants, which is a much devalued occupation, in order to sustain the living of their household has become a very prevalent phenomenon. This critical transformation is severely neglected by the international migration theories. Furthermore, individual migrant's position in the household, family, and kinship structures and community plays an important role in the decision to migrate. Immigrant women workers are motivated by the concern for their family survival. Kofman et al. also states that women and men migrate for different reasons since 'the constraints on women's behavior are usually greater than those on men' (Kofman et al., 2000:22). For instance, she emphasized that international migration allows women to escape discrimination and oppression structures they face their gendered lives, and give them the oppurtunity to have more independent lives and to restore self-respect. Therefore, the gender roles in the sending country is a very critical aspect of international migration of women workers, which is neglected by international migration approaches, and needs to be investigated:

> Although sex has long been recognized as a variable in migrant selectivity, female migration has only recently been included within the rubric of migration theories. Consequently... the reasons for and characteristics of gender-differentiated migration mobility have not been adequately addressed in conceptual terms: migrating subjects are assumed to be gender-neutral, while the reasons for population movements are generally presented as gender-blind. (Chant & Radcliffe, 1992:19)

Again, important implications can be extracted from each approach to have some political, social, and cultural perspective on the international migration of women.

Heyzer and Wee stress that trade in domestic worker is such a phenomenon that is too complex and significant and cannot be analyzed simply with structural or

migration theories, but rather needs to be investigated in both micro and macro levels (in Heyzer, Nijeholt, and Weerakoon, 1994:33). The macro level analysis they recommend should be consisted of;

- The uneven economic and social development processes occurring in different countries,
- The gender division of labor in the informal and formal sectors of the society,
- The impact of particular development processes on gender roles, family life, and household organization,
- The emergence of waged domestic service as an economic demand that comes to be supplied through a transnational transfer of genderized labor,
- Political structures and relations at national, regional and international levels affecting the flow of this trade,
- Cultural, social, ethnic, religious, and linguistic forces of significance that shape the specifities of this trade in particular countries,
- The role and the benefits of the major parties involved in this trade,
- The profits and costs of this trade in human and monetary terms.

The micro level analysis is consisted of;

- The recruitment process,
- The financing of the worker's departure,
- The protective mechanism operating in both sending and receiving countries,
- The situation of the families left behind,
- The modes of transferring remittances.

Therefore, each international migration theory sketched in this chapter employ some dimensions of this comprehensive analysis of trade in domestic work. World Systems approach introduce us the global cities, where women migrate as domestic servants as a result of the rise of service sector in these cities, which creates a demand for lowly-paid services requiring unskilled workforce. However, it does not address why it is Third World women fill this gap in services. Hoerder also criticizes this approach since "The theory does not explain who of a targeted

reservoir of labor migrates or is selected by his or her community to migrate" (Hoerder, 2002:10). Also, Broachmann underlines:

> World systems approach tends to view migration in a negative perspective as a mechanism for exploiting countries and classes resulting from uneven development and the international division of labor. Even though individuals may profit from migrating in the short-run, the consequences for the oppressed classes are unquestionably negative and serve to split the laboring masses on a global scale. (Brochmann, 1993:23)

Additionally, since many parties are involved in the employment of women domestic workers in global cities such as family/kinship structure, recruitment agencies, and state, all these are ignored in this approach. Thus, both global and local analyses are needed in order to investigate the situation in women's paid domestic work.

Dual labor market approach yields a demand-based conceptualization of international migration, which based on the assumption that migration is driven by the conditions of demand for labor rather than supply. Therefore, the local social, cultural, and political conditions of the sending countries are not taken into account as push factors integrating to the international migration of labor. Beyond this, Piore's categorization of labor markets as primary and secondary labor markets has been criticized by Massey and his colleagues for being arbitrary categories that can not be tested empirically among job sectors (Massey et al., 1993).

Equilibrium approach associates the role of migration with a positive function contributing to the economic development of the sending countries, and assumes that labor migration stems from wage-rate differentials between the countries. Although women domestic servants are paid better than in their country of origin, it is not elaborated in this approach that the governments who took the International Monetary Fund's (IMF's) package to pay their international debts had to adopt IMF prescriptions, which meant cutting back on the social service budgets of the governments. Thus, with the loss of earning power and the rise in the cost of living in their home countries, women had to migrate as domestic servants in order to earn

better wages. Moreover, Zoldberg argues that the conclusion of this approach has problems with the future implications of the international migration: "Migration does not reduce spatial inequalities and lead to equilibrium but, due to the loss of human capital, intensifies inequalities and perpetuates underdevelopment (Zolberg, 1989). Goss and Lindquist (1995) also state that neither rise in the employment nor economic development occurred as predicted in the sending countries.

Neoclassical economic framework is too narrow for understanding the international migration flows in that it states that individual migrants move in response to the spatial distribution of means of production and natural resources. Goss and Lindquist (1995) stress that this approach reduces migrants, a social category that is structured by gender, ethnicity and social class to mere embodiment of labor power, and thus this conceptualization ignores the underlying structural forces and the political, social, and cultural dimensions involved in the migration processes. Also, job availability in the country of destination, Hoerder states, is more important than wage differentials for the migrants (Hoerder, 2002:9).

On the other hand, the state plays an important role in the international migration by deciding on who is allowed to enter with what status. At that point, migration systems approach make contributions to the evaluation of international migration of women as domestic workers by emphasizing the state-to-state linkages and migrant agency activities that play important roles in the entry into destination country. In addition, by articulating the role of legal and illegal institutions in the migration process, institutionalization approach takes attention to the migrant agencies and other voluntary organizations initiating and sustaining stable stream of migration flows to supply the demand for domestic servants. Hence, new economics approach articulated the role of household in determining the migration as a new source of income for the supporting family members. Additionally, network theory explains how international migration of labor is institutionalized throguh migrant network, but as Faist (2000:58) argues, is inadeuate in explaininig "how migrant networks come into being", also "the characteristics of resources inherent in social and

symbolic ties". Yet, these integrative approaches concentrate on the networks and linkages facilitating the migration of women domestic workers abroad apart from the macro and micro level of analysis, they are still theoretically inadequate in shedding light upon the gendered nature of this new trade in women domestic workers and thus cannot be able to provide alternative conceptualizations for international migration of female labor.

To sum up, international migration of women's labor since 1990s cannot be comprehensively analyzed by international migration theories, since it is a very complex and multilayered process including many political, social, and cultural parties together with the local and global dynamics. Rather than accounting the structure or agency as the sole unit of analysis, evaluation of the immigrant domestic women workers' international movements should include macro, micro, and meso level of analysis, which will be discussed in the next chapter.

CHAPTER III

APPROACHES LINKING IMMIGRANT WOMEN'S LABOR TO THE CHANGES IN THE GLOBAL ECONOMY

3.1. Introduction

By 2000, forty-nine per cent of all international migrants were constituted of women or girls. According to the United Nations' 2004 World Survey, the proportion of females among international migrants had arrived at fifty-one per cent in more developed regions (UN, 2005). As discussed in the first chapter, theoretical approaches on the international migration have gender-blind explanations for the current trends in the international migration of women and ignore that it is a very complex and multilayered process. Indeed, a gender perspective is essential for understanding the causes behind the continuous flows of immigrant women workers from Third World Countries to mostly more developed countries since migrating overseas would be an option for escaping the economic, political, and social constrains due to the 'gender inequality' at the country of origin.

There are many explanations on the current trend in the international movement of women for being caterers, cleaning ladies, domestic servants, entertainers, laundresses, nannies, nurses, nurses, etc. The present pattern of international labor migration is argued to be "a new spatial division of labor resulting from a major restructuring of the global economy" (Salt, 1992). In addition, Chant and Radcliffe stress that gender-differentiated population movement reflects the way that sexual division of labor are incorporated into spatially uneven processes of economic development (Chant & Radcliffe, 1992:1). At that point, globalization as an uneven

process is crucial for understanding the nature of the international migration of women workers. Economic globalization has had a significant impact on the developing countries which sought to integrate into the global market and succeed economic growth through adopting Structural Adjustment Program (SAPs) offered them. These countries were encouraged to adopt new policies and accommodate new conditions associated with globalization in order to solve economic crisis by opening their economies to foreign direct investment and eliminating state subsidies, which inevitably led to financial crisis, growing international debts and finally the accompanying programs of the International Monetary Fund (Sassen, 2000). However, neither structural adjustment programs, nor the IMF packages has had opened the way to economic growth in the countries they were applied. On the contrary, Sassen enunciates that for most of the countries involved in these economic restructuring processes, these conditions have created big costs for certain sectors of the economy and population, and also have not actually reduced government debt. Among the most significant outcomes of the restructuring programs are the growth in unemployment as a result of the closure of many traditional sectors; transition to export-oriented cash crop production, which have replaced survival agriculture and food production for local or national markets; increase in poverty; and heavy burden of government debt in most of these economies (Sassen, 2000). All contributed to finding alternative ways one the one hand for governments to cope with the heavy debt burden, and on the other hand for the citizens to make a living for survival in the conditions of poverty and unemployment in their countries. Indebted governments passed regulation for international migration and promoted the migration of their citizens overseas to secure their revenues by remittances sent by the immigrants. At the same time, exporting labor was a way of dealing with the high unemployment in their countries. In 2003, total of the global remittances sent by immigrants were US$ 93 billion (see Table 1).

On the other hand, women and children were among the mostly damaged by the restructuring, primarily because of the cut backs in state subsidies such as in social

services including health, child-care, and education services. Due to high unemployment and low-paid jobs, women were forced to migrate from rural to urban areas or overseas for gaining employment or earning better paid jobs and with an impetus to support their families. Historically, men have been the breadwinners of the family, and migrated for getting income for their households. However, 'trade' in feminized labor has become so prevalent and institutionalized through recruiting agencies and government promotions that undocumented migration and illegal trafficking in women have become growing in importance as profit-making activities all over the world. Sassen uses the notion of "feminization of survival" to refer to the fact that households and whole communities are increasingly dependent on women for their survival and she stresses that international migration of women "could be considered as indicators of the (albeit partial) feminization of survival, because it is on the backs of women that these forms of making a living, earning a profit and securing government revenue are realized" (Sassen, 2000).

In this chapter, my aim is to analyze the causes and consequences of the current trend in the international migration of women in the light of global restructuring. Accordingly, the major women worker exporting countries will be portrayed in order to shed light upon the common transformations in the female employment after the adoption of the Structural Adjustment Programs.

3.2. Global Restructuring and Immigrant Women Workers

Since 1980s, Third World countries have experienced major economic transformations in order to solve their international debt problems and to integrate into the global economy. Classifying the two elements of global economy as 'economic restructuring' and 'globalization', Moghadam (1999) states that economic restructuring refers to the changes in the organization of production which could take place at the global, regional, national, or firm level. When I will

use the notion of global economy, I will refer to Moghadam's definition of globalization, which is:

> the increasingly integrated and interdependent system of capital-labor flows across regions, between states, and through transnational corporations and international financial institutions, in the form of capital investment, technology transfer, financial exchanges, and increased trade, as well as the various forms of deployment of labor, by which global accumulation takes place. (Moghadam, 1999:130)

While developed countries have become the sites of finance, management and service sector as a result of the technical transformation of the work process, developing countries shifted to the export-led production in agriculture and manufacturing accompanying a growth in the service sector. The main strategy towards restructuring their economies in Third World Countries was the replacement import-substitution industrialization with the production of goods for export to world markets (Moghadam, 1999:131). In addition, Asia's 'Four Dragons', namely Hong Kong, Singapore, South Korea, and Taiwan (The Newly Industrialized Countries) adjusted their economies to the export-oriented industrialization and became the main importers of not only raw materials but also manufactured goods. Eastern and Central Europe countries abandoned central planning and control, and accommodated open market strategies. Formerly socialist countries shifted from state planning to market-based decision–making. Russia promoted privatization, liberalization, and democratization in order to open their markets to the global economy (Stiglitz, 2002). African and Latin American countries abandoned import-substitution strategies and attempted to integrate their economies into global market.

The primary condition of integrating into the global market was introduced as adopting Structural Adjustment Programs by the international financial institutions; The International Money Fund and World Bank. World Bank gave structural adjustment loans to the countries facing macroeconomic instability, which includes

high inflation and severe government budget and foreign payment of deficits, in the conditions of;

1) abolition of liberalization of foreign exchange and import controls;
2) devaluation of the official exchange rates;
3) domestic anti-inflation programs consisting of a) control of bank credit to raise interest rates and reserve requirements, b) control of government deficits through curbs on spending, including in areas of social services for the poor and staple food subsidies, along with increases in taxes and public enterprise, c) control of wage increases, in particular abolishing wage indexing, and d) dismantling of various forms of price controls and promoting freer markets;
4) greater hospitality to foreign investment and a general opening up of the economy to international commerce (Todaro & Smith, 2003:613).

These conditions were 'short-run' adjustments for improving the balance of payment deficits and reducing the inflation of the indebted countries, and did not provide a sustainable economic development in the long-run. Structural Adjustment Programs are mostly criticized for hurting middle and low-income groups (Aslanbeigui, 1994; Todaro & Smith, 2003; Moghadam, 1999; Vickers, 1991; Sassen, 1988). At the same time, control of bank credit and increases in taxes as parts of the 'domestic anti-inflation programs' severely affected farmers relied on subsistence production and small producers. Rise in unemployment, decrease in family income, and increase in poverty are the three major outcomes of the SAPs. That's why in countries who adopted IMF policies, migration from rural-urban and overseas in the search of income, especially among poor agricultural workers, perpetuated:

> the expansion of export manufacturing and export agriculture in LDCs, both of which are inseparably related with direct foreign investment from the highly industrialized countries has mobilized new segments of the population into regional and distance migrations. (Sassen-Koob, 1984)

Indeed, women and men were differently affected, and it was women who were hard hit because of the double disadvantage of being poor and female. Aslanbeigui

argues that structural adjustment policies in the short-run perpetuated lower wages, higher prices, higher unemployment, and poverty, so women tried to compensate for the loss of social services and family income (Aslanbeigui et al., 1994:3). Similarly, Vickers enunciates:

> …the debt crisis and structural adjustment policies have placed the heaviest burden on poor women, who earn less, own less and control less…Reductions in health and child-care services mean that women must assume even greater responsibilities in these areas…Elimination of food subsidies, falling wages, and rising prices reduce women's spending power as food providers, and they must cope with the sheer survival needs of their families. (Vickers, 1991:15)

Additionally, the reductions of government subsidies of food, health and child-care services disposed extra productive and reproductive activities on poor women in order to make a living under the austerities of adjustment and stabilization policies (Moghadam, 1999: 133). Especially, women's situation worsens when they are heads of their families:

> The situation becomes particularly acute where women are heads of families, or are left behind by husbands who look for work elsewhere. Preparing and providing food and other household needs, and generally maintaining the home with less money, fewer public services and reduced social benefits places an extra burden on women, especially when their participation in the economic field is also increasing. (Vickers, 1991:31)

Moreover, the condition of having 'greater hospitality to foreign investment' in the structural adjustment programs means that the countries opened their economies to foreign direct investment from advanced industrial countries for export-led industrialization. Sassen (1988) states that countries with limited internal markets and large reserves of cheap labor welcomed foreign investment for export agriculture and manufacturing. Consequently, new segments of population have been drawn into labor force in new Export Processing Zones (EPZs). Although it varies from country to country, almost 70 per cent of all workers in zones are women (Sassen, 19948:12). Women's labor were primarily preferred in these production areas, since these manufacturing jobs were identified with the

characteristics of female employment, which are low-skill, low-wages, and limited possibilities for promotion.

Even though the export-oriented policies increased the participation of women in export-led economic activities, simultaneously, their participation in traditional areas of 'female jobs' (such as subsistence agriculture) became devalued (Vickers, 1991). Export agriculture has led to the 'proletarianization of women'. Similarly, Anker and Hein agree that modern sector took over traditional economic activities of women which were the means for self-employed women to earn their income (Anker & Hein, 1986:1). Therefore, IMF adjustment policies reinforced marginalization of women through imposing export-led industrialization policies.

Furthermore, 'young women who under conditions of a more gradual industrialization' have not participated into labor force in a rapid way (Sassen, 1988:97). Consequently, this situation created a 'pool of unemployed' people, who were forced to migrate as a 'family survival strategy'. Sassen (1988) points out that, for instance, Asian and Caribbean Basin countries were the major recipients of direct foreign investment, and also are among the main migrant worker exporting countries. In the export-oriented economies, families have become heavily relied upon women's labor. Migration of women in the family has become a survival strategy for the families, who lost their formal employments, state-sponsored services, and faced poverty. On the other side of the coin, common economic practices in international subcontracting and EPZs show that the emerging global economy has become depend on the women's labor, what Moghadam calls as "the feminization of labor":

> In all regions, high unemployment represents the downside of globalization and economic restructuring, especially for women workers, who must contend with not only the class biases but also the gender biases of free market economies… In the current global environment of open economies, new trade regimes, and competitive export industries, global accumulation relies heavily on the work of women, both waged and unwaged, in formal sectors and in the home, in manufacturing, and in public and private

> services. This phenomenon has been termed the 'feminization of labor'. (Moghadam, 1999:134)

Moreover, "feminization of unemployment" has become another characteristic of the global economy. Women who were teachers, nurses, office workers and lost their jobs due to strict SAPs measures left their countries to work in babysitting, domestic service, sex tourism, entertainment sector, etc. Sassen (2000) argues that heavy debt burden of the developing countries perpetuated the "formation of counter-geographies of survival", and economic globalization provided an institutional infrastructure for the global circuits of women migrants, which became an important monetary source for government revenues. In the next section, it will be discussed how female-labor export has become a strategy for the indebted governments to decrease unemployment and increase government revenue.

3.3. Major Female Labor-Exporting Countries and Global Remittances as a Source of Government Revenue

3.3.1. Remittances

Remittances sent by the migrants have been a prominent source for the migrants' families as well as the governments of the sending countries. In 2003, the total amount of global remittances was about 93 billion US dollars. In the Table 1 below, the regional distribution of remittances are illustrated:

Table 1. Regional Distribution of Remittances

(Billions of United States dollars)

Region	1990	1995	2001	2002	2003
East Asia and Pacific	3.0	9.9	13.7	17.0	17.6
Europe and Central Asia	3.2	5.6	10.2	10.3	10.4
Latin America and Caribbean	5.7	12.9	22.9	26.8	29.6
Middle East and North Africa	11.4	10.0	13.2	13.0	13.0
South Asia	5.6	10.0	13.1	16.9	18.2
Sub-Saharan Africa	1.5	2.7	3.9	4.1	4.1
Total	**30.4**	**51.2**	**77.1**	**88.1**	**93.0**

Source: UN 2004 World Survey on the Role of Women in Development, 2005:20.

3.3.2. Functions of the Remittances

There are several arguments on the importance of remittances for the labor-exporting countries. Vertovec argues that remittances represent the 'quickest and surest source of foreign exchange' for the labor-exporting countries, and many governments' economies depend on the remittances transferred by the migrants (Vertovec, 1999). Similarly, Sassen affirms that the increasing number of women migrants has supported an importance source of 'convertible currency' for the sending countries (Sassen, 2000). Also, remittances are an important and stable source of external development finance for the labor-exporting countries (Ratha, 2003). Additionally, it is argued that immigrant women contribute to the economic and social development of both origin and destination countries, through remittances, diaspora investments, and human capital gains on return (UN, 2005). However, the main argument in this section is that governments of the labor exporting countries have a crucial role in the 'institutionalization' of international migration of women workers. Eliminating unemployment and enhancing government revenues are the two tendencies for the governments to promote migration overseas. Obviously, it is not a coincidence that the major labor-

exporting countries had experienced financial crisis and adopted SAPs or opened their market to global economy. Therefore, firstly it is required to have a look at the situation of female employment after the introduction of SAPs in the indebted countries and application of IMF supported programs, who have become major women worker exporting countries.

Table 2. Female Migration: 2000

	Estimated Number of Female Migrants at Midyear				
Major area, region, country or area	1960	1970	1980	1990	2000
World	**35 469 362**	**38 507 161**	**47 156 135**	**73 817 887**	**85 080 716**
More developed regions	15 629 174	18 742 613	23 882 284	45 347 826	56 228 897
More developed regions without the USSR (former)	14 203 958	17 259 476	22 306 792	29 860 914	40 896 880
Less developed regions	19 840 187	19 764 548	23 273 851	28 470 062	28 851 819
Least developed countries	2 896 736	3 323 332	4 129 540	5 102 639	4 929 009
Africa	**3 794 583**	**4 208 331**	**6 216 156**	**7 441 517**	**7 595 140**
Eastern Africa	1 293 119	1 475 861	2 301 832	2 875 736	2 172 969
Middle Africa	590 194	826 174	885 992	678 235	688 812
Northern Africa	736 578	463 260	705 274	1 047 756	832 620
Southern Africa	295 111	315 178	391 477	559 760	652 419
Western Africa	879 580	1 127 858	1 931 582	2 280 030	3 248 320
Asia	**13 572 729**	**13 096 395**	**14 340 682**	**17 862 959**	**18 936 075**
Eastern Asia	1 278 511	1 420 383	1 785 838	2 102 777	2 960 174
South-central Asia	8 522 472	7 910 730	7 626 765	8 679 779	6 607 013
South-eastern Asia	1 996 622	1 650 835	1 386 772	1 444 668	1 994 868
Western Asia	1 775 123	2 114 447	3 541 309	5 635 735	7 374 020
Europe	**6 799 126**	**8 981 401**	**10 752 040**	**13 120 718**	**16 736 713**
Eastern Europe	1 839 170	1 564 127	1 396 956	1 289 489	1 547 640
Northern Europe	1 146 007	1 971 053	2 397 504	2 741 423	3 223 267
Southern Europe	746 303	966 136	1 211 280	1 853 954	2 736 125
Western Europe	3 067 646	4 480 085	5 746 300	7 235 852	9 229 682
Latin America and the Caribbean	**2 702 258**	**2 690 034**	**2 957 603**	**3 497 251**	**2 983 844**
Caribbean	204 522	288 102	362 570	433 491	523 755
Central America	226 661	200 950	276 194	940 403	531 621
South America	2 271 075	2 200 983	2 318 839	2 123 357	1 928 467
Northern America	**6 227 246**	**6 638 354**	**9 516 257**	**14 074 660**	**20 543 473**
Oceania	**947 643**	**1 408 956**	**1 797 350**	**2 333 426**	**2 945 035**
Australia/New Zealand	910 724	1 354 625	1 713 969	2 228 821	2 818 208
Melanesia	20 306	36 923	39 807	39 724	37 536
Micronesia	11 493	8 275	25 776	38 030	53 275
Polynesia	5 120	9 133	17 798	26 851	36 016
USSR (former)	**1 425 777**	**1 483 690**	**1 576 046**	**15 487 356**	**15 340 437**

Source: UN 2004 World Survey on the Role of Women in Development, 2005:10.

By 2000, the estimated number of women immigrant workers abroad migrated from USSR (former) was 15 340 437 out of about 30 million post-Soviet migrant population in the world, which constitutes one sixth of the total number of women migrants in the world (see Table 2). Political and economic factors beyond the increasing migration of Soviet women across borders as sex workers, domestic servants, entertainers, and order-brides can be traced to the economic crises of 1970s. Mikhail Gorbachev's economic reforms to end the economic crisis was *perestroika* (restructuring) through democratizing economic institutions and introducing market elements into the economy, which were based on the notions of 'openness' and 'democratization'. Gorbachev's policies were assumed to provide socio-economic development through greater efficiency. Therefore, in order to increase efficiency, unprofitable industries were closed, and unproductive or unneeded workers were laid off, which in turn resulted with increased unemployment and large losses of income throughout Central and Eastern Europe (Aslanbeigui et al., 1994:2). Also, financial reforms did not bring the expected financial outcomes. McMahon argues that Gorbachov's policies were gender-neutral. In addition to the pre-existing occupational segregation and gender gap at paid work, women now had to return their home (McMahon, 1994:61). After the break up of Soviet Union in 1991, most of the Baltics, Russia, and other former Soviet Union countries adopted macroeconomic stabilization of IMF. Between 1992–97, among 15 countries including the Baltics, Russia, and the other countries of the former Soviet Union, 14 adopted IMF-supported programs (Valdivieso, 1999). The economic transition from central planning to open economy was followed by sharp declines in output, high rates of inflation and decrease in the formal sector employment in which have severe outcomes especially on poor and women:

> Inadequate reforms and their slow pace have prolonged the output-deterioration with important implications for social protection. Declining government revenue in relation to GDP, combined with insufficient attention to targeting of public programs to be truly needy, has worsened the plight of poor and vulnerable households. This has resulted in severe hardships for many households, particularly those with large numbers of children and those headed by single pensioners, the unemployed, and females. Although

> output decline has been reversed in most of the BRO (the countries of former Soviet Union), policymakers are faced with the challenge of addressing deteriorating social indicators, rising unemployment and underemployment, increasing incidence of poverty, and widening income inequality. (Gupta, 1998)

When compared with men, women were more hurt by the neo-liberal reforms and macroeconomic stabilization programs. Although the strict measures of stabilization programs affect post-socialist societies differently, women were the most vulnerable group in the labor market during the process of political and economic restructuring. Before the transition, women had high levels of education and work in jobs with high social protection. They also had access to basic education, health care and employment. However, they suffered from job losses and reduction in pay (Esim, 2001). Whitehead and Demirdirek state that in regions of industrial restructuring and plant closures, in female-headed households, women took the responsibility of managing multiple strategies for household survival (Whitehead & Demirdirek, 2004). Due to unemployment, poverty, and loss of social services, women were forced to migrate overseas to gain income.

Moldova and Ukraine, which are the two major female exporting countries, experienced similar social and economic outcomes after the break up of the Soviet Union: drastic decrease in living standards, deteriorating quality and access to social, medical and welfare services for the population, as well as the deepening division between the rich and poor (IFRC, 2004). In Moldova, the economic crisis and falls in production, severe unemployment, a reduction of expenditures in the social sphere, the collapse of the education system and the lack of a national strategy on migration are the factors behind thee impoverishment of the population and development of illegal migration. Sleptova (2003) reports than between 2001 and 2003 more than ten thousand Moldovan immigrant workers were deported from Portugal, Spain, Turkey and Israel because they worked illegally there. Women migrated to neighboring countries or to Western Europe to work requiring low-skills to earn income for their families. (IPP, 2004) Many of them have been migrating illegally, or have become the victims of human trafficking. Because of

similar social and economic constrains, women of Ukraine and Russia were forced to trafficking as sex workers, and today these countries have become the major countries human trafficking formed as an organized crime. However, human trafficking differs from international migration; it is "the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons either by the threat or use of abduction, force, fraud, deception or coercion, or by giving or receiving of unlawful payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having the control over another person for the purpose of exploitation" (Morrison; Crosland, 2000). In this study, I focus on the international migration of women as independent persons. Although trafficking in women has become a very prevalent crime severely violating human rights, it is beyond the main discussion of this thesis.

Due to huge external debt, Latin American countries had to take IMF assistance since 1980s. In 1970s, Mexico, Argentina, Brazil, and Venezuela were the newly industrializing countries (NICs) of Latin America, whose growth rates above the developing countries. These countries followed outward-looking development strategies and import capital, goods, oil and food heavily. However, in the face of high oil prices and world recession, many Latin American countries sought to rely on heavy borrowing in order to keep their high growth rates from commercial banks and other private lenders. Between, 1975-1979, their total external debts doubled that they had no option other than seeking IMF assistance. Todaro and Smith evaluate the outcomes of IMF assistance in Latin America as follows:

> Balance of payments problems on many developing countries may be structural and long-tern in nature, with the result that short-term stabilization policies may easily lead to long-run development crises. For example between 1982 and 1988, the IMF strategy was tested in 28 of the 32 nations of Latin America and the Caribbean. It was not clearly working. During that period, Latin America financed $145 billion in debt payments but at a cost of economic stagnation, rising unemployment, and a decline in per capita income of 7%. These economies were adjusted but did not grow. (Todaro & Smith, 2003:614)

As we see in former USSR case, the negative effects of IMF stabilization programs in these countries disproportionately fell on the poor and females as well.

Among Latin American countries, Mexico accounts for 34 per cent of the flow of remittances to Latin America (Sørensen, 2004). In Mexico it can be said that the changing social and economic conditions of Mexican people were ignored by adopting the economic program without any concrete policy toward rural or urban sector. Flow of women workers from urban to rural and to the United States is a direct outcome of IMF stabilization programs. Mexico accepted the demands of the United States and the IMF to steer a new economic program in 1982. For enhancing economic efficiency and integrating economy into international markets, the Mexican government gave emphasis on reducing the foreign debt by restructuring domestic industries for export production. The reforms included the elimination of trade barriers, encouragement of new foreign investment, stable exchange rates, governmental monetary constraints, and controlled inflation. It seems that the reforms have had a mixed impact particularly on women. Women's job opportunities and participation rates in non- traditional areas such as manufacturing especially in the "export-processing zones" (the *maquiladoras*[1]) have increased. However, women have been pushed into the instabilities of informal economy that include a greater possibility of being poor. Moreover, since economic reforms have resulted in deindustrialization in the country, gross domestic investment has decreased (Holt, 1994:179). The economic reforms that led to important curtails in agricultural development programs caused massive migration from the countryside (Holt, 1994:182). Holt puts that "What is curious about Mexico in 1980s is that there has been an 'added' worker' effect when the primary worker of the family is laid off, another member enters the workforce in order to protect the family's standard of living" (Holt, 1994:181). As a result of the

[1] "Assembly plants as subsidiaries or subcontracting firms for the manufacture of export-oriented goods", Mittelman 1994.

increasing unemployment of the "primary workers" and restrains in public assistance, rural women were forced to join the workforce for keeping themselves and their families alive. Increasing rates of women workforce can also be remarkably observed in the rural-urban migration. Because of the limited job opportunities provided by the declining agricultural sector, many women have been forced to migrate to the urban areas of Mexico or to the United States to join the workforce. It is estimated that Latin America and the Caribbean are the main recipient areas of remittances in the world (Sørensen, 2004). By 2000, the total amount of Latin American women immigrants in the world was 1 404 712 (Table 2) and the remittances sent by Latin American and Caribbean migrants by 2002 were 29.6 billion US dollars (Table 1).

Most of the countries of Asia were severely damaged by the Asian crisis of 1997, and had to large sums of money from the IMF in order to stabilize their 'shaky' economies (Todaro & Smith, 2003). The overall effects of stabilization programs were increased poverty, unemployment, and high inflation rates. Additionally, declining state resources for social welfare programs were among the push factors for international migration in the Asian countries. In Asian case, the international migration of women workers shows differences when compared with the countries of former post-Soviet and Latin America. Chin states that "since the early 1980s, low-wage labor migration has become a long-term policy response of Asian sending countries to socioeconomic and political pressures brought about by structural adjustment and stabilization policies" (Chin, 1997). The governments of Philippines, Thailand, and India promoted the international migration of their citizens through passing legislation and formation of new institutions in order to decrease unemployment rates and secure foreign exchange reserves through remittances sent by the migrants (Sørensen, 2004). For instance, Filipino government has the largest program on permitting the migration of women overseas. Philippines Overseas Employment Administration (POEA) was established in 1982 to organize the supply the demand of countries for female Filipino workers. Sassen explicates the institutional structure of international

migration of Filipino women as follows:

> The largest numbers of Filipinos going through these channels work overseas as maids, particularly in other Asian countries. The second largest group and the fastest growing are entertainers, mostly to Japan. The rapid increase in the numbers of entertainer-migrants is largely due to the existence of over five hundred "entertainment brokers" in the Philippines operating outside the state umbrella even though the government may benefit from the remittances of these workers. These brokers work to provide women for the sex industry in Japan, which is basically supported or controlled by organized gangs rather than government-controlled programs for the entry of entertainers. These women are recruited for singing and entertaining, but frequently are forced into prostitution as well. (Sassen, 2000)

The Philippines is the second major labor-exporting country in the world. Immigrant Filipina women are working in one hundred and forty countries all over the world, and workers possess a competitive advantage in the global labor market due to their adequate education and English proficiency (Parreñas, 2000). On the other hand, for their interests many countries permitted the entrance of Filipino women into their countries. There was a demand in the Middle East for domestic workers after the 1973 oil boom. The United States passed the Immigration Nursing Relief Act of 1989 to deal with the sharp shortage of nurses nationwide. Japan economy was boomed after 1980s. The government of Japan facing rising expendable income and strong labor and young women shortages, passed legislation that permitted the entry of "entertainment workers" and “Filipino brides” into its booming economy in the 1980s.

The total number of female Asian migrants in the world by 2000 was 16 736 713. According to 1995 ILO report, immigrant Filipina women immigrant workers outnumber their male counterparts by 12 to 1 in Asian countries; there are more than three Indonesian women migrants for every male migrant, and about three Sri Lankan women to every two male migrant workers. They work as housemaids, nurses, helpers in retail shops and restaurants, and as entertainers in Middle East, Japan, Singapore, Hong Kong, and Western Europe (ILO, 1995). The total amount

of remittances sent by the migrants to the major labor-importing countries in Asia are sketched below:

Table 3. Ranking Asian Countries by Net Remittances between 1997-2000 (US$ BIO)

1997	1998	1999	2000
India 10.1	India 9.4	India 11.0	India 9.1
Philippines 6.7	Philippines 5.1	Philippines 6.8	Philippines 6.1
China, P.R. 4.3	Bangladesh 1.6	Bangladesh 1.8	Bangladesh 1.9

Source: IMF Balance of Payment Statistics Yearbook 2001.

By 2003, South Asia was the second-largest remittance recipient region in the world (Sørensen, 2004). India is the world's largest remittance recipient country and accounts for 73 per cent of the total global remittances to South Asia and the Philippines for 43 per cent of total flow to East Asia and the Pacific.

3.4. Conclusion

International migration of women in the developing countries to work in lowly-paid occupations in the more developed countries has become an institutionalized movement through the promotion of sending countries' governments. Countries of post-Soviet region, Latin America and Asia had to adopt IMF stabilization programs in order to deal with their depleted foreign reserves and economic crisis. Additionally, IMF and World Bank introduced these programs as the pathways to integrate global economy and sustain economic growth. However, the major problem with the IMF supported programs was that these policies and adjustments were short-term and has severe social and economic outcomes in the long-run. It is obvious that all the countries discussed in this chapter paid the same heavy bill of the IMF assistance: increased poverty, unemployment, international debts, and falls

in the living standard. Poor and women remained to carry the heaviest burden for the macroeconomic policies. They lost their jobs, incomes, social services and overworked by both reproductive and productive responsibilities of their families. Due to the decline in formal sector employments, their partners/fathers/brothers lost their jobs and it became women's turn to migrate in the search for family income. Both government and the migrant's family benefited from women's migration overseas. Some governments encouraged the international migration of women through creating the legislative body and recruitment agencies to sustain a stable source for their revenues through migrant remittances. The feminization of poverty is a component of global economy in that forces of supply and demand in global economy work to the detriment of women. Poor women of the developing countries were the most vulnerable group affected by the global restructuring practices since 1980s. That is not the end. In addition, because of their gender and immigration status in the host countries, immigrant women had to work under more severe conditions.

Domestic work is one of the most popular jobs immigrant women occupy in the receiving countries. Although immigrant women earn better wages when compared with the home country, working-class women migrants face downward mobility and become deskilled in that domestic work is constitutive of simple, manual, and monotonous tasks in order to cope with the economic constraints in their home country. In the next chapter, the factors behind the emergence and institutionalization of trade in domestic workers will be discussed.

CHAPTER IV

PAID DOMESTIC WORK AND IMMIGRANT DOMESTIC WOMEN WORKERS

4.1. Introduction

Boserup enunciates that engagement of women into paid domestic work is "a characteristic feature of countries at intermediate stage of economic development" (Boserup, 1970:103). She articulates that in the countries of very early stage of development, domestic tasks are done by usually female family members, whereas in the countries of intermediate stages of development, domestic tasks have become commercialized, and being performed by waged male or female domestic servants. For middle-class women, hiring a domestic worker has been a way for the emancipation from their double burden for centuries. Either they are working or not, middle-class women have hired domestic servants in order to extract leisure time from the gendered division of labor at their households. In this chapter, a brief history of paid domestic service in European societies since eighteenth century is presented in order to catch a grasp on the rising demand for waged domestic labor in different times.

Today, immigrant women are employed in industrializing countries for waged domestic work (Parreñas, 2001; Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2001; Enloe, 1989). Although some countries have a regular and formal establishment for the importation of foreign domestic workers, this occupation, which is very prevalent worldwide, is still unlegislated and invisible in most of the receiving and sending countries. In

Kümbetoğlu's (2005) terms, the "double blindness" situation in the home and host countries of migrant domestic service perpetuates the exploitation of immigrant women, who are already in a subordinated position because of their gender, race, class, illegal status, and sometimes religion. The main concern of this chapter is to situate the relationship between the global economy and international migration of workers in terms of the social, economic, and cultural dimensions both in the local and global level of analysis. Finally, seven in-depth studies conducted in different host cities and countries are displayed to show the current portrait of immigrant domestic women workers and their oppressive working and living conditions mainly result from the lack of sufficient control and protect mechanism in both home and host countries.

4.2. Paid Domestic Service in Historical Perspective

In the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, there was an enormous increase in the demand for servants in Europe. Both women and men were occupied in domestic service. However, between 1880 and 1900, with the decreases in the wages of male servants and new employment opportunities for male urban migrants became more attractive, the feminization of service accelerated (McBride, 1977). Quoting Gregson and Lowe, Momsen records that around two million women were employed as servants in the second half of the nineteenth century in Britain, especially in southern England (Momsen, 1999:3). Many authors elucidate that high demand for the domestic servants in European societies was due to the rise of middle class in eighteenth century. Industrialization and urbanization heightened the growth of domestic service workforce created a middle-class who hires domestic servants, and also a surplus of unskilled female labor due to the mechanization of agricultural work (Momsen in Momsen, 1999:2).

For middle-class family, McBride (1977) enunciates, hiring domestic servants was to "symbolize its ascent by the display of retinue of servants". Additionally, the

Victorian ideology of 'domesticity' underpinned the 19th century femininity and domesticity centered on family, motherhood, and respectability:

> The industrial revolution helped create a demand for domestic servants by nurturing the notion of the middle-class women who would protect her own feminine purity from manual labor and yet still provide a refuge for her hardworking husband. The histories of working-class British women, Irish women, African-American and Japanese-American women have all been shaped by the domestic jobs created by this Victorian ideology. (Chang, 2000:178)

> The 'cult of domesticity' is a crucial variant of motherhood, one made possible by the industrial revolution, by breadwinner husbands who have access to employers who pay a 'family wage', and by particular configuration of global and national socioeconomic and racial inequalities. (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 1997)

Accordingly, Glenn argues that in the nineteenth century, the demand for help in the household and the number of servants employed accompanied by the rise of industrial capital and the elaboration of middle-class women's reproductive responsibilities:

> Rising standards of cleanliness, larger and more ornately furnished homes, and the new emphasis on childhood and the mother's role in nurturing children" contributed to the expansion of middle-class women's responsibilities for reproduction. (Glenn, 1992)

However, Glenn enumerates that, middle-class women sought to ease their burden by hiring 'more oppressed groups of women' rather than questioning gender-based division of labor or the enlargement of their reproductive responsibilities:

> White middle-class women thereby freed for supervisory tasks and for cultural, leisure, and volunteer activity or, more rarely during this period, for a career … by hiring a recent immigrant, a working class woman, a woman of color, or all three. (Glenn, 1992)

Reporting the domestic servants in Europe in the eighteenth to nineteenth centuries, McBride asserts that the rising demand of middle class families for the domestic

servants in the city was satisfied by immigrants from the countryside. The need to escape poverty in the agricultural/overpopulated areas and have access to upward mobility were other two driving force behind the rural-urban migration of women as domestic servants.

An informal network between the cities and the rural areas played an important role on the placement of domestic service in the city. McBride (1977) notifies that young immigrants in Paris could stay with their relatives or with other natives of the same area residing in the city in order to find domestic employments. The most common motivation for young peasants to migrate Paris as domestics was higher wage levels in the city. In addition to high wages, board and lodging were not a problem for immigrants since almost all the domestics were staying in the employers' houses. Moreover, domestic service offered the possibility of upward social mobility for immigrant women:

> For a significant minority of servants, household service was the means to a good marriage, since service work allowed a young woman to accumulate a dowry, to acquire useful skills, and to meet men outside her own class, such as shopkeepers…There was a prejudice against factory work for women, and girls were believed to make better wives if they became domestic servants before marriage rather than factory workers. (McBride, 1977)

Despite all these advantages, domestic service included many disadvantages in the eighteenth century. There was no limited working hours for traditional servants. Most domestic workers lived in the house of their masters. An ideal servant was the one who "resided with his master, and unmarried and even asexual who had no outside attachment" (McBride, 1977). Although master-servant relationship based on a contract, it was more likely to be a personal relationship laid on superiority-inferiority. McBride (1977) describes the traditional servant as "much like a child in relation to his family, traditional servants are supposed to be entirely committed and loyal to a particular employer". Yet, most European jurisdictions had given the master a legal right to punish his servants.

In the mid-nineteenth century Britain, women outnumbered men. Momsen writes that lack of employment opportunities for women and a shortage of prospective husbands, encouraged many young, single, even married, European women to migrate as wet-nurses and maids (Momsen, 1999:3). In 1861, the Female Middle Class Emigration Society (FMCES) was launched in Britain, which proclaimed domestic work as "a respectable paid work in the homes of white colonial settlers" (Enloe, 1989:181).

In the twentieth century, especially during the Second World War, new employment opportunities for women opened up. Consequently, live-in servants disappeared from most middle-class homes after the war:

> In the fifteen years after World War II, this mystique of feminine fulfillment became the cherished and self-perpetuating core of contemporary American culture. Millions of women lived their lives in the image of those pretty pictures of the American suburban housewife, kissing their husbands goodbye in front of the picture window, depositing their stationwagonsful of children at school, and smiling as they ran the new electric waxer over the spotless kitchen floor. They baked their own bread, sewed their own and their children's clothes, kept their new washing machines and dryers running all day. They changed the sheets on the beds twice a week instead of once, took the rughoolag class in adult education, and pitied their poor frustrated mothers, who had dreamed of having a career. Their only dream was to be perfect wives and mothers; their highest ambition to have five children and a beautiful house, their only fight to get and keep their husbands. They had no thought for the unfeminine problems of the world outside the home; they wanted the men to make the major decisions. They gloried in their role as women, and wrote proudly on the census blank: "Occupation: housewife." (Friedan, 1963)

Momsen agrees that "feminine mystique" persuaded women that they should do their own housework. However, in the twenty-first century, there emerged a rising demand for women domestic servants by the middle-class women of the industrializing countries, which is discussed in the next section.

4.3. Approaches to Paid Domestic Work and Immigrant Domestic Women Workers Today

When compared with the traditional domestic servants, today's immigrant domestic women workers have a different migration pattern. In the former, women domestic servants were likely to be migrated from urban to rural areas. Today, women domestic workers move across countries in the search for employment. Indeed, they are subject to more physical/sexual abuse, social isolation, poorer working conditions, and mistreatment. In the cases of illegal migration, they are "disposable people" in Bales' terms (2002), that can be easily thrown away either if they are not submissive against their employers, or they are not in need anymore in that their 'illegal migrant status' make them invisible in the legal bodies of the governments and vulnerable against the arbitrary treatment of their employers. While Bales defines their working conditions as the 'new slavery in the global economy', Parreñas calls them as 'servants of globalization' who supply the demand for low-wage service of the highly specialized professionals in the global cities (Parreñas, 2001:9). On the other hand, Parreñas explains the rising supply of domestic servants as a result of the global restructuring in the world in that "global restructuring engenders multiple migration flows of women workers entering domestic work and consequently results in the globalization of this occupation" (Parreñas, 2001:9). Pettman (1998) argues that migration of women as domestic servants reveal "the unequal and gendered affects of structural adjustment policies and altered family income strategies in the face of these changes." While Parreñas puts that domestic service is a product of the global restructuring, Pettman (1997) similarly asserts that globalization has created "an international service class of female employees". Accordingly, Enloe connects the migration of domestic workers to the declining standards of living in the sending country as a result of the export-oriented policies:

> When a woman from Mexico, Jamaica, or the Philippines decides to emigrate in order to make money as a domestic servant she is designing her own international politics. She is trying to cope with the loss of earning

> power and the rise in the cost of living at home by cleaning bathrooms in the country of bankers. (Enloe, 1989:185)

As indicated in the previous chapter, Third world poor women are the most vulnerable group under the practices of global economic restructuring. 'Temporary' migration of Third World women in to the cities of First World as breadwinners was a family survival strategy in order to sustain income for the family due to the sharp decline in their living standards. On the other hand, in the First World, one of the most available occupations for immigrant women was domestic work. Domestic work in the last three decade has become a trade wherein state, recruitment agencies, and the First World women benefits from the cheap labor of immigrant women. Why a high demand by middle-class women for domestic servants has emerged after the 'feminist mystique' that there is an increasing flow of Third World women into this occupation? In order to answer to this question, it is required to investigate the changing conditions of the First World women's labor force participation.

4.3.1. Demand Side

As argued before, global cities have become the new sites of finance, management, banking, and high-technology. At the same time, service sector has expanded and middle-class women increasingly took the new positions in this sector. The demand for foreign domestic workers is strengthened by the participation of educated middle class women in the newly rich and industrializing countries into the skilled and professional jobs (Nijeholt, 1994:26). Gregson and Lowe assert that as a result of the transformation of single-breadwinner families to dual-career families, "the employment of waged domestic labor is treated as normal, necessary, and exceptional part of the dual-family pattern and its reproduction" (1994:62). Similarly, Sassen articulates that for the life styles of middle and upper-class families, usual modes of handling household tasks and life style have become inadequate; consequently, "serving classes in global cities around the world, almost

totally composed largely of immigrant and immigrant women" have emerged (Sassen, 2000). Hondagneu-Sotelo explicates the changes in the life and consumption styles of the middle- and upper middles classes in one of the global cities, Los Angeles, and their subsequent demand for waged domestic worker:

> Many people employed in business and finance, and in the high-tech and the entertainment sectors, are high-salaried lawyers, bankers, accountants, marketing specialists, consultants, agents, and entrepreneurs. The way they live their lives, requiring many services and consuming many products, generates other high-end occupations linked to gentrification (creating jobs for real estate agents, therapists, personal trainers, designers, celebrity chefs, etc.), all of which in turn rely on various kinds of daily servicing that low-wage workers provide. For the masses of affluent professionals and corporate managers in Los Angeles, relying on Latino immigrant workers has become almost a social obligation. (2001:6)

Although middle class women participated into workforce, they still carried the burden of the reproductive responsibilities at their homes. The transition into dual-career family pattern did not alter the gendered division of reproductive labor. Now, women have become double-burdened with both unpaid and paid labor. However, being a "superwoman" was no more an ideal for the middle-class women, but rather a sentence in the global economy (Enloe, 1989:178). Bakan and Stasiulis affirm that the employment of middle-class women led to "a crisis in the domestic sphere", which was solved through hiring another woman to transfer the domestic burden:

> The increasing employment of women outside the home in advanced capitalist countries and the growing dependence of the family upon two or more incomes have had led to what has been described as a 'crisis in the domestic sphere' even though women are waiting longer to have children and are having smaller families, the demand for quality child care has increased. (Bakan & Stasiulis, 1995)

Hondagneu-Sotelo (2001:22) puts that middle-class women did not question the unequal division of labor at home, but rather they released themselves from their gender subordination at home through purchasing 'foreign' domestic workers who

were also subordinated by their race, class, nationality, language, and citizenship status.

In the globalization of domestic service, governments also played an important role, as argued in the previous chapter. Since governments cut their services for child and elderly care, women turned to private nannies and caregivers in order to enter labor force. However, in some cases, although governments provide public care services, these services are provided on some basis or working women do not prefer them. For example, in Canada the public care services are available for only full-time women workers, who have regular working hours five days in a week. Women who work part-time or have irregular working hours can not benefit from the public services and remained to apply private care services or hire domestic workers (Bakan & Stasiulis, 1995). On the other hand, middle-class American families would not use public care services and prefer hiring private nannies or caregivers for their 'flexible service' and availability for longer working hours when required. Hondagneu-Sotelo explains this situation in Los Angeles:

> Even when conveniently located day care centers are available, many middle-class Americans are deeply prejudiced against them, perceiving them as offering cold, institutional, second-class child care. For various reasons, middle-class families headed by two working parents prefer the convenience, flexibility, and privilege of having someone care for their children in their home. With this arrangement, parents do not have to dread their harried early-morning preparations before rushing to day care, the children do not seem to catch as many illnesses, and parents are not likely to be fined by the care provider when they work late or get stuck in traffic…Meanwhile, more people are working and they are working longer hours. Even individuals without young children feel overwhelmed by the much-bemoaned "time squeeze," which makes it more difficult to find time for both daily domestic duties and leisure. (2001:4)

Therefore, hiring women for domestic work for making a career have become a solution for the women of developing countries in order to release themselves from their domestic responsibilities and seek career.

4.3.2. Supply Side

As discussed in the previous chapter, poor and women were hit by the changes in the global economy, and had to migrate overseas in order to seek employment. Hondagneu-Sotelo (2001:19) states that not only women of low socioeconomic backgrounds but also middle-class, college-educated women migrated to search for domestic employment in that they are unemployed or not paid well in their countries. For example, in the case of Soviet Union countries, female labor was very important for the post-war period. "Soviet superwomen" were handling their employment and party activities simultaneously, and state-sponsored services could lighten domestic burden of the women who work for the state. However, after the economic transition in the Soviet Union countries, working women came back to their homes to be "good mothers and wives" (Goldman, 1996:37). Hit by the open-economy policies, they had to migrate in order to find employment overseas.

Domestic service has become a racialized and genderized occupation that is mostly occupied by poor, immigrant women, and women of color that as Glenn puts, there emerged a racial division of reproductive labor in the world. Hondagneu-Sotelo (2001:13) affirms that this homogenous category of domestic workers reflects the subordination of both race and nationality/immigration status. Also, Mills emphasizes that domestic labor has become commodified and mostly performed by marginal women:

> Caribbean nannies in New York, Filipina caregivers in Los Angeles and Rome, in Hong Kong, and in Malaysia, Mexican and Latina housecleaners in California and other parts of the United States; Sri Lankan maids in Saudi Arabia-all provide a feminized and racialized support structure for more privileged households. In many cases, this commodification or reproductive labor frees female employers to enter or maintain professional occupations, thereby challenging some gender barriers in their own societies but without a racial reworking of gender responsibilities in the domestic realm. Instead, these duties are displaced onto ethnically and legally marginalized women in a complex entanglement of gender, class, racial ethnic, hierarchies that stretch across the globe. (Mills, 2003)

Furthermore, because the work they perform is labor-intensive requiring no skills or training and so it is devalued, they are paid cheaply and face downward mobility when women migrate as domestic service. How do downward mobility and 'being in the middle' of the three-tier hierarchy affect immigrant women? They sell their labor to support their family, but are still burdened with the gendered responsibilities in their own families. Thus, they experience "a relation of conflict or disarticulation" between these two simultaneous roles (Lan, 2000). While they stay overseas to assist the social reproduction of another family, they have a comparative high status due to the higher payment resulted from the wage differential in the host and sending country, and also have to neglect their own children left behind, and face a loss of guilty, and loneliness (Lan, 2000).

In the receiving countries, their work ranked among one of the lowest-status occupations. Glenn defines the reproductive labor domestic workers fulfill as follows:

> Reproductive labor includes activities such as purchasing household goods, preparing and servicing foods, laundering, and repairing clothing, maintaining furnishing, and appliances, socializing children, providing care and emotional support for adults, and maintaining kin and community ties. (Glenn, 1992)

Since female work in the private sphere is typically not valued as an economic activity because it has no market value, domestic work is not considered to be requiring public regulation and protection (HRW, 2004a). Likely, Chin articulates that because of the patriarchal belief that housework is unproductive work; it remained unlegislated in most labor-receiving countries (Chin, 1997). For example, having an old historical background on illegal immigrant domestic servants, Hondagneu-Sotelo (2001:20) reports, United States has no formal government system or policy to legally contract with foreign domestic workers.

Also, there are some host countries that established a legal basis for the recruitment of domestic workers. For example, Canada and Hong Kong have a highly

regulated, government-operated, contract labor programs that have institutionalized both the recruitment and working conditions of immigrant domestic women workers. (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2001:20) Canada's "live-in caregiver program" established in 1992 assisted the importation of domestic workers from overseas. According to this program, a Canadian employer can apply through the Canadian Employment Office for a domestic worker if only the employer shows that s/he first tried to find a Canadian employee for the occupation. On the other hand, the prospective employee is required to have six month of formal training or 12 months of experience in care-giving work and be in good health. If all these conditions are approved, the employee can gain temporary employment authorization for one year, which be extended for an additional year. After working in two years in live-in work, a nanny gains the right to apply for a landed-immigrant status, and in three years after applying for landed-immigrant status, she can obtain Canadian citizenship (Chang, 2000:135). In Hong Kong, foreign domestic workers have been recruited full-time, live-in basis domestic work formally since 1973, and working primarily in live-in jobs and under two-year contracts wherein the working conditions are defined.

Accordingly, Parreñas (2000) and Lan (2003) stress that domestic labor has been commodified; motherhood and wifehood, in other words, reproductive labor of a woman has become a commodity that can be bought and sold on the global market. In her study with Moldovan domestic workers in Turkey, Kümbetoğlu (2005) reports that Moldovan women migrate overseas for employment if only they have their household and children cared by their family members. On the other hand, Parreñas enumerates that immigrant Filipina women hire poorer women in the Philippines to perform the reproductive labor that they are performing for wealthier women in the receiving country. He reports that an immigrant Filipina woman receives on average U.S. $350 per week, whereas she pays U.S. $179 per month to the other Filipina woman who cares for her household left in the Philippines (Parreñas, 2000). Accordingly, Hondagneu-Sotelo (2001:9) mentions in her study in Los Angeles that some Latina nanny/housekeepers pay other Latina immigrants,

who are newly arrived Los Angeles or much older or younger than them to transfer their domestic responsibilities. Respectively, a “three-tier system” is established globally between class-privileged, migrant, and poorer women hired in the migrant domestic worker sending country determined by class, sex and race. Parreñas defines this transfer between the migrant domestic worker receiving and sending countries as “international transfer of care-giving”, whereas Glenn (1992) defines it as “a racial division of reproductive labor”:

> There is a hierarchical and independent relationship, one that interlocks race and class status of women, in its distribution in the formal and informal market. Class privileged women free themselves of the "mental, emotional, and manual labor" needed for the creation and recreation of people as cultural and social, as well as physical beings by hiring low-paid women of color. (Glenn, 1992:30)

Nevertheless, immigrant domestic women workers face a triple subordination because of their race, class, and gender; and if they have illegal status, arbitrary working conditions add to their oppression. In the next section, the case studies of immigrant domestic women workers working in different countries are displayed in order to have a better understanding of what they face in the host countries.

4.4. Domestic Workers around the World

4.4.1. The Malaysia Case

According to Human Rights Watch report (2004a), on the Indonesian and Filipina domestic workers in Malaysia, Indonesians in Malaysia make up the largest irregular migration flow in Asia and globally are second only to Mexicans entering the United States. In this report, it is stated that Malaysia relied upon foreign workers, especially from Indonesia, the Philippines, Bangladesh, India, and Vietnam in order to meet the labor demand arose from the industrial growth following the “New Economic Policy” in 1971, which pursued export-oriented industrialization and public sector expansion. The policies resulted in urban job

growth and a mass migration of rural Malaysians to the cities. Correspondingly, the expansion of middle-class families and the participation of Malaysian women in more secure, higher paying factory jobs in the cities of Malaysia generated a demand for immigrant domestic servants, which can not be supplied through domestic workforce. Currently, the total amount of immigrant domestic women workers in the country is 240,000 and over 90 percent of them are Indonesian women.

The recruitment of Indonesian women in Malaysia is operated by legal or illegal labor agencies. These agencies support foreign work permit applications, training, transit, and placement with an employer for the prospect Indonesian women domestic servants. According to the Indonesian government, finding a legal employment in overseas has to be processed through a licensed labor agency that helps domestic workers apply for a passport, obtain a temporary employment visa and medical clearance, pay insurance and other fees, and learn housekeeping, child care, and language skills (HRW, 2004a).

In her study, Chin (1997) sheds light upon the Filipina and Indonesian women servants in Malaysia. In her interviews, Filipino and Indonesian domestic servants reported that they migrated to Malaysia for better pay and more 'comfortable' life. She states that Filipina and Indonesian domestic workers remitted one-fifth to one-half of monthly earnings to their families, which contributes to sustaining the economic livelihood of their families and/or conspicuous consumption.

Also, Human Rights Watch (2004a) reports that some women stated that they were interested in domestic service employment in Malaysia in that it offers them gaining better wages, seeing a different country and having new experiences. Domestic work in Malaysia could also be a transit employment to be better candidates for more lucrative jobs in the Middle East, Singapore, or Hong Kong. Most immigrant domestic workers in Malaysia were between the ages of seventeen and thirty-five, and had elementary or middle school degrees.

A typical work day for the domestic servants consisted of sixteen to eighteen hour days including tasks as cooking three meals a day; cleaning the house, including mopping, vacuuming, cleaning windows, and dusting; taking care of children, including bathing them, tutoring them, feeding them, preparing them for school, playing with them, and putting them to sleep; washing the car every day; washing the entire household's clothes by hand; and ironing. In addition, Indonesian domestic workers have no day-offs and holidays. (HRW, 2004a) Moreover, they have no freedom of movement or association that most of them reported they are locked in their employer's home and do not meet their friends, or even call their families left behind, which stimulates social isolation and depression (HRW, 2004a).

Human Rights Watch reports the human rights abuses Indonesian immigrant domestic workers in Malaysia experience includes extremely long hours of work without overtime pay; no rest days; incomplete and irregular payment of wages; psychological, physical, and sexual abuse; poor living conditions; restrictions on their freedom of movement and ability to practice their religion; and in some cases, trafficking into situations of forced labor. Human Rights Watch emphasizes that many women were not informed about their duties under the contract, or the immigration and labor laws in Malaysia. In addition, they were not aware that they could turn to Indonesian Embassy in Malaysia when they have problems about their working and living conditions or face abuse. However, since their passports are kept by their employers, and they are not aware of their access to institutional assistance, immigrant domestic women workers are not able to report abuses, obtain help, or even escape (HRW, 2004a; Chin, 1997).

Chin narrates that domestic employment agencies promised better life conditions in Malaysia, such as working in wealthy houses with nice employers. However, in her interviews with the domestic servants, she narrates that domestic servants are complaining about their 'bad' employers:

> What emerged from Filipina and Indonesian women's narratives of their experiences was the desire to be perceived and treated as human beings deserving of respect. (Chin, 1997)

Chin also argues that through the presentation of foreign domestic workers, Malaysian media plays a role in the negative perception of employers and affects their relations with their servants:

> Middle-class employers' individual and collective fears over the perceived sexual and criminal tendencies of all domestic workers have become a key rationale for severely curtailing Filipina and Indonesian servants' ability to interact with people beyond the workplace… The news media play a major role in shaping negative public perceptions of foreign servants by printing sensationalized articles on police arrests of Filipina and Indonesian domestic servants. (Chin, 1997)

Finally, domestic service has no legislative body for the protection of immigrant domestic workers in Malaysia despite the efforts of UN, ILO and NGOs. Currently, domestic service is still unlegislated (Chin, 1997).

4.4.2. The Taiwan Case

Today, the Philippines is the second major labor-exporting country in the world. Filipina women have been working as cleaners, caretakers, and domestic helpers in countries ranging from North America and Europe to the Middle East and East Asia. Trager (1984) explicates that continuous outflow of Filipina women can be understood by looking at the socioeconomic background of the country. She tells that large numbers of Filipina people live at or below the minimum standards of living, and the major issue for people is to sustain the survival of their families to gain income. Due to the declining of male-oriented construction and manufacturing jobs in the Middle East during and after the Gulf War, it became women's role to find employment overseas as a family survival strategy. For women, the decision to migrate to get an employment is made in the family context (quoting Tarcoll, Trager 1984).

In her study, Lan interviews with the 56 Filipina domestic workers (fifty of them were documented and 6 were undocumented) in Taiwan. She reports that more than 110,000 foreigners are legally employed as domestic helpers or caretakers in Taiwan; ninety percent of who are from the Philippines and Indonesia, and the rest are from Thailand and Vietnam (2003). Since the government opened the gate to immigrant domestic workers beginning in the early 1990s, Taiwan has become a major receiving country in Asia. Government's action to import domestic servants was due to the growing demands for housekeeping and care services among the expanding nuclear households and aging population in Taiwan (Lan, 2003).

In her interviews with Filipina domestic workers, Lan notes that immigrant workers face difficulties to reintegrate their life in the Philippines after staying abroad for a long time. First of all, married women's relations with their couples left in the Philippines worsen. In addition, 'the ambivalent sense of homelessness' they felt when they are back at home is another factor increasing immigrant workers' incentives to stay overseas permanently[2]. Marrying Taiwanese men gives them an opportunity for upward mobility and economic stability. That is why some Filipina migrants marry Taiwanese or Western men they meet either through personal networks or international marriage agencies. She narrates a single 38-years-old Filipina domestic worker, who does not want to marry a Filipino man, as follows:

> I do not want to marry a Filipino. They have no money, low salary. What if he says to me, 'When will you go back to Taiwan? And send me money?' I will kill him! And it's not easy for me to find a Filipino. Because I have worked in Japan, in Taiwan, people think I am an urban, fashionable city girl. They think I must be materialistic, but I am not.

---

[2] In her book *The Mobility of Labor and Capital* (1988), Saskia Sassen notes that one of the distruptive effects of migration of women for participating wage labor in the new industrial zones is 'a cultural distancing' between the women and their communties when they return to their family homes as s result of the 'westernization' effect' of being employed abroad.

Accordingly, Lan agrees that international marriages is perceived as a path of social mobility for the single domestic workers , "changing status from a maid who offers waged service for her foreign employers to a wife who offers unpaid household labor for her foreign husband" (2003).

In addition, married women's overseas employment may negatively affect their relationships with their 'domesticated' husbands who remained in the Philippines and take the responsibility of household. Lan reports that many Filipina immigrant women's children left in the country would be cared by grandmothers, aunts, sisters, and other female kin, or immigrant women. In some cases, the husbands left their jobs and become 'full-time homemakers'. However, many immigrant Filipina women are discomforted with their husband about their inability on managing the household responsibilities:

> I frequently heard complaints that their husbands failed to adequately perform their new gender role, especially in the matter of household budgeting. Despite this, the shifting of social positions offers no guarantee that the husbands of migrant workers will take over domestic duties. Some of their husbands drink or gamble to excess when they are no longer in charge of the daily duty of breadwinning. (Lan, 2003)

Moreover, many immigrant Filipina women also hire lower-wage services of poorer women in the Philippines. These poorer women are the ones who cannot afford migrating overseas; thus they sell their domestic labor to immigrant Filipina women in very low wage.

4.4.3. The Lebanon Case

Jureidini conducted a research (2002) on Filipina domestic workers in Lebanon. He articulates that a woman domestic worker is required to be sponsored by an agency or individual employer in order to enter Lebanon with a three-month worker visa. Filipinas are better paid than other foreign women (live-in Filipina workers are paid $250-300 monthly whereas this amount is $150-200 for Sri Lankans and Africans)

because they are better educated, fluent in English, and have higher social prestige as domestic workers. In addition, Lebanese law requires the employer/sponsor to provide insurance for domestic workers that must cover medical, disability, accident, burial and repatriation costs. The insurance must be arranged within the first three months of employment and is a precondition for the annual work and residency permits.

In Lebanon, domestic workers are categorized as "live-ins", "freelancers", and "runaways". Live-ins stay with in the employer's house, and the employer has to meet all financial costs such as the work permit, health insurance, clothing and food, and the airplane tickets, after the completion of work time. In addition, the employer usually keeps the passport and traveling documents to prevent escape. Freelancers live on their own and have to have a sponsor and pay the sponsorship money to her sponsor in order to work in the country. Jureidini reports that there are cases that although some domestic workers pay sponsor's charge, they cannot obtain their passports, and their status become illegal. Since they do not have access to legal representation, they cannot go to the police to avoid deportation or imprisonment. Runaways are the former live-in domestic workers who left their jobs. If they leave their sponsor, their statuses become illegal aliens. They have to go back to their country or find a new sponsor. There is also one more category out of these three: illegal migrants who do not have a valid work, work permit, and residency permits. However, there is no data available accounting for the number of them.

Jureidini argues that live-ins have the hardest work conditions when compared with freelances and runaways. Although the Lebanon government limits the daily working hours with 12 hours with regular rest periods, on average, live-in workers work for 16-17 hours a day. Being at home makes them always on-call for 24 hours. Also, live-in workers almost have no day-offs, either than one or two hours on Sundays to attend church services. Freelancers are more advantageous at this situation since they can arrange their workdays. Their work includes cleaning,

shopping, ironing, washing, dusting, serving food, vacuuming except cooking. The employer is solely responsible for cooking.

Treatment of the employer is most severe at the first month. Jureidini emphasizes that physical abuse is a way of training new workers that it is a very strict and punitive way of socialization into the job. Although the domestic worker has a good relationship with her employer, Jureidini reports that domestic workers' freedom of movement is very restricted. They do not have any telephone access, sometimes no mail with their friend or families left behind. They cannot even talk with the other workers across the balconies. Moreover, they do not have adequate food, and mostly are confined to leftovers after the family meal.

4.4.4. The Rome and Los Angeles Cases

In his book Servants of Globalization: Women, Migration, and Domestic Work, Parreñas also categorizes the Filipina domestic servants in Rome and Los Angeles into three categories according to their type of work: part-time workers, elderly caregivers, and live-in housekeepers. Part-time workers are usually paid by the hour. They have greater control of their work schedule. In Rome, part-time domestic work is more prevalent than other two types. Parreñas reports that part-time workers can increase their earning by maximizing the number of their employers since they are able to manage their schedules. However, because they have to complete their tasks in a faster pace, they are physically more exhausted than other domestic workers (Parreñas, 2001:154). On the other hand, elderly caregivers claimed that their work differentiate from other types of domestic work in that the physical dependence of employers gives them greater control of their work routine and also this dependence gives them more autonomy. So, elderly care is more respectable work requiring more skills, and involves a 'more egalitarian relationship with employers'. However, Parreñas insists that their work still have a physically demanding workload including cleaning and cooking, and they are overwhelmed by social isolation and loneliness (2001:156).

Parreñas explains that live-in housekeepers include housecleaners and child-care providers who live with their employers. Among his three categories, live-in housekeepers have the least rewards, less control of their schedules, and are subject to social isolation and an unset work schedule (Parreñas, 2001:160). In Los Angeles, most immigrant Filipina domestic mostly workers work as live-in housekeepers. Parreñas reports that some Filipina workers prefer live-in domestic work because it has a slower pace when compared with part-time domestic work (2001:160). On the other hand, since they are confined to the employer's home, they have to cope with social isolation more than part-time workers:

> I felt like I was in prison. I wanted to cry… Now I gotten used to it. But I used to look out the window and wonder why I never see a single person in the middle of the day. It is just a bunch of houses. But after a while, the baby got older and now I have someone to talk to and I do not get boresd anymore. I have someone to no matter what. (Parreñas, 2001:162)

Parreñas concludes that the social isolation of domestic work shows up the 'mundane nature of the job' and makes domestic workers to feel their decline in status upon migration (2001:162).

In addition, in his interviews, live-in domestic workers mostly complained about the authority of employers more than other did. Since they have unset working hours, live-in are workers are subject to receiving orders from the employers 24 hours a day. For example, if there are guests at home, they have to be awake and serve them until they go late at nights (Parreñas, 2001:162). Parreñas enumerates how Filipina workers feel about their domestic labor as follows:

> For migrant domestic workers, the sharp decline in their occupational and social status aggravates the stigma of their domestic work. Second, they consider work to be a de-skilling process. Third, they carry a tremendous sense of loss for failing to utilize their educational achievements. (2001:151)

Consequently, he ask why they do not quit their jobs despite it is a very painful occupation. He reports that although Filipina domestic workers have compatible

skills and high level of educational attainment, they are still paid higher in the more developed countries than their professional jobs in the Philippines. Since they need to accumulate money, they have to work as domestic servants. He noted a Filipina domestic worker's feelings about her job:

> My life is difficult here. Would you believe that here I am a physical laborer? When I was working in the Philippines, I was the one supervising the supervisors. So, when I came here, especially when I cleaned the bathrooms, I would talk to myself. I would commend and praise myself, telling myself, 'Oh you can clean the corners very well'. You see, in my old job, I would always check the corners first, that was how I checked if my workers had cleaned place well. So, sometimes I would just cry. I felt like I was slapped in the face. I resent the fact that we ca not use our skills especially because most of Filipinos here are professionals. We should be able to do other kinds of work because if you only do housework, your brain deteriorates. Your whole being is that of a maid. (Parreñas, 1998)

In Parreñas' interviews, one Filipina immigrant worker says this: "In the Philippines, your work is light but you do not have any money. Here you have money, but your body is exhausted." (Parreñas, 2000:574) Since domestic work does not require any skills or education, they said that they feel like "mindless bodies" when they are performing domestic work. Being a domestic worker led to emotional deterioration on immigrant domestic workers as an outcome of the "deskilling process" of domestic works. In Lan's terms, "they were 'madam' of their households in their country, but they have become 'maids' in the family they are working for" (Lan, 2003). Along with downward mobility, pain of family separation makes them feel like lost, guilty, and lonely (Parreñas, 2000:575). They cannot care for their children, they cannot love their husbands; in other words, they cannot fulfill their motherhood and wifehood roles and responsibilities, so they feel guilty and lost. In Parreñas' words, they are "transnational mothers", who are in the middle (2000).

Wondering how domestic workers define a 'good employer', Parreñas directs questions to domestic workers and sees that when domestic workers are treated as 'like one of the family', they define their employer to be a good one:

> Because domestics work in the private sphere of the home, they desire a less rigid work environment and much prefer the intimate environment of being treated "like one of the family…A less rigid work environment does give them flexible work standards…Filipina domestic workers consider employers who treat them "like one of the family" to be "good employers". (Parreñas, 2001:182)

In her study on Latina and Mexican domestic workers in Los Angeles, Hondagneu-Sotelo (2001:8) states that the entry of Central American and Mexican immigrant women in Los Angeles into domestic service commenced with the local African American women's departure from domestic work in 1980s. She explains that social networks play an important role in the placement of domestic servants in the city. This new supply has contributed to the high demand for domestic servants which was already growing. Consequently, this rapid flow of new groups of domestic servants has pushed down wages made domestic service a more available occupation.

She specifies the factors take place in the flow of Latina women into live-in domestic service in US as follows:

> The expansion of U.S. private investment and trade; the opening of U.S. multinational assembly plants (employing mostly women) along the U.S.-Mexico border and in Caribbean and Central American nations, facilitated by government legislative efforts such as the Border Industrialization Program, the North American Free Trade Agreement, and the Caribbean Basin Initiative; the spreading influence of U.S. mass media; and U.S. military aid in Central America have all helped rearrange local economies and stimulate U.S.-bound migration from the Caribbean, Mexico, and Central America. Women from these countries have entered the United States at a propitious time for families looking to employ housecleaners and nannies. (Hondagneu-Sotelo 2001:8)

She asserts that domestic workers are well aware of the low status and stigma attached to paid domestic work. When she asked them in the interviews whether they recommend their friends or relatives to do domestic work abroad, he was replied that "none want their daughters to do it, and the younger ones hope to leave the occupation altogether in a few years". Although they are pleased about their

earning and sustaining the lives of their families, they are not proud of being domestic workers. Hondagneu-Sotelo puts: "This self-distancing from their occupational status makes it more difficult to see paid domestic work as a real job" (2001:12). She reports that domestic workers who are working without papers could face extra burdens and risks including criminalization of employment, denial of social entitlements, and status as outlaws anywhere in the nation. In addition, if they complain about their work, they may be threatened with deportation (2001:12).

Chang argues that domestic workers are "disposable domestics" that can be used and than throw away. In the light of her accounts on undocumented Latinas, Chang affirms that middle-class households often make exploitative use of the extremely cheap labor of immigrant domestic workers. In addition, the governments of the receiving countries and recruiting agencies benefit of the hiring of domestic servants by the middle and upper-class families:

> Recruiting agencies and other entrepreneurs on each end of the trade route reap the tremendous profits from providing employers in host countries with ready and willing service workers and caregivers of all kinds. Host countries are eager to receive these female mercenaries, as they bolster their economies also. As many countries of the First World undergo downsizing and dismantling of public supports, migrant women workers offer an ideal source of cheap, highly exploitable labor. These women are channeled directly into the service sector, where they do every form of care work for a pittance and no benefits. Ironically, immigrant domestic workers, nannies, in-home caregivers, and nurses pick up the slack for cuts in government services and supports that pervade the First World, as well as the Third World. Overseas, they provide care for the ill, the elderly, and the children, while their own families forego this care because of the economic restructuring that drives them overseas. (Chang, 2000:130)

4.4.5. Israel Case

Israel is another country that Filipina women are employed as domestic workers. In their study, Ellman and Laacher (2003) state that flow of immigrant domestic workers to Israel commenced in the1980s. They note that for employers in the domestic service including care-giving for the elderly, sick and disabled in practice

there is no effective regulation fixing the rights and duties of employers and workers. They emphasize that most migrant workers come to Israel through an agreement signed between a contact in Israel and an agency in their country of origin. Although in this contract working conditions and the salaries of the migrants are defined, mostly Filipina women could not find these pre-set conditions when they come to Israel. A Filipina nurse says:

> I worked as a nurse in the Philippines and I contacted a private agency to go to work in Israel. Everyone said there was plenty of work there. Here in Israel, I look after an elderly person. In the contract I signed, it said I needed to stay 2 years in Israel and that I would be paid $700/ month. But in fact I only get $500 and I am not paid in dollars. Sometimes, I am paid very late. I need to send money to my family and I need to repay the money I paid for the trip, because I paid $4000 to come here. (Ellman & Laacher, 2003)

On the contrary of the normal relationship between the employer and employee defined in the contract, immigrant domestic workers find themselves in a situation of extreme subordination to their employers. Ellman and Laacher write that although the conditions of the contract are not met by the employer, Filipina domestic workers are expected to be available at all times and to be completely docile.

At that point, Ellman and Laacher state that Filipino workers are better protected by their governments. If the conditions of the contracts are met and the immigrant domestic worker complain about the conditions, Filipino government supply new travel document. However, many Filipino workers are still underpaid, paid late or in shekels (when dollars were promised) and overworked. In addition, if they are dismissed, they become illegal.

Accordingly, IOM (2000) reports that the protection of Filipina domestic, which includes “licensing recruiters, providing information to workers, extending protection, and offering services for reintegration”, by the Filipina government is granted by law, and this protection mechanism seems to be “a model of effective overseas migrant worker protection”, NGOs such as Philippine Migrants Rights

Watch (PMRW) stress that Filipino immigrant workers continue to be subject to abuse, mistreatment, and discrimination in the receiving countries (PMRW, 2003). Yet it is among the very few examples, Chang notes a Filipino domestic worker who was subject to strict working conditions, workplace abuse, and bad treatment, and could finally turn on to institutional help under very rigorous conditions:

> Teresita Tristan is a widow who left two children behind in the Philippines for a job in Britain as a domestic server. Before leaving, she had been promised a wage or $400 a month; when she arrived, her employers took her passport and informed her that she would be paid $108 a month. On her first day in the country, she was taken for a medical exam, given medicine to clean her stomach, and instructed to take a bath and not to touch the dishes with her bare hands until five days passed. Her daily work consisted of cleaning the entire house, taking the children to school, and preparing family's meals, of which she ate only leftovers. She was not allowed to eat from their plates or glasses or to use the toilet inside the house. When her male employer kept making sexual advances, asking her to go to the guest house with him, she asked to be released and return home. Instead, she was transferred to her employer's daughter's home, where she was treated just as badly... One day, Tristan went to the park and met a British woman who took her phone number and called the police for her. The Commission for Filipina Migrant Workers helped her to leave her employer's home and find shelter. (Chang, 2000:138)

4.4.6. The Saudi Arabia Case

Although in 1962 King Faisal abolished slavery in Saudi Arabia, the domestic servants have been subject to slavery kind treatments, ranging from the shameful practices of the private employers to the legislative applications of imprisonment and death penalty (HRW, 2004). Indeed, domestic workers in private households and agricultural workers are excluded from legal protection in the Saudi law, so these are the most vulnerable immigrant groups in the kingdom:

> Edna, a thirty-year-old married woman from the Philippines who has two children, returned from Saudi Arabia in December 2003 after completing a two-year contract as a domestic worker with a Saudi family in Dammam. She told us that she was forced to leave the kingdom although her employers owed her $1,308 -- a sum that included $640 in unpaid wages. Agricultural and domestic workers in Saudi Arabia, who have no legal protections under

> the labor law, are particularly vulnerable to summary dismissals. (HRW, 2004)

Human Right Watch conducted an in-dept study of foreign domestic workers in Saudi Arabia in 2004. Their sample consisted of mainly immigrants from Bangladesh, India and the Philippines. They note that according to Saudi government by 2003 there were one million to 1.5 million Indians and the same number of Bangladeshis, together with 900,000 Filipina in the kingdom.

According to the Saudi labor law, foreign workers can seek employment if they are under contract with and guaranteed by a sponsor. The sponsors support secure employment visas from the Saudi government for the foreign workers, and contact with the recruitment agencies to bring them workers legally to the kingdom. After they arrive in Saudi Arabia, foreign workers are required to sign contracts, only valid if written in Arabic, with the sponsors in order to take work permit.

In the interviews, many women employed as domestic workers in cities of the kingdom reported that they worked twelve hours or more in a day, and paid salaries significantly lower than the ones promised in the contracts. For example, Filipina government prepared a standardized Arabic-English contract, commonly used between 2001 and 2003, for Filipino household workers. However, its provisions are mostly violated once the immigrants arrive in the country.

Most of domestic workers also are live-in workers, and cut off from the outside world. Thousands of women migrants escaped the private households they were employed. The Indonesian Embassy in Riyadh reported that 3,610 Indonesian domestic workers fled their employers safely (that they stayed at embassy safe houses until they returned their family's homes) in 2002. HRW notes a Filipina domestic worker's stories as follows:

> One woman from the Philippines, whose employers in Dammam did not provide her with sufficient food, described how she enlisted help from the family's Indian driver, to whom she was forbidden to speak. She told us that

> she wrote lists of what she needed and threw them out the window to the driver. He made the purchases, and "delivered" them to her by tossing the packages onto the roof of the house, where she retrieved them. Another Filipina, who also worked for a family in Dammam, said that she constantly watched the locked front gate of the house, waiting for an opportunity to escape after her male employer raped her in June 2003. (2004)

Similarly, hundreds of Sri Lankan domestic workers have fled because they worked poor working conditions, unpaid and physically or sexually abused. One of them told them she was beaten with iron bars and wooden sticks when she asked for her payment after three month she started working in the house. Her employer could sometimes burn her with hot iron (HRW, 2004b).

In the HRW report, it is stated that the prevailing gender segregation in the kingdom; restrictions on freedom of expression (particularly dress codes) and freedom of movement; gender inequality in the justice system; the tolerance of domestic violence in Saudi households underpin physical and sexual abuse of immigrant domestic women workers. In addition, it is emphasized that "the forced confinement that Saudi employers impose upon many low-paid women workers can be viewed as an extreme extension of the power that men can and do wield over the movement of Saudi women under law and social custom". Like Saudi women, immigrant women are subject to a system of Islamic jurisprudence wherein women's testimony carries half the weight of the testimony of men, and if they face sexual violence or rape, it is highly unlikely that they have little prospect of holding their assailants accountable in shari'a courts":

> In separate interviews, four domestic workers from the Philippines who were victims of forced confinement and sexual abuse provided Human Rights Watch with testimony about their experiences. The women ranged in age from twenty-six to thirty-five years old. Three of the victims were married and had two or more children. In all four cases, the perpetrators – three of whom were alleged rapists -- were not held legally accountable for their actions and did not face criminal investigation and prosecution. (HRW, 2004b)

When they are not docile, domestic workers would be the victims of false accusations by their employers, and cannot defend themselves because they do not speak Arabic, or have lawyers. For example, an Indonesian domestic worker said in the interview that her employer had accused her of sorcery. She did not have a lawyer and did not understand much about her case, she was imprisoned for ten months. Another domestic servant from the Philippines reports that she was sentenced because her first employer in Saudi Arabia accused her of being a witch. The only 'proof' of her crime was a small piece of paper with Arabic writing in her possession (HRW, 2004b).

4.5. Conclusion

In this chapter, it is discussed that waged domestic workers have been employed by the middle class families through the history due to the forces of global economy. In the eighteenth century Europe, emergence of middle class as a result of industrialization and urbanization reinforced the growth of domestic service workforce. When we trace back to the nineteenth century, we see that the Victorian ideology perpetuated the demand of European middle class women for waged domestic workers. However, this demand decreased after the Second World War since new job opportunities were available for women. Today, with the rapid participation of middle class women into service sector, the demand for waged domestic workers climbed again. On the other hand, this demand has been supplied by immigrant women due to the poverty, unemployment, and declining life standards in their country of origin.

In the light of seven recent case studies illustrated in this chapter, it can be concluded that whatever their ethnicity, nationality, race, and religion, in the host countries immigrant domestic women workers are open to arbitrary treatment and exploitation because sending and receiving countries do not have a well-operating legal protection system for the immigrant domestic workers. In the case of Filipina domestic workers, although Filipina government has the strongest legal system of

domestic worker recruitment overseas, the host countries do not have a protective mechanism for the immigrant domestic workers; thus one-side control mechanism cannot work functionally for the improvement of domestic work conditions in the host countries. There is a crucial need in host and home countries firstly for recognizing domestic work as 'work', secondly for negotiating with the NGOs for the improvement of the lives of the domestic workers in host countries, and finally for regulating the import-export of domestic workers through bilateral labor contract, wherein working conditions of the domestic workers are clearly defined and their human rights are secured. When immigrant domestic workers becomes visible, and the governments of sending and receiving countries seek to establish the necessary structure for the protection and regulation of domestic employment, women immigrant domestic workers could find the grounds for defending their right against exploitation.

In this chapter, mainly the working conditions of Asian and Latin American women domestic workers are discussed. However, post-Soviet countries have been one of the most women domestic worker exporting countries in the world in last two decades. Indeed, there is not enough academic study on the post-Soviet domestic workers in the host countries. Turkey has been one of the domestic worker importing countries from post-Soviet countries since 1990s, and there are a few case studies and reports on the flow of women domestic workers in Turkey. Because the concern of this thesis is to explore the immigrant domestic workers in Turkey, post-Soviet domestic workers will be mainly discussed in the next chapter.

CHAPTER V

ILLEGAL IMMIGRANT WORKERS AND IMMIGRANT DOMESTIC WOMEN WORKERS IN TURKEY

5.1. Introduction

International migration of women domestic servants into Turkey can be traced back to the early 1990s. The demand for domestic servants mostly arises from large cities like Istanbul, Ankara, and Izmir. The domestic servant importing cities overviewed in the previous chapter are either global cities or capitals. Istanbul is not a 'global city'; rather it is defined as "globalizing city" (Keyder, 2000), dwelled by professional women who are generally employed in the service sector. On the other hand, in Ankara, where the state officials predominantly reside, there is also a high demand for foreign domestic workers. The unavailability of the statistical data on immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey is a limitation to have an overview about these workers in Turkey. Indeed, this deficiency is an important indicator of the invisibility of these women, and also lack of attention of Turkish authorities on this demand and supply relations between the women domestic workers exporting countries and Turkey.

Foreign women migrants are illegally employed in domestic service sector in Turkey. To investigate why Turkey is an appropriate zone for immigrant workers, firstly illegal migration flows to the country are discussed in this chapter. Secondly, the legal and institutional framework concerning illegal migration flows in Turkey

is reviewed to understand the working and living conditions of immigrant workers in Turkey. Unfortunately, there are not enough academic studies on the immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey. Three academic studies conducted on immigrant domestic women workers in Ankara and Istanbul are also demonstrated in this chapter. The main concern of this chapter is to look into the recruitment process and consider the factors influencing working conditions of immigrant domestic workers in Turkey in terms of related Turkish legal framework and available studies conducted on this issue.

5.2. Illegal Immigrant Workers in Turkey

The increasing flow of international migration of illegal workers to Turkey has been recognized as a 'problem' requiring rearrangement of the Turkish international migration policies for the Turkish authorities since the beginning of 1990s (İçduydu & Köser-Akçapar, 2005). Before this date, Turkey had been mostly recognized as a migrant-sending country. Turkish citizens have been migrating to work in European countries, Libya, Saudi Arabia and Kuwait, and later to Australia and Russia since 1960s (Yorgun & Şenkal, 2004). In the last two decades, Turkey has become a 'transit' and one of the most international migrant receiving countries that attracts many people either from neighboring countries or overseas countries. İçduygu and Köser-Akçapar report that recently there are migrants from 163 different nations in Turkey (İçduydu & Köser-Akçapar, 2005).

The major reasons that Turkey attracts foreign people are enumerated by İçduydu and Köser-Akçapar as follows:

- Political turmoil in the neighboring countries increased the likelihood of their citizens to find safer places having better living conditions;

- Turkey's geographical position at the intersection between East and West and South and North makes it an attractive transit zone for the people who desire to reach western and eastern destination countries;
- Because of the increased strict entry controls in European countries, migration flows directed at Europe to peripheral countries, such as Turkey;
- Turkey has better economic conditions than the neighboring countries to the migrants who search employment.

Additionally, Yorgun and Şenkal (2004) spell out the socio-cultural reasons of immigration to Turkey:

- Turkey possesses a more democratic political structure than surrounding countries and has taken further steps in the area of human rights;
- Turkey is an attraction center owing to its historical past. After the collapse of the Ottoman Empire, people who had Turkish origin and had been living abroad wanted to move Turkey;
- Socio-cultural conflicts are intensively experienced in the geographic territory where Turkey is situated.

Furthermore, İçduydu and Köser-Akçapar (2005) classify four periods of irregular migration to Turkey which are determined in terms of the changing characteristics of the number of immigrant workers and the intensity of migration in Turkey together with the changing policies and the application of the migration policies of Turkey. The first period named as "fertilization", constitutes of the irregular migration flows from Iran as a result of the alteration of the regime in 1979 in the country. Persian migrants stayed in Turkey for a while, and left the country for the purpose of going to Europe or North Africa. Secondly, the "maturation" period between 1988 and 1993 can be defined in terms of two migration flows which include refugees coming from Bulgaria and Iraq, and the migrants coming from Soviet Union for economic purposes. Thirdly, the "saturation" period commenced with the Asylum Arrangements in 1992 and continued after 2001-2002. In this period, while new politic arrangements on the migration flows to Turkey took place,

the number of illegal migrants entering Turkey increased. Besides, most of illegal immigrants overstayed in Turkey after their visas expired. Finally, the "degeneration" period includes the time in and after 2001, and in this period, illegal migration, trafficking and their effects on the labor force took place in both in national and international agenda, and the both migration flows decreased and became more institutionalized since important steps were taken in terms of the rearrangement of the state policies and applications.

Turkey accepted the 1951 Geneva Convention with a geographical limitation that only people who apply Turkey because of the events in Europe can obtain refugee status[3]. There was no legal obligation for the non-European refugees. Thus, refugees who are not admitted to obtain refugee status in Turkey but stay in the country illegally are also classified as illegal immigrant worker (İçduygu, 1995).

Consequently, İçduydu and Köser-Akçapar (2005) put that there are two types of illegal migration flows to Turkey. The first migrant group composes of the migrants coming either from Eastern European countries such as Romania, Moldova or Russian Federation countries and Ukraine in the search for employment in Turkey. These migrants enter Turkey with tourist visa and overstay although their visas are expired. They work in construction sector and textile factories (such as Eastern European migrants between 1990 and 2000), do domestic work (such as Moldovan women), and work in the entertainment sector as dancers (such as Ukrainian and Moldovan women). In addition, they state that in the last eight years, Georgia has been one of the migrant-exporting countries to Turkey.

The second group make up of migrants coming from Middle East (primarily from Iran and Iraq), Asian countries (Pakistan, Bangladesh and Sri Lanka), and African

[3] In 2004, Turkey abandoned the geographical limitation on accepting asylum seekers from non-European countries to cope with the irregular migration due to the increasing external pressure on Turkey.

countries (such as Nigeria, Somali, Congo Republic), who target Turkey as a transit zone for passing to other Western countries. They enter Turkey through illegal ways, overstay than they are allowed, and work illegally in Turkey until they leave the country. Additionally, İçduygu identifies a third group of irregular migrants including "rejected asylum seekers who are reluctant to return home and are in search of illegal jobs and/or opportunities to migrate illegally to another country" (İçduygu, 2003).

Illegal immigrant workers have been almost absorbed by the informal sector in Turkey. İçduygu and Köser-Akçapar (2005) elucidate that informal economy in Turkey has grown with the temporary or illegal immigrant workforce, since small- and medium-scale companies highly employ illegal migrants for their cheap labor in order to survive under economic crisis, competitive market conditions, and heavy tax burdens. Additionally, this "reserve army of labor" is mostly working in low-paid, temporary, and 'dirty' works requiring manual labor. İçduygu and Köser-Akçapar categorize the sectors illegal immigrant workers concentrated according to their nations: Moldovan women are engaged in domestic works; East European, Ukrainian and Russian women work in entertainment and sex sectors; East European, Asian and African men work in construction sector; East European, Russian, and Ukrainian women work in textile sector, migrants coming from various countries such as Ukraine, the Philippines, Bulgaria, and Romania work in restaurants and food-related sectors; Russian, Ukrainian, and Azerbaijanis men work in agricultural sector. Additionally, Ekin states that Filipina women also work in domestic work in Turkey (Ekin, 2000).

The figures of the migrants from selected nations on the departures in arrivals are illustrated below. In Table 4, number of arrivals and departures by country of origin by the May, 2005 are compared. It can be concluded that number of departures is lower than the number of arrivals mostly in post-Soviet countries, except Pakistan and Iran among the selected countries, which means migrants from these countries stay in Turkey for certain purposes.

Table 4. Number of Departures in Arrivals from the Countries by 2005, May

Nationality	Arrivals	Departures	Difference
Afghanistan	7255	6620	635
Azerbaijan	101874	91753	10121
Bangladesh	10897	10032	865
Belarus	261	266	-5
Bulgaria	604483	616245	-11762
Congo	15	32	17
Georgia	428545	352106	76439
Iran	59188	59132	56
Iraq	4665	4416	249
Kazakhstan	3764	3810	-46
Kyrgyzstan	675	693	-18
Moldova	28801	26229	2572
Niger	12804	9042	3762
Pakistan	26039	23698	2341
Philippines	36794	36733	61
Romania	303076	213188	89888
Russia Fed.	127752	115848	11904
Somali	490	303	187
Sri Lanka	18504	14879	3625
Turkmenistan	1023	677	346
Ukraine	155731	146213	9518
Uzbekistan	1745	1826	-81
Subtotal:	**1934381**	**1733741**	**200640**
Other Countries	6819538	6357634	461904
Total:	**8 753 919**	**8 091 375**	**662544**

Source: Ministry of Interior, (BFBA); Bureau for Foreigners, Borders and Asylum, Ankara, and data compiled by the author.

Table 5. Number of Illegal Migrants Apprehended by Country of Origin between 1995 and 2005, May

Nationality	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	Total	Share
Afghanistan	24	68	81	921	2476	8746	9701	4246	2178	3442	312	32195	**6,0%**
Azerbaijan	21	3	3	10	620	2262	2426	2349	1608	1591	359	11252	**2,1%**
Bangladesh	113	322	301	2408	1193	3228	1497	1810	1722	3271	576	16441	**3,1%**
Belarus					82	281	273	197	142	88	19	1082	0,2%
Bulgaria	21	22	39	103	1005	1699	1923	3132	989	550	237	9720	**1,8%**
Georgia	37	9	9	5	809	3300	2693	3115	1826	2294	527	14624	**2,7%**
Iraq	2128	3319	5689	14237	11546	17280	18846	20926	3757	6393	1039	105160	**19,6%**
Iran	252	362	364	1116	5281	6825	3514	2508	1620	1265	255	23362	**4,4%**
Kazakhstan	2	2			185	294	489	396	414	367	68	2217	0,4%
Kyrgyzstan					35	200	161	274	285	410	85	1450	0,3%
Moldova	19		17	5	5098	8312	11454	9611	7728	5728	1268	49240	**9,2%**
Philippines		3			61	203	127	115	139	111	39	798	**0,1%**
Pakistan	708	435	307	1798	2650	5027	4829	4813	6258	3808		30633	**5,7%**
Uzbekistan	1	1			142	587	535	533	584	714	163	3260	0,6%
Romania	68	12	107	36	3395	4500	4883	2674	2785	1785	591	20836	**3,9%**
Russia fed.	5	4	52	2	1695	4554	3893	2139	2130	1266	251	15991	**3,0%**
Turkmenistan		1			44	142	124	203	187	514	213	1428	0,3%
Ukraine	9	4	17	4	1715	4527	3451	2874	1947	1341	345	16234	**3,0%**
Subtotal	3408	4567	6986	20645	38032	71967	70819	61915	36299	34938	6347	355923	**66,4%**
Other:	7954	14237	21453	8781	9497	22547	21546	20910	19920	26290	6715	179850	**33,6%**
Total:	**11362**	**18804**	**28439**	**29426**	**47529**	**94514**	**92365**	**82825**	**56219**	**61228**	**13062**	**535773**	**100,0%**

Source: The Ministry of Interior, (BFBA); Bureau for Foreigners, Borders and Asylum, Ankara, and data compiled by the author

*Includes illegal entrance, illegal departure, illegal stay, expiration of visa and/or residence permit.

According to the Table 5, number of illegal migrants apprehended is highest from Iraq, followed by Moldova, Afghanistan, Pakistan, Iran, Romania, and Ukraine and Russian Federation in 1995-2005. The highest amount of illegal migrants apprehended happened in 2000. Following the collapse of Soviet Union, there were high amount of migrants coming to Turkey for "suitcase trading". Started in 1980s firstly with the shuttling of Polish suitcase traders, by 1990s, the value of this illegal trade activity was between 5-10 million dollars (Keyder 1999: 211). In her study, Yükseker (2003) writes that most of the "çelnoks" (in Russian, traders) were women in these trade activities[4].

In addition, İçduygu puts that although these migrants were shuttling between their home countries and Turkey and were not included in the illegal immigrant workforce since they did not overstay in Turkey, they could be seen as the forerunners of the irregular migration flows from post-Soviet countries to Turkey (İçduygu, 2003). While flow of suitcase traders in Turkey declined after 1995, the number of migrants from these regions coming for illegal work has continued to increase. Also, since 2003 there is a sharp decline (almost 66%) in the total number of illegal migrants apprehended between 2000 and 2004. This decline can be understood by the changing attitudes of the Turkish government against illegal migration in 2003, which will be discussed in the next section. In addition, the decline in the Turkish economy's performance and 2001 economic crisis led to increased unemployment may have negatively influenced the illegal immigrant workers in Turkey (İçduygu & Köser-Akçapar, 2005).

[4] See for more details on suitcase trade*; Yükseker, Hatice Deniz (2003) Laleli-Moskova Mekiği: Kayıtdışı Ticaret ve Cinsiyet ilişkileri*, İletişim Yayıncılık: Istanbul.

5.2.1. Institutional and Legal Framework in Turkey for Illegal Immigrant Workers in Turkey

In order to understand the fluctuations in the number of illegal immigrant workers in Turkey, an analysis of the Turkish institutional and legal framework regarding them is required. The Passport Law (Law 5682), The Labor Law (Law 4857), The Law on the Stay and Movement of Aliens (Law 5683), and The Social Security Law (Law 506) regulate the entry, deportation, work/resident permits of the foreign migrants in Turkey. In the past, the issue of illegal migrants was negligible for the Turkish officials. İçduygu (2003) explain the lack of regulation in irregular migration flows as follows:

> This is partly because the country's experience with irregular migration is of relatively recent origin and partly because of the lack of established immigration policies and practice – except as regards the influx of ethnic Turks during the early years of the Republic, welcomed as part of the nation-building process. Today, most official initiatives to control and combat irregular migration occur in response to external pressures, such as from the EU, rather than local policy concerns. (İçduygu, 2003)

In the last two decades, the increasing flow of illegal immigrant workers has become relatively visible and many academic studies have been conducted in this issue. Recently, Turkish authorities have been seeking to combat and regulate the illegal migration flows to Turkey. Behind these efforts, Turkey's attempts to obtain European Union membership have a crucial influence. İçduygu emphasizes that the issue of asylum seekers and irregular migrants has been at the center of European Union-Turkish relations since the acceptance of Turkey's candidature for EU membership at the Helsinki Summit of December 1999 (İçduygu, 2003). Accordingly, new legislations are introduced; amendments on Turkish Law concerning this issue are provisioned; and reception and readmission centers for

illegal migrants are established. Furthermore, to combat with human smugglers and traffickers, amendments on Penal Code and the Passport Law are passed.[5] In this section, the major trends in illegal immigrant workers investigated in three reports. First is prepared by Ahmet İçduygu in 1995 for International Office for Migration (IOM), the second is prepared by Selmin Kaska and Sema Erder in 2003 for IOM, and the third is prepared by Ahmet İçduygu and Şelmin Köser-Akçapar in 2005 for ILO, and the corresponding amendments in the legal framework are sketched.

According to the Passport Law of 1950, there are 40 countries, whose citizens are not required to take visa to enter Turkey. Visa exemptions for the citizens of Iran, Tunisia, and Morocco is three months; of Romania is two months, of Russia Federation and Ukraine is two months; of Azerbaijan, Jordan, and Moldova is one month, and of Georgia is fifteen days (İçduygu & Köser-Akçapar, 2005). As stated before, irregular migrants include transit migrants, asylum seekers, and illegal immigrant workers. In all three studies, it is stated that migrants enter Turkey through tourist visas and overstay after their visas expire.

In Turkey, the residence and work permits of the migrants are regulated by The Law on the Stay and Movement of Aliens (Law 5683). The foreigners can obtain residence permit if they have work permit, adequate financial resources to maintain their lives, and no power or intention to disrupt the Turkish public order. In their study, Erder and Kaska illustrate the 2003 figures on the foreigners living in Turkey with work residence:

---

[5] For more information on the institutional and legal framework concerning human smuggling and trafficking, see: a) Erder, S. ve S. Kaska. (2003) *Irregular Migration and Trafficking in Women: the Case of Turkey,* Geneva: IOM; b) İçduygu A.; Köser-Akçapar,Ş. (forthcoming in 2005). *The Labour Dimensions of Irregular Migration and Human Trafficking in Turkey*. Geneva: ILO.

Table 6. Foreigners Living in Turkey with Residence Permits in 2001

Origin	**1998**	**%**	**2001**	%
Balkans	8868	19,9%	73393	45,5%
Middle East (1)	8210	18,4%	13361	8,3%
Ex-USSR	325	0,7%	29676	18,4%
Subtotal	17403	39.0	116430	72.2
Other	27241	61,0%	44824	27,8%
Total	44644	100,0%	161254	100,0%

(1) Includes only Iran, Iraq and Syria.
(2) Figures for 2001 cover all countries of the former USSR.
Source: Erder and Kaska, 2003:14.

According to Table 6, while the number of foreigners living in Turkey with residence permits, who are citizens of Balkans, Middle East, and ex-USSR countries, almost doubled in three years, foreigners of other countries living in Turkey with residence permits has declined fifty percent. In addition, in the Table 7 below (quoted from Erder & Kaska, 2003), it is seen that only 13.9% percent of the citizens of selected ex-USSR countries holding resident permits have work permits in Turkey.

Selmin and Kaska put that these figures (Table 7) show the existence of a large informal labor market in Turkey absorbing foreigners who do not have work permits but have residence permits. They also state that these figures are higher in their study sample consisted of irregular migrants. On the other hand, in his study prepared for the IOM in 1995, İçduygu reports that only 23 percent of the migrants interviewed have residence permits and 9 per cent of them also hold work permits.

Table 7. Foreigners with Residence and Work Permits in Turkey at the end of 2001

	Residence Permits	%	Work Permits	%	*
Azerbaijan	10044	6,2%	866	4%	8,6%
Georgia	761	0,5%	162	1%	21,3%
Moldova	855	0,5%	268	1%	31,3%
Romania	1304	0,8%	354	2%	27,1%
Russian Federation	6235	3,9%	1603	7%	25,7%
Ukraine	2290	1,4%	895	4%	39,1%
Subtotal	21489	13,3%	4146	18%	19,3%
Other	139765	86,7%	18270	81%	13,1%
TOTAL	161254	100,0%	22418	100%	13,9%

*Share of those who have a work permit.
Source: Erder and Kaska, 2003:14.

According to the Law on the Specific Employment Conditions of Turkish Citizens in Turkey (No. 2007 of 1932), foreigners were not allowed to work as construction worker, hairdresser, shoe maker, musician, singer, tourist guide, compositor, industrial worker, driver, dancer, gatekeeper in apartments, hotels, or in corporations, domestic workers, etc. The Law concerning Work Permits for Foreigners (No. 4817) enacted by Parliament on 27 February 2003. This law abolished the article regarding the occupations that foreigners can not handle in Turkey, designated the Ministry of Labor and Social Security as responsible for issuing work permits to foreigners. In addition, it provided a system of work permits facilitating immigrant workers to obtain work permits in Turkey. For example, migrants are allowed to work in domestic service as of 2003, if only they

have work permits. İçduygu and Köser-Akçapar argue that many Moldovan women were exploited because they were not allowed to work in domestic service, and this law would create for migrants workers safer working conditions if they obtain work permits. Furthermore, it put deterrent fines (article 21) for the employers who employ foreigners not having work permits and for the foreign employees, who work without work permits. Erder and Kaska elucidate that this new law "represents the first systematic legislation which specifically addresses the employment of foreigners in Turkey." Beyond these, immigrant workers are not required to be dependent on a third company or person to take work permits as it was in the past law. With this new law, they can work as independent employees. They can get legal work permits initially for one year, which can be extended to three, and then six years later after the completion of one year's work.

Another indicator explaining overstay of illegal migrants in Turkey is stated to be the increasing number of fake paper marriages with Turkish citizens in order to obtain Turkish citizenship. Erder and Kaska present that between 1995 and 2001, there are 24300 foreigners who got Turkish citizenship through marrying Turkish citizens.

Table 8. Foreigners Who Obtained Turkish Citizenship through Marriage (1995-2001)

Country	**Numbers**	%
Azerbaijan	3876	16,0%
Georgia	979	4,0%
Moldova	1292	5,3%
Romania	2894	11,9%
Russian Federation	2193	9,0%
Ukraine	*	*
Subtotal	11234	46,2%
Others	13066	53,8%
TOTAL	24300	100,0%

* Negligible and included in other countries in the original data.
Source: Erder and Kaska, 2003:15.

According to the Table 8, it is obvious that post-Soviet citizens constituted almost half of the population who obtained Turkish citizenship through marriages. In their study, İçduygu and Köser-Akçapar report two women who made fake paper marriage with Turkish men to acquire Turkish citizenship. In their interviews with immigrant workers, one Romanian woman stated that she came to Turkey to work as a sex worker through making a fake paper marriage with a Turkish man. Another woman sex worker said that she had paid $1000 for coming to Turkey and $3000 for making a fake paper marriage to an agency. The researchers also elucidates that after the collapse of Soviet Union, some agencies under the name of "tourism agency" provide passport, visa, and other documents at great cost for immigrant workers who do not have any international migration experience.

Accordingly, to deal with fake paper marriages, the Turkish Citizenship Law (No. 4866) was amended in June 2003. According to this amendment, a foreign spouse

can acquire Turkish citizenship after a three-year waiting period. In addition, the foreign spouse has to reside with his/her Turkish spouse during these three years. Before this amendment, foreigners could easily obtain Turkish citizenship after marriage without any waiting period. This amendment is supposed to decrease the number of fake paper marriages.

Despite these recent changes in the institutional and legal framework, the working conditions of immigrant workers are not improved considerably. First of all, the lack of bilateral agreements between Turkey and migrant worker sending countries perpetuates the arbitrary relation between the employers and immigrant worker. Working conditions need to be regulated by an institution in order to keep immigrant workers away from exploitation.

Since the main concern of this chapter is to investigate the immigrant domestic women workers, in the next section academic studies conducted on this issue is portrayed.

5.3. Immigrant Domestic Women Workers in Turkey

As in other countries sketched in the previous chapter, Turkey has become an important women domestic worker importing countries in the world since 1990s. Kümbetoğlu (2005) argues that there is a new wave of female migration flow in Turkey since 1990s, wherein immigrants from mostly post-Soviet countries enter and deport the country with legal means. In other words, after the break up of Soviet Union, considerable amount of Soviet women have entered Turkey with tourist visas, worked in domestic service work, and legally deported in regular or irregular periods of time to pay their visa expiration fines. On the other hand, domestic service work they engaged in Turkey is a low-paid, low-status, and deskilling work. However, in the studies portrayed in this section, immigrant

women express that they had no other means/alternatives to earn money other that domestic service. The geographical proximity of Turkey and also closeness of Turkish and for the Moldovans, Gagauz dialects are two facilitating factors pulling these women to Turkey. Since the recruitment of foreign domestic servants has no direct legal basis in Turkey, the recruitment of these women is operated through informal networks. For instance, İçduygu and Köser-Akçapar report that there are many illegal markets in Maltepe (Ankara) and Aksaray and Eyüp (Istanbul) neighborhoods, wherein immigrant workers wait on the streets somebody comes and offers them construction or domestic work.

Moreover, because of their illegal status, immigrant domestic women workers face many difficulties in Turkey. Among the difficulties they face, İçduygu and Köser-Akçapar emphasize the following:

- bribery[6],
- loneliness and suffering from separation of their families,
- debts they have to pay for the travel and recruitment charges to the intermediary agencies,
- cost of heavy visa expiration fines,
- limited freedom of movement,
- being deprived of their passports,
- fear of police and capturing.

Moreover, being a 'foreign woman' in Turkey adds up to the distress of immigrant domestic women workers in that former female Soviet Union migrant and sex workers are commonly known as so-called "Natashas", which means that foreign women are sexually available and willing to have lovers. Turkish media has had an

[6] İçduygu and Köser-Akçapar (2005) narrate that one immigrant woman in their study sample of illegal migrant complained about the bribery the police asked her when stopped her in the traffic lights. She says that the police asked her to give him $50 because she is not allowed to stand there. She adds that bribed enough in the border to enter Turkey, why does she still have to bribe?

important place in shaping the perspective of Turkish citizens through broadcasting red hot news on foreign women who work as sex workers. Thus, foreign women are open to sexual harassment because of this stereotype, as Keough (2003) states:

> Thus marked, and seen as working class women, they are often conflated with so-called Natashas and susceptible to being held as morally suspect assertive sexual predators and willing sexual prey.

In the light of this information, in this chapter three studies done about immigrant domestic workers in Turkey is discussed: Petra Weyland's study (1994) about Filipina women domestic workers in Istanbul, Gamze Ege's masters' thesis (2002) about the women immigrant domestic workers in Ankara (2002), and Belkıs F. Kümbetoğlu's study (2005) on Moldovan women domestic workers in Istanbul.

5.3.1. Petra Weyland's Study on Immigrant Filipina Women Domestic Workers in Istanbul

In her article, Weyland discusses the position of the Filipina domestic workers and their upper-class female employers, whose husbands are working for global business in Istanbul. She states that all of these upper-class women are housewives and mothers, and had worked in their professions before. All of them have some form of domestic help, often a live-in housekeeper, sometimes a maid who comes for work during the day, or less frequently a cleaning lady who comes several times a week. She writes that domestic help is usually performed by immigrant women from rural Anatolia[7] living in Istanbul. However, she also discovers that some upper-class women hire Filipina domestic workers.

---

[7] For more information on the immigrant domestic workers from rural Anatolia, see Özyeğin, Gül. (2004) *Başkalarının Kiri: Kapıcılar, Gündelikçiler ve Kadınlık Halleri*, Istanbul: İletişim Yayınları. In her study, she conducted interviews with these women living in Ankara.

Weyland writes that when compared with the immigrant Anatolian women Filipina domestic helpers are more restricted in the house. Among the reasons making the house they work as a prison is that they are live-in workers and because of their illegal migrant status, they are afraid of being captured when leave the house:

> Having crossed the globe to work in Istanbul they find themselves in a global local domestic space with very little chance to self determination, with their passports and earnings taken away, prohibited from using the telephone and allowed very little free time. Most of them do not have fixed working hours and are on duty from the early morning till late at night. They usually get a day off only on Sundays, though many of them have to work even on this day. Another important reason for their restriction to domestic space is that most of them are working illegally at Turkey, which makes them fear being apprehended when venturing into public global space. In such a situation the global household amounts to a kind of global prison. (Weyland, 1994:85)

In addition, their illegal status prevents them to find employment in the local labor market due to the very restrictive Turkish labor legislation and extremely low local wages. Thus, they can not handle any other occupation than private domestic service. She argues that when compared with the Anatolians, Filipina domestic helpers are obviously easier to exploit not only because of their more vulnerable position as illegal and live-in housekeepers, but also because of the higher quality of their labor in terms of education and experience with foreigners. In her study sample, many of Filipina domestic workers had graduated from high school and had worked for international employers in Manila or other cities before coming to Istanbul. On the other hand, Turkish employers prefer hiring Filipina domestic workers because of their "perfection in the performance of housekeeping, proficiency in the English language, 'modern' clothing, and around-the-clock presence in the household", which serves as an important signifier of status for the employer:

Weyland reports that Filipina domestic helpers prefer to work in domestic service rather than working in the factory in the Philippines. Another reason they stated in

the interviews is their desire to see new places and different people in the world. She narrates one of the domestic helpers' speech:

> Yes I want to work in different countries because I want to learn about the life of other people, I want to associate with different people … and is not everyone looking for greener pasture? (Mrs. R., domestic helper). (1994:85)

On the contrary, they avoid of going beyond their living quarters. Weyland enumerates the reasons for the Filipina domestic workers to avoid of public places as follows:

> Filipinas generally speak only a little Turkish; for many of them local Istanbul is identical with the space of rural migrants and the shanty towns, territories where the local system of meaning, in terms of language, of Islamic or rural Anatolian culture remain not only incomprehensible, but potentially threatening; as women form Southeast Asia they are notoriously stigmatized as prostitutes, and they often complain of being harassed in the streets and on public transport, especially if they are out alone or are out after sunset.(Weyland, 1994:90)

However, they have an informal social network excluding men, and prefer meeting the other Filipina women working in Istanbul. They meet usually on Sundays with their community and go to catholic churches. Weyland states that they can meet in the homes of those Filipina maids whose employers are absent or allow them to bring friends home. She describes these meeting times that Filipina women gather and socialize:

> These meetings are not only a rare occasion to socialize, to make friends with other Filipinas, and to have fun. It is here, too, a secret subversiveness and opposition to their employers is lived out, as stories are passed around about employers' private lives, their little quirks and quarrels. This is the time and place where they compensate themselves for all the drudgery they suffer during the week. This of course is also the time and place for consolation, to listen and give advice to those Filipinas who suffer from their employers' ill treatment, to think about strategies of how best to help them by spreading information about good and bad employers, about hiding places and job vacancies. Sunday's parties are a place of resistance inasmuch as they are an occasion to regain strength for the working week ahead of them. Perhaps still more important is the respect of the Sunday sermon given in

> English at one of Istanbul's Catholic churches attended by most of those who are legally in Turkey. (Weyland, 1994: 93)

Moreover, Weyland states that immigrant Filipina women never meet other foreign domestic helpers, rather establish close relationship with Filipina women who will possibly stay in Istanbul for a long period of time.

5.3.2. Gamze Ege's Study on Immigrant Domestic Women Workers in Ankara

In her study, Ege focuses on whether foreign domestic workers in Turkey is a new form of trafficking in Turkey or not. However, she ends up with the finding that the immigrant women she interviewed were not trafficked, but migrated to Turkey independently. Her study sample is constituted of seventeen immigrant domestic women workers in Ankara; fifteen from Moldova, one from the Philippines, and one from Uzbekistan. Their ages ranged from 23 to 51, and most of them were married, well-educated (on average their education level is high), and had a working-class background (some had worked in factories, warehouses, agriculture, schools, hospitals, while others worked in white-collar occupations as accountant, postal worker, high-school teacher, and day care center employee) in their home country. As domestic workers in the host country they were employed in housework, childcare and elderly care. However, their daily work plans were flexible; although they were employed for one task, such as housework, they were also responsible for the other tasks, for instance the care of the children.

Ege explicates that economic crisis and low wages as an outcome of economic deterioration placed women in a needy position and therefore forced to migrate abroad. In addition, wage differentials between the host and home country is a determinant in the decision to migrate as a domestic worker, yet whether the decision to migrate was a personal or familial decision has not been acknowledged in the study. Ege states that the average wage that her participants earn in Ankara

ranges between $250 and $300 monthly. In their country of origin, their monthly salary ranged between $10-30. Therefore, as Ege declares that the wage available in the home countries and in host countries is one of the most obvious incentives to work as a domestic worker abroad: "…working as a domestic servant in Turkey becomes a highly lucrative opportunity for these women." (Ege, 2002)

In addition, participants in her study disclose that they send most of their wages to their family left in the country of origin. These remittances are spent on the education of their children/grandchildren, buying food, paying for electricity and gas bills, and finally debt. Ege writes that saving or sending money was important for the participants, and since their employers support their basic needs (such as food and other personal hygiene products), more than half of the participants' income go back to their families in the home country. Although she does not clearly state, it can be grasped in the light of these two conditions (economic crisis and income differentials) that the participants in her sample have migrated to Turkey as a family survival strategy to cope with the economic constrains (in their home) country.

Additionally, she has not given a comprehensive socioeconomic and cultural background of the sending countries such as gender relations in the society, occupational patterns in the labor market; other than the economic crisis that they faced after 1990s. However, in her reports with employers, we have the chance to understand how foreign domestic workers are perceived by Turkish employers. Employers have agreed upon that they hire foreign domestic labor for their well-educated background, a sense of responsibility and work consciousness (which Turkish domestic workers are supposed to lack) they have, and their docile and obedient nature (they perform whatever the employer ask for without objection). In addition, since immigrant workers are isolated from their countries, employers declare that they are able to provide 24 hour live-in services without asking for their familial problems:

> Women in the Turkish (domestic services) labor force come from low-waged highly populated families with a lot of problems. If you take one on and you are a sensitive person, whether you like it or not, you take on the responsibility of their entire family. (Ege, 2002)

Although it is not exactly mentioned in the study, hiring foreign domestic workers are preferred by Turkish employers in that they are vulnerable to exploit; this factor is expressed in the interviews by the employers with regard to their docile and obedient nature that are more preferable for hire (when compared with Turkish domestic workers). Additionally, they are fully responsible for all the domestic tasks and do not have a standard schedule and definite working hours. In other words, their needy position (both economically and in terms of social isolation) is exploited by the employers, as in the employers' said they are '24 hour live-in servants'.

Ege's study demonstrates that the hiring foreign domestic workers is widespread among upper-middle class families in Ankara, the central city of Turkey, where the official class predominantly dwelled. Ege talks about the opinions of foreign domestic workers about their work and employers. She states that none of the women had mentioned discomfort and hard feelings with their work and employers. They are mostly content with their work, in that they are paid better in Turkey when compared with their country of origin. In addition, the kinship relation (which is peculiar to Turkish culture in this study) has an affect on these women's opinions. When compared with the ones who live separately from their employer, the live-in women have very close relations with their employers (eat meals and do outside activities, have or spend holidays together). Only two of the participants did not report very satisfactory feelings on her work:

> Despite the fact that they were satisfied with their work on whole, two women noted that they would have preferred working in their home countries; one of whom stated that this was because she had been her own boss there. (Ege, 2002:98)

Nonetheless, participants in Ege's study express an overall comfort with their employers and work. Ege states that simply being paid better and thus to be able to support their families satisfy these foreign domestic workers.

One of the limitations she faced during her field study is that she used an interpreter, because except one Gagauz woman, all other speak Russian and no Turkish.

5.3.3. Belkis F. Kümbetoğlu's Study on Immigrant Domestic Women Workers in Istanbul

Kümbetoğlu's study consisted of twenty five Moldovan women at the ages of 21-35 working as domestic servants in Istanbul. She writes that she communicated in Turkish, but used a simple language in her interviews.

She reported that contrary to her expectation, immigrant Moldovan women were willing to tell their stories to the researcher. She witnessed that all these women were anxious and strained about their families left in the country of origin. However, they needed the help of another woman as a relative, or a waged domestic helper who would be caring their children or sometimes their husbands when they were working in Turkey. Without this condition, it is highly unlikely that they would accept the risk of migrating Turkey to work as domestic servants.

On average, educational attainment of study sample was at least high school or technical institute graduate, and also most of them were working in an occupation in their country. Also, except one woman, all other were married and had children left in Moldova. They stated that they were paid monthly $350-400, and saved the major part of this wage and remitted $50-100 to their families in Moldova. They also told that they sent gifts to their families through transporters in Laleli.

Kümbetoğlu reported that these women migrated because of the poor living and working conditions in Moldova.

Kümbetoğlu elucidates that there is an informal network regulating the employment of Moldovan women in Istanbul. There are many illegal consultancy agencies in Laleli, Kadıköy, and Sirkeci, who operate as intermediaries between the Turkish employers and Moldovan women at great costs. In addition, many Moldovan women told that they also found domestic employment to their friends and relatives who wanted to work in Turkey and took little amount of money for this agency.

In the interviews, Moldovan women express that they have no alternatives than working in domestic service. All they expect from their employment is being treated as they are human being. Although they work under difficult conditions (they state that their passports were taken from them; they worked until morning up to midnight; their freedom of movement was limited because of their fear of being captured by the police, etc.), if they are treated well, they do not complain about their working conditions.

One of the most important findings of Kümbetoğlu's study with immigrant Moldovan domestic workers is that she reveals the informal social networks operating in almost every level of women's migration processes and recruitment in Istanbul. Having friends/relatives working in domestic service in Istanbul both before and after the migration to Turkey, in other words, having these informal social links is crucial for these women in terms of finding employment, arranging their new lives, and keeping a solidarity network among themselves through these informal social links.

5.4. Conclusion

When considering the recent law arrangements and the academic studies conducted on the issue, it is obvious that immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey are still vulnerable and invisible. The recruitment of women domestic workers is usually channeled through informal networks and agencies. As stated in the previous chapter, there are cases of legal and institutionalized recruitment and regulation of domestic employment which operate in both sending and receiving countries. Despite the new amendments on work permits, most of the recruitments are conducted by illegal intermediaries or agencies in Turkey and the sending countries. Turkish government is severely required to recognize that there is a high demand for the foreign domestic workers, and prepare the institutional structure both for control and the regulation of the recruitment of foreign domestic servants. Ministry of Labor and Social Security is responsible for only regulating the work permits of immigrants. However, there is no regulation on the working conditions such as working hours, insurance, wage, etc. which perpetuates arbitrary situations at workplace and exploitation of domestic workers. There is also no institution immigrant domestic workers can turn to in case of mistreatment or exploitation, since they have illegal status.

In conclusion, one of the most important factors making immigrant workers vulnerable is their illegal status in Turkey. They have to deal with the problems, such as bribery or sexual harassment, they face by themselves. Accordingly, their freedom of movement is limited because of the fear of police or deportation. As Weyland puts, they are like in a "prison" in which they have to stay because they have no other option to earn money and support their families, which are the primary concerns behind their migration. There is a need for conducting more studies on illegal immigrant women workers doing domestic service in order to analyze their lives in Turkey to contribute to the improvement of their working conditions through legal means.

CHAPTER VI

METHODOLOGY

6.1. Introduction

In this chapter, firstly the research questions, methodological approach, research method, and research process applied in this study are described. Then, the limitations of the study are explained. Also, the sample profile is portrayed, and other resources, including the interviews with the ambassadors and specialists on illegal immigrant workers contributed to the development of this study are elucidated.

6.2. The Research Questions

At the most abstract level, the main question shaping the theoretical framework of this study is "Why do the forces of supply and demand in the global economy systematically work to the detriment of women?" In order to answer this question, in the previous chapters, the macro and micro level of analyses, including the international migration theories; the linkages between the global economy and immigrant women's labor; and case studies of immigrant domestic workers in different countries, on the international migration of women as domestic workers have been discussed both in the local and global level.

The aim of this study is to explore the migration, working, and living experiences of immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey. Consequently, the following questions are raised in order to investigate their migration experiences:

- *Under what circumstances foreign women migrate to Turkey to be employed in domestic service occupation? How were their lives in their country of origin?*
- *What were their former occupations and their salaries in their homeland?*

Consequently, following questions are posited to immigrant domestic women workers in order to explore their working and living conditions in Turkey:

- *What are the working conditions of immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey?*
- *How do the variants of illegality, gender, and low-prestige of domestic work occupation determine the working conditions and the lives of immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey?*
- *What are the modes of transferring remittances to the immigrant women's families left behind?*
- *How do they perceive their domestic labor, which is lowly-paid and having low-status? How their lives changed after being domestic workers? What are their future plans?*

The migration experiences of immigrant domestic women workers are evaluated in chapter seven, and in chapter eight their living and working conditions are given place.

6.3. The Methodological Approach

The methodological approach pursued in this study is feminist. There are a number of reasons to conduct the feminist methodology in this study. First of all, as a

sociologist, I know that the traditional social science methodologies are male-centered in explaining the social reality in the world through ignoring the oppression of women. Marie Mies articulates that there is a paradox between the theories and methodologies of social sciences and political aims of women's movement in that if women's studies will be applied for women's emancipation, it is impossible to do them without criticizing positivist and quantitative methodology of social sciences. Yet, she argues that if women's studies are applied by this old methodology, they will turn into an instrument of oppression (Çakır & Akgökçe, 1996:50).

Secondly, traditional social science analysis is based upon only men's experiences by arising questions "about nature and social life which (white, Western, bourgeois) men want answered" (Harding, 1987:6). On the other hand, feminist research methodologies make visible the lived experiences of women in patriarchy thereby placing the concept of experience central to the feminist methodologies. In Harding's (1987: 7) words, women's experience is "a scientific resource" in the feminist analysis.

Thirdly, the objectivity principle of the traditional social science research constructs a hierarchy between the researcher and the researched as a kind of knower and the knowable relation. Stanley and Wise (1993:167) reject the pure objectivity approach of social science methods and describe such approaches as 'an excuse for a power relationship'. However, providing the "subjectivity principle", feminist analysis produce a more complete and 'distorted' knowledge, since it "insists that the inquirer her/himself be placed in the same critical plane as the overt subject matter, thereby recovering the entire research process for scrutiny in the results of research. That is, the race, culture, and gender assumption, beliefs, and behaviors of the researcher her/himself must be placed within the framework of the picture that s/he attempts to paint…Thus, the researcher appears to us not as an invisible, anonymous voice of authority, but as a real, historical individual with concrete, specific desires and interests" (Harding, 1987:9).

Finally, Stanley and Wise state that all women do not have a common experience of oppression since their experiences differ in terms of the places in the world they live, work, and struggle:

> The experience of women is ontologically fractured and complex because we do not all share one single and unseamed material reality. We also suggest that the category 'woman' used in academic feminist writing then (and, to an extent, now) actually reflected the experiences and analysis of white, middle-class, heterosexual, First World, women only, yet treated these as universals. (1990:20)

In conclusion, the study subject of this thesis is designated to be the immigrant domestic women workers, and a feminist analysis is required to be applied in order to cast light upon how the experiences of immigrant domestic workers are influenced and vary in term of their gender, ethnicity variants, and immigrant status.

6.4. Research Method and Research Process

The research method carried out with the research group in this study is in-depth interview technique. Unlike the male-stream quantitative methods, in-depth interview method enabled me to create an emotional closeness with the research group and also made these invisible women speak about how they perceive their experiences as immigrant domestic workers without being limited to the structured categories as in the survey method.

The research was conducted between April-May 2005 with sixteen immigrant domestic women workers who were performing domestic labor including the tasks such as cleaning, childcare, elderly-care, housework, etc. To reach immigrant domestic women workers, the interviews were conducted in Istanbul and Ankara, firstly because immigrant women workers are mostly employed in these two big cities. Secondly, they work illegally in these cities so that I could only reach them

through my personal network. I knew women who were employed as domestic workers and also the employers who employed domestic workers in and living in either of these cities. Accordingly, snowball sampling technique is conveyed in the study. I asked my friends and relatives in Ankara and Istanbul whether they knew people who were women domestic workers or employed domestic workers in their house. Also, interviewed women domestic workers were asked whether they had friends who were employed as domestic workers, and they directed me to other women domestic workers they knew. I either contacted them on the phone or, if I only had the contact of the employers, I asked them if their domestic helpers would like to have an interview with me. I never went to meet domestic workers for conducting interviews without their consent.

Each interview lasted from 60 to 90 minutes depending on the free time of the interviewee. If their employers were informed about me, I usually had the interviews with the domestic workers in their breaks in the house they were working. In these interviews, since their employers were informed about me, I could mostly talk with the domestic workers in a separate room alone. On the other hand, if I directly contacted domestic workers for an interview, I could meet with them outside such as a café, restaurant and church. In these interviews, only one of the interviewees met me in her workday with the permission of her employers. The rest of the domestic workers I personally contacted them to meet me in their day-offs. I met with seven immigrant women in their workplace, and with nine immigrant women outside.

I posited questions to the immigrant domestic women workers related to their life (particularly their socioeconomic status) in the country of origin, migration experience, recruitment process, working condition, relationship with their employers, perception of the domestic work they were performing, and their future plans.

I used a tape-recorder during the interviews. When I asked them whether they would be disturbed by the presence of a tape recorder, only one of them wanted me to take notes rather than recording the interview. There were times they asked me to stop the tape-recorder to give me confidential information about their private life, or I personally stopped the tape recorder when they felt sad and cried while expressing their feelings about their migration experiences and their families left behind.

Except two particular cases, I and the interviewees were very comfortable during the interview session. When I met them, most of these women showed me the photographs taken with their family members, relatives, or friends and introduced them to me, which was an indicator of their will to share their life and experiences with someone who was really interested in them.

6.5. Limitations of the Study

Research group of this study is not a representative of the universe of the immigrant domestic women workers for several reasons making up the population bias. First of all, due to the time and access issues, the population of the study was restricted to sixteen women. If I had more time for conducting the field study, and could reach more people that would meet me with the immigrant domestic women workers, I would contact more women for listening to their experiences as immigrant domestic workers in Turkey.

Secondly, I could only have interviews with women who were allowed by their employers to meet me, or they could themselves arrange their free time for an interview session with me. As discussed in chapter four, there are cases in the world that immigrant domestic women workers can not enter public space, but rather are imprisoned to the household they are employed in either because of their 'bad' employers or their fear of being caught by the police. If there are cases of

imprisoned women working as domestic workers in Turkey, I could not reach them during my field study. Another indicator of this bias is those what interviewees told me during the sessions. When I asked them to meet their friends who were working as domestic workers, they replied that they knew other domestic women but they did not quit home in any condition, even did not have day-offs, but rather stayed at the house they worked all the time, so I could not meet them. Therefore, when compared with those women, I relatively had the opportunity to contact less 'invisible' immigrant women working as domestic servants in Ankara and Istanbul.

The most important limitation in the field study I faced was immigrant women's fear to be detected by the police, since all of the interviewees (except three women who obtained Turkish citizenship) were staying and working illegally in Turkey. Only those whom I met in the church on Saturdays and in café or in restaurant in their free time were willing to give me every detail coming into their mind during the interviews about their relation with their employers, their working conditions, and their immigration experience in Turkey (such as bribery issues, mistreatment, their relation with illegal agencies they applied for migration, etc.). They felt secure and more comfortable when I granted them I will kept their names secret, and not meet their employers. Also, I could go to the church with a Moldovan woman, whom I contacted through a friend of mine. She introduced me to other Moldovan women, so I could interview four Moldovan women in the church. Particularly, in the church I did not ask many women their names to ensure them that I was only interested in their immigration experiences in Turkey, which could make them relaxed to tell their stories. On the other hand, there were three cases in the study that either the employer and/or the domestic worker was uncomfortable during the interviews, and did not get into detail about their informal networks or how their employer treat them. Especially, I felt difficulty when one employer did not leave us alone and interrupted my conversation with her domestic helper, and I could not ask questions to the immigrant woman relation related to her relationship with her employer because of the employer's presence during the interview. In addition, during another interview with a domestic helper in the apartment she was working,

the employer's old husband was not informed about me and he shouted at me. I finally convinced him that I was a master's student at METU studying the immigrant domestic women workers, but again he was very anxious and frequently disturbed the interview. Also, the immigrant woman was uncomfortable when I met her, and asked me to take notes rather than tape-recording. When I left the house, this woman called my friend, who mediated between me and her for the interview, to ask whether I was a confident person and would not report her to the police. Furthermore, in an interview the Turkish husband and a relative of the employer of the immigrant women did not leave me alone with her, and interrupted the conversation several times. Additionally, the interviewee was very anxious and did not inform me about her recent working conditions and relationship with the employer.

Although I introduced myself and gave information about my study to the employer and employee before meeting them, many women domestic workers whom I met at the household they were working were not confident about my intention to interview them. I felt like that their working place was private for them, and they did not feel secure when having the interview at the employer's place. In addition, even though I stated that I want to have the interviews alone with the immigrant women, there were the two cases mentioned above that the employers did not leave me alone with their immigrant domestic helpers.

Another limitation I encountered in the study was the language barrier. Except one Georgian woman who had arrived in Turkey just three month before the interview, all other women I interviewed were fluent in Turkish. Having fluent communication in Turkish was mostly because of the closeness of Gagauz dialect with Turkish, and also all women have been staying in Turkey for a long time and learned Turkish. With this Georgian woman, I particularly had difficulty to communicate so spent more than the average time of the interviews to understand each other. Also, I felt that if I was fluent in Russian, women who I met at the

household they were employed would be more comfortable to inform me about their relationship with their employer.

Finally, I could not meet two women who had to go back to their country because they had to pay their visa expiration fees. The more they stayed illegally in Turkey, the more they paid for their visa expiration fines. Therefore, they leave Turkey for a short time period, pay their visa expiration fines, and enter Turkey again.

6.6. The Research Group

The research group was designated to be consisting of twenty immigrant domestic women workers. However, two of them later decided not to participate to the research, and the other two left Turkey for visiting their family living in their country of origin, or paying the accumulated visa expiration fines and enter Turkey again. Among sixteen immigrant domestic women workers, one was Georgian, one was Filipina, one was Bulgarian, two were Crimean, two were Uzbek, and nine were Moldovan (Gagauz Turks) (Table 9).

Table 9. Nationalities of the Immigrant Domestic Women Workers in the Study

	Country of Origin					
Names	**Moldova**	**Uzbekistan**	**Crimea**	**Bulgaria**	**Georgia**	**Philippines**
Ms. A				√		
Ms. B		√				
Ms. C						√
Ms. D	√					
Ms. E	√					
Ms. F		√				
Ms. G	√					
Ms. H	√					
Ms. I	√					
Ms. J					√	
Ms. K	√					
Ms. L	√					
Ms. M			√			
Ms. N			√			
Ms. O	√					
Ms. P	√					
Total:	9	2	2	1	1	1

Fifteen women were living in the villages of their country of origin, and one Uzbek woman was living in Tashkent with her children. All the Moldovan women were living with their families in the Gagauz region of Moldova. Only one Moldovan woman was a citizen of Russia, although she used to live with her father in Moldova before moving to Turkey. Married/divorced/widowed women's children were either looked after by their husbands or their families such as their parents or their husbands' parent. The research group mostly composed of middle-aged

women. Their age ranged between 25 and 49. The distribution of the ages is listed below:

Table 10. Age Distribution of the Research Group

	Age Groups				
	25-29	**30-34**	**35-39**	**40-44**	**45-49**
Frequency	1	5	2	4	4
Total: 16					

In the research group, nine women were married. They were married at the ages of 15-22. Two out of nine women were married with Turkish men; one woman was living with her husband in Ankara and the other was not. She said that she had married him for gaining Turkish citizenship through an agency, but then she had never seen him again, and had not divorced him yet. Other six married women's husbands were living in the country of origin with their children through the remittances their wives sent, and one woman's husband was working in a textile factory in Turkey. Three women were divorced (one of them also made a paper-marriage with a Turkish man and then divorced him after acquiring Turkish citizenship), three women were single, and one woman was widowed.

Table 11. Marital Status of the Immigrant Women

Names	Single	Married	Widowed	Divorced
Ms. A		√		
Ms. B			√	
Ms. C		√		
Ms. D		√		
Ms. E				√
Ms. F				√
Ms. G		√		
Ms. H				√
Ms. I	√			
Ms. J		√		
Ms. K	√			
Ms. L	√			
Ms. M		√		
Ms. N		√		
Ms. O		√		
Ms. P		√		
Total: 16	3	9	1	3

Except the single women and one woman, who was divorced and lost her child when he was 3-months old, all other women had 1-4 children. The ages of the children ranged between 9 and 24, and they all were going to school. These women supported their families through sending remittances. On the other hand, single women sent money to home for the education of their siblings.

Table 12. Number of Children Married/Divorced/Widowed Immigrant Women Had

Names	Number of Children				
	none	**1**	**2**	**3**	**4**
Ms. A			√		
Ms. B			√		
Ms. C	√				
Ms. D			√		
Ms. E	√				
Ms. F				√	
Ms. G			√		
Ms. H			√		
Ms. J.				√	
Ms. M			√		
Ms. N		√			
Ms. O				√	
Ms. P					√
Total: 13	2	1	6	3	1

In the post-USSR countries, the compulsory education usually lasts for nine years (between the ages of 6 and 15). I classified women who have nine years education as "secondary school graduates". After compulsory education, there is higher secondary school education lasting for three years (between the ages of 15 and 18), and I grouped the graduates of higher secondary school education under "high school graduates" category. In addition to the high school education, students having vocational school education (in agriculture, teacher training, arts, mechanics, energetic, construction, industrial wood-processing, and economics), which last for 2-3 years, and vocational school graduates are assumed to have undergraduate degree level in post-USSR countries. I categorized the women who graduated from vocational school as "high school and vocational school graduate". On the other hand, high school graduates attend university education either than vocational

schools, and gathered under the category of "university graduates" in this study. The research group was composed of highly-educated women. (Table 13) Almost 70 per cent of the interviewed women had at least high school education.

Table 13. Educational Levels of the Research Group

Names of the immigrant women	Levels of Education			
	Secondary School Graduate	**High School Graduate**	**High School and Vocational School Graduate**	**University Graduate**
Ms. A	√			
Ms. B				√
Ms. C				√
Ms. D				√
Ms. E			√	
Ms. F			√	
Ms. G		√		
Ms. H	√			
Ms. I				√
Ms. J	√			
Ms. K			√	
Ms. L				√
Ms. M			√	
Ms. N				√
Ms. O		√		
Ms. P		√		
Total: 16	3	3	4	6

Married women's husbands were mostly unemployed, or employed in temporary jobs such as construction or agricultural work. On the other hand, Ms. A. migrated to Turkey with her husband, and her husband was working in a textile factory as a

worker. As stated before, Ms. C. did not have any connection with her Turk husband, since she made a paper-marriage with him. Ms. G. was living with her husband, who was a housekeeper in the apartment they were living together.

Among sixteen immigrant women, only four women had previous international migration experience to find employment. Ms. A migrated to Berlin, where her mother was married and working as domestic worker, and she worked there as a cleaning lady in 2000-2001. Ms. E. went to Russia, where her elderly brother was working, to be employed in domestic service for a year. Ms. O. and Ms. H. worked in temporary menial jobs when available such as wall painting and plastering in Moscow before migrating to Turkey. Except these four women, migrating Turkey in the search for domestic service employment had been the first international migration experience of all other immigrant women in the research group

6.7. Other Resources

6.7.1. Interviews with the Embassies

In order to investigate how the governments of sending countries act on the international migration of their citizens to Turkey, I sought to arrange in-depth interviews with the ambassadors of Moldova, Ukraine, Uzbekistan, the Philippines, Bulgaria, and Georgia in Ankara between May and June, 2005. Firstly, I contacted the secretaries of the ambassadors, and then sent faxes to each embassy giving information on my study and myself. However, among six ambassadors, only the Philippine ambassador accepted to have an interview with me. I called other embassies several times to take an appointment with their ambassadors, but none replied my request and stayed in silence, which was very disappointing for me. Finally, the third secretary of Ukraine Ambassador agreed to have an interview with me. In my opinion, non-respondents either had a very busy schedule and did not have time for an interview with me or were reluctant to discuss the illegal migration

of their women citizens in that they have no legal mechanism regulating and protecting their citizens who are working illegally in Turkey. Therefore, in this section I could only write about the interviews with the Philippine ambassador and the secretary of Ukraine Embassy in Ankara.

6.7.1.1. Interview with the Philippine Ambassador

In this interview, I asked the ambassador the number and working conditions of Filipina domestic workers in Turkey, whether there was a legal policy for the recruitment of their women citizens as domestic workers abroad and Filipina domestic workers turned to the embassy for their problems in Turkey.

Firstly, she informed me that it was the lack of economic conditions, and overpopulation problem pushing Filipina people to migrate overseas for employment. Arrivals of the Filipinas in Turkey started in late 1980s. According to her estimation in the light of embassy's statistics, there were approximately 1500 Filipina domestic workers in Turkey. She mostly gave information about Filipina women domestic workers living in Ankara:

> In Ankara, most domestic workers work for the Turkish diplomats. They are well-paid and have day-offs. When they are treated badly of unpaid, they call us. We recommend them to change their employers, and they do change.

Filipina government has labor agreements for the recruitment of Filipina domestic workers with many countries, but not with Turkey. She did not have any idea whether there were negotiations between the Philippine and Turkish governments on this issue. On the other hand, she stated that the Philippine government had legal mechanism for the recruitment and protection of their citizens working abroad. She emphasized that The Migrant Workers and Overseas Filipinos Act of 1995 provided the framework for stronger protection of Filipino workers abroad. This act ensures their immigrant citizens with legal assistance fund for their repatriation, named the "Assistance-to-Nationals Fund" regulated by the Migrant Workers'

Affairs. In addition, Office of Migrant Worker Affairs helps Filipina migrants for their problems. When illegal Filipina migrants are caught by the police for overstaying in Turkey, she said, the Philippine embassy report their names to their office in Manila, and they send money for repatriation. Moreover, she informed me that there were development programs for the migrant workers to teach them skills for other jobs, so that they could not stay as a domestic workers rest of their lives.

She stated that Filipina immigrant workers had to be high school graduates to migrate overseas. Filipina women domestic in Turkey worked in either baby-sitting or household general cleaning. Although their working conditions were not ideal, they had very little complains about their working conditions because, in her words, "they have a high tolerance". They turned to the embassy mostly for passport services. She knows only a few cases of victims of illegal recruitments of Filipina workers in Turkey. She could only remember the case wherein Filipina women were promised to go to Italy or France but were abandoned in Istanbul. The embassy helped them for repatriation.

6.7.1.2. Interview with the Ukraine Embassy

In the interview, the Embassy secretary stated that Ukraine had legal bilateral agreements for the recruitment of its citizens in Italy, Spain, Portugal, and Czech Republic, but not with Turkey. He informed me that the Ukraine government had ongoing negotiations with Turkish government on the trafficked women and illegal migration from Ukraine to Turkey. He said that they had a hot-line for the trafficked and maltreated Ukraine immigrant in Turkey operating twenty-four hours a day. In addition, the Ukrainian government provides financial support to her citizens for repatriation. However, the secretary had no estimation on the numbers of Ukrainian immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey, and whether they turned to the Embassy for their problems since he had no legal information on these issues.

6.7.2. Interviews with the Specialist on Illegal Immigrant Workers in Turkey

I had an interview on July 2005 with an executive specialist in the Turkish Ministry of Labor and Social Security on illegal immigrant workers in Turkey. I asked him how the Ministry dealt with illegal immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey, and whether immigrant domestic women workers turned to them when facıng problems in their workplaces in Turkey. He stated that they lack an estimate of the number of immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey since their workplaces are private 'houses', and because they work in the informal sector. In other words, he emphasized that since waged domestic work is performed at home, it is an occupation ın which it is very difficult to gaın access to working conditions of domestic workers and the employer-worker relationship. Similarly, Kalaycioglu and Rittersberger-Tilic (2000) argue that waged domestic work, which is a temporary, low-paid, and low-prestige work, is found in the informal sector in Turkey.

Statıng that waged domestic work takes place in the informal sector, and Turkey does not have any bilateral agreements with the sending countries, he argued that immigrant domestic women workers are in a more vulnerable position because they are working illegally in Turkey. When asked if Turkey has a legal recruitment procedure for immigrant domestic workers, he said that immigrant women could be employed only if they apply to the Turkish Embassy in their country of origin and state that they want to work in Turkey as a domestic worker. Additionally, the employer has to apply to the Ministry of Labor in order to hire a foreign domestic worker. If their applications are reasonable, then immigrant women can work as a domestic worker in Turkey. However, he stated that nobody has applied to the Ministry of Labor for such an application. He said that there has not been any immigrant domestic women workers who have approached them to dıscuss their problems in Turkey. Furthermore, he stated that if an immigrant domestic woman

worker would ask for help, for instance when they are not paid by their employe or they are maltreated in their workplaces, the Ministry would help them by contacting their employers and calling them to the ministry to discuss their complaints.

After my interviews, I found no proof of action directly addressıng the concerns of immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey - neither by the embassies of the sending countries, nor by the NGOs. As I stated before, field studies of Belkıs Kümbetoğlu, Gamze Ege (although it was focused on trafficking in women), and Petra Weyland on immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey were very illuminating for me to gain an insight into the issue.

CHAPTER VII

MIGRATION EXPERIENCES OF IMMIGRANT DOMESTIC WOMEN WORKERS IN TURKEY

7.1. Introduction

In this chapter, findings of the interviews with sixteen immigrant women about their migration experiences are discussed. The main concerns of this chapter are to explore the reasons why immigrant women choose Turkey for seeking domestic service work; their process of arrival to Turkey including how and through which channels immigrant women enter Turkey; the ways they seek employment; the frequency of entrances and departures in Turkey; and as immigrants, their information on their rights in Turkey.

7.2. Reasons of Migration and Decision to Migrate

In the interviews, all of the immigrant women complained about their difficult working conditions and high unemployment in their country of origin. Particularly, women of post-Soviet countries stated that after the collapse of Soviet Union, most of them and their family members were either dismissed from their work, or had to

work in temporary employment in return for 'very little money'. While the living conditions became more costly in these countries, their income levels sharply declined. Additionally, privatization of education and other social services placed great strains on their economic situation. As a result, the gap between their low income and the high cost of living led them to find alternative ways for earning better income for their families' living:

> I had worked in the bus station as a saleslady for twenty years. I left my job because I was paid only $10 per month. It was very little to make a living for my family. After the collapse of the Soviet Union, salaries went down. People became poorer. Factories were closed down. Our men were unemployed. We were not manufacturing anymore, but buying the imported goods at high prices. Everything became expensive. We almost had no purchasing power. These all were because of the collapse of the Soviet Union. Our people have to migrate abroad. There are no jobs in our country. Nobody wants to leave his or her country. But, money is not at home, it is abroad. We had to migrate. (Ms. G., Gagauz, 48 years old)

> We have our own land in Gagauzia. After the collapse of our country, there emerged a distinction between Gagauzia and Moldova. The state distributed land to people so that we could farm. Everybody works in agriculture, and barters their goods. Our soil is very rich; it is black soil. My husband is a farmer. I worked as a nursery school teacher for twenty five years. I built our own house with my hands. Then, my third son came into the world. I started cooking for farmers. The state was feeding them well at those times, but after Gorbachev, it was over. I sold goods in my sibling's store in the capital city. I went to Ukraine and Moscow for manual construction work. My monthly wage was at maximum $15. My oldest son got a virus while he was in the army. His illness required that he stay in the hospital for ten days each month. He has a pulmonary infection. His medicines are very expensive. My second child will join the army soon, he needs money also. I had to find a job paying well so that I could meet their needs. (Ms. O., Gagauz, 46 years old)

Immigrant women also expressed that they could no longer practice their profession because either they could not find suitable jobs, or their salaries in their professions were not enough to maintain their livelihood (see Table 14). The average monthly salary earned by immigrant women in their country of origin ranged from $10 to $50. Only Ms. A, Ms. C., and Ms. F were paid around $150-250 per month before migrating overseas. Yet, this amount was not a sufficient wage to support their

family since they have children. For instance, Ms. A. was a seamstress in Bulgaria, and then moved to Berlin, where her mother lives, in order to work as a cleaning lady:

> While my husband worked as a taxi driver he had insurance, but then he was dismissed. Our car was broken,so we sold it. I was working in a company as a seamstress. I was working until morning, and sleeping on the machines. But the company went bankrupt and I could not take my wage for months. We could not find jobs. Because of high unemployment in our country, our people moved to find work wherever they could. The administrator who came into power brought us to ruin. They ate our money. Rich people remained rich, but poor carried the burden. (Ms. A., Bulgarian, 33 years old)

Therefore, being unpaid or earning very little was the driving force behind their migration decision, since most of the immigrant women's husbands were dismissed or unemployed. Thus, immigrant women carried the burden of their family maintenance, and international migration to seek employment presented a temporary solution for them.

Ms. H. also carried several different work whenever she could to earn income for her family:

> I worked in a nursery home. I taught in primary school, and worked as a care-giver. Then, I worked in a post office, but my wage was very little. I went to Moscow for construction work. I painted and wallpapered the buildings there. I did not attend high school. The school was located a hundred kilometers away from our town and my parents did not let me to go school because of that. My children could not attend school either, because I had no money for their education. In my times, the schools were free. When my children entered the primary school, the schools were privatized. Thus, I could not send them to school. (Ms. H., Gagauz, 42 years old)

Table 14. Former Occupations and Monthly Salaries of Immigrant Women in Their Country of Origin

Name	Occupation	Monthly Salary ($)
Ms. A.	Seamstress/ Cleaning Lady in Berlin	200–250
Ms. B.	Doctor/Ministry Officer	40–50
Ms. C.	Nurse	150
Ms. D.	Russian Teacher	30
Ms. E.	Teacher	70
Ms. F.	Seamstress	200
Ms. G.	Newspaper Seller in the Bus Terminal	15
Ms. H.	Babysitter/Primary School Teacher/Construction Worker in Moscow	9
Ms. I.	Customhouse Officer	50
Ms. J.	Housewife	-
Ms. K.	Primary School Teacher	15
Ms. L.	Psychologist in Nursery School	15
Ms. M.	Nurse	25
Ms. N.	Nurse	10
Ms. O.	Nursery School Teacher /Seller /Cooker/Construction worker in Moscow	15
Ms. P.	Factory Worker	20

Ms. I. graduated from law school and Ms. L. from philology. They both stated that they could not find employment in their profession, and therefore worked in available occupations they found:

> My parents had their jobs until they were dismissed in 1993. My father was working as a driver delivering imported goods and sometimes worked in the fields, and my mother worked as an accountant. I had also worked in

> Moldova. After studying law, I worked in the customhouse for four years. Everything got worse in Moldova after 1991. I was the breadwinner of the family, but my salary was $150 a month. Although this amount was above the average income, it was not enough for a four-person family with children attending school (Ms. I., Gagauz, 25 years old)

> I have three siblings. They all attend school. My parents are retired. Their pensions are very little, 400 ley in total (approximately $29) a month. If there is nobody attending school, $150 per month can be enough; but if there are, it is almost impossible to make a living with this money for my family. We were living in the worst village of Moldova. There were no public utilities. Even the streets were not covered with asphalt. My major is philology, but I could not work in my profession there. I was working in a special nursery school for children with psychological problems. I was earning $15 a month. I worked there for two years. But my salary was not enough for to support my family. I am the oldest child in my family. There are two more children needing money for their education. In order to support my family, I had to work abroad. It was a depressed time for my family. My younger sister wanted to take piano courses, and we borrowed money from our neighbors to buy a piano for her. I had to work and save money to pay back the debt. (Ms. L., Gagauz, 31 years old)

Additionally, Ms. B. explained that she left her profession as a result of the lack of opportunity and the low-salary:

> After my husband passed away, I left my profession in 1995 and worked for twenty five years in the ministry. I left my work in medicine, because as a doctor, my monthly salary was $40. My working conditions were very heavy. In our country, people do not respect the medical profession. There is no research, no improvement in medicine. No laboratory for research. I worked long hours. When you have private patients, you can earn a little more. I wanted to open my own office, but I had to bribe for that. We were badly affected by the black market prices and our purchasing power declined. You see, the conditions prevented me from practicing my profession. I could not maintain my children's education and support my family in that way. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)

Furthermore, regardless of their marital status, all immigrant women stated that their children's/sibling's educational attainment was very important for them. As stated in the previous chapter, the overall education attainment of the research group is high. Also, these women want their children and siblings to continue their education. Since education became privatized, families have been unable to support

the tuition fees required for their children's schooling. Therefore, maintaining the education of their family members is one of the primary reasons behind the migration decision of immigrant women:

> I graduated from vocational school. I worked in primary school as a teacher for six years. I have two siblings going to school. My father is working in Moldova. I was paid very little, only $15 in a month, and sometimes I was unpaid for months. (Ms. K., Gagauz, 30 years old)

> I have been commuting between Turkey and Moldova for five years. I was a Russian teacher in Moldova, but my salary was very little; only $30 a month. My husband is working in a furniture factory, and his monthly salary is $150. It is good money, but still it is not enough for our family needs. I have two children going to the primary school. (Ms. D., Gagauz, 34 years old)

> My husband and I were unemployed in Georgia. We were living in the village. My elder brother is rich, he was helping us. We had a big garden, and were growing our fruits and vegetables there. But we had no money. Georgia is a small but very beautiful country. I have three children. They all attend school. We needed money for their education. (Ms. J., Georgian, 35 years old)

On the other hand, two Crimean women decided to search for work overseas because they needed money to complete the ongoing construction of their houses in Crimea. Their stories are somehow different than other post-Soviet immigrant women in that they had been deported from Crimea and living in Uzbekistan until 1990 and moved to their homeland when Crimea was re-opened for the Crimean Turks at the end of 1980s. When they obtained land they started to build their own houses. Again, high unemployment led many Crimean women to migrate abroad in search of work:

> We were living in Uzbekistan. One night, we were watching the television. Gorbachev was on the television. I never forget the date; it was November 18, 1987 (She started crying while talking about that night). He said that Crimea was opened to us. We all were shocked. My father had always wanted to go back to Crimea; he wanted all of our family to settle down in Crimea. My parents moved first, and then my husband and I moved there. In 1990, because of inflation, all the money we had had been trashed. We lost everything we had. We temporarily stayed in my parents' house, but it

was too small for all of us. My husband found employment in the village. We obtained land in Crimea, but it was not easy. We obtained our land from Crimea by organizing and participating in mass meetings. Then, we started to build our own house ten years ago, but we could only complete two rooms of the house. My husband's salary was not enough for us. I also worked in a healing clinic as a nurse, but the working conditions were very heavy and my monthly salary was only $25. There were six nurses working in the clinic, and together had to attend to almost fifty patients per hour. Thus, I decided to find employment abroad so that we could complete our house and support my children's education. My daughter will enter university next year. I have to find employment for to support my family. (Ms. M., Crimean Turk, 34 years old)

On May 18, 1944, Crimean Tatars were deported from Crimea. After the collapse of Soviet Union, Crimean people went back to their homelands. I was a nurse in Uzbekistan, and worked as a nurse in Crimea after 1990. At the same time, I was working in a market and selling goods. I was not paid during the last seven or eight months by the hospital I worked at. My monthly salary was $10-15. While we were building our new house in Crimea eighteen of us shared a small house. It was a family decision for me to seek employment abroad. We obtained land, but there is no employment opportunity in my homeland. Therefore, I migrated abroad to complete the construction of our new house, because we had no money to buy a house. (Ms. N, Crimean Turk, 41 years old)

Ms. F and Ms. C. are two informants in the research group who described different reasons beyond the poor economic conditions for seeking work abroad. Ms. F. stated that she wanted to start a new life after undergoing severe depression as a result of being left by her husband. Additionally, she expressed that her economic concerns for the future of her three daughters influenced her decision to migrate. Similarly, Ms. P. stated that she sought employment abroad for her daughters' marriages.

I was a seamstress in Uzbekistan. I was sewing t-shirts for $10 each, and earning on average $200 a month. My husband left me for a younger girl and married her. I had nervous breakdowns because he left me for a young girl. Both my depression and economic problems led me migrate to Turkey. I wanted to leave all these problems behind. He did not let me come to Turkey. But we were divorced; I told him that it is not his business to decide upon my life. I have my son going to university, and two married daughters. I did the entire dowry and marriage expenses of my daughters with the money I earned in Turkey. Now, my ex-husband divorced his second wife

> and now he is living with my son in Uzbekistan. (Ms. F., Uzbek, 47 years old)

> I worked in a bread factory from 1975 to 2003. I was paid according to the amount of bread I made. My average monthly salary was $20. In 2003, the factory was closed. I looked for a new job. For the future of my daughters; I decided to seek employment abroad. There were no jobs in my country. My daughters were going to get married. I had to earn money for their dowry and marriage expenses. (Ms. P., Gagauz, 49 years old)

On the other hand, Ms. C. explained that her life in the Philippines was very restrictive for her because of her conservative family. Therefore, she thought that working abroad would free her from family oppression. Like Ms. F, she also stated that she was planning to find better paid overseas employment:

> I was paid $150 monthly when working in a hospital as a nurse in my country. I am paid almost ten times more in Turkey. However, this was not my primary reason for moving to Turkey. I was curious about Turkey. I am more independent here. My family did not let me free in the Philippines. I could not neither go out independently nor wear what I wanted. I wanted to live my own life, so I left the Philippines. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)

Finally, women with children stated that they had their family members attend to their households when they were working abroad. Usually, their husbands would maintain this role in the household. Only Ms. P.'s husband lives in the village, while their daughters attend school in the capital. Thus, her father lives in the capital city with her children and looks after them. There are other cases in which grandparents take the responsibility of children if immigrant women who are divorced or widowed.

> We sold our house with and our garden and bought an apartment next door to my parents. Thus, my parents could look after my children while I am away. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)

> I divorced my husband two and a half years ago. My mother passed away. My step-mom cares for my two children in Moldova now, and I send money to her to support my children and pay their tuitions. (Ms. H., Gagauz, 42 years old)

However, Ms. F. said that her ex-husband lived with their son while he attended school, whereas their two daughters were married and thus lived with their husbands independently.

Obviously, an important factor for women deciding to migrate is the presence of someone to care for their children. In addition to the fact that the children are in school, the financial burden of bringing them to Turkey would be insurmountable. On the other hand, single women had been living with their families in their country of origin and their families could take care of one another. Finally, it is important to state that none of the immigrant women hired another woman for child/elderly-care before migrating.

In summary, the reasons behind the international migration of women are heavy working conditions, high unemployment, closure of many traditional sectors, low-paid or unpaid work, and deteriorating life standards that result from macroeconomic measures taken by their governments, as discussed in the previous chapters. When women lost their jobs in their countries, an indication of the 'feminization of unemployment', they were forced to migrate overseas in order to compensate for the loss of social services and family income (Vickers, 1991). In addition, immigrant women reported that they had to migrate in order to pay their children's tuition fees and secure a consistent source of financial support for the future to benefit their family members. Therefore, their migration decision was not simply an individual decision based on rational calculations as the Equilibrium Approach claims, but instead is a family-based decision as the New Economics Approach argues. In other words, women had to carry the burden of their family survival and pay the consequences of long-term effects of economic restructuring policies taken by their governments.

7.3. Reasons for Choosing Turkey as the Destination Country

In the research group, all the immigrant women reported that they had friends/relatives working in Turkey, a factor which played a crucial role in their migration decision. Their relations with friends/relatives constituted a social network that provided these women with information about the working opportunities in Turkey. In addition, women prefer to work in the places that their relatives/friends have been working. Subsequently, they benefit from the help of their friends while adjusting to their new lives and enjoyed meeting with their friends during their free time.

> My mother came to Turkey first. I knew that there were job opportunities in Turkey. There are lots of my peers working in Turkey. I first went to Ankara, because I had my friends working there. They found me an elderly-care job. In my second time, I went to Istanbul and have stayed here until today. (Ms. I., Gagauz, 25 years old)

> Girls were coming to Turkey for domestic works. They mostly go to Spain and Italy. I told my husband that I want to work in Turkey. My friends working in Turkey told me that the working conditions in Turkey are relatively better than Crimea. (Ms. M., Crimean Turk, 34 years old)

> We heard from our friends who were working in Turkey that there are available jobs in Turkey, and that we could find work too. Average monthly salary was 200-250 YTL in Bulgaria. If we did not come to Turkey, it would be almost impossible for us to pay the tuition of our children's school, and the bills of our house in Bulgaria. I can say that there are only children and elderly left in Bulgaria, all our people migrated for employment purposes. (Ms. A., Bulgarian, 33 years old)

With the exception of two women, all women traveled to Turkey with their friends or relatives to seek work. They stated that they already had friends working there and wanted to take a chance. Thus, the most critical factor in choosing Turkey as a destination for work is the presence of people from their homeland that would help them in this new place:

> I had never considered coming to Turkey. While talking with the girls in our town, my friends and I wanted to try our luck in Turkey. Everybody was seeking work in Turkey. I came here with my friends. (Ms. O., Gagauz, 46 years old)

> My elder sister was working in Turkey in domestic employment. I also had friends who went to Turkey. In her last visit to Moldova, my sister brought me with her to Turkey. (Ms. D., Gagauz, 34 years old)

> My neighbors were working in Turkey. I was informed by them that there were available jobs for us. (Ms. P., Gagauz, 49 years old)

> Migrating to Turkey was a family decision. We have many Georgian relatives in Turkey. (Ms. J., Georgian, 35 years old)

> I have a friend working in Turkey who earns good money. Why should not I try, too? (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)

In addition, two immigrant women said that after they came to Turkey their family members followed them and sought employment in Turkey too.

> Everybody was going to Turkey. I thought that was a good possibility of finding work, why should not I go also? I was earning $70 monthly when I was working as a teacher in the school. My husband did not want me to travel to Turkey. I told him that if he did not give me money to travel, I would go by myself. I came first, and then my husband came here with the money I sent him. In Moscow, there are good job opportunities, but I did not have any friends there. Most of my relatives and friends work in Turkey. That's why I chose Turkey for work. (Ms. E., Gagauz, 40 years old)

> I was complaining about the difficult working conditions to my friend working in the same school with me. She convinced me and my friend to try our luck in the summer in Turkey. If we did not like it, we could go back to our country. In my family, my mother first went to Turkey as a domestic helper. Then, I came and my sister followed after me. We all work in domestic work. (Ms. K., Gagauz, 30 years old)

Among all the immigrant women, Ms. H. and Ms. C. are two who came to Turkey alone. However, their reasons for traveling alone are different. Ms. H. expressed that Moldovan women migrating Turkey were perceived as 'bad women' who are prostitutes, so she kept her migration decisions as a secret within her family:

> I was going to Moscow for construction work. Then I heard that people earn better in Turkey. I decided to try my luck in Turkey. I did not tell anybody except my family because our people believe that women leave their families to work as prostitutes in Turkey. So, I did not tell anybody about my decision. (Ms. H., Gagauz, 42 years old)

On the other hand, like other immigrant women, Ms. C had a relative working in Turkey. She did not even know the location of Turkey - it was simply a coincidence for her to find employment there.

> Why did I come here? I had not heard anything about Turkey before, so I was curious about this country. I was working in a hospital in the Philippines until 1992. My aunt married a Turkish man and was working as a baby-sitter in Turkey. Her employer asked her to find a Filipina caregiver for her old mother. One morning my uncle came to my house and asked me if I would like to work as a caregiver. I had already applied in Saudi Arabia to work in a hospital, but Turkey was my destiny. My employer prepared my visa and passport, bought my flight ticket, and sent them immediately. My visa arrived before the results of my application to Saudi Arabia, but I came here anyway. Thank God I am here! I heard that Saudi Arabia is a strictly Muslim country, but Turkey is a modern country. Thus, my first job in Turkey had been elderly care. Also, Turkish culture is a little similar to the Philippine culture. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)

Considering the narratives of immigrant women, it is obvious that having social networks in Turkey facilitated their decision to choose Turkey for seeking employment. The presence of social networks provided these women with a sense of security and a reassurance that they would not be alone. According to the Migration Systems Approach, network linkages play a crucial role in immigrant workers' decision to migrate overseas. Fawcett emphasizes that relational/family and personal network linkages influence the migration decision of individuals, in that successful emigrants serve as a model for aspiring emigrants. In accordance with this argument, women in the interviews stated that they had family members/relatives/friends in Turkey working in domestic service, who informed them about the working conditions and available domestic work. Furthermore, they said that commonalities in language and similarities of culture also had an influence in their preference to migrate Turkey for work. Therefore, their personal networks

played an important role in their decision to migrate to Turkey in search of employment in domestic service.

7.4. Process of Arrival in Turkey

7.4.1. Means of Transportation and Supporting Travel Expenses

Among the sixteen women, only Ms. C. did nothing to arrange her transportation and travel expenses. This was because her prospective employer sent her flight ticket and other travel documents to enter Turkey to her. Therefore, she had no idea of the travel costs. The other women, however, traveled by bus, ferryboat, or flight and supported their travel expenses by borrowing money from friends or relatives.

Immigrant women reported that they entered Turkey with tourist visas, which on average cost them $10. Additionally, how much they paid for the travel ticket depends on the means of transportation they used. Ten of sixteen women traveled to Turkey by bus. Among these women, Ms. A. stated that she took the bus coming from Bulgaria and paid 50 Bulgarian Leva (almost 50 YTL) for the ticket:

> Travel costs 50 YTL to come Turkey. My mother living in Berlin sent me money for travel costs including bus ticket and passport. I came here by bus. It lasted 12 hours. We came to Esenler bus station (otogar). (Ms. A., Bulgarian, 33 years old)

Immigrant women reported that traveling to Turkey cost them between $50-310. When compared with their average previous income in their country of origin, this amount was too high for them. Therefore, they relied upon their friends or relatives to help pay the travel expenses and in return promised them that they would repay their debts as soon as they received their first month wage:

> For the bus ticket and visa expenses, I borrowed $120 ($100 for the bus ticket and $20 for the visa) from my friends. I sent my first two and a half

> month's wage to my husband to pay this debt. (Ms. M., Crimean Turk, 34 years old)

When compared with traveling by bus or ferryboat, travel expenses were the highest for the women who took a flight to Turkey:

> When compared with our income, travel costs are very high. Two-way flight tickets are $250, plus $10 visa. I had saved money, and my family helped me to buy a travel ticket and pay for the visa expense. (Ms. I., Gagauz, 25 years old)

> I came to Turkey by flight. I did not have any savings; my son-in-law loaned me $900. I paid $10 for the visa, and $300 for the flight ticket. I stayed in my friends' Uzbek Hotel in Beyazıt. (Ms. F., Uzbek, 47 years old)

Only Ms. B. from Uzbekistan used multiple means of transportation to pay less for the travel expenses:

> I borrowed a total amount of $300 from my mother and my brother working in the bank for travel costs. Flights from Tashkent to Istanbul cost $415. My friend working in Turkey asked me for $200 to help me find a domestic work job. Had I paid her, the total amount of coming to Turkey would have added up to $700. I wanted to keep $100 for my self. My friend and I tried another way, because we did not have so much money. We traveled by train to Moscow for $60, and paid $180 for the flight from Moscow to Istanbul. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)

Immigrant women coming from Moldova (except Ms. I. and Ms. P.) mostly either used bus or ferryboat for transportation, and their destination point in Turkey was mostly Laleli. Some stated that they stayed in Laleli either in a hotel room or in the bus they traveled in until they found employment. According to the narratives of these women, Laleli is the place most Moldovan women work or stay. There they also meet other people from their homelands who could help arrange employment for them.

> On my first visit, I traveled by bus. I paid $90, which I borrowed from my sister. The bus arrived in Laleli. I met a Gagauz woman there, and she asked me if I would replace her for a month while she traveled to Moldova.

> She promised to find me a new job when returned to Turkey. I accepted. (Ms. D., Gagauz, 34 years old)

> I traveled by bus departing from Comrat. I paid $80 for the bus ticket. I borrowed that money from my neighbors and I sent them money as soon as I received my first wage. I stayed in the bus I traveled in on my first day. My sister was working in Turkey, but she could not find me a job immediately. I had no place to stay, nowhere to go at that time. I have heard about lewd Turkish men and I was afraid. I took a hotel room on my second day in Laleli. It was a very dirty room, and I am a very neat person so I was very disturbed. I was lucky; God helped me in the third day. While I was standing in Laleli with other women, a woman came and hired me to look after her mother. (Ms. L., Gagauz, 31 years old)

> In those times, buses from Chisinau were regularly commuting between Turkey and Moldova. I came to Turkey under very hard conditions. I had to borrow money to come. I traveled with a friend of mine from my town. She had a job, so she left me in Laleli. I did not have any money. I did not know where to go or what to do. I stood there all alone until evening. These buses coming from Chisinau stayed in the bus station. I asked the driver of the one I traveled on if I could stay in the bus. He said OK. Myself and other two newly arrived women spent the night in this bus. In the morning, we got up at 7.a.m. and stood outside with other women who were looking for employment. Prospective employers were coming and dealing with us. (Ms. H., Gagauz, 42 years old)

Among all immigrant women, only Ms. M. did not directly come to Istanbul. She had relatives in Eskişehir, so she went there first. However, she sought to arrange work in Istanbul afterwards since she had no friends in Eskişehir.

> My husband's uncle lives in Eskişehir. I called them and said that I was going to Turkey. Their family is rich. I first went to Eskişehir. My husband's uncle invited me to stay with his family in Eskişehir and work for them. But, I had no friends there. I was comfortable, going out whenever I wanted but I was so lonely. So, I wanted to go to Istanbul. He gave me money for the bus ticket. (Ms. M., Crimean Turk, 34 years old)

Finally, fifteen immigrant women stated that they did not apply to an agency in their homeland for travel and recruitment issues, but rather they themselves sought to arrange their travel and find their own employment through informal social networks. The reason behind this is that they did not trust the recruitment agencies. Among three other women, Ms. B. stated that she applied to an agency for

recruitment but she paid her own travel expenses; Ms. G. said that she paid $90 to a commission agency to arrange her travel and employment; and Ms. O. was swindled by a woman who promised her and other Moldovan women help in arranging their travel to Turkey. Ms. O. believed that this woman had conspired with border officers to share the money she obtained from innocent women:

> We traveled to Turkey by a bus passing through Bulgaria. A woman arranged our travel in return for $150 for travel and visa. There were thirty six women in the bus. This woman took our passports before the journey. When we came to the Turkey's border, she gave our passports back and then disappeared. The border officer told us that there would be no entrances from the borders for a week and then he sent us back. Then we heard that she did the same thing to other women. I tried to enter Turkey with another bus after twenty days, and that time I succeeded. (Ms. O., Gagauz, 46 years old)

When compared with their family incomes in their country of origin, travel expenses were very costly for the immigrant women to enter Turkey. They had to take money from their relatives/friends in order to obtain enough money for travel expenses. If their travel expenses are not provided by their employers or travel agencies, they sought to travel Turkey by bus or ferryboat in order to pay less for their journey. These two means of transportation were also mostly used by the immigrant women in Ege's research group (2002). On the other hand, existence of illegal agencies and dealers in the transportation of immigrant women to Turkey is an indicator of trade in domestic workers and the institutionalization of this trade through illegal agencies, as Heyzer and Wee proposed (1994) in their article.

7.4.2. Visa and Passport Issues

In the research group, all women obtained tourists visas for entering Turkey. The expiration dates of their visas ranged between fifteen days to three months. if they hold official passports, Moldovan citizens can obtain tourist visa for a month; Crimean citizens for two months; Bulgarian citizens for three months, Filipina citizens for one month; Uzbek citizens for one month, and Georgian citizens for

fifteen days at the Turkish border gates. All immigrant women reported that they held official passports, and obtained tourist visas for entering Turkey. Therefore, they entered Turkey legally. However, when they do not leave Turkey after their visas expired, they became illegal. Similarly, Kümbetoğlu (2005) found in her study that immigrant women entered Turkey legally, but worked illegally when they overstayed after their visa expired. Kümbetoğlu explicates that Turkey faced a new people movement since 1990s, which differs from the classical migrant definition and totally different from illegal migration but rather happens through legal entrances and departures.

7.5. Recruitment Process: Ways of Job Seeking in Turkey

In the research group, six women reported that they applied to a recruitment agency either in Turkey or in their homelands; three women stated that they replaced other women who were working in Turkey and wanted them to work in their workplace while they were visiting for their family in the country of origin; five women contacted their friends/relatives working in Turkey to find employment and three women found employment in Laleli after their arrival to Turkey.

7.5.1. Finding Work through Recruitment Agencies

Among six women, three went to the recruitment agencies in their homeland, and other three contacted recruitment agencies in Turkey after they arrived. When asked how they contacted these agencies, they told that their relatives or friends working with/in these agencies recommended them to contact these agencies:

> Women who returned to Moldova gave us the phone number and address of a recruitment agency in Istanbul. We contacted them and they found us work. (Ms. O., Gagauz, 46 years old)

> My daughters are working in a restaurant. One of their friends has a recruitment agency in Moldova. They arranged me work in Ankara. I did

> not pay them money, but my employer paid them $200 to employ me. I had a friend traveling with me and she also found work in Turkey. This agency met us in the airport and brought us to a hotel. The next day I met Ms. A. (the employer) and I started to look after her elderly mother. (Ms. P., Gagauz, 49 years old)

Ms. O. and Ms. P. stated that they applied to these agencies only for their first employments in Turkey, and when left their first work, they found their second employments through their informal networks. On the other hand, Ms. G. stated that she paid once $90 to a commission agency in Moldova and this agency arranged new works for her when she needed:

> I contacted a commission agency in Moldova to seek employment in Turkey. I paid $90 them. $90 is a big money for our people. They prepared my travel documents and visa. They first sent me to Istanbul. Their workers met me in Istanbul and then they sent me to Ankara for my first elderly-care work. I worked there for ten months. When the old lady I cared passed away, the same agency arranged me another job in Bodrum. (Ms. G., 48 years old, Gagauz)

Three immigrant women who contacted recruitment agencies in Turkey for employment stated that these agencies were illegal institutions. They do not make contracts with the employees, but rather with the employers ensuring them to change their employers if they are not satisfied with their work. However, these contracts are illegal and have no articles concerning the working conditions of the employee:

> Recruitment agencies do not sign legal contracts with the employers. Legal agencies do not work with foreign domestic workers, but work with Turkish ones. They do not know who you are, and what your address is because you are a foreigner. It is better for them to work with the Turkish ones. As foreigners, we work with cheaper illegal agencies for recruitment. (Ms. L., Gagauz, 31 years old)

> I usually found employment through my friends, and only in my last job I applied to the agency. They did not ask me to pay money for their service but from my employer. They signed a contract defining my day-offs and my monthly wage with the employer. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)

Immigrant women either kept working with recruitment agencies or find their next work through their social networks in Turkey. In the cases of two Uzbeks women, they stated that there is an Uzbek hotel in Beyazıt they stay at the times of they are unemployed or looking for a job:

> I paid $100 to a Turkish recruitment agency for finding me employment. After working in that work for a year, my friends found another work. My friends always helped me in finding new works. In the times I was unemployed, I stayed in the same Uzbek hotel and helped to the cleaning of the hotel in return for temporary accommodation. (Ms. F., Uzbek, 47 years old)

> I stayed in an Uzbek hotel in Istanbul where Uzbeks stay and work. After three days from arrival, I paid $200 for a recruitment agency to arrange me employment. When I wanted to change my employer, I applied to the same agency and they found me another employer. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)

As argued before, recruitment of immigrant domestic workers in host countries is an indicator of the institutionalization of domestic work as a trade through illegal agencies. In seven domestic workers case studies illustrated in chapter four, it was emphasized that despite the existence of legal recruitment agencies, there were lots of illegal agencies both in host and home countries making big money through providing travel documents and employment for immigrant women. Similarly, Ege reported that the immigrant women she interviewed mostly applied to the illegal agencies, either in Turkey or their home countries, making labor contracts with them and the Turkish employers. However, none of the immigrant women she and I interviewed stated that these contracts had conditions protecting the rights of them or defining their working conditions. It can be concluded that, as Goss and Lindquist put, the illegal national and international institutions have become like a social capital that migrants gain access to employment in Turkey.

7.5.2. Replacement

Women immigrant domestic workers enter Turkey with tourist visas, and commute between Turkey and their country of origin. When they do not want to lose their

employment in Turkey during their vacation, they ask other women to replace them. There were three women who found their first job in Turkey when they replaced their friends working in domestic service. When these women return to Turkey, the immigrant women who had replaced them could found their second job through their informal networks:

> I met a Gagauz woman in Laleli and she asked me if I would replace her for a month when she would be in Moldova. She promised me to find a new job for me when she would be back in Turkey. (Ms. D., Gagauz, 34 years old)

> My aunt was working in Turkey and she was going to travel Crimea. I replaced her during her vacation. After she returned, she found me employment. Usually our women travel here with other women seeking employment. (Ms. N, Crimean Turk, 41 years old)

> I replaced my friend who was going back to Moldova. I returned to my country after working seven month in my first job. I stayed in Moldova for a few years and this is my second time in Turkey. My friends arranged my second job. (Ms. E., Gagauz, 40 years old)

It can be concluded that in order to keep their works, immigrant domestic women workers ask their friends/relatives to replace them for a few months during their visits to their country of origin. As a result, replacing another domestic worker during her departure has been a way of seeking their first employment in Turkey for the immigrant women.

7.5.3. Relatives/Friends Working in Turkey

Having friends or relatives already working in Turkey is another way of seeking employment for immigrant women. In the research group, five women stated that they asked their relatives/friends to find them employment or they were informed by them about the employment opportunities in Turkey.

> My relatives in Turkey arranged an elderly-care job for me three month ago. My elder brother gave me money for the travel expenses, and I came to Turkey. (Ms. J., Georgian, 35 years old)

> My mother-in-law had been working in Turkey as a cleaning lady. She informed me that she knew someone looking for a babysitter. I came to Turkey and cared their children and cleaed their house for five month. Then I had to go to Berlin because my mother was ill. I looked after her for three months and my mother-in-law found me another domestic work in Turkey. (Ms. A., Bulgarian, 33 years old)

> My mother was working here. I told her to find me work. (Ms. K., Gagauz, 30 years old)

Only one woman came to Turkey after she heard from her sister that there was available work for her, but she was not employed there after her arrival. She told that she had to wait until her sister found her another place to work:

> I came here in 1998. My younger sister was working in domestic service in Turkey. Her employer's mother needed an elderly-caregiver. When I arrived in Turkey, they had gone to holiday. I called my sister but she told me "I have no guarantee to keep my job also, I can be dismissed easily. They do not have to keep their promises; it has no importance for them." (Ms. K., Gagauz, 30 years old)

On the other hand, Ms. M. went to the Crimean Turk's Association when she arrived in Istanbul. Then she was introduced by her friends with two Moldovan women, who were domestic workers, and they found her a domestic work.

Therefore, immigrant women could find domestic employment in Turkey either before they decided to migrate to Turkey or arrived in Turkey through their personal networks. In other words, having relatives/friends working in domestic work in Turkey was a means of job seeking in Turkey for immigrant women.

7.5.4. Laleli

As stated before, Laleli had been the arrival point of many immigrant women. It is because there are lots of textile stores owned by post-Soviet people[8] and also there is a bus terminal, wherein buses coming from post-Soviet countries arrive in. An addition, Moldovan immigrant women stated that their women gathered in Laleli to meet with the potential employers. This place functions as a marketplace where immigrant women gather and look for employers to employ them.

However, it is also very risky for them to deal with the employers whom they do not know. Immigrant women are just standing there all the day and looking for people to employ them. For instance, Ms. I. expressed that she was 'lucky' to find a good employer, but she could just grasp that the man asking her to be his domestic helper seemed to be a good man at the first sight. She would not see if he was also a good man without accepting his work offer and experiencing the working conditions in his house. But as she said, she had to find work. Otherwise, she had no place to go, but had to find work:

> When I first came to Istanbul with my friends, my employed friends went to their work and we went to Laleli, and stayed in the street for two days. Where could we go? There were lots of people convincing women by saying that they would give them work. I was lucky and found employment coincidentally. One of my employed friends recommended me to her employer's friend. He came to Laleli and we talked about the working conditions such as day-offs, my wage, working hours, etc. He said me that he has two children and living in a four-story villa. He needed a domestic helper for his house because his wife had passed away. He also wanted me to take care after his children. I came here for earning money, so I had no condition to work for him. I accepted his offer. He took my passport in that he would save me if something happens to me in Istanbul. (Ms. I., Gagauz, 25 years old)

---

[8] In her Book "Laleli-Moskova Mekiği", Yükseker (2003) states that Laleli was the focal district for the district suitcase traders and there are lots of textile stores mostly managed and owned by post-Soviet people.

On the other hand, Ms. H. was not so lucky in her first days at Laleli. Because she had spent all her money for her travel expenses, so she had to stay outside in the bus she traveled. In addition, she left her passport with her traveling company and had nobody in Istanbul:

> I forgot to take my passport from the woman I traveled with. She had given me her phone number. I called her, but she could not leave the household she was working at that time. She gave me the address of an agency that I could take my passport. I went there, but could not find the address. I cried all the day and came back to Laleli. People were offering me work, but then refused to employ me since I did not have my passport. I stood there for three days without eating and drinking anything. My hands and feet got swollen. On the third day, a family came and asked me to care their elderly mother who was living in Ankara. I told them I did not have my passport. They took the address of agency. We went there together and took my passport. Then, they brought me to their house. I took a bath and they fed me. They put me on a bus and I went to Ankara. Their relatives greeted me in the bus station and brought me to the elderly lady's house. (Ms. H., Gagauz, 42 years old)

When asked how they knew about the marketplace in Laleli, immigrant women replied that their relatives/friends informed them that they could find domestic work employment in Laleli. Since the arrival points of the buses they traveled were Laleli, they could stay in these buses until they found domestic work while waiting in the illegal marketplace there. Therefore, Laleli has become an important marketplace for immigrant women to seek their first employments when arrived in Turkey.

7.6. Frequency of Visits, Duration and Stay in Turkey

Except Ms. B., all immigrant women stated that they had regularly departed from Turkey once in a year since they started working in Turkey. However, Ms. B. reported that she had never visited her country during her three-year working life in Turkey. The total length of working time of immigrant women in Turkey ranged

from three months to twelve years. For example, Ms. C. reported that she entered Turkey in 1992 and visited her family every year, whereas Ms. J. arrived in Turkey only three months ago.

Immigrant women expressed that they are overwhelmed by the visa expiration fines they had to pay. Since they entered Turkey with tourist visa, when they overstay, they have to pay fines for their visa expiration. Since they would lose their works if they frequently visit their country, they try to extend their duration time in Turkey as much as possible. However, at that time they have to pay heavy visa expiration fines. They stated that they saved money for paying these fines and sometimes their employers helped them to pay them:

> We entered Turkey with tourist visa. After one month your visa become invalid and you become illegal. The visa expiration fines are very exhausting for our people. They are very high and we have to pay it to see our family. (Ms. G., Gagauz, 48 years old)

> We faced difficulties while traveling to Turkey. Turkey did not require for Uzbek people to obtain visa for traveling before. We had general visas (umumi vize). In the borser, we said the officials that we were coming Turkey for tourism not for employment so they gave tourist visa for ten days. Now I work and stay illegally here. I had never left Turkey yet. I will pay 1.500 YTL when leaving Turkey for my visa expiration fine. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)

> I always paid my visa expiration fines, my employers did not help me for this. For example I start saving money for the fines 3-4 month prior to the travel to my country. (Ms. D., Gagauz, 34 years old)

Among immigrant women, Bulgarian woman had the longest tourist visa time to stay in Turkey. She could stay in Turkey up to three month. She stated that she departed Turkey in every three months, thus she did not have to pay any visa expiration fines. Although she stayed in Turkey legally, she did not have work permit so worked illegally during every three months she resided in Turkey:

> We depart from Turkey in every three months. Our visas expire in three months in Turkey but we can say in European countries as long as we want.

> We have to stay in Bulgaria at least for one week and then we can enter Turkey again. We are not illegal workers here. We regularly depart from Turkey when our visas expire. We only work illegally here. (Ms. A., Bulgarian, 33 years old)

On the other hand, Ms. C., Ms. G., and Ms. H. were married with Turkish men after they started living in Turkey. Among these three women, only Ms. G. was still married with her husband and living with him. However, Ms. C. and Ms. H. stated that they made paper-marriages with Turkish men to obtain Turkish citizenship, work and stay permits in Turkey. While Ms. H. herself dealt with a Turkish man to marry her, Ms. C reported that she applied to an illegal agency her friends recommended her:

> In order to acquire Turkish citizenship, I dealt with an agency to arrange a formality marriage for me with a Turkish man. Most of my friends from the Philippines also got Turkish citizenship now, because they had made paper-marriages. They advised me to consult this agency. I paid $2000 to the agency for this paper-marriage. They deceived me, it was a fake deal. Then I paid the same amount of money to another agency. This agency found me a Turkish guy who was living with his father and they were very poor. That guy's house was ruined in the 1999 earthquake and he needed money to join the army. I gave him 50 YTL. I thought that the agency paid him also, but they did not. Poor guy…Just made this marriage for 50 YTL. His father loved me a lot. He offered me to stay with his son as his spouse. But I did not. I married him in 1999, and have never seen him again after obtaining my citizenship. I am still married with him, because I could not find time to divorce him. It was easy to get citizenship those days, just after the day you are married. Today, it became difficult; you have to stay longer to get citizenship. And these agencies arranging marriages are very rare, almost there are not any today. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)

> I did not have any problem about my visa. I married a Turkish man, stayed married for a year, and then divorced him because of incompatibility. It was a formality marriage. (Ms. H., 42 years old)

Therefore, among sixteen immigrant women only three women were working and staying in Turkey legally when I conducted the interviews.

On the other hand, two immigrant women informed me that changing their surnames through divorcing their husbands would be another way to get rid off heavy visa expiration fines. When they divorced their husbands, they took out new passports with their maiden names. Thus, when entering Turkey visiting their country, they did not have to pay the visa expiration fine at the Turkish border gates:

> I changed my passport in my first travel to Crimea. I divorced my husband, and started to use my maiden name. I took out a new passport with my maiden name. I had to do this, because my visa expiration fine was too much since I stayed continuously in Turkey for 1.5 years. I stayed in Crimea for eight month, and then came back to my work in Turkey. My employer helped me to pay the visa expiration fines. (Ms. N, Crimean Turk, 41 years old)

> My mother divorced my father to take out a new passport with her maiden name. She had to do it, to keep her work in Turkey. (Ms. K, Gagauz, 30 years old)

The frequency of visits, duration, and stay in Turkey of immigrant women depends on their financial situation. If they saved money or their employers help them for gathering money to pay their visa expiration fines, they could visit their families once in a year. Since the money they paid was at least three times more than their monthly wage, they would prefer to save this money rather than visiting their homelands. On the other hand, in order to get rid of visa expiration fines, immigrant domestic women workers could make paper marriages to get Turkish citizenship or divorced their husbands and got new passports with their maiden names. As Erder and Kaska (2003) emphasize in their reports, making paper-marriages was an alternative for immigrant women in order to obtain work and stay permits in Turkey. However, only two women made paper-marriages in my research group in that after 2003 citizenship law changed and they had to wait three years to get Turkish citizenship. On the other hand, the case of Ms. C. shows the existence of illegal agencies in Turkey arranging paper-marriages for immigrant women in return for thousand of U.S. dollars.

7.7. Lack of Information

In the interviews I asked immigrant women whether they had turned to their embassies when they faced problems in Turkey about their working conditions or other issues. Fourteen of sixteen women replied 'no'. The other two women stated that they turned to the embassy for passport and inheritance issues, but embassy officers were not helpful to them since they were illegal immigrant workers in Turkey:

> I turned to the embassy only once. My dad died and I had to give my power of attorney to my mother for the inheritance issues. I went to the embassy with my employer. The embassy officials asked me "You are working illegally. Why are you doing that?" I replied that I needed to earn money. They told me to earn money in my country. They wanted me to registrar to the embassy so that I would be paid pension in my retirement. They told me that if I lose my passport, I would turn them again. So I need to be registered. But if I do, I have to pay tax. I told them "if there were available work opportunities in Uzbekistan, I had not come to Turkey. Give me work in my country then." Anyway, they did my transactions for the attorneyship; it was because I had my employer with me there. (Ms. F., Uzbek, 47 years old)

> When my employer did not give me my passport while I was leaving her house, I stayed without passport in Turkey for months. I had to go to Ankara because Moldovan Embassy was in Ankara. They did not take out a new passport for me easily. I waited for a long time and could finally take my new passport. (Ms. K, Gagauz, 30 years old)

Besides, I noticed how a strong informal social network operates within immigrant women informing them about recent amendments in the Turkish law issuing immigrant workers in Turkey:

> My friends have two-month visas. When they show a valid excuse for staying in Turkey, they can extend their visas one month more. (Ms. N, Crimean Turk, 41 years old)

> If you show Turkish officials that you are working in a household, you can take work permit. I heard this from my friends. But I have not applied yet. I will think about this. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)

> I heard that Turkish citizenship law has changed. You can not obtain citizenship anymore. You have to stay three years, as far as I know, after marriage. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)

Also, they can follow the recent news related to their immigrant status through media:

> I read in the internet that if you prove that you are Gagauz Turk, then you can obtain Turkish citizenship. I will apply for this. (Ms. K., Gagauz, 30 years old)

Yet, only one immigrant woman who is a Filipina expressed that she felt comfortable about turning to the embassy if she would have a problem in Turkey. As stated in chapter six, Filipina government has a strong immigrant worker recruitment policy with the receiving countries and helps to the illegal immigrant workers when they need. Accordingly, Ms. C. was informed about this situation:

> I know our consulate helps to us, but I have not needed help or instruction from them yet. For example, if the employer treats you badly or you lost your passport, you can turn to the embassy. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)

However, she expressed that she faced difficulties with her Turkish employers, but did not turn to the embassy but rather she handled herproblems by herself.

It seems like immigrant domestic women workers were looking for the ways to better off their working conditions and lives in Turkey rather than living as 'illegal immigrants' in Turkey. However, instead of turning to the formal institutions or their embassies for taking advice or help because of their fear of deportation, they prefer keeping in contact with their friends in Turkey, who are also immigrant workers. Also in the seven cases studies provided in chapter four, the researchers emphasize that immigrant domestic women workers did not apply for institutional help when they faced problem in the host countries. As Kümbetoğlu (2005) points, personal network serves a solidarity network among immigrant women in Turkey. She stated that social supports was an important basis when immigrant women

passing the processes of harmony, help and information in their first years in Turkey.

7.8. Concluding Remarks and Evaluations on the Migration Experiences of Immigrant Domestic Women Workers in Turkey

According to the narratives of interviewed immigrant women, it can be concluded that they solely rely on the informal and/or social networks both in their arrival and employment seeking processes in Turkey. Additionally, having informal and/or social networks also have an important role in their decision to cross borders for seeking employment, since they met immigrant women from their country of origin, who had migrated for earning income. In their words, if other women found employment in Turkey, they would 'try their luck' abroad, too. However, they would also be deceived through these networks as in the cases of Ms. O., who was swindled by the woman arranging the travel to Turkey; and of Ms. C., who paid huge amount of money to an illegal agency for paper-marriage, then also swindled by the same agency. What throws immigrant women into this situation is firstly "feminization of unemployment" as a result of the overall economic deprivation in their country. They were either dismissed, or working in unpaid or low-paid works in their country of origin. Since their husbands or parents were unemployed or dismissed, they took the responsibility for their family maintenance. However, their illegal status in Turkey drove them to bear heavy conditions also in Turkey. They can not frequently visit their families in that they have to pay heavy visa expiration fines when re-entering Turkey. Additionally, they can not turn to their embassies when facing problems because of their fear of deportation. Therefore, as immigrant women they are in a vulnerable position in Turkey. As stated in chapter five, Turkey does not have an institutionalized recruitment system of immigrant domestic workers in Turkey. Additionally, as showed in the previous chapter, embassy officers reported that they have bilateral recruitment agreements with many countries, but not with Turkey. Thus, immigrant women are all alone and open to

exploitation during their migration and working experiences in Turkey, because they are forced to work illegally as a result of their 'visible desperation' both in sending and receiving countries. They are informally informed about Turkey's new policies issuing immigrant workers; however, immigrant women I interviewed have not taken action on these new applications yet. Only three women in the research group have work and stay permits in Turkey before 2003 by obtaining Turkish citizenship based on paper-marriages. Yet, this is not a solution for the immigrant women anymore since new citizenship law requires foreigners, who married Turkish citizens, to remain married with them for three years in order to acquire citizenship. At that point, both the sending and receiving countries have to take steps for bilateral agreements for the recruitment and protection of immigrant women workers in Turkey. Otherwise, immigrant women will maintain their reliance upon illegal institutions and networks for these issues. In the next chapter, immigrant women's working experiences are discussed in order to investigate how their illegal status affects their lives in Turkey.

CHAPTER VIII

WORKING AND LIVING EXPERIENCES OF IMMIGRANT DOMESTIC WOMEN WORKERS IN TURKEY

8.1. Introduction

The aim of this chapter is to shed light upon the working and living experiences of immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey. Accordingly, immigrant domestic women workers are asked about their working conditions, their relationships with their employers, their social lives, the problems caused by their immigrant and illegal statuses in Turkey, their families left behind, and their personal opinions on their work, employers, and life in Turkey.

8.2. Work Experiences

8.2.1. Work Definitions and Everyday Routine of Domestic Work

In the interviews, immigrant domestic women workers defined their works in three categories: babysitting, elderly-care, and housework. Among sixteen women, six women are providing elderly care, six women are working as babysitters, and four women are employed for housework in their recent works. However, these three work categories are not mutually exclusive categories in that all immigrant women reported that they were also responsible for other chores in the household in

addition to their primary responsibilities. Ege (2002) also reported that the immigrant domestic women workers she interviewed were responsible for other works in the house they worked other than their primarily responsibilities. In my study, this situation is particularly significant when immigrant women are live-in workers. Fourteen out of sixteen immigrant women are employed as live-in domestic workers. Since they are live-in workers, they are expected to handle other works in the household. At the same time, they feel like they have to obey their employers since they would be fired if they do not do what their employers want them to do. For example, Ms. C.'s was a nurse before coming to Turkey and she supposed that she was employed solely for care work by her employers. However, she was expected to do housework at the same time. In addition, because she is fluent in English, she was expected to teach English to the children of her employers:

> My first work was elderly-care, and then worked in a house as a cleaning lady and babysitter. Now, in my recent work my sole work is babysitting. I also teach English to the children I care. Unfortunately, most of my employers having children wanted me teach English to them in addition to the cleaning. I did not want to stay unemployed, so did what they wanted me. My former employer wanted me to handle everything at the household. She hired me for babysitting, then she hired an au-pair and my work shifted to the housework, and then to the kitchen. My wage declined as I shifted to the dirtier works in the house. She always said me that her friends would find her another woman for her if she wanted. In that way, she had never increased my wage, because she believed that she paid me too much. She often said: "I would hire two women with this wage if I want rather than paying you that much." That was the way she made me to do all the work she wanted. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)

For the babysitters whose employers work outside, they are expected to do the all housework including cooking. For instance, Ms. J.'s first work was elderly care, and then she found a babysitting work in another house because she did not like her employer. However, her second employer was working in a bank six days a week and wanted her to do all the housework at home in addition to babysitting. At the time I met her, she was working in her recent work for two months and already exhausted with the daily workload:

> They hired me for child-caring, but I do everything. I work here almost eighteen hours. The Madam works and she has two children. I sleep in the couch in the living room when everybody sleeps. They get up 7 a.m., and I have to get up at the same time and work until they go to the bed. I feel so sorry because I work here. The housework never finishes. They are very naughty boys and I always have to clean the house and tidy up. What will I do here? (She cries) Elderly care was easier. I could finish my work in an hour and then sit all the day. But here, I am standing on foot all the day and always working. What will I do here? (Ms. J., Georgian, 35 years old)

Another immigrant woman whose work was babysitting complained about her overburden at the household she is working:

> I am in Turkey for seven years and during this time I always protected my rights. I talked clearly with my employers about my day-off and my wage before I start working for them. You should have time for yourself when working. I have been babysitting in my recent work now. The Madam wants me to do housework which is out of my responsibility. She has a cleaning lady coming to the house for three days in a week and she still expects me to do housework because I am a live-in worker. People should rest after work if they want to be effective at work. She rests at nights and then goes to bed. I look after her child until morning. I am available twenty-four hours for her family. They were living in a two-story house when I started working for them. Then, they moved to a 4-story villa. I do all the housework. When she wants me to do something, I can not say no because our people (Gagauz people) are pleasant. My employers want to exploit me. (Ms. L, Gagauz, 31 years old)

On the other hand, Ms. D. stated that she was responsible both for housework and babysitting in her current work. Her employer wants her to do the housework when her child is at school:

> I am responsible primarily from the child now. The child goes to school every day. I prepare the breakfast of my employers before I go to the bed. They have their breakfast in the morning. I get up after they leave the house for work. I send the child to the school. They all are not at home all the day, and I am comfortable. The child comes home at 5 p.m. I take her to the playground and play together. Then, I prepare the dinner. After I do the dishes, I ask them whether they want anything else. They always say, “we can get if we need”. I go to my room around 10 p.m. (Ms. D., Gagauz, 34 years old)

There are also cases that although babysitters are not expected to do the housework, they want to help to their employers or the cleaning lady. They told that if they were treated well by their employers, they wanted to help to the housework:

> All my work here is planned by the Madam. She is a psychologist, and teaching at the university. At first, I did not easily get used to have a planned daily schedule, and then I did. The babies also are used to have their days planned. The twins get up at 6 a.m., and sleep at 8 p.m. When they sleep in the daytime, I have break. Although the madam has a cleaning lady coming regularly, I help her. I want to help because I live here. Since she is a good employer, so I feel like doing housework and help the cleaning lady; here is like my own home. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)

Immigrant domestic women workers who were hired for elderly-care reported that they were living in a separate apartment with the elderly they were caring, so they were also responsible for the housework. In addition, they said that they had had no training for elderly care prior to their migration to Turkey but they learned by the time they worked in Turkey:

> My first work was elderly care. I also did the housework. There was nobody doing the housework, I had to do. The madam was ill, and her husband was bedridden. I did not know hot to give injection, but I learned there. I learned everything by the time. (Ms. G., Gagauz, 48 years old)

> I could only work for a month in my first work here, because the old lady I cared passed away. She was like my second mother. Her children hired me for nursing her. I had learned how to inject in the school. I was used to inject her medicines to her to decrease her pain every day. She was too ill. I stayed with them until I found a new work. They were very nice people. (Ms. L, Gagauz, 31 years old)

> I like elderly care. The Madam is like my mother. We get up at 7 a.m. in the morning and have breakfast. I cook and do the dishes. The Madam's daughter taught me Turkish cuisine. A cleaning lady comes once a week to the house and I help her. I like cleaning. There is dishwasher in the house. It is not a heavy burden for me. (Ms. M, Crimean, 34 years old)

In addition, providers of elderly care said that they were not very tired of their workload because they themselves could manage their work schedule. They

prepared the meals, gave the medications to the elderly on time, and did the laundry and cleaning. Since they are mostly expected to accompany the elderly people they care, they have time for breaks. When asked why they preferred elderly-care, some of them stated that it was not a heavy burden for them when compared with child-care:

> I do not work in a house that I am responsible for the children. It is a heavy responsibility. In all my works here I worked in elderly-care. (Ms. O, Gagauz, 46 years old)

On the other hand, two women stated that they had not chosen to work in elderly-care intentionally but the only work available while they were searching was elderly-care. In other words, if they were asked for babysitting or doing housework, they would accept in order to earn money.

Yet, elderly-care would be more boring than other works in that immigrant women have to stay at home with the elderly they care all the time. Parreñas (2002) states that elderly caregivers were overwhelmed by social isolation and loneliness since this work had a physically demanding workload. For instance, Ms. O. said that she felt lonely at home because the elderly woman she cared usually stayed on bed and she did not go out:

> We get up at 9 a.m. and have our breakfast together. I clean the house and cook for us. I wash her clothes everyday because she has paralysis and wets on her clothes. It is fine for me if I have things to do here. Otherwise, I get bored and have time to fall into thoughts. We were at home during the winter. The time passed very slowly for me. She is like my mother and I feel like at home here. But I miss my children and my house anyway. (Ms. O, Gagauz, 46 years old)

In addition, Ms. J. stated that her former work was elderly-care. She was very bored of accompanying an elderly man all the time at home that she found another work:

> This is my second work in Turkey. My first work was elderly care. I worked there for two month. The old man was very capricious. He would not take his medicines, and never talk to me. When it is time to take bath, he would not want it, too. He would not let me to watch television. I was very bored there. (Ms. J., Georgian, 35 years old)

Ms. G. was another woman in the research group who was working as a part-time elderly-caregiver. She was living with her Turkish husband in a separate apartment in the basement floor of the building where her employer lived. Her husband was the housekeeper of this building. Ms. G. stated that her employer was a very old woman and always needed a person accompanying her while she was sleeping at night. There was a regular domestic helper in her house, and Ms. G. was staying with the elderly woman between 4 p.m. and 8 a.m. while the domestic helper was not at home. She expressed that she was mostly sleeping during this period, and if the Madam wanted to go to the toilet or need water, she helped her.

Second part-time women worker in the research group, Ms. A., was employed for housework and cleaning in her recent work. Her husband also works in a factory in Istanbul and they live together. She has a regular working schedule, and leaves the house she works at a particular time unless her employer does not need her:

> I work six days a week, and sometimes have two day-offs in every two weeks. I usually work between 9 a.m. to 5 p.m. I do service, cleaning, and also tiding up. But if the madam has guests for the dinner, I stay longer and help her. I do not like babysitting. I have goiter and easily get nervous so cannot care children. I prefer cleaning to childcare. At least I am free when cleaning. Childcare is burdensome. You do not have specific working hours when caring children. Now, I leave the house when I finish my tasks. (Ms. A., Bulgarian, 33 years old)

Except Ms. B., none of the immigrant domestic women workers have scheduled daily works to do. They usually have flexible daily plans depending on their employer's schedule. Similarly, Ege (2002) states that the daily work plans of the immigrant domestic women workers she interviewed were flexible and depending on their employers' schedule.

According to their narratives, it is obvious that all these women are perceived as 'domestic servants' by their employer that they are responsible for wholly or partially for the housework in the household they are employed. In addition, except part-time workers and Ms. B., rest of the immigrant women workers do not have regular working hours. Since they are live-in workers, they are expected to serve to their employers until they go to bed and their total hours of work range between 11 to 19 hours in a day. Since they are paid on monthly basis, they are unpaid by their employers for their extra working times. In her study with Filipina domestic workers, Weyland (1994) argue that immigrant domestic women workers were subject to exploitation because of their vulnerable position as illegal and live-in housekeepers. Similarly, in the case studies provided in chapter four, it was reported that immigrant domestic women workers overworked and had extremely long hours of work without overtime pay because they worked illegally.

8.2.2. Wages

All the women reported that their salaries were paid monthly usually in dollars and only two of them were paid in Turkish Liras. Six out of sixteen women are paid $300 a month, which is amount of the lowest wage paid to the immigrant domestic women workers. Ms. A. is paid $300 per month for her part-time work which almost takes forty-eight hours a week. On the other hand, other five women who are paid the same amount of money work in multiple tasks and are live-in workers, which mean that they are available for twenty-four hours for their employers. The highest amount of wage, $1000, is paid to Ms. B., Ms. C., and Ms. L. who are babysitters. There is no basis for explaining why these three women are paid almost three times more than other immigrant domestic women workers. For example, Ms. C. is a Filipina nurse with a university graduate degree. However, she was employed in housework and elderly care before and paid half amount of her recent babysitting work. There are six university graduates among the women, but their salaries vary between $350 and $1000. Additionally, most of the women stated that they worked in different domestic services such as elderly-care,

babysitting, and housework during the time they have been working in Turkey. Therefore, it can not be concluded that a particular domestic work is paid more than the others due to the immigrant women's human capital in terms of level of education, training, or profession.

Moreover, women stated that when they found an available employment that they would be paid more, they quitted their recent work and started working in that better paid work. They also reported that they were paid very little in their first work and they were paid more every time they changed their workplaces. When considering the way that immigrant domestic women workers find or hear about the available works, the reason behind the wage gap between the immigrant women can be understood:

> My first work was elderly care and I worked for a month. I replaced my friend's place when she was in Moldova. The madam was a lawyer and her husband had paralysis. They offered me only 15 YTL (in 2000). The Madam told me that I did not speak Turkish and they taught me elderly-care there. So, what I deserved for a month was only 15 YTL! I did not tell her anything. I cried so much, and went to my sister. My sister called them and said that I had two children and came to Turkey for earning money, how they would do that to me. Still, they did not give my money. I worked in different places here. In five years I cared elderly people, I watched dogs, and I did housework. I can say that I worked for ten different families here. Now, I am babysitting. I was paid $300 in my previous work, and when found a better paid work, I moved to that. We are coming Turkey for working, not for enjoying ourselves. (Ms. D., Gagauz, 34 years old)

> The agency found my first work. I worked there for five months and was paid 250 YTL per month. I was comfortable in this household. The child was twelve years old. I looked after him. I quitted that work because the exchange value of dollar was high at that time. That amount of wage was very low. I came to Turkey for earning money. (Ms. F., Uzbek, 47 years old)

As stated in the previous chapter, immigrant women mostly seek employment in Turkey through their informal social networks. They have family members, friends, and relatives working as domestic workers in Turkey. Through these networks, they are informed about the available better-paid works and have the opportunity to

change workplace, since their primary concern to come to Turkey is earning money. However, two immigrant women told that their friends informed them about better-paid works and they did not want to move because they either had close ties with the household they work or they were comfortable with their working conditions:

> I have been looking after an eight year old child for five years. I love her too much. Her mother is a good and easy going employer. I do ironing when the child is at school. She gives me gifts, and sometimes pocket money in my day-offs. For example, she gave me 50 YTL today. She pays me $300 a month. I know other girls are paid more. Because I am a teacher and a pedagogue, people want to hire me. I would easily find a better paid work. The Madam has never increased my wage. In my last visit to Moldova, I stayed longer than I had told her. She shouted at me on the phone and said 'How can you do this to me?' When I said I want more wage, she increased only $50. I want to talk with her about my wage, but I know that although I am right about this issue, she will not want to increase my wage. I do not talk with her about this anymore. I love her child like my child. I do not want to change my working place. So I remain silence. (Ms. K, Gagauz, 30 years old)

> My current employers are younger than me. I am comfortable here. We are like friends. I feel like I am living in my home. For example, my friends recommended me another work last week; part-time babysitting, not a live-in work. But I get used to the baby I am caring now. My employers are good people. Their baby is only fifteen days old, how can I leave them? They hired me for the baby, I can not leave them. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)

Ms. C. also said that she knew how much other Filipina women domestic workers were paid in other foreign countries. She had difficulties about increasing the amount of her wage in her former employment. She stated that she was new in Turkey and could not change her employer easily until she met other Filipina women in Istanbul:

> I have had no problem about regular wage payment. Only Madam R. was forgetting to pay my wage. She would pay me ten days later. She would expect me to inform her about the children and house every hour when she was out at nights. Then, she told me I was paid too much. You work twenty four hours a day in Turkey, but you are not paid in the equal amount. But other foreign employers want you to make eight hours a day, and pay you for every extra hour you worked. For example I asked Madam R. to increase my wage a little, she blustered me to complain to her father. Her

> husband knew nothing. She also knew I was right, but continue to behave me in the same way. I waited until my friend working in the same neighborhood found me a better paid babysitting work. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)

Furthermore, when compared with the wages they took in their country of origin, immigrant domestic women workers are paid ten times more or less in Turkey. The wage differentials between the sending and receiving country are the most important incentives for women in term of their migration decision and their tolerance to their Turkish employers. Similarly, in her study Ege (2002) also stated that wage differentials wage differentials played an important role in women's decision to seek employment in Turkey.

8.2.3. Supplementary Wages and Social Security

Many immigrant domestic women workers told that their employers provided them financial support in their day-off, for their doctor visits and medicine expenses, or for the payment of their visa expiration fines if they returned to their work after they visited their homeland. Three immigrant domestic women workers stated that their employer gave them 10-20 YTL in their day-offs. In addition, three immigrant women said that their employers wanted to pay for their visa expiration fines when they visited country. Sometimes the employer gives gifts to their domestic worker:

> Madam N. takes gifts for my children when I got to my country to visit my family. She is a very nice employer. I also brought gifts to her family but she said me that there was no need for me to take gifts for her in return, I should save my money for my children. (Ms. A., Bulgarian, 33 years old)

When asked who paid for the doctor if they needed medication during their work time in Turkey, one woman reported that her employer supported the expenses, and the other said that she left her work because her employer did not take her to the doctor, and another said that she did not go to the doctor when she became sick:

> I was very ill once. My head became like a bald person's head. I went to the doctor, and he said me to return my country because my disease was caused by heavy stress. I did not want to return, I insisted on treat myself. I used medicines, Madam R. paid for my treatment. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)

> I do not see well, because I am over forty years. In my previous work, I was cleaning the bathroom. The bathrooms floor was covered with white marble. The Madam told me after cleaning that I did not take the hair on the floor. She said me the same thing every time I cleaned the floors. How could not she see that it was not because I am a dirty women but I needed to go to the doctor. I did not have money to visit doctor and take eyeglasses. I could not bear this situation anymore. Why did not she bring me to the doctor? It was very humiliating, and I found another work. (Ms. O, Gagauz, 46 years old)

> I have never gone to the doctor. Doctor fee is very expensive here. Will I pay for him also? Off course no! We brought every kind of medicine with us when coming to Turkey for saving our wage for our family. But my former employer was a very good person. My husband is still working in her husband's factory. She gave me her empty house and did not want us to pay rent for it. (Ms. A., Bulgarian, 33 years old)

Finally, Ms. M. said that her employer paid for her needs such as hygienic pad, and shampoo in addition to supporting her visa expiration fines.

> My friends found me this work. The Madam said me at the beginning that I would be paid $300 monthly, and have my day-off on Sundays. I wanted more money, because this amount was not enough for paying my debts. She told me that she would pay for all my expenses, and then I accepted. I went to the Madam's daughter's house for cleaning on my day-off for extra money. They are good people. They pay my visa expiration fines. (Ms. M, Crimean, 34 years old)

Immigrant domestic women workers told that they did not usually talk about supplementary wages that the employer would provide after recruitment. However, these kind of financial supports are available for the immigrant domestic women workers depending on their relationships with their employers.

Furthermore, none of the immigrant women have social security. Even the ones who had acquired Turkish citizenship and have work permits do not have social security. For instance, Ms. C. stated that she did not plan to stay in Turkey in the

future, so she did not ask for social security to her employers after she obtained Turkish citizenship and work permit.

In Ege's and Weyland's studies with immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey, except one woman in Ege's study population, none of the immigrant women stated that they had social security and work permits. However, immigrant women in Ege's population reported that their employers gave supplementary wages such as pocket money to them in their day-offs, and bought almost everything they needed. Since immigrant women do not have labor contract requiring their employers to provide insurance that cover medical, accident, or repatriation, as in the Lebanon case, these kind of supports are available for them depending on the willingness of their employers.

8.2.4. Remittances

The way that immigrant domestic women workers spend, save, and remit their wage varies according to their marital status, their connection with their families left behind, and their social life in Turkey. All the married women reported that they sent almost all of their salaries to their families in the country of origin. Since they are live-in workers, they do not need to spend money for accommodation, food, and cloths. Most of married women have their children going to school, so they send money primarily for their education. In addition, they stated that the money they remit to their families was mostly spent for household utilities such as water, gas, and oil, and for construction of their new houses. They would also send their families clothes, gifts, and Turkish goods such as china and deserts that cannot be found in their homeland. Among immigrant women, three of them send money regularly by bank, cargo, or Western Union, and the other remit through their friends or relatives returning to their country of origin. Sometimes they would give their wages to the bus drivers regularly commuting between their homeland and Laleli. Those who apply to their social networks for remitting their money cannot

regularly remit their wage for their families, but save their wage and wait until somebody they know would travel to their homeland:

> I do not spend money for myself. I send my entire wage to my daughters through Finansbank. They are young women. Their needs never end; they buy cosmetics, textile, jewelry…I do not need to spend money because I do not leave the house. (Ms. P, Gagauz, 46 years old)

> My children visit us in Turkey in summer holiday for three months. They went back to Bulgaria before their school starts. My mother-in-law cares them. I send her all my wage to care my children. I and my husband use my husband's salary for ourselves in Turkey. (Ms. A., Bulgarian, 33 years old)

> I send almost all of the money I earned here; let's say ninety per cent of my wage. I do not send regularly, but if I have friends going to my country, I give them money to take to my family. I keep a little money for myself. Everything can happen here. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)

> I send money for my son and my step-sister when my friends travel to Moldova. (Ms. H., Gagauz, 42 years old)

> Sometimes I send all the wage I took, sometimes buy gifts for my children and send them. (Ms. D., Gagauz, 34 years old)

On the other hand, three single immigrant domestic women workers spend or save a part of their wage for themselves and the other singles sending their entire wage to their families. For instance, Ms. C. and Ms. E. stated that they sometimes remit some money when their families need:

> Sometimes I spent all my wage in a day. I do not know why, I spend money like a maniac. I am matured now. I save my money. I send staff that my family could not find in our country like Paşabahçe porcelain and china, and Turkish delight through cargo to them. I visit my family one month in a year. I send them money through bank when they need. Sometimes I send $500, sometimes more…It depends. They do not usually need money. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)

> I send money to my siblings through Western Union when they want. I do not send regularly. For example, I have already sent them $100. I spend money for myself. I do whatever I want with my wage. (Ms. E., Gagauz, 40 years old)

However, it is important to note that Ms. C and Ms. E. stated that their families made their livings through their pensions and do not need extra money from them. Also, they do not have any siblings living with their families, but rather all their siblings are married and have their works. When considering that these two women said that they migrated to Turkey for having new experiences, being more independent and earning better wages, it is obvious that they work in Turkey for themselves and save money for their future lives.

However, the other single immigrant women said that they save a little amount of their wage for themselves and send most part of their wage regularly to their families:

> I regularly send money with my friends visiting Moldova. My mother wants me to save money for myself. But if I do not send them I would feel very bad. I send them clothes, ceramic goods, Turkish deserts. (Ms. I., Gagauz, 25 years old)

> I send all my wage to my family with my friends and the bus drivers going to Moldova so that they can pay the bills. Sometimes, the packets are opened in the border gates by the customhouse officers, but it is OK. I do not spend too much for myself, I only buy clothes. (Ms. K, Gagauz, 30 years old)

> I send all my wage to my family with the bus drivers going to the Moldova. However, their needs never stop, and money is never enough for them. Goods are more expensive here, but I buy some clothes for them. My siblings like wearing clothes made in Turkey. (Ms. L, Gagauz, 31 years old)

Except two of them, all other women remit most part of their wage to their families left behind. This is not a surprising situation since their primary concern to migrate Turkey was to earn money for the maintenance of their families in the country of origin. Similarly, Kümbetoğlu and Ege also report that the immigrant women they interviewed remitted most part of their waged to their family in their homelands.

8.2.5. Day-offs and Work Permits

Twelve immigrant domestic women workers out of sixteen reported that they have one day-off in a week in their recent work. Only Ms. J. had never gone out of the house she was working for two month. She was the newest women in Turkey among the research group. She had arrived in Turkey three months ago, and she was working in her second work when I met her. She told me that her employer said nothing about her day-off, so she was waiting from her to let her for a rest. She was so sorry when I met her. Although her Turkish was not good, she wanted me to stay with her more after I completed the interview just to have somebody with her. She said that she was about lose her mind because she did not see anybody out of the household, and she was so lonely and desperate. She showed me the photographs of her family and talked about them. Yet, I had to leave her to meet with other immigrant women.

Although most of the immigrant domestic women workers have regular day-offs in their recent works, they faced the same difficulty with Ms. J. in their former works:

> I have worked in seven different houses since I came to Turkey. The agency arranged my first work for babysitting. My employers were expecting twins, and I worked in their mother's house until twins came to the world. They paid me $135 a month. They taught me Turkish cuisine. They told me that I would do every work in the household. I had to work, and it was domestic work that I used to do it in my own house, so I thought there was no need to be afraid of. I stayed in that house until I earned as much to pay my debts. When the madam gave birth, they wanted me to get blood test. I am foreigner; I know it is because of that. Twins were their first children, and they treated me differently after twins came to the world. The parents went back to their work after birth. I was both babysitting and doing the domestic work. Just for $135 a month. I worked there for five months; in first three months I had no day-offs, and in the last two months, just two days in a month. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)

> My second employer was very a capricious woman. She did not let me to have any day-offs during two months, and I was responsible for everything at home including the care of her child, cleaning, and cooking. I was very embarrassed in these two months. I needed to have a rest. She always told me that I would have four-day vacation in the Ramadan Feast when they

> would be in holiday. I showed patience because I needed money for paying my debts. One day the cleaning lady left the house before completing the cleaning. The Madam shouted at me. She told me that I am old and forget the things to be done. I replied 'Yes, I am a stupid and stupid people like me should work in other houses. She fired me. She checked my suitcases to see whether I stole anything from the house. She gave my wage and I left the house. She offered me to stay that night at home, but I did not accept. That was the first time I left the house, not because it was my day-off but I was fired. (Ms. F., Uzbek, 47 years old)

On the other hand, three women stated that they prefer not to use their day-offs but rather stay at home. Among the reasons they prefer staying at home every day of the week is that they do not want to spend money outside or they are afraid of being caught by the police:

> There is not a particular day I have my day-off. It depends on their program. I do not go out. I prefer staying at home. I did not come here to spend money. What will I do outside? (Ms. O, Gagauz, 46 years old)

> I heard the police gather foreign women for deportation. I just go out to walk around the district for almost an hour when I get bored. I know young Moldovan women go to the park in Maltepe, chat and have fun there. Policemen stop women, I know. I am not young. I did not come here to spend money; but rather for earning money. (Ms. P, Gagauz, 46 years old)

Among three women who do not have day-offs, Ms. M. told that she cleaned the house of her employer's daughter to get extra money.

In seven case studies illustrated in chapter four, it was stated that most of immigrant women were imprisoned to their workplace and did not have day-offs. However, in my study, although a few immigrant women were not let to have day-offs, most of them preferred to stay at home because of their fear to be captured by the police. Similarly, Kümbetoğlu (2005) noted that because of their illegal migrant status, Filipina women domestic workers in Istanbul were afraid of being captured by the legal authorities when they leave the house, which make the house they worked as a prison for them. Therefore, it can be concluded that immigrant domestic women

workers confine themselves to their workplace because of their illegal status, which resulted with social isolation and feeling of loneliness.

8.2.6. Relationship with Their Employers and Workplace Abuses

Immigrant domestic women workers defined the people who hire them as 'good' and 'bad' employers. The criterion for the distinction between having a good or bad employer is how the employers treat themselves. For instance, if the employers do not interrupt their work, respect them, let them have breaks and day-offs, provide them adequate food, and pay their salaries regularly then they are good employers. The employers, who force immigrant domestic women workers to overwork, confine them to the house, pay their salaries irregularly or less than they deserve, and behave them as if they are slaves are perceived as bad employers. Similarly, Chin (1997) and Kümbetoğlu (2005) write that immigrant women they interviewed expressed their desire to be perceived and treated as human beings deserving of respect by their employer. In addition, in their study with Turkish domestic women workers, who migrated from rural provinces of Turkey to Ankara, Kalaycioglu and Ruttersberger-Tilic (2000) emphasize that domestic workers were more willing to work for their employers if they are respected by them. Also they note that ther are cases that domestic workers quitted working for their employers because of the humiliating behavior of their employers' agains them.

When asked how their employers treated them while working in Turkey, six out of sixteen immigrant domestic women workers expressed that they were comfortable with their employers and had had no problems with any of their employers yet. These women stated that their employers made them feel like they were just one of their families. For the ones who provide elderly care, they manage the household and feel like their employers are their parents:

> I am happy with current work here. The Madam is seventy five years old and her husband is eighty five years old. They are rich people. I help Madam to do housework. I do not feel like a stranger in this house. I am like their daughter. They treat me well. They took me out to the cinema and restaurant. They support my needs. When I am sick, they buy my medicine and pay for the doctor. I do not pay anything for my special needs, they support all. I am comfortable in their house. I sing when I want; I take a rest when I am tired. I heard some employers want their workers to stand all the day, but mines do not. (Ms. H., Gagauz, 42 years old)

> This is my second work in Turkey. My employers are like my parents. I wake up at 7.00 a.m. in the morning and go to bed at nights when I want. We watch television together. I can go outside when I want. I go to the marketplace twice a week. They are good employers. I am like the Madam of the house. I cook whatever I want. (Ms. E., Gagauz, 40 years old)

However, Ms. O. said that although her employers treat her well, she knew that she was employed for the housework and she is a worker in the house:

> Nowhere can be like your home. I can not get up whenever I want in the mornings. I call them 'mother' and 'father'. But, I do not want to be in a situation that they would ask me why I did not do my work. It never happened but if I can not get up on time and prepare their breakfast, I would feel very ashamed.(Ms. O, Gagauz, 46 years old)

Ms. I. is responsible for all the housework and the care of her widowed employer's children in the house she works. She stated that this was her second work. She expressed that she felt like the madam of the house she worked, and the children she cared were like her own children:

> We wake up at seven o'clock in the morning. I prepare the breakfast for the children. They go to school and I start cleaning the house, then cook. We have dinner together, and watch television after dinner. We do everything together. They tell me everything about them. We solve the problems together. I go to the bed whenever I want. I am happier here than in my family house. I am responsible for almost everything in this family. I go out whenever I want. I have flexible working hours. They are like my own family. I would not even dream to work in such place. (Ms. I., Gagauz, 25 years old)

Ms. J. and Ms. K. were the only ones among the immigrant domestic women workers who complained about their current employers. Ms. J.'s freedom of movement was limited in the household she worked, and she was overburdened with the childcare and housework. In addition to overwork, Ms. L. complained that her employer interfered with her work and did not respect her working style:

> I have my own working style, she should respect this. I do not like when she interferes to my work. She has to behave me as I am a human being, too. She has to respect me. I am neither her apprentice nor her servant. This is my profession, and she has to respect my ideas on babysitting. If she does, I love my work and seek to do it in the best way. (Ms. L, Gagauz, 31 years old)

On the other hand, other immigrant women have bad experiences about their previous employers. Among the reason they mostly complain about their previous employers were maltreatment and lack of respect against their work style and personality, which would result in searching for another workplace:

> The reason I changed my works was not because I did not like the work but rather my employers did not treat me well. For example, I am a babysitter now. Babysitting is a hard work, it required heavy responsibilities. On the other hand, my employers treat me well. They respect me because I care their child. I am living in a family environment here. They care me, they are interested in me. (Ms. K., Gagauz, 30 years old)

> My sixth employer was so cruel. She was living in a four-story villa, and had a private driver and a Filipina cleaning lady. I worked there for a year. The Filipina woman did not like me. She was always telling bad things about me to the employer. Once, the Madam's $500 was lost in the house, it was stolen. That day was my day-off. The Filipina woman told her that I had stolen the money. The Madam phoned me in the evening and told that she would send my suitcases with her driver to me. I was fired! My friends working in a close neighborhood there found me another work. (Ms. F., Uzbek, 47 years old)

In addition, Ms. B. reported that she suffered from her employer's slavery like treatment against her, which caused a long-term moral distress on her even after she left the working place:

> It was my sixth employment in Turkey. I was the eighth nanny employed in this house. I was not lucky at that time. It was a terrible family. They were paying me 1000 TYL at that time. The mother of my employer had psychological problems. She often visited and stayed with us. She told me "You will be my slave. You are the slave of this house, and do whatever we want from you." I did not reply her. I talked to my employer. I said her 'My parent did not grow me up for this. Sorry but I can not work here anymore after what your mother said to me.' She told me 'You are the eighth nanny of this house. If I lose you too, my husband will get angry with me because I could not manage you but he manages hundreds of worker at his work. Please understand her, she has psychological problems, do not leave us.' She was also had problems with her husband. I told her that their child was adversely affected by the stressful atmosphere at home, and I would not work there. I called the agency and said them I was leaving. They were surprised, and told me how I could leave such a well-paid work. I told them I wanted peace, and did not come Turkey for being insulted. I felt so bad for a long time after I quitted that work. I left this work earlier than we dealt. They did not pay me for the days I worked; they did not even give me money for transportation when I was leaving. Madam's husband told me 'do not make me angry!' What she told me frequently resounded in my ears: 'you are a slave'. OK, I heard such things from other immigrant women, but it happened to me for the first time during my two and a half year in Turkey. I did not deserve to hear these words. I decided to leave Turkey, but could not do that. I had to earn money. I needed a rest, so I did not work for a month, but ran out of money. The agency called me again for babysitting. I liked the working conditions, and accepted the offer. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)

Similarly, Ms. D. blamed the employer of her friend who treated her friend like a slave:

> I was working in a house where my friend was also employed. Our employers took off his pajama, and threw it to her face and said: 'You will stand up when I am talking to you'. I can not work in such a place. I told him 'she does all you work. Respect her please, she is a human'. Our country's economic situation is bad now. Who knows what will happen to Turkey tomorrow? (Ms. D., Gagauz, 34 years old)

Furthermore, three immigrant domestic women workers expressed that they were suffering from inadequate living standards and food their former employers provide them:

> I went to Paris with my employers. The madam's husband was a consulate in Istanbul. When returned from Paris, they wanted to move to Ankara, so I left working for them because I did not have any friend in Ankara. The Madam also was obsessive about the cleanliness of her house. She expected me to work eighteen hours a day. I would not even have time to have my meals. She was always giving me tasks to be completed when it is time for having my breakfast or lunch. She did not give me a private room. I was sleeping in a thin mattress on the floor. She did not let me to sleep on the coach, because she was said that I would use up the cloth of the coach. When we went to Paris, some Parisian government officials came to the hotel we were staying and questioned me if I am treated well by the employer. They offered me to pay my repatriation expenses if I were not comfortable about my employer. I did not want to return my country. I had to earn money. (Ms. F., Uzbek, 47 years old)

> I worked for a family living in Bodrum. They did non treat me well. (She did not want to tell everything but her friend encourage her to tell) I had never worked as a domestic servant, how could I know to behave like a domestic servant? My work was selling in my country. They did not give me meals. I had to have my meal after they ate. This is O.K. but I did not eat what they ate. For example they ate fish, and gave me their leftovers, the bones of the fishes to eat. How can they do that? Is this humanity? My weight was seventy-five kilo when I arrived in Turkey. When I was working in Bodrum, I lost ten kilos. Why did I come here, because I was hungry? I was so regretful because I came to Turkey. I had never seen so inhuman people in my life before. It was so weird for me. How could they behave to people like that? Was it because they are richer? (Ms. G., Gagauz, 48 years old)

> My first employer treated me badly. They would get up in the afternoon, and then go out. There was no food in the refrigerator. They would have their breakfast and lunch outside, and brought package food at nights. I lost seven kilos. I left them when I found another work. They did not pay my wage. I went to take my wage many times, and finally could take it. (Ms. N, Crimean, 41 years old)

Immigrant women stated that their employers did not take their passport away from them during the time they worked. However, Ms. K. stated that her employer captured her passport when she quitted working for her. She could not bear to be maltreated by her employer but had problems when leaving the house she worked:

> My first employer here behaved me so badly that I did not speak for a long time. She was one year older than me, and her husband was a mature man. He treated me well, but the Madam was a trouble. She hired me for doing

> housework and she would care her new-born baby. It was impossible to work for her. She always wanted me to start a new work when I was already doing something else. Also, she never liked what I did. I would not have time for having meals because she was always giving me more and more works to be done. I stayed in a very small room that I could not even breathe there. One day, I decided to quit working for her and I suddenly told her that. She was very angry because I did not tell her before. She did not give my passport. I left the house, but the security guys stopped me. They told me that the Madam wanted them to check my suitcase. They checked, and could not find anything there. They were nice men, but the Madam would fire them if they did not check my suitcases. Then I walked away, but my passport was with her. (Ms. K, Gagauz, 30 years old)

Finally, among all immigrant domestic women workers, only one woman reported that she was harassed sexually by her male employer, and immediately left him after the evidence:

> My friends arranged an elderly care work for me. He was eighty-seven years old and living alone. I accepted to this work because he was very old. He paid me $250 for one month. But, one day he took off his pants and wanted to touch me, kiss me, and sleep with me. I was shocked. I talked with his daughters and said that I am not that kind of woman, I would not work for them anymore. (Ms. F., Uzbek, 47 years old)

Immigrant domestic women workers expressed that it was just a luck to meet a good employer for them. If they had an alternative, they would find better employers they could change their workplaces. If they do not, as in the case of Ms. J., they say that they had to bear their employers. As stated before, Ms. J. arrived in Turkey only three month ago, and has not met anybody yet outside the home because she was confined by her employer to the work she did. If she had the chance to enter into some social networks, she would change her workplace. Except her, all other domestic workers have been working in Turkey for at least one and a half year and had had bad employers in their previous workplaces. However, they shifted to new house they could work through their social networks in the city they live.

8.3. Immigrant Domestic Women Workers' Lives in Turkey

In order to cast light upon how the immigrant status of domestic women workers shaped their life experiences in Turkey, I asked them whether they had experienced a language barrier and lived other problems in Turkey; how their social life outside the workplace was, and how being away from their families in Turkey influenced their lives in Turkey.

8.3.1. Language Barrier

As stated in the previous chapter, all the immigrant women, except one newly arrived Georgian woman, were fluent in Turkish when I met them. They stated that they had difficulties in their first work because they had not understood Turkish. Many of them learned Turkish through listening carefully to their employers and asking the meanings of Turkish words they did not understand:

> It was very hard for me to speak Turkish. I asked to the madam when I did not understand a Turkish word, and she explained its meaning. (Ms. A., Bulgarian, 33 years old)

> I did not understand what they were speaking at first. Then, their neighbors came to visit us frequently. I gradually learned Turkish thereby listening to them.(Ms. P, Gagauz, 49 years old)

In addition, many other learned Turkish through studying language books and dictionaries and watching Turkish channels when they had time:

> I am a Gagauz Turk. Some Turkish words are similar to ours. In my first work, I did not understand anything when my employers talked. I felt like I was in U.S.A. Then, I started watching television every night, and also read the books to learn Turkish. (Ms. E., Gagauz, 40 years old)

> We have to be respectful for Turkish language. We brought language books from our country to learn Turkish. At first, I decided not to learn Turkish

> since we came here to earn money. But then, I learned Turkish. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)

> I knew only commands as 'stop' 'do not do' etc. I had my dictionaries and language books with me. When I understand a Turkish word's pronunciation I would check its meaning in the dictionary. I learned how to speak Turkish by myself. My first employer spoke English and Italian. Her children spoke English, and they taught me Turkish words, too. Now, it is hard for me to speak English, because I get used to speak Turkish. I think in Turkish now, because I speak Turkish at home all the day. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)

Therefore, after a few months they arrived in Turkey, they had no problem in communicating in Turkish, and doing their works outside of their working place by themselves easily. I observed in the interviews that immigrant women from the same country of origin speak each other in their native language.

8.3.2. Social Life outside the Workplace

In their rest days, immigrant women mostly meet their friends from their country of origin in particular places. For instance, a Filipina woman stated that she regularly goes to the church on Sundays, and after ceremony she and other Filipinas gather and chat in one of her friend's house. She stated that she did not meet anybody who was not from her homeland. In addition, she informed that they have a Filipina association they make organizations together:

> I meet my friends on Sundays in the church. We have a Filipina association, and gather there. Now, we are preparing to celebrate our independence day on June 12. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)

On the other hand, two Uzbek women I interviewed said that they visited their friends in the Uzbek hotel where all of the workers were also Uzbeks. They stated that they turned to the hotel when they needed temporary accommodation, money, or any kind of support:

> I stayed in the Uzbek hotel for a month and did not work in a house when I had no employment. The cleaning lady of the hotel was on holiday, I did her work instead of for paying my accommodation at the hotel. They are working for money; of course I have to pay them. The receptionist in the Uzbek hotel always helped me. He would say me that Turkish men treat in a different way if you are a foreign woman. (Ms. F., Uzbek, 47 years old)

Moldovan women also meet their friends outside. They regularly meet in the church on Sundays and after ceremony spend their time with their friends in the churchyard. On the other hand, a Bulgarian woman said that she did not meet her friends outside, but rather visited then in their houses. She stated that Bulgarian people migrated Turkey mostly had their own house with their families and visited each other in their day-offs. However, she was a little fatigue because she had no time for herself in Sundays:

> I have only Sundays for resting but my relatives and friends here start visiting our house in the morning and visits never stop until midnight. I am bored of receiving so many guests in a day. I have no time left to do my housework and to have a rest. (Ms. A., Bulgarian, 33 years old)

Furthermore, single immigrant women complained that they would not have boyfriends in Turkey. They expressed that they had no time for getting into a love affair with men, and also would not like to have a Turkish boyfriend because of cultural differences. Therefore, they complained about their heavy working conditions and the cultural limitations on their relations with Turkish men:

> It is a good thing for me to be here in Turkey, because I am free here. On the other hand, I am bored of being alone. I do not marry a Turkish man. Our men are so different. I had Turkish boyfriends but they are very jealous. Our men are also jealous but not as much as Turkish men. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)

> Marrying a man in Turkey, it is not easy for us. I have only one day to go out, and you can not know much about a man in this way. I am not young now. By the time I get older, I will become choosier about men. There is no money in Moldova, and I do not want to marry a Moldovan man anymore. I changed in Turkey. So, I am stuck in the middle. (Ms. L, Gagauz, 31 years old)

It is not only because they do not like Turkish men; but also Turkish people's approach to foreign immigrant women in Turkey keep them from having a relationship with Turkish men:

> It is very difficult to have a relationship with a Turkish man here. They treat foreign women differently. I am ashamed because our women are known as prostitutes. I feel inferior because of them when I meet a man here. (Ms. L, Gagauz, 31 years old)

It seems like that immigrant domestic women workers have their community consisted of other immigrant women from the same country of origin, and spend their rest days with them. These communities are also a source of having news from their homeland. In addition, they can hear about the available works, and look for the solutions together when they have problems. Weyland (1994) asserts that the day-offs spent with people form their country origin are an occasion for immigrant domestic women workers to regain strength for the working day ahead them. Likely, Kümbetoğlu (2005) states that immigrant women's communities serve as a solidarity network they took help and advice from their friends/relatives. Therefore, meeting with other immigrant domestic women workers from their homelands in their day-offs is a time for immigrant women for relaxation and talking with others who share the same lives with themselves.

8.3.3. Problems Faced in Turkey

Immigrant women mostly complain about the police or people who introduce themselves as if they are police. They stated that when they were outside, police stopped them and asked for money. If women do not bribe them, the police threaten them to take to the police office and then deport them from Turkey. Since immigrant women were borrowed to their friends or relatives for coming Turkey and have their families waiting for their wages, they have no other choice than giving all their money to the police. Almost all immigrant women reported that police stopped them, or their immigrant friends:

> Police stops us in the street, and take our money. This happened to my friends. Once, a policeman stopped me at the street. He thought that I am a Turkish woman, but when I spoke, he understood from my dialect that I was a foreign woman. He took all my wage I had in my pocket. If I would not give him my wage, he threatened me to deport me. It was a very annoying day for me. I lost all my wage at once. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)
>
> The police caught me in the street. I know they were real police, because I saw the police car. They talked with me for a while and then said that they would deport me, if I did not pay them $100. My employers were on holiday at that time, and I had no money on. Then, they took my telephone number and said that they would call me in a week. They also checked by ringing my cell phone if I gave them the correct number. Then, they released me. They did not phone. If they did, I would call my employer to the phone. They do not have any right to take my money from me. They did the same thing to my friend. They showed their ID immediately, and then took her handbag and her cell phone from her. They took all her wage, and then went away. (Ms. D., Gagauz, 34 years old)

In addition, immigrant women told about the people who said that they were policeand took their money. Then these people understand that they are foreigners, they follow them and behave as they are police:

> There are people introducing them as they are police to our women in the streets. They try to take as much money from you as they can. Once it happened to me, too. I was with my friend, and she told me that she knew that guy. He was used to deceive foreign women in the street. I shouted at him and he ran away. But I know the police do the same thing through threatening the women to deport them. We are not prostitutes; it is not easy to earn money here. We work until morning all the day and need this money. I will pay my money at the border gates when leaving Turkey. So, why should I give all my wage to a policeman? We were vulnerable when arrived in Turkey for the first time, but we learned how to deal with such bribery matters. (Ms. K, Gagauz, 30 years old)
>
> There are lots of men introducing themselves as policemen in Kadıköy. One day, one of them asked me whether I was a foreigner. I said yes. First he asked me to look after his mother, and then threatened me to deport me. I did not believe him. He stopped me another day again. That time, I was about to be deported Turkey, so I did not mind him just went away from him. (Ms. N, Crimean, 41 years old)
>
> Today, a man said to my friend that he was a policeman and stopped her in the street. She had her wage in her pocket. He took $300 and left $100 for her and went away. She was crying when I saw her. I asked her if the man showed his ID to her. But she was so afraid that she could not ask the man

> to show his ID. If I were her, I would not believe him. I know there are men in Eminönü behaving as if they are police and taking away foreign women's money. (Ms. F., Uzbek, 47 years old)

Two immigrant women stated that they do not go to public places and mostly stay at home in their day-off, or speak Turkish outside because they heard from their friends that police caught immigrant women in the streets and take their money from them:

> Nothing happened to me in the streets because I look like a Turk. Unless I speak, people do not understand that I am a foreigner. (Ms. F., Uzbek, 47 years old)

> Nothing bad happened to me here in Turkey, because I do not go out. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)

Another immigrant woman stated that she had a bad experience with police when the house she was working was robbed by the thieves. She expressed that because she was a foreigner, the police questioned her as she was the suspect:

> My passport was stolen in the house I was working. The police questioned me first, when they came after thievery to the house, because I was a foreigner. They found all my personal information when they connected the people in my country. They asked me if I had a Turkish boyfriend. They called the Uzbek hotel I usually stayed. They could not find anything wrong about me. My employer loves me a lot. She told to the police that even if I did the thievery, there was no need to record me. Then, the police went and never came back. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)

Another common problem immigrant women usually faced with in Turkey was verbal abuse and sexual harassment. They told that walking in the street would be a trouble for them if people understood that they were foreigners:

> You know how Turkish men treat to foreign women in Turkey. They assault on women in the streets. One day I left the ferryboat, and a man came after me and suddenly pinched me. I am a brave woman. I slapped him, and said him that I knew why he did this to me, because I was a foreign woman. A young man standing there came across and said he was sorry. This is not

> disrespecting foreign women only, but also all women. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)
>
> At the beginning, Turkish men made a pass at me in the streets. My Turkish was not good, so I did not understand them. I get used to this situation, I do not mind now as I did before. Once, a man followed me after I got off the ferryboat. I was very angry. I suddenly stopped, went near to him and shouted at him. All the people in the street looked at me, because I was a woman. Then, he walked away. (Ms. K, Gagauz, 30 years old)

Immigrant women told that Turkish men approach them in a negative way because foreign women are supposed to be prostitutes in Turkey, particularly when they are from Slavic countries. They expressed that they blamed on women who earned their life through sex work because they were the cause of misperception against all foreign women in Turkey. As a result of negative presentation of them in Turkish media, foreign women are perceived to be sex workers, and inevitably subject to sexual harassment in their social life outside their workplace. Chin also reports that Filipina women domestic workers in Malaysia suffered from sexual harassment there because of the negative presentation of East Malaysian media play a major role in shaping negative public perceptions of foreign servants through publishing sensational news about them.

However, immigrant women are subject to any kind of exploitation in their lives outside the working place in Turkey since they can not defend themselves due to their illegal immigrant status. Either police or Turkish people, who want to benefit from the illegal status of immigrant women, exploit them by taking bribe from them. Since they are in a vulnerable position because of their illegal status, they can not do anything other than giving their money to these people.

8.3.4. Being Away From Their Families

Immigrant women told that because of heavy visa expiration fines, they could not frequently visit their families, but often talked with them on the phone. Almost

every woman has a cell phone, and their employers or they pay the credit (kontör) of their cell phones.

Among immigrant women, two of them stated that their family members visited them in Turkey, but they still miss them a lot:

> I visit my country once in a year. My son and his wife came to Turkey last year and worked here. (Ms. H., Gagauz, 42 years old)
> My children come to Turkey in their summer breaks and then return before the school starts in Bulgaria. I miss them a lot. If I were free, now I would leave Turkey and return my country. My mother has been working abroad for years, and I have been suffering from her lack for so long. Now, I am here and missing my children. I am sick of missing my family. Every time I have taken my wage, I said 'OK I am going back to my country tomorrow'. But I could not because I have to stay here and earn money. My children are always on my mind. I am lost in thoughts when doing my work here, so I can not do my work well. (Ms. A., Bulgarian, 33 years old)

They expressed that their families were always on their mind, and they missed them very much. For the married immigrant women, the only thing consoling them is that they support their children's education through earning good money in Turkey:

> Thanks Turkey for giving me a work. I miss my children a lot. But if I stayed there, I could not find employment and they would leave their school. (Ms. M, Crimean, 34 years old)

Ms. B. said that she has not seen her family for three years. Her son works in Dubai in a hotel, and her daughter lives with her grandparents. She has access to the internet in the house she works, and meets her children in the internet:

> I have never visited my family for three years. I see them in the web-cam on the internet. My employers told me that they would help me to pay the visa expiration fines, so I would see them. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)

Two immigrant women stated that they felt very sorry when they were alone because they had to come to Turkey for earning money:

> Being away from my family is very difficult for me. There are times I cry all the day when the child is at school and I am alone at home." (Ms. K, Gagauz, 30 years old)
>
> "I sometimes think that it is all because of me. I am responsible for my situation now. If only I did not marry him. I do everything for my family, and he just stays at home. He is a useless man." (Ms. O, Gagauz, 46 years old)

Finally, two immigrant women expressed that their children wanted them to return their country. Ms. M. said that her children were happy at first because their mother would send gifts and money them when she would go to Turkey. However, when their mother left the house, they cried too much on the phone. Similarly, Ms. J. told in tears:

> "I talked on the phone with my children. I have not seen them for three months. They cried and told me 'Mama, we do not want money, we want you. Come back.' I cried so much. What will I do here?" (Ms. J., Georgian, 35 years old)

The pain of being separated from their families does not make immigrant women to feel guilty because they cannot fulfill their motherhood and wifehood roles and responsibilities as Parreñas (2001) says. They feel secure since their relatives/family members look after their children and also they migrated to Turkey for secure a good future for their family members. However, they feel lost and lonely in Turkey because most of them live-in workers and spend their time in their workplaces. As the immigrant women in my study expressed, Kümbetoğlu (2005) notes that married immigrant women want to be busy with their work while they are in their workplace, so they will not have time to think about their families and worry about their separation from their families, which is an indicator of their pain of being away from their families.

8.4. Personal Evaluations on Their Works, Employers and Turkey

8.4.1. Work Satisfaction and Future Plans

When asked if they were satisfied with their work in Turkey, immigrant women usually replied that if they earned good money and their employers treated them as they were human beings, there was no problem for them except being away from their families. They expressed that domestic work was not a difficult work, but it was exhausting since they repeated the same thing everyday:

> When come Turkey, everybody can be easily work as a servant. You do the same thing in your house. You wash the dishes, you vacuum, do ironing, cleaning. (Ms. G., Gagauz, 48 years old)

> When compared with our salary in Moldova, we earn good here. But we get very tired, very tired… (Ms. H., Gagauz, 42 years old)

> I would do the same housework if I were in my country now. It is not difficult for me to do housework here. (Ms. I., Gagauz, 25 years old)

In addition, Ms. L. stated that domestic workers do not do the domestic work of their own houses, but they are hired for foreign people's housework. Therefore even they would do the same things in their own houses; working in a family as domestic workers never makes them feel in the same way:

> Even though you are very comfortable in the house you are working, it can never be like your own house. First, nothing belongs to you in the house. You have to ask your employer to go out. In the past, I wanted to stay alone. Now, I want to go out and meet people. I am alone at home all the time with the child. You can not talk with her. The house is located in the suburb. I get bored. Outdoors is always silent. My psychological health is deteriorating every passes day. Personal development is zero. I can not read book, I can practice my profession. The best thing about my work is I have no time for spending myself. (Ms. L, Gagauz, 31 years old)

Similarly, Ms. D. was very comfortable in the house she has been working for. However, she said that the worst side of working in a household was that she had to be at house all the time:

> I cared two dogs, but also did the cleaning and cooking. Only taking the dogs out two times in a day was what I liked about my work. I could breathe air when walking with the dogs outside. In Moldova, we were always outside. We are not used to stay indoors. (Ms. D., Gagauz, 34 years old)

Furthermore, immigrant domestic women workers said that as domestic workers they can not use their professional skills, and spend time to themselves for themselves for personal development. As Parreñas states, it is 'the mundane nature of the work' that makes domestic workers to feel decline in their social status. Also, since domestic work requires no skills or training, deskilling process of domestic work led to emotional deterioration in domestic workers. Therefore, domestic works has a deteriorating effect on their skills and trainings as a result of downward mobility:

> I do all the housework here. Sometimes the mother (the employer) helps me. I have a private room, but I go there only for sleeping. I do not have time to read a book or watch television. If I say that I work eighteen hours in a day that would be less than the time I really work. It has never been eighteen hours, but always more and more. I always have things to do. For example, I fell down while cleaning the house today. My waist is hurt, I can hardly move. But I can not sit down and have a rest. I was about to clean the floor when you came. You see, my bucket is over there. I will clean the floors when you leave. I can not say them I have pain and need to rest today. They pay me for doing housework, not to rest. (Ms. O, Gagauz, 46 years old)

> There is no difference between housework and babysitting for me. When you care babies, you have to get up at nights when they wake up. You are free when you finish housework. This is not my profession; it has nothing to do with my profession. When doing elderly care or babysitting, I use my professional skills. Housework is different. What can I do? I would earn three times less than my current wage if I stayed in a hospital in the Philippines. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)

For the babysitters, the best part of their work is the time they spend with the children alone. Two immigrant women babysitters said that they spent most of their work time with the children they looked after. Ms. N. and Ms. K. have been working as the babysitter of one child for three years and they have close relationships with children as if they are their own:

> I love her very much. She was eleven month years old when I started working here. Now, she is three and a half years old. Time passes quickly when I am with her. When I play with her, I forgot everything and do not have time to fall into thoughts. (Ms. N, Crimean, 41 years old)

> The best thing I love about my work is to stay alone with the child, and play with her when her mother is not around. I see in her eyes that she is happier with me than with her mother. (Ms. K, Gagauz, 30 years old)

On the other hand, Ms. F. stated that she liked child-caring more because it did not require bodily effort as housework did:

> I prefer child-care. Cleaning wears out your hands. The employers always give orders to clean every corner all the say. For my age, child caring is better. (Ms. F., Uzbek, 47 years old)

Additionally, I asked immigrant women their future plans about their work in Turkey to have a grasp on their satisfaction with their works. Many immigrant women stated that they would stay in Turkey as long as they had a work to earn money for their family maintenance, and pay their debts:

> I will stay one more year here, and then return to my country. I will be retired next year, and maintain my life with pension. (Ms. N, Crimean, 41 years old)

> I do not know how long more I will stay in Turkey. I have debts to be paid. My father died when I was in Turkey. My children are adults now, they do not need me. But my mother is very old. I will be very sorry if something happens to her when I am here. (Ms. F., Uzbek, 47 years old)

> I and my husband will go back to our country when it becomes better. If there will be no employment in Bulgaria, I will stay here as long as I have a work. (Ms. A., Bulgarian, 33 years old)

> I will work here at least four years more, because I signed a tuition contract for my daughter's education. I am planning to send the money with Western Union afterwards. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)
>
> I am considering for staying half a year more here. I do not know how I will leave Turkey, because I am indebted $2000. In my last visit to my country, I stayed there for one and a half year and I was indebted to my sister for shopping in the market for goods and food. I have to pay it back. I am counting down the days now. How six month will pass…I want it finish all in a sudden. My children are in Moldova, I am here…It is very hard for us. (Ms. D., Gagauz, 34 years old)

When compared with married women, single immigrant women are more flexible in their future plans. Two single immigrant women stated that they did not want to return their country because of high unemployment, and would stay and establish their lives in Turkey, and one said that if her father was not so old, she would stay in Turkey and there was no need to return her homeland:

> I do not want to return to my country. I hope the economy of my country would be better off. I want to work in a place where I can use my professional skills there. (Ms. I., Gagauz, 25 years old)
>
> I do not know how long I will stay here. I can say that as soon as I have a work and my health is good, I will stay in Turkey. Maybe, I will find a Turkish man and marry him (she laughs) (Ms. H., Gagauz, 42 years old)
>
> I do not know how long I will stay in Turkey. All my concern is to lose my father when I am not with him in Moldova. It is not very hard for me to be here. I return when I want anyway. (Ms. E., Gagauz, 40 years old)

In addition, single women plan to establish their own lives in another foreign country through working in their own profession:

> Except me all my siblings are married. If I return to the Philippines, I do not want to live with my family because I want to be independent. I do not know when I will stop working in Turkey, but I guess when I would have enough savings. I have never thought to live in Turkey all through my life. I want to work in Canada or England after Turkey. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)
>
> I will establish my own life in the future and work in my profession. It will be late for me I know, but I will do anyway. (Ms. K, Gagauz, 30 years old)

On the other hand, married women stated that they would return to their countries after they made enough money. However, they did not have a specific return date because their family needs never come to an end:

> My life here is…I thank to God. But I am also bored and sick of being here. My children are grown now, but their demands from us never finish. They want to have this and that. I neglect myself too much. I am a young woman, too. I want to do shopping for myself, but because of their demands, it is never my turn. For example, my daughter will have her graduate ceremony soon. Everybody knows in her school that her parents are working in Turkey. Her dress and jewelry have to be better than the others in the ceremony. I have to prepare her in the best way. (Ms. A., Bulgarian, 33 years old)

> I do not have any plan for the future now. I will go to my homeland, but Madam A. does not want me to leave them forever. Their neighbors love me too much. They cry because I am leaving. Madam A. wants me back. I do not know yet, but I will return to my family anyway. (Ms. O, Gagauz, 46 years old)

Apparently, women's satisfaction with their work does not directly influence their future plans. Rather, their future plans depend on their economic wellbeing. They would stay in Turkey until they pay their debts, save enough money to secure the maintenance of their family.

8.4.2. Personal Opinions on Their Employers and Turkey

Immigrant women mostly criticized their employers for not being good mothers and daughters for their children and parents. They stated that they were more concerned about the care of their own children and elderly in their homelands. However, in Turkey women shift their responsibilities either to their mothers or to women they hire. Additionally, they expressed that Turkish mothers spoilt their children with money and gifts to compensate their absence while they were at work:

> Child caring requires a heavy responsibility. You can do today's housework tomorrow, but you can not postpone the work regarding children. Turkish mothers do not how to look after their children. The grandmother looks after the children, and spoils them. This is not true. Money means everything

> here. Money does not make you important. We are socialized differently in our homeland. Money is not everything for us. (Ms. K, Gagauz, 30 years old)
>
> My first work in Turkey was elderly care. Turkish people are weird people. In our country, mothers care their children on their own. I think no matter how much they are busy they can spend time for their children. Here, they earn a lot of money, so they hire babysitter for their children and women to take care of elder people in their families. (Ms. I., Gagauz, 25 years old)

Ms. B. expressed her confusion when she was hired for mothering a teenager whose mother is a businesswoman:

> I went to another agency for my third employment. They set me up in cleaning work in a house. When I went to the house, the madam told me that she hired me to be a sister for her daughter, not cleaning the house. I said OK. She did not tell me the age of her daughter, and I thought she would be at the age of ten or less. Then, I saw that she is 20 years old. Her parents had been divorced, but they were good friends; the father was visiting them once in a week for having dinner altogether. Madam told me that her daughter was bored at home when she was at work. She wanted me to be with her as a friend when she was at work. She was a very nice girl, but very introverted. She did not even watch television but listen to the walkman all the day. She started to share her feelings with me in a short time. We became good friends with her. We were going to holidays and shopping together. I was hired for mothering her. (Ms. B., Uzbek, 40 years old)

Parreñas (2000) and Lan (2003) agree that reproductive labor of a woman has become a commodity that can be bought and sold on the global market, and what Ms. B.'s said is an indicator of this situation in Turkey. She was hired for mothering a child, not simply for looking after her.

When asked their opinions about Turkey, women mostly told that Turkey is a more modern country and richer country than their homelands. However, Ms. O. was confused to see that women do not work outside the house in Turkey:

> When I came to Turkey, I was shocked because men were everywhere. I could only see women when they are driving their cars. In our country, women work outside, it is weird they do not here. (Ms. O, Gagauz, 46 years old)

While single women said that they have an independent life here and would not like to return to their homeland, married women said that it made no difference to them.

> For us, our homeland is better than Turkey. Everybody loves her/his own country most. Our life there is different. How can I say? Turkey is boring. Your men are jealous. We had to come here, money was here. That is all. (Ms. H., Gagauz, 42 years old)

> Moldovan men do not have money, or they spend all the money they have in a minute. There is no work, no money there. I will work either in Turkey or in another country. Istanbul is a modern city, so it is very hard to return to the town I used to live for me. If I were married, I would have to go back for my children. I am not, and I will not return. (Ms. L, Gagauz, 31 years old)

Single immigrant domestic women workers expressed that it was very hard for them to continue their life in their country of origin after living and working in Turkey. They knew women who left their families because they were more independent in Turkey and working conditions would be better in Turkey.

> I know lots of families disappeared after women migrated to Turkey. Women are more independent here. Housework is easier than agricultural work. They do not want to return Moldova because of that. (Ms. D., Gagauz, 34 years old)

> My family lives in a town there. I would return there, but I do not want to stay with them. I want my have own family and my own house. (Ms. C., Filipina, 37 years old)

The single women were not willing to return their countries, since they feel like they could not maintain their lives after living in Turkey for a long time. This situation would be partly due to what Sassen (1998) calls 'cultural distancing' between the immigrant women and their communities in their homelands due to their long stays in Turkey. They do not want to go back to their family because either they feel more independent here as in the case of Ms. C., or they do not want feel like they would accommodate to the poor living standards in their homelands after living in Turkey.

8.5. Concluding Remarks and Evaluations on the Working and Living Experiences of Immigrant Domestic Women Workers in Turkey

Immigrant domestic women workers' working and living experiences vary according to their age, marital status, their employments' treatment against them, and the kind of work they do. However, there is a consensus that because of their immigrant and illegal worker status in Turkey, they have been subject to arbitrary treatment, exploitation, and oppression either in their workplace, from their employers, police, or Turkish people. The only reason they bear to these overwhelming working and living conditions is that they have to earn money for making a living for their families left behind, and they make good money in Turkey due to the wage differentials between their country and here. Since there are not many legal institutions they would return when they face problems, or they are not legally recruited they had no contract defining their working conditions, they have to deal with their problems by themselves or with their community members in Turkey. As discussed before, having informal social networks is the only source for they applied for having secure relationships, being aware of better works, and dealing with the problems they face in Turkey. On the other hand, informal social networks have been facilitating the movement of increasing number of immigrant domestic women workers to Turkey for seeking employment. However, immigrant women are all alone in coping with the emotional deterioration of being away from their home. Because of cultural differences, single women cannot have relationships with Turkish men. Additionally, these well-educated immigrant women lose their skills and training since domestic work requires no skills and training, but is a manual work. Many immigrant women stated that they have good employers. Whatever they are treated well by their employers, since they spend most of their times in the household they work, and many women do not go out even in their rest days because their fear of being captured by the police, they are mostly confined to home and have a limited freedom of movement. At that point,

they can neither return their country because they are the breadwinners of their families; nor they would bear outcomes of their immigrant and illegal status. Therefore, they are stuck in the middle. Unless Turkey recognizes that there is a huge supply of immigrant women who work illegally in domestic work in Turkey, and regulate the demand and supply relation between her and the sending countries through legal institutions, there will be no change in the recent portraits of immigrant domestic women workers working in Turkey. If she does not, they will continue to be 'disposable domestics', who are vulnerable and open to exploitation.

CHAPTER IX

CONCLUSION

This study begins with the intention of understanding how the forces of supply and demand work to the detriment of women in the global economy. Therefore, in the context of this study, economic restructuring in globalization has been defined as the main source of the sources of unequal gender relations both in the immigrant domestic women workers exporting and importing countries. The unequal development of regions due to the processes of global economy is the major reason behind the international migration of women workers from poorer to richer countries in order to seek domestic work employment.

Since the study subject of this study is immigrant domestic women workers, the first task has been to evaluate the approaches of international migration theories on the international migration of female labor for a comprehensive understanding of the nature of this issue. In chapter two, both the macro and micro approaches in addition to the integrative approaches, the meso level of analyses, have been taken into account. According to the World System Approach, international migration of labor can be understood in terms of the dynamics of market creation and the structure of the global economy. The emergence of global cities created a demand for the unskilled workforce that was fulfilled by immigrants for supplying the lowly-paid services of well-trained and highly educated native or foreign professionals occupied in these cities. Similarly, international migration is supposed to stem from the demand for workforce in secondary sector, which can be

supplied through immigrants since secondary sector works are temporary, insecure, and temporary works according to the Dual Labor Market approach. However, this approach does not address the reasons behind the migration decisions of people. On the other hand, the Equilibrium approach explicates that migration decision is held by individuals through rational calculations, and international migration stems from wage differentials between the countries. However, social, cultural, economic and political sources of decision of people to migrate overseas for better paid works are ignored in this perspective. The Neoclassical Economics Approach has a similar position with the Equilibrium Approach in explaining that income differential factor plays a significant role in the international migration decision of individuals, and simply the better paid works abroad is the primary motivation for them to migrate.

Furthermore, meso level of analyses somehow fill the gap between the macro and micro theories by focusing on household, social networks, and institutions that have significant influence on the international migration of people for seeking employment. For instance, according to the New Economics Approach, the nature of international migration can be understood through the analysis of families, households, or other culturally defined units of production and consumption. Therefore, it rejects that international migration of a family member is not an individual but a collective decision for providing a source for family income. While Institutional Approach gives importance to the international and national institutions in perpetuating the international migration of labor, according to the Network Approach, network connection has a significant place in migrants' access to employment overseas. For the Migration Systems Approach, political, cultural, and social linkages produce migration system, and governments, mass culture, family and personal relationship and migrant activity agencies play important roles in the international migration of labor. Since this approach is a an integrative approach between the macro and micro level of analyses, it has the most comprehensive explanation for this issue.

Yet, it has been concluded that none of the approaches has a coherent explanation by its own for the international migration of women for many reasons. Firstly and

foremost, international migration theories have gender-neutral positions in their approach to international migration of women. While macro approaches propose the structural determinants as the source of human migration, the micro approaches situate immigrants as rational individuals independent from social, cultural, and political dynamics. On the other hand, although meso level analyses do not formulate a theoretical framework, they shed light upon the different mechanisms such as social networks and many parties in the persistence of international migration. Yet, international migration approaches do not have a coherent analysis on the international migration of women, since it is a very complex and multilayered process including many political, social, and cultural parties together with the local and global dynamics.

In the third chapter, the approaches linking the immigrant women's labor to the changes in the global economy have been discussed with a gender perspective. The focus was that global restructuring policies severely damaged poor women due to the increasing poverty, unemployment, international debts, and falls in the living standard in the countries. At that point, the notion of feminization of survival has been introduced to be a component of global economy, since in the developing countries the whole communities and households have been increasingly dependent on women for their survival. As Sassen (2000) articulated, it has been concluded that international migration of women is an indicator of the feminization of unemployment and feminization of survival in that households started to rely on women's waged labor overseas. Additionally, the women domestic worker sending governments promoted and institutionalized the international migration of their women citizens because they are highly benefited from the remittances immigrant women sent since they were a secure source for their foreign exchange reserves. Therefore, women of the developing countries remained to burden the export-oriented policies of their governments seeking to integrate global economy, and international migration for seeking employment has become a family survival strategy for women.

However, immigrant women have been employed in lowly-paid and low-status occupations such as domestic service, which require no training or education, in the host countries. In chapter four, the history of waged domestic work and the current approaches on the immigrant domestic women workers have been presented. When considering the history of waged domestic work, the fluctuating demand of middle class families for domestic workers since 18th century in European countries has been discussed. It has been concluded that the rise of middle class in 18th century as a result of urbanization and industrialization created a demand for hiring domestic workers, which was supplied through a surplus of unskilled female labor due to the mechanization of agricultural work. In 19th century, the Victorian ideology of domesticity persisted demand of middle class women for hiring domestic workers. However, in the 20th century, new employment opportunities opened up for the domestic workers, and 'feminine mystique' convinced middle class women to do their housework; which led to decline in waged women domestic workers. With the expansion of service sector in the 21st century, middle class women participated in the labor market, and they wanted to release their domestic responsibilities through hiring domestic workers, who were mostly the immigrant women. In the six case studies provided in this chapter, the authors agreed that demand of middle class women for domestic servants is not supplied through domestic workforce but by immigrant workers, as Massey et al. (1993) argue, since low-wages, unstable working conditions, and lack of mobility in this occupation does not attract native workers. On the other hand, the findings of field studies on the immigrant domestic women workers in different cities proved that immigrant domestic women workers are mostly working illegally in the host countries due to the lack of bilateral agreements with the sending and receiving countries. Because of their illegal immigrant worker status, they are mostly subject to maltreatment, workplace abuses, exploitation, and oppression. The reason behind this is that there are not strong and well-operating legal protection system for the recruitment and regulation of the immigrant domestic women workers either/both in the sending or/and receiving countries.

In chapter five, Turkey's situation as an immigrant worker receiving country, the legal protection mechanism concerning the immigrant workers, and consequently the field studies on the immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey have been studied. It has been concluded that Turkey has been one of the women domestic worker importing countries since 1990s mostly from post-Soviet countries and the Philippines. Apparently, Turkey has neither bilateral agreement with the immigrant worker exporting countries, nor has taken effective steps both on the regulation and protection of immigrant domestic women workers. Therefore, immigrant women domestic workers are found by the informal sector in Turkey. Besides, although flow of women domestic workers has become a prevalent issue, there is not even available data on the number of 'women' immigrant workers in Turkey. Therefore, as in the other places of world, immigrant domestic women workers are open to exploitation both in the workplace and outside because of their illegal status, as I have also observed.

In my field study, I conducted in-depth interviews with sixteen immigrant domestic women workers employed in Ankara and Istanbul. I could reach a limited number of women due to their illegal status and time and space limitations of my study. However, interviewing a small number of women domestic workers enabled me to narrate their experiences in detail in my study.

The most important findings of my study are as follows:

First of all, economic crisis, high unemployment, poverty, and decline in the living standards of their families forced these women to seek employment overseas. Contrary to the increasing prices, the falls in their wages made it almost impossible for them to make a living for their families in their country of origin. Particularly for the post-Soviet women, the privatization of social services and the cut-backs on the government provisioned services worsened the livelihood their families in that they could not support their children's/siblings' education and family needs anymore. In addition, their monthly salary was on average $30 and they were unpaid for months while working under heavy working conditions, so that they

could not maintain their families. Many of them worked in temporary and part-time occupations in their homelands other than their professions to make a living, but these occupations did not provide a secure income for their families. Therefore, seeking employment abroad had become a family survival strategy for these women. The most important impetus for them is to support the education of their sibling or children in order to provide a better future for them. On the other hand, working abroad as domestic servants for them can be a door opening to their freedom and being away from their family oppression, although when compared with their professions, waged domestic work is a devalued, low-prestigious, and de-skilling work.

All immigrant women reported that they had chosen Turkey for seeking employment because they already had relatives/friends working in Turkey. I supposed that the closeness of Turkish dialect to their dialect would have primarily influenced their decision to migrate Turkey. However, it seems to me that more than the dialect, their personal networks in Turkey had a crucial influence on their decision to search employment in Turkey. Many post-Soviet migrant women domestic workers told that there were available domestic work opportunities in Russian Federation, but they did not have friends/relatives working there. Because they had friends/relatives working in Turkey, they wanted to work in Turkey as well. Furthermore, loose visa policies in Turkey has a crucial role in the flow of women workers to Turkey.

On general, immigrant women migrated to Turkey with their friends/relatives, or they had relatives/friends arranging employment for them in Turkey. Except one of them whose travel expenses were paid by her employer, all other women borrowed money from their friends/relatives for the travel expenses. Most of immigrant women found their first employment through their personal networks in Turkey, and only a few applied to the recruitment agencies. It is also important to note that many women found their first employment in the marketplace in Laleli, where prospective employees meet newly-arrived foreign women there.

As Kümbetoğlu also observed in her study, all immigrant women entered Turkey through legal ways with their tourist visas, but worked and stayed illegally when their visas expired, and had to pay significant amount of visa expiration fines when they re-enter Turkey, which decreased their frequency of visits to their homeland. However, as Kaska and Erder emphasize in their study, making paper-marriages with Turkish men in order to take Turkish citizenship was an alternative for immigrant women for being exempt from visa expiration fines, and secure their work in Turkey. In my research group, two women attempted to make paper-marriages to obtain Turkish citizenship, and have been working and staying in Turkey legally when I met them. However, one woman stated that she attempted to make paper-marriages through two different agencies, because in her first apply she was swindled by the agency. Then, she found another agency arranging paper-marriages with Turkish men. At that time, she could make a paper-marriage and then obtained Turkish citizenship. The presence of illegal agencies in recruiting and arranging paper-marriages for immigrant domestic women workers is a strong indicator of the institutionalization of trade in women domestic workers in Turkey.

Considering their migration experiences, it can be concluded that moving overseas to work as domestic workers was a very difficult decision for the immigrant domestic women workers. They were working in their professions as nurses, teachers, or doctors in their homelands. However, it became almost impossible for them to ensure their family survival due to the unemployment, poverty, and inadequate living standards. On the other hand, the available work they would be employed overseas was domestic work, which was not valued as work. They knew that they would face downward mobility, have the pain of family separation, and even their family life would be disrupted and their marriages would be broken when they migrated abroad. However, they did not have any other alternative other than work in this employment, since their fathers/husbands were unemployed. In addition, they saw foreign employment as a temporary solution for their family survival. They would return to their families as soon as they could save enough money. On the other hand, the remittances they send were mostly spent for family

consumption, and the governments of the sending countries do not re-structure their economies and find sustainable solutions for their citizens' lives.

Interviews with immigrant women indicated that they experienced workplace abuses. For instance, they all are live-in workers (except two), so are available twenty four hours a day for servicing their employers. They work around sixteen hours a day and many women stated that they worked more than eighteen hours and they are not paid for extra hours. In addition, they are employed for babysitting, housework, or elderly-care at first but usually given responsibilities regarding other works outside their pre-set tasks. For example, women hired for elderly care look after elderly, and also do cooking, and other chores. Immigrant women primarily employed for housework look after their employers' children. Furthermore, they do not have any social security and labor contracts with their employers so that they can be fired easily, if they cannot get along with their employers, which show their disposability. Finally, many immigrant women reported that their previous employers maltreated them. They suffered from adequate food and living conditions in their previous workplaces. Also one woman stated that the elderly man she was caring harassed her sexually, and she quitted working for him. Therefore, they are like paid slaves in the houses they work, subject to any kind of physical and sexual abuses, and can be easily thrown away if they complain about their harsh working conditions.

On the other hand, they also experienced abuses outside of their workplaces. The police stop them in the streets and ask for bribery to free them. If they do not give their money, they are threatened with deportation. Almost all women have experienced or witnesses that their friends have been subject to police abuses in the public place. In addition to police, they stated that people who introduce themselves as if they were police also take their money away when they are walking about the streets.

Another important finding of the study is that they solely depend on their social networks when they need help. For example, they can change their workplace

through their personal networks. Their friends/relatives working in Turkey inform them about the available employments they know. In that way, they would find better-paid works. Accordingly, in their testimonies they stated that they were paid better in every work they had changed since they arrived in Turkey. In addition, they spend their day-off with their friends/relatives from their country of origin, and take the news from their homeland, or information about the things they should careful about while working in Turkey. They also send most of their salaries to their families left behind through their social networks. Therefore, as Kumbetoglu (2005) found in her study with young Moldovan domestic workers in Turkey, informal social networks among the immigrant domestic women workers represent a kind of "solidarity network" that they could turn to when they need help or advice. Additionally, as it happened in Weyland's study (1994) with Filipina domestic workers in Istanbul, immigrant women in my research group indicated that they only met with their community consisted of women domestic workers from the same country of origin in their off days. From these results, it can be concluded that personal networks have a significant role in women's migration decision to Turkey, their working arrangements, and their social life in Turkey.

However, since they are illegal workers, they can not protect their rights both in the workplace and outside, and open to exploitation due to their fear of deportation. Their illegal status also delimits their freedom of movement that, they would either stay inside even in their day-offs, or were forced to work without having any rest time by their employers. Even though the overwhelming working and living conditions and being away from their families, immigrant women want to stay and work in Turkey since they have to pay their debts to to their relatives/friends, their visa expiration fines, or they have children/siblings attending to school.

As Parreñas (2001) puts, immigrant domestic women workers are "servants of globalization" who were forced to supply the demand of middle class women in the developed countries due to the economic crisis as a result of macro economic policies. In other words, while economic globalization pull the middle class women of developed countries into secure, well-paid, and full-time career occupations of

the service sector; it drags the well-educated women of developing countries into informal, insecure, temporary, and deskilling overseas occupations, such as waged-domestic work, regardless of their educational background.

When comparing the living and working experiences of other immigrant domestic workers around the world and in Turkey, it is possible to say that they have parallel lives. They all face downward mobility, humiliated and exploited by their employers, physically, sexually or verbally abused both in their workplaces and outside, have exhausting working conditions, and suffer from family separation. It is possible to say that they have parallel lives because the work they do is devalued, they are ignored by the authorities, work illegally, and are women. They are well-educated women who were forced to work in domestic employment abroad and provide the social reproduction of other families at the expense of their own due to the wealth disparities between their home land and more developed countries. Unless host and home countries do not cooperate for regulating the recruitment of domestic workers and improving the conditions of domestic employment, immigrant domestic women workers will remain invisible and fragile, and become more marginalized.

Due to time and access issues, this study was applied to the sixteen immigrant domestic women workers that I could reach through my personal networks. In order to represent the different working and living conditions of immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey, a bigger research group should be drawn from different cities of Turkey for the future studies. Additionally, I found in my study that illegal recruitment agencies are very prevalent in Turkey. However, I could not conduct interviews with them since my main concern was to listen to the working and living experiences of immigrant women, and also I did not have time for contacting the agencies. In order to investigate the level of illegal institutionalization of trade in domestic workers, recruitment agencies should be studied in future studies. Furthermore, in order to establish close relationships with the immigrant women; I did not attempt to make interviews with their employers. However, for understanding the demand of the employers to hire immigrant

domestic women workers, conducting interviews with them in future researches would be an important contribution to the immigrant domestic women workers studies.

REFERENCES

Anker, R., & Hein, C. (eds.) (1986). *Sex inequalities in urban employment in the Third World*. New York: St. Martin's Press.

Aslanbeigui, N., Pressman, S. & Summerfield, G. (1994). Women and economic transformations. In N. Aslanbeigui, S. Pressman & G. Summerfield (eds.) *Women in the age of economic transformations: Gender impact of reforms in Post-Socialist and developing countries* (pp. 1-10). London: Rutledge.

Bakan, A. B. & Daiva., K. S. (1995). Making the match: Domestic placement agencies and the racialization of women's household work. *Signs*, *20* (2), 303-335.

Bales, K. (2002). *Kullanılıp atılanlar: Küresel ekonomide yeni kölelik*. Istanbul: Çitlembik Yayınları.

Boserup, E. (1970). *Women's role in economic development*, London: Allen & Unwin.

Brochmann, G. (1993). *Middle East Avenue: Female migration from Sri Lanka to the Gulf*. Boulder: Westview Press.

Boyle, P. (2002). Population geography: Transnational women on the move. *Progress in Human Geography*, *26* (2), 531-543.

Chant, S. & Radcliffe, S. A. (1992). Migration and development: The importance of gender. In S. Chant (ed.), *Gender and migration in developing countries* (pp.1-29). London: Belhaven Press.

Chang, G. (2000). *Disposable domestics: Immigrant women workers in the global economy*. Massachusetts: South End Press.

Chin, C. B. N. (1997). Walls of silence and late twentieth century representations of the foreign female domestic worker: The case of Filipina and Indonesian female servants in Malaysia. *International Migration Review*, *31* (2), 353-385.

Coser, L. A. (1973). Servants: The obsolescence of an occupational role. *Social Forces*, *52* (1), 31-40.

Çakır, S. & Akgöşke, N. (1996) *Farklı feminizmler açısından kadın araştırmalarında yöntem*. Istanbul: Sel Yayıncılık.

Ege, G. (2002). *Foreign domestic workers in Turkey: A new form of trafficking in Turkey?* Unpublished Masters' Thesis, Ankara

Ekin, N. (2001). Küreselleşmenin iki yüzü: İstenmeyen "kaçak göçmenler-davetli bilgi işçileri. *TÜHİS Dergisi*; *17* (2). Retrieved from http://www.sosyalsiyaset.com/documents/nusret_ekin_1.htm

Ellman, M. & Laacher, S. (2003). Migrant workers in Israel: A contemporary form of slavery. *Euro-Mediterranean Human Rights Network & International Federation for Human Rights*. Retrieved from http://www.fidh.org/magmoyen/rapport/2003/il1806a.pdf

Enloe, C. (1989). *Bananas, beaches and bases: Making feminist sense of international politics*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Erder, S. & Kaska, S. (2003). *Irregular migration and trafficking in women: The Case of Turkey*. Geneva: IOM.

Esim, S. (2001). Women's informal employment in Central and Eastern Europe. United Nations Division for the Advancement of Women (DAW) Expert Group Meeting on "Empowerment of women throughout the life cycle as a transformative strategy for poverty eradication", 26 – 29 November 2001, New Delhi, India.

Faist, T. (2000). *The volume abd dynamics of internaional migration and transnational social spaces*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Fawcett, J. T. (1989). Networks, linkages and migration systems. *International Migration Review*. *23* (3), 671-680.

Friedan, B. (1965). *The Feminine Mystique.* London: Penguin Books.

Glenn, E. N. (1992). From servitude to service work: Historical continuities in the racial division of paid reproductive labor. *Signs*, *18* (1), 1-43.

Goldman, L. B. (1996). Without "ISMS": Women in East Central Europe and Russia. In J. Turpin & L. A. Lorentzen (eds.), *The gendered new world order: militarism, the environment, and development* (pp. 35-50). New York: Routledge.

Goss, J. & Lindquist, B. (1995). Conceptualizing international labor migration: A structuration perspective. *International Migration Review*, *29* (2), 317-351.

Gregson, N. & Lowe, M. (1994). *Servicing the middle classes: Class, gender and waged domestic labour in contemporary Britain*. New York: Routledge.

Gupta, S. (1998). *Economic transition and social protection: Issues and agenda for reform*, IMF paper on Analysis and Assessment. Washington: IMF.

Harding, S. (1987). Introduction: Is there a feminist method? In Sandra Harding (ed.), *Feminism &Methodology* (pp. 1-14). Indiana University Press: Indiana.

Heyzer, N. & Wee, V. (1994). Domestic workers in transient overseas employment: who benefits, who profits? In N. Heyzer, G., L. à Nijehold & N. Weerakoon (eds.), *The trade in domestic workers: causes, mechanisms, and consequences of international migration* (pp. 31-103). London: Zed Books.

Hoerder, D. (2002). *Cultures in contact: World migrations in the second millennium*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Holt, R. P. F. (1994). The 1983 reforms and the employment conditions of Mexican women. In N. Aslanbeigui, S. Pressman & G. Summerfield (eds.), *Women in the age of economic transformations: gender impact of reforms in Post-Socialist and developing countries* (pp. 179-191). London: Rutledge.

Hondagneu-Sotelo, P. & Ernestine A. (1997). I'm here, but I'm there: The meanings of Latina transnational motherhood. *Gender and Society*, *11* (5), 548-571.

Hondagneu-Sotelo, P. (2001). *Doméstica: Immigrant workers cleaning and caring in the shadows of affluence*. California: University of California Press.

Human Rights Watch (HRW). (2004a). *Help wanted: Abuses against female migrant domestic workers in Indonesia and Malaysia*, *16* (9). Retrieved from http://hrw.org/reports/2004/indonesia0704/

Human Rights Watch (HRW) (2004b). *Bad dreams: Exploitation and abuse of migrant workers in Saudi Arabia*, *16* (5). Retrieved from http://hrw.org/reports/2004/saudi0704/

İçduygu, A. (1995). *Transit migration in Turkey*. International Organization for Migration: Budapest. Retrieved from http://www.iom.int/DOCUMENTS/PUBLICATION/EN/MIP_Turkey_transit_eng.pdf

İçduygu, A. (2000). The politics of international migratory regimes: Transit migration flows in Turkey. *International Social Science Journal*, *52* (165), 357-367.

İçduygu, A. Sirkeci, İ. & Muradoğlu, G. (2001). Socio-economic development and international migration: A Turkish study. *International Migration*, *39* (4), 39-59.

İçduygu, A. (2003). *Irregular migration in Turkey*. International Organization for Migration: Geneva.

İçduygu A.; Köser-Akçapar,Ş. (forthcoming in 2005) *The labour dimensions of irregular migration and human trafficking in Turkey*. Geneva: ILO.

INSTRAW (International Research and Training Institute for the Advancement of Women. (1994). *The migration of women: Methodological issues in the measurement and analysis of internal and international migration*. United Nations: Santo Domingo.

International Labor Organization (ILO). (1995). "Women in the workforce: A global review 1985-1995. *Women's International Network News*, *21* (3).

International Monetary Fund (IMF). (2002). 2001 *balance of payments statistics yearbook*, *22*. Retrieved from www.imf.org

International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies (IFRC). (2004). *Appeal 2004: Moldova, Ukraine & Belarus*. Retrieved from http://www.ifrc.org/docs/appeals/annual04/018004.pdf

Institute for Public Policy (IPP). (2004). *Trafficking in Children for Labour and Sexual Exploitation in Moldova*. IPP: Moldova. Retrieved from http://www.ipp.md/publications/Raport%20Traficul%20de%20copii.doc

Jureidini, R. (2002). *Women migrant domestic workers in Lebanon*, International Migration Papers, *48*. IOM: Geneva. Retrieved from www.ilo.org/public/english/ protection/migrant/download/imp/imp48e.pdf

Kalaycioglu, S., Rittersberger-Tilic, H. (2000). *Comert Ablalarin Sadik Hanimlari: Evlerimizdeki Gundelikci Kadinlar*. Su Yayınları: Istanbul.

Keough, L. J. (2003). Driven women: Reconceptualizing women in traffic through the case of Gagauz mobile domestics. *Focaal - European Journal of Anthropology*, *21* (2). Retrieved from http://condor.depaul.edu/~rrotenbe/aeer/v21n2/Keough.pdf

Kessler-Harris, A. (2004). Women's history in the new millennium. *Journal of Women's History*, *15* (4), 186-202.

Keyder, Ç. (ed.). (2000). *Istanbul*: *Küresel ile yerel arasinda*. Metis Yayınları: Istanbul.

Kofman, E., Phizacklea, A., Raghuram, P. And Sales, R. (2000) *Gender and international migration in Europe: Employment, welfare and politics*. London/New York:Routledge.

Koggel, C. M. (2003). "Globalization and women's paid work: Expanding freedom?" Feminist Economics, 9(2-3), pp.163-183.

Kümbetoğlu, B. F. (2005). Enformalleşme süreçlerinde genç göçmen kadinlar ve dayanişma ağlari. *Folklor/Edebiyat*, *xi* (41), 5-25.

Lan, P. (2003). Maid or Madam? Filipina migrant workers and the continuity of domestic labor", *Gender&Society*, *17* (2), 187-208.

Lauby, J.; Stark, O. (1988). Individual migration as a family strategy: Young women in the Philippines. *Population Studies*, *42* (3), 473-86.

Massey, D. S.; Arango, J.; Hugo, G.; Kouaouci, A.; Pellegrino, A. and Taylor, E. (1993). Theories of international migration: A review and appraisal. *Population and Development Review*, *19* (3), 431-466.

McBride, T. M. (1977). Modernization of women's work. *The Journal of Modern History*, *49* (2), 231-245.

McMahon, P. C. (1994). The effects of economic and political reforms on Soviet/Russian women. In N. Aslanbeigui & S. G. Summerfield (eds.), *Women in the age of economic transformations: Gender impact of reforms in Post-Socialist and developing countries* (pp. 59-73). London: Rutledge.

Mies, M. (Winter1997-1998). Women and Work in a sustainable society. *Cross Currents*, *47* (4), 473-492.

Mills, M. B. (2003). Gender and Inequality in the global labor force. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, *32*, pp. 41-62.

Mittelman, J. H. (1994). The globalization challenge: Surviving at the margins. *Third World Quarterly*, *15* (3), pp.427-443.

Mittelman, J. H. (1995). Rethinking international division of labor in the context of globalization. *Third World Quarterly*, *16* (2), pp.273-295.

Moghadam, V. (1999). Gender and the global economy. In M.M. Ferree et al. (eds.), *Revisioning Gender* (pp. 128-160). London: Sage Publications.

Momsen, J. H. (1999). Maids on the move: Victim or victor. In J.H. Momsen (ed.), *Gender, Migration, and Domestic Service* (pp. 1-21). New York: Routledge.

Morokvasic, M. (1984). Birds of passage are also women. *International Migration Review*, *18* (4), 886-907.

Morrison, J. and Crosland, B. (2000). *The trafficking and smuggling of refugees: The end game in European asylum policy?* Geneva: UNHCR Evaluation and Policy Unit. Retrieved from http://www.unhcr.ch/refworld/pub/wpapers/wpno39.pdf

Nijehold, G.L. à. (1994). The changing international division of labour and domestic workers: A macro review (Regional). In N. Heyzer, G. L. à Nijehold & N Weerakoon (eds.), *The trade in domestic workers causes, mechanisms, and consequences of international migration* (pp. 3-29). London: Zed Books.

Özyeğin, G. (2004*). Başkalarının kiri: Kapıcılar, gündelikçiler ve kadinlik halleri*. Istanbul: İletişim Yayınları.

Parreñas, R. S. (2000). Migrant Filipina domestic workers and the international division of reproductive labor. *Gender and Society*. *14* (4), 560-580.

Parreñas, R. S. (2001). *Servants of globalization: Women, migration, and domestic work.* California: Stanford University Press.

Patricia L. (1994). Socio-economic impact of domestic worker migration: Individual, community, country. In N. Heyzer, G. L. à Nijehold & N Weerakoon (eds.), *The trade in domestic workers causes, mechanisms, and consequences of international migration* (pp.103-115). London: Zed Books.

Pettman, J. J. (1998). Women on the move: Globalisation and labour migration from South and Southeast Asian states. *Global Society: Journal of Interdisciplinary International Relations*, *12* (3), pp. 389-403.

Piore, M. J. (1979). *Birds Of passage: Migrant labor and industrial societies*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Portes, A. (1997). Immigration theory for a new century: Some problems and opportunities. *International Migration Review*, *31* (4), 799-825.

Ratha, D. (2003). *Workers' remittances: An important and stable source of external development finance: Global development finance 2003*. Washington: The World Bank Group.

Salt, J. (1992). The future of international labor migration. *International Migration Review*, *26* (4), 1077-1111.

Sassen-Koob, S. (1984). Notes on the incorporation of Third World women into wage-labor through immigration and off-shore production. *International Migration Review, 18* (4), 1114-1168.

Sassen, S. (1988). *The mobility of labor and capital: A study in international investment and labor flow*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Sassen, S. (2000). Women's Burden: Counter-geographies of globalization and the feminization of survival. *Journal of International Affairs*, *53* (2), 503-524.

Sassen, S. (2001). The Excesses of globalisation and the feminisation of survival. *Parallax*, *7* (1), 100-110.

Sleptova, E. (2003). *Labour migration in Europe: Special focus on the Republic of Moldova*. Moldova: Republic Institute for Public Policy (IPP). Retrieved from http://www.ipp.md/publications/St~Sleptova~fin.doc

Sørensen, N. N. (2004). *The development dimension of migrant remittances*. Migration-development follow-up study final report. Denmark: Danish Institute for Development Studies.

Stanley, L.& Wise, S. (1990). Method, methodology and epistemology in feminist research processes. In Liz Stanley (Ed.), *Feminist praxis* (pp.20-60). London: Routledge.

Stanley, L.& Wise, S. (1993). *Breaking out again*. London: Routledge.

Stiglitz, J. E. (2002). *Globalization and its discontents*. New York: W.W. Norton.

Tinsman, H. (1992). The indispensable services of sisters: Considering domestic service in United States and Latin American Studies. *Journal of Women's History, 4* (1), 37-59.

Todaro, M. P. & Smith, S. C. (2003). *Economic development*. New York: Addison West.

Trager, L. (1984). Family strategies and the migration of women: Migrants to Dagupan City, Philippines. *International Migration Review*, *18* (4), 1264-1277.

United Nations. (2005). *2004 world survey on the role of women in development*. New York: Women and International Migration, UN.

Weyland, P. (1994). Gendered lives in global spaces. In A. Öncü and P. Weyland (eds*.)*, *Space, culture, and power* (pp. 82-97). London: Zed Books.

Whitehead, J. & Demirdirek, H. (2004). Sexual encounters, migration and desire in Post-Socialist Context. *Focaal-European Journal of Anthropology*, *43*, 3-13.

Valdivieso, L. M. (1999*). Macroeconomic developments in the Baltics, Russia, and other countries of the Former Soviet Union 1992-97*. IMF occasional paper, *175*. Washington: International Money Fund

Vertovec, S. (1999). Conceiving and researching transnationalism. *Ethnic and racial studies*, *22* (2). Retrieved fromwww.transcomm.ox.ac.uk/working%20papers/conceiving.PDF

Vickers, J. (1991). *Women and the world economic crisis*. London: Zed Books.

Yorgun, S. & Şenkal, A. *Illegal mobilization of labour: The effects of illegal migration and unauthorized foreign workers on the Turkish labour market*. Paper Presented IIRA 5th Asian Regional Congress, Seul, Korea, on June 23-26, 2004.

Zolberg, A. R. (1989). The next waves: Migration theory for a changing world. *International Migration Review*, *23* (3), 403-430.

APPENDIX A

THE GUIDELINE FOR THE INTERVIEWS

Questionnaire for the Immigrant Domestic Workers

Individual Information

1) How old are you?
2) Are you married? If yes, what's the job of your husband?
3) How many children do you have? What are their ages? Do they attend school? Who looks after your children in your homeland while you are working in Turkey?
4) What is the last school you attended?
5) What other employments have you held in your country of origin, other countries, and Turkey?
6) What was your salary in these works?
7) Why did you decide to leave your home for seeking work in Turkey?
8) Was it your own decision to come to Turkey, or did your family members play a role in your decision to migrate?

Migration Experience

1) How and when did you come to Turkey? Did you travel to Turkey independently or through a recruitment agency?

2) How much did you pay for departure (including travel ticket and visa expenses)? How did you find the money?
3) Did you have any problem during your travel to Turkey?
4) What was your destination point in Turkey?
5) Where did you stay after you arrive in Turkey?
6) Who met you when you come to Turkey?
7) Do you have work and stay permit in Turkey?
8) Do you visit your family? How often do you enter and deport Turkey?
9) Have you had problems while entering and deporting Turkey?

Working Experiences in Turkey

1) How did you find your first employment in Turkey?
2) Did you apply to a recruitment agency and pay money for their services?
3) In what domestic services have you been employed in Turkey?
4) How many hours in a day do you work? Do you have regular or flexible working hours?
5) Please describe what is a typical workweek?
6) Do you get to rest and relax in a working day?
7) Do you have a regular day-off in a week?
8) Do you have health insurance/ social security?
9) Are you paid daily or monthly? How much do you earn? Do you spend the money you make on things for yourself?
10) Are you paid supplementary wage by your employer?
11) Have you experienced something opposed to your expectations/what you deal with your employer before attening the employment?
12) Can you tell me a little bit about your relationships with your employers?
13) Do you communicate with the employee about personal issues?
14) Are you treated well by your employers?

Remittances/Families Left Behind:

1) Do you have someone in your country that you support money?

2) How did you send money/gifts to your family/relatives left behind?
3) How do you communicate with your family?
4) How do they and you feel about the situation of being separated from you/your family?

Living Experiences in Turkey

1) Have you had problems in communicating in Turkish?
2) Do you have friends or family who are employed in Turkey, too?
3) How often do get together with your friends/other women who are domestic workers?
4) How do you spend your time in your day-offs?
5) Have you faced any problem while staying in Turkey?

Work Satisfaction:

1) What do you like the most about your work?
2) What do you dislike the most about it?
3) Are you happy with your work? Do you feel satisfied doing the work that you are doing?
4) What is you future plans? How long do you plan to work in Turkey? Do you plan to work in another work other than domestic work?
5) Personal Opinions on Turkey:
6) What do you think about Turkey and Turkish culture?
7) What is your opinion about your employer?

QUESTİONNAİRE FOR THE EMBASSIES IN ANKARA

1) What is your personal opinion for the push factors in your country driving women workers for seeking employment in Turkey?
2) What legislation and regulations is your embassy responsible for the international migration of female worker?

3) Do you have any information about the problems immigrant women workers face in Turkey? Do they turn to you for taking advice and help? What are the main problems they turn to you for advice?
4) Does your government have any activities concerning the recruitment and regulation of the immigrant women workers abroad?
5) Do you have any bilateral agreements with any countries for the recruitment of women workers?
6) Do you have any estimation for the number of immigrant domestic women workers in Turkey?