THE CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF ALTERNATIVE LOCAL GOVERNMENT
EXPERIENCES IN TURKEY: THE CASE OF HOZAT MUNICIPALITY

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO
THE GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
OF
MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY

BY

ENGİN BOZKURT

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF SCIENCE
IN
THE PROGRAM OF URBAN POLICY PLANNING
AND LOCAL GOVERNMENTS

SEPTEMBER 2011

Approval of the Graduate School of Social Sciences

—————————

Prof. Dr. Meliha ALTUNIŞIK
Director

I certify that this thesis satisfies all the requirements as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science

—————————

Assoc. Prof. Dr. H. Çağatay KESKİNOK
Head of Department

This is to certify that we have read this thesis and that in our opinion it is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science.

—————————

Prof. Dr. Melih Ersoy
Supervisor

Examining Committee Members

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Nil Uzun	(METU, CRP)	—————————
Prof. Dr. Melih Ersoy	(METU, CRP)	—————————
Assoc. Prof. Dr. H. Serap Kayasü	(METU, CRP)	—————————

I hereby declare that all information in this document has been obtained and presented in accordance with academic rules and ethical conduct. I also declare that, as required by these rules and conduct, I have fully cited and referenced all material and results that are not original to this work.

Name, Last name : Engin BOZKURT

Signature　　　　　:

ABSTRACT

THE CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF ALTERNATIVE LOCAL GOVERNMENT EXPERIENCES IN TURKEY: THE CASE OF HOZAT MUNICIPALITY

BOZKURT, Engin

M.S., Department of Urban Policy Planning and Local Governments

Supervisor: Assoc. Prof. Dr. Melih ERSOY

September, 2011, 127 pages

When analyzed within Marxist theory understandings, local governments can be considered as a body of administrative, political, social and economic relations which are defined in a certain spatial scale based on uneven development of capital accumulation. This definition removes the local governments from the context of a simple organizational-administrative problem and places them into a political context. Hence, as experience and strategies of socialist customs in our country is investigated regarding local governments, it can be observed that a serious experience is not present excepts certain limited examples. In this study, different from municipalism understanding constrained within today's neoliberal marketism and Islamist conservatism, possibilities of socialist municipalism will be discussed. In this context, "socialist municipalism" claim, which is trying to be actualized in Hozat Municipality, which is the study area of this thesis, will be analyzed depending on statement and application relation of the municipal administration, with observations made in the area and interviews.

Keywords: Socialist Local Governments, Tunceli, Hozat Municipality, People Counciles, Transparent Budget.

ÖZ

TÜRKİYE'DEKİ ALTERNATİF YEREL YÖNETİM DENEYİMLERİNİN ELEŞTİREL ANALİZİ: HOZAT BELEDİYESİ ÖRNEĞİ

BOZKURT, Engin

Yüksek Lisans, Kentsel Politika Planlaması ve Yerel Yönetimler Ana Bilim Dalı

Tez Yöneticisi: Doç. Dr. Melih ERSOY

Eylül, 2011, 127 sayfa.

Marksist kuramsal anlayışlar temelinde analiz edildiğinde yerel yönetimler, sermaye birikiminin eşitsiz gelişimine bağlı olarak belirli bir mekânsal ölçekte tanımlanan yönetsel, politik, sosyal ve ekonomik ilişkiler bütünü olarak değerlendirebilir. Bu tanım, yerel yönetimleri basit bir örgütsel-yönetsel sorun kapsamından çıkararak toplumsal ve siyasal bir bağlama oturtmaktadır. Buradan yola çıkarak ülkemizdeki sosyalist geleneklerin, yerel yönetimlere ilişkin deneyim ve stratejileri incelendiğinde, belirli sınırlı örnekler dışında ciddi bir tecrübenin olmadığı görülecektir. Bu çalışmada günümüzde neoliberal piyasacılık ve İslamcı muhafazakârlık eksenine sıkıştırılan belediyecilik anlayışından farklı olarak sosyalist belediyeciliğin olanakları tartışılacaktır. Bu çerçevede çalışma alanı olan Hozat Belediyesi'nde hayata geçirilmeye çalışılan "sosyalist belediyecilik" iddiası, belediye yönetiminin söylem ve uygulama ilişkisine bağlı olarak, alanda gerçekleştirilen gözlem ve mülakatlara incelenecektir.

Anahtar Sözcükler: Sosyalist Yerel Yönetimler, Hozat Belediyesi, Halk Meclisleri, Şeffaf Bütçe.

To my dear uncle Cömert and the other captive revolutionaries...

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES

TABLES

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURES

CHAPTER 1

1. INTRODUCTION

Strong and democratic local governance units have recently been an importanttheme for many fractions at a level of political statement. Political-administrative relations have been changed as a result of structural transformations at the level of economics and politics especially after 1980, and therefore the authorities of local administrations have been gradually increased. These changes have not occurred overnight, obviously, and they have developed in the history of our country in different forms in connection with the class struggle occurring in the world and structural crisis that capitalism is in.

There are numerous discussions on local governments in the literature. However, the only approach dealing with the issue from political economical framework and from a perspective based on classes came from Marxist frameworks. However, approaches of these frameworks to the issue have some variations as well. In this respect, when Marxist theories related with the local administrations are analyzed, it can be understood that local administrations are neither individually simple extensions of the system nor democracy islands independent from the system. If the definition is required within this framework, local administrations are combinations of administrative, social and economical relations defined in a certain spatial scale depending on unequal development of capital accumulation. The context of these relationships can, again, change towards community and labour depending on the course of political struggle, as was tried to be realized in Fatsa.

As the socialist movement is inspected, it is obvious that Turkey have a considerable accumulation in terms of class struggle. The leftist organizations struggling in our country for years have tried many struggle strategies in order to establish labour class power and bring down bourgeois state. However, the importance of local struggles has been very limited within these strategies. It is

not possible to say that there are serious experiences except some certain examples. However, importance of local struggles and local administrations has increased in the last 20 years in terms of leftist organizations. In connection with this, leftist organizations have presented candidates either individually or in alliance in many local elections. Independent candidates supported by socialist organizations, although in small numbers, have won elections in certain districts and towns. However, as the strategies and policies of these organizations have been analyzed, it can be seen that there are significant differences between the goals they had set and the applied policies. Hozat Municipality, which is the study area in this thesis, is not an exception to this. The municipality has started with socialist ideals, but these ideals could not be realized due to many different reasons. In this thesis, the relationship between the strategies and applications of Hozat Municipality, and how the perspective of a socialist understanding to the local administrations in general will be discussed.

1.1. Aim and Research Questions

Different from current sense of municipalism trying to govern our cities within the scope of sense of Islamist conservatism and neo-liberal marketism, Hozat district municipality of Tunceli pretend to govern the district based on revolutionary principles. The purpose of this thesis is to analyze the applications Hozat Municipality is trying to develop based around which strategies and policies based on field study.

Within this framework, the primary question that the answer of which is sought is that, what are the fundamental policies and strategies that separate Hozat Municipality from other municipalities which are within capitalist system. Policies and applications of Hozat Municipality will be analyzed pursuant to four fundamental sub-questions in parallel with this primary question.

The first research problem is directed towards understanding political and administrative policies of the current municipal administration. In this regards, with which statement did the Mayor was organized and came to power shall be

investigated. In parallel with this, the relationship of the political environment with municipality management that carried the Mayor to management and its effect over management tools will be investigated. Along with this, also within this framework, the relationship between the statements of the Mayor during elections and his political implementations will be discussed. With which mechanisms does the public is included to the decision making processes and, in connection with this, auditibility of given decisions by the public is another sub-question.

The second research problem is related with the economic policies of the municipality. The relationship of the municipality with national and international organizations for resource creation will be analyzed in parallel to this problem. Similarly, distribution of acquired resources with which priorities and formation of budget policy in a transparent and participant understanding or not is another question title. Place of production cooperatives within the local economy policies of the municipality is another discussion heading.

The third main discussion subject shall be towards understanding social and cultural policies of the municipality. In this context, expectations of the public from the municipality, and policies and application of the municipality towards social and cultural problems of the public shall be discussed. On the other hand, inclusion of women to social life and production process is an important sub-discussion subject. In this respect, the view of the municipality to problem of women and, policies it has developed and expectations of women shall be investigated.

Finally, answer to the question that around which urban principles does the Municipality shape its urbanization policies will be sought. In this context, participation of public to project preparation and application processes will be analyzed. How the income resulting from urban investments is distributed is another discussion subject.

1.2. Methodology and Thesis Structure

In this study, qualitative and quantitative methods have been employed in order to understand the characteristics of the area. The data of DPT (State Planning Organization), TÜİK (Turkish Statistical Institution) and public establishments in the region have been analyzed with quantitative method in order to understand the economic, spatial, social and cultural characteristics of the area. Based on these data, in the field study qualitative techniques have been employed. In this respect answers to research questions were sought via in-depth interviews with fundamental actors of the process namely 45 people composed of the Mayor, District Governor, public institution employees and political organizations were questioned. In addition to these actors 35 persons (workers, farmers, retired persons, craftsmen, students and women) residing in the city have been interviewed. Along with these, regarding the problematic areas, many observations and conversations were made and photographs were taken at the area.

The main structure of this thesis is composed of five chapters, except introduction chapter. These are composed of theoretical framework, development processes of local administration in the world, transformation of local administrations in our country, case study and conclusion.

The view of different theoretical approaches is very important for understanding transformation processes of local administrations being encountered both in our country and in the world. At the same time, conceptual framework that is analyzed in Chapter 2 presents a significant base in terms of understanding alternative local administration experience discussed in case study.

Development stages of local administrations in slaver societies and capitalist societies will be discussed in general terms in chapter 3. Following this, local administration models in socialist states will be analyzed with examples by discussing how the cities and urbanization dynamics are developed in socialist

systems. Finally, examples of anti-capitalist local administration in the world will be analyzed from different point of views.

In chapter 4, transformation processes of local administrations in Turkey will be discussed dividing into historical periods. These historical periods are categorized according to social, economic and political developments that our country has undergone. Therefore, transformation processes of local administrations were analyzed by forming a dialectic connection with economic, social and political transformation. Social and "socialist" municipalism examples that were tried to be implemented in our country will be analyzed at the end of this chapter.

In chapter 5, Hozat Municipalism experience, that is the subject of this thesis, will be examined. First, social and economic structure of the area will be attempted to be explained. Then, the case study will be analyzed in six headings that are based on research questions. Interviews with total of 45 persons were made in relation with these questions. Conversations with persons from different sectors were also made, important locations were photographed and observations regarding the area in questions were made.

In the final chapter, a general evaluation of the study will be made and suggestions regarding the area will be presented.

1.3. Scope

The interest to the area was started with the call made for "Revolutionary and Populist Local Administration Symposium" that is considered to be organized in an international scale by Hozat Municipality and Mazgirt Municipality. In this context, assistance was requested from relevant persons from labour and trade organizations, that I am included as well, and universities for organization of the process and formation of scientific and consultative committee. My friends and I also responded to the call positively and got involved to specific meetings. Hence, I have decided that Hozat Municipality should be the area of this thesis for

investigation of socialist municipalism practices in the claimed context that the Municipality is trying to apply apart from current capitalist municipalism mentality.

Another reason for the area to be the subject of this thesis is that the region has been an area of struggle for many socialist circles, primarily being Maoist organizations. Accordingly, on site investigation of administrative practices of this type of radical leftist movements which aim for establishing a socialist regime by overthrowing the current capitalist system has been an important opportunity for me.

Hozat is an area where, like surrounding districts, central government shows its presence only with gendarme forces. Along with this, the area has been deprived from the most fundamental urban-physical infrastructures and implementations on one hand and has lost its basic production activity based on stockbreeding due to village evacuations and other restrictions on the other. Similarly, it was observed that residence, transportation and social accessory areas were insufficient and technical capacity of the municipality was considerably limited. Regardless of all these negative effects, endeavors of the administrators of the said municipality to execute the decision making processes with the participation of the public and their will to direct the limited potentials at hand to needs of social character is very important in terms of social opposition.

CHAPTER 2

2. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1. Different Approaches to Local Governments

2.1.1. Pluralist View

Pluralism emerged against elite and Marxist understandings in the period after World War II. This view which emerged as a product of liberal political thinking can be defined as the effect of individuals and individual-based communities on decision making mechanisms of the state at local or central level by coming together on the basis of specific collectives (Waste, 1989).

In this view, social layers do not basically form a group in a class-based way that the Marxist understanding determines. Groups come together on the basis of specific interest-sharing. Even if resources such as fortune, social status, intellectual knowledge, etc. focus around specific classes in certain historical periods, they will scatter in a balanced way in favor of other groups. This situation prevents possible monopolism which will be carried out by specific social classes in political processes. Dalh who is one of the important representatives of classic pluralist approach defines this situation as a transition from cumulative inequalities to dispersed inequalities (UPL, 2002).

According to this approach, state is in the position of arbitrator and regulator in the conflicts and negotiations between different interest groups. Even if different groups become active in state policies in the ratio of the power they owe, in time this power will be balanced with effect of other pressure groups. On the other hand, the impartiality of the state has been safeguarded with the election systems. In this sense, democracy is tried to be directed by the representatives chosen by the individuals; is not directed by the individuals, themselves. Within this framework, we can say that political parties have an important place in the

democratic approach of pluralist approach. A government which tries to exercise power on society will be punished by elections (UPL, 2002).

Dahl has argued that governments should get the approval of the public in the policy making processes. He has stated that decisions taken by the governments which do not get the approval of social segments will damage the freedom and honor of individuals. Thus, while getting approval of public in the implementations which are tried to be realized hold an important place he has tried to explain how this will happen. Views and approaches of different segments of the society to social problems are no doubt different from each other and this situation will cause conflicts. One solution to this situation is to minimize the conflicts. However, Dhal assesses this approach as too utopian. On the other hand, his solution to this situation is to develop methods which will receive the approval of the people. If a mechanism and decision-making process which will receive the approval of different segments of the society are developed, the public will accept to agree on the decisions even if they do not like the solutions (Şener, 2005).

One of the significant approaches that new pluralists advocate recently is "regime theory". According to this understanding, cities have increasingly become places where chaos and disorder prevail. It is impossible for a single group which has the power to control this structure. Within this framework, urban policies will be determined with coalitions which are formed on the areas to be shared; not with conflicts of present groups with each other.

Hence, regimes will be shaped with the directions of these coalitions. Here the state does not cast a simple arbitrator role; it carries the responsibility of mobilizing urban resources and providing coordination. One of the impressive features of this theory is that unlike the classic pluralist approach it takes macro processes which Marxist approach defines and economic relations into account as well as it considers autonomous positions of urban managers which are advocated by managerial paradigm. In addition, not all pluralists advocate local governments against central state structure. The most important reason of this is that local

governments are considered as units which will provide different representation methods and pave the way for the citizens to take part in decision making processes. At the same time, it is considered that these units provide suitable environment for different religious and ethnic groups to express themselves (Şengül, 2001).

2.1.2. Managerialist View

It can be said that the most significant feature of this view is that the state is a centre of power on behalf of itself. Unlike the pluralist paradigm, the state is not considered as the reflexion of the conflicting powers around the state, itself. Apart from all social powers, it is an independent political focus of power with its institutional bureaucratic structure and its organizational form which develops from centre to local. Therefore, it is unlikely to be affected by the conflicts between the social classes since the bureaucrats that the state has, will value professional necessities above the inter-class conflicts. On one side inequalities occurring in locational structure and changes happening in social and economic structure, on the other side resource distribution channels which are shaped based on values and ideologies of urban managers are fundamental factors that create urban inequalities. (Saunders, 1079).

Pahl is known as the founder of urban managerialist view. There have been specific assumptions where he tells accessibility to urban resources within the framework of this view. The first one is spatial limitations which form time and cost expenses, the second one is social restrictions shaped by bureaucratic rules and processes, and the third one is the constraints that social groups which are dependent variable of urban system experience while accessing to the resources. It has been envisaged that this situation inevitably will create urban conflict. In this sense, it can be said that allocation of urban resources is in the centre of urban contradictions. How the resources will be distributed is again dependent on the local managers and experts in accordance with their ideologies and value judgments. The local managers and experts mentioned here include large scale

occupational groups such as real estate agents, managers of construction companies, and employees of public employment offices apart from local bureaucrats. This group of managers tries to allocate the present resources in a way that will meet the needs of the most disadvantaged parts of the society. However, resources can be allocated unequally because of reasons such as lack of data or misconduct of experts (UPL, 2002).

In his later works, Pahl has differentiated his view significantly by taking the criticisms into consideration. While the urban managers are only limited with bureaucrats of local government excluding the previous approach, urban managers have been defined as units which provide the link between the central state and the public, and the state and capital groups by losing their roles of being independent variable.

Another important point that needs to be highlighted here is that with the formation process of nation state, local governments have lost their power but their responsibilities have increased. With this new process, two different views have come to forefront within the managerialist view based on the functions of local governments. The first view is that the local governments are seen as units where central policies are transferred to the local level within the cooperation of central government. The second view states that there are contradictions between central and local governments while admitting that there is also cooperation between the two. These contradictions imply both those between the bureaucracy and democracy and those among the managers themselves.

It is seen that the approach of managerialist paradigm to issue of local government has differed in different periods. This view which has been close to the left in the times of welfare state has been shaped within the framework of the right acquisition after the welfare state times. The recent representative of this approach is public choice theory. According to this theory, past bureaucratic management mechanism is unlikely to provide solutions to the problem that will occur in differentiating cities which are becoming diversified in social and economic

sense. Thus, the establishment of a lot of local government units will develop representation and democracy thus the cities which present more qualified and cheaper life conditions will increase the attention to themselves and the population. It can be said that this approach differently from welfare state policies of Keynes which were applied in the past places itself among the new right understanding as dependent on market mechanism (UPL, 2002).

2.1.3. Markxist Views

The Marxist theories which build up around a class-centered view have basically emerged as a criticism to pluralist and managerialist view. It defends that both of the views approach to processes state goes through independently from relations among classes and capital accumulation processes. According to this understanding, while state is discussed as a reflexion of relations between classes in pluralist view, it is discussed as a power independent from all social processes in managerialist paradigm. This theory will be tackled basically among instrumentalist, structuralist and uneven developmental approaches. But before dealing with these theories which approach to local governments with a class perspective, it will provide a sound basis to analyze the views of Marx and Engel to city and state before moving on theoretical discussion.

2.1.3.1. The Views of Marx and Engel to City and State

2.1.3.1.1. Marx and Engel's Evaluation of State

2.1.3.1.1.1. State as a Product of Uncompromising Class Contentions

In his work titled as "The Origin of the Family, Private Property and the State" Friedrich Engels has tried to describe the state with the means of historical analysis. According to him, state is not a power that is imposed to the society from outside. As Hegel argues, it is not the image or reality of the mind. State is more like a product in a phase of the development of the society. At the same time, it is the declaration of the fact that society has been divided in counter-classes and the presence of class conflict. But a necessity of power which is above

the society in sight, which needs to weaken the conflict and keep it under order, occurs in order for oppositions; namely classes which have opposite economic interests not to eliminate themselves and the society in a vicious struggle. Thus, according to him, this power which arises from the society, but remains above the society and which becomes alienated to the society day by day is the state, itself (Engels, 2002).

Here, the basic opinion of Marxism on the historical role and meaning of the state is clearly stated. State is the product and sign of the phenomenon of the class conflicts being uncompromising. Where it is impossible for class conflicts to compromise objectively, the state emerges. On the contrary, the presence of the state is the evidence of the fact that class conflicts are uncompromising. According to Marx, state is an organ of class sovereignty, pressure instrument of a class over another class. It is the establishment of an order which legalizes and regulates this pressure (Marx, Engels, 1998).

2.1.3.1.1.2. State as a Pressure Mechanism

Engels expresses that the state shows it's another role with the pressure policies which it applies on the oppressed class. According to him, state is a public institution which is organized in armed forces. This significant armed force is mandatory. Because, after the society was divided into classes, it became impossible for the public to organize with the means of armed forces autonomously. This public power which girds itself with arms is present in every society. This public power which is not only comprised of armed people shows itself with prisons and other punishment bodies.

Engels states that in some parts of the world such as North America, this public power is powerless. He expresses that this situation has occurred in the periods in which free colonies dominate prior to imperialism and states that this situation has vanished with the development of capitalism. Civilized society has been divided into enemy classes. While states are established, the first thing that is done is always to develop armed forces. The primary goal of these forces is to enhance

the pressure and control mechanism on the oppressed class. Thus, as it can be understood every state is a pressure instrument of dominant class, which has been established to oppress the oppressed class and to keep the class under control (Engels, 2003).

2.1.3.1.1.3. State as an Instrument of the Exploitation of the Oppressed Class

According to Marx and Engels, taxes and debiting policies are very important in order to boost a specific public power that stands above the society. The officials who exercise the public power and the right to have the taxes paid appear above the society as the organs of the society. There needs to be extraordinary laws that provide them with authority, holiness and special immunity. Even the most worthless police officer has much more authority than the authority owned by all organs of the society (Engels, 2002).

As the state resulted from the need of restraining the class contradictions but at the same time emerged in the middle of this class conflict, as a rule it is the state of the most powerful class which dominates economically and thus dominates politically. Antic state and feudal state have been the organs of the exploitation of slaves and serfs; modern representative state is the instrument of the exploitation of wage labor by capital. As an exemption, in some periods in which class in conflict become so close to have a balance the power of state, so called as a mediator preserves its independent situation against these classes for a period of time like absolute monarchies of 17th and 18th centuries, Bonapartism of first and second empires in France, Bismarck in Germany (Engels, 2002).

According to Engels, state is not a thing that exists since an unknown time. In a specific economic development phase which is necessarily linked to the division of the society into classes, this division has made the state mandatory. He states that in the production the presence of these classes is not only a necessity and we are rapidly getting close to a development phase where the presence of these classes constitutes a real obstacle to the production. He states that these classes will disappear inevitably just like how they emerge inevitably. With these classes

the state will as well disappear inevitably. The society which will organize the production once again based on the free and equal union of the producers will draw away the whole state machine.

2.1.3.1.1.4. State as a Mechanism that Needs to be Disappeared

In his work titled as "Anti-Dühring", Engels has carried out significant studies on the future of the state phenomenon. According to him, the proletariat obtains state ruling and turns the production instruments first into the property of the state. But, by doing this, it eliminates itself as the proletariat. It as well eliminates all class divisions and class oppositions as well as the state as a state. The prior society which evolves in the class oppositions needs state. Under all circumstances, exploitative class needs an organization which it establishes in order to continue its external production conditions and to keep especially the exploited class under pressure conditions which have been provided by the present production method. State is the representative of all society and visible combination of the society in a board format. But this is a state of the society which represents all the society by itself. State is a state of citizens who own slaves in the first age; a state of feudal aristocrats in the middle age; a state of bourgeoisie in the capitalism. But when it becomes the representative of all the society finally, it will make itself unnecessary. When there will not be a class that will be kept under pressure and when individual struggle of living based on class sovereignty and current anarchy in the production and conflict and extremism resulting from these will disappear, it will mean that there is no more anything that will need to be kept under pressure. A special pressure ruling and a state will no longer be mandatory. The first action in which the state is perceived as the representative of all the society; in other words state's confiscating production instruments on behalf of the society is actually state's last action which is special to the state. The fact that state relations intervene into social relations will become unnecessary after a while and soon will end automatically. The government of people will leave its place to the governance of things and management of the production processes. Thus the state will die automatically. This theory proves that the hollow approach of the

bourgeoisie based on the idea of "free people's state" is insufficient scientifically and also in terms of its temporary validity as an agitation tool (Engels, 2003).

2.1.3.1.2. Marx's and Engels' Approach to the City

Marx and Engels have tried to explain the distribution of the population on geography based on capitalism and hence on the development of bourgeoisie. The city has attracted a serious number of immigrants because the development of manufactures which are the ancestor of the factories has happened in cities and thus cities have been governed by bourgeoisie who owns the production instruments (Marx and Engels, 1998).

As it is stated in Communist Manifesto, in a social system where the powers of producers are more developed and the state owns the property of the production instruments, the contradiction between rural and village, will be resolved within the process just like the contradictions between industry and agriculture, hand labor and manual labor.

Marx and Engels have stated that the proletariat emerged with the development of the cities while mentioning the contradictions between village and the city emerged in the capitalist society. While big bourgeoisie in trade and especially harbor cities and small bourgeoisie in industrial cities increase, this situation creates fundamental differentiations among cities. In his works titled as "The Problem of Housing" and "The Condition of Working Class in England" Engels has analyzed the reality of the city and alienation of the city dwellers with a broader aspect. Chicago School ecologists stated that urban settlement areas have occurred in accordance with the assumption that the circles indicate the common area. But Engels, is different from them, looked at the issue in terms of the concept of economic class (Keleş, 1993).

2.1.3.2. Instrumentalist View

One of the leading names of this theory is Cockburn. In his study titled as "Marxist theories of urban politics" Picvance has tried to understand how Cockburn has approached to state mechanism at local and central levels. According to Cockburn's instrumentalist view, state is an instrument of class sovereignty as a whole and the local governments which represent the organization of the state at local level are the representatives of the central state at local level in the simplest sense. In this sense, local state is defined as the extensions of the central state where labor in the production and services such as housing, education, health are provided (Pickvance, 1995).

In his work titled as "The Local State" Cockburn tries to define his instrumentalist view with the conceptualization of the local state. In his work which he analyzed managerial works in Lambeth, county municipality of London, he reaches specific conclusions by analyzing the local state with its many features. Although the scope of his study which is of vital importance in terms of instrumentalist Marxism is a subject matter which needs to be analyzed thoroughly, it will be analyzed in terms of its results in accordance with our topic.

As the state is an instrument of class sovereignty according to Cockburn, its most fundamental feature is its being a pressure institution. Therefore, state applies multidimensional pressure on the oppressed classes with its military and police forces, courts. Basically the fact that managerial units are based in the centre does not change anything. In capitalist system, all local units need to be dependent on central state structure and to be in the condition of being legitimization instrument in the presence of the public. The fact that the managers who govern these institutions are elected people is an instrument for the legitimization of the system. Social democrat groups in local councils are on the other hand important instruments which prevent and block labor class struggle and legitimize the system.

In terms of sovereign classes, occurrence of capital accumulation, renewal of production instruments and dissemination and expansion of production areas are important but also there is a need for re-production of the labor. This situation requires the provision of social, economic and cultural resources which ensure the self-realization of the labor class by the state. As it is well known, welfare state is a political method which was developed by capitalism in order to overcome over-accumulation crisis which capital goes into; on the other hand it is the statement of rights earned by labor class thanks to their struggles. Cockburn states that these rights have been earned as a result of struggles; he states that in terms of institutional state mechanism these rights are important instruments for the re-production area of the labor to get its own legitimacy.

Cockburn attributes great importance to family in local state discussions. The meaning of local governments for central governments is the same with the meaning of the family for capitalist production method. He expresses that child, woman and family are really important for capitalist re-production. Child grows up in the family before becoming part of the production process and the culture the child obtained in this institution determines the future.

Cockburn replaces group based struggle with collective action against the present inequalities because he thinks that group based struggle eliminates class based struggle of the working class and cannot go beyond the limits defined by the state. The collective action which he replaces determines three fundamental struggle areas. These are; re-production area as the receiver of the state's services, employment area which constitutes the work force of the local state and the family (UPL, 2002).

2.1.3.3. Structuralist View

Another term within Marxist understanding is structuralism. But it sees Structuralist events and processes as a whole apart from their individual appearances. It is wrong to see the reality only from its single appearance or to see the chain from its single ring. Hence, events that are experienced occur within the

social, economic and political structure which constitutes the basis for these events. Therefore, issues should be evaluated within the class relations which individuals are part of, not individually.

The approach of this theory to the state is shaped by the same framework. Differing from the instrumentalist approach, structuralists perceive the state as capitalist not because of direct relations of the bourgeoisie but because of the organic links of the bourgeoisie to capitalist production relations. Therefore, state is seen as the reflexion of the inter-class relations. But, state becomes an organ that regulates not only the conflicts between the bourgeoisie and the working class but also the conflicts among the bourgeoisie itself.

One of the important representatives of the structuralist theory is Poulantzas. Poulantzas has analyzed the state in terms of its functions and its relative autonomy. According to him, state is not a simple instrument of sovereign class but also is not a force independent from the classes. In this context, the state should be perceived as the reflexion of long term inter-class power balances.

According to Poulantzas, in the past there have been some important discussion to define the state by the Marxist side, but the political role of the state could not be defined correctly and that was the missing point. It is an important work in terms of defining economic relations occurring among capital state but political relations have been skipped. In this sense, it defends not only the interests of the working class, but also the interest of the capital as a whole as independent from interest differences among the capital groups (Clarke, 2003). The issue that needs to be analyzed is revealing the main factor that ensures the sustainability and reproduction of the capitalism. State is the only instrument to achieve this. In this context, the politic role of the state s also the global role of the state and this means the provision of long term interests, unity and integrity of the system. Although global role of the state is political, in some specific periods other roles come to the forefront. But what is important is to ensure the conditions which provide the continuity of the system. The mechanism which ensures these

conditions is "relative autonomy". According to him, relative autonomy is defined with the economic and political relations of the state. But this kind of relation does not mean that economic relations always determine the political area. For example; in 19th century Europe, although the bourgeoisie owns the production instruments, there have been many countries where aristocracy prevails in political life.

According to Poulantzas, the relative autonomy feature of the state in capitalist society has three major reasons. First one is that different bourgeois cliques try to have the upper hand on each other by conflicting each other based on their own limited interests. The state is an organization which looks after the bourgeois' interests as a whole rather than the interests of different bourgeois cliques. Second one is that the relative autonomy feature of the state keeps the working class away from class conflict by restraining them within the citizen limits. Third one is that traditional economic and social structure in some backward societies makes it possible for a disorganized peasantry class layer to occur. In this sense, peasantry does not constitute an organized force with this kind of its structure, the state needs to be autonomous in order to have the representation of these layers within the state (UPL, 2002).

Another important name of the structuralist approach is Castells. Castells like Poulantzas sees the state as a mechanism which regulates the struggle between the classes and these regulations are at the position where they secure the class interests of the bourgeois class which is sovereign in long term as a whole. Within this framework, cities have turned into struggle area of the conflicting classes with the development of the industrialization. While the increasingly intensifying capital investments make it possible for the workers to gather in specific places, it also has made the realization of both individual and collective consumption possible. On the other hand, rural problems can be explained by analyzing the relation between the capitalism and city place. In this sense we can say that cities are the instruments which make the reproduction of the labor within the capitalist social relations possible. The reproduction in the cities on the other hand is

realized by the provision of the needs of the working class such as housing, health, education, etc. Hence, the system retrieves from the possible attacks by keeping the labor force from which it will benefit in the production process within specific limits. According to him, the struggle against the bourgeois should not only be limited with economic struggles in the production process but should be united with social groups in the political and ideological fields. Castells envisages three types of struggle processes. The first one is economic struggle process which is carried out by working class for their economic rights. Second one is political protesting process which is based on multi-class organization and the last one is ideological urban action process in which students and environmentalist groups involve. Castells states that social importance of all these struggles can be understood within the framework of the relation with class movement. In this sense, urban social movements are of great importance. According to Castells a movement is required to target capitalist property relations and present ruling system in order to be defined as an urban social movement. He states that otherwise it will remain as a protest process which represents the present discomfort in the society (UPL, 2002).

2.1.3.4. Uneven Development View

Another theory that is developed in order to understand local state by the Marxist side is uneven development theory. The pioneers of this approach are Simon Duncan with his work titled as "The Local State and Uneven Development" and Mark Goodwin.

According to their perspective, social structure develops together with the present political and economic processes or in different ways in everywhere naturally. The inequality in the social structure brings spatial differences with itself. In this sense, local state is a solution which the central state proposes for present social and spatial inequalities. But on the other hand, these units become serious opposition points in terms of struggles carried out at the local level (Pickvance, 1995).

According to the uneven development understanding, it is much more important to discuss why local state has emerged and its differences in its policies rather than discussing the functions of the local state. In this context, according to them local state does not have any specific functions (Pickvance, 1995).

Capitalist states have developed as a part of social relations between sovereign classes and classes under pressure. In this context, in order to define the state as a social relation method and in order to differentiate this definition from organizational organs which are the instruments of the state, two definitions; state method and state instrument, have been put forth. What is important here is not what the state does but is how the state mediates in these relations and how the state gives meaning to them.

People produce social relations including class relations relationally among themselves. This relationality brings inequality with itself. What needs to be understood as inequality here is the materialization of relations among people more randomly, without an order, in different times and places and in different ways. This uneven structure causes the differentiation of the social relations. Local governments deal with these areas where the central governments can not reach or achieve. Another structural role of the local state is its representative role. Although local groups remain marginal in the society, local governments make it possible for these groups to be represented and to reach to the state. Uneven development can be explained by the presence of two processes simultaneously. First process is related with the division of labor which is caused by the differentiation of the labor force's productivity. This situation stems from the superiorities provided by the natural values. Second process is the equalization process. It means transferring the investments from the places where production conditions become stable to under developed places where still added value is obtained with the increase of labor productivity under competitive conditions (UPL, 2002).

Karl Marks and Friedrich Engels have tried to explain the state mechanism with multi dimensional analysis in their works. It will be meaningful to analyze the

explanations of the state in these works under four titles. Firstly state as a product of uncompromising class contradictions will be dealt with. Secondly, more emphasis will be attached on its pressure role on the oppressed class. Thirdly, the state will be analyzed as an exploitation instrument and finally it will be analyzed as a mechanism which needs to be absorbed.

2.2. Critical Analysis of Local Government Theories

In this section, first, view of pluralist theory to the local administrations will be evaluated, and then managerialist theory and Marxist theories will be analyzed in a critical manner, respectively.

The representatives of the pluralist approach; especially Dahl have states that the power relations spread among different segments of the society unequally but the power will spread in a balanced way as a result of the pressure of these groups. While defining these groups, the pluralist approach does not perceive the class position as a fundamental dependence point and states that other many factors cause the groups come together. But both the gathering and organization of these groups and their situations when they cannot succeed have been ignored. If these groups gather around certain needs, the hierarchy of the organization that will be formed, the harmony methods of the representative at the top and on the base while organizing and stating common demands are the issues that need to be discussed.

In addition, the representatives of the pluralist approach have developed their theories based on empirical studies which they carried out in specific cities. This situation creates a good reason for a serious criticism for this approach which is believed to be a universal theory. On the other hand, the studies are just for the successful groups, the explanation why the unsuccessful groups could not succeed is not sufficient.

Another handicap of the pluralist approach is that its point of view excludes the economic and political processes. Class relations and the ideological role of the state have not been analyzed for unsuccessful groups, but this situation was made an issue of discussion by the pluralist theorists within the process after 1980. At these processes, the pluralist theorists have tried to understand the features of other fields by going beyond the scope of their works but this was all eclecticism.

If we analyze the managerialist theory which is mainly based on Weber's political sociology, the fundamental assumption of this theory is that the decisive element of the community is the bureaucracy that manages the state. Therefore, differently from group-based understanding of the pluralists or class based view of the Marxist perspective, this understanding states that bureaucrats and technocrats within the state play effective role in the determination of the social process.

Even though this approach has reached some conclusions about state, local governments and urbanization processes, there are many points which are open to criticism. The opinions of Pahl who is one of the leading names of this theory are contradictory in many aspects.

While Pahl states that the determining factor in the allocation of the resources and urban implementations is the managers of the urban system and the bureaucrats, he argues that their value judgments and ideologies are effective in their decisions. According to him, the reason of the inequalities in the society is inadequate resources and deficient data which experts have on the allocation of the resources. While stating all these, Pahl has not paid attention to why the resources are inadequate. It has been stated that one of the reasons why the allocation of the inadequate resources is uneven is the lack of data, but value judgments and ideologies of the bureaucrats and experts have not been mentioned. While essential factors in the allocation of the resources are experts and their ideologies and it is possible that the segments which do not share this approach will not be able to make use of the services equally, it has been ignored how these ideologies have effect on this segment.

Another point that is open to criticism is the claim that the elected politicians and capital owners do not have any effect on the bureaucrats. This claim seems like a utopia which Pahl thinks of when the social structure and production relations are considered.

It is possible to define the basic theories of the Marxist theory in the field of local governments as instrumentalist, structuralist and uneven development. The evaluations of these theories which have been discussed above in detail are of great importance in terms of understanding the next chapters clearly and the subject of this study.

The first approach that needs to be dealt with is the instrumentalist view and Cockburn is the most important representative of this approach. According to his framework, the state is in integrity with local and central governments as well as the family and in this sense, local governments are at the position of local state as a part of the central state structure. Within this context, local state can not meet the demands of requests the local community in any way in respect of decision-making mechanisms and representation levels, and ways of resource distribution. When the locals demand right in respect of collective actions, the state suppresses these groups by means of armed forces and courts. On the other hand, the family reproduces itself out of system production area with education and other instruments.

Here the instrumentalist view needs to be criticized at specific points. First of all, the issue that needs to be emphasized is the question of why local governments are needed if they are simple parts of the state and simple extension of the central state. Offices of governors and other affiliated units to the centre already meet the need.

In the same way, local governments are determined as a result of the elections even if there is some pressure and allocation of resources in specific scales are realized in accordance with the ideologies of the segments which elect them. Local governments are not necessarily fundamental carrier units of the social

struggle but they own significant resources that need to made use of in respect of opportunities they have in terms of local struggle.

One of the significant representatives of local politics field of the structuralist approach is Castells. Just like Cockburn, Castells admits that local governments are parts of capitalist state. But in different from Cockburn, in Castells' view the state is not only a simple extension of the state but also instruments of the collective consumption. Within this framework, the functions of the local governments are determined by political struggles carried out locally especially by the social movements.

In this context, Castells ignores the internal relations of the local state and its different dynamics. This fact blurs the autonomy area which Castells defines in terms of local state. On the other hand, the importance of the urban social movements stem from the fact that the local social opposition is the main carrier. The question of how these movements will lead the oppressed classes to salvation, remains unanswered. The ambiguity of the methods of struggle and organization constitute the weak points of the theory that Castells advocates.

Duncan and Godwin have stated that spatial and political relations will develop unevenly in parallel with the uneven development of capitalism in social economic area. Therefore, a development in an area is a kind of sign of immaturity in another area. In order to regulate this kind of heterogeneous society, it is not expected to have a homogenous central state structure. According to their ideas, local state strives to overcome the social and spatial inequalities within the state. In this context, the uneven development approach does not perceive the local state as an instrument of local forces that the pluralists explain neither perceives it as an instrument of central state that the instrumentalist approach advocates.

Within this framework, the uneven development theory is of great importance in supporting the local government and local politics discussions, but it also hosts some insufficiencies. The first point that needs to be emphasized is the ambiguity

in how much managers of local system represent their positions and the demands of the local in respect of representation of local public by the local state. On the other hand, it can be said that the local state is the testimony of the struggles carried out locally. But there are serious deficiencies in the components of this struggle in terms of the relations they have with other segments of the society.

2.3. Evaluation of Theoretical Framework in the Context of Its Relation with the Case Study

State and the local governments affiliated to it differ according to the economic and political change processes which the world passes through and in parallel with this situation both at national and local levels management organizations and urbanization styles change and evolve. Especially when we look at the period after 1980, we can see that there have been important differentiations. While the cities were defined as the places where collective consumption was organized in the past, after 1980, they turned into localities which compete in order to attract capital to them. Within this framework, local governments have got free of their role of creating organization instruments of collective consumption; have become institutions which support the demands of the capital.

In accordance with these changes, theories of local government have differed among themselves. While Marxist paradigm has been becoming more sensible to local social struggles by moving away from the class based understanding; pluralist approach has moved towards macro economic and political processes which it neglected previously from group based struggle practice.

When analyzed in this context, the perspective of political fraction, which supports the Mayor of the district that is the study area of this work, has some variations towards local administration in certain historical periods. Local administrations have been ignored by considering them as simple extensions of central administration until 2004. Following 2004, the importance of local administrations underlying class struggle strategies have increased both in the

world and in our country as well. This situation has caused the revolutionarist organizations to seriously consider their strategies and policies.

The approach of DHF, which is an important political actor in the study area, prior to 2004, has been closer to instrumental approach of Cocburn. Following this period, however, the local administrations have started to be seen as an area of public struggles by considering the approach closer to the framework of the uneven development approach. In other words, the municipalities have been perceived as a part of the state on one hand, and on the other hand, considered as an instrument to revolt against capitalist state if apprpriate policies have been followed.

CHAPTER 3

3. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT IN THE WORLD

When we hear the word "local government" nowadays, political and managerial units that provide public services to a specific local community come to our minds. However, when it is considered within the historical development process, we can see that they are the organs of the central state which fulfill the duties such as military and police force organization, punishment and judgment. In the past, the rulers had to share their competences with their assistants with the enlargement of their management domain and these duties were undertook by local governors and carried out specific duties on behalf of the ruler (UPL, 2002).

The first example of the definition of the local government that we use today is the Parishes in England but they could not go beyond carrying out some local duties. Local governments emerged after 1789 revolution for the first time with its real function and meaning. It was experienced in England after 1835 (Erten, 1999).

If we are to analyze the development of local governments historically, we can not talk about the presence of local government in primitive societies in a way which we define today. There are serious differences between the local government of feudal and capitalist societies and of socialist societies.

3.1. Local Government in Slavery Society

Ancient site is the smallest democratic managerial units which are formed by the people who live on a specific territory. They have political functions and decision making authorities. Ancient site have sustained these features until the collapse of Roman Empire. With the collapse of Roman Empire, urban management has collapsed, as well (Keleş, 2009).

According to Owens, city is one of the fundamental institutions of the ancient world and it is not limited with Greek and Roman civilizations in respect to its

form. Cities have been the foundation of the civilization in the Near East for a long time, and actually the emergence of urban life in this geography dates back to centuries before the cities emerged in Greek and Roman world. But, even though the importance of the city in political, religious and social life has been emphasized in both the Greeks and the Romans, it is not enough. The criteria that define the city are different for the Greeks and for the Romans. According to the Greeks, polis does not need a definition. The city is basically a community of citizens who share common political, religious and social traditions (Owens, 2000).

In Ancient Era, the duties in official institutions were considered as honor duties in the city of Efes. The expenses required by this duty were met by the riches of the city. The political life in the city was comprised of two-council system. These were the advisory council which was composed of about 300 members who gathered in upper Agora and the "Demos" namely comitia curiata which was composed of all the citizens of Efes who gathered in the Great Theatre. Both of the councils had secretaries responsible for carrying out the duties. The secretary of the comitia curiata was also the president of the urban management (Erten, 1999).

3.2. Local Governments in Feudal Periods

In feudal times, the cities are at first connected to feudal managers. But this connection is much more related to power which is beyond today's understanding. Within the process the development of trade in cities has made it possible for the bourgeoisie to become an important actor in the city life after the 10th century. Even though the city of Middle Age has feudal structure and is just a residential area, bourgeoisie city is a kind of city where economic activities are on the forefront. The bourgeoisie class which does trade has established new cities around feudal principalities where the transportation is easy. The bourgs where the bourgeoisie live firstly have gained privileges about judgment and then have declared their autonomy. This autonomy includes levying tax which will meet their expenses and collecting these taxes (Pirene, 2000).

In the Middle Age Europe, cities emerged either as independent, autonomous or under the protection of the king with the development of communes that were established in the trading cities with licenses which were received from the church or the king by force or as a result of reconciliation by the merchants and the public of the city. Even though the power of the commune cities is under the control of one person, the autonomous structure is a feature that makes them stronger against the central government. It is thought that the fact that the communes have autonomous management institutions has significant contribution in the establishment of modern managements (Pirene, 2000).

3.3. Local Governments in Capitalist System

We see the emergence of nation-states as of 16th century in line with the development of capitalism. When the main institution of public administration was the city previous, the notions of nation and empire were in the background. People used to consider themselves as city dwellers and then they used to identify themselves with their cities or the regions (Keleş, 2009).

After the French Revolution, the obstacles before the bourgeoisies began to disappear in line with the development of nation-states and there were intensive migration from rural to urban as a result of the production activities in cities. In 1970 in France there were discussions about the election or urban managers by the elites. The reason behind this was that only this segment of the society could pay tax because of their property in the cities. In this period Napoleon made it possible for mayors to be determined by means of appointment not by means of election. In this era, the local government understanding in France affected all Europe. With the developments in France, in 1835 a definition of local governments was used in England for the first time. At the same dates, member of city councils were established in order to supervise the management of municipality. The mayors began to take office with re-election (Erten, 1999).

The beginnings of 20th century have been a period in which major developments were experienced in terms of local governments. In this period, the local

governments could find necessary amount of money for their expenses and were able to provide more services to the local public than the central government provided. Also in this period the scope of local governments expanded with economic and technological developments. With the expansion of the area of influence of the local governments, pragmatic methods have been developed in order to solve the problems beyond value judgments and beliefs so as to increase their productivity. For this aim, the number of technocrats in these units has been increased and political context has become of secondary importance (Keleş, 2009).

One of the significant features of this period is that especially in 1980s the local governments were increasingly restructured in order to meet the needs of the capital. With the neoliberal transformation in the world, a local government understanding which harmonizes with the market order has been shaped instead of a local government model as an instrument of mass consumption which stems from the welfare state of Keynes.

3.4. Urbanization and Local Government in Socialism

3.4.1. Socialism and Urbanization

Ideal foundations of socialism have been shaped by Marx, Engels, Lenin and its practical applications have been basically put forward by Stalin and Mao. In socialism the relation between society and space and urbanization has emerged as a product of a specific historical process and has been developed in accordance with the relations between forces of production and production. In the economic model which is based on the socialization of the production instruments differently from the private property, it has been aimed that the income is distributed in an even way.

The cities in socialist systems bear the trace of the social systems that have been experienced before. Just like Marx states, every social structure bears the marks of the system in which it is born like the infants who carry the marks of their mothers. In accordance with this, socialist cities have been built on the signs and

symbols that carry the social indications the previous capitalist and feudal periods. The main goal of the planners in the socialist system is to put forward the solutions as fast as possible in order to erase these marks.

3.4.1.1. Urbanization Styles in Socialist Countries

In Soviet Union, Stalin has emphasized that socialist city should have its own unique identity differently from capitalist model. A system which puts forward significant objectives such as new individual and free world and establishment of cities which disconnects with the past in terms of urbanization and planning and which will show equality and freedom in its real sense have been defined as inevitable factors for achieving the goal of communism. Together with Soviet Union other Eastern Europe countries have developed specific methods in order to achieve this goal. But in this sense some countries could not go beyond their present urbanization models.

As opposed to popular belief, socialist planners and architects such as Frank Lloyd Wright and le Corbusier who have been chosen to do the city plan of Moscow have been affected largely by the capitalist society in terms of their habits and understanding. In addition, The Institute of History, Theory and Long Term Problems of Soviet Architecture has declared that they do not have a notion of communist city which has solid infrastructure and is considered multi-dimensionally (Keleş. 2000).

Both the Soviet Union and other Eastern Europe countries have turned large fields and grasslands into big cities in order to settle the working class. The main aim here was to develop new socialist city models by preventing accumulation around large iron and steel complexes. After the revolution, approximately 900 cities were built. It has been much easier to build these new cities than to make the old cities more harmonized with socialist model. Almost all the socialist countries have strived to establish new cities that are appropriate for socialist model but the most successful country in this sense is Yugoslavia.

3.4.1.2. Main Differences of Socialist Cities from Capitalist Cities

The facts that production instruments and city's land is not related with private property, and there are no significant economic, social and spatial differences between the neighborhoods that people live are the most important factors that separate the socialist city from the capitalist city. Undoubtedly, there are contradictions in socialist cities but the old habits and value judgments have been eradicated thoroughly in units of local and central governments. It is inevitable that there are some deficiencies and faults. But, it is not possible for these faults to happen in a way in which they happen in capitalist society.

The facts that the basic necessities such as the quality of living places, housing and basic urban services are meet at a certain level, the social structure is of the same kind between the cities and in all parts of the cities are the fundamental principles that the socialist city is based on differently from capitalist city (Keleş. 2000).

Wealthy families' living in luxurious and rich neighborhoods and poor, oppressed groups' living in poor modest neighborhoods in deprived of services should not be observed in socialist cities. The high number of unemployed people living in ghettos and big cities is a problem unique to capitalist city and cannot be in socialist city. Every part of the socialist city should improve in a way which is open to all segments of the society and is easy to access by all citizens.

3.4.1.3. City and Urbanization in Soviet Union and China

3.4.1.3.1. The Soviet Union

The first years of soviet revolution have gone by ensuring that groups in large rural areas participate in the socialist construction process and attracting them to move to cities. The most important factor in this period is that soviet revolution is dependent on proletarian powers in rural areas and that it is basically a working class revolution based on cities. But, civil war in the early years of the revolution

as well as other impossibilities have resulted in migration of city dwellers groups to rural areas and it has continued until the revolution becomes self-sufficient and stronger (Stalin, 1997).

A rapid industrialization process has been envisaged in order to eliminate the contradiction between village and city which is advocated by Lenin, to ensure the integration of both the city dwellers working class and peasant groups and to make sure that they have equal share from the development. In this way, with a development based on heavy industry, agricultural production will turn into a production model that will contribute to the development of industrialization in rural regions; thus sectoral cohesion will be ensured and both the rural and the city will become units that complete each other (Stalin, 1997).

After World War II, the population growth has been limited in big cities and the population growth of Moscow has been stopped at five million. In addition, increasing population has been directed to medium-sized cities and especially new cities in inner parts. Satellite cities have been constructed near the big cities so that the working group could find job without moving away. Apart from this, the projects of agricultural cities have been tried to be implemented in order to eliminate the rural-village contradiction. But, when it was understood that this was not just a spatial problem but an economic issue, this method was ended. The problem of urbanization has been considered as a central problem differently from capitalist systems and has been tried to be solved by integrative policies (Keleş. 2000).

3.4.1.3.2. China

People's Republic of China has followed a different urbanization policy which is different from the Soviets. The rural areas have been designed in a way which will circle the cities. It can be said that people war strategy in China is great effect on this. The people war in China is based on the model of invasion of cities by the peasant segment of the society under the leadership of communist part and their realizing the revolution, which is different from collective rebel in Russia.

Although working class party has the leadership of the revolution, the main power has been peasantry on the basis of the conditions (Mao, 2000).

In early years of the revolution, there was a rapid increase in China. The reason of this was both natural population growth and rapid migration to Beijing. In 1967 the urban population increased from seven million to 130 million. The restrictions and measures that the state takes were not able to prevent the migration. These measures have been implemented meticulously as of 1957. This policy has required that the priority should be given to agriculture and the industry should be considered as a sovereign segment (Keleş. 2000).

The foundation of the urbanization policies applied in Chine lays in Maoism. Being backward economically has necessarily brought along an economic development which is based on agriculture. Within this framework, even though agriculture is the priority, the real issue is to ensure development and promotion in industry in following processes. What is much more important for Mao is to obtain the voluntary participation of the public in this development process and to ensure the development of production relations; which is beyond the understanding of rush development of forces of productions. That is why; different from the Soviet model, the main aim of this model is not the quick progress that is made real in industry against the probable attack coming from imperialism. Instead of this, although it might be slow, they tried to actualize an economical progress which is created by public involvement with the help of campaign made for community. Therefore, elimination of rural-city differentiation within the process is the main objective.

As of the first years of the revolution in China, cities have been not only production regions but also settlement areas. Cities have been always an attraction point for peasant groups in spite of the efforts to have a balance in relations between city and village. But in 1962 a decision of sending the excessive population to villages was taken. The aim was to increase the production in rural

areas and to ensure proletarianization by including city dwellers managers who become bureaucrats in the production process (Mao, 2000).

The main organization units in cities are city communes. The main idea behind the city communes; like village communes, is to establish an integrated settlement unit which includes industrial, agricultural, cultural and military issues. What is intended is to make the cities production units where people not only live but also both live and work. In other words, city communes will be the implementation of the revolution in cities which occurs in villages (Mao, 2000).

3.4.1.4. City and Planning In Socialism

Urban planning and city planning have important place in a socialist society where processes and events are discussed entirely and where the solutions are obtained as a product of a dialectic process. The discussion on how cities should be planned according to this understanding is not specific to only socialist societies. In the past, these kinds of discussions were held between Robert Owen, Charles Fourier, and Pierre Joseph Proudhon who were considered as utopian socialists. The example city of Owen and Planstere of Fourier have been considered as the ideas of reformists who have dealt with these issues in an era when urban panning did not exist. We can see criticisms of big industrial cities that alienate people in these ideas. Ensuring that people live humanly, rationality, an environment which will be created in accordance with scientific and technical principles are the common wishes of this group which is considered as utopian (Keleş. 2000).

3.4.1.4.1. Planning Principles for Socialist City

Socialist city planning principles have to provide an integral view which is different from capitalist understanding. First of all right to private property on every kind of land has been lifted and income of land has been presented to the use for the sake of the public. Secondly, standardization is an important principle, in other words it is important to determine criteria for the standardization of the

housing. Thirdly, appropriate size needs to be ensured for socialist city and some limitations are needed. The fourth feature is that city centers which are considered as business and trade centers should have political, cultural and managerial characteristic in contrary to this understanding. The fifth one is the harmony of city plans with the plans for higher scales. The sixth feature is making city public primary managers and voluntary workers of the plans that are tried to be realized instead of developing ways to ensure the participation of city public to the plans as stated in the capitalist system. The seventh feature is ensuring right to housing for everybody and finally integral neighborhood units which are needed to be considered while designing neighborhoods (Keleş. 2000).

3.4.2. Socialism and Local Governments

Socialism has endeavored to develop an alternative political, managerial structure as a social system which is the alternative of capitalism. Especially the soviet model is a significant example of this effort. Together with central and local units, it is aimed to ensure that the public live in an equalitarian and libertarian atmosphere. Above, the soviet model will be tackled in detail.

3.4.2.1. Local Governments in the Soviet Union

The main purpose of the soviet model is to realize the disappearance process of the state while the local units that will be established in socialist society gain authorities from the power of central state gradually within the period of transition to communism. Within this framework, the works in the local will be undertaken by paid experts in a specific period of socialism but the power will increasingly pass to the Soviets in the local with the transformations social infrastructure and superstructure; thus the state will disappear. But this has remained unfulfilled and has not been materialized.

3.4.2.1.1. The Main Features of Soviet Model

The Soviet Model has two main features. The first one is being power organ of local Soviets. This means that the power is exercised not only by central

legislative organs but also by local public council. The second one is democratic centralization. This means that every local executive committee (council) is liable to both local council and higher executive committee. The first connection of liability is defined as democratic in horizontal plane; the second one is defined as central at the top.

3.4.2.1.2. Problems of Soviet Model

The position of the Soviets, the power organ of the model, at local level and within the central hierarchical relation is an issue of discussion. In Soviet Union where the Soviet Model was first implemented, it is natural that the model was not materialized in the period of 1917-1950 because of civil war conditions, poverty and lack of education. While the Bolsheviks had to govern the state which includes approximately half million personal and which belongs to the Czarism, the number of educated people who were in favor of revolution was just %3 of the whole population. The number of experts who would govern the country was insufficient and the people in the present positions joined the army in case of an enemy danger. In the early years, &12 of the personal in the cities and %4 of the personal in towns have received higher education. The management at the sub-district level was under control of peasants who did not support the revolution because of anti-religion propagandas of the revolutionists and the policies of embargoing the products because of the war. Because of the problems that have been experienced, the Soviet model has not been materialized until the end of World War II (Stalin, 1997).

3.4.2.1.3. Strengthening the Local Governments

In 1950s, Second World War was succeeded and objectives such as industrialization and education were reached to some degree and also consumption demands differed and thus increased. The central government has become inadequate in meeting the different needs and demands, so it has been envisaged that the Soviets should be strengthened as local government organs and until the disappearance of reel socialism, these issues have always been on the

agenda in the Soviet Union and other Eastern Europe countries. It can be said that although there have been frequent legal amendments, a lot of campaigns and mobilization in these countries for this purpose, they have been insufficient. The main purpose of the policies that aim at strengthening the local Soviets in socialist countries is to create fewer large scale local units and to increase he authorities of local Soviets. In this context, in many countries legal amendments have been made and thus certain services such as transportation, road, police offices, and fire departments have been handed on local units (Güler, 2006).

3.4.2.1.4. The Unification of Local Units and Democratic Centralization

The general tendency is to enlarge the scales of local units even if it happens in different ways in every socialist country. While many changes have not been observed in East Germany, Czechoslovakia and some small Soviet republics, the number of local units has been increased from 300 to 1370 in Hungary and has been decreased from 4315 to 2060 in Poland (Güler, 2006).

Another tool for dynamizing the local soviets, was to eliminate the faults in the implementations of democratic centralization. Almost in all socialist countries, the horizontal dimension of democratic centralization has overridden the democratic dimension. The significant reasons of this fact are the commitment of local Soviets to the higher unit and the commitment of different units in the Soviets to the superior. In this sense, we can see a process which would cause authority confusion within wholly vertical relations and vertical relations have been ignored. Another problem is that individuals in local party organization have headed towards local executive units instead of local Soviets and that as a result, councils and party-rule have become equal. This has resulted in intertwining of party and soviet functions (Güler, 2006).

3.4.2.1.5. Local Governments and Utilization of Resources

Senior local Soviets, local Soviets at medium and low levels (places where workers live and villages), they all have utilized 20% of the budget of USSR from

1950s until now. The way of utilizing this amount of the budget has not changed significantly since 1940s; this fact shows that the way of utilizing resources needs to be analyzed in a socialist country in another way which is different than the one in a capitalist society. In socialist society, local government is the producer. It takes part actively as a founder and manager in many fields such as trade-service network, restaurants, education and housing. Even if it seems little to have only 20% share for such a wide working field extending from daily education and health services to trade, we can say that such an assumption will be wrong considering that fixed capital investments are realized by the central and the share of local Soviets is used mostly for service costs.

In Soviet model we do not observe an unequal distribution between different social classes in terms of the utilization of the resources that is observed in capitalist systems. On the contrary, system of resource utilization is determined by factors such as level of living, family structure. However, in socialist societies the complaints generally stem from imbalance between regions in the utilization of resources or inadequate housing (Güler, 2006).

3.5. Alternative Local Government Experiences in the World

Socialist governments in the world have been the leaders in terms of defining the path that will ensure the salvation of the working class. Especially Paris commune is an important example in terms of revolutionary practical experiences. On the other hand, worker council and practices which are in the format of "Little Moscows" in capitalist countries are significant processes that need to be analyzed. Worker councils have tried to establish local self-government organs in capitalist cities by the means of committees that they have established illegally by abandoning inner-system solutions. Thus, with revolutionary ways, they have tried to change the groups that have been excluded from power mechanisms. On the other hand, we can say that Little Moscows emerged in Europe in 1930s. Socialist governments that take the office with municipality elections that are held in the local within capitalist system have followed policies that contradict with capitalist structure of the society and have constructed "socialism islands". Both

of the approaches have been applied by local publics in various parts of the world until now in order to resist capitalist policies and neoliberal applications. Analysis of these applications that have occurred throughout world is of great importance in understanding different types of anti-capitalist struggles.

3.5.1. The Paris Commune

 In France-Prussia war, after France was defeated, the France Government tried to send troops in order to stop the public to get artilleries of Paris National Guard, but the soldiers refused to shoot at the public that hooted and directed their guns to their officers. Thus, the Paris Commune started on the 18th of March. As it is stated in Marxist theory, commune is the first workers' government in the history. Even though it survived only 71 days, this government has become a main guide in the strategic and programmatic construction of next workers' movement.

Commune wishes to remove class property which transfers the labor of all to the prosperity of a few and aims at turning those who dispossess into those who are dispossessed. Commune has created a National Guard troop that is mostly composed of workers who have been disbanded from the army. In addition, commune has tried to eliminate the power of priests who are spiritual pressure tools and has agreed on that all churches would be disposed and become dispossessed (www.marksist.org).

Closed businesses because of the Bismarck Army attack was re-opened according to a decision of workers' associations. It has been stated in the decree published by Paris Centre Committee that abandoned workshops should be itemized and their places should be found and draft bylaws of workers' cooperatives should be prepared.

Rental payments have been delayed and measures that would ensure that homeless people could return to their homes and acquire homes have been taken. Priorities have been given to cooperatives for the instruments of the state; it has been lifted that workers in bakeries would not work at nights, minimum wage

guarantee has been provided, the wages have been equalized and employment bureaus have been organized. The factories that were abandoned and did not run have been handed over to workers' cooperatives. The management of the businesses has been left to a factory committee that was formed with participation of all workers

The measures of commune concerning private property are in a way which ensures that factory and workplace councils would have control over the management and supervision of the facilities. It has been believed that in this way a real democracy could be obtained (www.ozgurluk-dergisi.org).

When commune is analyzed, two significant features draw the attention. First one is that it has always been wished that institutions such as army, police force, courts and parliament which is based on national representation would be dissolved and bourgeois state structure would be abolished. The second one is that a democratic government which aims at direct participation of public militia, public courts and public communes instead of these institutions has been targeted.

3.5.2. Mexico: EZLN, Caracoles

In the new year of 1994 when NAFTA (North African Free Trade Agreement) which Mexico signed with USA and Canada would come into force, Mayans of Chiapas rebelled under the leadership of EZLN (Zapatista National Liberation Army). After short conflicts in 1996 San Andres treaty was signed with government of Mexico. But, in 2001 the Congress annulled the treaty with "Law of Natives". As a result, EZLN established local units that they named as Caracol and declared their autonomy (Özbudun, 2009).

Caracols have been divided into five administrative regions that are named differently by each rebellious community and that include and represent each ethnic group that are different from each other. In every region, a unit where affiliated communities are represented works. Every unit represents five-six "Zapatista Rebellious Autonomous Municipality (MARZ)". Every autonomous

municipality is managed by an autonomous council which serves two-three years. The duties of these councils are to ensure justice and to carry out the services of health, education, housing, food, trade, informatics and culture. Daily life in the communities, planning production, problems encountered in the operation of cooperatives such as shoe and hand-made in the field of community and operation of school and health care centers are among the responsibilities of these councils (Özbudun, 2009).

Units that are composed of delegates who have been assigned alternately by autonomous councils of a region fulfill duties of a kind of "union of municipalities". The fact that each Caracol includes four-five different unit teams makes it possible that managerial duty is realized weekly and alternately, that in time all grown-up members of the community participate in these units. Council members work alternately and do not acquire any fee. Only advantage that is provided for council members is that throughout the time they are in charge in the council, their fields are cultivated by the members of the community. The core of the unit management is composed of paying attention and reacting not imposing. In case of situations such as intolerance, corruption, injustice, these units are under the supervision of local secret revolutionary committees in every region (Özbudun, 2011).

In addition to these, the government of Mexico has wished to attract the public in the region by providing services to the areas where they live. On the other hand, it has been thought that such kind of practical applications would pave the way for EZLN to stop carrying guns.

3.5.3. Porto Alegre Municipality and The Practice Of Participatory Budget

Participatory Budget (PB) was first applied in Porto Alegre which is the capital of Rio Grande Do Sul state of South Brazil when municipal election was won by Brazilian Labor Party (PTB) in 1989.

PTB was founded in 1980 by trade unionists, left Christians and Marxist militants under harsh conditions when they were in anti-fascist struggle. It emerged as a political struggle against military dictatorship in outskirts of Sao Paulo. PTB was able to been applied thanks to self-assertiveness of the political power. The approach of political power is important in mobilizing and informing public for their participations in the process (www.sol-hareket.org).

Participatory budget means that public plays guiding role on the expenses of municipality budget. In other words, choices of expenses are made by public. This is not just about economical figure it also means participatory democracy. In this sense, participatory budget means promotion of active citizenship, social justice and managerial reforms. This need stems from the demand of Brazilian public who has long lived under the dictatorship for ensuring transparency and explicitness of state by means of democratizing the state and decentralization. Public wants to get involved in policy making (www.sol-hareket.org).

With this application, the public has defined its priorities, has set rules for the running of the budget, has chosen its advisors for PB and has established co-management process of the city. Thus, PB has contributed to the democratization of state-society relations and has ensured that citizens would play active role in public administration and would supervise the public in a way that is maybe the first example of its kind in the world. The public has experienced a transition from passive citizenship to active citizenship by participating in the formation of the budget. For this reason, this process is called as "citizenship schools".

The municipality has always informed the public about time and place of the meetings and has tried to organize meeting in appropriate time and close places. Meeting places were movie theatres, theatres, churches and even circuses.

Table 3-1. The Public Participation in Pb in Porto Alegre Municipality

Year	Regional Meetings	Thematic Meetings	Total
1989	1510		1510
1990	976		976
1991	3694		3694
1992	7610		7610
1993	10735		10735
1994	9638	1609	11247
1995	11281	2446	14267
1996	10148	1793	11941
1997	11908	4153	16061
1998	13687	2769	16456
1999	16813	3911	20724
2000	15065	3694	18759

Source: (Tarso, G. & U, Souza, 1999).

Table 3-2. Cities That Accept Participatory Budget

Year	Cities
1989	4
1989/1992	12
1993/1996	36
1997/2000	138

Source: (Tarso, G. & U, Souza, 1999).

According to participatory budget system, every year in March public chooses neighborhood delegates who will state the tendencies. As of April, these delegates hold regional meetings in order to discuss the investments made in previous year, currently carried out projects and investment that will be made next year. Negotiations are ended with election of regional delegates which happens in June and in these elections every region has a right to choose two representatives. They compose 32 representatives of the decision-mechanism which is called "participatory budget". With the representatives of trade unions, cooperatives and non-governmental organization this number reaches to 44. The council defines how the budget will be used in coordination with planning and organization which are two main mechanisms of the president (Tarso, G. & U, Souza, 1999).

Participatory budget includes three types of participation. These are; direct participation, representative participation and real participation. Direct participation is seen in regional and thematic sessions and in a lot of meetings with communities. Representative participation constitutes delegates of Regional and Thematic Forums. Participatory Budget Commission (COP) is the highest

decision organ related to public budget in Porto Alegre (Tarso, G. & U, Souza, 1999).

In 1989, public of Porto Alegre found out that the urgent problem of the city was sewage system. The municipality spent four years for the infrastructure of Porto Alegre. While the priorities were agriculture, education and health respectively in 1999, education, agriculture and transportation were defined as the priorities in 2000 and a share was allocated from the budget according to this order (Tarso, G. & U, Souza, 1999).

When the applications in Porto Alegre are analyzed, it is seen that budget planning has been made after open to public discussions which lasted for months instead of the bureaucracy.

3.5.4. Curitiba

Architect Jamie Lerner began to implement a comprehensive project in order to change the tendency of using private cars instead of public transportation vehicles in urban transportation when he was elected for the first time in 198-1992 period. He aimed at finding inexpensive but effective solutions for the city by using the current potential instead of big and costly projects. Lerner tried to make the bus lines more convenient and preferable instead of carrying out a high-cost subway project for public transportation that would last for many years (Saner, 2004).

First of all, old busses were combined and three-layered new busses that have 270-passenger capacity were obtained. For these vehicles, specific bus lanes which have right of way and which are in circular way in the city center, in radial way from center to distal areas, were opened. Special bus stops were designed. At the end, with its passenger capacity and speed the fast bus system which presents transit pass and easy access to every corner of the city and which runs like the subway but cost one eightieth of the cost of subway construction became unique for Curitiba and within a sort time namely in six months it began to work.

Urban waste is another problem of Curitiba. The wastes are separated by citizens at their homes and given to garbage men in specific times instead of collecting waste in a single place and separating wastes there so that they can be recycled. Thus, the responsibility shared by all the citizens makes recycling easier and cheaper. In residential areas belonging to relatively low-income groups where collecting vehicles cannot reach, wastes that are separated at homes are brought to recycling centers by the people, themselves. In return for waste they bring, essential food stuffs that are produced in fields around the city with low cost, or bus tickets are given free of charge. Other waste separating works apart from those which are done by large majority of the city are carried out by homeless people, alcohol and drug addicts in recycling centers. In this way, people who have been excluded from the society are reintegrated into the society. Thus, the responsibility shared by public contributes greatly to balancing the social structure (Saner, 2004).

When the three terms in which Jaime Lerner was Mayor of Curitiba are analyzed, we can say that Curitiba can be a model for cities that face with similar problems in order to understand how local government notion can be analyzed with local approaches. Cities can turn into livable places through participation of citizens who do not only expect management and service provision but also who act together against common problems and a shared responsibility by all public.

The reasons why citizens of Curitiba see their city as the best place to live and thus why Jamie Lerner is considered as a legend of local government are basically that the citizens embrace their own city and that people responsible for the management of the city create an environment of mutual trust. City dwellers can participate in government only if there is an environment of trust and then important steps can be made for the cities and they become livable places (Saner, 2004).

3.5.5. Marinaleda

Marinaleda is a town in Andalusia which is like a large village. But, it is a town that attracted the attention of the world. Sanchez Gordillo who is the mayor of the town for 30 years where Marx would have lived if he had not died, explains the process in El Mundo Newspaper. He states "the first handicap was to eliminate the political framework that Franco dictatorship cast upon the local governments. Franco regime saw the municipalities as guards of central power not as a unit of service, solidarity and struggle and they were organized in this way. Second important problem was unemployment that was experienced throughout Andalusia. 70% of active population in Marinaleda was unemployed. Therefore, we started to fight for land. Being land owner meant having a product instrument; having a product instrument and working on land meant opening up new employment areas. We were able to solve land problem thanks to our fights against governments and bourgeois landlords which took different shapes in time. The real struggle was against Duke of Infantado. Duke had 17 thousand hectare land in all Andalusia. Some of the land was empty and was not cultivated. As a result of fight and struggle, we obtained 1200 hectare of Duke's land. We established an industry based on agriculture. We turned public works such as production areas and housing construction into a tool for eliminating unemployment. It is actually very simple; if you establish a solidarity economy, then everyone can have a job." (www.birgün.net).

Everything was about unemployment. Firstly, units have been set up for fighting against unemployment, and then these units have organized first movements and protests. These organizations which were based on fight against unemployment have gained political feature in time. Peasants have set up committees where they discussed their problems in every neighborhood and then all budget of the municipality have become open and every citizen have earned right to have a say on the budget. Workers participated politically in Workers' Union Collective and they involved in the local election with this organization in 1979. They won the

elections with absolute majority and thus they won the position of mayor. Since that date, all elections have been won (www.birgün.net).

Leftist leader Gordillo states "people who create wealth by working need to control the production instruments in order to ensure full employment in a society. Almost all constitutions and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights consider working and having a job as a right. But unfortunately, there are 1,3 billion unemployed people in the world. The reason for this is simple: capitalism shapes and organizes society in a way in which a few people become wealthy despite poverty and unemployment of overwhelming majority." With these facts in mind, Leader Gordillo lives and fights in the same way with people he represents.

The main features of the model in Marinaleda can be listed as follows:

- Constantly being in the struggle for earning rights,
- Ensuring the broadest participation of all people living in Marinaleda,
- Accepting that having a house and a job is a right,
- Ensuring equality among leaders, managers and people they represent (www.birgün.net).

There are some examples of cases where these features can be seen. The land outside Marinaleda has been declared as public land open for urbanization because having house was considered as a right. Thus, the land has been given to young people who wanted to have their own houses. In addition, they have been provided with equipments necessary for construction and have been supported. 300 three-room houses which have 100 square meters area have been constructed.

There was not any municipal police in the town. According to Mayor Gordillo, it has not been observed that anybody damaged municipal property because the whole town agreed on the works done by the municipality. Mayor and members of municipality council did not get any wages and mayor made a living from his wage as a high school teacher. When any of them needed a house, their names were written at the end of the list of people who would get land for house (www.birgün.net).

Red markets were the days when voluntary works were carried out for the sake of the community. During these days, on the basis of voluntarism they cleaned their streets, constructed roads and carried out other similar infrastructure works. The real aim was to ensure that people would understand that they did not need to work just for money. This was also a practice which reinforced community's living together and solidarity.

3.5.6. Nepal

NKP (M) took a resolution on the subject of "Development of Democracy in 21st Century" in 2003 as a result of experiences they have acquired from counter-revolutions in socialist countries. In this resolution it has been emphasized that the issue of democratization of the state until it is totally abolished is much more complicated and harder than acquiring the power of state. Therefore, the real problem was how to combine proletarian dictatorship which has constantly a perspective of revolution with the duties of daily operation of the state (www.solundogusu.net).

Today, there is United Revolutionary People's Assembly at central level; below it, at regional level there are various autonomous regional governments which are national or based on land; below autonomous regions there are villages and neighborhood groups. At all levels, there are managerial organs and people's assemblies based on public representation act. There is still an ongoing effort for staffs and groups to comprehend that people's committees are different than party committees. Only in this way, a new state power which is more effective and accountable at local level can be established and it is thought that people's committees can earn necessary authority in order to act independently. Therefore, there are regular elections for people's committees in every possible place for groups' supervision, their monitoring and their working under intervention when needed (www.solundogusu.net).

The organization in the areas where People's Committees operate is divided in three levels; county, village and hamlet. Some of the people's committees at hamlet level have been united in order to create Example Villages for the purposes of strengthening, centralizing and uniting the works of People's Power. Generally, almost all members of these committees are households who have been organized in party, mass organizations or militia forces. In these example villages, Dalits (members of pariah castes which are located at the bottom of the social hierarchy of Nepal) and women have been granted with special representation rights. Women have earned the equal right to heritage and it has been forbidden to exclude Dalits. Schools operate in salvaged regions and children are thought in their own languages with books prepared by education department of NKP(M). Throughout the country, a great number of communes and agriculture cooperatives operate at different levels in base regions (www.solundogusu.net).

3.6. Evaluation of Experiences in the World in the Context of Their Relation with the Case Study

Both the local administration experiences of socialist countries in the world and also anti-capitalist local administration models in capitalist countries constitutes significant base for the case study. Domination of pre-capitalist economical structures and in connection to this, feudal characteristic of social structure in the study area enables comparison mostly with the examples of underdeveloped countries. As the production relations analyzed in the study area, it is obviously seen that precapitalist mode of production types still keeps their domination. Based on this structure anti-capitalist governmental transformations do not occur easily as it is occurred in the developed cities. But there are some examples mentioned before like Marinaleda and Curitiba, although they are more developed cities than Hozat, are important esperiences in the field of participation to government. In addition, red market experience occurred in Marinaleda is remarkable. According to this project, the municipality aimed to ensure the people residing in the city to aware of the fact that they did not need to work just for money. This was also a practice which reinforced community's living together and solidarity. This practice can try to implement in the study area. The

agricultural cooperatives and market networks will be tried in Hozat to reinforce the solidarity and fair distribution of the sources.

Nepal and Mexico experiences are especially important in this sense. Because the political fraction supporting the Mayor introduce themselves as Maoist and they take red political power model that is applied in the China in the past as a basis in their revolution strategies. On the other hand, as shall be observed at the case study section, the issues such as democratic centralism, socialism, red and technical contradiction continuing between the Soviets and China for years, are important discussion issues for the administrative structure of the Municipality. Because some of the people questioned in the study area believed that either the Mayor or any political activist in the study area must work together with the workers and farmers. On the other hand, participatory budget application in Porto-Alegre and examples of public participation to the administration in Spain are also important for the case study area.

CHAPTER 4

4. TRANSFORMATION OF LOCAL GOVERNMENTS IN TURKEY

4.1. Historical Background of Municipalities in Our Country

The history of local governments in our country does not have a long history as the Western countries and it is known that the duties of local governments have been carried out by trade corporations and foundations. It can be said that the status of an officialized local government in Ottoman Empire was necessary fro the centralized structure of the empire and as a result of the pressure of Western states it emerged on the basis of rights that the minorities tried to acquire in social life. There were people called as "qadi" who were responsible for the duties of government, municipality and also judiciary duties before Tanzimat reform era based on Arabian and Islamic traditions. The most important work that the qadis were responsible was to audit craftsmen. It can be said that a centralized structure prevailed in local governments which became clear with Tanzimat. Groups who were in favor of Tanzimat, have tried to institutionalize local governments and their aim in doing this was to make central government more organized in the field of order and tax collecting which are considered as interference of central government into local areas (Keleş, 2009).

First municipality organization was established in Istanbul in 1855. A "Şehremini" was appointed by the government and there was a city council composed of 12 people. This council was composed of respected and reliable people living in Istanbul and two third of the members should be renewed every year. Before the establishment of this organization, a commission called as "Order of the City" most of which was composed of foreign national people, was established whose duty was to make suggestions to the municipalities which were to be established. Based on these suggestions, sixth "Municipal Departments" which included Beyoglu and Galata districts of Istanbul was established. A manager appointed by the government and a council whose 7 members were chosen and appointed by the government were in charge of this organization.

Then with "Dersaadet Municipal Administrative Regulation" which was issued in 1869, municipality became widespread and Istanbul Şehremini institution which had 14 departments in charge of local governments in various districts was established. Dersaadet Municipality Law which was issued in 1877 preserved old municipality organization the way it was but increased the number of municipality departments to 20 (Keleş, 2009).

After the declaration of 2. Meşrutiyet in 1908, Emergency Decree about Dersaadet Municipality was issued in 1912 and preserved the centralized tradition. But, this decree abolished Municipality Departments and replaced them with municipality and branch offices. This structure sustained its presence unchanged until Municipality Law No:1580 was issued in 1930 after the declaration of the Republic. Municipality Law No:1580 which was in force since 1930, was lifted with the Law No:5393 in 2005 (Sütlüoğlu, 1999).

There were many initiatives to establish municipality organization outside Istanbul since 1868. City Public Administration Regulation in 1870 made it mandatory to establish a municipality organization at the levels of city, district and sub district. City Municipality Law prepared in 1876 envisaged that a municipality would be established in every city and town. Mayor would be appointed among council members by the government, council members would be elected by the public, and Municipal Association would be formed with the combination of "Local Administrative Council" with "Municipal Council" (UPL, 2002).

4.2. Transformation Phases of Local Governments in Turkey

Transformation phases of local governments in our country can roughly be divided into five periods: period from Ottoman to 1930, the period between 1931 and 1945 in which etatism prevails at local level, period between 1946-1960 in which traditional urban elements prevail in councils, local powers transformation and squatting period between 1961 and 1980 and new partnerships period which

is based on interest alliance of capital with small producers from 1980 today (Güler, 2006).

4.2.1. Development of Local Governments from Ottoman Till 1930

In order to analyze the historical development of local governments in our country, it goes without saying that we need to examine these periods in economic, political and managerial contexts.

4.2.1.1. Period of Economic Change and Local Governments

Analyzing this process economically is an issue of discussion which should be carried out within the framework of serious and deep data but it would be beneficial to analyze the economic structure of Ottoman Empire in order to understand the changing managerial structure. The aim of this study is neither to tackle deeply the issues such as Ottoman economic structure and the components of this structure which are agricultural structure, management types, production relations, distribution relations, social class and segments nor to discuss feudal and Asian-type production style. The main aim of this study is evaluate main features of economic relations which will facilitate understanding the managerial structure which was inherited from Ottoman Empire.

Feudal property differs fundamentally from modern bourgeoisie property. Within feudal units, the property of land belongs to the land owner and he hereditarily has the right of disposition of the land he has cultivated in serf (Eaton, 1997). In lands belonging to personal or family property feudal rights of feudal manager have turned into modern private property. With Republic the Civil Law legalized these two types of land possession (Noviçev, 1979).

The Civil Law does not have a proper answer to land property passed from Ottoman because Switzerland Civil Law which Civil Law was taken is based on modern bourgeoisie property. For this reason new land reform was discussed within 1961 Constitution.

Large property lands have not been thoroughly turned into private property in a modern sense with Civil Law and this situation has not lead to any change in the current situation of production relations in the regions where not only traditional relations but also traditional production methods dominate. In many Anatolian regions feudal relations have been sustained (Boratav, 2004).

In the cases where the whole or large amount of land of village belong to individuals or families, peasants who constitute the village society have continued to pay their taxes to the land governor in small lands and in a sharecropping way. It can be said that share cropping method corresponds fully to feudal relations in the regions where production instruments apart from land generally belong to land owner and in addition where houses and annexed places, meadow and pasture lands seem to belong to land owner.

As a summary, it can be said that this economic structure which was passed from Ottoman has reproduced itself due to being in touch with capitalist production method for a long time even though it experienced certain changes. Therefore, it will be appropriate to define economic structure which was inherited from this period as a semi-feudal period in which capitalist and feudal relations have been experienced closely. Thus, transition processes in managerial structure have occurred depending upon and related with changes in economic structure.

On the other hand, the transition process which local governments in Turkey passed through from 1930s till 1980s was completed by England between 1882 and 1884, by France after 1848 revolution. The common feature following this period is that a serious centralization was in force. In England and France where feudal elements in the economic field were eliminated to a great extend, local positions were captured in a short while. In turkey however this process was much more problematic (Güler, 2006). The reason was that elimination of feudal factors in economic and social areas was very hard. In every period, political circles where these groups are represented and capital groups which these circles rely on,

have always found political parties within the state and around themselves which rely on them.

4.2.1.2. Political Change Processes and Local Governments

Many discussions related to local governments in Turkey have taken centralized structure of Ottoman Empire and political periods which complete this process as a starting point. After analyzing economic structure within a specific framework, it is important to have a deep look into political framework of this period in order to understand the transformation of local governments within this time.

Many historians who write about Ottoman Empire stress that religion was an important factor in the establishment of Ottoman Empire. On the other hand, the main reason behind underdevelopment in Ottoman Empire in last periods was related with religion. Considered within Marxist view, it is seen that religion is an ideology. Ottoman social formation is based on religion-based ideological legitimization just like before itself and those alike it. Stating that religion plays positive role in a period negative role in another period is shaped as a product of a Europe-centered ideology.

Last two hundred years of Ottoman Empire are discussed as a history of colonization. Since that period on, it can be said that the place and position of Turkey within capitalist world system have continued without any serious change. In last eras of Ottoman Empire European states always interfered in Ottoman Empire under the pretext of protecting Christians in Ottoman lands. These interventions caused the Empire to grant certain authorities to the local. In other words, it can be said that one of the important factors in the increase of local governments' authorities and duties is foreign interventions.

Republic took over Ottoman management units as they were thus we can say that in this process there is continuity rather than a serious break from Ottoman. Laws issued between 1924 and 1930 intervened in local government structure. 100 out of 120 cities whose population is more than fifty thousand nowadays are

settlement which established municipalities in Ottoman era. In addition, with new regulations, municipalities have been granted with authority to penalize and some occupational groups lost their guild privileges. These changes have decreased the importance of traditional factors which use local public power (Güler, 2006).

1921 Constitution divided the country into cities, districts (kaza) and sub-districts (nahiye) and the management of cities and sub-districts were given to councils (şura). The representative of government of Turkish Grand National Assembly, governor was only in charge with general state works in the city, local state works were under the responsibility of councils. But, these steps have not formed a suitable structure for Kemalist nation-state formation project. After a while, against khilafat and feudal factors which began to predominate at both local and central level, changes were made to these regulations with 1924 Constitution. Together with these changes, it was planned to grant traditional local factors with local public power. Provincial local governments became limited with management and supervision of governor office and tuned into instrument of central management for directing local sovereigns (Güler, 2006).

4.2.2. Etatism in Local Scale: 1930-1945

Main features of this period in terms of economic policies are protectionism and etatism. In terms of objectives set forth by economic policies and results achieved, this period can be defined as a period in which first industrialization policies were applied. We can see that Turkey became close to open countries and endeavored to have a national industrialization process with the leadership of state in 1930s in which the world was passing through a capitalist structural crisis process (Boratav, 2011). In managerial terms, practices at both local and central levels developed in accordance with the economic tendency of the time. This period is defined as one party era; the reflexion of this period to local governments is the development of mechanisms that will be subject to ideological and managerial supervision of local dynamics within a framework of a harsh centralization.

In etatism era, municipalities become an instrument for transferring resources into industrial and trade capital in a way which they will not be under the area of influence of local feudal powers. In a socio-economic social structure where capitalist capital accumulation does not work efficiently within a market mechanism and where production method prior to capitalism including small commodity production is wide spread throughout the country, resource transfer has not been able to extended all over the country, but it has been tried to include all provincial municipalities.

Because of priority given to industry in economic development, resources transferred from agriculture to industry have been transferred from rural municipalities to metropolitan cities in order to create the necessary conditions for industry. Municipality bank is the main implementer of this process (Güler, 2006).

Municipality law was issued in 1930 in order to make municipalities suitable for developing modernization. We can say that this law has five main purposes. These can be listed as follows; to ensure equality among municipalities, to give the decisions of progress and public works on the condition that they are not against state laws, to enhance state supervision over municipalities, to ensure supervision of public by means of elected councils, to differentiate the duties of municipalities by extending their service areas (UPL, 2002).

4.2.3. Sovereignty of Traditional Urban Factors in Assemblies: 1946-1960

1946 was an important breaking point in terms of both economic and political policies.

Economically, close and protective policies which were followed non-stop for sixteen years were replaced with a regime in which import was liberalized and increased, external deficit was extended and increased, export based on agriculture was developed, an economic structure based on foreign aid and loans was formed. Politically, we see that we passed from one-party regime which lasted for a long time to multi-party regime. National Development Party was

founded on 5 September, 1945; Democratic Party was founded on 7 January, 1946 and despite all pressure and corruption for the first time single degree elections were held in 1946. With the elections held in 1950, the government changed and it passed to Democrat Party from Republican People's Party.

Democratic Party made a lot of criticism regarding one-party period but during its period, it could not bring any effect on formation related to special provincial administration, municipalities and village administration and democratization. Previous institutional structure remained the same and related with election system, one party structure also remained unchanged. Like in parliaments, one party has overwhelming majority in local councils and thus it is quite difficult to distinguish this period from previous one-party period. Only innovation in the field of local governments is that elections are completed in a single day.

There are also some new developments in this period which are different from previous period. In power, at central level the number of bureaucrats who are close to Republican People's Party decreased and power of the group which is composed of large land owners, industrialists and tradesmen increased. We can say that at local level the power of local notable people and tradesmen increased. On the other hand, we can see that in terms of capital accumulation, state sector was replaced with private sector and regarding outward-oriented economy policies different approaches to world capitalist system were tried (Boratav, 2011).

Another important development seen in this period is the assistance provided to underdeveloped or developing countries in accordance with Marshall Plans and Truman Doctrine. Basically, the aids which were military for the purpose of blockading Soviet Block were used mostly in transportation and establishment of road networks in our country. As a result of this situation, with capitalizing and agricultural mechanisms occurring in agricultural field in urban part of certain regions, migration from rural areas to big metropolitan cities accelerated and thus squatting began. While the reaction of sovereign class against increasing squatter houses mostly resulted with destructions, middle class elite group who had

previously power over urbanization stated that with the invasion of fields by immigrants a significant attack was made to state property.

In addition to all these developments, in the field of city planning we can see that new institutions were established. In 1945 İller Bank (Cities Bank) was founded with the merging of Belediyeler Bank (Municipalities Bank) which worked only for municipalities since 1933 with Municipalities Public Works Board which was in charge of public works of new municipalities. On the other hand in order to centralize planning, Ministry of Public Works and Housing was established. During this period the fastest urbanization was observed in Ankara. At the same time the number of municipalities in our country increased from 583 in 1945 to 995 in 1960.

4.2.4. Transformation of Local Powers and Squatting: 1961-1980

This period differs qualitatively from all other periods of Republican history in terms of economic policies that were applied. One of the main reasons of this is that economy policies were carried out within a framework of a plan in this period. 3-period five year plan which was prepared as of 1963 became effective on investment policies despite all its deficiencies. Public investments had to be in harmony with 5 year plans. At the same time, in order for private sector to have state support the projects need to be approved by institutions that audit whether they are in accordance with plan objectives of State Planning Organization. As a result of this situation, industrial development after 1960 went beyond the industrial plans of 1930 because of planning policies (Boratav, 2011).

Spatial view of this change has been very clear. The ratio of urban population to rural population and the ratio of industrial sector to agricultural sector have developed rapidly. While the number of municipalities was increasing in average in the ratio of 50 annually, the population began increasingly to live municipality areas whose population was over 10 thousand. Despite the increase in the number of municipalities, we can see that their duties and authorities have increasingly declined. In addition, special provincial government have continued contraction

period inherited from previous periods (Güler, 2006). When the distribution of resources of state is analyzed, it is clear that central government did not transfer resources to municipalities in this period and this need was met by municipalities based on their own incomes. İller Bank (Cities Bank) which had a significant share in local expenses considered municipalities as disgraced in line with their expense capacities but it succeeded to preserve its investment power compared with municipalities.

In 1970s the contradiction between traditional factors within local municipality councils and central state ended but another contradiction began between municipalities and central power. The reason for this is that poor segment of the society in squatter settlements and especially the youth increased social struggle with revolutionary organizations within the scope of developing revolutionary struggle n the world. In this period political parties considered the problem of squatting as a potential vote area for the elections. "New Urban Leftism" movement which was started under the leadership of middle class which gathered within and around Republican People's Party was supported by these groups, in 1973 and 1977 elections Republican People's Party became ruling party almost in all big cities. But the populist policies that Republican People's Party followed towards poor squatter settlements got reactions of central government and also central government of Republican People's Party.

On the other hand, as a result of economic crisis in the world and Turkey, all segments of the society carried out movements which expressed their demands. Student movements in 1968 and following years, 15-16 June workers' resistance and land invasions of peasants are significant social movements of this period. In order to cope with the crisis in 1979 well-known "the 24th January Decisions" were put into force. 1980 military intervention happened in order to apply the 24th January Decisions better and to suppress increasing social opposition.

4.2.5. Interest Alliance Of Capital With Small Producers And New Partnerships: From 1980 Until Today

After 1980, in terms of structural features of local governments there are both differences and similarities between the changes happening in the West and those in Turkey. As of 1970s, a lot of developed capitalist western countries restructured itself accordingly in parallel with capitalism crisis in the world. At local governments' level, resources were withdrawn from common consumption services which would pave the way for reproduction of labor. Within this framework, authorities of local governments were limited and they had to withdraw from services such as housing, health and education. In the areas where they did not withdraw, they had cooperations with private sector and tried to provide these services by means of private sector (Şengül, 2001).

Differently from developments in the west, in our country authorities and resources of local governments were increased. The main reason behind this however is that local governments were used as a tool for capital resource transfer. Local governments were re-organized within the framework of market understanding and gained power in especially urban infrastructure investment services. Investments in this field have been directed in a way which would meet the needs of capital.

The change period experienced in these months has two main characteristics. First one is that the balance between central government and local government has become in favor of local government and localization has gained importance. Second one is that local governments have removed from reproduction of labor as it was in the past and turned into a tool for reproduction of capital.

In this period resources that municipalities received have been increased in accordance with general budget income and they have been basically directed towards investment expenses. Also in stable capital investments, the share of public has decreased gradually; share of private sector has increased. We can say

that investments in local infrastructure sector have been totally left to local governments. In addition, share of Iller Bank (Cities Bank) which acted as a municipality in the past has been decreased within public investments, it can be said that it has been deactivated to a large extend in accordance with investment capacity of local governments. It is clear that resources have been divided between 2800 separate local units and capital groups around these units to a larger extend with this application (Güler, 2006). Another important issue is that the interest of not only capital groups working nationally but also international capital groups has increased. As of 1990s, this situation has continued increasingly until today.

Another significant feature of this period is the contribution of local governments to capital accumulation. Motherland Party which was in power in this period has become the main implementer of neoliberal transformation in our country. Local units have withdrawn from areas such as housing, education and health in which they worked even if just a bit in the past, they have been turned into instruments of transferring state resources to private sector. Local governments have carried out this new duty in different ways.

First one of these ways is privatization of urban services and delegating them to companies. Municipalities have incorporated in their own works and connected to market understanding. This situation is seen in loan resources that were applied for investments. The needs that have been met by public loans totally since the foundation of Republic were tried to be met by domestic commercial bank loans and foreign loans (Güler, 2006).

In 1990s a multi-actor process under the name of governance was tried to be used in local decision-making processes. Market circles, municipalities and non-governmental organizations were main actors of the structure that was intended to be formed. Especially in metropolitan cities, international capital circles have gained business privileges not only in terms of finance and investment but also in terms of local partnerships by signing agreements with metropolitan

municipalities. Thus, we can say that local units have gained an international dimension starting from 1980s until today.

4.3. Alternative Local Government Experiences in Turkey

4.3.1. Fatsa Municipality

Municipalism experience in Fatsa is a fundamental starting point for a lot of circles who are eager to form municipalism which is alternative to system. In this sense, analyzing the process experienced in Fatsa is of great importance for this study. Analysis of this experience deeper is beyond the scope of this study. But evaluating it generally is important for further discussions of this study.

In 1978, revolutionary organizations tried to create a large social opposition in the region by means of meetings that they organized in villages and centers of Fatsa, and "end to hazelnut exploitation" campaigns. Thanks to this campaign which was carried put with high participation, prices of hazelnut were decreased and revolutionists gained the support of locals (Erten, 1999).

With this success, revolutionary circles began to fight against black market. The deficiency in basic consumption food was a problem not only in this region but also throughout the country. A lot of meeting and protests were organized with the locals. Following a protest with the public goods of blackmarketeer dispossessed and these goods were sold at market price and the income was distributed to the public. Thus, public began to trust revolutionists more.

Because of health problems of Nazmiye Komutoglu who was elected as Mayor from Republican People's Party in 1977 elections, by election was held. During this period Fikri Sonmez who was prominent in revolutionary circles and was supported as a mayor by the public was nominated as a candidate for municipality mayor position as an independent, revolutionary candidate as a result of pressure from public. Thus, election campaigns were carried out in all neighborhoods by all revolutionists in the region and public and Fikri Sonmez (Tailor Fikri) was chosen as a mayor with 3096 votes.

During election, the slogan "municipality will be governed by public" was brought to foreground and an important work was done. Committees were established in every neighborhood. After election, starting from Kurtulus Neighborhood, committee elections were held in 11 neighborhoods and the committees which would represent the neighborhood were strengthened (www.birgün.net).

After the establishment of these committees which were people's own organizations, first meeting was help with the spokespeople of these committees. A decision made by municipality would be implemented by the committees and a campaign that aimed at cleaning streets of Fatsa from mud was started. With the help of other municipalities, villages, cities and even universities, the town was cleaned from mud with just a week (www.birgün.net).

With these practices, the government of Tailor Fikri began to be disturbed. Only in four months inspectors of Ministry of Interior were sent four times and accounts were audited four times. Municipality which was faced with smear campaigns carried out by state powers organized a festival to raise awareness of public about this situation but pressure continued without pausing. Governor Resat was sent to Akkaya so that pressure over Fatsa could be increased. Following these events, a spot operation was organized on 11th July in 1980 and Tailor Fikir and a lot of revolutionists who took part in the process were arrested. With this intervention collective solidarity relation of Fatsa was defused with state pressure (www.yenidendevrim.org).

Despite everything, revolutionists during this period aimed at creating a participative life style together with people of Fatsa. Firstly, their struggle against black market and exploitation of hazelnut headed towards state and dominant class as a result of municipality of revolutionists. Sovereign class and its representatives who perceived revolutionary struggle and struggle of people as a thread against dominant system ended experience of Fatsa by means of state and military intervention.

4.3.2. Dikili Municipality

Osman Ozguven who was the mayor for 2 terms in Dikili between 1984 and 1994 was elected again after 10 years and is still the mayor of Dikili. Since he took the office again, while he has been supported by a lot of groups because of his municipalism policies, he has been tried to be kept under pressure especially by central power (www.aktuela.org).

An investigation was pursued towards Mayor of Dikili Osman Ozguven who provided up to 10 tons of water free of charge for every house by auditors of Court of Accounts in 2008 because of his practice. Ozguven who was tried in the court because of damaging the state was released on the grounds of protecting public interest. The mayor who was believed that he did not damage the state increased the amount of water he provided free of charge from 10 tons to 13 tons. He stated that he was in favor of provision of all amount of water free of charge but laws did not allow him to do so. Apart from his water policy, he decreased the price of bread to 0.50 TL and also paved the way for students to use public transportation vehicles free of charge (www.sendika.org).

Osman Özgüven who states that municipality is not a business organization it is for service is one of the rare mayors who tries to implement rarely seen social municipalism understanding in Turkey from 1989 on.

4.3.3. Mazgirt Municipality

Mayor of Mazgirt Municipality Tekin Türkel was elected as an independent candidate of Democratic Rights Federation in 2009 local elections.

Turkel who aims at creating new and more developed models which are beyond the previous experiences in the field of local government, expresses that it is hard for socialists to achieve this but of course it is not impossible (www.birgun.net).

Turkel who states that in previous periods system parties have fouled people in the region with lies believes that their priority is to create channels that will make it possible for them to govern their city with public. He argues that tools that will make it possible for people, who have been removed from their lands through evacuation of villages and pressure for years to turn to their region, need to be created (www.demokratikhaklarfederasyonu.org) .

Planned projects are not able to be carried out because the resources are insufficient technically and economically. Although people who live in the region casted vote for Justice and Development Party hoping that services would come, they gave a chance to revolutionists in this period.

4.3.4. Aknehir Municipality

Aknehir is the smallest town of Samandag whose population in 2700. Mehmet Mübarek was elected as Mayor from Freedom and Solidarity Party after 2009 local elections. Mubarek who states that basically he will try to govern the town with socialist understanding aims at governing the town together with public. Mubarek who argues that there was a management understanding which was totally independent from public before his office claims that other political parties exploit people's feelings (www.birgun.net).

Mubarek who tries to settle an open and transparent management understanding has opened council meeting to the public. He has stated that apart from municipality council, they are planning to form a people's council which will be composed of the public of the region. In addition to this, he has stated that they will plan to establish neighborhood committees. People living in Aknehir have the opportunity to learn what is going on in the municipality, its financial situation without difficulty differently from previous periods (www.birgun.net).

However the municipality has serious resource problem and tries to clear its debts by preventing illicit city water connections and applies for UE funds for the projects it has developed.

4.3.5. Samandag Municipality

In 2009 local elections Mithat Nehir who was the candidate of Freedom and Solidarity Party was elected as a socialist mayor. In his speeches during election campaigns he mentioned Fatsa municipality wherever he went, he used populist discourse and succeeded to be elected as mayor by making people believe what he promised to do. Nehir who states that left ideology has lost its effect generally in our country has expressed that the policies he will follow from now on can only be the beginning in order to have a municipality like Fatsa (www.birgun.net).

The mayor tries to understand experiences and policies by reading Fatsa and Porto Allegre examples. Council meetings are open to public and carried out in large meeting, objections of the public are handled with broad discussions and persuasion process.

4.3.6. Ağılbaşı Municipality

Ağılbaşı is a town located between the mountains, which is 80 kilometers away from centre of Malatya. In 2009 local elections Cengizhan Kılıc who was the candidate of Freedom and Solidarity Party was elected as Mayor.

In this town works are carried out in a collective way and with the participation of the public. Kılıc who states that even in a smallest municipalism works public provides serious help, aims at establishing people's council which will strengthen the solidarity and cooperation more (www.birgun.net).

The municipality which states that they need serious budget for the projects they are planning to carry out states that EU funds are the way to have such budget. The mayor of Agılbası who meets with expert firms in their fields for construction plan and similar projects has not been able to materialize the projects due to lack of money.

4.3.7. Çamlıhemşin Municipality

Independent Mayor Candidate of Camlıhemsin Neighborhoods Union Idris Lutfu Melek was elected as Mayor in March 2009 local elections in Camlıhemsin district of Rize.

Melek defines local governments as tools for management of the public by itself. In order to achieve this, Melek argues that priority must be given to organizations which will be established in neighborhoods. He states that thus everybody will have a say in management starting from their own places where they live. In addition, as stated in election declaration, for Camlıhemsin, an ecologic and local development model has been defined and a democratic, participatory, equalitarian and collective local government is targeted (www.birgun.net).

Melek who states that they have benefited from EU funds has expressed that they have presented two files in order to get resource. One of the projects is Ayder waste water treatment project and the other is a project targeting women's employment. Melek who states that soon they will have resource for the second project believes that with this project approximately 80 women will have both an occupation and a job (www.birgun.net).

Melek states that social municipalism experiences that have been carried out in the past need to be well analyzed. According to him, in Turkey Fatsa and Hopa examples are those that everybody should take lessons from. It is really important how the participation of all people in the city was ensured and thanks to this participation which achievements were made. Although a lot of significant works have been carried out in Hopa, second term election was not able to be won (www.birgun.net).

4.3.8. Municipalities of Peace and Democracy Party

Peace and Democracy Party which won 99 municipalities in 2009 elections considers municipalities from the angle of local autonomy and democratic autonomy. The understanding of this segment argues that etatist power and centralization alienate people to moral and political reality. But, they believe that with democratic, ecologic and non-gendered local governments people can reach to their own essence. They argue that thorough local governments which have obtained administrative and financial autonomy, everybody can live their identity, cultural assets, mother tongue and believes freely (www.ozgur-gundem.com).

As a result of long lasting works, an important step was taken in alternative management system. Although important steps have been taken with regards to placing these phases to a theoretical system, there are serious deficiencies. It is seen that although there are important women experience, organization and representation, man-dominated mentality and institutionalization have not been overcome (www. bianet.org)

For local government movement, Van, Tunceli, Viransehir, Baglar, Nusaybin, Varto, Digor, Kolludere and Erentepe were declared as pilot regions. In the model which does not refuse the unitary structure of the system but does not accept its present way, it is envisaged that mechanisms which will ensure direct participation of public will be formed (www.ozgur-gundem.com).

With this model it is thought that state and system will be democratized. The system which will be applied firstly in the municipalities of Freedom and Democracy Party is expected to contribute to democratic autonomy model. For this purpose they plan to establish local governments academy (www.ozgur-gundem.com).

4.4. Evaluation of Experiences in Turkey in the Context of Their Relation with the Case Study

The municipalism experience of socialist movement in Turkey is almost non-existently limited except Fatsa example. There are many different trials apart from Fasta, however, these are far behind from satisfying socialist goals. The main reason that Fatsa is being discussed by many fractions, and primarily by socialists, from past to present is that the public have shown the determination to self-governance via organizing around their own needs. One reason for this success is the firm union of the public with the revolutionist movement in the region, and another one is the rising revolutionist trend in the world and in our country. This situation has generally affected all sectors of poor population in our country. The movement actualized in Fatsa is bringing this trending public opposition together with a socialist goal.

But today, it can be observed that there is no people opposition recognizing the initiative of the local scale and that organized against the capitalist system except a few BDP municipalities. As it is analysed the other anti-capitalist municipal experiences ın our country like Samandağ, Ağılbaşı, Çamlıhemşin, it is seen that their political, economical, social and cultural policies are far from the socialist ideals. One important reason of this situation is that the real socialism has collapsed in the world and people approach the socialist circles skeptically. In addition to this situation, most of the socialist groups change their struggle strategies from the ideal of socialist state to reformist transformations of capitalism. In this context, it is necessary to consider certain internal and external factors while analyzing Hozat experience. In the case study area, the most important external factore is the collapse of socialist states in the world. The internal factor is non-existence of a socialist experience except certain examples in our country in local administration field, respectively. But if the political actor supporting the Mayor analysied, it is seen that class revolution in its classical meaning is still the basic aim of this organization. Despite their inexperienced

situation about local elections and governments and they try to implement democratic governmental relations in the study area.

CHAPTER 5

5. CASE STUDY: HOZAT

5.1. General Information on Study Area

5.1.1. History of the City

The old name of Hozat was Dersim. After the Reforms, the town became a city in 1845 by separating from Erzurum. Following this, those from landlord (aga) and organization (ocak) management who had benefited had rebelled. When Elazığ became a province in 1848 and Dersim was attached to Elazığ as district, local community and gentry has fiercely opposed to settlement of state authority in the region. Thus Dersim rebellions have occurred. Forces sent under command of Ali Şefki Pasha in 1855 and Dede Semih and Kürt İsmail Pashas in 1877 had tried to quench the rebellion (Çetin, 2010).

However, as the administration domination was not brought to a structure that is appropriate for social and cultural values of the local community, rebellion had re-started. In order to quench the rebellion, Reşat Pasha, under the command of Harput Redif Brigadier General, was sent to Dersim in 1907. The movement which continued throughout 1907 and 1908 was stopped with the declaration of the Constitutionalism. The reports prepared by Ferit Ali Pasha and Mustafa Bey as a result of their inspections in Dersim were discussed in the First Parliament (Meclis-I Mebusa), and it was decided that rest should be secured in Dersim. Therefore, Commander of the 4th army Muhtar İbrahim Pasha and his forces were sent to Dersim. The army was recalled with the agreement made as a result of the negotiations made at Hazuzlu (Hopik) village of Ovacık (Çetin, 2010).

As a result, during historical development process, Dersim, which has reached province status in 1862, was reduced back to district in 1975 as its incomes did not meet its expenses. It was attached to Elazığ province in 1879 as its district. Hozat became the center of Dersim district between 1881 and 1922. Hozat, which was attached to Elazığ as its district between 1922 and 1935, became a country

attached to Tunceli in accordance with the Tunceli Law numbered 2884 and came into force in December 25, 1935. This status is still ongoing (Çetin, 2010).

5.1.2. Economic Structure

The district has continued its existence as self-enclosed for centuries, its market economy was nearly undeveloped and this same economic structure continued until 1930s. Following 1930s, small craftsman businesses were opened at the district center, and a market food and clothing need of the community was created. Agriculture and stockbreeding in primitive conditions has performed in the district from of old sufficient enough self-sustenance. Important agricultural changes observed in 1950 had no effect on the agriculture of the district. Potatoes and bean plantation was started in 1960. The community found a market for their animal product in Elazığ city and tried to satisfy their food, clothing and household goods (www.hozat.bel.tr).

Gendarmerie Private Training Regiment formed at Hozat in 1950 had vitalized the economy of the district. Many craftsmen businesses have opened in the district center in this term, and a development in the district had occurred. After removal of the Regiment in 1978, the prior bright economical structure has receded. No improvement in the economy of the district has been observed following establishment of a Military Brigade in the district center in 1996. Because shopping permission is not given to the soldiers and the needs of the brigade is met from Elazığ (www.hozat.bel.tr).

In 1970, utilization of tractor in agriculture has improved the economy in small amount and following these years, further division of the lands due to high fertility rate has caused high rate of non-agricultural area, thus has accelerated the migration from rural areas to city and out of town. This migration could not be stopped as the district is not developed in agricultural and stockbreeding activities.

Today, the production stays at self-sustenance level as plant production and stockbreeding activities are performed under primitive conditions and production

for market in a broader sense is not performed. Therefore, economic structure based on agriculture and stockbreeding is static in the district.

5.1.2.1. Industry

The natural structure, climate, lack of transportation means, low efficiency in agriculture and low level of income in the district caused no capital to be accumulated for industry. Due to absence of raw material and high transportation distances to the market, it is not possible to mention industry at all. Production industry is nearly absent except small manual embroidery works (Arslantürk, 2000).

5.1.2.2. Agriculture

Another means of livelihood is agriculture in the district. The agriculture in the district, which is dependant on the climate conditions, is rather undeveloped. As the efficiency is lower than normal and input expanses are high, the farmers are dealing with agriculture by their own capacities. Agriculture sufficient enough for sustenance is common in the district and acquired production is far from being sufficient for local consumption.

Cultivable lands form approximately 21% of the district (16.800 hectare). However, as the labour force working at the agricultural areas was decreased due to migration, significant drops in the production have occurred. One third of the cultivable lands wet and the remaining two thirds is dry land, and agricultural activity based on dry-land agriculture is being applied.

Wheat ranks first in produced agricultural products in the district. The product following wheat is barley. Alfa-alfa, vetch and sainfoin cultivation is performed as fodder crop. Vineyard and orchard agriculture is mostly performed for meeting own needs of the district community. There is no commercial production is present, and along with this, the surplus greengrocery (apple, pear, nut) is sold within the district and partially outside of the district.

5.1.2.3. Animal Breeding

In Hozat district, which is a mountainous region, the main source of income is animal breeding as the lands of the district is not quite suitable for agricultural activity. The land structure of the district is ideal for animal breeding.

Sheep and goat (small cattle) breeding is rather common in the district due to its geographic structure, topographic status and vegetation cover. Animal breeding constitutes the most important source of income of the district. Small cattle breeding, ranks first both in number and in diversity of the products in this economic structure.

However, in the recent years, as meadows and plateaus are closed to animal breeding due to security reasons, the animal breeding activity of the district has significantly regressed. Approximately 21.000 small cattle are present in the district. Cattle breeding are significantly less when compared with small cattle breeding. Cattle number in the district is approximately 2200. Cattle breeding is performed mostly directed towards milk production. Mostly East Anatolian red and local dark cow is present, and along with these crossbreed and culture type cattle breeding is also performed (Arslantürk, 2000).

Mostly cheese making is performed in animal breeding sector, and this cheese satisfies the local needs and sold outside the district via personal relations.

5.1.2.4. Beekeeping

There has been a significant increase in the number of hives with bees in the district in the recent years and beekeeping has become a source of income for the people in the district following agriculture and animal breeding. There is one or more family is present in all of the villages. There are 150 family dealing with beekeeping in the district center and villages. Some of these families performs

beekeeping in a commercial manner and earns their living (Hozat District Directorate of Agriculture, 2011).

Currently, mostly stationary beekeeping is performed in the district. As the rural areas of the district are not used due to security reasons, beekeeping is also negatively affected just as animal breeding. Number of bee hives is approximately 4300 in the district. Approximately 8 to 10 tonnes of honey is produced from these hives (Hozat District Directorate of Agriculture, 2011).

5.1.2.5. Plateaus and Meadows

There are 10 plateaus present in the district center, Kozluca, Sarısaltık, Çığırlı and Buzlupınar Village boundaries. As these plateaus are not open to animal breeding for years due to public safety and security, animal breeding is not developed in the district (Hozat District Directorate of Agriculture, 2011).

5.1.2.6. Population and Geographic Structure

The district have boundaries with Tunceli, Çemişgezek, Ovacık and Pertek districts in east, west, north and south, respectively. Hozat, which is a mountainous region, is surrounded by steep mountains.

Figure 5-1. Hozat District (Source: Google Earth (prepared by author)).

Lands of the district are divided by deep valleys formed by rivers. The elevation decreases from north to south and the district have continental climate.

Figure 5-2. Location of the study area (Source: General Directorate of Highways.).

According to the 1997 population census, total population of the district is 9238 persons being 7506 and 1732 living at the district center and villages, respectively. According to the 2007 population census, total population is 7823 being 5837 and 1986 at the district center and villages, respectively. According to a research conducted in 2010, the population at the center is 4512 and at the villages is 2133 [TÜİK (Turkish Statistical Institute), 2010]. However, according to the previous population censuses, there has been significant drop in the population in the district. For example, according to the population census conducted in 1990, number of persons living in the villages was 7027. The reasons for this decrease relative to past can be stated as: absence of work fields, insufficiency of arable lands, scarcity of meadows and evacuation of the villages due to armed conflict.

5.2. Hozat Municipality

5.2.1. Historical Process of Hozat Municipality

Although establishment of a municipality at each district is obligatory in accordance with the Municipality Law numbered 1580 and issued in 1930,

municipality administration in Tunceli were established with the annulment of Tunceli Law in 1947. As this law was a special law, municipality managements in the city were undertaken by governorship and district governorships.

Hozat Municipality could not perform its institutional duty until 1980 due to regional underdevelopment, financial impossibilities and technical inadequacies. Economic and social development is significantly slow in small settlements, and especially in the east of our country and even development plans were not comprised in most of these districts. Municipalities could not earn sufficient income due to inability to obtain funds from central administration and as the population is poor, and they were functionless.

Development plans were not prepared as the municipalities having less than 10.000 populations were not legally obligated to do so and technical insufficiencies of the municipalities, therefore this have negatively affected the urban development. Due to these reasons, the municipalities have become unable to construct infrastructure services such as drinking water and sewer. Along with all these negative conditions, the dominance of feudal structure in the region has caused the candidates in the local elections to become effective by using their tribal relationships. Mayors selected as a result of their tribal relations, have causally managed the municipalities according to political power and initiatives of local beneficiary circles. With this understanding, let alone producing urban services, most of the municipalities did not even paid the salaries of the municipality personnel.

During the interview with Mayor Cevdet Konak, Mr. Konak made important observations regarding the residence area:

> Municipalities were abolished and mayors were relieved of their duties as Martial Law seized public administration as a result of the 1980 military coup. Same things happened in Hozat as well. Municipality administrations have been managed by district governors until March 1984. Presence of municipalities became understandable with the Law on Municipal Revenues numbered 2464 and came into force in 1984 due to increasing importance of local administrations in our country, in parallel with the developments in the world, and impasse that municipalities were in, and also with

increased shares from the Bank of Provinces. In Hozat municipality, municipal services were started to be given with acquired machinery and equipment in parallel with the increasing revenues starting from this date. Although development plans were prepared and urban infrastructure services, such as water and sewer, were started to be produced during this period, traditional sense of administration based on feudal mentality have continued. I announced my candidacy, by discussing it with democratic powers, in order to eliminate this situation which was beneath the historical importance and mission of Hozat, to change the municipal administration understanding, to establish a populist administration, to form the infrastructure for creasing a modern city by enabling urban transformation. We had a chance to talk to voters one by one due to advantage of local scale being small. We distributed a leaflet on my candidacy and our administration program during election period. I was elected mayor by having 950 of 2300 votes in March 28, 2004 local elections, and trying to perform this duty for two terms with revolutionary and populist understandings (Mayor of Hozat, Personal Communication).

The result to be deduced from the speech of the Mayor is that the municipality was administrated with a reactionist mentality by traditional and feudal elements prior to 2004. Administrative mentality after 2004 will be inspected at the following sections of this study.

5.2.2. Critical Analysis of Policies and Applications of Hozat Municipality

5.2.2.1. Political and Governmental Policies

Mr. Cevdet Konak, who is the mayor for two terms since 2004, is also a member of Hozat Democratic Public Solidarity platform that is composed of various leftist groups. However, the main element forming this platform is the Federation of Democratic Rights (Demokratik Haklar Federasyonu (in Turkish) – DHF). Interviews conducted with the representatives of DHF in the field are important in order to understand the structure of the organization, its approach to local administrations and most importantly its relations with Hozat Municipality:

> DHF is a political mass organization. It is a program organization, which is emerged as a result of struggle for democratic rights which is a front in class struggle in our country and that is based on decades of political and organizational experience. DHF is composed of various revolutionary program organizations that it assembles together under its roof based on democratic centralization principles. It fights against imperialism, comprador capitalism, feudalism, fascism and all types of reactionism with a scientific socialist ideology and political stand (DHF member, male, age: 23).

There are important details within the above mentioned definition. The representative of the organization does not say capitalism but comprador

capitalism while he is defining the organization and states his anti-system ideas mainly by emphasizing feudalism. At the same time, he defines themselves as Marxist, Leninist and Maoist. Their fundamental form of struggle is to spread the democratic public revolution to all country piece by piece by creating red political powers at rural areas. Her view on local elections and local administrations was asked to another person from DHF:

> We do not primarily refuse the elections and parliament; we see these as a tactical issue in relation with cyclical developments. The answer to be given to the questions weather parliament, which is a tactically tool, will be benefited from or not and are there any conditions for this or not should be sought within solid analysis of solid conditions. We repeat that we will benefit from these tools under the condition that Democratic Public Revolution, which is a minimum program, strengthens its struggle. We would like to highlight something at this point, benefiting from parliament as a tactical tool in service of revolution, in other words, our general strategy, and parlamentarist struggle should not be confused with each other. Maoists does not primarily decline the former (parliament) by considering it as a tactical issue, however, they principally deny the latter (parlamentarist struggle) by considering it as a strategic issue. Therefore, our awareness on this subject should be lucid and our attitude should be clear. General elections should be independent from parliament and parliament and local elections, in other words, local administrations are different from each other as it is directly under the supervision of political power. Local elections targeted for local administrations are not, as a matter of course, exclusive from political power and completely independent from this. However, a formation in the form of direct self-governance of the public can be displayed if approached correctly. Both the indirect supervision of political power on local administrations and also the autonomous structure of the local administrations in a partial manner give an opportunity to establish democratic governance. It is necessary to establish governance in service of masses by exceeding the current legal legislations. Due to this reason, local administrations is currently in service of our general strategy and are useful and correct tools in a way to strengthen our general strategy. In the period we are going through, in the hand of masses, correct tactical policy on local elections turns into a front which strengthens the struggle without rejecting this tool (DHF member, female, 20).

As can be understood from these statements, DHF sees participating in the general elections and using parliament as a tactical tool in their revolution strategy, and does not approach participating to local elections positively due to indirect supervision of the government. It was asked to another DHF member who is a craftsman, that how the previous two terms were regarding the application of the said policies:

> The main issue here is to crease the organized power of the public. It is necessary to let the public to be included in the administration and decision making mechanisms in

order to enable the applications of the municipality to satisfy the public. It is necessary to improve the tools which can include the public. We get serious criticisms from certain sectors of public. At this point, we call them to come to public municipal council meetings and make the decisions together. Many people make their critics from outside and do not participate in the meetings. Therefore, the critics hung in the air. On the other hand, establishment of public councils aimed by the municipality was positive at the first term. Even, all municipal works were performed with the public. But there are serious regressions at the current state (DHF member, male, 40).

The administration before 2004 was CHP [Republican People's Party, Cumhuriyet Halk Partisi (in Turkish)] Municipal policies were also asked to the person who was the mayor during this term:

The public did not support us at 2004 local elections; on the other hand, they say that they have elected the current mayor because he is revolutionist. However, nothing regarding revolutionism can be observed when their implementations are observed. Many projects which are being applied during this term were already started during my term. Apart from these, there is no contribution to Hozat (ex-mayor, male, 60).

Figure 5-3. Mayor of Hozat works for local election with people (Source: DHF Archive).

Following the answers, interviews directed towards understanding of political nature of the municipality were made with workers of the municipality:

All community became hopeful when the mayor was first elected. The public used to support even the smallest works in the beginning. However, if they currently do not support, there are reasons for this of course. For example, where are neighborhood councils? The council meetings are held publicly, that's alright, but why the public is reluctant to participate? Because the Mayor drove himself forward during this period.

> Some people from the Federation come from Tunceli or out of town when there is an important problem. But they listen, hold a meeting with the Mayor and go back. Friends from the federation are good people, but they do not know municipal works, therefore they can not audit. All people here are all countrymen; they do not know anything about municipal works (Municipal worker, male, 27).

A worker at the municipality to use these statements is a rather strange case. Therefore, it is necessary to expand the interviews to the different sectors of the public in order to interpret the interviews correctly. Answers of a housewife to the questions are interesting:

> I am very pleased with the works of the Mayor. The community gossip about him too much, buy gossip never ends in this type of a community. It is necessary not to heed to those gossips. He is not stealing and whisking like the others. He is very kind to people. Other parties came and did what so far? All of them were from bourgeois parties. They all used the sources of the municipal for their own tribes. They employed those of their own (housewife, 33).

Those that a civil servant working at a public institution told were also present data regarding the attitude of the municipality as well:

> The mayor has actually done other politics in the past. Moreover, there is a gap between him and DHF. He tells, in anyplace he goes, that he is a friend of the revolutionists. But he tells that he is also a member of DHF when he is with those from DHF. This is a contradiction. In the meantime, he worked for BDP in secret, although DHF has decided to boycott BDP (Barış ve Demokrasi Partisi (in Turkish) - Peace and Democracy Party). This is not a way to organize. People from DHF who should audit him are very naïve. Thus, they cannot be a solution. If the issue is asphalt paving, then Melih Gökçek is giving a better service. Our actual expectations from the municipalities here is that they show a revolutionist stand (civil servant, male, 30).

Apart from recorded interviews, information given during chats with people who did not want voice recording and observations presents data regarding the political quality of the municipality. There are certain issues which become prominent as a result of these chats. Most important of these is that many persons whom ideas were asked states that applications based on populist policies are made to many fields. Many people think that the Mayor does not represent the political stand which satisfies the local community apart from names of Ahmet Kaya and Kazım Koyuncu being given to a fountain and a street, respectively. On the other hand, there are many people who believe that the performed physical infrastructure works have no meaning for them and the actual thing to be performed should be

that the political stand of DHF should be represented by the Mayor. Along with this, there is a constant comparison of the Mayor with the Mayor of Mazgirt Municipality, which is another municipality of DHF. The fundamental reason for this is that the Mayor of Mazgirt Municipality comes from DHF and he is an activist of the organized structure.

Certain results regarding the political structure of the area and the political stand that the municipality represents are derived from both interviews and also observations and un-recorded talks in the field. First thing that should be told is that there are significant differences between the starting point and the current conditions for both the community who are supporting the Mayor and also for the Mayor as well. Participation of the public in the most basic municipal service after a short time from 2004 elections indicates an important enthusiasm. However, the most important reason for this enthusiasm to decrease following this period is the separation of the Mayor with the political circle that the public thought the Mayor represents. The most important reason for this is that, no sound communication and audit relation could not be established between the Mayor, DHF and the Public. The community supports DHF regardless of all these negativities and the relations are significantly disrupted during this period.

Another important point which should be emphasized is that members of the said political group from nearly every house are either dead or imprisoned. Therefore, an emotional relationship between this political tradition and the public is present as well. Due to this reason, a stand close to this circle is expected from the Mayor. Even the political investigations that the Mayor had undergone during his term in the office did not change the opinion of the public significantly.

Another striking point is that the fractions embracing the Mayor are mostly from political circles and different fractions from DHF. During the talks with the public, it was stated that this situation is mostly connected to the Mayor's desire to be a candidate for the parliament in the future. Beyond correctness or incorrectness of all these rumors, the gap between the political circle which

carried him to the place that he is currently at and the Mayor presents an intriguing situation.

As a result of both statements and interviews, an important fact comes out; that is the main point related to local governments, that is emphasized by municipality management which tries to work claiming to establish a revolutionary and populist municipality and political circle which this management tries to represent is to establish a structure which is governed by public's decisions. In this part whether public participates in decision making mechanisms or not will be dwelt upon based on interviews made with different actors in this field, observations and data. Within this framework, data gathered from the field will be of great importance in terms of understanding how much the revolutionary and populist municipalism model which is intended to be applied is put into practice. First of all, interviews with mayors will be provided. Then, an evaluation will be made based on conversations with municipality employees and the public.

Public's participation process in decision making mechanisms has been asked to the Mayor:

> As of the year I took office, the first thing I made was to clarify division of labor and job definition among municipality employees. I said that I would not let feudal management understanding inherited form the past and would in the struggle for a productive service on the basis of public and respect to labor. Then, I ensured that decisions would be taken all together by making it possible for public to participate increasingly in council meetings. I set the basis of a transparent management understanding by hanging all income and expenses and spending on municipality notice board. This practice increased the trust of public to the municipality. Thus public started to participate voluntarily in every municipal work ranging from garbage collection to infrastructure services. In this period, all order parties especially Republican People's Party started to organize smear campaign about me. Within this period I was sued many times because of the talk I made. Since I was elected for 2nd term in order to lay the foundations of public councils, bylaw and regulations have been formed for public council (Mayor).

According to conversations carried out with municipality employees, a situation which is in contraction to what the Mayor told has come up:

We can not get our salaries thoroughly. We acknowledge that the municipality has debts. But we see deductions in different proportions in our salaries every month. The same amount of deduction is not applied to all of the employees. We want that same amount of deduction should be made in everybody's salaries even if there is lack of resource. If this does not happen, employees will become enemies to each other (Municipality official, male, 37).

We can not find anyone to tell our problems. We are laborers, not enemies. We want to be heard by especially people from Federation of Democratic Rights (DHF). People here do not have enough technical level. Actually a meeting was held previously with employees because of salaries. People from Federation of Democratic Rights (DHF) attended to that meeting. Problems have been solved in a way but I can say that there is a lack of communication between Mayor and employees (Municipality official, female, 42).

We have receivables form the municipality belonging to previous periods. The Mayor sold us land because of lack of resource but now we are in a position of being indebted to the municipality. These debts are taken from our salaries every month in amount of 500 TL following the council decision. But the cuts from our salaries are not always in the same amount. It differs from month to month (Municipality official, male, 56).
We are laborers. I understand that the resources of municipality are limited but we have our own families whom we are responsible for. We have to earn living for our families (Municipality official, male, 34).

As we understand from these statements, budget of municipality is very limited based on previous analysis. Income is not even at a level to meet the expenses rather to maintain the salaries of employees. In this context, provision of urban services becomes problematic. Therefore, the efforts of the Mayor in creating resources are worthy of respect. But apart from resource problem another important issue that is understood from what has been told is the communication problem between the Mayor and employees. In addition, employees see the Federation of Democratic Rights (DHF) as insufficient in terms of supervising municipality and in regulating failing relations. We need to take the views of the Mayor and Federation of Democratic Rights in terms of the problems that have been mentioned by the employees:

I always governed the municipality in an open way. I told our financial situation to the employees clearly in the meeting we held. But how I cover the expenses from my own income and try to create resources apart from municipality budget, they must as well sacrifice a little for their town. They can come and tell me such problems. We hold regular meeting with them in specific periods but nobody tells their problems or criticizes me personally. All financial records are transparent, what can I do more? I

have suggested before and I still do. Employees should come together and establish a commission. And then I work with this commission (Mayor).

Even though significant developments have been achieved in public's participation in management within the time we has so far, we can not say that we have reached enough level. We could not put public councils which we have set as a main target into practice thoroughly in practice. One of the main reasons of this is that we could not have regular communication and dialog between public and municipality. We have a local management commission which includes members of municipality council, Mayors of Mazgirt and Hozat Municipalities and representative of Federation of Democratic Rights. But our friend from Federation of democratic Rights is insufficient in terms of especially municipalism and technical issues. This is a big problem. We see that there is a necessity of establishing more tight communication with both municipality employees and public in future periods when we consider negative things we have experienced (member of Federation of Democratic Rights, male, 34).

Considering the points that have been mentioned, specific conclusions can be reached. Firstly, it is a positive point that the Mayor presents income and expenses to the public in a transparent way. But there needs to be more open communication method in terms of eliminating problems of employees. The main problem of employees as understood from their statements is not the deductions from their salaries but the way they are made and the lack of communication with Mayor. In this sense, the main structure which will ensure the communication is Federation of Democratic Rights together with workers' union. In addition, the fact that person from Federation of democratic Rights is insufficient in terms of municipalism technically is an important problem. More importantly, the politic level of activists from Federation of Democratic Rights who carry out activities in this field is law. This situation leads to non-resolution of public's problems. Thus, shallowness in theory leads to narrowness in practice and the link between employees and municipality management breaks off.

Apart from working class, Hozat Municipality has a public council bylaw and regulations which it established in accordance with international treaties that Turkey is a part, national laws and related laws of the municipality article numbered 5393. This council divides into groups such as neighborhood, women, youth and elderly people's council and it is aimed at supporting them with working commissions. Interviews have been carried out with public on this subject.

They make announcements from municipality vehicles when the meetings are held. They distributed declarations for the establishment of public councils but almost nobody cares. In this way solidarity relations with public can be promoted. Actually I did not participate personally and do not know what is being done. Maybe declarations can be made constantly in order to have more effective communication (Housewife, 36).

I think establishment of these councils is of course important. People can register. But after a while people go back to their own daily lives. It is a good thing that people make decisions about municipal works jointly. But if they do not see practical practices of these efforts in their daily lives, nobody continues these works (Farmer, male, 29).

My situation is bad, because I am sick. I go to district governship so that they can help me. We have three cows and in a single house I live with my daughter, her husband and three grand children. I do not recognize council or anything like this, if they are revolutionists, they should come and help us (elderly person, male, 67).

It would be really nice in terms of promotion of social solidarity. But our people are poor. They will not participate for a long time in any effort that does not provide any gain for them. After a while they turn to their own daily lives (shopkeeper, male, 35).

I do not believe that I will go to a university when I graduate from high school because we do not have enough income that will make it possible for me to go to a special training center. Maybe when youth council is established, some areas where we can study together and make up our deficiencies can be created. Otherwise I will have to sit in coffee houses (kahvehane) like all graduated teenagers. Youth council will also be beneficial for teenagers not to grow up in a degenerated culture (student, male, 17).

Summers I go to our village and work in the field, winters by the way I am in the coffee house (kahvehane) like everybody. I do not have computer literacy and I do not know any foreign language. Therefore if I go out of city and look for a job, I will work as an unskilled worker. Everybody here expects municipality to hire them. But municipality has so limited capacity. We can not go back to our villages. Soldiers (officers) do not let because there are conflicts. In this sense public councils can be of importance. Fund can be created for poor people, courses can be opened and thus solidarity relations can be promoted (unemployed, male, 28).

Figure 5-4. People participation to municipality council meeting (Source: DHF Archive).

These interviews shed light to point of views of people from different segments of society related to public councils. Everybody has economic expectations from public councils in accordance with their needs because public is poor. Common point of people who have participated in the interviews is that these councils will promote solidarity relations. But if they are not supported with economic policies, people will go back to their daily lives and will not participate in meetings. In this sense, there is nobody who generally considers councils as negative. But who will be leading actor of this process and how he will approach to the problems of public are issues of discussion. As understood so far a lot groups including municipality expect financial support from district governship and other public institutions. In this context we can say that public is in need of even smallest income. Public councils need to be established in order to have cultural transformation which will include both economic and solidarity and sharing relations and these councils need to be partners in the decisions made by municipality. Here an important duty falls to Federation of Democratic Rights. As an actor who will provide link between municipality and public, it needs to carry out its work in a planned and programmed way and in coordination with public. Although bylaw and regulations are ready, the fact that public councils are not put

into practice is a sign of insufficiency of people within Federation of Democratic Rights qualitatively. An organization which claims to be revolutionist should try harder to solve problems of public in a more selfless and patient way.

Table 5-1. The summary of political and governmental policies (The red items refer unachieved policies)

Political and Governmental Policies			
Targeted Policies	**Evaluation of the Mayor**	**General Evaluation**	**Suggestions**
Participation of the public to the administration and its audit	The public is insensible	The municipal council meetings to be held publicly is a positive effect	Political actors, demolition-construction dialectic
Public council (women-youth-elderly, retired, neighbourhood)	Political body does not support	Public councils-City councils, capitalist municipalism-socialist alternative	The Mayor, intellectual labour-physical labour contradiction
Local democracy and local autonomy	Contradiction between political groups	Unable to become as red as being technical	Public Councils with definite content (sub-councils, audit and upper-council)
Cooperation with national and foreign socialist municipalities	Prevention of the State	Mobilization of the people was not realized	Problem analysis in neighbourhood scale, weekly information and meetings
Public relations unit (polls and public opinion surveys)	Anti-propaganda of system parties	Criticism-alternative creation	Socialist Municipalities Union
Cooperation with labour-trade organizations and non-governmental organizations		Labour-trade organizations and university relations, and democracy problem	
The municipal council meetings is open to public		Relationship between political actors, people and municipality	
		The basis of local democracy and local autonomy is empty	

5.2.2.2. Economic Policies

The Hozat district ranks 340 among the entire district in Turkey regarding the economic development level according to the research carried out in 2004 by DPT via utilizing the economic markers It is ranked first among the districts of Tunceli. The district has economic relations not with the Tunceli province which it is attached to, but with Elazığ.

Table 5-2. Socio-Economic Development Order of Districts of Tunceli

Province	District	Development rank among 872 districts
Tunceli	Hozat	340
Tunceli	Ovacık	377
Tunceli	Pülümür	432
Tunceli	Nazımiye	510
Tunceli	Çemişgezek	518
Tunceli	Pertek	586
Tunceli	Mazgirt	711

(Source: DPT, 2004)

As Table 5-2 is inspected, it can be seen that agriculture have an important share among the economic effects on the population of the district according to the Hozat Development Plan made in 2000.

Table 5-3. Distribution of Sectors in Hozat

Agriculture	66.1%
Administrative and Official Institutions	15.3%
Trade	8.8%
Other	19.2%

(Source: Report of Hozat Development Plan, 2000)

Along with this, as Table 5-3 is inspected, some important results regarding the area can be drawn. The economic fraction forming the majority in the district is among service sector. Those working in the agriculture sector, on the other hand, comprise 29% of the population of the district. Rate of those working in the service sector represents the highest value on a sectoral basis. If Table 5-2 and 5-3 is compared, it can be said that number of those working in the agriculture sector was decreased due to village evacuations. Inflation in the service sector has occurred with the migrations from rural village areas to district center. In a similar

manner, an increase in the number of persons employed in the public institutions has also occurred with the increase in the population in the urban areas.

If, again, Table 5-3 is observed, it can be said that no industry is present except small handicrafts in the district. Those dealing with animal breeding also sell their product via personnel communications, not via capitalist market mechanism, which is also the case in agricultural products.

Another reason for migration from village to city is that the lands are fragmented among relatives or families as the population increases. This situation decreases the agricultural efficiency. Therefore, people try to find jobs by migrating to city centers and out of town.

Table 5-4. Ranks of Hozat in Turkey According to Economical Indicators

Province	Tunceli
District	Hozat
Population	9 143 (798)
Average Household Size	5,43 (326)
Ratio of Labour in Agriculture Sector (%)	29,71 (840)
Ratio of Labour in Industry Sector (%)	1,25(768)
Ratio of Labour in Service Sector (%)	69,04 (9)
Unemployment Ratio (%)	3,59 (637)
General Budget Income Per Capita (1000 TL)	46 028 (366)

Note: The numbers inside the parenthesis show the rank among Turkey. (Source: DPT, 2004)

The resources allocated for the local administrations from central government have also increased in our country in parallel with the Keynesian Welfare State policies which has started to be utilized since 1960s. However, together with the neoliberal economic developments starting from 1980s, a transition from urban governance to urban management became a necessity for local governance. This model brought a competitive and entrepreneur understanding instead of previously utilized division of labour based, complementary urban development model, thus let the cities by themselves on creation of resources based on their needs. Therefore, the cities which have more opportunities regarding economic, social and cultural point of view could be included into international market more

easily and could be developed, while cities with low population and which are underdeveloped are experiencing serious inconveniencies due to resources.

In this respect, many interviews were made in order to understand the economic dynamics of the area. During the interview with the Mayor, questions related with the financial structure of the municipality and the projects during the first term from his election in 2004 to 2008.

> There were total of 53 employees, 35 of them being worker and 18 civil servant, when I first took office. Today, there are total of 41 employees, 30 of them being worker and 11 civil servants. One of our civil servants was appointed to another institution and 6 of our civil servants have retired during this period. The population of our district dropped from 6580 to 5840 in 2007 and a decrease of our shares ranging from 8000 to 12000 has occurred in 2008. During this 4 year period, the total income of the municipality was 5603662 TL, however the total expenses were 7009890 TL. During the same period between 2004 and 2008, an increase in the municipal incomes which is incomparable with the previous term. Furthermore, the Inspector of Ministry of Internal Affairs has indicated in his inspection report that there has been an important increase in municipal income in 2004-2005 in comparison with the previous years and pointed out to the steep increase in the rental income. Again in this inspection report, the mayor who was in the office prior to me during the inspection period was mentioned as well. It was observed that although total of 67 workplace, land and residence held by the municipality was sold, there was no significant decrease in the debts of the municipality to both its personnel and also to public institutions and organizations, and a permanent and regular income types were not concentrated on. I will add a couple of things in addition to this. I am not telling these to praise myself but to make the situation understood clearly. I went abroad a couple of times during my term. Although I went there as a representative of the municipality, I covered all expenses from my own pocket. And again, I used the vehicle that belongs to me during this period. I pair my own BAĞ-KUR (insurance institution) premiums. Most of the concerts and activities held in the district were covered by me. Computer infrastructure of the municipality was very weak when I took office. The expenses of the new computers acquired to the municipality were covered by me. I made many other contributions like these (the Mayor).

As the activity reports of the Hozat Municipality from 2004 to 2011 were inspected, it was possible to find data which allow us to make some points regarding the study area. It can be seen in this report that Hozat Municipality has been using EU funds for its resource creation policy. The project presented to the EU for construction of 21 km drinking water network, replacement of old water pipes and delivery of healthy drinking water to the district was accepted and therefore, the water network problem, which was one of the most important problems of Hozat, was solved. Some of the infrastructure expenses were also

covered from state resources with BELDES (Municipality Support) projects. In order to relieve the municipal budget, the municipality gave land to personnel for compensation of their lien from the municipality. For the lands with high value, the personnel have become indebted to the municipality and the amount of this debt is being deduced from the salaries of those employees.

Several questions were directed to working class of the public and general population in order to understand the economic policy of the municipality:

> I am aware that the resources of the municipality are limited. However, although there should have been 500 TL deduction from our salaries each month due to our land debts to the municipality according to the municipal committee decision, this value changes each month. There are different deductions from different person's salaries. This is a problem (Hozat Municipality, civil servant, 49).

> The main problem in our municipality is the ill-communication between the employees and the Mayor. There can be deductions from our salaries. But what we want is that equal deduction from everyone. Otherwise there will be opposition between employees (Hozat Municipality, civil servant, 50).

> Actually there is not much that the Mayor can do. Because the municipal incomes are very limited. Deduction from the salaries is a necessity. If only our income would have been higher and we would had higher salaries, but this is not possible (Hozat Municipality, worker, 43).

As can be understood from the interviews with the municipal employees that, there is a significant miscommunication between the Mayor and the employees. Non-payment of the municipal employees due to limited resources is taken to be normal by the employees. This situation actually shows that the employees also embrace the municipality as well. One employee, who did not want any recording, has stated that they are embracing the municipality, but DHF should take more interest in their problems. As can be understood from this, DHF has been significantly insufficient in creating a bridge between the municipal administration and the employees.

We asked the public about the economic policies of the municipality along with the problems within the municipality:

The funds transferred to the municipality by the state are very limited. Nonetheless, there have been many services to our district which can not be compared with the previous terms. I am happy with the economic policies of the municipality (woodcutter, male, 37).

The municipality may encourage the production which can create resources. There had been a large scale migration from our district to the city center due to armed conflict. Most of the young population is spending their time at the coffee houses as there are no work fields. Production cooperatives to be established may resolve this problem (craftsman, male, 29).

I think a small factory should be established in Hozat. The unemployment problem can not be solved otherwise. Some of the young population are working in the fields or dealing with animal breeding during summer. However, there is nothing to do during winter (housewife, 51).

Small workshops or handicrafts market may be established. This will partially attract public to production. Therefore people will tend to produce instead of walking around lazily. In the mean time, some projects directed towards women should be developed in order to attach them to production (student, male, 18).

Agriculture and animal breeding are important sectors in our district. However, soldiers are preventing agricultural activity in the villages and plateaus. The thing that should be done in Hozat is to organize the rural population around cooperatives (DHF member, female, 21).

Important results have been deduced from these interviews and observations in the field. Those migrated from completely or partially evacuated villages due to security reasons after 1994 have moved to Hozat. Limited residence in the Hozat caused migrated people to live with their relatives in the same houses. Along with this, those who migrated were forced to feed the animals they own at barns which they have built near their homes. At the same time, the field remained at the villages became unattended and they also sold the animals they could not feed in the city. These people, who tried to work as craftsmen along with agriculture and animal breeding; and have been failed to do so at this sector which they know nothing about. According to the municipal officers, the businesses at the city are changing hands constantly.

The status of those working as a laborer or shepherd at the rural areas is even more serious. Those who migrated were forced to pay for the animal products and agricultural products they used to produce themselves in the villages.

In this context, the main policy that the municipality must do should be establishing production farms by creating resources. A permanent and sustainable revolutionist-socialist local governance claim would be developed beyond an economic dynamism that is oriented around solidarity endeavors that have been developed at a different level or a tourism oriented economic dynamics, and with applications which can respond to local social production relationships in a certain level and which can transform the production relations in a collectivist manner. Because while a politization at an ideological and cultural ground shall weaken and shatter unless it is not transformed to production relations, a tourism oriented economic dynamic shall cause a sense of community which is not highly fragile and collectivist.

In this context, Hozat Municipality should seek out the ways to develop solidarity practices with leftist-socialist forces at a larger geographic scale at one hand and to find ways to transform the socio-economic facts of the region towards collectivist production relations.

Table 5-5. The summary of economic policies (The red items refer unachieved and the blue items refer partially achieved policies)

Economic Policies				
Targeted Policies	**Financial Resource**	**Evaluation of the Mayor**	**General Evaluation**	**Suggestions**
Support for industrial and trade establishments which shall enable employment	Aid campaigns and concerts (ADHK-DHF)	Excess staff from previous terms	NGO aids and voluntary aids, social embrace	Analysis of socio-economical structure (dominant production relations – social classes)
Development of agriculture and animal breeding	Personal aid of the Mayor (Konak Gıda A.Ş.)	Insensible agricultural applications of the commoners	Mayor's spending from his own capital is a positive effect	Analysis of agricultural operation type (small manufacturer – capitalist farms)
Ecological agriculture and greenhouse cultivation	Donations of Fellow Townsmen Agencies	Market area is not developed	Significant income increase in comparison with the previous term	Analysis of production relations (Rule of law – market criteria)
Creating scholarship for university students	Aids of fellow townsmen businessmen	Village evacuations, plateau-meadow prohibitions	Budget from Provincial Bank is limited	Analysis of distribution relations (producer, usurer-capitalist, bank-land owner)
Transparent and Participatory Budget	Aids of Çankaya, Şişli, Avcılar, etc. Municipalities	Industry is undeveloped	Current capitalist system municipalism have not exceeded its boundaries	Funds from national and international organizations to model production cooperatives
Revenue increase-collection of debts	EU Funds	Capital migration	Transparent budget application, participation is questionable	Pressurizing district governorship for resources-social movement
Urban technical infrastructure investments	SODES (Social Support Fund-DPT).	Insufficient transportation and communication network	International funds is questionable	Porto Alegre, Viranşehir examples
Temporary Employment Areas	Project of Working for the Society (TYÇP - Ministry of Labour)	Industrial inputs except agriculture (energy etc) are insufficient	Negative attitude of armed forced of the state (shopping etc.)	
Procurement of necessary tools and equipment, computer hardware		Animal breeding and agricultural credit is insufficient		

5.2.2.3. Social, Cultural and Women Policies

It is important that a municipality which claims to govern the city with public and political actors within municipality or around it carry out social and cultural works along with economic and political works. Within this context, within the framework of interviews, conversations and observations, it will be analyzed which means are used by municipality and political actors in the social and cultural transformation of public.

First of all, interviews have been carried out with the Mayor related to this subject:

> Our town has undeveloped and feudal structure socially and economically. Although there is not a structure which involves landlord in social life like the one in Southeastern Anatolia, tribal relations and traditional structure still continue. In this sense, policies which needed to be applied as a local government were to develop policies which will save public from these backward relations. Of course this structure needs to be carried out with economical and cultural transformation. But as municipality we at least tried to work in cultural issues. Firstly, Municipality Wedding Hall which was not used for years was repaired and made ready for Festival activities. Munzur Culture and Nature Festival whose fourth one was organized in our city, was celebrated in 2004 for the first time with the efforts of our municipality. With efforts of municipality, public and our artist friends throughout the festival, festival activities turned into a solidarity and sharing activity of public. In the same way, in order to reflect our city's culture and history, it has been agreed that mural painting would be made on all empty walls. In this context, as a result of municipality's announcements, with the help of housewives and other people who are talented in painting and especially student teenagers, walls of our city were decorated with photographs whose themes were chosen by public. At the same time, Ahmet Kaya Fountain was built. In addition, two streets were named as Cevahir and Kazım Koyuncu. In terms of preserving social balance and values related to faith in our town, because of our town's need and strong demand from our public concerning a Cem House; land was prepared near to Koprubasi Neighborhood Mass Housing area and was sold to Hozat Hacı Bektaş-ı Veli Association in order for them to build a Cem House. Our municipality worked actively for May 1st Laborer Day, 8 March World Women's Day and other activities. On the other hand, another problem of our city is that young people always are in coffee house (kahvehane) and unemployed. In addition to this, a serious view come out when we consider this situation with drugs, heroin consumption and prostitution which bourgeoisies state uses to degenerate public. I think teenagers of Hozat should focus on different issues rather than having such bad habits. Otherwise, such policies will remove Dersim from its own culture (The Mayor).

Similar questions have been asked to representative of Federation of Democratic Rights on the same issue:

Everybody knows problems and issues experienced in Dersim and bourgeois state carries out dirty policies on the basis of Dersim from past periods till today. We organized a lot of campaigns against degeneration so far. Our campaigns were realized firstly meetings held with public. There are substance users in our town despite the fact that their number is low. There are still works that are carried out in order to reintegrate substance users into society and a lot of substance users have been reintegrated into society. In addition, internet café culture still continues. Our teenagers spend their times at internet cafes from morning till night. On the other hand women and elderly people spend their times at homes, men on the other hand spend theirs at coffee houses (kahvehane) because there is not any place where people can attend cultural and art activities together. This situation leads to non-production. Against this situation, we try to organize many cultural and art activities at our town (member of Federation of Democratic Rights, male, 33).

As understood from these remarks, cultural and social transformation can not be thought separately from economic and political processes. But this process requires a long transformation and can not be thought independently from social and economic transformation of the country. Additionally, works which are carried out by both the municipality and Federation of Democratic Rights actually intend to appeal public for sharing, solidarity and common production. But it is clear that unless they are supported with economic and political campaigns, they will be periodic and temporary.

Figure 5-5. A demonstration against cultural degeneration organised by DHF (Source: DHF Archive).

Again people from different segments of the society were talked on the same issue:

Our teenagers are very lazy, even though they are unemployed; they all have cigarettes and most luxurious cell phones in their pockets. Our working field is so limited that

girls are in a hurry to get married, boys are more like in a panic of saving the day and work at temporary jobs. For this, they are always at coffee houses (kahvehane). Students on the other hand are spending their times at internet cafes (Civil servant, male, 46).

When compared with past, relations among public has been degraded. In the past everybody used to help each other. Sharing and solidarity relations have started to deteriorate. In the past, everybody used to work at fields in their villages together, and used to pasture their animals together. But they have evacuated our villages, and now city life here is deprived of areas which bring us together and make us produce together (Farmer, male, 38).

People here are very sensitive. They are attached to their revolutionary values coming from past. Even though capitalist system tries to degenerate us, our people are aware of every thing. Things that municipality can do related to cultural and social transformation are very limited. Here the real task falls on the shoulder of Federation of Democratic Rights. It should organize campaigns against degeneration as the real representative of revolutionary values. It should promote establishment of cooperatives by finding resource. Thus, people will develop solidarity relations in common production areas (Shopkeeper, male, 44).

People here are very poor. We try to help them as much as we can. Almost half of the population of the city has Green Cards. The main reason of poverty is terrorism. They convince our people to take the hills. Thus they migrate because they are afraid of terrorists. Then unemployment begins because working areas are too limited. Apart from this, consciousness of being a city dweller is very weak. They throw their garbage near the streets. In addition there is an issue of laziness. People come from Southeastern Anatolia in order to work in constructions here (The Mayor).

Teenagers here try to preserve the revolutionary values that we created in the past in a very fixed way. They consider themselves revolutionists when they grow beard. However, revolutionism starts firstly in personality. People here primarily should organize their own lives instead of organizing other people. It does not work by organizing movements or shouting slogans. We need to create precedent personalities in order to assure public (Retired civil servant, male, 57).

From these interviews, we gather important data related to social structure of the area. It is possible to group them in specific titles. Structure based on land is seen not only in economic structure but also in social structure. There is not large land ownership and land feudalism like those in Southeastern Anatolia. But structure of village preserves its culture in city life and reproduces itself because small peasant production facilities still preserve themselves in a certain proportion and people living in the city are always in touch with villages. People who are not in touch with villages spend their times in coffee houses (kahvehane) when they can not find a job. This situation leads to a kind of insensitivity and freeloading. Even

though young labor force is enough in the city to work at construction sites, people outside the city come to work at such places. On the other hand, municipality and other political actors state that they organize campaigns related to specific problematic areas. But it is clear that they do not carry these campaigns within a framework of a specific program. This situation does not create constant relations with public. The activities organized by the municipality such as festival and concerts are of important in terms of bringing people together but not enough. What the municipality needs to do primarily is to take out especially teenagers from coffee houses (kahvehane) and women from their homes and to create areas where they can spend time together and exhibit their common outputs of production.

The issue of women is a historical and social one which exists in all managerial systems and social classes ranging from most developed social structure to most backward one in social and economic sense. Especially in close and traditional social structures it is experienced more deeply. The issue of women is a much deeper and sophisticating topic that will extend our limit of the study. Therefore, what is intended in this study is identify main problems experienced by women in the area and to analyze policies developed by local managements and other political actors against this problem. Therefore interviews made with women in the area present valuable data in terms of analysis:

> I am always at home. I have four kids. My days pass by taking care of my kids, laundry, dirty dishes, cleaning, cooking. Neighbors help me when I can not complete them all. My husband does not resort to violence. After all he works day and night at construction sites and fields. When he gets home, he is tired. I expect from the municipality to create a place where women can spend time together and discuss their problems (housewife, 34).

> We of course have sometimes discussion with my husband. But it is normal. At every house the same thing happens. My husband runs a coffee house (kahvehane). I have three kids. I am always at home. Sometimes I visit neighbors. I just wish that in the future my kids go to university and find jobs. I expect from the municipality to build a nursery or a laundry house (housewife, 48).

> I have two sons. They study at high schools. All my time passes by doing chores at home. I go to pasture cows when the kids do not go. What can the local government do about this? Will it give a housemaid to our house? I do not believe that there is anything tat can be done for the women in our town (housewife, 55).

Revolutionary struggle which is given for years in our region has resulted in fundamental changes in the position of women within the society. Our revolutionary women who refuse traditional roles assigned by the patriarchal society have strived in every area of life in order to ensure social transformation. Revolutionary struggle given by women has made women active actors before men and the present system. Today women in our town stand on their own legs more than women in many other regions (unemployed woman, 25).

I try to do house chores when I have time from my work. I have two sons. They both go to high school. It is really hard to both work and do house chores. I become too tired. My husband does not help me in doing house chores like all men in Hozat. What the local government needs to do is to open places such as nurseries, laundry houses, etc where we can meet our common needs (Civil servant, female, 47).

Important conclusions related to the lives of women in the town can be reached from these interviews and other conversations and observations within the town. Women can not participate in labor market. The number of women working paid is a very low rate according to the general number of women. There are women who work in public institutions and small sized family trade facilities. But apart from these, the number of women who work paid is very low. Women generally are busy with house chores, families who keep in touch with villages go to villages to work in the fields in summers; families who do not keep in touch with villages on the other hand posture their animals if they have and generally take care of house chores. Patriarchal men sovereignty which is a general problem of social structure is experienced deeply in this area.

Figure 5-6. 8 March World Proleterian Women Day Organisation by Demokratic Women Movement (Source: DHF Archive).

Women who are involved in revolutionary institutions participate in social life much more. They spend more time in the market. Because the society is alevi, women have more comfortable lives compared to other Eastern Anatolia cities.

Questions related the position of women in social life and how local governments tackle the issue of women have been asked to representative of Federation of Democratic Rights and the Mayor:

> Since the day I took the office, I paid attention that women attend municipality council meetings which we organize open to public and express their problems. Before council meetings, vehicles belonging to municipality visit neighborhoods and make announcements of meetings and call for especially women. In addition, 8 March World Women Day activities are organized regularly in our town. Prior to these activities, works are organized as campaigns and women are called to get together for their common problems. At the same time we also tried to establish women council within the municipality council which we try to establish. But we can not say that we have reached to desired level (The Mayor).

> As a result of a class based social structure, women are exploited like men. But along with this women are underestimated by men because of patriarchal structure. Therefore, exploitation of women is two times more than men. For this reason women have to fight and organize against both system and patriarchal order. But today women do not or can not carry out enough activities for their rights. It is not correct to blame women for women not being sent to streets. Women organizations should have some lessons from

this negative situation. Also violence against women is an important problem in our region like any where else. All around the world women are exposed to violence. For this reason women should get organized in order to eliminate the second class treatment which is applied to women (member of Federation of Democratic Rights, female, 37).

As understood from these interviews, the issue of women has been analyzed correctly within the framework of its historical and social context and it has been stated that women need to get organized. But answers related to tools and methods of organization are not satisfactory. The participation of women in both urban life and production process is very low. In this respect, employment policies which will enable women participate in production processes by getting out of their houses should be developed. And this can be realized through organizations such as cooperatives for common production. On the other hand, the fact that municipality develops policies for women such as nursery and laundry house, will make it possible for women to have time for themselves. Otherwise, work done by women in houses which is not appreciated will make them more dependent on house. On the other hand, women who are not independent economically become increasingly more dependent on men and are not able to make decisions related to their own lives independently from men. Another conclusion which is reached from observations and conversation within the area is that the role in social life of women who have met with revolutionary struggle is free. They make their own decisions and call both state and men account when they experience injustice. Democratic Women Movement which is part of Federation of Democratic Rights carries out activities in the region. It can not be said that works carried out by both this organization and women councils which were established under the leadership of the municipality are satisfactory.

Table 5-6. The summary of economic policies (The red items refer unachieved policies)

Social, Cultural and Women Policies			
Targeted Policies	**Evaluation of the Mayor**	**General Evaluation**	**Suggestions**
Social Transformation projects	Tribe structure-politics relation	Production relations-social structure	Intervention to production relations-social transformation
Women Solidarity Houses	Insufficient funds	Patriarchal structure-objectification of women-marriage age	Union of labour an democracy forces
Youth center	State pressure	Sect-religious order-University-AKP relation	Culture-Art center (handicrafts, music, sculpture, etc.)
Municipal Public Library	Disinterest of the public	Provincial governorship-District governorship aids	Urban service in the language of the region
Munzur Culture and Nature Fest	Low education quality	Corruption-police relation	Women councils
Wall paints, Emek Fountain, Cevahir Street, Deniz Gezmiş Street		Dams, de-settlement	Religious places (cem evleri, ziyaretler, ocaklar) and politics (Pir S.A. DER.)
Cem house		Education-Fetullah Gülen-Munzur Collage-courses	Inclusion of women to production process (cooperatives-workshops)
		State-alevicilik	Voluntary education courses- Eğitim-Sen (Education and Science Laborers Union) and other NGOs

5.2.2.4. City Planning Policies

In this part, city planning policies which are tried to be applied in the region will be presented within the framework of observations, conversations and interviews. First of all, observations related to the region will be presented and then data gathered from interviews will be evaluated.

Topographic features, property structure, physical situation of river beds, agricultural areas and features of soil class are among the significant factors in the spatial development of the region. Apart from this the most significant factor is

Military Security Limit. 51st Infantry Brigade which is located on the southeast of Hozat on a large area has been determinant in the identification of development direction of the town. Consequently, threshold planning method has been found appropriate and has been applied.

Another factor which directs planning activities in Hozat is that public fields apart from the Municipality property are much and diverse. The fact that public lands which can be planned are not much makes it harder to find places for facilities such as education, parks, play grounds for children, market places, which are necessary for urban use.

Figure 5-7. The Military Land Territory in The City (The area marked with red line refers to military land territory and the area marked with blue line refers to TOKİ blocks area) (Source: Google Earth).

In the developing areas on the east of the town, with the population increase there will be housing need and along with this some urban use areas (education, green area, mosque, health institutions) have been considered as necessary in accordance with city planning principles.

It is seen that municipality utilizes present transportation networks. But the level of private car ownership and use is very low because the economic structure of the town is very low. Therefore, present vehicles park alongside the roads rather than underground and open parking lots.

It has been observed that traditional nature of structuring in Hozat has started to degenerate. Especially, multi storey apartment blocks have surrounded the city. This situation causes a structuring type which is contrary to social and cultural pattern of the region.

Economic structure of Hozat is weak. This situation weakens the social structure as well. There is very limited number of picnic areas for public to have fun together and spend their free times. Also there are not places in the town where teenagers do sports in closed areas, have fun and hold ceremonies during harsh winter months.

It is important to support the observations related to spatial structure of the region with interviews carried out in the region:

> In my term I started my works by meeting a need which has been ignored in previous terms. Picnic area is an important issue at our town. I arranged and turned the place which was used as avalanche fountain into a picnic area. Along with this I renewed pipes which have been rusty for years with the EU funds. Thus people in the region who have used dangerous water for years started to drink health water for the first time in my term. In addition, aesthetic pattern of the city changed when we covered the roads with stone block pavements by using state and municipality resources. An area in Koprubasi Neighborhood has been divided into 70 parcels and these parcels have been delivered to people who were forced to migrate from their villages in 1994 by casting lots. Within the scope of Social Support Program (SODES) which is carried out by State Planning Organization; SODES (World of Fairytale) culture, art and sports project which is considered to contribute to children and teenagers in the region to express themselves better through cultural, art and sports activities was evaluated and accepted by Undersecretariat of State Planning Organization in July, 2010. Total cost of the project is 186831 TL and 168810 TL of the total cost was covered by SODES. With the completion of the project, our children had multi purpose playing grounds and green parks. 108 dwelling houses project was carried out jointly by our municipality and TOKI (Housing Development Administration of Turkey) and 100 dwelling houses and 4 working places were delivered to their buyers and opened as settlement areas. Again in the same area two-year Office Management and Secretary Department which is a part of Tunceli university opened for education in 2010. On the north of the area there are building lands which are zoned for housing. Most of them have been sold (The Mayor).

Figure 5-8. TOKİ Blocks, Chisldren Park and New Housing Blocks Area Territory (Source : Personel Archive).

Physical infrastructure investments which have been told by the Mayor are very important but TOKI dwelling houses and similar projects are open to discussion. Interviews with different segments of the society have been carried out in order to understand above mentioned projects other city planning practices:

> The problem of water which has not been solved so far by any municipality management has been solved in this period. Similarly, renovation of roads and similar practices have been realized in this period. We are very satisfied with the practices of the Mayor (Shopkeeper, male, 36).

> The green park which was in the entrance of the city is very good. We go there to have our breakfast together with my family at weekends. The facts that water system which was a problem for years was arranged and roads have been repaired are good practices. I also find the mural paintings successful. They represent the cultural values of Hozat (Worker, male, 25).

> I do not like TOKI policy of the municipality. If there is a housing problem, this can be solved in a way by finding resource. These buildings are not suitable for traditional housing nature of our town. They create inharmonious and bad images (Unemployed, female, 28).

> A park called World of Fairytale has been built so that our children can play. But the place where it was built is far away from our city. Our children are accustomed to play on the streets. How can they go a place which is very far away? I think this project is senseless. It would be better if they had done it in the city (Housewife, 28).

I am a civil servant. The mayor sold us, employees of the municipality land near TOKI houses in return for debt it owes. Now we are indebted to the municipality. Lands in the area have been bought by paying approximately 280 000 TL and sold for 15 000 000 TL. Lands were cheap when they were bought. Their prices increased when TOKI and similar investments were made in the area (Civil servant at the municipality, 51).

Our house was included in housing area within the construction plan in the past. But the municipality declared here as disaster area in 2001 and turned into afforested area. But after a while someone living in the same area called a geological engineer and they made survey study and found out that ground of his parcel was strong and got license by making modifications in construction plan. We waived objections against municipality and stated that if this area would be open to construction, it would be applicable for everybody. Then after the research in the area done by the municipality they determined 750 TL cost for each and every one of the houses in the area (Retired, male, 61).

Interesting conclusions are reached from interviews. First one of these is the urban investments carried out in Koprubasi Neighborhood. This neighborhood is on southeast of the city and a little away on walking distance. But with the opening of this area to construction and structuring, investments have increased rents in the area. Thus, land owners in the area have gained serious amounts of income. Apart from this, TOKI dwelling houses in the area are not health and materials of the houses run down.

Figure 5-9. Traditional Housing Structure of The City (Source: Personel Archive).

Figure 5-10. Traditional Housing Structure of The City (Source: Personel Archive).

In addition to these, it is quite common that municipalities declare some urban areas as disaster areas in an illegal way in order to get more money from Iller Bank. The same situation is true for Hozat Municipality. Mayor before this Mayor

have also applied to the same method. But what a municipality which advocates the interests of the society needs to do is to treat everyone equally on the basis of their rights.

Another problem of Hozat is that especially since 1990s animal husbandry has increased in neighborhoods due to migrations from villages to town centers. Public who can not go to their tablelands and villages because of security reasons feed their animals in barns which they have built in the neighborhood and this situation creates an unpleasant environment in terms of public health. On the other hand, the town has a rural structure because trade and industry have not developed.

As a whole, while urban investments are carried out in the town by the municipality, they need to take the opinions of public prior to decisions and ensure that public participates in decision making processes. During the interviews, it was told that these meetings are held frequently during project processes. But it is observed that Federation of Democratic Rights which is an institution that the public trust is inactive in these meetings. The local government commission which involves representative of Federation of Democratic Rights needs to be more authorized in the field of city planning. Otherwise, a closed municipalism practice which is not supervised will emerge and intended socialist municipalism will not be realized.

Table 5-7. The summary of city planning policies (The red items refer unachieved policies)

City Planning Policies			
Targeted Policies	**Evaluation of the Mayor**	**General Evaluation**	**Suggestions**
Participatory Urban Transformation	Relations with TMMOB (Union of Chambers of Turkish Engineers and Architects) and ŞPO (Chamber of City Planners) is weak	Residence problem-TOKİ (Housing Development Administration of Turkey)	Integral perspective to planning, urban rents
Settlement according to social-cultural structure	Inadequacy of District Directorate of Agriculture and Chamber of Agricultural Engineers	Public participation to projects	Effectiveness of people in decision making processes
Ecological urban planning	Technical and financial insufficiency (lack of technical works employee, city planner)	Spatial investments and distribution of rent	Voluntary consultancies from TMMOB and Universities
City without residence problem		Military field	Relocation of military field outside of the city
Technical infrastructure investments		Planning, relations around municipality	Employment of technical personnel
Free land assignment to those migrated by force and technical support		Settlement pressure on agricultural lands	Residence problem-collective work culture-social solidarity
		Urban Transformation concept	Traditional residence texture-TOKİ

6. CONCLUSION

In this chapter, suggestions regarding the study area will be made by making a general assessment of this study.

The Marxist approaches are the ones which consider the situation in a political economy within organizational discussions at the area of local administrations. The approaches can be fundamentally group as structuralist, instrumentalist and uneven development. But when all these approaches are assessed separately, they possess certain deficiencies within themselves. When assessed on the basis of these three approaches, local administrations are neither a simple extension of the system nor democracy islands independent from the system. In this aspect, we can consider the local administrations as a body of administrative, political, social and economic relations which are defined in a certain spatial scale based on uneven development of capital accumulation. This definition removes the local administrations from the context of a simple organizational-administrative problem and places them into a political context. When considered from Marxist point of view, basis of social and political problem is the class struggle.

When observed from this perspective, the fundamental factor effecting the quality of local administrations and especially municipalities is the social struggles given in local scales. Therefore, the submission on local power can be on the side of central state or local communities depending on the social struggle given in local scale. In other words, each reform demand regarding local administrations is the representation of the struggle between social classes or fractions in the essence. When this struggle is resolved in agreement, then this means the reform works have reached a result. The situation indicated here is the statement that the contradictions between social classes or fragments have not been keen yet. When the problems are not resolved, however, the contradictions turn into unaggreable opposition and the present situation is the messenger of a serious transition. The new situation is formed as a result of important chaos and the newly formed administrative structure re-established the local organization from head to toe in

parallel with the new social power. The organization of monarchy in a local scale coincides with 1789 revolution in France, after the Reform of 1832 in England and revoke of serfdom in Russia. In Ottoman, however, the same period has progressed under the pressure of colonization and according to effect of domestic and foreign dynamics.

The local administrations of western societies have acquired their institutionalized in 19th century and have transformed with limited arrangements during 20th century. Western European countries have responded to the democracy criticisms especially by socialist countries with elevating the self-governance of local administrations. Although these countries constantly emphasize the self-governance of local administrations, the number of local administrations has constantly decreased and their scale was enlarged. Along with this, on the contrary to the suggested, the local administrations at the west have not been financed by their self-revenues but according to the resources allocated by the central governance.

On the other hand, local administrations have a special place in socialist models. According to Marxist theory, the state will be attenuated when transition from socialism to communism period is completed. No need for a mechanism called state, which would manage the society shall remain. Because the society will come to a level in which it will self-govern. In this context, local governments are model units within socialism for local population to self-govern. However, the situation is not as it was though as the application at the Soviets are observed. Although the self-governance of local governments is defined in their development programs, their authorities were narrowed in practice and local units were merged in certain numbers.

During 1980s, local governments were released from their structure which is contracted to local committees and expended to capitalization actors and non-governmental organizations of different scales within the framework of governance model on the basis of new rightist policies which became common

throughout the world with Thatcher-Reagen implementations. The fundamental purpose of this governance is to enable local councils to share the representation and resources with market actors.

However, in our country this transition period had been more painful. The Mayors were appointed by the central government and has acted as conveyor of policies of central government to local scale during the period from foundation of the republic to 1960s. Municipal councils, on the other hand, were units which represent the interests of local capital circles. It can be said that important changes have occurred in the municipalities as of 1970s. Both mayors and also political parties have developed populist municipalism in order to restrain the reactions of working class of rural origin, starting from 1960 and increasing in 1970, and who are mostly present at shacks.

In this context, especially municipalities at metropolitan cities have started to reach and make more investment to these places where they see as a potential vote depot. The middle age and older fraction of the social opposition started at the suburbs during this period have started to take side within CHP. The fraction younger than middle age has participated within radical leftist organizations depending on the revolutionist acceleration developing in the world. As a result of revolutionist struggle developing with an increase in Turkey, revolutionists have won the municipal elections at Fatsa. The revolutionist municipalism understanding which was tried to be actualized in Fatsa constitute an important reference point for how the revolutionist municipalism understanding should be from that period until today.

In 1980s, an all-around unification period had started with international capital. In this context, the fundamental dust of local administrations has been to adjust the partitioning relations of the resources in a local scale. Obviously the capital classes are the ones who benefited from this period the most. There are three main properties of the role of the municipalities during this period:

The municipalities, similar to other public institutions, have transferred the public resources to private sector via acquisition of goods, service and credit.

They have enabled the creation the unpaid cost factor for private industry and trade sector via urban investments.

They have enabled the capital circles to acquire share from urban land rent via utilizing planning tool.

As the period starting from mid 1990s to present is inspected, it is observed that the main axis of municipalism policies in our country is formed by neoliberal marketing along with Islamist conservatism. This understanding, starting from Welfare Party term, is continuing today with AKP (Justice and Development Party).in an institutionalized manner. In parallel with this, the municipalism of AKP is re-defining the municipalities around market logic, and causing the society to become needy to itself via reinforcing its domination over this fraction with implementations such as food and fuel aid, especially to lower classes, and mass circumcision feasts.

Leftist-socialist traditions in Turkey have not or could not be put an opposition power struggle and practice into agenda on the basis of locality up to present day. Localities have stayed limited as a social and geographical resistance of a rebellion location in general. Frankly speaking, it is not possible to show any opposite-local administration experience from the history of socialist movement which have exceeded social participation trials that is generalized to a certain level (Fatsa) and some social municipalism application (Dikili).

Tunceli and its district Hozat are on top of the regions which have paid the price of development process of Turkish capitalism through the West Anatolia with economic underdevelopment, political oppression and cultural assimilation. As this situation is ongoing at different levels and forms, there are many deficiencies and problems in financial, administrative, technical and social extent before

political movements which won the municipality elections in the region and especially which have a revolutionist claim.

The following section of the result chapter will develop a general assessment regarding economic, socio-cultural, political-governance and urban problems of the area, and develop solution suggestions.

Firstly, if we start with economical structure, it is necessary to make an assessment of the area before developing solution suggestions. It is obvious that the solutions to be produced before discussing the socio-economic structure and dominant production style of the area will be insufficient. However, the purpose here is to get into detailed discussion of feudal and Asian type production methods. But to discuss the present production relations based on production style. Although there are certain aspects of the area which differentiate from dominant production relations of our country, it is obvious that these are not included into dominant production relation of our country. From a historical perspective, a socio-economic institution formed of a single production relation and a single production form is rarely encountered. According to Marxist economic principles, this continues its existence at the same society with different production types are side-by-side and intertwined. In this respect, correct interpretation of production relations in the area means starting this type of a research from square one, in other words selection of fundamental production unit as a starting point. The fundamental producing unit is agricultural facilities in the area. When the dynamics of the study area is inspected, the fundamental forms which may allow us to understand the relation between operation forms and production are: tenancy and partnership structure, agricultural labour, trade and usury, small commodity production and self-sustaining agricultural facilities, rich peasantry and land feudalism, and detailed assessment of these is out of the scope of this study. However, it is possible to have more detailed information if discussions of production style during 1970 are especially observed.

Suggestions regarding the local economic structure of the study area will be made within the framework of these discussions. These suggestions can be classified in two main categories. The first of these is the policies which should be developed directed toward improvement of the economic situation of the population, and the second one is composed of interventions to be done to the economic structure of the region which shall exceed these incidental improvements. The second part requires a structural transformation on a country scale which will exceed the study area. In other words, it is fundamentally necessary to focus on the second heading as it includes an intervention directed towards changing the dominant economic relation form in the country.

In this respect, one of the fundamental problems of the region from economical point of view is that inefficiency of the small agricultural enterprises. The agricultural production performed in the region is not connected to a widespread market. Thus, the products are marketed through personal relations. In the same time, another problem of small agricultural enterprises is that the profit and the rent of the acquire product in the small agricultural areas are not carried out by the enterprise owner. Therefore, self-sustaining production is dominant. The fundamental thing to be done towards solution of this problem is to join the small land ownership and supply equipment in order to increase the efficiency. Thus, usury structure prevailing in the area in a certain level shall be eliminated. The capital that agricultural producer requires shall be solved with cooperation relations along with the aid of the Municipality. In the same time, dry-land agriculture is dominant in the region. Methods which can broaden wet-land and organic agriculture should be developed. Another important problem is the marketing network. The main thing that should be done by the district municipality is to establish an active villager market (bazaar) at the district and to enhance the marketing channels by establishing a relation of this market in a regional and national scale. This method is also valid for animal breeding and beekeeping. Small production units should be discarded and large breeding farms should be established. Application to national and international funds can be made

in order to actualize this. Also, activities which may urge the state can be organized and more funds may be requested.

On the other hand, industry is non-existent in the region. However, marketing of the products of the population can be enabled by creating small handicrafts workshops and marketing areas. Therefore, employment areas to women and unemployed can be created. Policies directed towards development of tourism in the area should be applied. Although current texture of the district does not go long way back in terms of historical and cultural value, there are structures remained from Armenians from 1800s. These structures can be restored and opened to tourism with a participative plan. Also, the area has important natural beauties in terms of geographical features. In this respect, planning of certain rural areas can develop mountain tourism. The study area has a structure suitable for mountain climbing and other nature sports.

Another important feature of the district is its cultural richness. There are many artists from Hozat, especially in music and literature field. Some visits to the district should be made each year, and poetries and stories which are facing extinction should be compiled and became artworks. A cultural and art center can be established in the district, both with the aid of Ministry of Culture and also other financial resources to be created.

Along with all these, the budget of the municipality is being presented to the society in a transparent manner. However, the society should be more effectively informed regarding how the budget should be utilized and the decisions should be made by participation of everyone. Otherwise, presenting only the income and expanses outputs shall not enable society to embrace the municipality and the district. Therefore, participatory economy should be improved in the area.

Another field of suggestion regarding the study area is the political-governance policies. As relation with the political actors and participation processes have been

inspected in the previous chapters, only suggestions regarding this field will be developed in this chapter.

The study area is a region where armed conflicts are occurring between state forces and leftist groups. Therefore, a significant state oppression and supervision is observed even at the policies to be developed regarding various problematic areas in a legal framework. This situation creates a significant negativity for the Municipality. However, certain solutions regarding the problems of the area should be developed, regardless of these negativities, and these suggestions will be presented in this section.

There is a public council work of the municipality. A bylaw and regulations have been prepared as a part of this work. It can be said that the public council work which includes women, youth, old and neighborhood councils have stayed only on paperwork so far. The public council works should aim at that the decisions regarding the problems of the public are given by the public. It should go beyond mundane, routine meetings. In order to do this, meeting times and agenda should be determined by the public. These councils should be perceived as the solution place of even the smallest problems. In order to do this, a problem analysis that these said councils should concentrate should be performed. This analysis shall discuss the basic problems of the women, youth and councils to be established for other fields according to the needs. The municipality and represented political fractions shall distribute the problems pre-determined along with the public as notices to the public prior to meeting of these councils and summon the public to the meeting.

Another important point is the case that these councils to act as a justice body. The problems which could not be resolved at public councils of different fields should be resolved at an upper council to be formed with council representatives, the Mayor, democratic fraction organizations and representatives of leftist policy.

The municipal council meetings should be held publicly. Participation of labour and trade organizations, and people from leftist ideology from University and effective role of them in decision making processes is necessary.

Another suggestion field is the socio-cultural area. According to Marxist understanding social and cultural structure of the society constitutes the social super-structure, and this is determined by production relations and production forces which forms the social infrastructure. This framework is a point of origin both in determination of social and cultural structure of the study are and also in suggestion generation. This structure of the area has been investigated in the previous sections. In this section, basic suggestions regarding the study area will be presented.

As capitalism is still not the dominant production type in the infrastructure, the social super-structure has developed depending on this situation as well. Tribalism and feudal relations, although not as deep as at the Southeast Anatolian Region, have maintained themselves. However, this traditional cultural structure is collapsing due to alevi belief of the region and the revolutionist struggle ongoing for a long time. However social alienation, which comes with capitalist modernity, should not be the alternative of the collapse of this understanding. Therefore, it is necessary for political actors and the Municipality in the area to develop important policies regarding this field.

Production cooperatives to be developed in agriculture and animal breeding fields or small handicrafts should be not only economic units but also units which shall develop collective production and organize solidarity relations. Along with this, solidarity houses for women and cultural centers for youth should be established. A location where art productions are performed and exhibited should also be established. Also, a series of courses on art should be given in this location. The fundamental purpose of these projects which have both economic and also social content should be to rescue women from home and men from coffeehouses, attract them to social production and develop relations of sharing.

Another suggestion field is the urbanism applications. As the macroform of the district is initially investigated, its development direction can be observed as westward. However, the settlement in this area is threatening the productive agricultural fields. On the other hand, people forced to migrate from villages have settled in the area west of the district. Thus, the settlement in this area should be limited.

Families forced to migrate from villages have started to live at houses of their relatives in the district. They have brought their animal to these houses as well and started to feed them at barns they have constructed adjacent to their houses at the alleys of their neighborhood. Therefore, this situation poses an important negativity regarding the public health of the district. Animal inside the district should be fed at common collective breeding farms at the boundary of the district. Residence problem of the district should be resolved by public cooperatives working collectively, not by TOKİ (Housing Development Administration of Turkey). This practice should be tried for poor people. Traditional residence texture of the district should be observed during construction of houses. A structure and settlement model which has few stories, which have a garden and which is not isolated from its surroundings should be developed.

The Military Base occupying a significant space at west and south of the district should be removed from district boundaries and should be used for urban needs with development plan alterations. Along with this, public should be included in project and application process of this and all similar applications.

REFERANCES

Boratav, K. (2004). Tarımsal Yapılar ve Kapitalizm. Ankara: İmge Kitapevi

Boratav, K. (2011). Türkiye İktisat Tarihi. Ankara: İmge Kitapevi.

Clarke, S. (2003). Devlet Tartışmaları. Praksis, 9.

Çetin, M. (2010). Yas Kitabı. İstanbul: 2010

Eaton, J. (1997). Ekonomi Politik. Ankara: Bilim ve Sosyalizm Yayınları.

Engels, F. (2002). Ailenin Özel Mülkiyetin ve Devletin Kökeni. Ankara: Sol Yayınları.

Engels, F. (2003). Anti-Dühring. Ankara: Sol Yayınları.

Engels, F. (2003). Devlet ve İhtilal. Ankara: Bilim ve Sosyalizm Yayınları.

Ersoy, M. & Şengül, H. T. (2002). Yerel Yönetimlerin Yeniden Yapılandırılması. Ankara: Department of Urban Policy Planning and Local Governments, Middle East Technical University

Erten, E. (1999). Nasıl Bir Yerel Yönetim. İstanbul: Anahtar Kitaplar Yayınevi

Güler, B. A. (2006). Yerel Yönetimler. Ankara: İmge Yayınevi.

Keleş, R. (1993). Kentleşme Politikası. Ankara: İmge Kitabevi.

Keleş, R. (2009). Yerinden Yönetim ve Siyaset. İstanbul: Cem yayınevi

Mao, Z. (2000). Seçme Eserler. İstanbul: Kaynak Yayınları.

Marks, K. & Engels, F. (1998). Komünist Partisi Manifestosu. Ankara: İnter Yayınları.

Marks, K. & Engels, F. (2003). Siyasi Yazılar. İstanbul: Hil Yayınları

Noviçev, A .D. (1979). Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nun Yarı Sömürgeleştirilmesi. Ankara: Onur Yayınları.

Owens, E. J. (2000). Yunan ve Roma Dünyasında Kent. İstanbul: Homeros

Özbudun, S. (2009). Meksika: EZLN, Caracoles ve Yerel Yönetimler, Kaldıraç, 103.

Özbudun, S. (2011). Latin Amerika'dan Özerklik Deneyimleri, Yeni Harman, 151.

Pickvance, C. (1995). Marxist Theories of Urban Politics in Theories of Urban Politics. SAGE.

Pirene, H. (2003). Ortaçağ Kentleri. İstanbul: İletişim.

Saner, M. (2004). Bir Yerel Yönetim Efsanesi: Jaime Lerner, TMMOB Mimarlar Odası Ankara Bülten, 19.

Saunders, P. (1979). Urban Politics: A Sociological Interpretation. London: Huchhinson.

Stalin, J. V. (1997). Leninizmin Sorunları. Ankara: İnter Yayınları.

Sütlüoğlu, İ. (1999). Mahalli İdareler ve Yeniden Yapılanma Yüksek Lisans Tezi. Trabzon: Karadeniz Teknik Üniversitesi.

Şener, E. H. (2005). Kamu Yönetiminde Katılım ve Çoğulculuk. Cilt:38, Sayı:4, Ankara: Amme İdaresi.

Şengül, H. T. (2001). Kentsel Çelişki ve Siyaset: Kapitalist Kentleşme Süreçleri Üzerine Yazılar. İstanbul: Demokrasi Kitaplığı.

Tarso, G. & U, Souza. (1999). Porto Allegre: Özgün Bir Belediyecilik Deneyimi. İstanbul: Demokrasi Kitaplığı.

Waste, R.(1989). The Ecology of City Policymaking. New York: Oxford University Press.

Internet References

Karaca, E. (2011, August 15). Dikili'nin "Don Kişot"u: Belediye Başkanı Osman Özgüven. Retrieved from http://www.aktuela.com/manset/dikilinin-don-kisotu-belediye-baskani-osman-ozguven-6122.html.

Gürsel, D. (2011, December 14). Fatsa Bir Yol Deneyimi. Retrieved from http://www.yenidendevrim.org/genel/bizden_detay.php?kod=2761&tipi=23.

Solun Doğusu. (2011, December 12). Nepal'de Komünistler Özerk Eyaletler İlan Etti. Retrieved from http://www.solundogusu.net/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=422&Itemid=33

Unutturulamayanlar "Paris Komünü ve Fatsa". (2011, May 11). Retrieved from http://www.ozgurlukdergisi.org/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=243&Itemid=31

Akyıldırım, V. (2011, May 24). 1871 Paris Komünü: Sıradan insanların iktidarı. Retrieved from http://www.marksist.org/teori/127-asagidan-sosyalizm/3255-1871-paris-komunu-siradan-insanlarin-iktidari.

Porto Alegre Belediyesi Katılımcı Bütçe Uygulaması. (2011, May 12). Retrieved from www.sol-hareket.org.

Dikili Belediyesi kamusal hizmette diretiyor. (2011, June 22). Retrieved from http://www.sendika.org/yazi.php?yazi_no=35973.

Mazgirt Belediyesi Halk Toplantısı Yaptı. (2011, June 23). Retrieved from http://www.demokratikhaklarfederasyonu.org/temmuz-2011/mazgirt-belediyesi-halk-toplantisi-yapti.html.

Hozat Belediyesi Halkla Birlikte Çalışmalarını Sürdürüyor. (2011, May 16). Retrieved from http://www.demokratikhaklarfederasyonu.org/mayis-2011/hozat-belediyesi-halkla-birlikte-calismalarini-surduruyor.html.

Demokratik özerklik ve Hukuk. (2011, July 6). Retrieved from www.ozgur-gundem.com.

Demokratik Özerklik İlanı, Merkeziyetçi Yapıya Tepkidir. (2011, July 23). Retrieved from http://bianet.org/bianet/siyaset/130382-ergil-demokratik-ozerklik-ilani-merkeziyetci-yapiya-tepkidir.

Sosyalistlerin Belediye Deneyimleri. (2011, July 19). Retrieved from (www.birgün.net).