

FROM PRECARIOUS EMPLOYMENT TO PRECARIOUS LIFE:
THE CASE OF NON-APPOINTED TEACHERS IN TURKEY

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO
THE GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
OF
MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY

BY

SEHER SAĐIROĐLU

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF SCIENCE
IN
THE DEPARTMENT OF POLITICAL SCIENCE AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

FEBRUARY 2013

Approval of the Graduate School of Social Sciences

Prof. Dr. Meliha Altunışık
Director

I certify that this thesis satisfies all the requirements as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science.

Prof. Dr. Raşit Kaya
Head of Department

This is to certify that we have read this thesis and that in our opinion it is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science.

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Necmi Erdoğan
Supervisor

Examining Committee Members

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Necmi Erdoğan (METU, PADM) _____

Prof. Dr. Gamze Yücesan Özdemir (ANKARA UNI, JRN) _____

Assist. Prof. Dr. Mustafa K. Bayırbağ (METU, PADM) _____

I hereby declare that all information in this document has been obtained and presented in accordance with academic rules and ethical conduct. I also declare that, as required by these rules and conduct, I have fully cited and referenced all material and results that are not original to this work.

Name, Last name: SEHER SAĞIROĞLU

Signature:

ABSTRACT

FROM PRECARIOUS EMPLOYMENT TO PRECARIOUS LIFE: THE CASE OF NON-APPOINTED TEACHERS IN TURKEY

Sađirođlu, Seher

MS., Department of Political Science and Public Administration

Supervisor: Assoc. Prof. Dr. Necmi Erdođan

February 2013, 191 pages

The debates on precarious employment and precarization of labor since the 1970s are significant to understand the neo-liberal transformation of labor market and socio-cultural analysis of the new forms of production relations. This study aims to contribute to the academic debates on the precarization and precarious employment by exploring the working and life conditions of non-appointed teachers in Turkey. Nowadays, the non-appointed teachers have faced with the precarious working conditions both in public and private education sectors. As a result of the privatization of education services and the changes in the public employment of teachers, the non-appointed teachers have to live with the new forms of working life such as short-term, temporary, and insecure. Since these precarious conditions are not merely confined within their work places, this study aims to demonstrate that the feelings of precariousness have penetrated into every sphere of social life. In Turkish labor market, the precarious working conditions have brought about not only the precarious life experiences for the non-appointed teachers; but also their daily lives have discontinuously redefined by risks, anxieties and uncertainties.

Keywords: Precarious Employment, Precarization of Labor, Precarious Culture, Non-Appointed Teachers.

ÖZ

GÜVENCESİZ ÇALIŞMADAN GÜVENCESİZ YAŞAM ŞARTLARINA: TÜRKİYE’DE ATAMASI YAPILMAYAN ÖĞRETMENLER ÖRNEĞİ

Sağiroğlu, Seher

Yüksek Lisans, Siyaset Bilimi ve Kamu Yönetimi Bölümü

Tez Yöneticisi : Assoc. Prof. Dr. Necmi Erdoğan

Şubat 2013, 191 sayfa

1970’lerden beri süregelen güvencesiz çalışma ve emeğin güvencesizleşmesi tartışmaları emek piyasasının neoliberal dönüşümünü anlamak ve yeni üretim ilişkilerinin sosyo-kültürel analizini yapmak için önemlidir. Bu çalışma Türkiye’de ataması yapılmayan öğretmenlerin çalışma ve yaşam koşullarını araştırarak güvencesizleşme ve güvencesiz çalışma tartışmalarına katkıda bulunmayı amaçlamaktadır. Günümüzde ataması yapılmayan öğretmenler hem özel hem de kamusal eğitim sektöründe güvencesiz çalışma koşulları ile karşı karşıya kalmaktadır. Eğitim hizmetlerinin özelleştirilmesinin ve öğretmenlerin kamu istihdamındaki değişikliklerin sonucu olarak, ataması yapılmayan öğretmenler çalışma yaşamının kısa süreli, geçici ve güvensiz yeni biçimleri ile yaşamak zorundalar. Güvencesizlik sadece işyerlerine özgü bir olgu olmadığı için, bu çalışma güvencesizlik hissiyatının sosyal hayatın bütün alanlarına sirayet ettiğini göstermeyi amaçlamaktadır. Türkiye’deki emek piyasasında güvencesiz çalışma koşulları ataması yapılmayan öğretmenler için yalnızca güvencesiz hayat deneyimlerine yol açmıyor, aynı zamanda onların gündelik hayatlarının sürekli olarak riskler, endişeler ve belirsizliklerle yeniden tanımlanmasına neden oluyor.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Güvencesiz İstihdam, Emeğin Güvencesizleşmesi, Güvencesizlik Kültürü, Ataması Yapılmayan Öğretmenler

*To my mother and my brothers,
And to non-appointed teachers whose lives are precarized.*

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This study has led me to think about on my own life experiences and feelings that are affected by the flexible culture of our times. Therefore, understanding experiences and emotions of the interviewees is the most valuable experience that I have ever had in my academic efforts. Firstly, I would like to thank my interviewees who accepted my request of interviewing and sincerely shared their feelings and experiences during the interviews despite their lack of time. This thesis cannot be meaningful without their valuable sharings and experiences which enable me to draw a general picture of precarious culture.

I would really like to thank my advisor, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Necmi Erdoğan who has shown his endless patience especially when I tried to decide the scope of the field research. I feel grateful for having the experience of working with him and for everything I have learned from him not only during this study, but also during his courses. I am also grateful to my examining committee members, Prof. Dr. Gamze Yücesan Özdemir and Assist. Prof. Dr. Mustafa Kemal Bayırbağ, for their precious comments and friendly attitudes.

I would like to express my gratitude to a group of very special friends. I would like to thank Semih Sapmaz and Öznur Erdemli for their constant support, friendship and hours of conversations. I have had pleasure of working with them and I feel very lucky that I have had lots of unforgettable memories during these hours. Sedef Süner, Serkan Atamer, and Deniz Mengüllüoğlu have always been with me in METU and helped me whenever I needed them. Special thanks to Mühdan Sağlam for accompanying me during the writing process of this thesis in the library and providing me cheerful breaks with the hundred cups of coffee. I also want to thank Cemil Atik for the funny and inspirational times that we spent together in order to relax by giving small breaks during the writing process too. I am also very thankful to Gökçe Özge Tümkan, Engin Süne and Pelin Yılmaz not only for having special places in my life, but also for making a burdensome work by editing the drafts of this thesis without any complaints.

I am also deeply grateful for having iğdem Usta as my best friend. I cannot enough thank for her support, care and devotion since the the early days of our friendship. She did not only open her home or her heart, but also she provided me peaceful “table” to talk when I was down or tired. I know that our friendship will last for a lifetime.

It would not have been possible for me to write this thesis without Berkay Ayhan’s love, care and encouragement. He was living one of the distant parts of the world, but actually I always found him next to me whenever I needed him. He not only showed his great patience and devotion to me in my harder and sensitive times, he also provided really valuable comments and contributions to convey my ideas properly. Actually, I do not know whether any word is able to express my gratitude to him.

Lastly, I owe my deepest gratitude to my family for their indispensable and endless support. I am forever indebted to my mother Kevkep Sađırođlu, my brothers Erhan Sađırođlu and Okan Sađırođlu who taught me humility, how to value the lives, thoughts and expressions of others, how to care for and understand. I will always be amazed from their endless patience and toleration for everything.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PLAGIARISM.....	iii
ABSTRACT.....	iv
ÖZ.....	v
DEDICATION.....	vi
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	vii
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	ix
LIST OF TABLES.....	xi
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....	xii
CHAPTER	
1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
2. FROM PRECARIOUS WORK TO PRECARIOUS LIFE.....	10
2.1 The Historical Framework of Precarization of Labor.....	11
2.1.1 The Conditions of the Labour Market in the Fordist Era.....	11
2.1.2 Structural Transformation of the Labour Market in the Post-Fordist Era.....	12
2.1.3 Conceptual and Theoretical Understanding of “Precarization” and “Precarious Employment”.....	16
2.1.4 Historical Analysis of the Turkish Economy.....	22
2.1.5 The “Precarization” of the Labour Process and the “Precarious Employment” in Turkey.....	25
2.2 The Hegemony of the New Capitalist Culture.....	30
2.2.1 The Character under the New Capitalist Culture.....	33
2.2.2 The Differentiated Feelings and Experiences of Precariousness.....	37
2.2.3 Some Notes on Precarity in Turkey.....	40
3. TEACHER TRAINING PROCESS AND “PRECARIOUS” WORKING LIFE OF THE NON-APPOINTED TEACHERS.....	42
3.1 The General Structure of Turkish Education System.....	43

3.2	The Privatization of Turkish Education System	48
3.3	University Entrance Exams and University Preferences	53
3.4	Teachers' Training System	57
3.4.1	The Differences between Faculty of Education and Faculty of Arts and Sciences in Teaching Profession.....	59
3.4.2	The Critiques towards Public Personnel Examination System and the Conditions of the Appointment	63
3.5	The Forms of Employment and Working Conditions of the Non-Appointed Teachers	71
3.5.1	The Forms of Employment in the Public Sector and Working Conditions of Paid Teachers	72
3.5.2	The Working Conditions of Teachers in the Private Education Centers	81
4.	PRECARIOUS LIFE OF THE NON-APPOINTED TEACHERS.....	93
4.1	The Meaning of Teaching as a Profession	94
4.2	The Dissolution of Occupational Belonging.....	97
4.3	The Character under the Precarious Working Conditions	99
4.4	The Socio-Cultural Hierarchies Existing among the Non-Appointed Teachers	107
4.5	Political Consciousness of the Non-Appointed Teachers	117
4.6	Who is the Responsible for the Precarization of Teachers' Labor?.....	119
4.7	The Views towards Existing Movements or Struggles.....	124
4.8	The Antinomies of Subjects under the New Capitalist Culture	130
5.	CONCLUSIONS.....	138
	REFERENCES.....	146
	APPENDICES	
A.	SAMPLE INTERVIEW.....	161
B.	LIST OF QUESTIONS	186
C.	LIST OF INTERVIEWEES.....	189
C.	TEZ FOTOKOPİSİ İZİN FORMU	191

LIST OF TABLES

TABLES

Table 1 Number of Applicants and Appointments	64
Table 2 Appointment by Teaching Branches.....	65

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ILO	International Labour Organization
DİSK	Devrimci İşçi Sendikaları Konfederasyonu (Confederation of Progressive Trade Unions)
GATS	General Agreement on Trade in Services
LYS	Lisans Yerleştirme Sınavı (Placement Exam for Undergraduate Studies)
MONE	Ministry of National Education
MÜSİAD	Müstakil Sanayici ve İşadamları Derneği (Independent Industrialist and Businessmen's Association)
OKS	Orta Öğretime Geçiş Sınavı (Entrance Exam to Secondary Education Schools)
ÖSYM	Ölçme, Seçme ve Yerleştirme Merkezi
SBS	Seviye Belirleme Sınavı (Placement Tests in Primary Education Schools conducted for 6 th , 7 th and 8 th Grade)
PEC	Private Education Centers
PPSE	Public Personnel Selection Examination
TES	Turkish Education System
TİSK	Türkiye İşverenleri Sendikaları Konfederasyonu (Turkish Confederation of Employer Associations)
TÜİK	Türkiye İstatistik Kurumu (Turkish Statistical Institute)
TÜSİAD	Türkiye Sanayici ve İşadamları Derneği Turkish Industry and Business Association)
YGS	Yükseköğretime Geçiş Sınavı (Entrance Exam to Higher Education)
YÖK	Yükseköğretim Kurulu (The Council of Higher Education)

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

“I think that those who want to be a teacher are similar to the pigeons waiting in front of the mosque in Eminönü. They are just waiting for someone to throw birdseeds to them. Thank god, my children have not become civil servants”¹. These words belong to Ömer Dinçer, who was the former Minister of National Education of Turkey. It is clearly seen that the Minister associates the growing rate of unemployment of teachers with individual incapability or failure. Also this statement shows the attitudes of the government² towards the non-appointed teachers³ as well as the public servants in general in Turkey. In the last decade, the news about the non-appointed teachers and public statements of the representatives of the current government in the media has become an indicator of the disagreement between non-appointed teachers and government. The attitude of Ministry of National Education, insisting that the state is not capable of employing every graduate in public institutions⁴ pit government against non-appointed teachers. During the election

¹ “Ben öğretmen olmak isteyenleri, Eminönü’ndeki caminin önünde bekleyen güvercinlere benzetiyorum. Bekliyorlar ki biri önlerine yem atsın. Allahtan çocuklarım memur olmadılar”. Retrieved January 10, 2013 from: <http://www.taraf.com.tr/haber/guvercin-gibi-yem-bekliyorlar.htm>

² The concrete example of the discourse of government which criticizes public employment can be seen in several examples. In one of the speech, Prime Minister criticizes teachers for working lesser hours and getting higher incomes. <http://siyaset.milliyet.com.tr/ogretmenler-basbakan-erdogan-dan-ozur-bekliyor/siyaset/siyasetdetay/26.05.2012/1545436/default.htm>

³ The term of “non-appointed teachers” refers teachers who are eliminated by Public Personnel Selection Examination and are not appointed to public schools by The Ministry of National Education. These people are excluded from the rights and benefits reserved for teachers who are appointed and working as public servants in state schools. Two different definitions are used for entitlement of these teachers. Firstly, they are named as “ teachers who can not be appointed”. While this title has mostly used in mainstream media, their problems are presented as their individual failure and incapability. I prefer to use the term “non-appointed” teachers to highlight the structural reasons of this social problem. Since the signification struggles over the social codes and the meanings are repercussions of the social antagonisms in society, the seeds of resistance and struggle are began to be raised through the war of meaning.

⁴ Retrieved 10.01.2013 from: <http://www.radikal.com.tr/Radikal.aspx?aType=RadikalDetayV3&ArticleID=1102044&CategoryID=78>

campaigns in 2002, the current government had promised non-appointed teachers to provide solution to their problems and to appoint them without personnel exam⁵. However, as early as 2010, Prime Minister started to blame non-appointed teachers because of the fact that they cannot be appointed⁶. The changes in the attitudes of the government towards the non-appointed teachers can also be seen in the latest statements of Prime Minister. When a non-appointed teacher said to him ‘no vote for you if there is no appointment’, he responded by saying “keep your vote to yourself”.⁷

Regarding the political scene presented above, today huge number of novice teachers are excluded from the rights and the benefits of the public employment and are forced to work under the precarious working conditions. This study aims to understand experiences and feelings of the non-appointed teachers in relation to their precarious working life and daily life. By linking the theoretical insights of Richard Sennett, Pierre Bourdieu and Antonio Gramsci with the interpretations and thoughts of interviewees arising from the fieldwork; this study develops three main arguments. First of all, this study asserts that the self-perceptions and the self-images of the non-appointed teachers are corroded by the insecure and temporary working relations. It is important to bear in mind that those teachers, whose characters are corroded, are not passive subjects who accept every conditions and rules imposed upon them within the production processes, but they are also active agents who reproduce and transform the production relations consciously or unconsciously. /in other words, they become active part of the reproduction of the relations in labor processes. Secondly, it may be claimed that the precariousness has deepened social and cultural hierarchies between people who have been obliged to work under

⁵ Before general election 2002, Prime Minister, Recep Tayyip Erdoğan, promised to appoint all non-appointed teachers and solve their problems if they would come to power.
<http://www.ajanskamu.com/haber/gazinatepte-ogretmeni-azarlayan-erdogan2002de-gaziantep-te-nedemisti-6613.html>

⁶ The Prime Minister of Turkey accused a group of non-appointed teachers who visit TEKEL workers in order to show their support. In his public speech, the Prime Minister criticized non-appointed teachers they can not be successful in Public Personnel Exam.
<http://www.ensonhaber.com/gundem/253856/ogretmenler-olum-orucu-tutacak.html>

⁷ In opening ceremony of huge factory in Gaziantep, on the one hand the Prime Minister was stating that recent industrial developments would increase the rate of employment; on the other hand one of non-appointed teachers was taken into custody because he loudly said that he wanted to be appointed.
<http://www.hurriyet.com.tr/gundem/22401866.asp>

precarious conditions and people who have worked under relatively secured working conditions. This study aims to explore to what extent the social and cultural hierarchies exempt from the class positions of non-appointed teachers. Lastly, thesis will reveal how the atomized and individualized culture of new capitalism has dispersed, fragmented and dismantled the political struggles of teachers.

Since the end of the 1970s, neoliberal economic policies have brought about a set of changes in a variety of spheres of life. Privatization and new public personnel management have resulted in a significant/sharp decrease in employment in the public sector, and the rate of unemployment has reached to serious levels. On the other hand, post- Fordist production relations and the increases in the forms of employment have created flexible, insecure and temporary working conditions for workers. With the expansion of flexible working arrangements, labor market has become fully precarized.

Teaching profession used to be seen as guaranteed profession providing long-life job security; however the social effects of precarious employment have recently been visible in the conditions of non-appointed teachers, who are deprived of permanent jobs security, considerably higher wages and social rights. A new generation of teachers has to be confronted not only with the threat of unemployment but also with the precarious working conditions in Turkey caused by the neo-liberal labor policies. In consequence of the increase in the number of university graduates and the expansion of private education sector, teachers have been forced to work under insecure and flexible working relations both in public and private sector; or they have been entirely excluded from the labor market as a teacher. In comparison to a few decades ago, teaching profession has not been characterized with the employment security provided by state any more.

Recently, it is claimed that there are over 300.000 non-appointed teachers who have been waiting to be appointed⁸. However, the actual number is much higher than the statistics of Ministry of National Education. There is also a great majority of teachers who are working in other sectors due to the fact that they entirely lost their hopes to be appointed as a teacher. On the one hand the non-appointed teachers have

⁸ “The Problems of Non-appointed Teachers are going to be solved”. Retrieved from: <http://www.kpsrehber.com/kpsshaber-600-atama-bekleyen-ogretmen-sorunu-cozuluyor-html>

to make their living from deskilled jobs, on the other hand the effects of unemployment make them more vulnerable to psychological problems.

Within this context, interviews conducted with non-appointed teachers in 2010⁹ shows that a great number of non-appointed teachers make their living from deskilled jobs varying from being waiter to working in the construction sector; from being plumber to selling something in the streets (Yıldırım, Kansu, and Akçasoy, 2010). The psychological problems of non-appointed teachers have become so unbearable that in the last five years over thirty teachers committed suicide¹⁰. Most commonly, financial difficulties that they had and psychological breakdowns stemming from being non-appointed led them to end their lives.¹¹

Consequently, these examples apparently reveal to what extent the non-appointed teachers have to face with such serious problems caused by both insecure and uncertain working conditions and unemployment. As claimed by Bora (2011), the conditions, in which precariousness is seen as a structural component of “work”, have become dominant. It should be noted that new production relations that have brought about new mindsets can not be analyzed independently from specific mode of living or feelings. The precarious landscape of neo-liberal labor market have various effects upon the individuals’ feelings, emotions and experiences. According to Sennett who explores the disorienting effects of on the self of new capitalism, flexibilities and uncertainties of new capitalism have corroded the personal characters. This process is likely to continue causing more traumatic social problems, there is an urgent need to understand how workers are affected from precarious employment conditions in Turkey.

Although there are a number of studies concerning precarious employment and cultural analysis of precarious working relations in Turkey, it has to be noted that the literature dealing with precarious employment or precarization of labor have

⁹ These interviews were conducted with non-appointed teachers and their mothers. Deniz Yıldırım, İlker Akçasoy and Kansu Yıldırım conducted these interviews during and after one of the demonstration organized by non-appointed teachers in Ankara.

¹⁰ “Teachers on the verge of suicide”. Retrieved from: <http://www.sendika.org/2012/04/intiharin-esigindeki-ogretmenler-mehves-evin-milliyet/>

¹¹ It has to be noted that socio-economic conditions, emotional and psychological attributions of teachers who committed suicide deserve to be evaluated as a separate topic. The underlying reasons of suicide in relation with the experiences of unemployment and financial difficulties are serious problems that are shared by all non-appointed teachers.

began to increase after collective resistance of workers of TEKEL in 2010.¹² Within this context, the writings edited by Bulut (2010) and Öztepe (2012) are significant in terms of providing the analysis of precarious employment in Turkey. With the inspiring resistance of TEKEL workers, two books attempted to formulate changing conditions of class formation and class struggle on the grounds of precariousness and precarization of labor. While the first essay collection edited by Bulut (2010) particularly focused on changing dynamics of working class movements and new forms of resistance in Turkey, the collection edited by Öztepe (2012) aimed to shed light on the forms of precarious employment based on a critical analysis of literature which define precariat as a new class. With the inspiring effects of TEKEL movements these two studies approached to precarious working relations as a potential common base for the workers to unite. Taking the contributions of these two studies as a major reference point to itself, this thesis aims to show how different groups of people experience precariousness in different ways in their daily lives, and to question which individual and social effects could bring those people to act together.

Other group of studies related with the scope of this study is concentrated upon working classes. Even though there is a voluminous literature about working class, there are a limited number of studies dealing with the cultural and sociological analysis of working classes. Özüğurlu (2005) attempted to provide sociological analysis of working class formation and aimed to identify hidden ways of resistance of workers. Following this study, Geniş (2006) wrote about the class experiences and isolated conditions of workers in small scale industry, while Durak (2012) recently contributed this literature by analyzing the effects of Islam upon the employment relations in one of the most religious and conservative cities, Konya.

A more recent work that inspired me to write this thesis makes the cultural analysis of white collar unemployment in relation to precarious nature of jobs and increasing rates of unemployment for skilled labor power (Bora, Bora, Üstün and Erdoğan, 2011). This work is based on emotions, psychologies, experiences and

¹² TEKEL resistance is epoch-making political labor movement which paves the way of unified class struggles (Özüğurlu, 2010, 49). Workers of TEKEL (a privatized public enterprise producing cigarettes, tobacco, alcohol and spirits) took the main streets of Ankara in order to protest new working contract –known as 4C- that was imposed to them. The 4C contracts with significant loss of pay and social rights were formulated by government as transient solution to provide part-time employment for displaced workers after privatization of state-owned industries (Yeldan, 2010).

daily practices of unemployed white collar workers. We can also identify the collaborative study of Ayşe Buğra (2010) as relevant literature specifically dealing with precarious working conditions in Turkey. This study aims to provide working landscape of Turkish labour market by analyzing the working conditions of various segments of society varying from farming workers to office workers, from employees in health services to employees in cinema sector. In particular, the article of Ertürk in this study is especially important in understanding the historical analysis of changes in the meanings of teaching profession.

This study aims to understand the precarious life experiences of non-appointed teachers who are working under precarious working conditions. Within the broader context of precarization of whole labor market; the field research tries to answer the question how the precarious working conditions affect social life of non-appointed teachers in particular. Since the precarious conditions are not merely confined within the ingwork places, it aims to demonstrate that the feelings of precariousness penetrate into every sphere of social life. In order to do this, firstly working relations of non-appointed teachers including the strategies of subsistence and the relations with their colleagues are going to be understood. In doing so, the precarious conditions in public and private sector are going to be compared. Secondly, the implications of precariousness in daily life are going to be analyzed in relation to occupational identity, corrosion of characters, future expectations and world outlooks. Also, the class experiences of non-appointed teachers will be taken into account in the analysis of precarious life. Emotional and psychological responses to the existing differences and separations among non-appointed teachers cannot be understood independently from existing class relations. As long as class relations are taken “as men and women live their productive relations and experience their determinate situations, within ‘*the ensemble of the social relations*’, with their inherited culture and expectations, and as they handle these experiences in cultural ways” (Thompson, 1978, p.150), social and cultural hierarchies have become manifestation of class hierarchies – including hierarchies arising from indices occupation, gender, age, ethnicity and so on.

I aim to provide a cultural analysis of precarious employment of non-appointed teachers. It is important to note that I will try to provide a combined theoretical framework provided by both labor studies and cultural studies. While the

characteristics of new labor relations are held as precarious working relations – part-time, flexi-time, lack of social benefits and rights -, the experiences, perceptions and responses of non-appointed teachers relating to their precarious works are going to be formulated as precarious life. Through this analysis, this study aims to contribute to the studies on how non-appointed teachers experience new reality of work, named as precariousness. The main questions that are going to be dealt with in this study can be organized as the following: Which working conditions create feelings of precariousness, and how precarious employment influence non-appointed teachers' perceptions, apprehensions or preferences? For which reasons are the experiences and feelings of non- appointed teachers are differentiated? What is the relationship between class positions and the degree of precariousness?

This study is based on a fieldwork consisting of semi-structured in-depth interviews with 22 non-appointed teachers living and working in Ankara. The interviews were held between January and July of 2012. Even though there are many people working in different sectors, the interviews were made only with non-appointed teachers in private education centers (PECs hereafter), and those working in public schools as paid teachers. Since paid teachers constitute the largest part of flexible forms of employment in public schools, working under the most-disadvantageous conditions; I believe that their life experiences accurately present the personal and social consequences of precariousness. In a similar vein, teachers working in the private education sector also constitute the largest part of employment in private education sector. The intensifying working hours, the minimum wages and absence of social guarantees make them more disadvantageous than teachers working in private schools or colleges.

The interviewees were selected randomly among non-appointed teachers living and working in Ankara. The number of paid teachers and teachers working in PECs; the number of male and female teachers were tried to be balanced. In addition to this, diversity in terms of their ethnicity, political and religious views and educational backgrounds were tried to be maintained. Interviews with teachers were conducted individually and lasted around half an hour. The interviews were held in different places where I could tape-record. Except one of them, all interviewees accepted to make interview with tape-recording. In order to understand the precarious character of their jobs, I asked several questions about their working

conditions including the amount of wages, social security premiums, working hours, control mechanisms and working contracts. I also asked questions about interviewees' life stories including their childhood, the cities they grew up, their educational backgrounds, university periods, friends, leisure time activities and different working experiences. Furthermore, the views and thoughts about politics and their political stances were tried to be understood by questioning contemporary political debates in Turkey.

There were some advantages and limitations while I was undertaking the field study. The first limitation was related with time. Since the non-appointed teachers do not have enough leisure time due to several reasons; it was very difficult for me to arrange the time of the interviews. In order to make interview with some of the paid teachers, I had to go to the schools where they work. The interviews made in the school were also difficult because some interviewees answered my questions about school administration and politics reluctantly since they did not feel comfortable. On the other hand, I had chance to observe the relations of paid teachers with their colleagues and students in their own working place. Teachers' room in those schools allowed me to observe attitudes and hear thoughts of tenured teachers about the conditions of paid teachers. Time was also problematic for teachers working in private education centers because of intense working hours. Since those teachers were allowed only one day a week, I had to make an appointment which was suitable for them. Due to not only the time limitation of my interviewees but also my own time limitation as a precarious worker, who also had to arrange her time schedule, the field study took much longer time than I expected.

The second limitation was the size of the study's sample. A larger sample would better reflect the comparative analysis of working and life conditions of non-appointed teachers. Although attention was paid to select diverse groups of non-appointed teachers; the sample remained limited with one city, Ankara. If there was not time limitation, this study could have contained a comparative analysis of working and life conditions of teachers living and working in small cities or urban areas. Because geographical inequalities are significant variables to determine opportunities, chances and alternatives, this field study had to consider all variables existing in Ankara. Different geographical locations where the interviewees have grown up have effects on determination of social and cultural capital. This issue was

considered at the selection of interviewee. Nevertheless, this study does not have a claim of representability. Rather, it aims to understand common tendencies and experiences in precarious working relations for non-appointed teachers.

In Chapter 2, in order to analyze interviews theoretically, I will try to provide theoretical framework comprising both historical development of precarious employment and cultural analysis of precarious life. While the first part provides the political economy of labor market relations in two different periods namely the Fordist and post-Fordist eras, the second part deals with cultural theories which specifically explain hegemony of new capitalist culture and ideological reproduction of precariousness.

Chapter 3 examines the training processes and precarious working relations of non-appointed teachers. After giving general information about Turkish education system and privatization policies imposed on education services, exam system and university structure that determine teachers' preferences are also mentioned. In doing so, the views and thoughts of interviewees are referred in order to show how they evaluate Turkish education system and to what extent they relate their conditions to their educational backgrounds. The last part of this study is composed of working conditions of paid teachers in public schools and those in PECs. The working conditions are comparatively analyzed in terms of written rules and factual experiences of teachers. By doing this, it is aimed to show how incompatible the factual data is from the legal framework that regulates working conditions both in the public and the private sector.

Chapter 4 is dedicated to cultural and ideological analysis of the teachers' experiences, feelings and emotions related to their jobs. These narratives reflect the social meanings of teaching profession and occupational belongingness; the self-image and self-perceptions of non-appointed teachers under precarious working relations; the socio-cultural hierarchies among teachers in relation to class hierarchies; political consciousness of non-appointed teachers and the views towards politics in general and political movements in particular.

CHAPTER II

FROM PRECARIOUS WORK TO PRECARIOUS LIFE

This chapter is composed of two main parts. In the first part, the political and economic developments associated with the labor market are historically explained with an emphasis on the world-wide macro-economic developments. The chapter begins with an analysis of the general transformations in the labor regimes that focus broadly on the transition period from Fordism to Post-Fordism including local and global dynamics. Role of the states in the accumulation strategies and in the regulation of labor market; general tendencies of the Fordist and post-Fordist production relations and their impacts upon labor force are also a concern of this part of the study. The literature about “precarization of labor” and “precarious employment”, by concentrating on the flexible employment regime, is also examined. Moreover, the historical analysis of the Turkish labor market that has transformed parallelly to the world-wide developments is provided. At the end of this part, how precarious labor regimes become dominant in the working patterns and which specific rules and regulations prepared the legitimate grounds of precarious employment are discussed. The second part aims to provide the theoretical and conceptual frameworks which explain interdependency between relations of production and culture. In order to analyze how production relations have led to changes in social and cultural life, firstly the effects of new capitalism upon personal characters are going to be evaluated. In addition to this, social and cultural differences deepened by precarious working relations are going to be mentioned in relation to different class positions. Lastly, the second part also tries to touch upon the class culture in Turkey.

2.1 THE HISTORICAL FRAMEWORK OF PRECARIZATION OF LABOR

2.1.1 The Conditions of the Labor Markets in the Fordist Era

Fordism, which was a specific form of production dominant in post-war era, was characterized by the Keynesian welfare state. According to the regulationist view¹³, welfare state was assumed to regulate the relations of production that was based on assembly line and was capable of high industrial productivity (Neilson&Rossiter, 2008, p. 54). According to Jessop (2003), general tendencies of Fordism¹⁴ are characterized with a distinctive type of labor process, a stable mode of macroeconomic growth, a mode of economic regulation and a general pattern of social organization (p. 56). The reconciliation between the scales of production and consumption was the distinctive feature of the Keynesian welfare states since the state aims to “adjust effective demand to the supply driven needs of Fordist mass production with its dependence on economies of scale and full utilization of relatively inflexible means of production” (Jessop, 2003, p. 59). The main characteristic associated with the Fordism is the mass production and it does not only result in mass consumption but also led to “reproduction of labor power, new politics of labor control management, and new kind of rationalized, modernist and populist democratic society” (Harvey, 1990, p. 126).

Having considered the implications of Keynesian welfare states on labor power, Jessop claims that Keynesian welfare states aimed to secure full employment in a relatively closed national economy. According to him, these forms are referred as *welfare* regimes since they tried to regulate collective bargaining and provided various legal, political and social rights to political subjects, as citizens of national state¹⁵ (Jessop, 2003, pp. 57-72). Therefore, the Fordist wage relation was

¹³ In order to find more detailed analysis of Fordism in Regulationist School see also: Michel Aglietta (1979) and Boyer (1990).

¹⁴ He specifically talks about the characteristics of Atlantic Fordism that is experienced in highly developed countries namely US, Canada, North-western Europe, Australia and New Zealand (Jessop, 2003, p. 55). In that sense, it has to be noted that we can not talk about Fordism as homogeneous phenomena, since every nation state has unique socio-economic developments, the general tendencies, that are stated above, can be somehow differentiated.

¹⁵ On the contrary to this argument, Harvey argue that only certain sectors of Fordist economy and some nation states could provide the social benefits to its citizens or workers. “Other sectors of high

determined through collective bargaining that was achieved between business, trade unions and state's intervention. It is possible to say that Fordist welfare regimes provided welfare rights to the workers either in the working sphere or in the socio-political sphere by taking them as national-citizens¹⁶.

2.1.2 Structural Transformation of the Labor Markets in the Post-Fordist Era

The 1970s and 1980s are characterized by the economic, political and social crisis of the Fordism. These crises have resulted in an important paradigmatic shift in the economic sphere which is also led to great transformations in social, cultural and political life. Even though there is great body of literature aimed to define or explain these transformations by concentrating on neo-liberalism or globalization, this part is going to be based on both economic and political transformations and their impacts on the working conditions, after 1970s that have affected labor market relations.

Economic transformations have been legitimized on the grounds of high level of social expenditure and costs of labor in the welfare regimes. The huge impacts of two oil shocks in 1970s; global circulation of goods, services and capital; global division of labor in order to decrease the cost of production; and the existence of multinational companies and transnational banks have inevitably undermined the macroeconomic policies of Keynesian welfare regimes such as full employment, economic growth, stable prices or balanced of payments (Jessop, 2003, p. 82). With the changes in the accumulation strategies and mode of regulation, competition state¹⁷ turned to be the dominant form in order to secure economic growth and competitive advantages either in its borders or abroad (Jessop, 2003, p. 96). Contrary to closed national-economy of Fordism, new information and communication technologies paved the ways of international circuit of capital and networked society; therefore, knowledge has come to the fore as a significant "factor of production"

risk production still depended on low wages and weak job security. "And even Fordist sectors could rest upon a non-Fordist base of sub-contracting" and the discontent of excluded people – determined in line with ethnicity, race and gender- resulted in social tensions and movements (1989, pp. 137-138).

¹⁶ In order to understand the direct linkages between welfare policies and citizenship see also: Jorgen Goul Andersen and Jensen (2002).

¹⁷ Jessop explains this process as transition from Keynesian Welfare National State to Schumpeterian Workfare State. For detailed analysis of transformations in capitalist state see: Jessop (2003).

(Jessop, 2003, pp .97-98). Jessop claims that post-Fordism is to be seen as “new configurations of contradictions and dilemmas that have emerged in the wake of the crisis of Fordism” (2003, p. 95).

Similar to the emphasis on continuities by Jessop, Harvey (1989) proposes that as a response to the *rigidity* during Fordism, *flexibility* has turned to be the dominant feature of market since the 1970s. He asserts that the inabilities of Fordism and Keynesianism emerged out of the *rigidity* that was associated with the “long term and large scale fixed capital investments in mass production”, and prevented flexible production which resulted in the stable growth of the invariant consumer markets. After 1970s, a new regime of accumulation, social and political readjustment “coupled with quite different system of political and social regulations (Harvey, 1989, p. 145). In that sense, it was assumed that economic crisis could be overcome by dismantling the Fordist accumulation regime and by the elimination of the social rights systems enhanced by the welfare states. Thus, *rigidity* replaced with *flexibility*- not only in the economic sphere but also in the social and cultural ones.

When we look at the labor market, we see that post-Fordist growth strategies mainly targeted to provide the welfare conditions of workers relatively. As argued by regulationist school, transition to post-Fordism led to “the breaking of collective bargaining, and the stratification of labor force into a restricted upper level of highly skilled workers¹⁸ and a vast lower level of atomized and flexibilized individuals kept on low wages and in precarious jobs” (Rossiter&Neilson, 2008, p. 57). However, there is a need to recall that the miserable working conditions of the immigrants in the developed countries or the presence of lower-paid female labors contrary to highly paid and less easily laid-off male workers¹⁹ have always existed in every form

¹⁸ On the contrary to the emphasis on deskilling process of assembly line in fordist production, development of information technologies and technical innovations, in post-fordist production some sectors have come to the fore as the most privileged work in which managerial, professional and technical competencies taking place. See also: Castells (2005).

¹⁹ For some, Fordist production system has been covered predominantly male breadwinner model. In that understanding Fordist welfare conditions had not guaranteed social rights and benefits for immigrants, womens. As discussed by Harvey, the resultan inequalities produced social movements organized and people who were excluded from privileged work in mass production also were excluded from mass consumption (1989, p. 138).

of production. Harvey (1989), who discusses the impacts of flexible accumulation²⁰ strategies upon labor market, states that:

[T]he labor market has, for example, undergone a radical restructuring. Faced with strong market volatility, heightened competition, and narrowing profit margins, employers have taken advantage of weakened union power and the pools of surplus (unemployed and underemployed) laborers to push for much more flexible work regimes and labor contracts (p. 150).

It was claimed that *rigidity* created some problems in the labor markets, labor allocation and labor costs (Harvey, 1989, p. 145); however, *flexibility* has corresponded to the smooth moderation in production process (i.e. quality and quantity of products), labor process (i.e. working hours, control mechanisms, work places), and organizational structure in comparison to highly disciplined and standardized Fordist production (Belek, 1997, p. 66).

In the post- Fordist labor process, four different types of flexibility can be defined; *external-numerical flexibility*, *internal numerical flexibility*, *functional flexibility* and *financial/ wage flexibility*. According to this classification provided by Atkinson (1984), while the *external numerical flexibility* companies determine the quantity and the quality of labor force according to market requirements, the *internal numerical flexibility* provides the chance of working time flexibility which enable employer to adjust working hours of workers through the ways of part-time work, flexi-time work, flexible working hours and overtime. Moreover, the *functional flexibility* is based upon the transfer of workers to different tasks and activities within the same company. This flexibility has also included outsourcing activities. It is asserted that in order to implement functional flexibility, the companies need high skilled workforce (Türkiye İşçi Sendikaları Konfederasyonu [TÜRK-İŞ], 2000, p. 892). The *financial* or *wage flexibility* means that wage levels are decided individually and determined with respect to changing nature of labor force or market economy (TÜRK-İŞ, 2000, p. 893). Belek (1997) argues that this kind of flexibility leads the wages to move down in the labor-intensive sectors of

²⁰ It rests on flexibility with respect to labor processes, labor markets, products and patterns of consumption (Harvey, 1989, p. 147).

peripheral countries in which cheap labor force is the basic component of economy,²¹ and this expands the subcontractor system or recruitment of illegal workers which, in return, increases the insecurity of the work force (p. 8). On the other hand, the *locational flexibility* (Reily, 2001), which simply incorporates changing the location of work and distancing strategies²² from the work, is used as a flexible model in the work places. All conditions in the work place are aimed to design highly adaptable to the changing needs and requirements of the market economy. This process can be seen as the employers' freedom in which they shape the labor force according to their own interests. Besides the flexible organization of production in working places, labor process has to be analyzed within a broader context that comprehends the production and reproduction of labor and existing power relations in working place.

Besides the scientific and technological changes in the post-Fordist production processes, the theory of labor process has focused upon the technical and social relations that are produced and reproduced within working place and it also aims to explain the debates on skills, control, technology and politics which are already embedded in labor processes (Özdemir&Yücesan-Özdemir, 2008, p.22). As Marx stated, the processes of capitalist production are transformed in accordance with the accumulation of capital; and this transformation manifests itself as continuous changes in the labor processes of each branch of industry and as a redistribution of labor among occupations and industries (as cited in Braverman, 1974, p.8-9). According to Braverman (1974), who provides Marxian analysis of labor processes, white collar workers are deskilled through the division of working tasks into simpler and smaller components in capitalist labor processes. Therefore, capitalists can increase their control over the labor processes and this presents itself in history as *the progressive alienation of the process of production* from the worker (Braverman, 1974, p.40). On the other side, Braverman' study (1974) draws attention to the control of capital upon labor for the maintenance of surplus value in production process (p.54). Nevertheless, it is vital to note that capital has applied different control strategies upon labor in different historical and conjunctural periods

²¹ Onaran (2004) also dwells upon the wage flexibility after 1980s in Turkey. According to her, wage flexibility in Turkey means that they are made flexible downwards (Onaran, 2004, p. 218).

²² For understand the pressure of distancing from work upon workers see also Ansal (1996).

(Özdemir, Yücesan- Özdemir, 2008, 28). In today's capitalism, while the control of labor is realized both inside and outside of factories, the control of labor is also a complex and contradictory process that includes coercion and consent mechanisms²³. (Özdemir, Yücesan- Özdemir, 2008, 39).

Therefore, it is significant to note that the macro economic and political changes which prepared the precarious conditions of work have to be analyzed within the capitalist labor processes. On the one hand, there have been the vital changes in the structure, the organization and the speed of production as a result of technical and technological developments; on the other hand, the skills of labor and the power relations which are central in labor processes have transformed (Özdemir, Yücesan- Özdemir, 2008, p. 21-39). In that respect, the precarization of labor does not only analyzed with working hours, employment benefits and wages, but also precarious labor analysis has to include the debates on skilling, deskilling or re-skilling of labor; and has to touch upon the different control strategies of capitalist production.

2.1.3 Conceptual and Theoretical Understanding of “Precarization” and “Precarious Employment”

There is a considerable body of literature dealing with the changes in the working life and labor regimes under the impacts of flexibilized and transnationalized capitalist production. In academic literature, there is an increase in the proliferation of terms to describe the insecure and uncertain working conditions. The term *precarization* derives from the French term “*precarite*” which was first used by French scholars in order to describe the temporary or seasonal workers (Standing, 2011, p. 9). While literally the term refers to unsure, uncertain and delicate situations; as a political term, *precarization* is mainly understood as a working process which “dismantle and polarise the levels of social rights and standards of living for most of the labor force” and considered “as a form of work below the standards of old Fordist labor relation” (Candeias, 2005). However, this term should

²³ The production of consent in control mechanism was firstly argued by Burawoy (1985). According to him, the control in capitalist working place can not be reduced to antagonistic relations between capital and labor, and direct control of capital upon labor. However, the control mechanisms are now closely associated with the production of consent during the control of labor (Burawoy, 1985, p.158)

not be taken as a mere description of production process since it also includes the process of *double precarization in daily work and daily life* in which basic social services for human existence are deteriorated (Candeias, 2005). On the one hand, it comes up with the “removal of social guarantess of working classes such as health care, housing, paid time off, unemployment insurances” (McCarthy, 2006), on the other hand, it has socio-cultural effects on individuals’ daily life. Therefore, it is obligatory to describe precarization as an integral process covering insecurity and flexibility that have impacts on all aspects of life. Bourdieu, who argues the effects of *precariousness* in relation to job insecurity and causalisation of employment, states that it “is a part of mode of domination of a new kind and based on the creation of a generalized and permanent state of insecurity” (1998, p. 85). It is related to “not only the disappearance of stable jobs but also questions of housing, debt, welfare provision and the availability of time for building affective personal relations” (McCarthy, 2006). Since the precarization is closely related to both work and daily life, the analysis of precarization of labor cannot be confined to the production field; and therefore, there is need to provide a comprehensive analysis of these terms by taking the historical and geographical scales into consideration.

With the rise of social protests against precarious working conditions in the Western European Countries²⁴, various strands of debates on the subjects and political content of social struggles known as *precarity movements* came to the fore. Precarious workers are seen as a response to the mass workers of the Fordist production (McCarthy, 2006). According to Neilson and Rossiter (2008), who focus on *double-edged* nature of precarity, these movements provide a platform for struggling against the degradation of labor conditions and provide the means to imagine more flexible circumstances in the work and life. In political agenda, it is seen that “precarization symbolizes a contested field which expresses the refusal of the old, so-called fordist regime of labor” (Frassanito Network, 2006). Generally, the

²⁴ With the establishment of Chainworkers Crew in Milan since early 2000s, precarity has been at the centre of following protests, actions and events such as: EuroMayDay activities in seventeen European cities, Precarity Ping Pong in London -2004; in 2005, Precair Forum and International Meeting of Precariat (Neilson & Rossiter, 2005; Oğuz, 2012, p. 236). With the hundreds of thousands of people, mostly young and educated, taking to the streets across Europe. Even further it goes beyond the borders of Europe in line with transnational character of labor and its affects upon migrants’ labor (Standing, 2011, p. 12).

definitions of precarization are seen as referring to the new epoch of labor market relations that are characterized with post-Fordist form of production.

Precarization is seen as an outcome of the deregulation policies and the flexibilization of labor markets (Neilson&Rossiter, 2008; Vosko, 2010). Labour is totally precarized from the upper level of highly skilled workers to the lower level of atomized and flexibilized individuals kept on low wages. According to Seymour (2012):

[P]ost-Fordism has increasingly dispensed with long-term employment, as managers and administrators have sought to make production more flexible out of fragmentary work and social lives.... This process is creating dynamically expanding stratum of workers who, often well educated, are insecure, lack prospects and form transient modes of existence.

The definitions and content of these terms vary to different sets of experiences, social developments or geographical sites. Moreover, the extent of precarization differentiates in accordance with the experiences and practices of different classes. Candeias (2005) explains this separation on the basis of *cybertariat*²⁵ and *precariat*²⁶. Furthermore, activists' idioms concentrate on two types of workers: "chainworkers (i.e.being workers in malls, shopping centres, hypermarkets, and in the myriad of jobs of logistics and selling in the metropolis) and brainworkers (i.e.cognitive laborers; programmers; freelancers) who possess individual value on the labor market but do not yet have a collective force or a subjectivity regarding social rights - that is to say that they might make above-standard wages but if they lose their job they are thrown into poverty" (Oudenampsen&Sullivan, 2004). According to Candeias (2005), even though both groups and class fractions have in common flexibilized and de-formalized labor relations, they occupy very different positions in the production process. Lorey (2010) also claims that there is no need to construct specialized groups into "luxury precarity" and "impoverished precarity", because they both ultimately reproduce neo-liberal dynamics of competitiveness between different degrees of precarization.

²⁵ "*Cybertariat* refers a group of highly qualified, flexible individuals, working in short-term projects. Huws (2003) and Candeias (2001) claim that they take off the old working class habitus, they are sceptical toward unionism or refuse it, and their activities are marked by operating / dominating informational Technologies (as cited in Candeias, 2005)

²⁶ A group of people under the pressure of growing unemployment, a sub-proletariat in insecure labor relations and with low income (Bourdieu, 1998; Candeias, 2005)

The debates on *precariat* centered on the new class formation subjected to precarious conditions. Guy Standing, the founder of the concept, defines *precariat* as a dangerous class that is created by the neo-liberal agenda (Standing, 2011, p. 1). He tries to provide a definition of *precariat* by referring to Marx and Weber. In Weberian terminology, it is conceptualized as a socio-economic group; and in Marxian sense, it is often used as *a class-in-the-making* (Standing, 2011, p. 7). Richard Seymour (2012) criticizes Standing's mildly utopian politics and states that:

[A]ttempts to make [precariat] into a class are theoretically incoherent, and facts of precarious labor and social precarity are misunderstood if boxed into an emerging class thesis." He particularly claims that the term precariat works as a kind of populist interpellation that operates on a real antagonism emerging between power bloc and the rest, so there is a need to understand that "precarity exerts effects right up the chain of class strata, throughout the working class and into sections of the middle class, especially the petty bourgeoisie.

Either precarious movements can lead to alternative forms of struggles or to an organized movement is an open-ended debate. According to Bourdieu, Castel and Wacquant, since precariat is highly fragmented along gender, national and ethnic lines, there are no means of representation for them within the existing political institutions (Candeias, 2007, p. 5). Candeias (2007) criticizes these scholars for calling the state back to regulate market and says that this negative attribution to the organizing capabilities of the movements resulted in "retronormative idealization of the European Welfare state against the aggressive Anglo-Saxon capitalism. However, there is no instance of *too little welfare state*. On the contrary, the density of welfare state and surveillance institutions work massively as an element of and control with a profound impact on the way of life of the dependent *clients*" (pp.5-6). Generally, those scholars become a target of critiques because they are inclined to underrate the capacity of the precarious workers to act and underestimate the importance of the subjectivation of people as a part of this movement (Candeias, 2007, p. 2; Bora & Erdoğan, 2011, p. 35).

Castel (2003) also has become the target of criticisms for his pessimist attitudes towards the excluded or marginalized people. He states, "*aging workers*

(often less than fifty years old) who no longer have a place in the productive process; young in search of their first jobs and who wander from internship to internship and from one menial job to another; the long term unemployed who try with little success to retrain themselves” are all seen as “*useless of the world*” (Castel, 2003, p. 390). As he entitled them as *supernumeraries* who are not integrated or unintegrateable to the working relations (Castel, 2003, p. 389); he clearly declares that they are “not social actors”, but rather social “non-forces”, which means “a non-class of the marginalized that passively submits to its destiny” (Castel, 2003, pp. 357-359). According to Bora and Erdoğan (2011), who discuss the question of agency in the contexts of unemployment, insecure employment and poverty, there is a potential for a collective movement for individuals that are excluded, devoid of the spatial tools, marginalized, and atomized (p. 40).

Precarization is mainly understood as a withdrawal from *standard employment*²⁷. The characteristics of precarious employment are mostly associated with the “non-standard forms of employment” or “atypical employment”²⁸. In flexible capitalism, “a growing number of workers forced to piece together a package of temporary, part-time and other non-standard forms of employment” (Beck, 2004). Vosko and Standford (2004) argue that “employers were inclined to adopt *flexibility-enhancing* strategies in the 1970s and 1980s, contracting out jobs and relying on the non-standard forms of work in order to shrink their core staff” (p. 8). According to them, precarious employment is a strategy that employers used to eliminate workers’ collective empowerment and to construct a supply of more vulnerable workers such as women, immigrants or racialized groups (Vosko&Standford, 2004, p. 8). Lewchuk, Wolff, King and Polanyi (2003) who particularly focus on the effects of precarious employment on the health, define precarious employment as “a cumulative combination of atypical employment contracts, limited social benefits, poor statutory entitlements, job insecurity, short tenure and low wages” (p. 23).

²⁷ Standard employment is defined as “long term, full employed, equipped with extensive social rights and organized in trade unions” (Candeias, 2005).

²⁸ The indept analysis of relations between non-standard forms of employment and precarious employment in Turkey please see: Savul (2008).

Given the growing heterogeneity within the non-standard forms of employment,²⁹ such as part-time, temporary–contract, seasonal, casual, own account self employment and multiple job holdings³⁰; Cranford, Vosko, and Zukewich (2003) prefer using the term precarious employment in a broader context in which income and occupational polarization and the effects of sex/gender, race/ethnicity and age on each other are taken into account (pp. 8-14). In the pursuit of integrated and interdisciplinary approach, Vosko claims that precarious employment is shaped by the internal “relationships between employment status (i.e. self- or paid employment), forms of employment (e.g. temporary or permanent, part-time or full-time), and dimensions of labor market insecurity, as well as social context (e.g. occupation, industry and geography) and social location (or interactions between social relations, such as gender³¹, and legal and political categories, such as citizenships).”

It can be seen that precarious employment which has become dominant in the new capitalist culture has also inevitable social and cultural effects on the individuals’ life styles, their characters, the forms of thought including their perceptions, imaginations or mental life. As stated above, precarization of work or employment concomitantly means precarization of whole life. As emphasized by Sennett (1998), “flexible capitalism has brought an end to coherent work histories for everyone, leading to anxieties in individual lives, and exposing even the most privileged to insecurity and uncertainty”. Since precarious employment has crucial impacts on the mind sets of individuals and daily life and since post-Fordist era is identified with flexibility, there is a need to pay greater attention to the culture of precariousness.

²⁹ Tucker, who conducted a survey to analyze the relationship between non-standard employment and precariousness in New Zealand, claim that non-standard forms of employment is likely to be precarious. In order to understand potential indicators of precariousness in non standard employment see also (Tucker, 2002).

³⁰ For a detailed analysis and definitions of non-standard forms of employment see Krahn (1991 and 1995)

³¹ In order to find further analysis of gendered character of precarious employment see Vosko (2010).

2.1.4 Historical Analysis of the Turkish Economy

Turkey has tried to implement a political-economic programme based on the liberal economic policies advised by international financial institutions³². From 1946 onwards, Turkey has abandoned closed, protectionist and inward oriented economic policies and started to integrate to the world economy (Boratav, 2005, p. 95). As a result, Turkish economy has become highly dependent on the foreign financial aids and has faced the problem of increasing foreign debts (Boratav, 2005, p. 96). Between the years 1954-1962, Turkey implemented a mixed economy model under which consumer goods substituted in a relatively closed economy, public investments and private industrial production increased. Throughout the 1960s, populist policies are implemented in the framework of development plans which aimed to secure the long term power of the capital (Boratav, 2005, pp. 118-123).

By the 1960s, economic growth is coupled with the rises in the real wages and labor rights such as union membership and right to strike. Furthermore, populism also resulted in a developed social security system. In this era, laborers reached non-wage incomes, benefits and securities (Boratav, 2005, p. 124). However, from 1963 onwards, relative deterioration of the working class and the rising labor capital escalated into a crisis of import substitution. This crisis of industrialization has been closely linked to the global crisis of the 1970s.

After the 1970s, Turkish economy has attempted to integrate to the world economic system on the basis of its “national development” strategy and introduced a neo-liberal economic program aimed at the liberalization of financial market, the removal of national barriers upon financial capital and the minimization of state control upon economy (Güler, 2005, pp. 93-98). Under the guidance of structural adjustment policies provided by IMF and World Bank, Turkey abandoned import substitution and initiated export oriented industrialization (Onaran, 2004, p. 213;

³² Under the guidance of American power, in order to create an integrated economy on a global scale, development theories particularly emphasized that underdeveloped countries had to be aided by financial credits and foreign investments so as to strengthen private sector at these countries. So between 1945- 1960, business relations between highly developed countries and underdeveloped countries were highly condensed (Güler, 2005, p. 39). In this period, financial programmes of IMF, World Bank, International Development Association have come to the fore as an important international institutions so as to integrate global economy under the liberal order. The last developments in Turkey such as New Personnel Law, Higher Education Reform, the Law on Energy Sector must be seen as an important attempts of Turkey in order to achieve the liberalization on services (Güzelsari, 2007).

Boratav, 2005, pp. 93-96). Structural adjustment policies that brought financial and trade liberalization were the main themes of the era of 1980s (Onaran, 2004, p. 214; Ercan, 2004, p. 12). Presented as a 'stability' programme, IMF and WB initiated policies of two dimensions: market liberalization and strengthening of domestic capital against the labor³³. During this time, rather than monetary-capital policies, anti-labor policies were mainly targeted as a response to the shrinking domestic demands (Boratav, 2005, pp. 148-49). Anti-labor dimension of this programme means that Turkey is integrated into the world market through its cheapened labor.

Since the 1980s, structural adjustment programs have mainly prepared the grounds of deregulation and privatization policies (Özdemir&Yücesan-Özdemir, 2008, p. 95). According to Güler (2005), standby agreements and structural adjustments loans, which are based on the principles of *deregulation* and *privatization*, has led to the elimination of state economic enterprises, privatization in energy sector, and establishment of money and capital markets which enable the penetration of global capital flows³⁴ into the country (p. 17). A closer look at the policies after the 1990s shows that privatization policies have come to the fore as a solution for the financial liabilities of public sector and, as a result, large part of state economic enterprises were privatized between 1990- 2002 (Boratav, 2005, p. 178). According to Boratav (2005), due to its vulnerability to the economic crises, foreign debts and budget deficits, the rate of public expenditures on education and health have been diminished by state. For example, while the public investment on public services was used to be 64 % in the year 1988, it decreased to 33% in 2002 (p. 188). The privatization in the main economic sectors such as energy and agriculture (Güler, 2005, p. 17) deprived majority of people from the basic public services and,

³³ As emphasized by Korkut Boratav, starting from Marshall Plan, Turkish economy has always confronted with problems of external loans. Between 1980 and 1987 foreign debts has increased to striking level- app.30 million dolar-,that has been never accounted for any other country before (Boratav, 2005, p. 84). Thus, the inabilities of Turkish economy should be considered with the pressure of external loans provided by IMF and WB.

³⁴ These years can not be taken as the beginning of global capital flows. The total liberalization in goods, oney and service market were aimed to be implemented since the acceptance of GATT and the principles of Geneva Convention signed in 1947; these were followed by agreements of World Trade Organization that were held in Uruguay at the end of 1980s and Millenium Round held in 1999 (Güler, 2005, p. 16). Therefore, these developments can not be taken into account without considering the liberalization policies of global market. One of the main document of World Trade Organization that is known as GATS (General Agreement on Trade in Services) aim to liberalize service sector on a global scale varying from energy, education, water resouces, to health, transportation or telecommunication.

as a result, these privatization policies have inevitably increased the inequalities in the social sphere.

Starting from the 1980s, Turkish state has been restructured through reforms in public administration and social policy system (Diner, 2011, p. 310). During this period, the public personnel regime has structurally changed because of the deregulation policies and the paradigmatic shift from “government” to “governance” (Güler, 2005, pp. 18-21). The impacts of the new public personnel administration and approaches on the human resource management have led to greater changes in the public personnel administration system.

It is important to note that the transformation of the economic policies has not been only a consequence of the external factors, but also internal ones. For example, institutional and legal frameworks have also played an important role in determining the changes in the economic liberalization (Boratav, 2005, p. 164). Firstly, the ideological and political conjuncture enabled by the military coup d’etat in 1980, paved the suitable ground for the implementations of the structural adjustment policies (Ercan, 2004, p. 20). Military coup not only paved the way for a new economic programme, but also restructured the state and prevented the opposition of the labor movements and of the broader society (Ercan, 2004, p. 21; Öngen, 2003, p. 176). By eliminating trade union activities, banning strikes and limiting collective bargaining, the new low wage labor regime was initiated (Öngen, 2003, p. 176; Boratav, 2005, p. 150). As a result, the working class in Turkey was disassociated from the rights which were gained by the class march across the political stage throughout the century (Özdemir&Yücesan-Özdemir, 2004, p. 34).

Having considered the integration efforts of the Turkish economy to global capitalist world since 1950s and the structural transformations of the labor market, it can be asserted that labor market relations in Turkey has followed the path-dependent policies including the recipies provided by the international monetary institutions. The neo-liberal economic growth model with its inner contradictions has deepened the grounds of insecure labor market especially after the 1980s. Turkey made a breakthrough in the supply of cheap labor force in the international division of labor (Özdemir&Yücesan-Özdemir, 2008, p. 89). For the following part, the extent of insecurity in the Turkish labor market and the particular developments that

have emerged after the 1990s, which prepare the legal grounds of precarious employment, is analyzed in its relation with the flexible employment regimes.

2.1.5 The “Precarization” of the Labor Process and the “Precarious Employment” in Turkey

Macro-economic changes in the global world have reciprocally affected the national, legal and institutional frameworks as well as the economic model. In parallel with the socio-economic changes led by the flexible accumulation strategies; privatization policies, flexibilized labor relations and neo-liberal assault to social security system has prepared the grounds of the precarious working conditions in Turkey. On the one hand, flexible employment has become a norm of the production relations; on the other hand, workers have subjected to insecure working conditions through the increasing sub-contracting activities, fixed contract and temporary works. Moreover the flexible employment has minimized the privileges of wage workers in the formal industry sector through the restriction of their wages and their rights (Bulutay, 1999; Şenses, 1996). This part is mainly dwelled upon the political actors such as business class and state and legal framework which legitimize the precarious employment in Turkey.

Under the pressure of the international economic institutions- such as IMF, OECD³⁵ and World Bank – and the demands of the business class in Turkey, flexibility in the production relations has begun to be discussed as a global market prerequisite. Since the mid-1990s, some of the business corporations has started to publish reports³⁶ in order to draw public authorities’ attention to the issue of “flexibility”. Flexibility has been presented as a recipe for decreasing unemployment rate and it is assumed that current labor policies based on rigid principles of the employment, contracts and working period has made employment circulations difficult (1999, 59). Turkish Confederation of Employer Associations [TISK], one of

³⁵ In one of OECD (1996) report on Turkey, it is advised to minimize public employment ratio in total employment and also it is stated that severance payments or nonwage labor cost were seen as prevention in the creation of new employment capacities (Onaran, 2004, p. 218).

³⁶ The most important business associations in Turkey – TISK, TÜSİAD, TOBB or MÜSİAD – have published reports in a broader spectrum including privatizations policies, structural adjustment in state’s institutions, education or health system. Their liberal opinions about the role of privatization in education system will be analyzed in the following chapter in a detailed manner.

business associations, held a meeting on “Flexibility in Working Life” in which they criticized the legal framework of the labor market with the claim that it precludes Turkish entrepreneurs to integrate into the global market (1999, 6). TISK argued that the legal framework complicates laying off workers, leading to negative results in the employment flexibility (1994).

The other big business association, Turkish Industry and Business Association [TÜSİAD], also insists on the growing importance of the flexible employment in order to increase the employment capacities and sustain economic growth. TÜSİAD (2002) has emphasized the role of private employment agencies in the effective allocation of labor power in the flexible labor market (pp. 36-43). In one of the TÜSİAD’s reports published in 2002, “speed” and “flexibility” were presented as the preconditions for success for the companies and it has seen that labor market flexibility is justified with its effect on the decrease in the unemployment rates. However, the new regulations are applied to the principle of flexibility in favour of employees and in turn significant decreases in the real wages of the workers has become a manifestation of the flexible capacity of the labor market in Turkey (Onaran, 2004, p. 212).

A closer examination of the legal frameworks that prepares the ground for the flexible employment regimes proves that the remedies provided by the international regulatory institutions and interests of their local partners are reflected in the state policies and regulations.³⁷ Onaran states that Seventh Development Plan (1996-2000) strongly emphasized the flexible working hours and the new employment regimes (Onaran, 2004, p. 217). Again, the Ninth Development Plan (2007-2013) has targeted the flexibilization of the labor market on the basis of efficiency and effectiveness of the labor power³⁸. While Labor Act no. 4857 has included crucial articles that allows insecure working conditions for the workers in the private sector, the recent changes in the Civil Servant Law coded 657 has legalized temporarity and insecure forms of the employment for the workers of the public sector (Oğuz, 2012,

³⁷ It should be noted that business association is only one stake of the hegemonic alliance of global capitalism in the country. While state has contibuted to the transformations in labor market through its institutional and legaslative power, the transition can only be possible with multistaged compromised between different interests of states, transnational or national companies, political parties, and the other powerful groups in political, economic and social sphere.

³⁸ Article 226, Retrieved 10.01.2013 from: <http://ekutup.dpt.gov.tr/plan/plan9.pdf>

p. 230). Moreover, the published draft of the National Employment Strategy is worth of paying attention since it shows the future projections of the labor market.

As discussed by Akkaya (2005), labor law no. 4857 seems to be prepared merely by taking employer's interests into account. A closer look at the articles Labor Law reveals that the relationship between employers and its subcontractors provide a room for them to employ laborers under insecure conditions and with cheap wages³⁹ (Akkaya, 2005, p. 29). The issue of temporary employment in the law enables the employer to transfer employees to another work or another establishment within the structure of the same company (2003, art.7). This article has made workers' social or daily life more temporary in the similar way as it changes their work life (Akkaya, 2005, p. 29). While the article 13 and 14 regulates the part-time employment and work on call, the article related with to termination of contract provided other favours to the employers (Akkaya, 2005, p. 32). In brief, it can be said that the labor law that was enacted in 2003 was coming to the fore as a legal document based on the desires of business class for a flexible labor market (Özveri, 2012, p. 153).

Employees have faced with the insecurity not only in the private sector but also in the public sector with the flexible and insecure working conditions since the 1990s with the changes in the public personnel management. Public employment began to be seen as a financial burden on the Turkish State, so the reforms in the public employment regimes has become one of the main issues in the political agenda (Güler, 2005, p. 49). As a result of the changes in the Civil Servant Law during 1990s, the forms of employment for public personnel can be described in four main categories: (A) civil servants, (B) contract employee, (C) temporary employee and (D) workers⁴⁰. The social rights and benefits reserved for the civil servants and workers are differentiated from those defined for the contract and temporary employee. The implementation of different forms of employment and different legal procedures attached to these different positions has inevitably resulted in a more fragmented working culture in the public sector⁴¹. Replacing the civil servants with

³⁹ Labor Act of Turkey no 4857, Article 2. Retrieved 10.01.2013 from:
<http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/eurpro/ankara/download/laboracturkey.pdf>

⁴⁰ Civil Servant Law no.657 Article.4

⁴¹ For summary analysis of the great differentiation of legal procedures and defining cadres for these different forms of employment see Güler (2003).

the contract workers eliminates job security as it deteriorates the collective rights⁴² (Güler, 2005, p. 52). On the other hand, the statue of the temporary workers is also planned to eliminate the secured social rights of the permanent workers and open the ways of temporary conditions such as subcontractual working, and transfer of workers between different institutions or cities (Güler, 2005, p. 53). Temporary and contrac-based positions added to Civil Servant Law pose a challenge for the labor market security that is granted by the government commitment to “full-employment”. This situation exists as a threat of precariousness to the public employees.

In that respects, the draft document of the national employment strategy⁴³ includes the regulations related to the subcontractor and private employment agencies which mediate the employer and employee relations. According to Özveri, the private employment agencies provide employers a flexible model that enables easy and fast models for hiring and firing strategies (2012, pp. 156-162). Moreover, this drafted document also gives reference to the forms of flexible employments such as “home based work” or “telework”. This document is important to foresee the possible changes in the labor market which are going to be implemented for the upcoming years.

In relation to all the documents mentioned above, we need to consider the impacts of the neo-liberal social policy which creates insecure working environment for workers. Özdemir and Yücesan-Özdemir (2008), who analyze the labor process with respect to the *politics of production*, assert that the labor process has immanently related with the state policies and the conditions of the reproduction of the labor. According to them, the politics of production is not only determined by the labor- capital relations in working place, but also the state regulates the labor relations through its social policies (pp. 51-52). Thus, it is crucial to understand to

⁴² Recent statistics indicates that the number of contract employee in public institutions has been growing day by day. Within ten years, the number has increased nearly one hundred thousands. The statistics indicate that ten thousands people have been recruited on a contractual basis between the years 2001-2011 (TR. Prime Ministry State Personnel Presidency). Retrieved 10.01.2013 from: http://www.dpb.gov.tr/dpb_istatistikler.html

⁴³ National Employment Strategy, which has prepared by Ministry of Labor and Social Security since 2009, was published as a draft version in 2012. This document has drawn heavy criticism from labor fractions. It has not been enacted as a law yet. See also: Symposium on National Employment Strategy(2012).

what extent the neo-liberal social policy would have effects on the labor regimes if it is taken together with the deregulation and flexibilization. The basis of the Turkish social policy system has paradigmatically shifted from the society to the individual and from the state to the market (Özdemir and Yücesan-Özdemir, 2008, p. 52), according to the prescriptions of European Union, International Labour Organization [ILO] and the General Agreement on Trade in Services [GATS] (Akyüz, 2011, pp. 171-172). Low wages policies, established for decreasing the individual or social cost of the labor since 1980, and de-regulation in labor market are important components of the neo-liberal social policy. The other component is directly linked with the social insecurity (Özdemir and Yücesan-Özdemir, 2008, p. 65). According to the statistics of January of 2012, nearly 40%⁴⁴ of the total labor force works without having any social security (Turkish Statistical Institute [TÜİK], 2012).

The likelihood of job losses and costs of job losses are influential indicators in the sense that they can reveal the extent of insecurity.⁴⁵ The threat of unemployment is putting workers in a permanent danger of losing their jobs regardless of whether workforce is skilled or non-skilled. Since, there is no employment benefit system provided by the state, employees have subjected to the higher level of employment insecurity. Özdemir and Yücesan Özdemir (2004) describe the extent of the insecurity examined in the Turkish labor marked as *endemic insecurity*. According to them, the decrease in unionization, neo-liberal structural reforms related with labor market and the lack of social security has forced people living in endemic insecurity. As a result “social exclusion, political indifference and individualized survival strategies for the majority of the population” is observed (p. 40). Additionally, precarization of the labor creates unequal opportunities to access basic social services. Due to the lower level wages and lack of social security – including health insurance or pensions-, workers have difficulty

⁴⁴ It has to be noted that these are official statistics; the probability of deviation is very high due to the existence of informal sector. This number appears as approximately 82% of agricultural sector workers and 25.1% for non-agricultural workers.

⁴⁵ According to recent statistics, TÜİK published unemployment rate as 10.2 % (TÜİK, 2012). However, Özügürü, who attracts our attention to the wide range of informal employment statistics, states that the number of unemployed people has increased to over one million (Özügürü, 2010, 70-71). This pessimistic scene is also valid for skilled labor force. Bora points that after economic crisis in 2009, unemployment rate in non-agricultural population aged between 15-24 has reached to % 29.8. Moreover, the number of unemployed architecture, engineer or city planners increase to % 32.7 (Bora in Bora et al. 2010, 51-52)

in managing their basic social needs such as sheltering, health and education. Working under the subsistence level can be seen as the proleterianisation of labor as argued by Özüğurlu (2005). According to him, primitive accumulation does not only result in the dispossession and emancipation of labor, but also commercializes the fields of reproduction. Neo-liberal social policies introduce restrictions on the conditions of the reproduction of the labor. All the non-commodified sources of income and skills are absorbed by the capital relations. Consequently, proleterianisation leads to the deskilling and depreciation of the labor and commercialization of every day life in return for wages (2005, p. 65).

Precarization of labor, the historical analysis of which discussed above, has expanded with the formation of the new working relations. It is important to bear in mind that workers have always been subjected to the precarious working relations since the early times of the capitalist production. Even though labor power has attained the basic rights and benefits throughout the years, labor market immanently have included precariousness for some groups such women, youth, migrants and children. Today, precarious working relations difuse everywhere from public to private sector and become dominant in the labor market. Precariousness have become dominant because leads to the precarization of whole life from workplaces to home; from workers' rights to citizens' rights; from production cycles to consumption patterns. In that sense, we need to mention the new precarious culture transecting all aspects of the life.

2.2 THE HEGEMONY OF THE NEW CAPITALIST CULTURE

This part aims to provide the conceptual framework in order to explain internal linkages among the production process, dominant ideology and culture. Parallel to the changes in the production process, there is a need to state that the social and cultural life has been changed by the moral and ideological values of the new capitalism. In the account of Gramscian analysis, which attempts to show social and cultural transformation of the American society by the advent of fordist production relations, “the new methods of work are inseparable from a specific mode of living and of thinking and feeling life” (Gramsci, 1999, p. 597)? Fordist form of the production, which enabled higher level of wages and lower level of selling prices,

was seen as a critical phase in the creation of new ways of life. All these matters linked with “the need to elaborate a new type of man suited to the new type of work and productive process” (Gramsci, 1999, p. 557). Gramsci (1999) asserts;

Since these preliminary conditions existed, already rendered rational by historical evolution, it was relatively easy to rationalise production and labor by a skilful combination of force (destruction of working-class trade unionism on a territorial basis) and persuasion (high wages, various social benefits, extremely subtle ideological and political propaganda) and thus succeed in making the whole life of the nation revolve around production. Hegemony here is born in the factory and requires for its exercise only a minute quantity of professional political and ideological intermediaries (p.71).

Nowadays, workers have to face with the new production relations that are characterized by insecurity, fluidity and precariousness. Regarding the linkages between the production relations and cultural life, this part is dealing with some remarkable questions: How does the culture of precariousness become prevalent in the social life? How does it affect the society and its members? And through which mechanisms precariousness is reproduced in the everyday life? All these questions are aimed to be analyzed with reference to the theoretical insights developed by Antonio Gramsci, Richard Sennett, and Pierre Bourdieu.

Antonio Gramsci asserts that changes in the socio-economic conditions do not create political changes on their own, but prepare the grounds of changes that are possible for a specific period of time (Forgacs, 2010, p. 230). In order to explain the domination of new production relations, there is a need to apply the Gramscian notion of hegemony. Gramsci applies to this concept in order to explain socio-economic changes and their impacts upon political-judicial and cultural spheres which are attributed to the field of superstructure. According to him, hegemony refers to a unity of political, economic, cultural and ideological domination in which particular interests of the dominant class do not only transcend its own economic interests, but also integrate with the interests of subordinated classes in a context of national-popular programme (Forgacs, 2010, pp. 250-251). It does not only refer to the economic and political unity, but also to a unity of moral and ethical values (Forgacs, 2010, p. 250). While dominant power is diffused into every spaces of the life, there is a need to state that hegemony is closely engaged with “culture”. And

within this culture, counter-hegemony struggles are created in the meanings of values, habits, linguistic patterns or rituals (Eagleton, 2011, p. 156).

The term of hegemony is used as a reference to the unity of economic, political, ideological and cultural dominance of the new capitalism which legitimize precariousness in the minds, values and codes of society. If we recall Gramsci's approach to culture, "we all of us come to consciousness as members of specific cultural world at specific historical moments and we tend to experience the particular 'realities' of our cultural world as fixed and unalterable" (Crehan, 2011, p. 277). Hence, the culture of precariousness has been internalized in today's world and precarious relations become one of the "realities" of our cultural world that we born in. By the domination of the post-Fordist production and growing rate of flexible forms of employment, everyday life has subjected to causalization, insecurity or a great extent of flexibility. Today's capitalism has characterized with these principles and the culture of precariousness has somehow affected every individual whether they are white-collar or blue collar workers.

It can be claimed that 21st century have witnessed the neo-liberal hegemony that comes up with the new capitalist culture. Working culture historically analyzed above would also correspond to the new ideological and cultural formation of the society. Sennett, in his most recent book, namely *New Capitalist Culture*, describes the new features of the capitalist culture. According to him, individuals have to cope with three crucial problems of the new capitalism: fluidity of time, renewals on abilities and talent, and the disappearance of narratives accumulated throughout the long years. Individuals have to adopt themselves to the fluidity of time (Sennett, 2011, pp. 11-13). Hegemonic domination of the new phase has led to changes for subjects and cultural life concomitantly. On the one hand, there exists a shift from the "collective" and "social subjects" to "segmented and pluralized subjects"; on the other hand cultural life has transformed with the commodified, pluralized and diversified cultural practices and popular tastes (Hall, 2005, p. 119). In relation with the cultural changes, precariousness has become one of the significant characteristics of the social life. It is not only settled in material conditions but also reproduced in the symbolic sense. In daily life precarious culture is epitomised by thoughts, feelings, experiences and daily practices of the subject who actively participates in the ideological reproduction of the production relations. If we take the term of

ideology as “living relations” which produces thoughts, beliefs and values in social life (Eagleton, 2011, pp. 52-55), we can say that the precarious working relations are ideologically reproduced in the daily practices and experiences of the cultural life. In Althusserian terminology, this point is explained such as: “on the one hand every social formation continues to produce; on the other hand, productive forces and production relations are reproduced in parallel to production process” (Althusser, 2006, p. 46). According to Althusser (2008), while the wages provide material means to the workers to reproduce their labor power (the wherewithal to pay for housing, food and clothing), education system reproduce labor power by varying degrees of skills adoptable to be set to labor market (p. 5). Regarding the contemporary functions of the education institutions in preparing the youth as skilled labor force for the flexible market, education become a distinctive reproduction mechanism which reserves the army of unemployed or precarious workers.

Regarding the hegemony of new capitalist culture, following parts aim to analyze the new characters under the new capitalist culture and the impacts of working relations on the different class habitus.

2.2.1 The Character under the New Capitalist Culture

How the new capitalist culture influences individuals’ minds and experiences will be understood with the theoretical contributions of Richard Sennett’s pioneer works⁴⁶. In his celebrated book, *The Corrosion of Character* (1998), he provides analytical concepts related to the impacts of work on the individuals’ characters during the new capitalism. In contrary to the claims that flexibility presents new opportunities for the self fulfillment of the workers, Sennett argues that in reality flexibility and flexi-time create new forms of oppression undermining individuals’ emotional and psychological well-being in the new capitalism. New era of work and economy is defined with flexible capitalism in which “rigid forms of bureaucracy are under attack, as are the evils of blind routine. Workers are asked to behave nimbly, to be open to change on short notice, to take risks continually, to become ever less

⁴⁶ Even though there is large number of books written by Richard Sennett, this study is confined with the references to related books namely *Hidden Injuries of Class* (1972), *The Corrosion of Character* (1998), *Respect* (2003) and *The Culture of New Capitalism* (2006). These books are important with respect to this thesis to the extent that they are focusing on personal and emotional consequences of new era or work and economy.

dependent on regulations and formal procedures” (Sennett, 1998, p. 9). In parallel to those factors, Sennett (2011) also deals with the new institutional structure and changing forms of companies and asserts that three new features has characterized the new types of institutions: *flexibility*, *de-layering* and *causalisation of labor*. The new characteristics of the institutions lead to causalization of labor, so that contract work or part-time work become dominant in this culture (p. 26). Since organizations are constantly redefining their structures or networks, individuals are getting determined by ever changing present. In other words, individuals are ultimately redefined by the changing structures. As described by Sennett (1998), workers are potentially in drift from place to place or job to job and personal character is attacked by the new capitalism (p. 15). “No long term” principle and the short-time frame of the modern institutions not only “corrodes trust, loyalty or mutual commitment” but also “limits the ripening of informal trust” (Sennett, 1998, p. 24). De-valuation of the terms trust, loyalty or commitment has inevitably resulted in more segmented, fragmented or atomized individuals both in the working life and in the daily life.

It has to be noted that devaluation of these terms are not only arising from flexible institutions. The new capitalist culture also produced its own meanings through the social codes, values or norms that has been embedded in the specific period of time and culturally sedimented throughout the years in a specific society. The reproduction of the values and norms of the new capitalist culture presuppose the ideological domination of the ruling class through the mechanisms of education, religion and family as discussed by Gramsci and Althusser. While educational curriculum has served the idea of more individualized and competitive society by raising children with the ambition of success, families make great amount of investment to their childrens’ career and expect from them to move up in the career stages. However, the capitalism– whether in its primitive or modern form- always represents the discrepancy between the expectations of individuals and real conditions.

Flexible capitalist culture is against the routine and bureaucratic time and success is associated with taking risks and moving upward in the career stages (Sennett, 2010, pp. 32, 91). In other words, the necessity of taking risk is highly emphasized in order to be succesfull and respectfull in the new competitive daily life. In the new capitalist culture in which working in a same place or doing the same job

for long years are seemingly presented as routine and boring, the companies are in need for employees who are flexible enough to easily adapt to the discontinuous and changes in the institutions. Although people have to cope with the problems of unemployment, young people prefer to avoid from some professions such as being teachers or civil servant (Sennett, 2012, p. 52). However, in such a competitive labor market in which everybody may confront with the risk of being unemployed, everyone's ambition to reach successful career carries the risk of being failed. According to Sennett (1998),

Failure is no longer the normal prospect facing only the very poor or disadvantaged; it has become more familiar as a regular event in the lives of middle classes. The shrinking size of the elite makes achievement more elusive. The winner-take-all market is a competitive structure which disposes large numbers of educated people to fail (p.118).

As argued by Sennett (1998), success is considered in conjunction with desire of career, but “the short term, flexible time of the new capitalism seems to preclude making a sustaining narrative out of one's labor, and so a career” (p. 122). For example, being unable to achieve prestigious career is seen as a personal failure. However, temporary and flexible work does not enable people to write their own stories. As a consequence, life story that is composed of only episodes, fragments and constant changes does not give stability to one's life or character. The other indicators of failure can be seen as being dependent on the state, or to someone. In his book, *Respect* (2003), Sennett attempts to compare the meanings of “respect” between welfare regimes and today capitalism. The main argument of this book reveals that being dependent is seen as a result of subjective failure or inability⁴⁷ (Sennett, 2010, p. 147). Sennett (2003) explains the dominant discourse of new capitalist culture in relation with the emotions “respect” and “dependency” as such:

[I]n the public realm, dependence appears shameful particularly to modern welfare reformers. Eschews neediness and emphasizes self-sufficiency brings

⁴⁷ In his early study, co-authored by Jonattan Cobb, Sennett and Cobb attempt to explore emotional experiences of working class in America during the beginning of 1970s. According to them, “ability is the badge of individual worth that is to have the right to transcend one's social origins- these are basic suppositions of a society that produces feelings of powerlessness and inadequacy in the lives of working class people” (1972, 62). In brief, a man is known and socially legitimized by his own ability (1972, 268). This book is more illuminating study to show hidden dimensions of class underlying the feelings of dignity, self-respect, shame and honour.

respect in the eyes of others and breeds self respect (...) Liberal thinkers have supposed that dependency, particularly dependency on government, makes adult behave like children (pp. 101-103)

Sennett (2010) also asserts that people who are dependent on state's unemployment benefits or social pensions are not represented as needy person, but are seen as social parasites (p. 147). As neediness and dependency are seen as shameful practices, this leads to a corrosion of mutual trust and commitment; and the dissolution of social networks also results in a threat of dissolution of collective organizations (Sennett, 2010, p. 148). Even though, flexible capitalism has led to the decline of values and personal traits that are desirable in the society, people whose self-respect and self-worth are eroded by the unequal and competitive world have potentially surrounded with anger (Sennett, 2010, p. 149). In *Hidden Injuries of Class*, Sennett and Cobb (1972) attempted to show "how historical moments of structurally necessary and personally experienced social failure pose a danger to hegemony, one that is averted by the most insidious texts aimed at the self to assure that the failure of the promise in social participation is absorbed by subaltern people, who accept the blame for failure by diminishing further their sense of self-worth or by seeking dignity in self-defeating ways" (Rebel, 1989, p. 130).

Despite of providing provide a powerful account of how individuals' character has been corroded by newcomers of the flexible capitalism and how it is emotionally and morally reflected by working people, Sennetts' studies do not tell much about the organization of the collective movements aroused from "collective anger". In order to go beyond the moral and psychological interpretations⁴⁸ on an individual basis, this thesis will try to employ mainly the effects of social, cultural and ideological orientation of the new capitalism on the individuals regarding their class positions. For that reason, we have to apply the dialectical analysis of Bourdieu who provide comprehensive conceptual framework covering relations between culture and politics, the relations of dominations, social classes and class hierarchies.

⁴⁸ At this point the study of Andrew Sayer (2005) is critical to illuminate psychological and moral characteristics of different class positions. He provides an analysis of psychic sides of social classes in varying degrees of resentment, defensiveness, contempt, arrogance, pride, embarrassment or pity. In order to psychological and psychic mapping of social classes see also Reay (2000 and 2005).

2.2.2 The Differentiated Feelings and Experiences of Precariousness

Having considered that “job insecurity is everywhere now” (Bourdieu, 2000, p. 81), there is a need to read precarious culture as a double-faced phenomena that has become both a manifestation of the class differences and a process that deepens the social and cultural hierarchies among the different classes. Social and cultural changes, already analyzed in the contexts of the new capitalist culture and new types of characters, should also be considered through the extent they deepen social inequalities. It has to be noted that these changes can not be understood without taking into consideration the power relations or class struggles that exist in every historical moment. If we recall Gramsci’s approach that defines culture as a condensation of class relations (Crehan, 2011, p. 277), the new capitalist culture can be seen as an area in which different class practices, experiences, values or meanings confront with each other. These confrontations observed in practical sense; are also symbolically re-oriented in terms of meanings, codes and discursive practices. As Grossberg emphasizes, the culture is seen as “the struggle over meaning, a struggle that takes place over and within the sign⁴⁹” (as cited in Morley & Chen. & Hall, 1996, p.157). This part aims to question the differences between social classes’ precarious working experiences and how precariousness diffused into cultural practices of individuals. In order to reach our goal, this study is going to apply to Bourdieu’s conceptualization which supports the idea that each social class has its own class practices, experiences and perceptions.

Although there is an enormous academic literature provided by Pierre Bourdieu, this study is limited with some analytical concepts such as “habitus” and various forms of capital. The habitus has seemed to offer a powerful theoretical tool for those who deal with the culture of everyday life. In Bourdieu’s work (1992), “habitus” is defined as follows:

The habitus, a product of history, produces individual and collective practices - more history - in accordance with the schemes generated by history. It ensures the active presence of past experiences, which, deposited in each organism in the form of schemes of perception, thought and action, tend to guarantee the

⁴⁹ There is a considerable literature making use of semiotics and linguistics for approaching the relations between culture and ideology. In order to understand how discursive field is articulated implicitly by existing power relations see also: Voloshinov (1973) and Hall (2001).

'correctness' of practices and their constancy over time, more reliably than all formal rules and explicit norms (p. 54).

What produce the habitus is the material condition of existence characteristic to class condition (Bourdieu, 1977, p. 72). Habitus generates all the *reasonable, common-sense, behaviours* that are embedded within its limits (Bourdieu, 1992, p. 55) and produces different opportunities suitable for different social classes (Swartz, 1997, p.104).

A closer look at the Bourdieu's class analysis shows that, the roots of social inequalities arise from objective structures in which forms of capital are distributed unevenly (Swartz, 2011, p. 204). Bourdieu introduces the term of capital in all its forms. While economic theories reduce the capital to solely economic exchanges, he defines other forms of the term as its *non-economic, immaterial and disinterested* states. Bourdieu (1986) defines the forms of capital as follows:

[C]apital can present itself in three fundamental guises: as *economic capital*, which is immediately and directly convertible into money and may be institutionalized in the form of property rights; as *cultural capital*, which is convertible, on certain conditions, into economic capital and may be institutionalized in the form of educational qualifications; and as *social capital*, made up of social obligations ('connections'), which is convertible, in certain conditions, into economic capital and may be institutionalized in the form of a title of nobility (p. 242).

As understood from this definition, even though economic capital is seemingly constitute the root of other types of capital, Bourdieu (1986) focuses on the *transubstantiation* whereby “economic capital presents itself in the immaterial form of cultural capital or social capital” (p. 241). It is significant that all these forms of capital determining the chances or the possibilities of success are unevenly distributed in the structures of the habitus. In particular, the notion of *cultural capital* is seriously emphasized in order to explain the unequal educational opportunities and the differences among the children that originate from the different social classes in reaching those opportunities. On the issue of educational capital, Bourdieu (1986) claims that “educational system makes the reproduction of social structure by sanctioning hereditary transmission of *cultural capital*” (p. 244). Hence the

educational capital is inherited from cultural capital embodied in the whole family. It may be somehow transformed into *social capital* which is the aggregate of the actual or potential resources that are linked to possession of durable networks and relationships. These social relations are to be ensured by mutual acquaintance and recognition or by the application of a common name - i.e the name of a family, of a school, a party etc (Bourdieu, 1986, p. 246). The forms of capital are important in order to map out the social classes in Bourdieusian analysis. While the *volume* of total capital demarcates the interclass divisions, differences in the composition of capital determine the intraclass fractions (Swartz, 1997, pp. 160-163).

According to Bourdieu (1984), contrary to economist interpretation of class⁵⁰, “social class is not only defined by a position in production relations, in fact by the class habitus which is associated with position in production relations” (p. 372). Additionally, class is also defined by its perception and consumption as well as by its own. The class habitus includes lifestyle indicators, tastes, educational credentials, gender, age, as well as occupation and income (Swartz, 1997, p. 147). Classes are taken as the groupings of individuals sharing *similar conditions of existence* and their *corresponding set of dispositions* which generate similar practices in return (Swartz, 1997, p. 153). In Bourdieu’s theoretical framework focused on habitus and different combinations of capital is closely related with class structure. The class structure of the society becomes internalized as a distinct class habitus which means the embodiment of both material conditions of the existence and the symbolic differentiations – e.g high/low, rich /poor. In other words, class habitus is predisposed to people to make lifestyle choices which are characteristic to their class habitus. For instance, Bourdieu differentiates a *dominant-class habitus of distinction* from a *working class habitus of necessity* (Swartz, 1997, p. 165). In comparison to taste for freedom of dominant classes, workers experiences are “*forced choice of necessity* not as a deprivation, but as preference – *taste for necessity* that privileges substance over form, the informal over the formal, the sensual over the intellectual” (Swartz, 1997, p. 168). While material constraints are transformed into a distinct habitus; the cultural and social differentiation between lifestyles, consumption

⁵⁰ Bourdieu criticize Marxist scholars in such a way that they provide economic determinist approaches to class (Swartz, 2011, 205). However, it is important to bear in mind that there are distinctions within Marxism and there are “other” Marxism which could go beyond the economic-determinist or structuralist interpretations of Marxism.

patterns, perceptions or preferences among the different class habitus generates power relations in return. And as emphasized before, existing precarious working relations can not be taken independent from the existing power relations in the society.

2.2.3 Some Notes on Precarity in Turkey

Regarding the importance of theoretical concepts proposed by Bourdieu, this study supports the idea that class positions or class culture are fundamentally shaped by the economic forces, a way different from the crude economic determinist approach. Even if the term of habitus provides the tools for the analysis of “how and why culture persist through time, reproduce themselves from generation to generation, it does not tell with much about dynamic of change” (Crehan, 2011, p. 281).

If we take a look at the class culture analysis of precariousness in Turkish academic literature, there are a quite limited number of studies coming to the fore. The collaborative study, *Boşuna mı Okuduk? Türkiye’de Beyaz Yakalı İşsizliği* aims to analyze the experiences and emotions of the white collar workers in relation to the unemployment and precarization (Bora et al. 2011). In this study, Bora (2011) talks about the dominant ideological discourse accompanied with the restriction on the number of public employees and precarization of public employment. The ideological discourse presents the positions of the civil servants as useless and parasitic; nevertheless it glorifies a specific type of individual who can easily take risks, produce constantly, create new opportunities and investe him/her “self” (p. 55). Erdoğan (2011) focuses on the ideological, cultural and politic processes which enable the causalisation and precarization of labor (p. 75). According to him, the cultural and moral framework after the 1980s has led to the expansion of the cynical subjectivity which defines itself as “non-ideological”; corrosion of belongingness and commitment by the effects of “fast” and “fluid” capitalism; and lastly the emergence of narratives of a “new subject” who is individualistic, narcissist and self centered (Erdoğan, 2011, p. 104).

In the same study, Bora (2011) asserts that unemployment leads to the loss of self-worth and corrode feelings of belongingness and commitment (pp. 62-65). Since

cultural capital attained by education began to be seen as “useless”, white collared workers are emotionally and morally affected by the devaluation of their own educational credentials (Bora, 2011, p. 69). In a similar vein, symbolic power imposed upon “self” leads to erosion of the respect and the self (Erdoğan, 2011, p. 92). According to Erdoğan (2011), precarious labor and life style creates “self” that has to face with the constant uncertainty and risks, whose self-worth is constantly tested (pp. 89-90).

In the context of social and cultural hierarchies, it is possible to say that with the commodification of education there emerges a layer of hierarchy in the mental labor and depreciated mental labor experiences precarization similar to the lower classes (Erdoğan, 2011, p. 75). Erdoğan (2011) states that devaluation and stratification of the mental labor creates different hierarchical positions within the same profession group. Even though educational capital (economic condition of family, the quality and level of education etc.) determines the social positions in the labor market, a determining factor of the social position in the labor market in the last instance is the economic structure (Erdoğan, 2011, p. 78). In other words, labor market, which is an area of reproduction of production relations, in fact determines preferences, opportunities and chances of workers.

CHAPTER III

TEACHER TRAINING PROCESS AND “PRECARIOUS” WORKING LIFE OF THE NON-APPOINTED TEACHERS

This chapter aims to provide the general framework of the teacher training system and teachers' forms of employment in the flexible labor market in Turkey. Given the fact that education is used as an ideological apparatus that deepens class differences and reinforces dominant capitalist production relations, there is a need to understand to what extent the Turkish education system has shaped the perceptions, preferences or future plans of individuals who want to become a teacher. Firstly, the general structure of education is going to be explained in a comprehensive manner in order to draw an outline of pre-vocational training. How the Turkish education system has discriminated against students with respect to their economic, social and cultural capital; or which structural inequalities prevent students from enhancing their capabilities are important questions that need to be answered. Without understanding the educational background of interviewees, we can not provide comprehensive analysis of insecure employment of teachers' in relation to their class backgrounds and ideological views. In line with social, economic and political developments in the international arena as well as in the national one, how privatization and new capitalist discourse become dominant particularly in the education sector will be analyzed. A general description of the educational structure, in particular the teacher training system, will be given in relation with to the structural problems arising from the centralized exam system and the conditions of appointment of non-appointed teachers. The legal framework and institutional structure related with teachers' fields of employment are will also be clarified. On this matter, rules and bylaws of the MONE are discussed in relation to the criteria of appointments and some crucial statistics will be given in order to analyze causes of the problem of being unemployed or non-appointed. Since the scope of this thesis is limited to paid teachers and teachers working in private education centers, working conditions of these two groups are comparatively understood and analyzed with respect to their own views and perceptions.

3.1 The General Structure of Turkish Education System

The history of the Turkish education system in a modern sense can be traced back to first quarter of the twentieth century. After the proclamation of the Republic of Turkey, the education system was organized and unified under the National Ministry of Education by the law “*Tevhid-i Tedrisat*⁵¹” No. 430. Until the 1980s, the Turkish education system aimed to educate modern citizens in accordance with Kemalist ideology which was based on the principles of laicism, westernization and modernization (İnal, 2008, pp. 73-77). Even though the objectives and structure of education system have continuously been redefined and transformed with respect to international and national socio-political and economic developments, the principles of education have always harmonized with politics of successive governments.

The General structure of the National Education System was determined by the National Education Basic Act No. 1739 in 1973 (MONE, 2007, pp. 24-25). According to the National Education Basic Act, the national education system consists of two main parts; namely “formal education” and “non- formal education (MONE, 2010, p. 1). Formal education is defined as “*the regular education conducted within a school for individuals in a certain age group and at the same level, under programs developed in accordance for this purpose*” and it includes pre-primary, primary, secondary and tertiary levels of education (MONE, 2010, p. 1). Citizens who have never entered formal educational institutions or have left at any level, who want to enhance own abilities may do so in non-formal educational institutions alongside formal ones (MONE, 2010, p. 1). In other words, non-formal educational institutions are designed as complementary to formal educational institutions in order to enable participants to acquire the same qualities as a student in formal education (MONE, 2010, p. XI).

Formal education institutions involve four levels of schools: pre-primary, primary, secondary and high schools. The number of formal education schools/institutions is 46,427 and approximately 16 million students are enrolled in these schools/institutions⁵² (MONE, 2012, p. 48). While only one thirteenth of the

⁵¹ *Tevhid-i Tedrisat* means the unification of education institutions. By the enactment of this law, madrasahs were eliminated and national education system was structured in a modern sense.

⁵² According to Turkish Constitution Article 42, no one shall be deprived of the learning and education; and primary education is compulsory for all citizens of both sexes and is free of charge in

total number of schools/institutions is to be found in the private sector, official statistics show that there are 4,664 private institutions in total formal education institutions/schools (MONE, 2012, p.48). According to these statistics, it can be said that the private sector in formal education is still quite limited; however, the aim to increase the number of private schools is strongly promoted by recent laws and regulations⁵³.

The role of centralized exams becomes prevalent after primary education. Students' preferences about which specific field they would like to study and which schools they will go to is mainly determined by the central exams. There is a great variety among school types at every education level and secondary education in particular includes over thirty different schools types (MONE, 2007, p. 123). While some secondary education schools accept students without any exam score, others accept students according to their success rates in Entrance Exam to Secondary Education Schools [OKS]⁵⁴ and their success rates in Placement Tests [SBS]⁵⁵ and are then allocated to different classes of secondary schools (MONE, 2007). However, the selection of students for secondary schools according to their academic success created a group of elite schools (Turkish Education Association [TED], 2010, p.23). These schools are considered as prestigious and "sterile places" where students are supposed to take advantage of their schools' success rates in OKS and SBS (TED, 2010, p. 23). Since Anatolian high schools, in which education is given predominantly in English, are considered more prestigious than vocational and technical high schools, there are significant social differences in terms of access to educational opportunities and academic success between students of these two types of high school. Vocational and technical high schools are not seen as an effective route to higher education because the aim of these schools is to prepare students for a

staten schools. Retrieved 10.01.2013 from:
http://www.anayasa.gov.tr/images/loaded/pdf_dosyalari/THE_CONSTITUTION_OF_THE_REPUBLIC_OF_TURKEY.pdf

⁵³ Retrieved from: <http://www.aa.com.tr/tr/egitim/51472--dershaneler-azaldi---zel-okullar-artti>

⁵⁴ OKS (Orta Öğretim Kurumlarına Geçiş Sınavı) is general exam applied for the entrance into secondary education schools.

⁵⁵ SBS (Seviye Belirleme Sınavı) is a kind of test measuring the success level of students at the end of academic year in 6th, 7th and 8th grade. Retrieved 10.01.2013 from: http://oges.MONE.gov.tr/doc2012/2602_Say%C4%B1%C4%B1_Orta%C3%B6%C4%9Fretim_Kurumlar%C4%B1na_Ge%C3%A7i%C5%9F_Y%C3%B6nergesi%20.pdf

skilled occupation or job according to their interests and abilities (MONE, 2012, p. XIII). In the university entrance exam the success rate of students from Anatolian high schools can reach up to 60 %, the same rate falls to 2 % or 3 % for students from vocational and technical high schools (Keskin, 2012, pp. 178-179) Therefore, families are inclined to send their children to general high schools which prepare students for higher education in order to get a profession (TED, 2010, p. 18).

OKS and SBS are just the primary steps on the way to higher education. The students have to enter other centralized exams known as Entrance Exams to Higher Education [YGS] and Placement Exam for Undergraduate Studies [LYS] which are conducted on a national scale⁵⁶ for tertiary education. These exams are highly competitive for students who want to enroll in one university due to the increase in demand for university education and the quota specified by universities. According to the statistics from 2011, while nearly 2 million students entered university entrance exams (Students Selection and Placement Center [ÖSYM], 2011, p. 21), 800,000 students can currently enroll in the universities (ÖSYM, 2000). While the number of enrolled students was around 400.000 (ÖSYM, 2012c), this number could be doubled in twelve years with the increasing number of universities since the start of the 2000s⁵⁷. In 2009, 36 % of students, who entered YGS and LYS, were composed of those who could not be placed in any universities in previous exams (TED, 2010, pp. 29-37). It has been observed that that the number of students who enter YGS and LYS increases incrementally and this provokes a “competitive culture” in which people are getting more competitive, more individualized and the sense of community and publicity are disappearing (Keskin, 2012, p. 20).

The exams that are conducted on a national scale occupy an important place in the Turkish education system. It is stated that nearly 5.5 million students have entered exams prepared by the ÖSYM in 2012 (ÖSYM, 2011). More exams have led to the increase in the number of private education centers [PECs] which are expected to prepare students for central exams. Since the quality of education

⁵⁶ YGS (Yüksek Öğretim Geçiş Sınavı) and LYS (Lisans Yerleştime Sınavı) are central exams that are applied for students who want to enter universities.

⁵⁷ Currently, there are 104 state universities and 65 foundation universities in Turkey (<http://yenisafak.com.tr/Gundem/?i=339099>). According to last strategic report of MONE, in order to increase private funding sources in education and competitiveness, there is an aim to increase the number of private universities (MONE, 2009, 136).

depends on the money is paid for the education service, some students have become more advantageous comparing to their peers. In other words, the success in the exams is closely dependent to the financial capabilities that can be paid for private education services. According to a study which conducted a survey about the expenses paid on private education, a family has to pay nearly 3500 Turkish liras to any PECs, on a yearly basis for the preparation of their children for OKS and SBS (Serdar, 2008). For the high school generation, the educational expenses of a family may reach 16,000 Turkish liras for each student (TED, 2010, p. 239). It is notable that the competitive culture, fostered by exam system, is not only internalized by students, it also leads parents⁵⁸ to compete with each other on the basis of their childrens' success (Keskin, 2012, p. 20). However, competition in the educational sector presupposes some degree of material conditions that can manage to pay these costs.

Since educational opportunities are unevenly distributed in society due to uneven socio- economic development, students can not have the same opportunities in accessing qualified education. Some inequalities among geographic regions can be summarized in terms of schooling ratio, students' sex ratio and literacy ratio in the different regions of Turkey (TED, 2010; TÜSIAD, 2006; Gül, 2008, pp.182-185). With this exam system, education has become as economic sector where socio-economic inequalities and discrimination are reinforced since students are compelled to compete with each other in unfair and unequal conditions. According to the study conducted by the Turkish Education Association, there are serious differences in success rates among schools and this situation deepens educational inequalities for disadvantaged groups in the case of accessing educational services (TED, 2010, p. 9). In other words, socio- economic differences corresponding to class differences directly affect educational opportunities, the ability to be successful in later career building stages. In that sense, there is need to recall the class analysis in education system provided by Erdoğan (2012) that draws our attention to the class confrontations between public and private schools. According to his article based on the news about social discrimination against lower classes in public schools,

⁵⁸ This situation is explained as third wave in the socio-historical development of education, called as parentocracy. According to Brown, parentocracy is characterized with a new stage in which education of children depends on the richness and desires of their families rather than their personal abilities or success (as cited in Keskin, 2012, p. 63).

“education has become an important part of strategies that separate upper and lower classes” and poor workers’ children have not got any chances to compete against the children who have got the opportunities to access private schools, courses or education abroad. Although upper and middle class families can manage to send their children to several private courses, foreign language courses or private schools abroad, the children of lower class families who cannot afford these opportunities are going to remain in lower class positions in terms of their schools and job opportunities (Keskin, 2012, p. 67).

Due to the *so-called* inadequacies and deficiencies in the public- formal educational institutions, parents are inclined to send their children to private education institutions in order to prepare their children for successful results in central exams. Hence, this situation increases the role of non-formal educational institutions in which students have the possibility of continuous education to complete their substandard education (MONE, 2012, p. 1). In contrary to formal education, non-formal education is mainly provided by the private sector. While the number of non-formal education institutions is counted as 13,452 and nearly 11,500 institutions provide private education services (TUIK, 2010). This sector has been growing day by day because of the growing number of private education centers [PECs]⁵⁹. As mentioned above, students are also forced to go to private education centers because educational quality in public schools is not seen as sufficient and effective for being successful in general exams⁶⁰. PECs are not only places in which students purchase education services, but they are also the places where teachers’ labor becomes cheaper. While teachers’ labor supply increases in greater numbers⁶¹, it becomes an opportunity for the employers to employ teachers with low ages and precarious conditions in private education market.

⁵⁹ According to the statistics of 2009-2010 education period, the number of private education centers is 4099. There is need to note that these numbers are formal statistics which exclude the existence of informal economy. http://www.tuik.gov.tr/VeriBilgi.do?alt_id=14

⁶⁰ It is important to bear mind that this belief is closely associated with neo-liberal discourse which aims to undermines the functions of public sector in order to liberalize all public services and privatize these services. This point will be discussed in following parts.

⁶¹ The number of teachers working in PECs is approximately 50.000 with reference to statistics in 2010 (MONE, 2010, p. 25).

3.2 The Privatization of Turkish Education System

The present era of neo-liberal transformation has led to privatization of state-owned industries such as education, health, and public services which are funded by the state itself. Considering the general transformation of the public sector as a result of economic reforms in Turkey, the educational sector has been regulated and revised according to the economic and political pressures coming from international agencies and multilateral business corporations as discussed before.

In comparison to international standards, the Turkish educational system has been characterized by a number of deficiencies and inadequacies, so the expansion of privatization and commercialization are to be justified on the grounds that public education services are not able to overcome these deficiencies. If we give a statistical portrait of inadequacies; while UNDP Turkey Development Report states that the average school starting age in Turkey (6.5) is lower than the average schooling ratio in Middle East and Europe (9.4) (UNDP, 2006); according to data published by Turkish Statistics Institute⁶² and State Planning Institution, only %7 of total manpower is literate (Gül, 2008, p. 183). In higher education, the schooling ratio only reaches 33 %⁶³. In addition to this portrait, inter-regional inequalities, gender inequalities and the inadequate educational curricula are also stated as important problems in the Turkish education system (Gül, 2008, pp. 182-185). All research and studies focused on the inefficient education system are interpreted as such that the Turkish education system should urgently be restructured in accordance with the international standards and the requirements of the labor market (UNDP, 2006; World Bank, 2005; OECD, 2011). Considering the statement in the World Bank Report, the government of Turkey recognizes that an inefficient education sector is constraining economic growth, competitiveness and social cohesion (World Bank, 2005). Since forms of privatization have come to the fore as effective solution to the

⁶² If we look at the recent data, only ten percent of fifty five million population over 15-year old is graduated from higher education institutions. Moreover, nearly fifteen million of this population is composed of primary school graduates (TUIK, N.d) http://rapor.tuik.gov.tr/reports/rwservlet?adnksdb2&ENVID=adnksdb2Env&report=wa_turkiye_cinsi_yet_yas_egitim_top.RDF&p_xkod=egitim_kod&p_yas=15&p_yil=2011&p_dil=1&desformat=html

⁶³ TUIK, Eğitim İstatistikleri, Göstergeler: http://www.tuik.gov.tr/Gosterge.do?metod=GostergeListe&alt_id=14

perceived inadequacies of public service education (Ball and Youdell, 2008, p. 8), the privatization discourse has been legitimized on the grounds that the quality of public education is relatively lower than the international standards so it has to be privatized to be enhanced.

Having considered the neo-liberal policies explained in the second chapter, Ercan and Uzunyayla (2008) make a timeline of the commercialization of the Turkish education system in three stages. According to them, although Turkish education system aimed to develop modern national subjects under the guidance of the Turkish nation state during early republican periods, from the 1980s education started to be commercialized⁶⁴ in relation with changing accumulation strategies. As a third phase, internationalization would take place in the privatization of education by the internationalization of finance capital and goods on a global scale (Ercan & Uzunyayla, 2008, p.125; Ercan, 2005, p. 26). Drivers for liberalizing the education system in Turkey have included the public sector and education sector reforms in line with the recommendations of World Bank, The International Finance Corporation, Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency [MIGA] and General Agreement on Trade in Services [GATS] (Roskam, 2009, 65). GATS legitimized the grounds of commercialization of all services to accelerate the privatization of education services in Turkey since 1998 (Keskin, 2012a, pp. 86-89; Keskin, 2012b, p.170).

Besides international actors and global conjuncture preparing the grounds for privatization, state policies and the interests of the business class are coming to the fore as national partners of international groups. As it has been previously mentioned, the state took part in this process by enactment of the social and economic policies. By the adjustment of the 9th Development Plan (2007-2013) and the 15th National Education Strategic Plan, aims and principles of the educational system were updated in accordance with the interests and the privileges of the private sector (Keskin, 2012a, p. 170). On the one hand, the state cut back on the public expenditures and state-funding resources for education, on the other hand state promoted private education institutions through tax allowances and incentive credits (Gök, 2004, pp. 101-104). Thus, the substantial and the growing level of private

⁶⁴ In political conjuncture, Turgut Özal, the Prime Minister, declared that Social Welfare State was out of fashion similar like the discourse used by Thatcher. Kenan Evren, who became the president of Turkish Republic by military intervention in 1980, criticize the role of social policies which make education free of charge and claimed that this led to social injustice (Gök, 2004, p. 101).

funding institutions becomes prevalent⁶⁵ in the education system. The collaborative projects of state institutions and private sector come to the fore during this process. While some private funding projects aim to remedy the structural deficiencies of education such as regional inequalities or gender inequalities⁶⁶, some other projects under guidance of the MONE aim to enhance relations between employment and education (Ercan & Uzunyayla, 2008, p.140).

Private institutions have increased at even a greater rate and this process results in not only statistical changes but also crucial social impact upon students, parents and teachers. With the crucial role of exams in the education system as mentioned before, private education centers take a significant place in the private education sector because of the amount of expenditure by parents for entrance into secondary and tertiary education is reaching close to 16 billion TL (TED, 2010, p. 244). With a shift from welfare state-funding services to private funding services, privatization leads to the radical transformation of teachers' labor and different forms of employment regimes both in the public and private sectors. According to Keskin (2012b), while employers want to increase their profits by decreasing production costs, families are inclined to purchase more qualified education by paying less, thus the private sector seeks to decrease the cost of labor (pp. 39-140).

Similar to governments' desire for privatization, the other proponents and advocates of privatization in education are members of the business class. The most important demand of the business class is to develop effective relations between educational institutions and the labor force. Since the Turkish business class has been part of international market competition, the education system is supposed to be consistent with a high-skilled and flexible labor force that is required by the labor market (Ercan & Uzunyayla, 2008, p. 132). In this sense, the reports and studies⁶⁷ conducted by business class corporations are crucial in legitimizing privatization of

⁶⁵ Even it is quite limited in formal education institutions, the number of private education institutions is getting close to 16.000 and nearly 4 million students are currently attending both in formal and non-formal education, (Keskin, 2012b, p. 139).

⁶⁶ The campaigns are "Haydi Kızlar Okula", "Bilgisayarlı Eğitime Destek", "Köy Merkezli Tarımsal Üretime Destek" etc. (MONE, 2007, 92-93).

⁶⁷ During this process, the most important business class organizations published reports to propose recommendations based upon the occupational competences, skilled labor force and flexible employment strategies and the relations between sustainable development and education. See also: TİSK (2006), TÜSİAD (2006), MÜSİAD (2006).

education on the terms of “efficiency”, “quality” and flexibility (Ercan & Uzunyayla, 2008, p.131).

Marketization of education services is legitimized under the hegemony of neo-liberal discourse that is proliferated by dominant classes. Thus, this process is accompanied by its own discourse based on the terms: “knowledge society”, “skilled labor force”, “competition”, “efficiency”, “standardization” and “lifelong learning” (Ercan & Uzunyayla, 2008, pp. 125-126). As we discussed earlier, the production and the circulation of neo-liberal discourse is not only realized by the material conditions, it is also reproduced through immaterial ways. Education, which is ultimately responsible for the building of social relations, is expected to accommodate new production relations. Thus, the concepts which are dominant in market relations inevitably penetrate the educational system such as the performance management of teachers, the standardization of students’ success through the exams and efficiency measures in teaching models.

With the privatization policies, teachers have come under the rule of free market and they are forced to work according to the rules of market relations (Ünal, 2005, p. 6). The domination of market principles upon education sector has not only resulted in strategies that devalorized teaching labor - including flexible forms of employment, performance evaluation, surveillance mechanisms, occupational hierarchies- (Ertürk, 2010, p. 118), but also brought about social preferences underestimating the meaning of teaching as a profession. The degradation of teaching as a profession is the particular outcome of degradation of the occupational identity in new capitalist working culture. In the commercialized education sector, teachers have become wage workers and their labor has been commodified (Keskin, 2012a, p.169).

On the one hand capitalist labor process has led to the deskilling of labor in order to increase the productivity of labor in line with the interests of capital; on the other hand labor market may also necessitates highly skilled labor to increase surplus value (Özdemir& Yücesan-Özdemir, 2008, p. 39). In the case of teachers working in private education institutions, their experiences are standardized through multiple choice test scores (Ünal, 2005, p.7). Maguire (2002) states that teachers’ performances are measured through several control techniques: performance management, efficiency analysis and performance based salary system. Every detail

of the tasks of teachers is aimed to be defined and “new” teachers are expected to work as a *technician* rather than a *professional* who has the control upon her/him teaching models (Maguire, 2002). While education process has been standardized because of the centralized exam system, the performance of teachers is measured with the exam scores of their students and this has resulted in deskilling of their labor (Ünal, 2005, p. 7; Keskin, 2012a, p.179).

Besides deskilling mechanisms, teachers working in PECs have to develop and increase their skills every year because of the increasing competition among private institutions. While private education centers have compelled teachers to work ten or twelve hours in a day, administrators have expected them to do more work in lesser times. Furthermore, teachers are also expected to develop their abilities according to the new information and communication technologies applied in education institutions as a result of commercialization of education services. Private education sector is not only much harder than public sector, but also teachers have lost their decision making authority and control upon their teaching processes, and all decisions related to the courses or the education curricula has been determined by the administrators according to the requirements of market. In that respect, Keskin (2012a) claims that the working conditions of teachers proletarianized day by day because of commercialized education system in which teachers have been compelled to update their knowledge and develop their skills day by day (p.171).

Besides the impacts of privatization upon teachers’ labor, it has also deepened the inequalities and inadequacies among different social classes (Ercan, 2005, pp. 18-19). According to the advocates of the marketization of education, “approaches to education reform create a market in educational services which will foster competition among providers and thus spur delivery of better services at the same or lower cost than providing them through traditional public schools” (Molnar and Garcia, 2007, p. 11). However, competition creates serious inequalities among students coming from lower and upper classes in Turkey as well as other countries where the majority of people are excluded from basic welfare conditions. In relation to the fall of social policy and withdrawal of the state from public services, education services are not only commodified, they are also instrumentalized so as to reproduce the social hierarchies between classes. In the second chapter, the discriminative nature of education is going to be analyzed as an *institutionalized form of cultural*

capital. Having considered Bourdieu's (1984) focus on education, the differentiated opportunities in accessing educational services has practically deepened socio-cultural differences between lower and higher classes. In the commodified education system, more money invested in education has resulted in more qualified education that brings about prestigious and advantageous career opportunities.

3.3 University Entrance Exams and University Preferences

The quality and structure of universities has always been a debated issue for many years. Giving a detailed analysis of these debates is beyond the scope of this study. However, it is important to address certain issues about university system because the university education epitomizes the differentiation of social and cultural capital. First of all universities are affected by the above-mentioned privatization process⁶⁸. In this process, there is a shift university as an academy towards "the university as a company" (İnal, 2008, p. 100). The state's financial contributions to science have been decreased and the quality of academic knowledge has been undermined. Coşkun (2008) describes the structural change in education policies as an evolution from "the reproduction of social traits" to "the reproduction of capitalism" in which universities are expected to train entrepreneurial and individualistic young generations on the axis of a culture of investment and competitiveness (p. 197).

The other most debatable issue of university system is the problem of autonomy and democracy in universities. Since 1980, academic and scientific production in Turkish universities has always been under the administrative control of The Higher Education Council. On the other hand the autonomy of universities has also been threatened by the marketization of higher education. In particular, academic production has been closely determined by capital relations and academic knowledge is reduced to market value (Çoşkun, 2008, p. 198). Since universities are places where the relations between industry and education are reproduced through technoparks or profit based projects, academicians are both deprived of an autonomous and scientific work environment or secure working relations. At this

⁶⁸ The proposed changes in YÖK have significant implications in this regard. According to the law draft, in addition to foundation universities, real and legal persons are granted the right to open private universities.

point, insecure and temporary working conditions of research assistants who work on a contract basis need to be evaluated in relation with the lack of security of labor.

The number of universities has gradually increased over time. Today there are a total of 103 public funded universities and 65 privately-funded universities in Turkey. It is apparent that the number of private universities will increase in the next years with the new draft on Higher Education Institutions. More universities do not lead to more qualified academic production as well. The regional separation between big universities in the biggest cities- named as metropolitan universities by Erdoğan (2011)- and so called *Anatolian* universities scattered around Anatolia, symbolizes differentiated educational and social capital that are characterized by differentiated academic competencies or social networks. Erdoğan (2011) asserts that these differentiations are closely associated with class differences. He states that class differences between graduates of “*prestigious*” metropolitan universities and of “*worthless*” peripheral universities have revealed themselves in differentiation of social capital that is used for job seeking (Erdoğan, 2011, p. 80). In that sense, the universities from which interviewees graduated are significant factor determining their chances for finding a job in the education sector.

In the general structure of education system, it is already stated that students can enter the tertiary level of education with the university entrance exam known as LYS and YGS. Rather than giving a broader explanation of the criteria or system of the university exam, this part only deals with the pre-vocational training of teachers. In particular though the ways in which candidates can become teachers and how their university preferences affect their job opportunities are going to be answered. Article of the National Education Basic Act no.43 states that students who would like to be teachers should enter relevant departments of universities as specified by the Ministry of National Education. Students are allocated to universities according to their scores in university entrance exams, their preferences and the quota or prerequisites of higher education programs (ÖSYM, 2012b).

The success rate in university exams directly shapes or limits the preferences of students in decision of departments which they are going to study. For example, while a student would like to study physics teaching in the faculty of education, he/she may have to choose a department of physics or chemistry because his/her score is not adequate to register in the faculty of education. Since the base points of

departments of universities are differentiated in the Student Selection and Replacement system, students have chosen the fittest department and universities according to their exam score and interests.

Throughout a year, students are preparing to answer thousands of questions, spending hundreds of hours on this preparation. However, it must be noted that students are under pressure and the exam preparation periods have resulted in negative psychological effects upon individuals due to all the effort put in throughout a whole year. Under this pressure, students who could not get a high enough score to enroll in his/her desirable university necessarily choose to enroll in any one of the universities or department whether he/she would like to go. This situation bring us to the points of “*choice of necessity*” explained by Bourdieu. In addition to the stress that there will be another year of preparation, costs of this preparation forces lower class students are forced choose from available options immediately. University entrance exams shape the career and job expectations of young people with university choices; and satisfaction or dissatisfaction arising from jobs are associated with university preferences through these exams (Bora, 2011, p. 260).

A closer look at the interpretations of interviewees, their university preferences and their experiences of university entrance exams reveal that exam system has dented their expectations, negatively impacted on their plans and their lives in general. On the one hand, they have blamed themselves for making the wrong choices or decisions about their career; on the other hand, they are highly critical towards an exam system which obligates them to build career according to their exam scores. With their thoughts about the quality of education given in their universities, most of the interviewees state that they do not satisfied with the quality of education in their universities.

Interviewees state that a university entrance exam has led them to choose their profession with respect to their exam scores instead of their personal preferences or decisions. While Öznur (32) wished to study geography education or psychological counseling and guidance, she had to choose social science education that corresponded with her exam score. Fikret (34) stated his regret about choosing a department of social sciences teaching in one of the biggest universities in Ankara instead of Erzurum, because he thought that if he had preferred primary school

teaching in Erzurum he could be appointed easily and he wouldn't have been unemployed. His argument was as follows:

When I took the university exam, I wanted to gain entrance to a good university. In those times, between 1985-1996, people were being appointed by drawing lots. I said that it should have been a good university. You don't know what you are confronted with. I wish I had chosen primary school teaching in Erzurum, Van, or Ağrı because primary school teachers are appointed easier.⁶⁹

While Okan (36) blamed himself for going to University of Harran instead of preparing for university exam for one more years, Engin's (36) words show how teaching branches would pragmatically determine their job opportunities.

In fact, I wanted to study at Gazi or Ankara University. I wanted to study where I was born and I lived, but I did not have enough points so I had to go to Şanlıurfa. I do not believe that I could improve myself in Urfa, since there were not enough social facilities. In my opinion university does not mean merely a diploma.⁷⁰

There are a lot of tenured teachers who have never entered the PPSE or got an adequate score to be appointed. Then I thought that I wished I had chosen the department of Education of Religious Culture and Moral Knowledge.⁷¹

Most of non-appointed teachers have tended to blame themselves for their preferences of university or education branches. Due to current conditions of teaching branches, Ferdi (24) plans to enter the university entrance exam again and Okan (36) is studying in Department of Social Service. The preferences of teaching branches are critical because the number of teachers of each branch is determined by the MONE for each year with respect to the need for teachers in formal education.

⁶⁹ Fikret: "Ben üni sınavına girdiğim dönemler de iyi bir üni olsun istiyordum o zamanlar insanlar kura ile atanıyordu, 85-96 yılında öyleydi. İşte şimdi ben dedim iyi bir üni olsun. Bilmiyorsun tabi nelerle karşılaşacağını keşke diyorum o dönem sınıf öğretmenliği yazıp Erzurum'da, van, Ağrı'da olsaydım. Sınıf öğretmenleri de düşük puanla atanıyorlar."

⁷⁰ Okan: "Ben aslında Ankarayı düşünüyordum Gazi üniversitesi ya da Ankara. Doğup büyüdüğüm şehirde okumayı düşünüyordum. Ama puanım yetmediği için mecburen urfaya gitmek zorunda kaldım. Oranın da sosyal imkanları zayıftı kendimi tam yetiştirdiğime inanmadım. Hani sadece diploma değildir çünkü üniversite."

⁷¹ Engin: "Ben aslında Ankarayı düşünüyordum Gazi Üniversitesi ya da Ankara. Doğup büyüdüğüm şehirde okumayı düşünüyordum. Ama puanım yetmediği için mecburen urfaya gitmek zorunda kaldım. Oranın da sosyal imkanları zayıftı kendimi tam yetiştirdiğime inanmadım. Hani sadece diploma değildir çünkü üniversite."

Similar to the success rates in OKS or SBS, the performance that is shown in the university entrance exam cannot be independent from the socio-economic differences among students. As discussed before, the inequalities among secondary schools and uneven socio-economic conditions among students resulted in “*choices of necessity*” where students are forced to make preferences according to their exam score which is the embodiment of forms of capital.

İnal (2008) claims that the exam system should be considered as a tool of neo-liberal ideology which determines the quality as an outcome of the exams (pp.262). According to him, exams are used only for the assessment and evaluation of the exam score, not for the structural conditions that prepare the grounds of the outcome (İnal, 2008, 263). If we apply to the arguments of Bourdieu, there is an important role of economic, social and cultural capital in determining the outcome of these exams. In that sense, faculties of education and faculties of arts and sciences are coming to the fore as optimal preferences for students who can access an average level of education that is attained by moderate costs. It is related to the economic conditions of families – material conditions of existence- which in turn determine their level of investment to their childrens’ educational background. Most of interviewees that I have interviewed have grown up in working class families in which fathers are either workers or public servants⁷².

3.4 Teachers’ Training System

It has already been stated that university preferences are mostly determined by centralized exams in the Turkish Education system. Moreover, university preference and the underlying reasons for these preferences have been discussed. In this part, the teacher training system is going to be analysed. In article 43 of the National Education Basic Act, the teaching profession is defined as an occupation that requires professional education that is obtained through higher education (MONE, 1973). Since 1982, teacher training schools / institutions have been delegated to higher education institutions and only faculties of education have been authorized for teacher training even though a few exceptions were stated in related

⁷² Especially, the occupations of fathers are taken into account, because only mothers of three interviewees are working. Two mothers are teachers and the other one is working in private sector.

by-laws and regulations (The Council of Higher Education [YÖK], 2007, p. 9). There is a general criterion stating that teacher training curricula has to include courses related with general culture, pedagogical formation⁷³ and the professional field that is going to be specialized (MONE, 1973, Art. 43).

In secondary education, students who early on decided to be a teacher also have options to get an education based on teacher training courses. Anatolian Teacher Training High schools are one kind of vocational school which specifically give teaching education and prepare students for education faculties. Students who want to be a teacher decide to go to these schools and become more advantageous if they prefer enrolling in any one of faculties of education. In case of choosing any other faculties, student's scores in the exam are decreased so they may become disadvantageous in university entrance exams. Two of the interviewees graduated from Anatolian Teacher Training high schools. When I asked why they would like to be teacher, graduating from Anatolian Teacher Training high school is the first reason (Tuğba, 28; Fikret, 34). However, Fikret (34) said that since there were serious unequal success criteria among high schools in calculation of exam scores⁷⁴, there is not any option for students of teacher training high schools except choosing education faculties. Recently, Anatolia Teachers Training High Schools began to lose their significance because teacher training necessitates a level of higher education and there is no specific reference to teacher training in secondary education (TED, 2010, p. 6).

Besides faculties of education, the right to be a teacher has also been given to people who have graduated from different departments so as to meet the needs of teachers in the formal education system. Regarding the regulations of the Council of Higher Education which revised the teacher training program, students graduating

⁷³ Pedagogical formation certificates programmes are given by specific universities in specific fields that are determined by Ministry of National Education with respect to the need of teachers. These programmes are aimed to prepare prospective teachers by the guidance of education science courses covering education programmes and teaching, the management and planning of education, psychological counseling and guidance. Retrieved 10.01.2013 from: <http://www.yok.gov.tr/content/view/1276/>

⁷⁴ Until 2011, vocational and technical high schools were disadvantageous groups in university entrance exams because their schools success ratio would be decreased in calculation of scores. Students in vocational and technical high schools had to choose departments only related with their professional field in these schools. Thus their preferences had been limited since 1997 and students were forced to choose departments even they didn't want.

from faculties of arts and science have the chance to be a teacher if they are able to complete a non-thesis master program that is known as pedagogical formation program (MONE, 2007, p. 219). However, this right has been amended again and the priority of become a teacher is given to people who have graduated from faculties of education⁷⁵.

As a closer look at the reasons of new regulations, the MONE justified their decision on the grounds that there are nearly 200.000 students enrolled in 187 faculties of Arts and Science and there is urgent need to decrease the number of students who want to be a teacher in the existing system⁷⁶. However, since 1997 many students have preferred to enter faculties of arts and sciences with the hope that they are going to be appointed as teacher. It is stated that the new regulation will not damage the rights of prospective teachers who had already obtained their pedagogical formation certificates. There is also a large number of people who plan to apply to pedagogical formation programs in following days even though they do not exactly know whether they have the right to be appointed or not.

3.4.1 The Differences between Faculty of Education and Faculty of Arts and Sciences in Teaching Profession

Even though the priority of appointment is given to teachers who have graduated from faculties of education, there is a large number of people graduating from faculties of arts and science who are still waiting to be appointed⁷⁷. Students are placed in universities in accordance with their exam scores as well as the base points of departments. It is crucial to note that base points of faculties of education are a bit

⁷⁵ For up-to-date regulations of MONE see: <http://oyegm.MONE.gov.tr/www/talim-terbiye-kurulu-80-nolu-karari/icerik/35>

⁷⁶ A great number of news were published about the new amendments of MONE: Retrieved from: <http://www.haberturk.com/polemik/haber/736357-ogretmen-adaylarina-kotu-haber>

⁷⁷ Current number of students in Faculties of Arts and Sciences are announced nearly two hundred thousands. And they are excused from the recent amendments. In last ten years, it is claimed that the number of faculties of arts and sciences increase by % 67.12 and the number of graduates increase nearly by %45.
<http://www.radikal.com.tr/Radikal.aspx?aType=RadikalDetayV3&ArticleID=1086301>

higher than base points of faculties of arts and sciences⁷⁸. Generally, students who can not get adequate exam score for faculties of education prefer going to faculties of arts and sciences. Although there is a few points difference between the base points of these faculties, students make their choices with the hope of becoming a teacher after graduation. Considering psychological pressures of exam preparation, many students are not inclined to prepare for university entrance exams for another year even if they have to unwillingly study in a department. University preferences, especially made in accordance with exam scores, will determine job opportunities in the future. However, it is very difficult to predict which teaching branches will be more needed and which branches will not be appointed for in the following years. For instance, with the latest decision of the MONE, the quotas for prospective teachers who have graduated from faculties of arts and sciences have decreased⁷⁹. Even today, it is not certain whether graduates of faculties of arts and sciences will be appointed⁸⁰

In the field research, Zeynep (28), Esra (32), Özlem(30), Sedef (35), Engin (36), Öznur(32) and Okan(36) have graduated from faculties of Science and Arts and aimed to be appointed as teachers. Except one of them (Zeynep), all interviewees have got a pedagogical formation certificate which gives them a chance to become teachers. Although Zeynep (28) had thought to apply for the pedagogical formation program, she said that she had totally lost her hope to be appointed as a teacher when the pedagogical formation was annulled. And Zeynep (28) expressed her regret about preferring the faculty of arts and science as follows:

In that case, number of university educated unemployed people will rise and I would never go to university. Because I would not gain anything from that. Instead, you can find in the private sector to develop your skills and at least you have a profession. You need to be aware going to Faculty of Arts and

⁷⁸ For a comparative data there is need to look at the base points of related departments of these two faculties see also:

<http://www.osym.gov.tr/dosya/1-58862/h/bolum1lisans.pdf>

⁷⁹ Milli Eğitim Bakanlığına Bağlı Eğitim Kurumlarına Öğretmen Olarak Atanacakların Atamalarına Esas Olan Alanlar ile Mezun oldukları Yüksek Öğretim Programları ve Aylık Karşılığı Okutulacak Derslere İlişkin Esaslar Talim Terbiye Kurulu 80 Nolu Karar <http://oyegm.MONE.gov.tr/www/talim-terbiye-kurulu-80-nolu-karari/icerik/35>

⁸⁰ Latest news state that there will be division of cadres in schools for these two groups. It is allged that graduates of faculties of arts and sciences will still be apointed to secondary education schools. <http://www.egitimtercihi.com/spot/6390-ogretmen-atamalari-sil-bastan-duzenleniyor.html>

*Sciences. I am not aware, but nobody said anything to me. You know everything changes in three months in this country. If I was there, I had never gone to the university. What can I make of being a graduate of Arts and Sciences?*⁸¹

According to Okan (36), the graduates from faculties of arts and education are handicapped by the MONE because they open these faculties to more student than are necessary for the education system. Sedef (35) also raises her criticism towards state policies and asks: “Why did they give me certificate which entitles me to become a class teacher? And why then punish me and take away my right to be a teacher? (Sedef, 35) The anger in her words can be seen in each teacher who graduated from faculties of arts and sciences:

*How funny it is that the state does not have a well settled system. Education is the most changing field. Education has become a game, I mean the state defines a right one day and then takes it back the next day. Can a given right be taken back? The State gave me a certificate to work as classroom teacher. Then they declared that I could not work as a classroom teacher after 2006. Did I change or did the education that you gave me change? Why did they give me a certificate? So the state does not trust the quality of certificate that it already gave me.*⁸²

When I asked for job opportunities rather than being teacher, they answered with same question? What will I be? The words of Öznur (32) clearly show how the system makes them unaware of their job qualifications,

*In fact, we did not know what else qualified teachers of Geography could do? In university, our professors said something about how graduates of Geography could find other jobs. Even it is not possible in Turkey, I know that graduates from department of Geography can find alternatives, but in Turkey we can only be a teacher. So I arranged everthing according to this expectation.*⁸³

⁸¹ Zeynep: “Mezunu işsiz çoğalacak ya ben olsam hiç üniversiteye gitmem. Çünkü hiçbirşey kazandırmayacak bana. Git sanayi de kendini geliştir en azından bir mesleği olun. Adam gelmesin fen-edebiyata bilinçli olarak gitsinler. Ben farkındayım bana hiçbir şekilde böyle bişey denmedi ki. Biliyorsunuz 3 ayda herşey değişiyor bu ülkede. Ben olsam üni'ye hiç gitmezdim. Ne yapım fen-edebiyattan mezun olup da”.

⁸² Sedef: “Ne kadar komik ki devlet bir şeye sahip değil oturaklı bir şeye sahip değil. Özellikle en çok oynadığı sey eğitim. Yani bir ülkenin eğitimi bu kadar oyuncak olur mu? Bir gün veriyor bir gün alıyor. Verilen hak geri alınır mı sen bana ilkokul öğretmenliği verdin sonra diyorsun ki 2006 dan sonra yapamazsın.niye ne değişti? Ben mi değiştim verdiğin eğitim mi değişti. O verdiğin belgeyi neden verdin. Sen verdiğin diplomaya mı güvenmiyorsunuz.”

⁸³ Öznur: “Cografya mezunları başka ne iş yapar bilmiyorduk aslında. Üni deyken hocalar biraz bahsetti. Bölüm mezunları başka işler de yapabilir Türkiye de olmasa bile yurtdışında mesela baksa işler yapıyorlar. Onu biliyoruz ama burada sadece öğretmenlik yapabiliriz bu bölümde. O yuzden kendimi bu beklentiye gore ayarladım.”

Although people from faculties of Arts and Science have also made a great effort to either apply to pedagogical formation programs or get acceptance to these programs, most graduates of education faculties are against the appointment of these people as teachers.

Interviewees who graduated from a Faculty of Education claim that only teachers who graduated from these faculties should be appointed as teachers to public schools. According to some interviewees, the recruitment of teachers from Faculty of Arts and Science has influenced the quality of education negatively. For instance, Hülya (30) and Ebru (31) emphasized that teaching practices of those who were not trained in a Faculty of education would decrease the quality of education. Even though this opinion is not totally shared by most teachers, the discourse of Ebru (31) shows to what extent people are inclined to marginalize or accuse others when they thought that they were threatened unfairly. Ebru (31) explained her disapproval of these people:

Although a graduate of a faculty of science and arts has a lot of chances to find jobs, they are also getting pedagogical formation. You know we have no chance to work for another private institution. Or we have no chance to be appointed to another public institution. Either you will be appointed as a teacher or you will work as a salesman. We have no other alternatives. Although the graduates of a faculty of arts and science have chances to work in other places, they seize our chances. Thus I support the new regulation (...) There was unjust application. I entered university with high scores but they could not. S/he got pedagogical formation and then s/he will be in the same position or conditions. That is unfair.”⁸⁴

Considering the abolishment of right to be teacher for those who graduate from Faculties of Arts and Science, it is indeed a controversial issue that separates specialists and academicians into two separate camps:⁸⁵ while one group claims that

⁸⁴ Ebru: “O dertten çok müzdaribiz aslında. Zaten şeye çok karşıydım: sonucta fen-edeb fakültesi bitiriyorda zaten gidip bir sürü iş imkanı varken onlar da gidip formasyon alıyorlar. Zaten bizim başka bir özeldede çalışma imkanımız yok. Ya da başka bir devlet kurumuna atanma ihtimalimiz yok. Ya öğretmen olarak atanacaksın ya da gideceksin tezgahtarlık yapacaksın. Bizim bir ikinci alternatimiz yok. Ama fen-edeb başka başka yerlerde devlet kurumlarında çalışabilecekken onlar gidip bizim hakkımıza tecavüz ediyor. O yüzden bu yasanın çıkması benim çok hosuma gitti (...). Zaten orda bir adaletsizlik var. Ben yüksek puanla girmişim adam düşük puanla girmiş ondan sonra gidip formasyon almış, gelmiş benimle aynı kategoride aynı şartlarda eşit şartlarda... yok böyle bişey.”

⁸⁵ For several examples of these debates see also: <http://www.radikal.com.tr/Radikal.aspx?aType=RadikalDetayV3&ArticleID=1086301&CategoryID=77> and <http://forum.memurlar.net/konu/1515699/>

people who graduated from a Faculty of Arts and Science are eligible to be teachers, the other group insisted that the teaching profession should be carried out only by professionals who have graduated from a Faculty of Education. Similar to Ebru's ideas, Ali (30) emphasized the difference between two faculties:

Everyone should do their own job. Graduates of a faculty of education must train and become teachers but graduates of arts and science should be scientists. The graduates of Mathematics can work as a statistition or a bank employee but I don't have a lot of opportunities. Education is an area of expertise so it needs to be done by an expert. Well, we registered with the university with high scores. I should be appointed firstly because I registered the university with high scores and got a specialized education to become a teacher.⁸⁶

The marginalization of other people who have graduated from different faculties is an important indicator showing the social polarization. For instance Hülya (30) underestimated the professional knowledge of those who had not graduated from Faculty of Education. However, the threats of labor market are common for teachers regardless of which faculty they graduated from.

3.4.2 The Critiques towards Public Personnel Selection Examination System and the Conditions of the Appointment

Starting from primary education, exams dominate and determine the whole lives of individuals. Even after graduation, people are again confronted with exams to prove their language skills or professional competences so as to find a job both in the private and public sectors. A person who plans his/her education career through the various kinds of exams is also expected to prove that she/he is eligible to get a job with her/his occupational knowledge and skills. Public Personnel Selection Examination (PPSE hereafter) is a kind of central exam that is designed for selection and placement of individuals to positions in state institutions. This exam is compulsory for every individual who would like to work in state institutions. According to article 4 in Civil servants Law No 657, teachers are appointed to

⁸⁶ Ali: “Şimdi herkes kendi işini yapmalı. Eğitim fakültesi mezunları eğitim işini yapsın, eğitimci olsun. Fen- edeb fak de bilim insanı olsun. Kaldı ki matematik mezunları bir istatistikçilik yapabiliyor ya da ne bileyim bankaya da girebilir. Ama bizim alanımız biraz daha az. Eğitim bir uzmanlık mesleğidir bir uzmanlık gerektiriyor. Yani biz sonucta yüksek puanlarla girmişiz üniversiteye. Yüksek puanla girmişim bunun eğitimini öğretimini görmüşüm öncelilk benim hakkım.”

openings as public servants whose social protections and social benefits are stated in the same law (MONE, 1965).

While prospective teachers could have become teachers right after they graduated from related faculties, PPSE has become as compulsory prerequisite for prospective teachers to be appointed to state schools since beginnings of the 2000s (Keskin, 2012a, p 167). With the application of this exam, unemployment of teachers has come to the fore due to the gap between the limited number of positions in state schools and the increasing number of prospective teachers (Keskin, 2012a, p. 167). According to statistics from 2011, nearly 278.000 prospective teachers applied to ÖSYM in order to enter PPSE⁸⁷ and this number grows apace year on year because of the limited number of positions determined by the MONE according to the need for teachers in state schools.

Table 1 below shows the striking difference between the number of applicants and the number of appointed teachers. As a result of this gap, teachers who are not appointed would either continue to take private education courses⁸⁸ for preparing the next PPSE or work in private education institutions for a nominal fee or work as a trainee teacher (Keskin, 2012a, p. 178).

Table 1 Number of Applicants and Appointments

The Period of Appointment	The number teachers who apply to be appointed	The number of teachers who can be appointed
2012- September	99.970	35.914
2012- February	79.490	15.934

(Source: MONE, 2012 Şubat ve Eylül Ayı Öğretmen Ataması Alan Bazında Minimum Puanlar⁸⁹)

⁸⁷ A Summary Report on PPSE in 2011. Retrieved from: <http://osym.gov.tr/dosya/1-57979/h/2011-kpss-sonuclarina-iliskin-ozet-degerlendirme.pdf>

⁸⁸ There are specific private education courses that prepare prospective teachers to PPEC. Their curriculum is prepared according to the subjects in PPSE and teachers are getting prepared through intensified class hours. The annual fees of these courses are varied from 1000 tl to 2500 tl.

⁸⁹ http://ikgm.MONE.gov.tr/sayisal_veriler.asp?ID=207

There are 97 specific teaching branches determined by the MONE⁹⁰. Teachers are appointed according to their own teaching branch only if they can get a base point which is specified by MONE⁹¹. Most interviewees stated that they are affected by limited numbers of positions in their own education branch⁹². Based on the teaching branch of interviewees, **Table 2** below indicates the number of teachers who are appointed to positions in specific teaching branches.

In **Table 2**, it is seen to what extent the base point is differentiated according to the different branches. While teachers of religious culture and pre-primary education can be appointed with exam scores in the 50s, teachers of physics and primary school teaching have to reach scores in the 90s. As seen in the table the minimum PPSE score is closely related with the number of opening positions in that branch. The openings of religious culture and pre-primary education are more than the other branches.

Table 2 Appointments by Teaching Branches

The name of Teaching Branch	Minimum PPSE score (base point) ⁹³	The number of applicants	The number appointed
Geography	77,44	1546	423
Religious Culture and Moral Knowledge ⁹⁴	55,003	1984	1822
Physics	88.811	1586	107

⁹⁰ Higher Education Institutions”. Retrieved from: <http://oyegm.MONE.gov.tr/www/alanlara-kaynak-olan-yuksekogretim-okullari/icerik/34>

⁹¹ “ Higher Education Institutions”. Retrieved from: <http://oyegm.MONE.gov.tr/www/alanlara-kaynak-olan-yuksekogretim-okullari/icerik/34>

⁹² The number of teachers who are needed in state schools is announced as nearly 120.000 by MONE Retrieved from: <http://kpsrehber.com/kpsshaber-520-meb-branslara-gore-ogretmen-ihiyacini-acikladi.html>. However it is alleged that this number does not represent the reality. According to education unions, thenumber of needed teachers in state schools reaches to approximately 300.000 http://www.turkegitimsen.org.tr/haber_goster.php?haber_id=14125

⁹³ Minimum based point is calculated over 100.

⁹⁴ The number of opening cadres for Religous, Culture and Moral Knowledge teachers has been gradually increased. While there were not any appointment in 2000 and 2001, the number of cadres was 630 in 2003. Under the JDP jurisdiction opening cadres reached to 1248 in 2010, and 1443 in 2011. (Comparative data can be found at : http://ikgm.meb.gov.tr/sayisal_veriler.asp?ID=207)

English	76,273	6362	2799
Maths	88,498	5445	1021
Biology	87,734	1902	158
Pre-Primary Education	57,886	5428	4148
Primary School Teaching	87,422	4378	324
Social Sciences	79,88	7586	2012
Turkish	81,205	9000	4385
History	82,327	3175	356

(Source: MONE, 10.09.2012 Tarihli Atamaya İlişkin Alan Bazında Sayısal Veriler)

Even though the MONE claims that the positions of branches in schools are opened with respect to the need of teachers, non-appointed teachers are inclined to think that the MONE has determined the positions ideologically and politically. Some interviewees thought that even the number of appointed religious culture teachers exceeds the need in the schools and these people are appointed to administrative positions in schools. Öznur (32) and Okan (36) criticized the decisions of the MONE:

In my opinion, it is not necessary that they give so much importance to religion teaching. I think that there can be appointments in that branch but it must not be much more than in other branches. They determine a need, they are saying it is necessary; but they are not saying about the courses which are necessary, for example they are saying that we need 8000 religion teachers so they determine that need but they do not care about other needs.⁹⁵

[W]ho opened these universities, who will employ these students? The state will. When they say that they won't take it on, it's their responsibility. Actually, the state says that it can not employ everyone, the state implements a policy of denial. They have to take some responsibility. For whom does the state act? (...) The State acts on behalf of those who vote on behalf of state.

⁹⁵ Öznur: "Yani dine çok fazla ağırlık vermelerini gereksiz buluyorum. Hani o konudada alım olsun ama bazı branşların önüne geçmemeli diye düşünüyorum yani önemli olan branşların önüne geçmemeli. Bir de ihtiyaç belirliyorlar mesela, su kadar ihtiyaç var diyorlar mesela gerekli olan dersler hakkında demiyorlar da mesela 8000 din öğretmenine ihtiyacımız var diyorlar. Yani o ihtiyacı belirliyorlar ama öteki ihtiyaçları belirlemiyorlar."

*The crowd is clear and the government make all its investments for them. For example Religious Affairs. They transfer financial resources to them.*⁹⁶

Since the Justice and Development Party is associated with Islamic values and tradition, some teachers are inclined to think that the MONE makes ideological decisions which have resulted in political favouritism. In this regard, Okan (36) explains that:

*In fact, those who are appointed do not work as teachers. They are working as administrative staff and they are promoted to principal or vice principal (...)For example, I know there are people the became vice principals as soon as their internship period had finished. On the other hand, someone who has worked as a teacher for ten years can't get a promotion to the position of vice principal. This happens as they do not approach the science of education in a neutral way. This happens as they seek how to make my friends rich, not looking to education in an impartial, scientific way. It is also motivated by the concern appointing people who vote for them to higher offices*⁹⁷

The content and method of the PPSE is another issue that is criticized by all of teachers. All teachers, from different teaching branches, are responsible for the same subjects in the exam. For teachers, the PPSE is two-stage exam and has included topics related to general culture, general ability and educational science.⁹⁸ While the courses on educational sciences are common ground for a teaching education, teachers cannot be good at all of these subjects because their educational formations are differentiated. For instance, to get high scores in mathematics is hard for Tuğba (28) who is good at social sciences.

⁹⁶ Okan: “Sonra bu üniversiteleri kim açtı, bunların hepsini kim işe alacak devlet işe alacak. Almıyorum dediği zaman onun getireceği bir sorumluluk var. Zaten almıyorum diyor sürekli inkar politikası. Yani elini biraz taşın altına koyması gerekiyor. Onu da hangi kitle için yapacak?(...) kendisine oy verecek kitle belli bütün yatırımlarını da onun üzerine yapıyor. Mesela diyanet işleri felan. Kaynakları onlara aktarıyor. İstese bu sorunu çözer ama kafasında tarttığı zaman çözmeye degeceğini düşünmüyor mevcut system.”

⁹⁷ Okan: “Zaten bu atanalar öğretmenlik coğu yapmıyorlar. İdari kadroya çekiliyor müdür yapıyor müdür yard. Yapılıyor(...) Ben çevremden biliyorum mesela stajer öğretmenliği kalkar kalkmaz müdür yard yapanlar var. Ama diğer taraftan adama 10 senedir öğretmenlik yapmış idari görev verilmiyor. İşte bu eğitime tarafsız bilimsel bakmamaktan oluyor. Ben çevremi nasıl zengin ederim. Bana oy verecek insanları nasıl üst tabakalara getirebilirim.”

⁹⁸ The first session included two tests: a test for general culture and a test for general abilities. These tests comprise of questions about mathematics, history, geography, Turkish and contemporary general culture (ÖSYM, 2012a).

I felt anxious during the PSSE because I did not know mathematics. I do not want to study math. If I had studied PPSE, my point of view could have changed. I am so sorry for people who study for the KPSS every year. Because, they solve such different questions from different subjects that you are shocked. You look at the education science questions and you think that the question are found in space or you ask where they come from.”⁹⁹

The system of exams is seen as unfair and inconvenient for the evaluation of teachers’ professionalism. The logic of the exam is explained as a competition between unequal people by Emir (29). Rather than assessing teachers according to their professional field, PPSE obligates people to enter into a race which is designed to eliminate most of them. Deniz (30) paid attention to the point that the exam system does not care about psychologies or feelings of people during the exam period which lasted at most 4 hours.

[T]hey do not make me responsible for Math, it is not my teaching branch. It is the biggest problem in this exam. They do not care how you are during exam. Your mother may have died, your father may have died, They do not care how you feel during the exam.¹⁰⁰

Nonetheless, Esra (32) and Hatice (29) stated that there must be an exam in order to eliminate people but its content or method should be revised. The ambiguity about the existence of PPSE is critical.

[T]he exam is significant in Turkey because there are a great number of graduates. It is necessary that someones is eliminated in a way. Not everybody can not be appointed. There are a lot of graduates in our field and most of them take an exam. Let me say people are successful in my teaching branch so are required to score well to be appointed...¹⁰¹

⁹⁹ Tuğba: “Sınavda çok kaygılandım çünkü ben gerçekten matematik bilmiyorum. Oturup da matematik çalışmak istemiyorum. Kpss çalışmış olsaydım olaya başka bir pencereden bakıyor olabilirdim. ben her sene hazırlananlara üzülüyorum. Çünkü o kadar hazırlanıp o kadar kaynaklar vs. çünkü o kadar değişik sorular, o kadar değişik şeyler geliyor ki karşına şaşırıyorsun. Eğitim bilimlerine bakıyorsun sorular uzaydan mı indi ya nerden geldi bu sorular.”

¹⁰⁰ Deniz: “Beni metamatikten sorumlu tutamaz bu benim branşım değil yani. Ki bu kitlesel sınavların en büyük handikapı da bu zaten.hani senin ne yaşadığın çok da umrumda değil. Annen ölebilir, baban ölebilir hasta olup ölüyor olabilirsin adamı ilgilendirmiyor yani.”

¹⁰¹ Hatice: “Sınav Türkiye’de anlamlı çünkü mezun çok fazla. Bir şekilde birilerinin elenmesi gerekiyor. Herkesin atanması gibi bir durum yok. Bizim branşta mesela mezun sayısı fazla girenler de çok. Bizimkiler biraz başarılı diyelim. O nedenle puanlar çok yüksek.”

*It isn't necessary. But how will they be appointed? They can be appointed according to school points.*¹⁰²

Their emphasis on the need of elimination brings us to hegemonic discourse of new capitalist culture which reduces the problem to the individual's competence and success. On the other hand, the claims of cheating scandals during the PPSE in 2010 attracted peoples' attention to structural problems in the exam system. It was alleged that some prospective teachers had already known the questions before entering into the PPSE. According to these claims that appeared in mainstream media for months, it is thought that an electronic database of ÖSYM was hacked and some people could reach the questions before the exam¹⁰³. As a result of strong reactions from teachers' groups, education unions and NGOs, the ÖSYM annulled the education sciences session of PPSE¹⁰⁴ and an investigation was launched by prosecutor's office of Ankara and the State Supervisory Council¹⁰⁵. However, the investigation has not made progress for three years and there was no explanation about how questions could be stolen or who organized this crime. If we look at the hundreds of comments¹⁰⁶ in social media websites, after these cheating scandals people have become highly critical to ÖSYM because it could not take adequate security measures before and during the examination. Emir (29) and Osman (32) told of the unfair applications stemming from the cheating organization in 2010:

¹⁰² Esra: "Gerekli değil. Ama bunu da yapmak durumunda neye göre atayacak. Okul puanına göre atayabilir."

¹⁰³ Retrieved 10.01.2013 from: <http://www.milliyet.com.tr/kpss-ye-savcidan-kopya%20sorumlari/guncel/haberdetay/24.08.2010/1280245/default.htm>

¹⁰⁴ Retrieved 10.01.2013 from: <http://www.osym.gov.tr/belge/1-12135/2010-kpss-lisans-egitim-bilimleri-testinin-iptali-17092-.html>

¹⁰⁵ Retrieved 10.01.2013 from: <http://t24.com.tr/haber/2010-kpssdeki-kopyacilari-mit-bile-bulamadi/208033>

¹⁰⁶ www.eksisozluk.com, www.uludagsozluk.com, www.memurlar.net are important web forum websites in which people can share their comments. In that matter, hundreds of comments can be seen about cheating scandals. Especially, www.memurlar.net is used by people who would like to work in state institutions and prepare PSSE.

I would have got better scores according to the answers in that year when cheating occurred. A lot of people answered the questions correctly. I got lower scores than I expected.¹⁰⁷

In 2007, I achieved a serious success. I answered 102 of 120 questions in the part of Educational Science, it was a serious achievement. It was almost same in the General Skills questions. When the results of the exam were published, there was a strange thing. There was serious gap between true answers and wrong answers and we brought a suit against SSRC.¹⁰⁸

Individuals have made great effort in order to prepare for exams starting from their childhood as well as their adulthood. Besides unemployment worries, ongoing preparation periods for exams have had negative psychological effects upon nonappointed teachers. The accounts of psychological affects are mentioned as such:

I was overcome by serious illnesses psychologically. The PPSE devastated me. I studied all study materials all day and night long (...) I put on weight, around 30 kg, due to psychological medicines. I mean it destroyed my life. When I hear it, I get nervous. To draw away was the best.¹⁰⁹

It was a nightmare, my psychology was broken down. I felt devastated. I couldn't sleep, eat. I lost weight. After that, I overcome that.¹¹⁰

I took the exam every year but I wasn't successful. There is a line and I couldn't pass that line. You are preparing for the exam but you are nervous. It affects you. You are taking the exam but you do not want. Friends who got lower point than me were appointed.¹¹¹

¹⁰⁷ Emir: "Kopya olduğu sene yaptığım netlere göre çok iyi puan alıyordum aslında. O kadar çok kişi bütün soruları bildiği için. Standart sapma vs. Dersanede yaptığım netlerden daha yüksek net yaptım ama 75 puan geldi. Hani dersanede o netleri yaptığımda 83-85 alıyordum. Ama daha yüksek netle daha düşük puan aldım."

¹⁰⁸ Osman: "2007 yılında çok ciddi bir başarı sağladım. 120 eğitim sorusundan 102'sini yaptık, çok ciddi bir başarıydı. Genel yetenekte de keza öyle bir başarı vardı. Ama o sene sınav sonucu geldiğinde biraz tuhaflık vardı. ÖSYM'ye dava açtık çünkü gelen netler ve yanlışlar arasında sıkıntı vardı çok ciddi."

¹⁰⁹ Mikail (22): "Çok ağır hastalıklarda atlattım psikolojik olarak. Kpss mahvetti beni. Piyasada kaynak bırakmadım yani. Hepsine gece gündüz çalıştım. 60 kilodaydım bu ilaçların bu psikiyatri etkisiyle 90 kilo oldum. Bir sene dolmadan 30 kiloya yakın kilo aldım. Beni tam anlamıyla mahvetti yani hayatımı yıktı bu kpss. Duyunca bile stres oluyorum. En iyisi ondan uzaklaşmaktı."

¹¹⁰ Deniz (30): "Rüyalarım girdi artık psikolojim bozuldu. Çok yıprandım hırpaladım kendimi. Uyuyamıyordum yemek yiyemiyordum kilo kaybettim."

¹¹¹ Fikret (34): "Ben her yıl sınava girdim kal payı da kaçtı. Yani 80-85 arası puanlarla öyle gitti. Genelde bir sınır var ondan yukarı almak lazım ben de alamadım. Sınava hazırlanıyorsun, moralin bozuk. Onun da etkileri var. Sınava giriyosun zaten içinden yapmak gelmiyor. Benden daha düşük alan arkadaşlar atandı."

The statements of interviewees show that PPSE is not a fair mechanism for the assessment of teachers' professional skills or abilities. The same questions in the PPSE are prepared for all teachers even though they are specialized in different branches. It means that every prospective teacher can not compete with each other equally. Some can easily get higher scores than others; some teachers have great difficulty compared to the others. However, the higher scores in the PPSE are not only variable on the road to being appointed. The number of positions determined by the MONE also affects the possibility of appointment. In that case, the decisions and regulations of MONE come to the fore. The scandals in PPSE exams diminished the public's sense of fair assessment as well as led to a sentiment that appointments are made improperly. Hence, many of the interviewees point the need to eliminate PPSE and making appointments in other ways that are fair.

3.5 The Forms of Employment and Working Conditions of the Non-Appointed Teachers

Parallel to recent transformations in the education system, neo-liberal structural adjustment policies have given way to radical transformation of an educator's labor in terms of their forms of employment and working conditions. Even though it is known that flexible working conditions are part of the privatized labor market, teachers are faced with non-standard forms of employment in public sector too. Due to the increasing number of graduate prospective teachers and a limited number of open positions, prospective teachers do not only face unemployment but also insecurity¹¹² both in the public and private sectors through the elimination of their social rights and benefits. The aim of this thesis is confined to the experiences and perceptions of non-appointed teachers who examine insecure working conditions. Thus, those who are not working but waiting to be appointed or those who do not want to become a teacher are not taken into account because the limits of the field of research. Firstly, flexible employment regimes and the working conditions in the public sector are to be understood in relation to the observations of interviewees who are paid teachers in public schools. Secondly, after drawing up the

¹¹² In that sense, Keskin's emphasis on "proletarianized" and "increasing unemployed" teacher is crucial. For a detailed discussion, please see Keskin, (2012a, p. 177).

general framework of private education institutions, the roles and working conditions of private education centers are going to be discussed in accordance with the thoughts of teachers working in private education centers. The aim is to analyze the relationship between forms of employment and insecure working conditions of teachers and to what extent teachers feel under insecure working conditions.

3.5.1 The Forms of Employment in the Public Sector and Working Conditions of the Non-Appointed Teachers

Article 4 of Civil Servant Law no.657 states that public services cannot be provided from personnel except those who are not employed in the four employment categories defined in the same article. The legal base of flexible working conditions for teachers can be traced back to 2006 with the appointment of 20,000 teachers as contract teachers in public schools in order to meet the need for teachers (MONE, 2005). A contract has included the rate of wages, the working period, duties and rights. The duration of time cannot exceed one education period, nearly 20 months (MONE, 2005). While the number of contract teachers was 20,134 in 2007, this number reached 73,950 in 2010¹¹³. Before general elections in 2011, the Council of Ministers has decided to appoint all contract teachers to state positions¹¹⁴.

Besides teachers who are appointed as civil servants whose rights and conditions are stated in article 4A (tenured teacher), currently there are different forms of employment which are associated with flexible working arrangements¹¹⁵. According to article 9 of a decree of the Council of Ministers no. 11350, the MONE can employ teachers on a temporary (contractual or pay-per-lesson) basis in the case

¹¹³ KESK, Kamuda Güvencesiz Çalışma Yaygınlaşıyor, 4.4.2010
<http://www.kesk.org.tr/taxonomy/term/13>

¹¹⁴ 632 Sayılı KHK Kapsamında Sözleşmeli Öğretmenlikten Kadrolu Öğretmenliğe Geçmek İçin Başvuru Yapan / Yapmayan Öğretmenlerimize Duyuru,4.6.2011
<http://personel.MONE.gov.tr/basinaciklamasi/632%20SAYILI%20KHK%20KAPSAMINDA.pdf>

¹¹⁵ Because contract teachers were transferred to tenured cadres specified by 4A by a decree of Council of Ministers No 632, this form of employment is not taken into account. Moreover, the positions of part-time temporary teachers were annuled by Council Of State before it began, so this position also is not taken into account. However, the variations among forms of employment in public sector are crucial to see intention of governments to transform public personnel regimes.

that the number of teachers in schools is inadequate¹¹⁶. According to interviewees, it can be claimed that the state itself tries to expand non-standard employment in public institutions too. The reasons for this statement are already mentioned above in the manner of the transformation of the public personnel regime in relation to reforms in public administration system. A closer look at the forms of employment show four types are coming to the fore; tenured teachers, master trainees, substitute teacher and paid teacher.

a. Tenured Teachers

These teachers are appointed according to prerequisites stated in article 48 of the Civil Servant Law No. 657 and rules stated in By-Laws on Teachers' Appointment and Replacement¹¹⁷. Considering the role of the PPSE in appointment conditions, teachers who can get higher score than the base point of the branch to which they are going to be appointed will be appointed to open positions in public schools. The Civil Servants Law No 657 specifies all rights and duties of public employees: general social rights such as social security, pensions, union rights and promotions; working hours, the content of leave (annual, sick or casual leave). By the 2011-2012 academic year, the Minister of MONE Ömer Dinçer make a statement that there are.

b. Master Trainee

Master trainees refer to the instructors to be assigned with duties in pre-primary institutions on a temporary (contractual) basis (MONE, 2012, p. XIV). Master trainees are employed based on the need for teachers in pre-primary schools and a contract is signed between them and related education directorates but the contract expires at the end of academic year if a teacher is appointed to the same position (Kuşaksız, 2011, p. 29). Wages are not paid in the summer and semester holidays (Kuşaksız, 2011, pç 29).

c. Substitute teacher

The term of substitute teacher is defined as a person who teaches a school class when a regular teacher is unavailable; e.g. because of illness, personal leave, or

¹¹⁶ MONE Yönetici ve Öğretmenlerinin Ders ve Ek Ders Saatlerine İlişkin Karar <http://www.MONE.gov.tr/mevzuat/liste.asp?ara=13&Submit=Listele>

¹¹⁷ MONE Öğretmenlerin Atama ve Yer Değiştirme Yönetmeliği, 4.3.2006, http://mevzuat.MONE.gov.tr/html/24076_0.html

other reasons. However, this term may be differentiated in different countries. In Turkey, substitute teachers are mostly employed as classroom teachers in the case that tenured teachers are unavailable for a temporary period (Article 86 in Civil Servant Law). Substitute teachers are assigned with personal rights of tenured teachers during working period. This means that master trainees can get wages close to tenured teachers' wages (2/3 of it). However, the MONE has preferred to employ paid teachers who are paid-per lesson instead of these teachers, because personnel costs are much lower than paid teachers (Şahin, 2008, p. 83). Since this position is not preferred by provincial district national education directorates, no related statistics and information stating current conditions of these teachers could be found.

d. Paid Teachers

A paid teacher is a kind of teacher who refers to the instructors to be assigned with duties in formal education institutions of the MONE on a pay-per-lesson basis. These people are employed according to article 89 of Civil Servants Law No 657¹¹⁸. Teaching hours and their wages are determined by decisions of the MONE (2006). According to these regulations, paid teachers are allowed to work at most 30 hours in schools and their wages are also specified by the MONE. Because these teachers work on pay-per-lesson basis, the payment of insurance premiums is calculated by dividing total teaching hours in a month (at most 120) to 7,5 which is maximum working hours in a day (Kuşaksız, 2011, p. 25). Paid teachers are deprived of social rights, benefits and protections which are guaranteed for tenured teachers specified in Civil Servant Law No 657. According recent statements of MONE, there are 53.453 paid teachers in formal education¹¹⁹. Since paid teachers have not signed any contract with related institutions, they become more disadvantaged than master trainees or contract teachers.

¹¹⁸ <http://www.mevzuat.adalet.gov.tr/html/388.html>

¹¹⁹ This statistic shows the data for April, 2012. MONE does not publish any official statistics about the numbers of paid teachers so the numbers vary. The information is only attained from statements by media channels. However, there exists a great variety of statistics given in these web-sites. The statements of Education Union have differentiated from these statistics. According to the, by 2012 the number of paid teachers are more than 60.000. <http://www.haberlermeb.net/haber/bakanlik/2011-2012-ucretli-ogretmen-sayisi/150.html>. and <http://www.haberturk.com/polemik/haber/709459-ucretli-ogretmenlik-kalkiyor-uzmanlar-ne-diyor>. Minister of National Education, Ömer Dinçer claims that the number of paid teachers in the being of 2012-2013 academic year has decreased 13.000. <http://www.memurlar.net/haber/318175/>.

In the scope of field research, paid teachers' views about their working conditions will be given. The differentiation in their thoughts and interpretations is understood due to the absence of rules and regulations about different types of employment. According to interviewees, insecure working conditions of paid teachers can be associated with the uncertain work period and the lack of specific working contract. When the worst side of being a paid teacher is asked, Özlem (30) answered that *"it's the temporary nature and irregularity of social insurance. It does not have any guarantee. It is not definite what will be happening next year."*¹²⁰ The uncertain work period and unknown working relations is caused by the lack of contracts signed between teachers and provincial/district national education directorates.

Based on article 9 of Civil Servant Law, the number of empty positions for paid teachers is announced by the Provincial or District National Education Directorates (Şahin, 2008, p. 83). After non-appointed teachers apply to related national education directorates, they can be assigned with the approval of the district governor only if there is need of teachers in public schools (Bayram, 2009, p. 37). In contrary to the centralized appointment of the MONE, provincial and district national education directorates are authorized to decide who is going to be assigned as paid teachers according to the need for teachers in their regions. However, the application process to directorates may be different. Since the prerequisites or application rules can be different, personal and arbitrary outcomes can exist.

While (27) claimed that her application was accepted according to her score in the PPSE, Tuğba (28) said that there weren't any specific criteria related with the scores in the PPSE, she added that *"I did not enter the exam thinking that I will be successful, I just entered to be able to apply to the provincial directorate of national education. However, I saw that there are those people who start to work without having a PPSE score"*¹²¹. In that case, different applications inevitably resulted in inequalities among teachers. These inequalities can be seen in the process of recruitment of paid teachers by provincial or district directorates of education in an

¹²⁰ Özlem: *"(...)geçici olması ve sigortanın tam yatmaması. Garantisi yok. Haziran bittikten sonra seneye ne olacağını belli değil."*

¹²¹ Tuğba: *"Ben kpss 'ye aslında kazanırım diye girmedim, ücretli öğretmenliğe başvurabilmek için kpss 'ye girdim. Ama hiçbir şekilde kpss belgesi olmadan girenler de var."*

unfair manner. The need of teachers in schools is forwarded to provincial national directorate of education and some teachers who have relatives or friends are more advantageous than others. According to Osman (32), Sedef (35) and Deniz (30):

[B]ecause my father wanted me to be a teacher, he called someone who has close relations with the political party in power now and asked them to help me to be appointed to open positions as a paid teacher, he arranged everything without my knowledge. To speak honestly they did help me. That's means this job was obtained by pulling strings for someone. This also means that not every person who from education faculties can become even a paid teacher easily.¹²²

There is no specific rule, even the vet can be a paid teacher or business school graduate person can be too. Even – and I don't exaggerate- high school graduate person was a teacher in Kars thanks to the kind help of someone.¹²³

[being a paid teacher] it's is not easy, belive me, because there is favoritism during application processes. Unfortunately, it is the reality. For example I worked in Artvin. You give a petition to provincial directorate for application. If you have strong relations, if you know people, they send you to a school in central places of the city; if not, you are sent to remote villages. Beside this, I'm a high school teacher but they sent me to the village for primary education level. It was really remote village, anyway because I was keen on working I went there.¹²⁴

Sedef's emphasis on "there is no specific rule" is adequate to show how the applications process can be arbitrary. In article 9 / (a) of the MONE's decision coded 11350, any person who are completed higher education can be assigned as paid teacher¹²⁵. According to Ebru (31), the problem of non-appointment of teachers firstly emerged as a result of the appointment of everyone who graduated from

¹²² Osman: "Babam dogal olarak çalışmamı istediği için benden habersiz biraz da işgüzarlığının da etkisiyle o dönemin siyasi iktidarının- ki hala da aynı iktidar- muhataplarını arayarak yardımcı olmalarını istedileri. İşin açıkçası oldular. Yani öyle olduğunu da biz bir şekilde meşrulaştırmıştık. Yani bu iş torpille oluyor. Yani her eğitim fak bitiren insan ücretli öğretmenlik dahi yapamayabiliyor. Yahutta mümkün değil çalışamayacağı yerlere gönderilebiliyor"

¹²³ Sedef: "Bunun bir kuralı yok. Bir veteriner mezunu da gidebilir, ya da bir işletme mezunu da gidebilir. Hatta ve hatta abartmıyorum karsta lise mezunu bir insana bile torpil sayesinde ilköğretim öğretmenliği verildi."

¹²⁴ Deniz: "o da çok kolay değil çünkü inan ki orda da torpil dönüyor. Maalesef öyle bir acık gercek var. Ben mesela Artvin'de yaptım. Bizim ilçeye dilekçe veriyosun milli eğitim müdürlüklerine orda eğer adamın varsa ilçeye veriyorlar, yoksa uzak köylere veriyorlar. Kaldı ki ben lise öğretmeniyim bir köy çıktı bana mesela. Orda bana köy çıktı, baya da uzak bir köy... Neyse ben hevesliyim ya böyle yeni mezunsun çalışacan felan filan"

¹²⁵ <http://www.MONE.gov.tr/mevzuat/liste.asp?ara=13&Submit=Listele>

higher education institutions. She said that “the people who graduated from agricultural engineering, botany and veterinary medicine were appointed as teachers and all unemployed people whoever they were became teachers at that time (...) yes graduating people from universities are professionals in their field but this does not mean that they can be educators”¹²⁶. This situation causes the degeneration of the teaching profession and this point will be analyzed in relation to the meaning of teaching profession.

When the worst side of being a paid teacher is asked, Özlem (30) answered that “*it is temporary and social insurance payments are not paid regularly. Paid teachers do not have any social security. Moreover, where you will work or when you will find a job are not known for sure*”¹²⁷. The temporary working conditions are explained by Sedef (35) as follows:

*[W]e did not work a whole year. Three months for the first education period, four months for the second period, it depends on the need for teachers. I have worked for a long time (...) Before this school, I have worked in two schools for one year, except this school, I always worked for three or four months.*¹²⁸

Due to the lack of specific working contract, the applications in the school can be different according to different school administrations. Some interviewees claim that paid teachers are obliged to take on extra work in the schools. For example, Okan (36) complained that paid teachers have to work more than the appointed teachers; he said “*in normal cases paid teachers are not responsible to be monitors out of class hours, but you cannot give this job to the tenured teachers, because they have rights. They could easily slam their fists on the table*”¹²⁹. Although we should talk about exploitation of teachers’ labor in general, teachers working

¹²⁶ Ebru: “*ki benim yengem var ziraat mühendisi- botanik mezunları, veterinerleri bilmem neleri cartu cartu o dönemlerde öğretmen olarak atadılar. Butun bu işsiz ortada kim varsa onları aldılar öğretmen olarak atadılar(...) [T]amam bir üniversite mezunu, bir iş sahibi ama eğitimci değil*”

¹²⁷ Özlem: “*geçici olması ve sigortanın tam yatmaması. Garantisi yok. Haziran bittikten sonra seneye ne olacağın belli değil. Hani hangi okula gideceğin veya beni bir yere yerleştirecekler mi sıkıntısı var.*”

¹²⁸ Sedef: “*Evet ama tum yıl da değil. Birinci dönem 3 ay ikinci dönem 4 ay vs. ihtiyaca göre haber veriliyor. Uzun süreli kaldığım oldu burası da böyle. Bundns önce de iki yerde bir yıl çalıştım onun dışındakiler hep 3 ay 4 ay 2 ay.*”

¹²⁹ Okan: “*Normalde ücretli öğretmenin nöbet tutması yasak. Ama kadrolu öğretmene nöbet tutturamazsın çünkü onun hakkı. Yeri geldiğinde masaya vurabiliyor.*”

under such precarious conditions are more vulnerable to exploitation of capitalist production relations.

The other problem in working conditions is related with geographic location of the schools that they have to work in. According to interviewees, teachers can only find empty positions in the schools which are placed in the suburban areas of the city or rural areas where living conditions are very hard.

Paid teachers have generally worked in troubled places in Ankara. For example, I have worked in Çinçin, İsmetpaşa¹³⁰ until now. These places are already the most dangerous places, almost every day we have witnessed troubles. You are in a tight situation and you have no legal rights as a teacher. You can not be even claim against or think differently from students' parents because when they make a complaint most probably you will be dismissed (...) For example you cannot find paid teachers working in the schools in Çankaya. Paid teachers work in Altındağ, Mamak, Doğantepe where troubled schools are located.¹³¹

Absolutely, there are empty positions for paid teachers in Altındağ, Mamak and Sincan. Nobody wants to be appointed to these places.¹³²

The school in which I taught was a village school. It was rural district called Yakup Abdal which is far away from Mamak and it is around Elmadağ Ski Center. This means that it is not in Ankara. I went there for one year and I had five classes. There were fifty students in each class (...) you have to go remote places by taking three buses. So the money that you get was only enough for transportation expenses. I applied many schools in which there is need for teachers, but people who has close friends [in national education directorates] can take the job.¹³³

In rural areas, people have to live under very poor conditions because of difficult climatic conditions and the inadequacy of infrastructure such as public

¹³⁰ These are streets in Ankara which are populated by poor and migrated people, especilly Kurds and Romans. These places are seen as dangerous places due to high crime rates and illegal events.

¹³¹ Okan: “en sorunlu okullarda çalışır ücretli öğretmenler. En zor işi yapar en düşük ücreti alır. Mesela Çankaya da ücretli öğretmen bulamazsınız. Sınıf öğretmenliği olsun çankayada kolay kolay ücretli öğretmen bulamazsınız. Altındagda mamakta dogantepe yani sorunlu okulların olduğu yerde ücretliler çalışıyor. Çünkü kadrolular oraya gitmek istemiyor.”

¹³² Tuğba: “Mamak altındag, Sincan gibi bölgelerde mutlaka mutlaka açık var. Kimse buralara atanamıyor zaten.”

¹³³ Emir: “Öğretmenlik yaptığım yer bir köy okuluydu. Yani Yakup abdal diye Ankara'nın bir ilçesi. Mamak'tan daha ilerde işte Elmadağ kayak merkezinin oralarda bir yerde. Ankara değil. Bir sene oraya gittim ve bes tane sınıfım vardı. Sınıflar ellişer kişi. Çocuklar 3er kişi oturuyor (...) Ankara'nın bir ucuna gidiyorsun, 3 vasıta yapman gerekiyor zaten aldığın para yol parasına gider. Birçok yere başvurduğum öğretmen açığı var ama herkes tanıdığını buluyor ve onlar işi kapıyor”

transportation and communication. Osman (32), who worked in a village school for three years, explained that “paid teachers are sent to the schools in the village by mountains where the roads were closed even when the weather is rainy; I’m not talking about snow.”¹³⁴ As also emphasized by Deniz (30), rural areas are a compulsory address for those do not have crony relations with people working in provincial directorates. This point will bring us to how social and cultural capital functions to intensify class differences among teachers. People who have strong social capital or social networks can find opening positions in schools which are close to their home or have comfortable working conditions.

The insufficient wage that is paid per lesson is an important variable to highlight the differences between tenured teachers and paid teachers. The paid teachers claim that they work as much as tenured teacher but they are paid a lot less than tenured teachers and they thought that they are treated unfairly. During holidays, their social insurance is interrupted and their wages are cut off. At the end of each academic year, paid teachers get employed and even then they are not sure whether they can be a teacher next year or not. For instance, Tuğba (28) said that teachers have to find temporary work during the summer. Because their wages are insufficient, all paid teachers stated that they inevitably become dependent to their families. Okan (36), having a one year old daughter, has to work as security guard in a private company at nights. On the other side, those who live with their parents said that the wage is not sufficient to live their own life. Osman (32) and Fikret (34), who work in private sector now, gave up their job while they were paid teacher because of the impossibility of reproducing their livelihoods.

*In fact, I started to work as a paid teacher. I would like to benefit from the social insurance. I was thinking like that. I could not earn enough money. Moreover, the social insurance premium is not fully paid. So, I decided to study for the PPSE.*¹³⁵

¹³⁴ Osman: “Yahutta mümkün değil çalışamayacağı yerlere gönderilebiliyor. Dağ köylerine, yağmur yagsa yolunun kapandığı, kar demiyorum, yağmur yagsa yolunun kapandığı bir köye gönderiliyor”

¹³⁵ Fikret: “Orda da baktım ben hadi sosyal sigortadan yararlanım diye aslında. Biraz da o şekilde düşünüyordum. Gittim orda 8 saat bir gün mü sayılıyordu öyle bir şeydi ben yani bir yıl da çalışsam olmuyor yani bir şekilde olmuyordu. Aldığım para zaten yol parası olarak gidiyordu. Baktım hiçbir karım yok o yuzden dedim sınava çalışım.”

*I live in a place that is far away from school so I had to get on three different buses to come to school but I could not get sufficient wage to cover these expenses. Thank God there was a teacher who lived near my house. He took me the school or half of my money would be spent on the commute. My aim was experience. I would like to see what the teachers did, how the working environment was eg...*¹³⁶

Paid teachers who are married are able to manage their lives with their couples. In Turkey, mainstream understanding of gender assigns responsibility of being breadwinner to males. In the case of Okan (36), a man is forced to find extra jobs and have to earn the sufficient wage not only for him but for his family. On the other hand, women paid teachers who are married are seen as confident because the contributions of their husbands form the family budget. Even though Öznur (32), Sevim (27) and Sedef (35) complained about the inadequacy of the wage that is paid to them, they are relatively comfortable in comparison to single women teachers. It is important to note that gender role differentiates their socio-economic and cultural positions in their daily life.

The indeterminacy and the temporality of working times force them to be ready for every possible outcome. Paid teachers who have to work in different schools within a same year always refresh their knowledge and adapt themselves to the new conditions. This situation has led to new working stories that have started again and again. Therefore, the experience gained through work is continuously refreshed when they start to work in different school with new working partners and new students. Sedef (35) explained this:

*[T]he experience does not matter for them [the officials in provincial directorate]. The important thing is that there must be a teacher during class without questioning whether the teacher is good or not. It does not matter how you teach. My class did not have a teacher for the next year, even though I know the learning level of my class I asked the directorate to appoint me to the same class but they did not.*¹³⁷

¹³⁶ Emir: “Ankaranın bir ucuna gidiyorsun, 3 vasıta yapman gerekiyor zaten aldığın para yol parasına gider. Allaha okulda bir öğretmen vardı bizim yakınlarda biryerde oturuyordu, yoksa aldığım paranın yarısından fazlası yol parasına verecektim zaten. Benim ordaki amacım tecrübe edinmekti. Hani bir yere atanırsam ortamı görürüm, işte öğretmenler ne yapıyorlar planlar felan filan. Bunları görürüm.”

¹³⁷ Sedef: “Onlar için deneyimin hiçbir önemi yok. Önemli olan bu sınıfta boş kalmasın bir öğretmen olsun, hani ne yaparsın iyimisedir kötü müsündür. Nasıl eğitim verirsin... aynı sınıfımın bir sonraki sene gene öğretmeni yoktu ve o sınıfı istediğim halde hiç olmazsa seviyelerini biliyorum, bana bu sınıfı verin dediğim halde vermediler. Bunun bir kuralı yok.”

The expressions and comments of paid teachers depend largely on the negative outcomes of this form of employment. The uncertain work period and lack of specific contract make them to feel like they're in insecure working conditions. All paid teachers talked to me assuming that their jobs are temporary. The indeterminacy and insecurity resulting from working conditions prove that these kinds of jobs can not be done for a long term period.

From the application stage till they lose their job, the positions of paid teachers are characterized by insecurity. Teachers are exposed to some humiliating behavior like provincial and district national education directors' preferential treatment to those who are close to them and school administrators' arbitrary manners. The degree of humiliation will be analyzed in the context of characters of teachers. Paid teachers think that they are not treated equally with tenured teachers because they were not able to get a high enough score to be appointed and they are not paid as much as tenured teachers. These circumstances cause hierarchic differentiation between paid ones and tenured ones.

Paid teaching is a form of employment that teachers are bound to accept in order not to be unemployed or to find time to study for PPSE. Unfortunately, paid teachers' insecure working conditions do not allow them to have free time that paid teachers want. Moreover, it obliges teachers to seek or find another job. While young and single teachers who want to make time to study for the PPSE feel dependent to their parents, married female teachers feel dependent to their husband and to do their duties in the home, they bear this job's conditions. As mentioned before, in the precarious working relationship, this circumstance shows why the women labor force is preferred more. When we take all these circumstances into account, we must underline that paid teaching is an obligatory choice for unemployed teachers and their working conditions are felt to be miserable because of this obligation.

3.5.2 The Working Conditions of Teachers in the Private Education Centers

Private funding institutions have increased at an even greater rate both in formal and non-formal education. While the number of private schools is quite limited in formal education compared to private education institutions in non-formal

education¹³⁸; in general, privatization of education services in both sectors resulted in similar outcomes for the working conditions of teachers. There are different types of schools or institutions in the private education sector and the working conditions of teachers can be different even though they are regulated by the same law and by-law¹³⁹.

In Turkey, there are nearly 50,000 teachers are working in private education institutions (MONE, 2010). A comparison of the statistics between formal education and non formal education institutions show that while number of students per teacher in non-formal education institutions is 41, the number of students per teacher in formal education is only 8. This indicates that teachers in private non-formal institutions have a more intense work load than teachers working in private schools in formal education. However, this does not mean that teachers working in private formal institutions have sufficient wages, or they are not exploited. It has to be noted that the new labor market aims to expand insecure working relations for all types of employment. In particular, privatization policies in the education sector have transformed teachers' labor in recent times.

When a closer examination of private education centers takes place, the number of teachers working in PECs is around 50,000 (MONE, 2010) and currently over one million students are enrolled in these institutions¹⁴⁰. These numbers indicate that these institutions are important working places in the private education sector. As emphasized by Keskin (2012b), who analyzes the extent of “*shadow education*” in Turkey, private education centers and various private courses in which education is sold or purchased have expanded the grounds of privatization by legitimizing private education in social subconscious (p. 130).

The establishment of PECs was traced back to 1965 with enactment of Private Education Law no.665¹⁴¹. Even though the functions of these institutions

¹³⁸ In formal education, 4664 schools are private in total 46.427. However, in non-formal education there are 11.669 private education institutions in total 13.738 institutions. This statistic show that private sector dominates non-formal education institutions (MONE, 2011, Örgün eğitim, 48)

¹³⁹ Private Education Institution Law no 5580, MONE By-law on Private Education Institution http://mevzuat.MONE.gov.tr/html/ozel1/28239_.html

¹⁴⁰ Eğitim-Sen 2012-2013 Eğitim Öğretim Yılı Başında Eğitimin Durumu http://www.egitimsen.org.tr/ekler/5b823ac353d2df7_ek.pdf?tipi=3&turu=X&sube=0

¹⁴¹ Öz-De-Bir/ Tarihçemiz: <http://www.ozdebir.org.tr/tarihcemiz-c-2.html>

have been interrupted due to political reasons, they have continued their functions since 1984. Until the 1990s, PECs were profitable places for teachers due to the lack of competition in the private education market and the supply of teachers. Teachers preferred either working in PECs as an extra job or they voluntarily resigned from their jobs in state schools in order to work in these centers for better income. However, increasing demand for PECs led to increasing number of PECs and market competition among PECs inevitably worsened the working conditions for teachers and the quality of education. Moreover, with the increasing number of graduate teachers, non-appointed teachers were forced to work in PECs (Keskin, 2012, pp 154-160). As emphasized by Keskin (2012b), non-appointed teachers would become a reserve army of unemployed for the PECs (pp. 154-160). Growing numbers of teachers who are considered as a skilled labor force are found to be exploited under very hard working conditions.

Besides the Private Education Institutions Law no. 5580 and the Bylaws on Private education Institutions, employee personal benefits and working conditions of teachers are also regulated by Labor Law no. 4857, the By-laws on Private Education Centers and other legal documents issued by the MONE about personnel affairs and discipline matters (Keskin, 2012, 155). In the following statements, the deviations from legal rules and regulations are going to be understood from the working experiences of interviewees.

In article 9 of the Private Education Institutions Law, personal benefits and duties of the employee should be written into the personal employment contract in accordance with rules and regulations in related bylaws and laws (MONE, 2007, Article 49). It can be claimed that the legal framework enforces managers making fixed term contracts with teachers. The term of contract can not be less than one year except in a few situations and the contract should be renewed at the end of each year. At the end of contract period, the decision of whether it is renewed depends on employers' choices or preferences. It is crucial that teachers whose contract is renewed each year are deprived of retirement payment (Sosyal-İş, 2010) because the Labor Law states that "divisible amounts for a given time period relating to wages and other monetary benefits to be given to an employee working under a fixed-term contract shall be paid in proportion to the length of time during which the employee has worked" (Labor Law, 2003, Art. 12).

If we look at working experiences of interviewees who are working in PECs, it is understood that there are structural problems at these institutions that obliged teachers to work insecurely. Although the rules and regulations about working conditions in PECs are clarified further in related laws and bylaws, the application of these described in interviews are quite distant from the written rules and regulations. First of all, according to rules stated in By-Laws on Private Education Institution, a contract should be issued in three copies and one of them should be given to employees¹⁴². However, most of managers of PECs do not show the contract to their employees. Just two interviewees had chance to read their employment contract and they both work in the same institution. However, most of the interviewees said that they were not allowed to read their contract.

I did not have any chance to read my working contract, in fact they did not allow me to read it. Even if they let me read the contract, they somehow interpret the principles in the ways whatever they want, because the manager are professional in this matter. That means the contract and the reality does not match each other¹⁴³.

You cannot get a copy of employment contract. I couldn't get any copy of the contract from any institutions that I worked for. I asked, but I couldn't. Even this year, I signed a document from the beginning in which "I resign my job on my own will" is written. If they need a reason to fire me, they already got a document prove that I resigned.¹⁴⁴

The law states that the fixed term contracts are to be cancelled unilaterally with a valid reason, thus employers and employees have right to break the contract with a just cause (SOSYAL-İŞ, 2010). In the articles 24 and 25 of Labor Law, just causes are specified in terms of reasons of health; immoral, dishonourable and malicious conduct. However, the meaning of "just cause" is ambiguous and depends on who interprets the termination. Employers are inclined to misuse this rule in order to fire employees easily and this inevitably brings about employment insecurity for teachers.

¹⁴² 28239 sayılı yönetmelik http://mevzuat.MONE.gov.tr/html/ozell/28239_.html

¹⁴³ Zeynep (38): "valla okuma şansım hiç olmadı daha dogrusu hiç okutmadılar ki okutsalar da artık profesyonel olmuşlar bu konuda adamlar. Birşekilde altüst etmeyi biliyorlar. Yani sözleşme ile gerçekte hiçbiri birbirine uymuyor."

¹⁴⁴ Esra (32): "sözleşme nüshası alamazsın. Ben çalıştığım hiçbir yerde sözleşme nüshası alamadım. Talep ettiğim oldu ama alamadım. Hatta bu yıl burada baştan bişey imzalıyoruz, kendi isteğimle istifa ediyorum diye hazır dilekçemizi imzalıyoruz. Ellerinde bir gerekçe olsa ben istifa etmişim gibi dilekçe var ellerinde."

*They wanted me sign something, a contract, but I learned later it would be invalid legally. That contract frightened me because I did not know anything at that time. They added a clause in the contract which states that even if a person will leave his job, he promised to pay compensation.*¹⁴⁵

*The employment contracts are unilateral. The boss can break the rules of contract and he can fire an employee on his own will. The rights are so limited legally.*¹⁴⁶

The employees who have not even read their contract are also lacking knowledge of the rights that they have. Fikret (34) explained this: “We signed the contract but we did not read what rights we have”¹⁴⁷. It has two meanings: teachers are obliged to do everything that managers want and they are left unable to express their rights and to know their benefits.

It is important to bear in mind those teachers who are politically organized are highly conscious about their rights. For instance Osman (32) and Tuğba (28) become aware of their rights and benefits because they have very close relations with a teachers’ union and they are members of an organization of non-appointed teachers. Osman (32) explained the reality of contract as follows:

*[T]he contracts are one-sided and the managers can break the contracts as they want. They can dismiss the people. Their rights are quite limited. The managers always threaten you with unemployment.*¹⁴⁸

The duties and liabilities of employees in PECs are stated in the articles 6-19 of By-Laws on Private Education Centers¹⁴⁹. Employees can not be assigned any tasks except those stated in article 14. However, some interviewees said that they had to do all kinds of job besides teaching. According to Osman (32), teachers are

¹⁴⁵ Erhan: “bir şey imzalatıyorlar bize bir sözleşme imzalanıyor ama sonradan öğrendim onun bir geçerliliğinin olmadığını hukuki olarak. O sözleşme de korkutuyor insanı o dönem bilmediğimiz için hani ayrılmak istiyorsun ama adam sana madde koymuş: ayrılırsa işte su kadar tazminat ödeyecektir felan. Bilmediğin için de korkuyorsun gidiyorsun.”

¹⁴⁶ Osman: “Sözleşmeler tek taraflı patron dilediği gibi sözleşmeyi bozabiliyor, kişinin işine son verebiliyor, yasal anlamda hakları son derece sınırlı.”

¹⁴⁷ Fikret: “imzaladık ama sözleşmenin hakları neydi ne değildi hiç okumadık.”

¹⁴⁸ Osman: “Sözleşmeler tek taraflı patron dilediği gibi sözleşmeyi bozabiliyor, kişinin işine son verebiliyor, yasal anlamda hakları son derece sınırlı, sürekli dışarıdaki işsiz seninle tehdit edebiliyor.”

¹⁴⁹ The By-Laws on Private Education Center was annulled in March 20, 2012. After this annulment, Bylaws on Private Education Institutions will take place.

<http://www.egitimmezuat.com/index.php/20091126607/Yonetmelik/mlli-etm-bakanlii-ozel-dershaneler-yoenetmel-rg2110200927383.html>

subjected to double exploitation in PECS. For instance Osman (32) could not get his money, although he wrote six question books and he was fired because he discussed this issue with his employer. Before getting fired, he had worked without any social insurance for six months. The extra work which is not defined as teachers' duties can be observed in the following statement of Ebru (31):

(...) You are not teacher there. You both distribute brochures and interview the parents to make thir chilren enroll. We disributed a lot of brochures. We were going in front of schools and distributing brochures to students. Why were you doing this? Because, they gave a lot of money.¹⁵⁰

Teachers in private education centers are subject to Labor Law with respect to their personal rights / benefits and the Social Security and General Health Insurance Law no 5510 with respect to their social insurance. Even though the legal framework makes the fixed term contract compulsory between employer and employee; some employers avoid signing any contract with their employees. Since the fixed term contract has to include the salaries of teachers, working hours and additional payments for social insurances, institutions incline to employ teachers without contractual relations. Whereas the MONE make it obligatory for PECs to prepare a contract and pay social insurance during internship periods¹⁵¹, prospective teachers who have to complete their one year internship are employed without any social insurance and personal rights. This has been misused by employers is to pay social insurance contributions lesser than the amount specified in Social Insurance Act no 506. In Labor Law, it is stated that social insurance contributions levied on wages shall continue to be paid (2003, art. 32). Osman (32) defines the working process in PECS as fraud. He calimed that state does not seriously control PECs, thus managers can easily employ teachers without employment contracts and with the least amount of payments for social security. It means that for a teacher who earns a wage over 1200 Turkish liras, social insurance contribution is intentionally measured from 700 Turkishliras as the official minimum wage. This apparently damages the social

¹⁵⁰ Ebru: “(...) sen sadece öğretmen değilsin orda, hem broşür dağıtıyorsun hem de veliler kayıt yaptırmak için görüşmeler yapıyorsun. Ama broşür felan çok dağıttık. Okullara gidiyoruz, okullarının kapısına gidiyorsun kapıda çıkan öğrencilere broşür dağıtıyorsun. Ha orda da insanlar niye bunu yutuyor verdiği maaş ciddi anlamda iyiydi.”

¹⁵¹ Özel Öğretim Kurumlarında Görevlendirilen Personelin İşlemleri ile Sicil ve Disiplin Amirleri Hakkında Yönerge. This obligation is regulated in Article 28 of Bylaws of MONE.
http://mevzuat.MONE.gov.tr/html/2626_0.html

pensions of the teachers when they will retire. Hatice (29) has worked for one year without having any social security, even though she was misinformed that the social insurance contributions were paid. Hatice (29) who thought she was deceived said that she could not be aware of this situation while she was working.

In article 31 of the By-laws on Private Education Institutions, it is stated that employers have to pay the wages of employers on a timely basis¹⁵². The wages and payment of extra working hours are regulated by articles 31 and 41 in Labor Law no 4857 and it is stated that “*wages must be paid on a monthly basis at the latest*” and “*wages for each hour of overtime shall be remunerated at one and a half times the normal hourly rate*” (2003). Alongside the fact that teachers could not get any payments for extra working hours, they could not even get their wages on a timely basis. Zeynep (28) said that wages are paid so late and she is grateful that at least a wage is paid. She also complained about the deduction in wages due to being late for class or not being ready during tuition hours¹⁵³. For new graduated teachers who have to complete their internship period, very low wages are offered by employers. Erhan (32), who immediately worked in PECs after graduation, said that he had to accept approximately 300 Turkish liras without social benefits. The employer offered him two alternatives: paying a wage for each hour or paying only social insurance contributions. He accepted to work for a nominal fee in which his wage for each hour was just 1.5 Turkish liras. Teachers who were new graduates and inexperienced said that they had either difficulty to get their money or never got their wage. Fikret (34) also accepted very low wage in order to complete his internship period and he stated that he has never received his wages on time. Esra (32) and Ebru (31) indicated that they have had serious difficulties in receiving their wages at the beginning. Esra (32), who has worked in seven different institutions in ten years, could not make any effort legally to get her wage because she thought that it would be useless.

The reasons including an increasing number of unemployed teachers and escalation of competition among PECs directly affect the wages of teachers in this sector. As quoted from Hülya (30), her manager clearly enunciated that all teachers who are not appointed by the state are working in private sector due to these

¹⁵² http://mevzuat.MONE.gov.tr/html/ozel1/28239_.html

¹⁵³ Etude hours are given for helping students to solve their problems in the exams or tests. These hours are not included the working hours of teachers paid by institutions.

managers. As stated by all teachers, the state avoids the financial burden of education system and paves the way for the development of private sector. The wages are determined by private market conditions. There is need to say that the wage may be differentiated in accordance with working experiences, the branches of teachers and customer profile of Private Education Institutions. For instance teachers who work in small private education centers have to accept lesser wages than those working in largest private education institutions. Ebru (31) who work in small PECs in Batıkent said that the money that she got was only adequate for buying soup or tea. That means her wage is only adequate for her daily needs.

The working hours of teachers are specified as being 40 hours at most in one week (Article 30 of By-Laws on PEI). Weekly course hours have to be written into the contract and overtime work shall be remunerated at one and a half times the normal hourly rate. In most PECs, the working hours not only exceed weekly working hours specified in by-laws, over time work is also not paid to teachers as well as the payments for extra jobs. In real life, weekly working hours may reach to sixty or seventy. Inhuman working conditions described by Osman (32) as follows:

*The working conditions are very tough. There are people who work from 07.30 to 20:00. the questions are written but the courses don't give money for this. These are made in exchange for more salary. Normally, it is necessary to pay a copyright fee. There are a lot of students studying. You carrying out face to face tuition with the students. A fee isn't paid for this. The course markets not only its own possibilities but also teachers.*¹⁵⁴

Working hours are putting real pressures upon teachers at these centers. On the other hand, the wage paid per hour offered to teachers is identified at unbelievable numbers. Fikret (34) and Erhan (32) explained that they had to work for wages around 300 or 400 Turkish liras although they were responsible for weekly 40 or 50 hours. Hülya (30) also stated that during the class hours they are not even allowed to sit. In one institution that she worked at before, she heard that “being ill is forbidden and being dead is free”¹⁵⁵. This slogan is clearly shows to what extent

¹⁵⁴ Osman: “*Fakat çalışma koşulları çok daha ağır. Sabah 7.bucuk akşam 7- 8 e kadar çalışanlar var 10 saat 12 saati buluyor. Soru yazılıyor yayın faaliyet olabilir bunlar için artık dersaneler herhangi bir telif ödemiyor veya para vermiyor. Daha çok maaş karşılığında yapılıyor böyle işler. Normalde telif ödenmesi gerekiyor. Bir sürü etüd yazılabiliyor. Öğrenci ile birebir etüd yazılabiliyor. Bunlar için herhangi bir ücret ödenmiyor. Dersane sadece kendi imkanlarını değil aslında öğretmenini de pazarlıyor.*”

¹⁵⁵ Hülya: “*hasta olmak yasak ölmek serbest.*”

employers in PECs can be cruel towards teachers. Teachers are also exposed to degrading treatment from their employers. Hülya (30) told that “*our boss said that when parents come to here, you should even mop the floor of the toilets*”¹⁵⁶. This is just one of the reasons for feeling worthless.

As enunciated by Osman, teachers’ labor is commodified in private education institutions. The ineffectiveness of students in exams is seen as the consequence of the ineffectivity or inadequacy of teacher’s training. Teachers are blamed by both employers and parents. The main problem that all teachers complained about is their positions between students and parents. The specific position of teachers before the parents is summarized by Zeynep (28) as follows;

*Am I satisfied? Of course, the private sector is always more difficult. At first the desires of students are prioritized however good you are. If student blames you for any reason, they fire you as soon as possible*¹⁵⁷.

This situation not only results in accusations but also results in being fired from the job. Because of the threat of dismissal, teachers are compelled to do everything as the employers order. Hülya (30) said that she felt uncomfortable when she had to lie the parents about their children’s success. Because the parents’ – namely customers- satisfaction has priority over teachers’ labor, so she had to satisfy the parents with the words what they want to hear. In private education sector where education services are purchased and sold, while students and families have become customer, teachers have become a seller. Since customers’ satisfaction has priority over everything, if teachers think otherwise, they do not have right to speak. The lower position of teachers towards parents is defined by Ali (22) as the most troublesome side of working in PECs. He represents a different case among other interviewees. He works under good conditions and earns much more than others said that the private sector enables teachers to earn a much better income than in the public sector. According to him, working conditions in private sector are not as bad or cruel as much as is claimed, if teachers could do his job very well s/he could easily determine his/her working conditions.

¹⁵⁶ Hülye: “*veliler geldiğinde tuvaletleri bile paspaslamalısınız.*”

¹⁵⁷ Zeynep: “*Memnun muyum tabii ki özel sektör her zaman zordur, önce öğrencinin isteği önemlidir sen ne kadar iyi olursan ol. Öğrenci bir şekilde sana iftira attığı zaman işin o an biter. O yüzden öğrenci merkezli kuruluşlar.*”

*[A]s said every time, if you allow people to fool you, they will take advantage of you. You are be carefull not to be donkey so that you do your job well in my opinion.*¹⁵⁸

As quoted by Ali, private education institutions are not considered as threat for those who gain a lot and move up the life standards. According to him, these conditions may be possible, if people know how they can be successful; and the more success and skills you have, the more money you get. It is the reason why Ali (22) does not want to work in state schools. This is the other side of the coin referring the class hierarchies among teachers in private sector. If we recall the hegemonic discourse of new capitalist culture, Ali (22) analyzed reasons of unemployment or worse working conditions as the outcome of individual failure. However, insecure and inhumane working conditions in PECs can only be grasped with the analysis of structural reasons which facilitate the exploitation of teachers' labor in private sector. The other important problem of PECs is arising from the control mechanisms of employers at these institutions. Teachers are not only controlled during the class hours, the employers or administrators also control them out-of class hours.

*[F]or example, I gave up break in the class and start to study my exam called KPSS. It is also considered as mistake/ crime. They said me 'you're a teacher in PECS and you are not allowed to study for state exam here.'*¹⁵⁹

*You are always standing, you don't have a luxury like sitting. There are the round windows on the door and while you are explaining lesson, you can see Jale Tezer's head. She never trusts. You have explained the lesson for 7-8 hours and you are sitting in the teachers room. It is a natural right. She says that those who sit, still sit and goes.*¹⁶⁰

The control mechanisms are embedded in the nature of capitalist working system. There are several control mechanisms in private education courses. According to Zeynep (28) and Hülya (30), the acts of teachers are closely monitored by employers during working hours. The other important mechanism is the exam scores of students. Teachers' success is evaluated and measured on the basis of

¹⁵⁸ Mikail: "Ama Hani derler ya sen eşek olursan semer vuran çok olur diye. Eşek olmamaya dikkat edeceksin onun için de işini iyi yapacaksın şahsi düşüncem."

¹⁵⁹ Zeynep (30): "Mesela biraz önce derse ara verdim ve kpss' çalışıyoruz bu bile suç yani. Sen dersane öğretmenisin kpss'ye burada çalışamazsın o bile problem yani."

¹⁶⁰ Hülya (30): "Sürekli ayaktasınız zaten oturma gibi bir lüksünüz yok hiçbir şekilde. Ve kapıların üzerinde yuvarlak kamera şeklinde camlar var ve siz anlatırken orada kocaman jale tezer kellesini görebilirsiniz. Hiçbir şekilde güvenmiyor. Ve düşünün 7 -8 saat derse girmişsiniz öğretmenler odasında oturuyosunuz bu insanın en dogal hakkıdır. Gelir oturanlar hala oturuyor der basar gider."

scores of their students. In other words, the success rate of students in the exams determines teachers's qualifications. The importance of exam scores can be seen in following statement:

For example, if the children are on the top at 29 of the 30 exams, and if they are unsuccessful at an exam, she asks what has happened. She is a very idealist person. She hasn't a thought that the student may make a few mistakes in science. In her opinion, the teachers could not teach. It is one opinion. You know if you make one mistake in maths, you make the whole question wrong. She couldn't accept it. It is always teachers' mistake. (Ali, 22)¹⁶¹

Albeit the workings conditions of paid teachers in public schools and teachers working in PECs are regulated by different legal frameworks, the expressions and statements of these teachers related to their works indicate that insecure and temporary working conditions are experienced in the same manner. The lack of a specific contract is common ground which cause uncertain and temporary working periods for them. The uncertain future of employment is also important variable along with the threat of unemployment. Paid teachers and teachers in PECs do not know whether they are going to work for the next year or not. While paid teachers have to re-apply to provincial or district national education directorates in each academic year, teachers in PECs hope to renew their contracts with their employers every year. While the number of weekly course hours of paid teachers is quite limited as opposed to teachers in PECs, they both complained about the lower wages. Both of them express that the wage is not adequate to manage their lives on their own. Likewise teachers in PECs do not get any extra payments for their over time work, the wage of paid teachers are paid per lesson and holidays are excluded from their monthly earnings. Both paid teachers and teachers working PECs are compulsorily choosing to work under these working conditions because they do not want to be unemployed. Although their working conditions are different, they are both experiencing precarious working conditions. The research field indicates that flexible and temporary forms of employment resulted in the instability of teachers' labor both in public and private sector. On the one hand there are teachers who can achieve higher incomes and experience upper class culture, on the other hand there

¹⁶¹ Ali (22): "Mesela matematikte 30 sınav yaptılarsa toplamda 29 unda en üstte gidiyorsa birinde düşüş yaşadığınızda ne oluyor diye soruyor. Çok idealist biri. Öğrenci fizikten birkaç yanlış yapmıştır diye bir düşüncesi yok, öğretmen öğretememiştir. Tek düşünce o. Metametikte bilirsiniz bir işlem hatasına bütün soru gider onu kabul edemiyor hiçbir zaman. Yanlış çıktığında öğretmenin hatası."

are the teachers who can not build a life because of poverty. Although we can say that a small minority do not face precarization due to their skills and experience; in the context of constant change in experience and skills, there is a need to note that the welfare of such teachers are not secure. As a result, social, cultural and daily life of non-appointed teachers who are subjected to similar insecure working conditions are becoming insecure in a similar way.

CHAPTER IV

PRECARIOUS LIFE OF THE NON-APPOINTED TEACHERS

Today, prospective teachers have to cope with the threat of unemployment or the insecurity of precarious working conditions. With the acceleration of private education services and the growing number of university graduates from related teaching departments of universities, newly graduated novice teachers should be aware of the new working conditions and the new living standards awaiting them. As a result of the total precarization of labor regimes, non-appointed teachers are now getting used to the new forms of labor life: short-term, temporary, insecure and lower wages. However, working conditions are not confined to working place. Given the fact that the precarization of labor is not only considered as a withdrawal of the standard employment or the removal of social guarantees, it also brings about the precarization of daily life that is discontinuously redefined by risks, anxieties, uncertainties of flexible capitalism. This part is going to dwell upon the social, cultural and ideological effects of precarious working conditions upon non-appointed teachers. Some remarkable questions will frame the general lines of this chapter: Are non-appointed teachers defining themselves as teacher? How are they experiencing precarious employment in their daily life? How are they acting in a precarious condition? And how are they explaining the causes of problems of non-appointed teachers?

In the previous chapter, the precarious working conditions of non-appointed teachers are provided. Regarding their opinions about their working conditions, the field study confirms that teachers experience “flexibility” as “precariousness” because their everyday lives have clearly become “insecure”, “uncertain” and “temporary” under these working conditions. As claimed by Gramsci, working conditions cannot be independent from a specific way of living, mentality and perceptions (as cited in Forgacs, 2010, p. 359), we need to understand how their emotional world and perceptions are affected and how they interpret or mention their own situations. In order to understand the lines between working conditions and everyday life, firstly the attitudes of society towards teaching profession are going to

be retrieved from the viewpoints of teachers. Secondly, the hidden or concealed parts of their feelings and emotions are tried to be inferred by the affective impacts of work they have been experiencing. In relation with their self-perceptions and self-images, I aim to focus on social and cultural hierarchies stemming from different class positions. Since the problems of non-appointed teachers have become a hot debate in the political agenda of Turkey, their views about political solutions and political struggles will also be revealed.

4.1 The Meaning of Teaching as a Profession

In the last three decades, there have been great changes in the meanings of teaching. The ideal role of teachers as the founder image of modernism has now – shifted to a profession where being- unemployed is quite normal (Ertürk, 2010, p. 118). Teaching has taken place in lower positions in the hierarchy of occupations in new flexible capitalism. In Turkey, teaching profession is considered as a job that does not necessitate the capabilities such as taking risks, investing in personality and getting high level positions in working life. In the case of non-appointed teachers in Turkey, it can be claimed that the degradation of teaching profession is clearly associated with the loss of prestige enforced by new capitalist production relations. However, the loss of prestige is not associated with individual success or failure; it must be analyzed as a structural outcome of the education system in which huge numbers of graduated teachers have been forced to join the army of cheap labor force for private education sector. In this part how non-appointed teachers define the attitudes of society towards their profession and to what extent their opinions and thoughts are different from the rest of society is going to be analyzed.

The changes taking place in teachers laboring conditions relates back to our discussion on privatization. From the viewpoints of non-appointed teachers, we can understand how MONE policies form a hierarchy among teachers. Furthermore, within the current neoliberal context that shapes workers' lives, it is important to review the self-reflections of teachers regarding their profession as well as their opinion focused on how the society perceives teaching profession, and what teachers deduce from these perceptions.

Up to the last ten years, teaching professions was considered as one of the most stable and secure jobs in Turkey. However, the growing numbers of unappointed teachers dramatically changed this perception. The statements of interviewees show the changes in the meanings of teaching profession. According to Öznur (32) and Deniz (30), in the attitudes of society “*even if you cannot acquire any profession; at least you can be a teacher in Turkey*”¹⁶². According to them, in comparison to ten or twenty years ago, teaching profession has been decreased in value and not been considered as prestigious as medicine or architecture is now seen. They emphasized that the meaning and the importance of teaching profession are underestimated by society.

*[I]n the past it was seen more valuable. Now, it is only thought with ensuring position in public schools and seen as profession which has not got any value as much as in the past.*¹⁶³

*[W]hen I was student, according to my father and mother told, teachers were highly respected. However, I do not think that young parents respect to teachers nowadays and correspondingly students don not take their teachers' words seriously because of the attitudes of their parents.*¹⁶⁴

This situation can be explained by two factors: Private sector, which does not value teaching profession as a highly prestigious one, and the education policies, which increase the problems of teaching profession. Some of the interviewees clearly pointed out the role of government policies to devalorize the meaning of teaching profession in society. Ali (30), who thought that teachers were highly dignified in the early republican period, claimed that teachers are now under the attacks of ministry of education and Prime Minister. The claim that the government itself paved the way to degrade importance of teachers in the society is also emphasized by Engin (36). According to Ali (30), the policies of government challenge the authority of teachers in the system of education. For Okan (36), the degradation in the meaning of teaching profession is made by state consciously,

¹⁶² Öznur and Deniz: “*Türkiye’de hiçbir şey olamazsan, en azından öğretmen olursun*”

¹⁶³ Engin (36): “*eskiden daha değerli bir meslekti. Şu anda devlete kapağı at, kendimi garantiye alim diye düşünülen fakat eski değeri olmayan bir meslek haline geldi.*”

¹⁶⁴ Özlem(30) : “*benim zamanımdayken annem babam da anlatıyordu saygu fazlaydı annem babam da saygılıdır. Ama şu zaman da genç anne babalarda öğretmenlere karşı bir saygı olduğunu düşünmüyorum ben. Bu anne babanın tutumu çocuğa da yansıyor.*”

Well, teaching is in fact a good job. However, its career is despised in society. It is consciously despised because there are lots of graduates. There is a need to plan and revise education faculties again. They were left on their own for a long time¹⁶⁵.

On the other hand, the degradation in the meaning of teaching profession is explained in terms of “status” or “prestige”. Sevim (27) explained this as such:

Actually, let's not say degraded, [teaching profession's] status has been diminished. Other professions promise lots of money, status and prestige, while teaching profession stays in the background. You know what they say: “if you cannot become anything, becomes a teacher”. This [view] is widespread in Anatolia.¹⁶⁶

For some interviewees, the reason of this degradation is caused by teachers themselves. In their opinion, teachers working in public schools are not enthusiastic about developing their skills. Some of them are highly critical towards tenured teachers in the schools. However, private education institutions are seen as enforcing teachers to refresh their knowledge and improve their skills.

If I worked in a private school in Ankara, I would work hard and be so tired but I earn money rightfully. Do not get me wrong but teachers working in public schools, not all of them but most of them, do not work. Students are not actually enthusiastic so this is even better for those teachers. The private schools are different they measure the success of teachers¹⁶⁷.

If I am allowed to say that I saw teachers, who we call dinosaurs, are unqualified. There is no adequate education in public schools and the students are incompetent. This drives me away from working in the public schools. My conscience would not approve taking 2300 liras in my pocket and do my job and do not care about the rest. Private sector exhausts the teacher but you know you deserve the money you get.¹⁶⁸

¹⁶⁵ Okan (36): “ya öğretmenlik aslında iyi bir meslek. Ama toplumda artık şeyi, kariyeri düşmüş bir meslek. Biraz da bilinçli olarak düşürüldü. Mezunlar çok fazla. Plan yapılması gerekir eğitim fak tekrar elden geçirilmeli. Böyle başı boş bırakılmış uzun süredir.”

¹⁶⁶ Sevim: “Yada aslında rencide edildi demeyim de aşağıda kaldı statü olarak. Diğer meslekler çok fazla maddiyat getirirken çok fazla statu ve saygınlık getirirken öğretmenlik mesleği ikinci planda kaldı. Hani bu toplumda da soyle bir cümle vardır ya hic birsey olamıyorsa öğretmen olsun” bu anadoluda çok fazladır.”

¹⁶⁷ Ezgi (27): “Ankarada bir kolejde kadrolu çalışırsam çok yorulsam bile, ben çok yoruluyorum ama ben haram para yemiyorum. Ya devlette ki öğretmenler hepsi değil yanlış anlama lütfen çalışmıyorlar. Çocuk talep etmiyor bu da öğretmenin işine geliyor (...) ama kolej farklı, yani orda öğretmenin başarısını ölçüyorlar.”

¹⁶⁸ Sevim (27): “ya öğretmenlerin, sözüm meclisten dışarı hepsi tabii ki değil, özellikle dinazor diye tabir ettiğimiz öğretmenlerin boş olduklarını, hani belki haddi değil ama özellikle devlet okullarında eğitim verilmediğini, çocukların boş olduklarını gördüm. Bu da beni devlette çalışmamaya itti. Yani evet 2300 lira belki cebime alırım, hani vazifemi yaparım gerisi beni ilgilendirmez düşlemediğim için ben, vicdani olarak. Özel sektör öğretmeni yorar ama aldığın parayı hakkınla aldığını bilirsin”

The words of Ezgi (27) and Sevim (27) exemplify the dominant discourse that glorifies private sector and devalorize the public sector. However, it is critical to note that while non-appointed teachers become the victims of privatization policies, they are unconsciously legitimizing the neo-liberal discourse which exposes them to work under temporary, insecure working conditions. However, these expressions cannot be seen as only arising from their personal contradictions, they also resulted from contradictions embedded in religious, cultural norms and values encoded by the new capitalist culture itself.

4.2 The Dissolution of Occupational Belonging

Contrary to the approaches which glorify flexible working conditions in the new capitalist culture, non-appointed teachers want to be appointed as a tenured teacher and attain social rights and an employment security lasting for long years. Working in public sector is seen as decent work in Turkey and it is still most preferred way to lead a regular life. The statements of interviewees confirm that working in the public sector is guaranteed employment security, income security, job security and income security; whereas; precarious working relations keep non-appointed teachers distance from regular and stable life. The emotional world of non-appointed teachers is a reflection of the emotional world of unemployed people. A. Bora (2011) argues that in the unemployed white collar peoples' world, working gives a sense trust and security. It can be further argued that since non-appointed teachers could not feel belongingness and satisfaction in working, even when they work, they tend to share the emotional world of the unemployed people. As A. Bora (2011) points out, non-appointed teachers could not yet have a job to make sense of their lives (pp. 118-125). Because of unstable and temporary jobs, they cannot feel themselves the sense of belongingness to their profession, thus they can not build up their own life stories.

*I don't feel attached at all to the schools. I always feel like finishing the week or semester and getting out of there. Because there is no guarantee, I'm not tenured... We try to put it off. Just like counting days in a jail; day one, day two...*¹⁶⁹

¹⁶⁹ Öznur: "hic ait hissetmiyorum kendimi okullara. Ya böyle bir an önce bitecek su haftayı bitirim de su dönemi bitirimde surdan çıkayım diye düşünüyorum. Çünkü garantisi olmadığı için kadrolu

The fluidity of time in the new capitalist culture is already argued in the context of new capitalist culture. Sennett (2011) claims that the new institutional structure which was framed under the new capitalist culture prevents people from belonging to their work places. The interpretations and discourses of interviewees show that social ties with colleagues in the workplace and, loyalty to the job are corroded by the causalization of the workplace; and this results in the loss of occupational belonging for non-appointed teachers. Most interviewees say that they cannot see themselves as teacher. Some of them perceive themselves as “slaves” (Engin, 36; Tuğba, 28; Öznur, 32; Sevim, 27; Ali, 30; Ferdi, 24) To illustrate, Osman (32) said that he is not considered as a teacher in the eyes of society and his family. The occupational identity is crucial for them to belong to their jobs. During the interview, Öznur (32) asked why she could not see herself as a teacher even though she graduated from faculty of education. She also mentioned that being non-appointed does not mean being a real teacher in the eye of society. The most striking comparison is given by Zeynep (28). She stated that teachers who are working in PECs are ‘seasonal workers’ to her. She added that they have worked for ten months a year and they have only been paid for 9 months; and except these days they were considered as unemployed. She said; “*we are not seen as teacher. We worked much more than tenured teachers in the public schools, we are much more qualified than them but we belong to the working class, in fact we are not even working class, we are seasonal workers*”.¹⁷⁰ Their confusion about occupational identity is clearly seen in their analogies. For Tuğba (28) and Zeynep (28), being a teacher is analogically referred to both being a “slave” and a “seasonal worker”.

Lack of specific occupational identity brings about the need to prove themselves as a “teacher”. Sedef (35) thought that paid teachers need to prove their abilities and ambitions for teaching in schools against the experiences of tenured teachers. Rather than idealist attributions to teaching profession, the dissolution of identity may alienate non-appointed teachers from their jobs. This process of alienation was mentioned by some of interviewees. Emir (29) is one of them who

olamadığım için bir an bitsin diye sey yapıyoruz. Sanki böyle hapiste gün sayarmıs gibi şafak 1, şafak 2.”

¹⁷⁰ Zeynep: “*Biz öğretmen olarak görülüyoruz en çok milli eğitim hocalarından daha çok çalışıyoruz daha fazla bilgiye sahibiz ama işçi sınıfındayız hatta işçi sınıfında bile değiliz. Dönemlik işçi.*”

does not expect to pass PPSE and – began to work in the private sector. He said that “because I could not find appropriate job, I was getting alienated to teaching profession day by day”¹⁷¹. Fikret (34) also totally lost his hope for being tenured teacher; however, he continues to study for PPSE in order to find more secure job in public sector. The loss of occupational identity towards teaching profession led non-appointed teachers to regret for being teacher. Zeynep (28) explained her regret as:

*If I knew this would happen, I have not made great efforts to enter university and never studied at all. I would say that I am not educated, I am housewife’ and I bow to my fate. Now I am aware of that I am creeping. If you are not aware which conditions are better, you could be happier.*¹⁷²

The uneasiness and regret for not having a regular working life in the interviews reveal that this process is interpreted by teachers as a personal one. Not being a teacher in the eyes of public have certain psychic consequences for non appointed teachers. The analogy of being “a slave” and being “a seasonal worker” dramatically shows to what extent occupational identity is dissolved through the unsatisfying working conditions. The dissolution of occupational identity increases the alienation of non-appointed teachers from their work and also from their colleagues. In that case of erosion of social relations in work place, one can not mention solidarity, understanding or empathy among teachers.

4.3 The Character under the Precarious Working Conditions

This part explores how the characters of the teachers are determined and shaped in short-time, temporary and indeterminate working conditions. The self-perception of non-appointed teachers is closely related to what Erdoğan (2011) describes in reference to the white collar unemployed: Being constantly under the risk of unemployment, the self’s worth is tested with uncertainties and bounded with worries (p. 90). Precariousness is more like unemployment, as the problems of respect, self-esteem and shame of middle class unemployed are observable in the case of non-appointed teachers as well. Precarious working relations have influenced

¹⁷¹ Emir: “kendime uygun bir iş bulamadığım için öğretmenlik mesleğine gün be gün uzaklaştım”

¹⁷² Zeynep: “Eğer böyle olduğunu bilseydim üniversite kazanmak için bu kadar uğraşmazdım, hiç okumazdım. Okumadım ev hanımıyım der kaderime boyun eğdim ve ne veriliyorsa önüme onu yer otururdum yani o şekilde. Şu an bilinçli olup da sürünmek, kötü durumda olursun ama iyinin farkında olmazsın o yüzden bu sana çok acı vermez.”

their perceptions on “the self”. Subjects who are psychologically and morally determined by working relations are still need to be understood in a particular case of Turkey. In this part, the experience and self- perceptions of teachers are tried to be understood in relation to self-respect, self- esteem or devaluation of the “self”.

Firstly, non-appointed teachers cannot have self- respect due to not having been offered a tenure and thus not having employment security. Accord’ng to them, people generally th’nk that non-appointed teachers are failure and people do not respect them for this reason. For example, Deniz (30) is irritated by the views of tenured teachers in her schools. She described her anger “[tenured teachers] do not understand us and the worst thing is in their opinion we are responsible for not getting tenure. They say the state hires thirty thousand each year, if you can not be one of them, you are to blame”¹⁷³. On the other hand, paid teachers state that they are inevitably under the pressure of society. They complain about the attitudes shown by the closest peer groups, such as relatives, neighbors and friends.

*There is pressure coming from the society saying that “oh! Couldn’t you pass the exam”. Firstly they make an insinuation and then give me moral support insincerely.*¹⁷⁴

*[My] age is getting old, I am 36 years old, I understood that I cannot go on with my life like this. Being a paid teacher has not got any prestige in school because it is not promised a career.*¹⁷⁵

The attitudes of society towards teaching profession and their own opinions about their professions are already mentioned but these are also important variables for the maintenance of self-esteem. A. Bora notes the feeling of shame experienced by the unemployed white collar workers, who want to escape from others’ attention (A. Bora, 2011, 130). Likewise, non-appointed teachers emphasize their frustration regarding constant questions about their employment and try to escape from them. As emphasized by Okan (36), “building up a career is associated by prestige”¹⁷⁶ and

¹⁷³ Deniz: “Anlamıyorda işin kötüsü cunku ona göre suçlu sensin. Devlet alıyor atansaydın kardesim bak 30 bin tane alındı sen girememişsin kabahatlı sensin.”

¹⁷⁴ Deniz (30): “hani çevremizden bir baskı var. Cevrenin baskısı ay gene mi atanamadın diye önce bir laf sokma ardından a olsun canın sagolsun diye ortamı yumusatmaya çalışma gibi samimiyetsiz sözler.”

¹⁷⁵ Okan (36): “yaşım ilerliyor yani 36 yaşındayım hayatımı şu şekilde sürdüremeyeceğimi anladım. Ücretli öğretmenliğin okulda hiçbir saygınlığı hic bir kariyeri hiçbirseyi yok”

¹⁷⁶ Okan: “kariyer yapmak prestijle ilgili bir şey”

these codes are culturally re-produced by people and the expectations of families. For instance, Fikret (34) has decided to live in Ankara rather than living in his hometown because he felt depressed due to the rumors of people. It was observed that the expectations of family directly affects the preferences of interviewees. The sentence of “[in the eyes of our families]we were gold once upon a time, now we are turning into a mud”¹⁷⁷(Ferdi, 24) clearly shows the discrepancy between the expectations of family and the real possibilities. This point apparently reminds the structural mismatch between “aspirations” and “real probabilities” explained by Bourdieu, because the increases in the number of graduates without expansion of employment opportunities in labor market brought credential inflation and devaluation (Swartz, 2011, pp. 159-60). In order to avoid the feeling of “self” as *useless* and *devaluated*, they prefer working at least as a paid teacher, in order to be seen as a teacher at least in the eyes of their families. This motive is explained by Emir (29);

*My father wanted to see me as teacher very much, he supposed that I am a teacher. He knew that I was a paid teacher but at least you go to school and when you come back home and he could be happy even for this. I mean, he assumed that I am working as a teacher and teaching. I did because I want to make him happy.*¹⁷⁸

Many interviewees preferred to continue being a paid teacher rather than waiting at home without doing anything. Since new capitalist culture is based on talent, educated and skilled people confront the risk of unemployment and the feeling of *uselessness* that descends over like a nightmare. Regarding this nightmare, it is claimed that most of the non-appointed teachers have to choose to find teaching positions to feel themselves as teacher. Since their education and profession reflect their societal identity (A. Bora, 2011, 117), non-appointed teachers tend to accept lower paid and temporary work because of the feeling of being a teacher. However, effective and efficient use of time is also dictated by this dominant capitalist culture in which unemployment is seen as useless or an individual failure. Sedef (35) gave clues about how the feeling of uselessness is examined in relation to gender roles:

[F]or instance I'm a teacher – even if I'm a paid teacher- I do my profession, I can say I am useful. Not everyone cares about this. If you ask a housewife

¹⁷⁷ Ferdi: “ [ailesinin gözünde] Bir zanlar altındık şimdi çamura battık”

¹⁷⁸ Emir: “ babam çok istiyordu beni öğretmen olarak görmek. En azından o işi yaptığımı düşünüyordu. Ücretli öğretmenlik yaptığımı biliyordu ama en azından okula gidiyorsun, sen okuldan geliyorsun felan onun için büyük bir mutluluk. Hani öğretmenlik yapıyor, ders anlattığını düşünüyor ve mutlu oluyor. Onu biraz da mutlu etmek için.”

*she may prefer sitting at home rather than being of any help to society. But you have a diploma and ambition to work. When I do not do my job, I can not respect myself.*¹⁷⁹

Even though she did not accept to sit at home like housewives, she also stated that she does not want to work in the private sector because she had the responsibilities of her husband and her son.

The other reason decreasing the feeling of self-esteem can be associated with inequalities of working conditions. While paid teachers work as much as a tenured teacher, they get lower wages in comparison to them. Paid teachers claimed that their labor is seen more worthless compared to the others. Sevim (27) thought that being paid teacher beneath their dignity and it is insulting situation because of its lower incomes. Most of the non-appointed teachers could not earn enough money to manage their life, so they become dependent to their parents.

*[A]fter a certain age expecting pocket money from your parents and still living with them... Can't you work? Of course, yes. You may find a job in a café, you will be a waitress at least. This does not make sense for me. I have already a profession, I am educated to be a teacher. This being the case, I do not want to do an errand.*¹⁸⁰

Since dependency is attached with the laziness and inability (Sennett, 2010, 34), depending to family decreases self-esteem. While the family may be seen as an assurance for single teachers, married female teachers become dependent to their husbands. However, their feelings about their dependency were seen to below their dignity. Sedef (35) who is married and has an eight-year-old son told this situation as:

*Some times when we had very difficult periods, my husband told me "am I married to a university graduate housewife? There were days when our marriage got into troubles. We had days spent only with quarreling that time. He thought that I did not do my best and was not furious to pass the exam"*¹⁸¹

¹⁷⁹ Sedef: "Mesela ben ücretli öğretmenlik yapsam bile ben işimi yapıyorum ben bir işe yarıyorum diyorum. Herkes bunu düşünmez belki ev hanımına sorsanız bir işe yaramaktansa bütün gün evde oturmayı tercih edebilir. Ama sizin diplomanız var çalışma azminiz isteğiniz var. Yapmadığınız zaman ne oluyor kendime benim saygım kalmıyor"

¹⁸⁰ Deniz (30): "bir yastan sonra hala işte ailenle beraber onalrden harçlık beklemek yani... tabii ki çalışamaz mısın çalışırsın atıyorum gidersen bir kafede en kötüsü garsonluk yaparsın ama ne gerek var. Bu da bana çok mantıklı gelmiyor benim zaten bir işim var ben bunun eğitimini almışım o dururken abuk sabuk işler yapmak istemiyorum yani."

¹⁸¹ Sedef: "Artı hani onun gözüünde de bazı dönemlerde sıkıntıya girdiğiniz zaman "e üniversiteli ev hanımı ile mi evlendim." Onun sıkıntısını yaşadığımız evliliğimin kritik noktaları olduğu günler de oldu. Nerdeyse Birbirimize girdiğimiz çok kötü kavga ettiğimiz günler oldu. Sen işte gerekeni yapmıyorsun, hırslanmıyorsun, ders çalışmıyorsun işte istersen yaparsın felan(...)

My husband works and earns a living for the family. I was sure that I would have a tenure in 2010, but it did not happen. I was disappointed at that time. It is very hard to feel dependent on someone. If you are single it is better to feel dependency to your father than your husband. I have always had difficulty; even today I have a hard time¹⁸²

The loss of self-respect corresponds to the loss of self-confidence. The non-appointed teachers who can not create their own life stories are looking for ways to find other jobs. Okan (36) who has a one-year-old daughter, tries to find alternative ways to maintain his family. He is a paid teacher and he is both enrolled in open religious vocational high school¹⁸³ and social service department in open educational faculty at the same time. He has not found any chance to be appointed as a biology teacher. Therefore, he wants to try all possibilities in order to find a stable and regular job. On the one hand he envisages finding a job easier as a social worker; on the other hand he prepares to be an imam after high school graduation, if he fails to achieve the former. Working as a security guard at nights, this uneasy condition of Okan (32) can be taken as an illustration of the confusion created by uncertainty. Okan (32) needs a long term secure job and a valid professional identity in recognized by society.

Self-confidence is considered in conjunction with success getting in PPSE. Due to the high PPSE scores in their branches and the less number of quotas, Fikret (34) and Hülya (30) totally lost their self-confidence to get enough high scores to be appointed. Instead, they continue to study PPSE for being public servant in one of state institutions. Emir (29) who gave up taking PPSE prefers to work in private sector. Deniz (30) has entered to PPSE since 2008 and she could not be appointed since then. She said that she made application for a position to be a wardress even she does not want to be. All these interviewees, who are seeking for other jobs, stated that they did not choose to work in PECs due to the insecure and hard working

¹⁸² Öznur (32): “Eşim çalışıyor yine evi gecindiriyor. Ben 2010 da kesin kpss alırım atanırım diye düşünüyordum. Olmayınca tabi büyük hayal kırıklığı oldu. Yani evde birine bağlı olmak tabii ki çok zor. Baba olunca biraz daha farklı oluyor ama eş olunca biraz daha zor oluyor insan için. O konuda zorlanmışımdır, zorlandım ve hala da zorlanıyorum yani”

¹⁸³ This school also known as İmam Hatip High schools. People who graduated from these schools can be imam. The imam is Muslim religious leader and appointed by Directorate of Religious Affairs.

conditions. Rather than accepting the working conditions in PECs, they seek more secure jobs in other fields

On the other hand, for the ones who prefer only to be a teacher, being a paid teacher or working for PECs has become a necessary option. Considering class habitus determining the necessities that are internalized and inherent in the learning of conditions (Bourdieu, 1984, 170), precarious positions become compulsory choices for non-appointed teachers. Internalized frame of choices of necessity can be seen in statement of Öznur (32) who is coming from a small village in Trabzon:

*I do not think of what I can do because now I am only able to be a teacher and I want to be a teacher. Otherwise, I have sometimes thought what I could do but I could not find something that suits me (...) I do not trust in myself, to be honest. For instance, I was told to work in PEC for many times but I do not trust in myself in that issue either. Because working in a PEC is not an easy thing. Besides your day off, you need to be in the PEC everyday and this is very exhausting.*¹⁸⁴

As understood from her words, she describes her own situation as a result of her inability or lack of self-confidence. On the other hand, some interviewees seem that they do not have any troubles with their self-confidence. In the case of getting higher incomes, self-confidence or self-respect do not appear as a problem for character. For instance, Mikail (22) who gains sufficient¹⁸⁵ amount of money from private courses never wants to be appointed as tenured teacher any more. According to him, *“I never work in public sector even if state entreats me to be a tenured teacher.”*¹⁸⁶ Mikail (22) wishes to establish his own private education institution in future and being appointed as a tenured teacher will lay burdens on his career in private sector.

Parallel to the loss of self-confidence and self-respect, non-appointed teachers, who are compelled to seek for alternative jobs, experience depreciation in their professional knowledge. Given the account of “diploma inflation” described by

¹⁸⁴ Öznur : *“Bunun dışında bişey yapsam da ne yapabilirim diye dusundugum oldu ama yapabileceğim bişey bulamadım kendime gore bişey bulamadım (...)Kendime güvenmiyorum açıkcası, mesela dersanede de çalış diye çok söylendi de ama o konuda da kendime güvenmiyorum çünkü dersane çok kolay bişey degil haftanın bir günü boş onun dışında hep dersanede olacaksın ve bu çok yorucu bir iş.”*

¹⁸⁵ In the sense of sufficient means that his earnings enable Mikail to buy a new house, to make an investment to open his own education center and so on. He is overconfident about that he will never be unemployed as long as he is good at his job.

¹⁸⁶ Mikail: *“Devlet bana bu saatten sonra yalvarsa bile devlette çalışmam.”*

Bourdieu (1984), non-appointed teachers experience disenchantment because they could not attain social identity school system seems to promise (p. 144). Bourdieu (2009) also claims that the devaluation of academic diplomas is direct advantage of suppliers of jobs; in other words, diploma inflation is a structural de-skilling process which has been used for a long time (p. 143). “Diploma is more like a patent of nobility” and it proves the value of qualifications and “the victims of devaluation are disclined to perceive and acknowledge the devaluing of qualifications which are closely identified” (Bourdieu, 1984, p.142). Even though diploma has symbolic means to maintenance of social identity, non-appointed teachers state that their diplomas have no importance in current labor market.

I have not gone to my faculty to get my diploma yet. I do not feel like getting it because I do not think it works. I am not going to get (...) it is just a piece of paper and it does not serve to my purpose. Since I think like that, either I do not want to go or take it.¹⁸⁷

I wish I had intended to study technical education because employment opportunities are more than teaching profession (...) even if you prove your success in your working field, the value of our diploma is not as much as diploma of graduated people of technical education faculties.¹⁸⁸

The other side of the coin is that their diploma is seen as highly qualified for some jobs in labor market. Since it is taken as a proof of skilled labor, employers are inclined to avoid higher labor costs. This situation is exemplified by Deniz (30) as follows;

You can somehow be tenured or find a job, but being a scholar ties your hands in a way. To be frank, your degree cause you trouble. It happened to one of my friends, he applied for a job, and the guy said ‘we are looking for a high school graduate, not you.¹⁸⁹

On the other hand, the very existence of diploma limits the choices in front of teachers. For instance, while Deniz (30) believes that selling lemon on the street is

¹⁸⁷ Deniz (30): “Ben daha diplomamı bile almadım mesela. Gidip alalım bile gelmiyor.ki gerek de gormedim işe yaramayacak diye gidip almadım bile(...)kesinlikle bir lkağıt parçası hiçbir işe yaramıyor. Bunu dusundukce gitmek de istemiyorum almak da istemiyorum”

¹⁸⁸ Ferdi (24): “Dedim ya hani öncesinde teknik eğitim okumak isterdim. Çünkü dış tarafta iş imkanı daha fazla, yani teknik donanımı daha fazla(...) hani kendini ne kadar kanıtlamış olsan bir teknik eğitim fak aldığı diploma kadar bizim diplomamızın değeri yok”

¹⁸⁹ Deniz: “Tamam kadro iş güc bir şekilde bulunur ama hani okumıs olman bir yerde elini kolunu baglıyor yan. Diploman başına bela oluyor açıkcası. Benim bir arkadaşımın başına geldi mesela bir işyerine başvuruda bulunmus lise mezunu arıyorlarmıs adam demiş biz lise mezunu arıyoruz seni aramıyoruz.”

not shameful, she would still regret doing such a work. Furthermore, having worked as a waiter or a construction worker during his undergraduate studies, Osman now prefers not to work in such jobs because of the risk of coming across his students. Nevertheless, it can still be stated that many of the non-appointed teachers in Turkey are working in these job in order to sustain their lives.

As understood, the strongest correlation between the devaluation of diplomas and its psychological effects upon the character has been determined by the perceptions, values and the norms of cultural habitus. Contrary to the argument that education system enables upward social mobility among classes, in the case of teaching profession, majority of non-appointed teachers whose diplomas have the least relative value are destined to experience the dilemma; either work under precarious works or to be unemployed. Bourdieu (2009) well defined this dilemma as:

Greatest losers in the process of de-skilling process are those whose diplomas have least relative value in the hierarchy of diplomas and are most devalued. In some cases the qualification-holder finds he has no other way to defend the value of his qualification than to refuse to sell his labor power at the price offered; the decision to remain unemployed is then equivalent to a one-man strike (p. 143)

The disparities between their aspirations feeling when they graduated and the real outcomes finding themselves in working conditions have led to disenchanted characters that are incapable of making their own plans and realizing their dreams. To be appointed by MONE is still a priority for those who have not totally lost their hopes. The expectations and aspirations of interviewees are not independent from their socio- cultural positions in class hierarchies. The general framework of their future aspirations can be classified as the middle class habitus. Erdogan (2011) argues that experience of time varies between classes (p. 100). Teaching profession does not promise upward mobilization. Yet, with its relatively secure prospect of future, working long years until retirement in one job is an important goal. This is highly compatible with our field results. All interviewees emphasized firstly being appointed and then having a secure job which lasts long years. If we look what moderate middle class life represents in their perceptions, being appointed guarantees middle-class lifestyles in terms of having their own house, or a car (Tuğba, 28; Okan, 36; Özlem, 30).

Some interviewees are not motivated to make future plans. While Fikret (34) said that he cannot make any plans without having a guaranteed job, Deniz (30) also emphasized the need of feeling stability in her life. She explained her worries that “*I want to overcome constant moving and seek order and stability in my life. I may even sacrifice 3-5 months salary for that, at least I can find a regular and stable place.*”¹⁹⁰ Mikail (22) and Ezgi (27) talked about their career plans. While Ezgi (27) wishes to open his own private school after finding a proper position in any private college, Mikail (22) also desires to establish his own private education centers. The expectations of Öznur (32) are remained very naïve in comparison to Mikail and Ezgi. She wants to be appointed as soon as possible because she also wants to have a baby. Under precarious working conditions, mothers cannot have enough time and money for the baby-care.

Without any guarantees provided by a stable and secured job, it is hard to speak of the future. Their imaginations, aspirations and expectations are important variables to reveal to what extent precariousness determines their world of senses perceptions. At this point, some remarkable questions should come to the fore and be tried to be answered. What will happen to the people who cannot receive a recompense for their work, and both their abilities and their diplomas are regarded as insignificant in the eyes of society because of being appointed? In which terms are this characters created by unsecured working conditions involved in the recreating of “precariousness” in these circumstances or with which strategies does it problematize the epitome of this relationship?

4.4 The Socio-Cultural Hierarchies Existing among the Non-Appointed Teachers

There is a need to interpret the feelings of non-appointed teachers about their “selves” through the lens of class. As Skeggs (1997) points out, class relations should be considered intertwined with terms such as self-respect, value and dignity. The feelings and perceptions that can be observed in the daily practices of non-appointed teachers reflect the differences related to unequal class positions. In this respect,

¹⁹⁰ Deniz: “Düzen istiyorum, hayatımda artık bu göçebelik bitsin istiyorum, yerlesik düzene gecmek istiyorum. 3-5 ay maas bile istemiyorum yeter ki yerim yurdum belli olsun hayatım düzene girsin

there is a need to go beyond the psychological and psychic aspect towards intra-class and inter-class hierarchies in which emotions and meanings are produced and reproduced culturally. It is crucial to know that the social and cultural hierarchies in the same class positions are related to social and cultural capitals, and the variables relating to these forms of capital are directly determined by the condensation of economic capital in the last instance.

It is seen that the different forms of employment inevitably tend to create differentiated lifestyles or living standards for teachers. It should be stated that governance practices such as performance measurement and total quality management created professional hierarchies among teachers working in public sector. Further to this, the differentiation created between appointed and non-appointed teachers in public schools have very different impacts on non-appointed teachers. Regarding the statements of interviewees, most of the paid teachers feel to be discriminated by both the school administration and the tenured teachers in their schools. Thus, there is need to understand to what extent socio-cultural hierarchies and differences emerged among teachers and in which ways these can be analyzed with reference to their class positions. The class-based polarization is clearly reflected in the statements of Okan (36), who had to work as paid teacher for ten years in order to sustain his life:

Being a paid teacher has no prestige or career at school. Men at my age are school principals. Deputy Manager is one year younger than me, but he has more influence. He has job assurance and all. He says do this and do that. And you feel it much more when you gather with other teachers; that there is discrimination, a class discrimination. I already don't meet their families outside. I don't hang out much in the teachers' lounge either, and I don't want to talk to regulars, because you feel like a loser.¹⁹¹

He defined the discrimination between paid teachers and tenured teachers as a result of class differences. As seen in his statements, paid teachers are psychologically affected from the exclusionary attitudes of the tenured teachers in their schools. Even though Öznur (32) stated that they have not seen discriminatory attitudes in such a

¹⁹¹ Okan: “Ücretli öğretmenliğin okulda hiçbir saygınlığı hic bir kariyeri hiçbirseyi yok. Benim yaşımdaki insan okul müdürlüğü yapıyor. Müdür yardımcısı benden bir yaş küçük ama onun sözü daha çok geçiyor. İş garantisi var, seyi var. Yeri geliyor sunu yap bunu yap diyor. Ve öğretmenlerle bir araya geldiğinizde bunu daha çok hissediyorsunuz; ayrımcılık yaptığını sınıfsal bir ayırım olduğunu... Zaten hicbirinin ailesi ile dışarıda görüşmüyorum. Öğretmenler odasına da fazla gitmem hani kadrolularla fazla muhatap olmak istemiyorum çünkü ezildiğinizi hissediyorsunuz.”

way that they are lower than tenured teachers, she also emphasized that they feel themselves inferior. In her school where she is working, even though they could sit together around the same table, paid teachers are sitting and chatting as a separate group. Paid teachers, by communicating with each other, consciously or unconsciously separate themselves from tenured teachers. Öznur (32) also stated that feeling of abasement is not only related with tenured teachers, but also with the school administration. According to paid teachers, the experiences and the knowledge of paid teachers have not been taken seriously by tenured teachers or administrative persons in schools. This leads paid teachers to feel self-depreciation. Sedef (35), who has been working for ten years, complained about being neglected as a teacher. She stated that;

When you try to express or deliver your opinion on something, they just nod and act like you don't exist and as if you never practiced teaching or graduated from a university. You are temporary anyway; you won't be there tomorrow, so they don't take you seriously. Besides, they interfere with your personal relations with other people.¹⁹²

Even if they are not inclined to accept being discriminated, there is real discrimination which is revealed by their incomes or social positions in the last instance. Even though most paid teachers do not state that they are explicitly subject to discriminatory attitudes or behaviors, their words also contain hidden meanings of that they see themselves as lower than tenured teachers. Even though Hatice (29) did not experience discrimination directly, she explained her feelings as such:

Well, nothing concrete has happened but you feel it. Actually I feel like a loser. It becomes worse as your age increasing. I don't know maybe I am being resentful, but I feel that way¹⁹³

I haven't encountered [discrimination] here. But I have been hearing it from my friends before. One of my friends even told me that he greets and cannot get a response. He doesn't know how to xerox, and bends on his knees to be

¹⁹² Sedef: “Bir şey hakkında görüşünü belli etmeye çalıştığın zaman veyahut fikrini söylediğin zaman sanki sen öğretmenlik yapmamışsın gibi veya bir kurumdan mezun olmamaıssın gibi kafa sallıyorlar sen yokmussun gibi davranıyorlar. Nasıl olsa sen geçiscisin yarın yoksun seni mi ciddiye alacam diyorlar. Ayrıca insan ilişkilerinize karışıyorlar.”

¹⁹³ Hatice (29): “Yani somut olarak bir şey olmadı ama hissediyorsunuz. Ezik hissediyorum açıkçası. Hele de yaş ilerledikçe daha da sorun oluyor. Bilmiyorum belki ben alınganlık yapıyorumdur ama hissediyorum.”

*able to get help. Thank goodness I haven't seen that here. There is no difference between tenured and paid teachers.*¹⁹⁴

*Well, I didn't felt [as discriminated] but some of my friends did. As I said, I was lucky that I didn't encounter that with other friends. Yet no one needs to say anything, you already see it. He/she lays around and still makes three times salary than me. It was terrible. That's why I am not a bit against to [paid teaching].*¹⁹⁵

Although paid teachers feel inferior against tenured teachers; they do not inclined to accept their lower positions in a discursive manner. The statements posed above clearly reveal the discriminative attitudes among teachers in the same school reproduce the occupational hierarchies within the same profession.

The social positions of non-appointed teachers are not only determined by their social positions in the working relations, but they also identified through variables such as occupation, income or educational level. Additionally, the indices of gender, geographical differences and “by a certain sex ratio, a certain distribution in geographical space and by a whole set of subsidiary characteristics which may function, in the form of tacit requirements, as real principles of selection or exclusion without ever being formally stated” (Bourdieu, 2009, p. 102). As also stated by Bora and Erdoğan (2011), social hierarchies in production process came up with socio-cultural differences arising from ethnic, religious, and gender based identities (p. 39). Regarding complicity of their expressions and views, social and cultural hierarchies are tried to be understood in relation to whole set of variables.

The social and cultural differences are getting to be deepened between those whose labor is precarized and those who has worked with employment security as long as capitalist labor market has characterized with growing flexibility and competitive culture (Bora and Erdoğan, 2011, p. 38). In Turkey, the hierarchy between precarized labor and secured labor can easily be observed in public schools. As mentioned earlier, paid teachers thought that tenured teachers do not respect to

¹⁹⁴ Özlem (30): “Burada yaşamadım. Ama onun öncesinde duyuyordum ben arkadaşlarımdan. Hatta arkadaşımın birisi anlattı selam veriyorum verdiğim selamı bile almıyor dedi. Mesela bir fotokopi çektirecem ben bilmiyorum rica minnet yalvara yakara cektiriyorum demişti. Allaha şükür ben burada hiç yaşamadım. Yani kadrolu ücretli öyle bir ayırım yok.”

¹⁹⁵ Deniz (30): “Hani ben hissetmedim de yaşayan arkadaşlarım vardı açıkcası. Ben o konuda şanslıyım dediğim gibi hiç öyle bişeyle karşılaşmadım diğer arkadaşlarla. Ama kimsenin bişey demesine gerek yok zaten sen görüyorsun. O yan gelip yatıyor ve benim 3 katım maaş alıyor.hani birinin bişey demesine gerek bu zaten insana tokat gibi koyuyordu gerçektende. Çok kötü bişeydi. O yuzden biraz da şimdi ücretliye karşıyım.”

them. If we recall Sennett's (2003) emphasis on that "to be respected" is only possible between equals, the personal expressions of interviewees reveals that there is no relationship based on respect. Osman (32), who paid attention to the structural reasons of unequal relations in work, explained that occupational hierarchies are designed on purpose dissolving peaceful working environment.

In addition to the hierarchies' in work place, it should be noted that the social inequalities are emerged along the lines of educational level, family's incomes, gender and geographical locations. According to Erdoğan (2011), the devaluation and fragmentation of mental labor compel lower classes to get lower wages, deprive them of attaining upward mobility opportunities and also place them in the lower stages than those who have even the same diploma with them (p. 77). The field work revealed that for most teachers selecting education faculties with lower-middle class backgrounds insecurity becomes the norm. For the ones who have better economic conditions, precarious jobs are not preferred for such a long time. But for the ones who need to work, insecurity is a condition that is inescapable. Some non-appointed teachers who are deprived of economic and social capital have obliged to work under lower wages and irregular working conditions. Those who have financial difficulties and little chances to live without job have to bear all consequences of the working conditions: not received wage, wage deduction, no insurance etc.

Lots of our friends were fired, internship of some of them were killed. I was one of them. I quit by having an argument with the boss, so my internship was killed. We were employed uninsured for 6 months. It is more difficult to live in a big city; you need to earn money to cover your needs. So I had to remain silent about some unfair treatments, although I didn't accept them.¹⁹⁶

As stated by A. Bora (2011), in Turkey where the risks of unemployment have been increasing everyday, families have become a source of assurance or guarantee for the lives of their children. The important variable determining social and cultural differences is related with economic conditions of family.

They give me 650 liras and make me work 12 hours for 6 days. Still I would work if I needed money. And I considered that I would work instead of working at home and doing nothing. My dad said: 'Whatever you say, but you

¹⁹⁶ Osman (32): "Bir sürü arkadaşımız işten atıldı, stajı yakılan var. Ki onlardan biri de bendim. Patronla tartışarak ayrıldığım için benim de stajım yakıldı. 6 ay sigortasız çalıştırıldık. tabi hani büyük kentte yaşam biraz daha zor para alman lazım ihtiyaçlarını karşılamak lazım felan, o yüzden bazı yaşanan haksızlıkları eyvallah demesen bile sesiz kalmak zorunda kaldığım oldu."

will be exhausted. They will exploit you next year already; this year just sit and take a rest, or get prepared and apply for private schools.” (...) Of course I can make ends meet with 600 liras, this is not the case. But paying 600 liras for a teacher is exploiting him/her. And I didn't let them to do it, since I am a bit against the system. But I would accept if I had to.¹⁹⁷

My only guarantee is my family. If anything bad happens to my mother or my brothers, I will have no assurance or nowhere to go. I neither have a salary or insurance; if I decided to live alone, I got nothing in my life.¹⁹⁸

For Ezgi, who graduated from a private university, escaping from exploitive working conditions of private education institutions is easier than the conditions of Osman (32) or Tuğba (28).

The projection of social and economic conditions of non-appointed teachers shows us how their job preferences can differ considering their class relations. Ferdi (24), whose father is a retired worker, has been working since he was ten years old in different sectors varied from construction to glass industry as a worker. Tuğba (28) is the other interviewee who told that she had to work ever since she could remember. Osman (32), who now trains upper-class students in a private education institution, had been working for several years throughout his education period. His father is a farmer who has got ten children. Since Osman (32) could not get any financial support from his family, he has to work in different jobs such as being a waiter, a cook or a driver. Despite the fact that all non-appointed teachers are now defined as educated and skilled workforce, the experiences relation to works is differentiated in accordance with their class positions.

Geographical differences are coming to the fore as discriminative variable to distinguish people according to their social and cultural capital. While teachers whose families have lived in small villages would rather work in schools closer to their villages, the others whose families have lived in cities would rather work in schools which are closest to them. This seems as a severe handicap for those whose

¹⁹⁷ Ezgi (27): “Yani bana 650 lire veriyor, 6 gun 12 saat calıstırıyor...Şöyle bişey var tabii ki çok ihtiyacım olsa çalışırdım, gene de çalışmayı düşündüm evde oturmaktansa çalışım diye, babam dediki bana sen bilirsin ama çok yorulacaksın. Seni sömürecek zaten seneye bu sene otur dinlen, oku yaz çiz kolejlere başvur, başka bişey yap(...) tabii ki, yani ben 600 lirayla da geçinirim o mesele değil. Ama söyle bişey bir öğretmene 600 lira vermek onu sömürmektir. Bende buna izin vermedim. Birazcık sistemin karşısında olduğum için. Ama çok zor durumda olsaydım kabul ederdim.”

¹⁹⁸ Deniz (30): “Benim tek guvencem ailem yani, atıyorum anneme bişey olsa ağabeylerime bişey olsa hiçbir şekilde bir guvencem yok gidebileceğim. Ne bir maasim var ne bir sigortam var, kendi basıma kalsam su anda, tamam hadi ben tek basıma kalsam desem hic bişey yok hayatımda.”

family has lived in small place because they had to prefer living with their family in order to maintain their lives. While non-appointed teachers who live in the big cities have never preferred to work in small villages, only those whose families have lived in rural areas accept to go to schools in small villages. For instance; Öznur (32), Deniz (30) and Osman (32) had to go back their small hometown after the graduation in order to avoid life expenses. They left their jobs after a while because they did not want to work as paid teachers. Since Osman (32) and Deniz (30) wanted to gain work experiences PECs, they decided to come to Ankara. While big cities may provide more job opportunities, they can also drag people into poverty because of higher living expenses. At this point, teachers who are born and raised in a city can be seen more advantageous than unemployed teachers who are migrating from small towns in order to find jobs.

When the social and cultural hierarchies in private sector are analyzed, the differences among teachers are also related with the work experiences and teaching branches that teachers are professionalized. As mentioned before, private education centers employed non-appointed teachers on basis of fixed term contract and their contents may be differentiated according to different institutions or employees. Teachers' expressions confirm that some of teachers get more advantageous positions than the others. The long period of professional experience and rarity of qualifications enable teachers to get best incomes in private education sector. In addition to this, they also have chances to arrange their working conditions on their own. This situation creates a dilemma between the majority of teachers who get less income and the minority of teachers who get higher incomes. Mikail (22) who considers this situation as an advantage of private sector described his powerful position as such:

*You need to be pickier. You are drowning, but selecting the straw to clutch is in your hands. If you sank, you try to generate a better option. (...) When you say I know how to do it and I will, and you make others feel it too, there is not a problem anymore.*¹⁹⁹

Moreover, Ebru (31) said that some teachers have bargaining power with the employees because their teaching branches are more critical for those institutions. In

¹⁹⁹ Mikail: “Biraz daha seçici davranmak gerekiyor. Denize düştük ama sarılacağın yılanı da belirlemek elinde hani. Batmışın bari biraz daha iyi bir seçenek oluşturmaya çalışacaksın (...) Bu işi ben biliyorum ben yaparım dediğiniz de, karşı tarafa da bunu hissettirdiğiniz de sorun olmuyor.”

her point of view, teachers of mathematics are more advantageous than the other teaching professions. On the one hand, there are prosperous teachers who can earn great amount of money from this sector; on the other hand there are huge numbers of new graduated teachers who have to enter private education sector.

*They see you as a newbie... And my internship is not finished yet, it is a big problem. As long as you don't finish your internship, you depend on them; it is their excuse for making you work for little money. If your internship is over, then they see you more like a teacher. But if it is not, you are not accepted as a teacher.*²⁰⁰

In addition to these, gender roles come to the fore as an important variable that influence the preferences and practices of teachers; and creates unequal opportunities or chances for interviewees. Given precarious employment is highly gendered in a way that it is spreading especially among women, it cannot be claimed that precarious employment conditions are mostly preferred by female teachers. While we cannot know the distribution of paid teachers according to their sex, in private sector the number of male and female teachers are very close (TUIK, 201)²⁰¹. However, my observation in schools confirms that female teachers are more inclined to choose being paid teachers when comparing to male teachers. Considering the expressions of interviewees, married women incline to choose being paid teacher because of part-time working hours. Less working hours that they spend in schools means more free time to spend in their home to cope with their domestic responsibilities. When I ask paid female teachers why they do not want to work in private education institutions, they reply that working in these institutions would take their energy and they would not have time to deal with their husbands or children (Sedef, 35; Osman, 32; Nuray, 27). In the case of PECs, Ebru (31) and Esra (32) state that they have to arrange and limit their working hours because they have to deal with their children who are aged 3 and 7. However, the lesser working hours directly mean that the lesser wages for them.

²⁰⁰ Erhan (32): “Onlarda seni aynen yeni başlayan şey gibi, stajım da daha kalkmamış ya o büyük bir sorun. Staj yapmadığın sürece sen onlara bağlısın, ucuza çalış bahaneleri o aslında. Stajın kalkmış olsa o zaman biraz daha öğretmen gözüyle bakıyorlar ama stajın kalkmadıysa sen öğretmen kabul edilmiyorsun.”

²⁰¹ The statistics show that while the number of male teachers is 28.000, number of female teachers is nearly 22.000. TUIK (2010) Yaygın Eğitim Kurumları. Retrieved in 25.11.2012 from http://www.tuik.gov.tr/VeriBilgi.do?alt_id=14

As emphasized earlier, families become a source of assurance for people who are working precariously. For female teachers, husbands would become as a source of security or assurance. Most female teachers acknowledged that if they husbands were not, they could not manage on their own.

My husband also works in a private education center; mathematics teacher. Already he covers for me a bit. Sometimes I am not paid, or paid in 25th instead of 5th of the month.²⁰²

For instance, I did not work to make big money last year, rather for getting out of home, for a change. The money I made was just enough to cover my gas expenses plus eating and drinking. I could not contribute to home budget, my husband provided.²⁰³

I depend on my husband. My health insurance is on my husband, he can do that investment. I can only plan my future thanks to him, but me... No.²⁰⁴

My husband is lucky about his family. They are landowners, and he says that he would return to his lands. They have cherry gardens in Afyon; they have a job. He has only one sibling, it wouldn't be troublesome. His family would even be pleased.²⁰⁵

Female teachers, especially those who have children, prefer to arrange their working conditions according to their responsibilities as a wife and a mother. The wages paid for non-appointed teachers do not allow them to hire baby sitter or caretaker for their children. This is an indicator of the low socio-economic status of female teachers that make them dependent to their husband. Marriage inevitably changed their expectations and future plans.

The private education center [that she worked] was very tough when I was married. It is not possible to run marriage and working in there together. So

²⁰² Zeynep (28): "Eşim de yine derslane hocası, o matematik öğretmeni. Zaten o beni biraz kurtarıyor biraz böyle şey olabilirse. Ben maaşımı alamıyorum mesela veya beşinde alacağım maaşımı 25inde alıyorum."

²⁰³ Ebru (31): "Mesela ben geçen sene öyle büyük paralarla çalışmadım maksat dışarı çıkım bana değişiklik olsun diye. Zaten aldığım para arabamın benzin parasına gitti artı yediğim içtiğim yani. Onun dışında artı hiç bişey katamadım eve. Onun dışında eşim geçindirdi yine."

²⁰⁴ Esra (32): "Güvendiğim dediğim işte eşim. Sağlık sigortam eşim üzerinden gayet iyi. Ya da o yatırımını yapabiliyor mesela. Geleceğe dair onun sayesinde plan yapabiliyorum ama ben yok."

²⁰⁵ Sedef (35): "Ama eşim aile yönünden şanslı. Toprak sahibi insanlar o ben toprağıma dönerim diyor. Afyonda kiraz bahçeleri var. Onların işi var. Zaten iki kardeşler sıkıntı yaşamaz o. Hatta memnun bile olur ailesi heralde."

*tough... My husband is in the army, he told me not to work at PEC anymore. I already quit when I got pregnant. I started to be paid teacher 2 years after my son was born.*²⁰⁶

On the other side, the perceptions and decisions of male teachers represent their gender roles which are socially attached to them. Several male teachers that I interviewed point out that they cannot even make a plan to marry because they cannot get enough money to manage their life (Fikret, 34; Orhan, 26; Engin, 36; Osman, 36; Emir, 29; Erhan, 32). On the other hand, Okan (36) who is married, defined his role as a family bank. This connected to social and cultural codes that entitle men as breadwinner. It can be mentioned that precarious employment challenges to their social role as breadwinner in the case that they could not maintain their family. Thus, these challenges may also deepen the feelings of self-depreciation, uselessness and shame for married male teachers.

During this research, the universities that the interviewees graduated, their occupational opportunities, the social and cultural capital heritaged from their families, gender roles as well as their different lifestyles and their working conditions are highlighted as the main variables that create differences among non-appointed teachers. There is a need to analyze all of the variables in a relational framework because each of them is a part of the re-production cycle. Even though it is hard to comprehend how production relations are re-produced through these variables for teachers, there is need to understand that the capitalist system is benefitted from the controversies and crisis stemming from the fragmentations or separations among laborers. The more fractions are emerged in the same professions, the more controversies are needed to prevent collective rights demands. However, the separations and differences expressed in teachers' discourses concretely show their views towards themselves; their profession is articulated and determined by contradictions and controversies that are intrinsically resulted from class relations.

²⁰⁶ Sedef (35): “Evlenince dersane çok sıkıydı. Evlilikle dersane yürütmek mümkün değil. Saat altılara yedilere kadar dersane oluyor. Çok ağır. Eşim asker zaten, dersaneye devam etme artık dedi. Hamile kalınca bıraktım zaten. Ücretli öğretmenlik de oğlum döndü 2 yıl sonra başladım.”

4.5 Political Consciousness of the Non-Appointed Teachers

Erdoğan (2011) claims that the discourses of white-collar unemployed never include the reference to the antagonistic relations that exist in society. While they are explaining the reasons of the unemployment, they do not refer to antagonistic relations between capital/labour, oppressor/oppressed, ruler/people (Erdoğan, 2011, pp. 104-105). In this thesis, we aimed to understand how non-appointed teachers understand and analyze their problems, how they view politics and political struggles. The discussion about the non-appointed teachers' characters revealed that they only focus on their own problems while they are talking about the problems of being non-appointed. It can be claimed that this undermines the affiliation to any political ideas or political groups

The field study suggests that teaching profession is still considered as a profession associated with the public sector. Since the educational services are supposed to be provided by the state, the interviewees state that being appointed or having tenure in public sector are their basic right which was attained by their diploma. How can we make connections between their personal claims that are merely based upon their own "rights" and collective demands of the non-appointed teachers? Can we say that the claim of being appointed teacher is a precondition for the collective demands of the non-appointed teachers? Is it possible to claim the possibility of any collective actions or collective will which are supposed to be articulated by these discourses? In order to answer these questions in a consistent manner, we need to understand how non-appointed teachers explain their own problem.

The incoherent and conflictual statements about the political issues –covering from Kurdish issue, the role of European Union, privatization policies etc- reveal that the interviewees do not share a homogeneous or a cohesive political position. When their political stances are questioned, a few of them describe their political stances with political terms which clearly present their ideological positions. While Tuğba (28) and Osman (32) identified their political stances as leftist, Ali (30) described his political position as anti-imperialist and nationalist. They seemed more familiar with

the ideological and the political terms since all of them are actively placed in one of the political groups.

It was very difficult for me to ask individual political views of the interviewees. Most interviewees abstained from revealing their political inclinations or attitudes. Therefore, I asked variety of questions about different political issues in order to reveal their individual political attitudes. While doing this, I realized that they always started to their sentences with the phrases such as “in my opinion”, “I think to myself”, “it’s my own point”. It may be claimed that they want to show that they have any commitment to any collectivity or any ideology. All individual expressions were presented as their individual views. It can be referred that politics is understood in an individual manner and their views are quite distant to any specific political jargons.

The individualistic expressions in the interviewees’ discourses are critical to analyze their views towards any social commitments. These subjects, focusing merely on their own problems and trying to cope with them individually, tend to see their problems as unique ones. Indeed, most interviewees did not make reference to the other social problems or social groups that suffered from the system. The political portrait of the interviewees has composed of different political stances. If we look at the general portrait of the interviewees, it is seen that there are different political inclinations of them. When I asked who are suffered from the government’s policies in Turkey, Tugba (28) and Hatice (29) answered that Muslim women have been suffered for long years. In addition to this their sympathetic views towards policies of government lead me to think that their political stance is closer to the Islamist or the conservative perspectives. Moreover; Sedef (35), Engin (36) and Ali (30) have nationalist sentiments and emotions to the extent that they emphasize on the importance of essences of Turkish culture and traditions. The focus on anti-imperialism by Ali (30) and anti-European Union thoughts of Engin (36) can also be considered as the nationalist reactions to the threat of foreign forces. The degree of nationalist sedimentation is differentiated among them. While Osman (32) and Erhan (32) saw themselves as close to leftist politics, the meaning of “leftist politics” and the ways of political struggle can be differentiated among them.

It can be claimed that the politics has pejorative meanings for them. My observations confirm that most interviewees do not have a unified or collective

political consciousness. For Ebru (31), Esra (32), Mikail (22), Hülya (30), Fikret (34), Emir (29), Ferdi (24), Sevim (27), and Zeynep (28), all political parties and ideologies are self-seeking mechanisms that are evil in nature. There can be found many sentences which equate leftist and rightist politics. Esra (32) states that there is no difference between policies of rightist and leftist parties. According to her, even unions –whether they are leftist or rightist- deals only with their own economic interests rather than seeking ways to defend the workers’ rights. This statement clearly shows how 1980 military coup has successfully implemented depolitization in people minds. Emir (29), who describes himself as apolitical, said that being political meant being a part of ideology blindly. Most interviewees do not trust any political ideas or political parties because of the self-seeking and the bad nature of politics. However, the claim of being apolitical is apparently a kind of political view. As argued by Erdoğan (2011), cultural and moral codes after 1980s have created new subjects which consider their “self” as distance from being ideological. It is the culture which brings about new types of men who signify de-politicized, atomized and individualized subjects (Erdoğan and Bora, 2011, p. 36)

Besides the pessimistic scene of individualist culture of society, there is also possibility to establish collectivity among those who are suffered from the system. Even though it is asserted that precarization process– in which labor is characterized with fragmentation, causalization, flexibilization- make difficult to organize collective resistance (Erdoğan&Bora, 2011, p. 36), deepening socio-cultural hierarchies among teachers through impoverishment of teachers’ labor and threat of unemployment are making non-appointed teachers angrier towards the system itself. Even though they are angry, they are not rebellious in the ordinary sense (Sennett & Cobb, 1972, p. 79) As reminded by Eagleton (2011), the field of culture includes the seeds of counter-hegemony struggles or daily resistances (pp. 116-118). How collective anger or disillusionment transferred into collective resistance is going to be discussed in relation with their views about current collective struggles of teachers.

4.6 Who is the Responsible for the Precarization of Teachers’ Labor?

When the responsible actors of the precarization are questioned, the wrong education policies of the government and general politics in Turkey are seen as two

important reasons that the interviewees criticized. Firstly, the deficiencies and errors in education system are explained in reference to state, government or politicians who have corrupted education system according to their politics. The concepts of state and government are interchangeably used. While sometimes the scope of state has reduced to the specific role of government, they mainly used the notion of state only associated with political process in which governments, politicians and policies are taken into account. Regarding their problem analysis, the education policies of government is central points of their critiques.

*Plus; the reason for these increasing protests, and unassigned teachers' remaining on the agenda is the failed policy of the government; promising 55.000[of appointment] and not keeping it. The government is hundred percent guilty here. They should have realized it.*²⁰⁷

*Unfortunately, the government is the architecture of this process. All in all, it made promises. 'A university for each province', so the graduate number has inevitably been expanded. The government neither makes proper regulations nor determines the need. The number of graduated teachers expands gradually; and according to governmental policy, fewer teachers should be appointed in order to fulfill EU criteria. Hence, as graduate number increases, so does unemployed teachers.*²⁰⁸

In general politics, the government is mostly mentioned as the responsible actor for increasing the number of unemployed teachers. Some of them put the blame on the general politics in Turkey, so current government could not be seen as mere responsible for the growing number of unemployed teachers. Some of them analyzed this problem as an outcome of wrong education policies ongoing from past to the present, their arguments are followed;

Whose problem is this? It is this government's, the previous one, or the one before it? I don't push it off to one of them; neither this nor the previous one.

²⁰⁷ Sevim (27): "Artı devletin bir yanlış politikası daha bu eylemlerin cogalmasında ve atanamayan öğretmenlerin bu kadar gündem yaratmasındaki sebep 55 bin sözü verilip daha sonrasında uygulanmaması. Burada yüzde yüz suçlu devlettir. Uygulasalardı."

²⁰⁸ Engin (36): "Devlet bu sürecin mimarı ne yazıkki. Sonucta birtakım vaatler verdi, her ile bir üniversite. Her ile bir üniversite olunca tabi mezun sayısı mecburen arttı. Hem yeterli düzenlemeler yapmıyor, hem ihtiyaç belirlemiyor. Mezun olan öğretmen sayısı gittikçe arttı. Devletin politikasına göre daha az öğretmenin atanması gerekiyor Avrupa Birliği kriterleri için...Dolayısıyla mezun sayısı artınca işsiz kalan öğretmen arttı."

*This is years of problem. National resources are a bit restricted, and people in charge to manage it could not be successful enough.*²⁰⁹

*I think no one act themselves. Anyone who takes the lead is put into his position by the same source, so it would all be the same. They all would do the same; a,b,c,d... Same difference.*²¹⁰

Hulya (30) also criticized the political decisions of government which enable Imams to be teachers instead of them. This is widely accepted critiques directed towards government because government is seen as to make political favouritism. According to Engin (36), Osman (32), Sedef (35), Ferdi (24), Tuğba (28), Okan (36), Deniz (30), and Hülya (30) and Zeynep (28), social status of the non-appointed teachers have become much worse because of the wrong education policies of the government. Moreover, the government is highly criticized because of its ideological decisions. As shown in Table. 3 in recent years, Ministry of National Education gave highly ideological decisions facilitating the appointment conditions of teachers of Religion and Ethics by increasing the number of cadres. Tugba (28) and Okan (36) focused on this issue:

*If it appoints 500.000 imams, it can also appoint 350.000 teachers. If there are 500.000 imams, there may be 350.000 teachers too; the government can afford it. But it is not [Prime Minister Erdoğan] concern. His aim is... As I told you, he plays big. He is positioning his soldiers to their places right now. He placed his staff [who politically proponent of his party] in Mamak, the region I am working, the principals of all schools I have worked in are teachers of Religion and Ethics. Why? Are they seniors, why is that? In one school, the appointment even came from Religious Affairs. They have a different agenda. They would solve our issues if they wanted, but in this direction, they don't.*²¹¹

²⁰⁹ Özlem (30): “Bu problem kimin problem. Bu hükümetin mi ondan önceki ondan öncekinin mi. Bunu birinin üstüne de yıkıyorum ben ne bunun ne bundan öncekinin. Bu senelerin problemi. Biraz ülkenin kaynakları sınırlı başa geçenlerin onu yönetmesi tam başarılı olmadı.”

²¹⁰ Sedef (35): “Ben sunu düşünüyorum hiç kimse tek başına hareket etmiyor. Ülkemiz de başa geçen kim varsa hepsi aynı kişi tarafından başa geçirildiği için aynı şeyler geçerli olacaktır. Hepsi aynıyını yapacaktı a,b,c,d hepsi aynı.”

²¹¹ Tuğba (28): “Eğer 500bin tane imam atıyorsa 350bin tane öğretmen atar. 500bin imam varsa 350bin öğretmen de olabilir buna hükümetin gücü yeter. Ama adam bunu yapmak gayesinde değil. Onun gayesi dedim ya daha büyük oynuyor. O şu anda askerlerini yerleştiriyor yerlerine. Kadrolaştırıyor, ki benim görev yaptığım bölgede mamak'ta benim çalıştığım okulların bütün müdürleri din kültürü öğretmeni. Neden? En kıdamlı onlar mı niçin yani? Hatta bir okulun ki diyanetten direk gelmiş. Başka bir amaçları var. Bu doğrultuda da bizimle ilgili bir şey çözmek isteseler çözerler ama çözmek istemiyorlar.”

*[The reason for Religion and Ethics teacher's being appointed with less points] is because of the government's thing. Most of these appointed ones don't practice teaching anyway. They are moved upwards to administrative staff; principal, deputy principal. (...) This is because they don't education from a scientific point of view, their concern is: 'how do I make my circle richer, how do I move the ones who will vote me up.'*²¹²

Tugba (28) and Okan (36) blamed the governments for being highly ideological in their policy-making processes. In this sense, the usage of ideology in their statements refers to the pejorative meanings of ideology including beliefs, thoughts and experiences of ruling classes.

Beside these interpretations, the interrelations between state and media are emphasized by some teachers. According to Tuğba (28), “[government] gives the impression that everything is okay. Government appointed 40.000 or 60.000 teachers. [People] asked that why you are not in these groups. You know the role of media, what the government says they repeat after them.”²¹³ By means of media, the problems of the non-appointed teachers are presented as a result of individual failure. According to Sedef (35), in Turkey media enables the political parties to come to power and people are forced to vote some parties by the impressions of media²¹⁴.

There can also be found some criticism directed to the neo-liberal economic policies of the government. According to Ali (30), who is a member of nationalist and anti-empyralist political group, “Ministry of Finance do not make financial allowance to Ministry of National Education to employ teachers more than the numbers that they decided”²¹⁵. As discussed in the matter of neo-liberal policies, the

²¹² Okan (36): “*Din kültürü öğretmenin az puanla atanmasının nedeni] işte bu iktidarın şeyinden kaynaklanıyor. Zaten bu atanlar öğretmenlik coğu yapmıyorlar. İdari kadroya çekiliyor müdür yapıyor müdür yard.(...). İşte bu eğitime tarafsız bilimsel bakmamaktan oluyorç ben çevremi nasıl zengin ederim. Bana oy verecek insanları nasıl üst tabakalara getirebilirim.*”

²¹³ Tuğba: “*Devlet herşey yolundaymış izlenimi veriyor. 40 bin atadılar, 60 bin atadırlar. Soruyorlar sen niye bunların içinde değilsin diye. Biliyorsun medyayı, onlar ne söylerse onu tekrarlıyorlar.*”

²¹⁴ Sedef: “*Çünkü bizim başımıza gelen hiçbir idareci sadece biz seçtiğimiz için gelmiyor. Biz falanca partiye oy verdiğimiz zaman basının etkisiyle baskısıyla biz buna gidiyoru. Orda ne oluyor çahil halkın da eğitimle daha ayrı. Biz de basın çok kuvvetli. Yani bizi medya çok güzel yönlendiriyor bugün bize birini kötölemek istiyorlarsa sevdirmemek istiyorlarsa bunu 2 gunde yaparlar. Medyanın bunda gücü var çünkü medya bizim elimizde değil.*”

²¹⁵ Ali: “*Bir de şey Maliye bakanlığı biliyorsunuz bir ödenek ayırmıyor. Maliye bakanlığı bir yük olarak görüyor maalesef eğitimi. Öyle de olunca o kadroları açmıyor ya onları ücretli öğretmenle dolduruyor ya da açmıyor yani.pek çok yere harcanırken paralar ama nedense eğitime gelince*”

government has imposed cuts on public expenses, thus MONE do not appoint teachers to the empty cadres despite the increasing need of teachers in state schools.

Rather than criticizing neo-liberal policies, some teachers thought that state cannot appoint all the non-appointed teachers because of the economic incapacibilities. When any social phenomena is started to be explained with economic terms, it inevitably brings about the risks of undermining the role of politics or ideology. In other words, the politics of precarization in labor regimes are began to be legitimized under the cover of the inadequacies or incapacibilities of the Turkish economy. Rational calculation of state budget has found its repercussion in Özlem's (30) arguments as follow:

*Because everything is about money, the finance; how much the governmental budget is. Sometimes I think like this: if I wanted one billion [one thousand in new liras], my father would not give me that unless he had it. Or we are three siblings, and my father can meet our needs to the extent of the money he has. That is how I perceive the government. The government is poor and it has lots of children, it can't support.*²¹⁶

The questions of whether governments can either solve this problem or not, these economic analyses are coming to the fore as legitimization and consiliation basis for the government policies. For instance, Esra (32) thought that “*Turkish state is not rich because Turkish state can not use its own natural or economic resources*”²¹⁷. Therefore, their precarious life is to be justified by saying that “*State is poor enough not to provide employment for all*”²¹⁸.

All interviewees claimed that being appointed is their basic right. All of them have spent several years and made great efforts to pass the exam. It is observed that state is considered as social state which is supposed to provide public employment in education services. However, the expectations from social state are merely limited with their own problems. Given the critiques towards the government or state, most interviewees thought that the government is an important actor that should solve their

²¹⁶ Özlem: “Çünkü her şey paraya bakıyor maliyeye. Devletin bütçesi ne kadar. Şey gibi düşünüyorum bazen ben babamdan bir milyar para istedim babamın verecek durumu yoksa babam bana onu veremez. Veya biz 3 kadesiz babam cebindeki paranın miktarınca bizim ihtiyaçlarımızı karşılayabilir. Devleti de öyle görüyorum ben. Devletin durumu fakir ama çocukları çok fazla.yetmiyor.”

²¹⁷ Esra: “Biz çok zengin değiliz. Kendi kaynaklarımızı kullanmadığımız için biz zengin değiliz. Son 10 yılda ithalatta ihracatta geldiğimiz noktaya baktığımız zaman zaten biz ne kadar fakir bir ülke olduğumuzu görebiliyoruz.”

²¹⁸ Özlem (30), Esra (32) and Hatice (29) emphasized this sentence: “Devletimiz herkese istihdam sağlayacak kadar zengin değil”.

problems. Because the private sector is not seen as secured as the public sector, employment in private education institutions can not be seen as alternative working places for them. However, this is not to say they are against private sector, but state is also responsible to regulate the working conditions in private sector too.

4.7 The Views towards Existing Movements or Struggles

How teachers' labor are fragmented in relation to the different forms of employment regimes and how its qualifications are being precarized are already mentioned in the context of precarization of teachers' labor. In previous part, it is claimed that most of the non-appointed teachers think that state or the government can only solve this problem. Since they do not have political prescriptions, they cannot see how things could be possibly other than as they are. The total precarization of labor provides the common ground for people who are subjected to precarious life. Özüğurlu (2010) claims that precarization process which transects different forms of employment leads to homogenize the in-class separations on a common destination (p. 47). This part is aimed to shed light on the some insights about political collective resistance or movements of the non-appointed teachers.

It has to be noted their insights and choices should not be understood without considering the general crisis in labor struggles. The withdrawal of class struggles in the mainstream political agenda and the structural crisis in the unions has undermined the potentialities of collective struggles. Today's, the unions are incapable of organizing people who particularly intensify in the irregular employment regimes of service sector (Çerkezoğlu and Göztepe, 2010, p. 83). The distance between subjects and current conditions of struggles has been increased by the legal and political reforms which structured the tyranny of capital upon labor relations. In this sense, to what extent crisis in trade union movements and passification of labor movements affect the choices and decisions of non-appointed teachers are going to be questioned. Hence how teachers are looking at the social struggles varied from The Platform of the non-appointed teachers [AYÖP] to Tekel resistance is going to be questioned? In order to do that firstly current political organizations and movements are going to be mentioned briefly.

As we mentioned earlier, while teachers working in the public sector have right to be organized under the unions, precarious teachers are deprived of being a

member of unions and they lack of structural capacity to struggle or collective bargaining rights. In recent years, the non-appointed teachers started to organize their political groups or platforms in order to raise their demands. When we look at these political formations, AYÖP²¹⁹ is more widely known in comparison to the other formations. In 2010, AYÖP started its activities by making press statement about cheating scandals in PPSE and achieved to attract public attention by going on hunger strike for calling people to join to their struggle. Indeed, the struggle gained its popularity with the personal determination of Safak Bay. Şafak Bay was a non-appointed teacher who went on hunger strike in 2010 and paved the ways of struggle for non-appointed teachers. Despite his serious illness²²⁰, Yıldırım defined his determination as symbol of “collective personality”, according to him Şafak was always emphasizing the importance of social struggle of non-appointed teachers as against the mainstream media²²¹. He became as inspiring role model for non-appointed teachers even after his death. AYÖP has organized different protests, actions and press statements since 2009²²². Especially, the breaking out the news about the cheating scandals in PPSE in 2010, the platform has continued its activities by making allegations for related state institutions and authorities, organizing protests and marches in different time periods. The platform has several district branches which are supposed to expand their activities on a national scale.

Tuğba (28), who is member AYÖP, described the demands of AYÖP as “the appointment of all non- appointed teachers”. This is the joint demands of its members regardless of their personal ideologies²²³. According to Tuğba (28), even if they have political stance there is no specific ideology dominated AYÖP, in fact there are many people in different thoughts and beliefs because they have common

²¹⁹ <http://www.ayop.biz/index.php?sayfa=AYOP&link=1-Platformumuz>

²²⁰ Şafak Bay was cancer patient and he was not able to cost his cancer treatment expenses because of that he was unemployed. <http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/?hn=159194>

²²¹ Deniz Yıldırım “Şafak Dersleri” in http://www.sendika.org/yazi.php?yazi_no=45635

²²² See also: <http://bianet.org/arsiv/ara?q=AY%C3%96P&locale=tr> and <http://www.milliyet.com.tr/Milliyet.aspx?aType=ArsivAramaSonuc&Keyword=AY%C3%96P&PAGE=1>

²²³ Deniz (30): “*tabii ki farklı görüşler var ama sorun ortak yani. Görüşün ne olduğu şey olmuyor o noktadan sonra. Hani sen muhafazakarsın ben liberalim hani bir ortak noktamız var ikimizde atanamıyoruz. Tabii ki karsıt görüşler var ama ortak sorunlar etrafında orda toplanabiliyorduk.*”

purposes²²⁴. The other member of AYÖP, Osman (32) told the importance of AYÖP as such:

*AYÖP is the first in the world literature [as a platform whose activities started by hunger strike]. The unions and teacher's groups from Algeria or Greece has contacted with us. They imitated our struggle method. Lastly, teachers in Algeria went on a hunger strike. Even though our struggle brought voices in a global scale, our [government] could not hear our demands or they did not want to hear.*²²⁵

On the other hand, most interviewees criticized the ways of political struggles organized by AYÖP. It is important that most of them thought that AYÖP is highly political and ideological teachers' group. This can be thought in relation to the pejorative meanings of politics and ideology. For example Okan (36), who was a member of AYÖP in the beginnings, criticizes AYÖP because its discourse is getting much closer to the leftist politics such as Republican People Party²²⁶ and Eğitim-Sen²²⁷. According to him, the demand of leftist group does not match the social realities of Turkey. Although Sevim (27) and Deniz (30) joined one or two protests organized by AYÖP, they stated that they could not actively participate or follow all meetings and protests²²⁸.

*Not in every day, but I try to follow the news and AYOP from facebook groups. I tried to join protests or demonstrations as much as possible. If there is any development.*²²⁹

²²⁴ Tuğba, (28): "Başka platformda ne yapıyorsun. AYOP dediğin şeyde zaten siyasi anlamda bir şey yok ki. Bir çok farklı düşünceden insanlar var. Böyle bir ideolojiye yönelik bir şey değil. Tamam siyasi bir duruşu var. Çünkü bir amacımız var. Ortak paydamız var. Atanmak. AYOP'un tek gayesi atanmayan öğretmenlerin atanması."

²²⁵ Osman: "Açlık grevi ile başlayan AYOP dünyada bir ilk. Literatüre girdi. Yunanistandan cezayirden sendikalar işsiz öğretmen toplulukları bizlere ulaştılar yani bu mücadeleyi örnek aldılar. En son geçen yaz cezayirdeki öğretmenler türkiyedeki açlık grevine ithafen açlık grevine başladılar. Dünya ölçeğinde ses getirdi bir bizim sağır sultanlar duymadı, aslında duydular da duymamazlığa veriyorlar."

²²⁶ Republican People Party which was the first political party and established by the first president of Turkish Republic, M. Kemal Atatürk.

²²⁷ The Union of Education and Science Laborers

²²⁸ Deniz (30): "Eylem olduğu zaman ya da yapabileceğim bir şey olduğu zaman. Elimden geldiğince katılmaya çalışıyorum."

Sevim (27): "Bikaçına katılamadım eylemlerine her zaman destekliyorum çünkü çok haklılar... Bir kere katılma şansım oldu. Ankara da küçük bir eylemde sanırım. Onun haricinde katılamadım ama katılmayı çok istedim sadece şartlarım uygun değildi."

²²⁹ Sevim (27): "Mesela hergün değil de bi şekilde takip ediyorum AYOP u de takip ediyorum, facebookta gruplarından. Eylemlere mümkün olduğunca katılabildiğim kadar katılabiliyorum."

There are other groups which were organized on the basis of the rights and demands of the non-appointed teachers. The Association of Non-Appointed Teachers (AYÖDER) was established by those who left AYÖP. The platform of unemployed and precarious educators (IGEP) was formed during the hunger strike in 2010²³⁰. This group also aimed to pay public attention to the unemployment and precarious working conditions of non-appointed teachers. The Association of Education Laborers (EED) is the other political group that was formed in 2006²³¹. However, we cannot mention about these political groups are effective neither in social media nor in the streets.

Beside these political formations or platforms, there is great variety of social media groups organized in social media sites such as Facebook or Twitter. Social media groups are preferred by most teachers because of that they have not got enough time to join to any protests or movements. Some of them said that they could not have got enough time because they have to study for the exam out of work. For some, social media sites are alternative places to reveal their angry or discontent. Engin (36) and Deniz (30) explained their responses on social media groups as such:

*I know about [political] groups, I follow them but I don't join them, just to the comments on the internet [social media?]. We don't have the time anyway, since KPSS hold our hands, I believe joining that kind of groups is waste of time. (...) It won't work, the government policy is very clear.*²³²

*Well, there is not much to do; we tweet to the President, lots of our friends make videos. For example, AYÖP group in Antalya even prepared a song as a chorus. They shot a film like 'what is teacher's crime'. Lots of people are working in virtual platform [social media?]; we keep asking questions, following on twitter, and so on.*²³³

²³⁰ <http://www.sendika.tv/index.php?eylem=izle&id=371>

²³¹ <http://egitimemekcileridernegei.org/>

²³² Engin (36): “[politik] grupları biliyorum, takip ediyorum ama gruplara katılmıyorum da internetteki yorumlara katılıyorum ancak. Zaten zamanımız yok, yani KPSS elimizi kolumuzu bağladığı için o tür gruplara katılmak boşa zaman harcamak gibi bir şey oluyor bence.(...) işe yaramaz çünkü hükümetin politikası belli.”

²³³ Deniz (30): “Yani çok da yapacak da başka bişeyimiz yok işte tweet atıyoruz cumhurbaşkanına videolar çekiyorlar birçok arkadaşımız, mesela antalyada ayıop grubu bir şarkı bile hazırlamıştı koro halinde. Film çektiler öğretmenın suçu ne felan diye. Baya çalışanlar var işte sanal ortamda, ürekli sorular soruyoruz tweeter dan takip ediyoruz felan.”

The activities in social media websites invite people to share their thoughts and views in the visual ways. This visual configuration has symbolic meanings in the new culture of capitalism. Even though the representation of the opposition in social media groups has some social effects to attract the public attention²³⁴, it also brings about the risk of “sanal resistance” which may be disappeared in short-time because of temporary and fluid reactions. Deniz (30) and Okan (36) described the outcomes of sanal resistance as the passivisation of people in front of computer.

*Recently I wrote my phone number on the internet [social media], and suggested my Biology-graduate friends to go and talk the YÖK president not to open this department. Let's go and talk to the Board of Education and Discipline in National Education. One cannot open a university without their consent. I suggested [graduates] to go and talk. I got an appointment from the secretary of YÖK president, and she said they would accept up if we were 4 or 5 people. I wrote my number there, no one called. So I say this occupational group deserves it.*²³⁵

*Still I find my teacher friends guilty in this matter; it is easy to show off in virtual platform [social media?]. We organized a protest, for instance; half of them were there or not. It is easy to show off in from of your computer. You storm around there, but when it comes to action.*²³⁶

While social media provide people to organize different groups easily and forward their messages to a lot of people within a second, the increasing numbers of groups and the variety among social media groups lead to decrease in their influences in a short time period.

Besides the lack of belief to the organized struggles, the non-appointed teachers mentioned their certain worries that create hesitation in joining the rallies. Özüğurlu (2010) states that fear which is the main explanatory code of working classes is arising from the fear of losing jobs; and it also stemmed from the fear of incapability to meet the requirements of social roles in daily life such as being

²³⁴ In that respect, it has to be noted that teachers were easily organized through these web sites and went to protests in important days.

²³⁵ Okan: “Ben geçen internette sey yaptım telefonu verdim, biyoloji mezunu arkadaşlar gidelim YÖK başkanı ile konusalım bu bölümde fak açmasın. Gidelim milli eğitim de talim terbiye kurulunun başkanı ile konusalım. Bunların imzası olmadan üniversite açılmaz. Gidelim konusalım dedim yok başkanı sekreterinden randevu aldım, 4-5 kişi olun gelin kabul ederiz dedi. Telefon yazdım oraya, Allahın bir kulu aramadı. Bende dedim ki bu meslek grubu buna layık.”

²³⁶ Deniz: “Ama söyle bir şeyde var ben bu konuda öğretmen arkadaşlarımı da suçlu buluyorum yani sanal alemde atıp tutmak kolay. Biz bir eylem yaptık mesela ordakilerin yarısı ya vardı ya yoktu. Show yapmak kolay bilgisayarın basında. Hani orada esip gürlüyorsun eyvallah da icraata gelince”.

protective parents, good children and precious wife (p. 59). The field study confirms the similar points for the non-appointed teachers. Fikret (34), who was currently waited to be appointed as public servant, explained that he was afraid of getting flagged and he could not join any protests²³⁷. Moreover, participating to protests is seen dangerous by Sedef (35) whose husband is soldier and by Erhan (32) whose mother is worried about him. Tugba (28) described the individual fears and worries of her colleagues as such:

*Half of the school staff is union member. Some of their spouse is police officer, some are in the military. "We are spouses of military members; we can't protest, we need to stay away the union". Or "the protestors throw paving stones at the banks" they say. Protesting is our very natural right, my friend. If the guys across press against you unjustly, and try to repel you with tear gas; then you grab a stone from the ground. They just can't comprehend how natural this is, and you are declared as a traitor. When you say protest, scary horrible things instantly come to their minds; they will be arrested, their spouses will be in trouble and so on. They are frightened.*²³⁸

Özüğurlu (2010) also claims, fear is closely related with the fear of losing self-esteem. It can be said that the devaluation of occupational identity and the loss of self-esteem clearly preclude these people to believe in social struggles. For instance, Esra thought that there would not be any collective resistance of teachers because Turkish people become more satisfied with their current conditions comparing to their conditions in the 1980s. For Esra (32), the reason of depolitization in society is closely related with the repressive power of the government examined on protestors or opponents recently. Government does not allow people to show their opposition in any circumstances²³⁹. Even though Zeynep (28) criticized herself

²³⁷ Fikret: "Açıkçası bu saatten sonra bazı şeylerden korktuğum için(...) . iş bulma olabilir, oralarda gördüğüm zaman ilerde bir işe atandığım zaman başımın belaya girebileceğini kadar düşünüyorum yan. İnsanlar kameraya alıyorlar seni, sonra fişleniyorsun. Ki insanlar söylediler fişleme el değiştirdi diye. Bunu bile bile lades yapmaya pek cesaretim yok açıkçası."

²³⁸ Tuğba: "Okulun yarısı sendikalı bizim birkaçının eşi polis birçoğunun eşi asker. Biz asker eşiyiz eylemlere katılamayız, biz sendikadan uzak durmalıyız. İşte eylemcilerde kaldırımları bankalara vuruyor felan. Arkadaşım eylem yapmak bizim en doğal hakkımız. Karşıdaki adam sana haklı bir şekilde yükleniyorsa, seni gazla püskürtmeye çalışıyorsa sende yerden alıyorsun taşı..bunun doğallığını kavrayamıyorlar sen de vatan haini oluyorsun. Eylem deyince insanın aklına hemen korkutucu ürkütücü, tutuklanacak tutuklandığı için eşinin başına bir şeyler gelecek felan. Korkutuyorlar."

²³⁹ Esra: "Bu hükümet buna izin vermiyor. Görüyoruz çocukları kaç yıl hapisle mahkum ediyor sırf pankart açtıkları için. Bu hükümet bunu kalırmaz. Çok ciddi anlamda bastırıyor (...) Biz 80ler döneminin yüzde 10u bile olamayız. Türkiye artık kanaatkar oldu. İnsanlar işini yapıyor çok kanaatkar bir millet haline geldik."

to not struggle for her own rights, she also agrees with Esra in a way that collective attempts would bring no solutions²⁴⁰. The meaning of being organized is explained by Mikail (22) as such:

*It bothers you at some point, since you hear oppositional voices all the time in Turkey. Which one tells the truth? A guy says that one plus one makes two all the time, there are even ones objecting that. [people] Going out to the streets, and protesting. Besides I am concerned with making a living, so I am not involved much.*²⁴¹

4.8 The Antinomies of Subject under the New Capitalist Culture

Since ideology represents the imaginary relationship of individuals to their real conditions of existence (Althusser, 2006, p. 85), subjects are positioned in real life according to their acts, ideas and perceptions that are articulated historically within existing structures and discourses. Given the incoherent and inconsistent nature of ideology, the statements and expressions of the interviewees represent fragmented and episodic narratives. This part is going to question how new capitalist culture penetrates into their incoherent and contradictory discourses. And how their reactions to the precarious working conditions are getting blurred by these antinomies?

When the interconnections between precarious working conditions of non-appointed teachers and the total precarization of labor regimes are questioned, it is observed that they do not consider that precariousness is a characterization of whole labor market. When it is asked whether there are other professions suffered from precarious works or not, a few of them mentioned about the precarization of other professions. Most of them complained about their “unique” problems, their understanding to their problems can be defined as unique because they represent their conditions as the worst conditions among educated skilled labor, even some of them see their conditions even much worse than “workers”.

²⁴⁰ Zeynep: “[mücadele içinde] hiç olmadım işte hak ediyorum ben burada olmayı. Çünkü hiç mücadele etmedim. Sesimi duyuracak hiç bişey yapmadım(...)çözüm getireceğini düşünmüyorum. Sonuçta evli bir insansın. Tek başına hareket edemiyorsun.”

²⁴¹ Mikail: “Türkiyede her zaman muhalif sesler çıktığı için artık sıkıyor. Hangisi doğruyu söylüyor ki yani. Her zaman için bir artı bir esittir 2 diyor adam ona muhalafet eden var. Sokaklara çıkıyor eylem yapıyor. Bir de kendi ekmeğimin derdine düştüğümünden çok da şey yapamıyorum.”

On the other hand, I observed that there is no specific reference to the problem of poverty or unemployment in their perceptions. Since they are not placed themselves into poor conditions or they thought that their precarious conditions are temporary, they do not have any real perceptions or images of poverty or unemployment. When I asked which groups are socially most disadvantageous in society, just a few of them mentioned that the working conditions of workers are worst than all other groups (Osman, 32; Deniz, 30; Ali, 30; Sevim, 27). While Okan (36) said that there is no other group as frustrated as paid teachers, Ferdi (24) claimed that teachers have not got job opportunities as much as other professions have. Although all of them are very critical about their working conditions, they are not critical in ordinary sense of the word. They cannot define their problems as a structural problem of capitalist relations of production since they are more individualized by dominant ideology.

Some interviews indicated that the imagination of poverty is impossible for people who experience middle class lifestyles. When their opinions about poverty are asked, Ebru's statements about poor people are highly significant revealing that how middle classes are distanced from lower classes. According to Esra (32) who thought there is not poor people any more, poverty is;

There are certain standards, and the ones who can't fulfill them are in poverty. But somehow, on loan or credit can he/she pay or not. When you look at the lifestyle, not a poor person but is in 100 billion [thousand in new Turkish liras] in debt. Being poor is something else. I see everyone has a car, they don't own a home but at least they have a car.²⁴²

Here, Esra either does not want to see poor people who actually live in streets or she may live in areas that are totally isolated from the images of poverty. Considering her own life story, Esra (32) is not inclined to see that insecure and temporary work in private sector impoverish her own life standards. Poverty is a distant notion for her who had to receive support from his father when she and her husband were unemployed. Suffice it to say that precarization of labor which always come up with the threat of unemployment has characterized with poverty in life conditions. When we look at the images of poverty, Ebru (31) attached the conditions

²⁴² Esra: "Belli standartlar vardır o standartları insan yerine getiremiyor insan yoksuldur. Ama bakıyorum iyi kötü borç-harç krediyle felan ödeyebiliyor mu ödeyemiyor mu. Ama yaşamsal olarak baktığımda fakara değil ama adamın 100 milyar borcu var. Yani yoksul başka bişey. Ben yoksul diye yaşan...ama bakıyorum herkesin bir arabası var gerçi evi yok ama en kötü ihtimalle bir araba herkeste var."

of poverty with illiteracy and lack of education. According to her, the most important problem of Turkey is illiteracy. From her standpoint:

What you call poverty; for the ones getting a four-year license degree and starting a job with 2 billion [thousand in new Turkish liras], poverty is not poverty. It is in lower strata. But they draw their own destiny. You don't have a job and get married, so far so good. What do you make? 4 or 5 children. Lack of education comes into play there. How could you make ends meet with 4 or 5 children on 1000 liras of salary? It is difficult even with one child, how will you do that? The biggest issue in this country is lack of education. Not being appointed or not, education problem comes first.²⁴³

The views about poverty and poor people are quite important in order to reveal antinomies that are inscribed in their discourses. The images of poverty in their discourses are become as manifestation of class differences between them and poor people. Even though all interviewees see themselves as the victims of the wrong economic policies, -but not of capitalist system- most of them never approach to poor people as victims who are compelled to live under poverty. When I asked them how they define their economic conditions, nobody defined his/her social position as lower class or as poor enough that cannot live on their own. It is interesting that poverty is seen as an outcome of individual inabilities, inadequacies or failure (Ebru, 31; Esra, 32; Mikail, 22; Sedef, 35). The statements of Sedef (35) and Okan (36) clearly showed separations between different social classes;

I am thinking of the reasons of [poverty], how does a person become that... I think it is whether laziness or insensibleness, ignorance I mean. Making more children, having nothing left in hand; 8 children and no job. What can you say that? You are an unemployed person, why do you make so many children? He/she is unaware of the state (...)They are all dressed in tatters. We help them out here. We give them shoes and trousers. These people get used to expect everything from the state. Some are even unaware of the state. Some say that the state will take of them. He/she has 8 children, and goes to government office to ask for a pair of shoes. I am angry at them; I am sad, but I am also angry. Because they did this consciously.²⁴⁴

²⁴³ Ebru: "Bu yoksulluk dediğimiz olay 4 yıllık mezun olup da sonra 2 milyar maaşla işe başlayanlar için yoksulluk yoksulluk değil. Yoksulluk alt tabakada ..ama onlar da kendi kaderlerini kendileri yazıyorlar. Yani madem bir mesleğin yok elinde evlenmişsin amenna güzel. Ee yapıyorsun 4- 5 cocuk....işte orda da eğitimsizlik baş gösteriyor. Yani 4 cocuk 5 cocukla o aldığın atıyorum 1000 lirayla evi nasıl geçindireceksin. Yani bir çocukla evin geçimini sağlayabiliyorken sen nasıl yapacaksın. Bu ülkenin en önemli sorunu eğitim sorunu yok atanması yok atanmaması yok şöyle yok böyle. Eğitim sorunu en başta."

²⁴⁴ Sedef: "[yoksullugun] sebeplerini düşünüyorum bir insan bu hale nasıl gelir. Bence şu bir insan ya tembellikten gelir, ya da bilinçsizlik cahillik yani. Çocuk sayısını arttırmış elinde avucunda hiç bir şey yok, 8 tane çocuk işi yok. Buna ne diyebilirsiniz sen çalışmayan bir insansın niye bu kadar çocuk yapıyorsun. Devletten hiç haberi yok(...).Hepsinin üstü başı yırtık pırtık içinde. Biz burada yardım ediyoruz. Ayakkabı veriyoruz pantolon veriyoruz. Herşeyi devletten beklemeye alışmış bu insanlar.

There are two reasons to poverty. First, these people don't know how to make money. For example, they don't apply to training courses. They are not prone to change and self improvement. They might be found guilty because of that. Their educational level is low, rate of literacy is low. There are lots of illiterate parents. We opened literacy course here; the husbands usually don't let their wives to attend the course, or even if they are registered, women don't want to come using their obligations to look after the child for an excuse.²⁴⁵

Despite the fact that the precarious employment regimes impoverish people by the fewer wage or threat of unemployment, the interviewees are not inclined to see themselves as impoverished. Due to their middle class culture- at least sustained by their families- poverty is seen as another social problem that is totally external to their problems. Differentiated world outlooks are also proposed by Erdoğan (Bora et.al. 2010) who compares the languages of unemployed skilled labor and poor people. Erdoğan's interviews with middle class unemployed reveals that unemployment is constructed as an abstract, impersonal and anonymous story. Likewise, we can consider teachers' abstention to talk about their own poverty in the same way.

The other important antinomies revealed in their discourse are related with their views about unemployment. Paradoxically, some teachers explain the unemployment on the basis of individual capacity and individual wrong preferences.

I am also thinking this: well, no one would become unemployed in this country, I know that too. People who really want to work and do something about it would not be unemployed in this country. Well, some can be unemployed since they don't like the salary or the working conditions. Yet it is impossible not to acknowledge them to be right.²⁴⁶

Bazısının devletten haberi yok. Kimisi diyor ki devlet bana bakar. 8 cocugu var gidiyor devlet kapısına bana ayakkabı ver. Ben bunlara kızıyorum üzülüyorum ama kızıyorum da. Çünkü bunu bilinçli yapmış."

²⁴⁵ Okan: "Yoksulluk bu iki şeyden kaynaklanıyor. Birincisi bu insanlar nasıl para kazanacaklarını bilmiyorlar. Mesela eğitim kursu açıldığında da gitmiyorlar. Yeniliğe kendilerini geliştirmeye kapalıdır. Bu bakımdan suçlu bulunabilir. Eğitim seviyeleri de çok düşük, okuma yazma oranı düşük. Okuma yazma bilmeyen veli sayısı çok. Okuma yazma kursu açtık burda, genelde kocaları kursa göndermek istemiyor karılarını, ya da kadınlar işte çocuguma bakıyorum diyerek gelmek istemiyor kayıt yapsak da."

²⁴⁶ Ebru: "Ben şunu da düşünüyorum. Yani kimse işsiz kalmaz bu ülkede onu da biliyorum. Yani bu ülkede gerçekten çalışmak isteyen gerçekten birşey yapmak isteyen insan işsiz kalmaz. Ha parayı beğenmediği için işsiz kalanlar olabilir. Ya da şartları beğenmediği için daha iyi. Gerçi hak vermemek de imkansız."

Should I say belittling the job, he/she is not content with what they have. [...] here people say that 'I am graduate of something, would I do that job'. But when they go abroad, they work as a pumper in gas station or waitress in restaurant. So? He feels it beneath him in here, but he does that job there. Actually they have something to do with it too.²⁴⁷

The contradictory responses to the several questions – covering the role of state, Kurdish issue, European Union, gender roles etc.- do not mean they provide me wrong answers or they are unconsciousness about the issue about which I asked. However, the antinomies of their discourses are embedded in society and determined by social norms, moral values, traditions that sedimented throughout years. All these chaotic and incoherent images or meanings in cultural life are produced and reproduced by everyday life through different mechanisms.

Even though the interviewees are highly critical towards the policies of government or support current struggles bringing the issue in political agenda, it is highly difficult to draw general scene of their views and attitudes about political struggle. Just some interviewees, who were actively participating political groups, thought that there is need to collective struggle to overcome this problem. According to Ali (30) and Osman (32), non-appointed teachers should come together on a national scale and raise their voices.

People should get together and be organized. It may be the union, I am a member of TGB for instance, or there is Eğitim-İş Union.²⁴⁸

Struggle will be in togetherness. We want to communize the struggle and include people from all strata. But unfortunately, our struggle does not end up with the appointment of these friends.²⁴⁹

Mikail (22), Hatice (29), Ebru (31), and Erhan (32) say that even if everybody will come together, then this may be resulted in effective outcome. According to them, in real life, this is not possible for teachers to come together and act as collectively. Many of them do not trust or believe in political struggles. Therefore,

²⁴⁷ Özlem: “İş beğenmeme mi diyim arık, kendine göre yetinmiyo, ...o şey olmuyor. Burda insanlar ben bu mezunuyum bu işi mi yapacam yok ben şu mezunuyum bu işi mi yapacam. Ama bir yurtdışına gittikleri zaman benzincilerde pompacı lokantalarda garson ee aynı işi burada yaptığı zaman mesleğine yediremiyor ama oraya gidince yapıyor. Aslında biraz insanlarda da var bişey.”

²⁴⁸ Ali: “İnsanlar örgütlenip bir araya gelecek. Bunlar sendikalar olur ben mesela TGB uyesiyim eğitim iş sendikası vardır mesela.”

²⁴⁹ Osman: “Mücadele birliktelikte olacak.Olabildiğince mücadeleyi ortaklaştırmak her kesimden insanı katmak istiyoruz. Ama işin acıcası üzücü bişey de var. Ama bizim yaptığımız mücadeleler ne yazık ki bu aradaşlrın atamaları ile sonuclanmıyor.”

the possibility of collective struggle or teachers' political movement cannot be taken into account as a solution. Some of them address the role of state to bring effective policies by restructuring education system and increasing the number of teachers to be employed. It is striking that Okan (36) support the idea of enhancing paid positions for teachers:

Paid teaching may be provided as an opportunity. Graduates of Faculty of Education, who work as a teacher for more than 5 years, can be moved to permanent staff considering their teaching experience, and their working under bad conditions. In other words, ücretli teaching can be improved. But I find tenured appointment inconvenient too. It is OK to have job assurance so that people are not fired with flimsy reasons. But an inspection mechanism is needed too, to see if he/she really performs teaching or not (Okan, 36).²⁵⁰

The interviews indicate that teachers do not trust either state or political struggles that can enhance their life conditions. However, the solution may be resulted in collective struggles framed and defined by class relations.

To sum up, this chapter was aimed to provide cultural analysis of precarious working relations in the case of non-appointed teachers' experiences, feelings and emotions in the daily life. First of all, it dealt with emotional aspects of their precarious jobs. Since the meanings of teaching profession have changed by the effects of precarious and competitive work culture, it can not be mentioned about ideal images of teaching profession for non-appointed teachers. The devalorization of teaching as a profession by the neo-liberal market values and education policies has dissolved the occupational identity and corrode the social ties among teachers. Flexible and temporary working relations have destroyed the solidarity and trust among teachers, so non-appointed teachers were inclined to alienate to their colleagues. The feeling of alienation is revealed itself in the statements of the paid teachers who saw themselves as separated from tenured teachers. The feeling of alienation is also related with the dissatisfaction and discontent in the working conditions. It is seen that all the non-appointed teachers were emotionally suffered from insecurity and uncertainty in their working life. When the self-perceptions or self images were questioned, suffice to say the feelings of being non-appointed

²⁵⁰ Okan: "Ben ücretli öğretmenlik bir fırsat olarak değerlendirilip hani eğitim fak mezunları, 5 seneden fazla yapanlar kadroya alınabilir öğretmenlik deneyimi göz önünde bulundurularak, zor şartlarda çalıştığı göz önüne alınarak. Yani ücretli öğretmenlikte iyileştirme yapılabilir. Ama ben öğretmenin tam böyle kadrolu atanmasının da sakıncalı olduğunu düşünüyorum. Hani iş güvencesi felan olsun eften puften sebeplerle işten atılmasın. Ama bir denetim mekanizması da olsun gerçekten öğretmenlik yapıyor mu, gerçekten görevini yapıyor mu?"

teacher are directly associated with emotional world of being unemployed. While the lower wages made non-appointed teachers dependent to their families, the feelings of inadequacy and unsuccess have decreased the self-esteem and self-respect. The comparison between non-appointed teachers and tenured teachers reveal that non-appointed teachers feel themselves as more disadvantageous in society. The discrimination between paid teachers and tenured teachers showed that paid teachers feel themselves as inferior against tenured teachers. Their feelings of anger and harshly critiques towards tenured teachers can be seen as individual responses to the existing separations.

The social and cultural differences shaped by differentiations along class, gender, positions in production process apparently show to what extent precarious working conditions has deepened the inequalities among teachers. On the one hand it can be mentioned about the discrimination between paid teachers and tenured teachers in public schools, on the other hand there are also socio-cultural differences among interviewees in terms of their economic conditions, their social and cultural capital. As a result of different combination and volume of cultural and social capital, some interviewees were seen as more advantageous than other. In fact, the opportunities and preferences of non-appointed teachers show that these are determined by social and economic conditions of them or their families.

Regarding individualized and atomized culture of neo-liberalism, political stances of non-appointed teachers were also tried to be understood. To put it briefly, most of interviewees avoided to present their beliefs or views as political or ideological. It can be generalized that the politics and ideology were associated with pejorative meanings. On the issue of political struggle, most of interviewees believed that political struggles could not able to orient social transformation or changes. Even Tuğba, who is active member of AYÖP, acknowledged that collective resistance of teachers is not possible in any case because of atomized and fragmented working and daily life of teachers. Since most of interviewees refused to join political protests and preferred to follow political groups in social media, it can be said that political struggles have negative connotations for them. While political struggles are seen as dangerous and uneasy actions, participation to protests or demonstrations was associated with the risk of being arrested or with having bad criminal record for job applications. In relation with depoliticized scene, state is seen as political actor who

should solve the problems of non-appointed teachers. However, most of them stated that they do not even trust the state or government.

CHAPTER V

CONCLUSION

The academic debates on precarious employment and precarization of labor since the 1970s are significant to understand the neo-liberal transformation of labor market and socio-cultural analysis of the new forms of production relations. While production relations have been reorganized on the basis of the flexible production, labor power has subjected to more precarious conditions. Under the guidance of flexibility, recent increase in the forms of works and of employment has fragmented labor force along the lines of standard forms of employment – full-time, secure and permanent- ,and non-standard forms of employment such as part-time, flexi-time, temporary, seasonal and fixed-term works. The neo-liberal economic policies aim to expand non-standards forms of employment in the labor market. On the one hand these policies based on the de-regulation strategies and the privatization of services dismantled social welfare regimes; on the other hand, labor power has been doubly precarized by the elimination of social security and employment benefits system. In relation to this general economic framework, this study aimed to contribute to the academic debates about the precarization and precarious employment by questioning the working and life conditions of the non-appointed teachers in Turkey.

Regarding the ideological role of education apparatus, the neo-liberal labor market needs skilled and flexible workers who are trained by education system. In recent years, Turkish education system has been restructured according to the requirements of flexible labor demands of neo-liberal market. The proposal of the Higher Education Board to close unattended academic departments can be regarded in this manner. This proposal shows that universities are expected to develop in academic branches of the high market demand²⁵¹. The role of education apparatus in the analysis of precarization of teachers' labor was discussed in the manners of

²⁵¹ A closer look at this proposal shows that the quota of departments of arts and sciences such as physics, biology and chemistry are aimed to be decreased or they are going to be closed down. <http://www.memurlar.net/haber/228554/#.UQqljWezfQU>

following questions: how did educational backgrounds determine job opportunities and work preferences of the interviewees? And to what extent were social and cultural differences increased by education apparatus?

As discussed in the manner of teachers' training process, university education is a significant indicator determining job opportunities, working conditions and average incomes during the works. The prestige and the quality of universities are highly considered during job applications in the private sector. As emphasized by Erdoğan (Bora et. al, 2011), it is accepted that metropolitan universities provide more advantages to teachers in order to find working positions in the private sector. As emphasized by some of interviewees, since private schools have mostly preferred employing the graduates of prestigious universities, the graduates of *Anatolian* universities have mainly found jobs in the private education centers whose working conditions are more insecure and inhumane than those at the private schools. This study confirmed that the universities from which the interviewees graduated are significant factors revealing the differentiation of social capital that is used for job opportunities in private sector. Like emphasized by Bourdieu, education system has deepened social and cultural hierarchies because of the unequal distribution of social and cultural capital.

In addition to the role of educational background in determination of social and cultural capital, there is need to pay attention to increasing social inequalities among different social classes. By the growing number of private courses preparing students to the centralized exams, privatized education services increases the inequalities between the higher and the lower classes in Turkey. Students who are coming from different social classes do not enter competitive exam system in an equal manner. Therefore, as shown in this study, the educational backgrounds of the non-appointed teachers exemplified the social differences among them as long as they are classified by labor market according to their success in the exams and their university preferences.

Although it is accepted that the most qualified and prestigious universities have brought about the more advantages in social and working life, the interviews also revealed that getting high scores in Public Personnel Selection Examination are more decisive for increasing the possibility of teachers' appointment. The statements of interviewees showed that being appointed is specifically associated with the ways

of preparation for the exam and the time preserved for this period; and these are more closely associated with the economic opportunities of graduates regardless of the quality of university education. Since every prospective teacher has to be prepared seriously for the exam after his/ her graduation, the private courses and the free time that are needed to study are only possible for those who can afford the fees of private courses and who does not necessarily need to work for the maintenance of his/ her life.

This thesis was also based upon precarious working conditions of the non-appointed teachers both in the public and the private sector. By the increasing number of graduates and limited number of teaching positions in schools, majority of graduates are confronting with the threat of unemployment or precarious working conditions in the education market. As a result of the elimination of people by Public Personnel Selection Exam, most of non-appointed teachers either work in the private education sector or find jobs in any other sectors. This study compared the precarious working conditions of paid teachers and teachers working in the private education centers. The most significant result of the interviews showed that the non-appointed teachers defined their working conditions as precarious, as long as their jobs are characterized with insecurity, uncertainty, and temporary relations. It was also shown that precarious working conditions have deteriorated the life standards of two groups of teachers and made them dependent to their families.

The main argument is that the absence of employment and of job security caused not only the feelings of precariousness in the work but also precarious life conditions for the non-appointed teachers. In other words, the precarious working conditions paved the ways of precarious life experiences in their lives. The field study showed that the non-appointed teachers have coped with the social, emotional and psychological effects of working under precarious conditions. In this study, it was aimed to delineate the scenes of precariousness in their daily life. The common feelings and experiences indicated that the more precariousness teachers experienced in their jobs resulted in the more precariousness they felt in daily life. The similarities on their experiences, feelings, anxieties and uncertain living conditions are significant variables showed how precariousness affects their social life in the same manner.

A closer look at the feelings and emotional world of the non-appointed teachers revealed that precariousness has affected their self-perceptions, self-images and self-worth. The non-appointed teachers, who were compelled to accept precarious works, are not only dissatisfied from their working relations but also disenchanted because they could not achieve their expectations after graduation. They thought that they are failing in the eyes of the society. Thus, they have always tried to escape the critiques and gazes of society. While they are also seen as failed in labor market, their professional knowledge is also underestimated and devaluated according to them. The devaluation of professional knowledge/experience or the corrosion of occupational identity comes up with the depreciation of the “self”.

The field study showed that expressions and statements of the interviewees are centered on their “self”. While they were comparing themselves with tenured teachers, they mostly emphasized their personal abilities or professional competencies. While doing this, they criticized the competencies of tenured teachers in order to prove themselves. This comparison may be seen closely associated with the competitive culture in which everyone is evaluated and judged individually. On the other hand, this atomized and individualized culture led individuals to deal with only their own problems and conditions. Even if the general problems of non-appointed teachers were commonly expressed by them, most of them were inclined to see her/his conditions as more victimized than others.

The separations and fragmentations in teaching profession were clearly observed in the expressions of some teachers. On the one hand, teachers working in private education centers criticized paid teachers because of the fact that they accepted humiliating working conditions of paid teaching and insult tenured teachers because they could not develop their teaching skills; on the other hand paid teachers blamed accused tenured teachers not working as much as themselves. Albeit labor market strategy of neo-liberalism creates fragmentation and stratification within and among occupations – fragmentation of labor market, it can be claimed that the emphasis on the “self” in interviews’ discourse also ideologically reproduced the occupational hierarchies in society. If we consider all diverse fragmentations along class, gender, the positions at work and forms of employment, it should be stated that non-appointed teachers alienated to their working relations. While they alienated to

their jobs, the social relations such as solidarity and trust were corroded among teachers in work places.

Besides the questioning of “self” for non-appointed teachers, I tried to show to what extent precarious relations are related with social and cultural hierarchies that already exist in class society. I tried to delineate the general scene of social and economic conditions of the interviewees. Some of interviewees, who worked as a paid teacher or worked in PECs for a while, are now unemployed and live with the financial support of their families. They are studying for the exam or trying to find more secure jobs. It is important to note that they left from their job and now have prepared for the exam through private courses. Ezgi, who drew confident profile during the interview, stated that she could leave from paid teaching by means of her family’s economic conditions. While she said that she did not let people to exploit her labor, she also said that she had chances to make this choice. She worked as a paid teacher just for gaining experience, not for the income. Ezgi, who graduated from private university, had entered into precarious working relations just for a while, but she did not want to bear those conditions more. In a similar vein, Fikret also had chance to get off his precarious work. Similar to the conditions of Ezgi (27), Fikret (34) could get private courses in order to prepare PPSE by the financial aids of his parents. However, he was seemed as inferior while he was talking about that he had to get money from his family at his age.

The other side of the coin is composed of teachers who could not get financial support from their families. Regarding the notion of *forced choices of necessity* attributed to lower classes by Bourdieu, the interviews revealed that teachers coming from lower class families are more vulnerable to accept precarious working relations. It should be stated that precarious works have been a compulsory choice for those teachers who are coming from lower class families. However, teachers coming from middle class families have opportunities to get off unbearable working conditions whenever they want. Those teachers who are coming from lower class families have no choice other than working. Therefore, precariousness may be psychologically and emotionally more harmful for those who have to bear precarious conditions for long years. As discussed in the study focused on the emotional world of white collar unemployed workers (Erdoğan in Bora et.al, 2010), social differences arising from class origins and positions have revealed themselves in precarious working relations.

The interviews indicated that the non-appointed teachers wanted to establish regular life which is only possible with permanent jobs guaranteed by income security. While they continue to their precarious jobs, they also try to find other alternatives which are assumed to be more secure than their current conditions. It can be claimed that the lower wages and insecure working environment led individuals to seek find better alternatives. Non-appointed teachers always look for a job like unemployed people. In that sense, it can be claimed that the emotional world of non-appointed teachers reminds the feelings and emotions of unemployed white collar workers at many points. The non-appointed teachers exemplified the emotional world of white collar unemployed people (Bora, 2011). The feelings of being unsuccessful, being regret for choices, escaping from the inquiring gaze of society, self-depreciation, being dependent on someone else and career crisis are important factors in the self analysis of the non-appointed teachers.

In parallel to the argument claiming that “precarity is this form of exploitation which, by operating only on the present, exploits simultaneously also the future” (Tsianos and Papadopoulos, 2006), it was seen that the future plans and expectations or the interviewees are uncertain and unstable like their present conditions. They just mentioned about short-range expectations that can be foreseen in the near future. This revealed that they avoid making long-range future plans or they even cannot make them. The despair and uncertainty for the future seems to imply the introverted personalities who always engage with their own problems and who believe to overcome their problems – even they are stemming from structural reasons- on their own. However, it is important to note that subjects are not passively engaged with structures or conditions, but also they have the capability to change or transform rules and regulations which are imposed to them. As reminded by Erdoğan and Bora (2011), subjection and subjectivation are concurrently realized and intimated processes. In other words, even though one is subjectivated by dominant ideology, one is also an advanced subject who is capable of being writer of his/her life story (p. 40).

A closer look at political stances revealed that individualization and depolitization strategies of the neo-liberal hegemony have been successfully formulated in the political stances of the interviewees. Most of the interviewees were agreed the idea that the politics is considered as unreliable and all of them criticized

politicians – whether they are leftist or rightist- for being self-interested. Rather than manifesting their own political stances, they defined their political views as apolitical and non-ideological. The only one issue about which they openly demonstrate their oppositions was related to education system and the conditions of appointment regulated by the government. While most of the interviewees - except those who are actively members of political groups- harshly criticized the government not to act scientifically in the field of education, they also tried to soften their heavy criticism by praising the “effective” policies of the government in other areas.

Nowadays, precarious teachers, whose social rights are eroded, are taking to the streets and reclaiming their social rights and benefits. Teachers across Europe are taking action against cuts from public spending. Thousands of teachers in UK, France, Italy, Spain, Greece and Portugal have gone on strike with public sector-workers²⁵² and protested austerity regimes being imposed on education. A wave of protests is also spreading to all over the world. For instance, over 25.000 teachers have gone on strike in Chicago in order to recall regulations providing job guarantees for laid off-teachers, elimination of the use of tests scores to evaluate teachers and fire poor performers²⁵³. As argued in the manner of precarity movements spreading throughout the world, workers both in the public sector and the private sector begin to organize and take to streets for demonstrations, protests. In the same context, recent labor movements in Turkey should be taken into account as a reaction to anti-labor policies of Turkish state. As long as labor market is increasingly determined by insecure and flexible working conditions, from call-center workers to employees in health and social services, from the non-appointed teachers to contract based research assistants are taking the streets in Turkey too.

A wave of protests and demonstrations of the non-appointed teachers has become visible in Turkey since 2010. It can be said that AYÖP has paved the ways of struggle for the non-appointed teachers. Even though most of the interviewees stated that they do not actively take part in AYÖP, the necessity and the importance of struggle has been shown by AYÖP activities. It should be said that AYÖP has created awareness in this regard. There is also need to state that in the last few years

²⁵² <http://www.teachersolidarity.com/blog/european-teacher-strike-wave-builds-against-cuts/>

²⁵³ <http://www.foxnews.com/us/2012/09/10/chicago-teachers-to-go-on-strike-after-talks-with-district-fail/>

recent protests organized by different non-appointed teachers' groups seem as concentrated on a limited area and lacking of mass support. The separations among teachers' political groups cannot be analyzed independently from heterogeneous and disorganized characteristics of labor movements after 1980s. It seems to be more difficult to organize collective resistance today's Turkey where trade unionization has been decreased seriously; the rights of strikes and collective bargaining have been eroded since the late 1970s. However, as shown by TEKEL resistance, laborers meet in the common faith of precarization. Today's total precarization of labor creates the common ground for worker to act together. Even though labor movements are segmented, disparate and lacking of mass support, there is also possibility to create common grounds that bring laborers together acting against precarious working relations. In that sense, the feelings and emotions shared by workers who are subjected to precarious working conditions are important to understand how to bring people together. Therefore, there is need to organize a collectivity based on the cooperation and collaboration of the non- appointed teachers, the employees in health and social services, the contract laborers, the contract research assistants – namely all workers under the precarious working conditions.

REFERENCES

Althusser, L. (2006) *İdeoloji ve Devletin İdeolojik Aygıtları*, İstanbul: İthaki Yayınları.

Althusser, L. (2008) *On Ideology*, London: Verso

Aglietta, M. (1979) *A Theory of Capitalist Regulation: The US Experience*, London: Verso.

Andersen, J.G. and Jensen, H. (eds.) (2002) *Changing Labor Markets, Welfare Policies and Citizenship*, Bristol: The Policy Press.

Ansal, H. (1996) *Esnek Üretimde İşçiler ve Sendikalar*, (1. Basım), İstanbul: Birleşik Metal-İş Sendikası Yayınları.

Ball, S.J. & Youdell, D. (2008) *Hidden Privatization in Public Education*. Brussels: Education International. Available at: <http://download.ei-ie.org/docs/IRISDocuments/Research%20on%20Education/Privatisation%20and%20Commercialisation/2007-00242-01-E.pdf>

Beck, U. (2000) *The Brave New World of Work*, Cambridge: Polity.

Belek, İ. (1997) "Postkapitalist" Paradigmalar Post Kapitalizm- Endüstri Ötesi Toplum- Post Fordizm- Esnek Uzmanlaşma- İkinci Endüstriyel Bölünme- Enofrmasyon Toplumu- Disorganize Kapitalizm, İstanbul: Sorun Yayınları.

Bora, A. (2011). "Çalışmakla var olacağım gibi...": İssizin Duygu Dünyası. In T. Bora, A. Bora, N. Erdoğan, & İ. Üstün (Eds.), "Boşuna mı Okuduk?" Türkiye'de Beyaz Yakalı İşsizliği (pp. 117-139). İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.

Bora, T., & Erdoğan, N. (2011). "Cüppenin, Kılıcın ve Kalemın Mahcup Yoksulları": Yeni Kapitalizm, Yeni İşsizlik ve Beyaz Yakalılar. In T. Bora, A. Bora, N. Erdoğan, & İ. Üstün (Eds.), "*Boşuna mı Okuduk?*": *Türkiye'de Beyaz Yakalı İşsizliği* (pp. 13-44). İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.

Bora, T., Bora, A., Erdoğan, N., & Üstün, İ. (2011). *Boşuna mı okuduk?: Türkiye'de Beyaz Yakalı İşsizliği* (1. ed.). (N. Erdoğan, Ed.) İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.

Boratav, K. (2003) *Türkiye İktisat Tarihi 1908-2002*, İstanbul: İmge Kitabevi Yayınları.

Boratav, K. (2005) *1980'li Yıllarda Türkiye'de Sosyal Sınıflar ve Bölüşüm*, İstanbul: İmge Kitabevi Yayınları.

Bourdieu, P. (1977) *Outline of a Theory of Practice*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bourdieu, P. (1984) *Distinction: A Social Critiques of Judgement of Taste*, Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Bourdieu, P. (1986) "The Forms of Capital" in J. G. Richardson (ed.) *Handbook of Theory and Research Fort he Sociology of Education*, New York: Greenwood Press, pp. 241- 254

Bourdieu, P. (1992) *The Logic of Practice*, Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Bourdieu, P. (1998) *Acts of Resistance: Against the Tyranny of the Market*, New York: The New Press.

Bourdieu, P (2000) *Acts of Resistance: Against the New Myths of our time*, Cambridge: Polity Press

Bourdieu, P. (2009) *Distinction: A Social Critique of The Judgement of Taste*, New York: Routledge.

Boyer, R. (1990) *The Regulation School: A Critical Introduction*, New York: Columbia University Press.

Bulutay, T. (ed.) (1999) *The Burdens Related with Turkish Labour Markets and Policies*. Ankara: ILO/SIS.

Candeias, M. (2005) *Double precarisation of labor and reproduction -Perspectives of expanded (re)appropriation*, Retrieved November 18, 2012, from Rosa Luxemburg Stiftung:

http://www.rosalux.de/fileadmin/wgdw_uploads/Double_precarisation.pdf

Candeias, M. (2007) Unmaking and Remaking of Class: The Impossible "Precariat" Between Fragmentation and Movement, *Rosa Luxemburg Stiftung Policy Paper* , 1-12.

Castel, R. (2000) “ Nicht Exklusion, sondern Desaffiliation” in: *Das Argument* 217, 38.Jg., 1996, (pp.775-80) ders., *Die Metamorphosen der sozialen Frage: Eine Chronik der Loharbeit*, Konstanz 2000

Castells, M. (2005) *Enformasyon Çağı: Ekonomi, Toplum, Kültür, I. Cilt Ağ Toplumunun Yükselişi*, İstanbul: Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları.

Cranford, C., Vosko L. and Zukewich N. (2003) Precarious Employment in The Canadian Labor Market: A Statistical Portrait, *Just Labor*, 3: 6-22.

Chung, H. (2008) Flexibility for Whom? Working Time Flexibility Practices of European Companies. Retrieved on 13 december, 2012 from: <http://www.rwi.nl/CmsData/Signaal%202009/Flexibility%20for%20whom.pdf>

Crehan, K. (2011) Gramsci's Concept of Common Sense: A Useful Concept for Anthropologists? *Journal of Modern Italian Studies*, 16(2): 273-287.

Ercan, F. (2004) "Sermaye Birikiminin Çelişkili Sürekliliği: Türkiye'nin Küresel Kapitalizmle Bütünleşme Sürecine Eleştirel Bir Bakış", in N. Balkan and S. Savran (eds.) *Neoliberalizmin Tahribatı: Türkiye'de Ekonomi, Toplum ve Cinsiyet*, (pp. 9-44). İstanbul: Metis Yayınları.

Ercan, F. (2005) Neo-liberal Eğitim Politikalarını Anlamak, *Sivil Toplum* 3(12):17-37.

Ercan, F. and Uzunyayla, D. (2008) "Türkiye'de Eğitim Sistemine Yönelik Yeni Talepler ve Yeni Aktörlere Sınıfsal Bir Bakış" in S. Akyol, M. K. Çoşkun, Z. Yılmaz, M. B. Aydın and R. Altunpolat (eds.) *Dönüştürülen Üniversiteler ve Eğitim Sistemimiz* (pp. 125-145). Ankara: Eğitim Sen Yayınları.

Erdoğan, N. (2011). Sancılı Dil, Hadım Edilen Kendilik ve Aşınan Karakter. In T. Bora, A. Bora, N. Erdoğan, & İ. Üstün, "Boşuna mı Okuduk?": Türkiye'de Beyaz Yakalı İşsizliği (1. ed., pp. 75-116). İstanbul: İletişim.

Erdoğan, N. (2012) *Sınıf Karşılaşmaları 3: Devlet Okullarında Sınıflar ve Okullar*, Birgün, Retrieved on 21.09.2012 http://www.birgun.net/actuels_index.php?news_code=1343723956&year=2012&month=07&day=31

Ertürk, E. (2010) "Türkiye'de Öğretmenlik Mesleğinin Dönüşümü" in A. Buğra (ed.) *Sınıftan Sınıfa Fabrika Dışında Çalışma Manzaraları*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.

Fairclough, N (2003) "Dil ve İdeoloji" in B. Çoban, and Z. Özarslan (eds.) *Söylem ve İdeoloji: Mitoloji, Din, İdeoloji*, İstanbul: Su Yayınları.

Forgacs, D. (2010) *Gramsci Kitabı Seçme Yazılar: 1916-1935*, Ankara: Dipnot.

Frassanito Network (2006) “Precarious, Precarization, Precariat?” Retrieved November 18, 2012, from Mute Magazine <http://www.metamute.org/editorial/articles/precarius-precarisation-precariat>

Geniş, A. (2006) İşçi Sınıfının Kıyısında: Küçük Sanayi İşçileri Üzerine Bir İnceleme. Ankara: Dipnot Yayınları.

Gramsci, A. (1999) *Selections From Prison Notebooks*. Q. Hoare and G. N. Smith (eds.) London: Lawrence & Wishart.

Grossberg, L. (1986) “On postmodernism and articulation: An interview with Stuart Hall” reprinted from *Journal of Communication Inquiry* vol: 10(2): 45-60, in S. Hall, D.Morley, Kuan-Hsing Chen (1996), *Critical Dialogues in Cultural Studies*, London: Routledge.

Gök, F. (2004) Eğitimin Özelleştirilmesi. In N. Balkan & S. Savran (Eds.) *Neoliberalizmin Tahribatı: 2000’li Yıllarda Türkiye* (pp. 94-111). İstanbul: Metis

Gül, H. (2008) Türkiye’nin Eğitim Sorunları, AKP’nin Eğitime Bakışı ve Çözüm Önerileri. *Toplum ve Demokrasi*. Vol: 2(3), pp.181-197.

Güler, B. A. (2003) Türkiye’de Personel Rejimi Esasları, Türkiye’de Kamu Personel Rejiminin Yeniden Yapılandırılması Sempozyumu 22-23 Şubat 2003. Retrieved 14 December, 2012 from: <http://80.251.40.59/politics.ankara.edu.tr/bguler/pdf/dpb-turkiye.pdf>

Güler, B. A. (2005) *Yeni Sağ ve Devletin Değişimi: Yapısal Uyarılama Politikaları 1980-1995*, İstanbul: İmge Kitabevi Yayınları

Güler, B. A. (2005) *Devlette Reform Yazıları: Dünya’da ve Türkiye’de Ekonomik Liberalizasyondan Siyasi-İdari Liberalizasyona*, Ankara: Paragraf Yayınevi.

Güzelsari, S.(2007) “Küresel Kapitalizmin ‘Anayasası’: GATS”, in F. Ercan, T. Tören, Ö. Taştan, M. S. Tümtaş, and Ö. Tezcek (eds.) *Türkiye’de Kapitalizmin Güncel Sorunları*, (pp.177-217). Ankara: Dipnot Yayınları.

Hall, S. (2001) “Encoding/ Decoding”, in M. G. Durham and D. M. Kellner (eds.) *Media and Cultural Studies: KeyWorks*, Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

Harvey, D. (1989) *The Conditions of Postmodernity: An Enquiry into the Origins of Cultural Change*. Cambridge&Oxford: Blackwell

Keskin, D. (2012a) Eğitimde Piyasalaşma ve Öğretmen Emeğinde Dönüşüm, *Çalışma ve Toplum*, 32(1): 167-186.

Keskin, D. (2012b) *Bitmeyen Sınavlar Yaşanmayan Hayatlar: Eğitimde Paradigma Değişimi*, Ankara: Dipnot.

Krahn, H. (1991) Nonstandard Work Arrangements, *Perspectives on Labor and Income*, 3(4).

Krahn, H. (1995) Nonstandard Work on The Rise, *Perspectives on Labor and Income*, Winter, 35-42.

Kuşaksız, A. (2011) Kadrosuz Usta Öğreticilerin Sosyal Güvenlik Hakları, *Yönetim ve Ekonomi*, 18(2): 23-35.

Labor Law (2003) Labor Law No. 4857. Retrieved September 29, 2012 from: <http://www.mevzuat.adalet.gov.tr/html/1243.html>

Lorey, I. (2010) Becoming Common: Precarization as Political Constituting, Retrieved 22 November, 2012 *E-Flux* from: <http://www.e-flux.com/journal/becoming-common-precariation-as-political-constituting/>

Lewchuk, W., Wolff, A., King, A. and Polanyi, M. (2003) From Job Strain to Employment Strain: Health Effects of Precarious Employment, *Just Labor*, Fall, 23-35.

Maguire, M. (2002) "Globalization, Education Policy and the Teachers". *International Studies in Sociology of Education*. Vol.12 (3). Retrieved November 28, 2012 from : http://www.triangle.co.uk/pdf/validate.asp?j=iss&issuevol12&issue=3&year=2002&article3_Maguire_ISSE_12_3

McCarthy, J. (2006) Is Precarity Enough?, Retrieved 18 November, 2012, from Mute Magazine: <http://www.metamute.org/editorial/articles/precariety-enough>

Molnar, A & Garcia, D.R. (2007) The Expanding Role of Privatization in Education Implications for Teacher Education and Development. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, Vol: 34 (2), pp. 11-24.

Neilson, B. and Rossiter, N. (2005) From Precarity to Precariousness and Back Again: Labor, Life and Unstable Networks. Retrieved August 24, 2012, *The Fibreculture Journal*:

<http://five.fibreculturejournal.org/fcj-022-from-precariety-toprecariousness-and-back-again-labor-life-and-unstable-networks/>

Neilson, B. and Rossiter, N. (2008) Precarity as a Political Concept, or Fordism As Exception, *Theory, Culture and Society*, 25(7-8): 51-72.

Oğuz, S. (2012) "Sınıf Mücadelesinde Özne Sorunu: Proletarya mı, Prekarya mı?" in O. Göztepe (ed.) *Güvencesizleştirme: Süreç, Yanılgı, Olanak*, (pp. 229-250). Ankara: NotaBene Yayınları.

Oudenampsen, M. and Sullivan, G. (2004) Precarity and N/European Identity: (An interview with Alex Foti (Chainworkers)), *MUTE*, Retrieved 22.11.2012: <http://www.metamute.org/editorial/articles/precariety-and-neuropean-identity-interview-alex-foti-chainworkers>

Onaran, O. (2003) Emek Piyasasına Dayalı Yapısal Uyum: Katılık Miti. In N. Balkan & S. Savran (Eds.) *Neoliberalizmin Tahribatı: Türkiye'de Ekonomi, Toplum ve Cinsiyet*, (pp. 211-233). İstanbul: Metis Yayınları,.

Öngen, T. (2003) “‘Yeni Liberal’ Dönüşüm Projesi ve Türkiye Deneyimi”, in A. H. Köse, F. Şenses and E. Yeldan (eds.) *İktisat Üzerine Yazılar I: Küresel Düzen, Birikim, Devlet ve Sınıflar*, (pp.161-191) İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.

Özüğurlu, M. (2005) Anadolu’da Küresel Fabrikanın Doğuşu: Yeni İşçilik Örüntülerinin Sosyolojisi. İstanbul: İstanbul Halkevi İktisadi İşletmesi.

Özüğurlu, M. (2010) Tekel Direnişi: Sınıflar Mücadelesi Üzerine Anımsamalar. In G. Bulut (Ed.) *Tekel Direnişinin Işığında Gelenekselden Yeniye İşçi Sufi Hareketi*, (pp. 45-63). Ankara: Nota Bene Yayınları.

Özveri, Murat (2012) Güvencesiz Çalışmanın Hukuki Dayanakları, *Çalışma ve Toplum*, Vol: 33(2), pp. 147-172.

Reay, D. (2005) Beyond Consciousness? The Psychic Landscape of Social Class, *Sociology*, Vol: 39(5), pp. 911-928.

Rebel, H. (1989) Cultural Hegemony and Class Experience: A Critical Reading of Recent Ethnological-Historical Approaches, *American Ethnologist*, Vol: 16(1), pp. 117-136.

Reilly, P. (2001) *Flexibility at Work: Balancing the interests of employers and employee*, Hampshire: Gower Publishing Limited.

Robinson, P. (2000) “Insecurity and the Flexible Workforce. In E. Heery and J. Salmon (Eds.) *The Insecure Workforce*, (pp.38-51).London: Routledge.

Roskam, E. (2009) *Liberalizing Education in Turkey: Social Disparities and The Future of Democracy*. Paper presented at International Symposium on Social Rights, Antalya. Retrieved September 23, 2012 from <http://www.sosyalhaklar.net/2009/bildiri/rosskam.pdf>

Savul, G. (2008) *Güvencesiz İstihdam, Örgütsel Dönüşüm ve Çalışma Üzerine Etkileri*. Unpublished Master Thesis submitted to Graduate School of Social Sciences, Ankara: Ankara University.

Sennett, R. (1998) *The Corrosion of Character: The Personal Consequences of Work in the New Capitalism*, New York: W.W. Norton & Company.

Sennett, R. (2003) *Respect in A World of Inequality*, New York: W.W. Norton & Company.

Sennett, R. (2010) *Karakter Aşınması: Yeni Kapitalizmde İşin Kişilik Üzerine Etkileri*, İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları.

Sennett, R. (2011) *Yeni Kapitalizmin Kültürü*, İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları.

Sennett, R. (2012) *Saygı: Eşit Olmayan bir Dünyada*, İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları

Serdar, S. (2008) *İlköğretim Öğrencilerinin ailelerinin yaptığı harcamaların tür ve miktarının belirlenmesi*, Gazi Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Yayınlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi, Ankara.

Seymour, R. (2012, February 10) We Are All Precarious - On the Concept of the 'Precariat' and its Misuses, *New Left Project*, Retrieved May 16, 2012, from: http://www.newleftproject.org/index.php/site/article_comments/we_are_all_precario_us_on_the_concept_of_the_precariat_and_its_misuses

Skeggs, B. (1997) *Formations of Class and Gender: Becoming Respectable*. London: SAGE

Smith, V. (2001) *Crossing the Great Divide: Worker Risk and Opportunity in the New Economy*, Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Stanford, J. and Vosko, L. (eds.). (2004) *Challenging the Market: The Struggle to Regulate Work and Income*, Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Swartz, D. (2011) *Kültür ve İktidar: Pierre Bourdieu'nün Sosyolojisi* (E. Gen Trans). İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.

Şahin, Ö. (2008) "Yalancıkdan Öğretmenlik ve Kadınlar / Yeni Liberal Eğitim Düzeninde Yenilenmiş Öğretmen İstihdam Rejimi", *Eğitim ve Bilim İshkolunda Çalışan Kadınların Sosyal Hakları ve İş Güvencesi Sempozyumu*, Ankara: Eğitim Sen Yayınları.

Şenses, F. (1996) "Structural Adjustment Policies and Employment in Turkey" *EDC Working Paper* No.96/01. Ankara: Middle East Technical University.

Tarman, B. (2008) *The European Union and The Modernization of The Turkish Education System*, New York: Cambria Press.

Thompson, E.P (1978) "Eighteenth- Century English Society: Class Struggle without Class?" *Social History* 3, no.2 (May 1978): 149. n:36

Tsianos, V. Papadopoulos, D (2006) *Prearity: A savage Journey to the Heart of Embodied Capitalism*. Retrieved January 20, 2013 from <http://eipc.net/transversal/1106/tsianospapadopoulos/en>

Tucker, D. (2002) *'Precarious' Non-Standard Employment- A Review of the Literature*, Labor Market Policy Group, Retrieved on 07.10.2007: <http://www.dol.govt.nz/pdfs/PrecariousNSWorkLitReview.pdf>

Ünal, L. I. (2005) Öğretmen İmgesinde Neoliberal Dönüşüm, *Eğitim Bilim Toplum*, 11: 4-15.

Voloshinov, V. N. (1973) *Marxism and the Philosophy of Language*, Harvard University Press: Cambridge.

Vosko, L. (2010) *Managing the Margins: Gender, Citizenship, and International Regulation of Precarious Employment*, New York: Oxford University Press.

Whatman, R. (1994) ‘Non-Standard’ Work in New Zealand-What We Know”, in P. S. Morrison (ed.) *Labor, Employment and Work in New Zealand*, Wellington: Victoria University, pp. 356-366.

REPORTS

Ministry of National Education (1965) Devlet Memurları Kanunu coded 657, Retrieved 30.09.2012 from: <http://mevzuat.meb.gov.tr/html/dmk.html>

Ministry of National Education (1973) Milli Eğitim Temel Kanunu, Retrieved 20.09.2012 from: <http://mevzuat.meb.gov.tr/html/88.html>

Ministry of National Education (2005) Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı Taşra Teşkilatında Öğretmen İhtiyacının Karşılınması Bakımından Alanlar Bazında Öğretici Görevinde Kısmi Zamanlı Geçici Personel İstihdamı ile Bu Personele Ödenecek Ücretlere İlişkin Karar, Retrieved 23.09.2012 from: http://mevzuat.MONE.gov.tr/html/25932_0.html

Ministry of National Education (2006) Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı Yönetici ve Öğretmenlerinin Ders ve Ek Ders Saatlerine İlişkin Karar, Retrieved 13.11.2012 from: http://mevzuat.MONE.gov.tr/html/26378_0.html

Ministry of National Education (2007) Özel Öğretim Kurumları Kanunu, Retrieved 24.09.2012 from: http://mevzuat.meb.gov.tr/html/26434_0.html

Ministry of National Education (2007) Orta Öğretim Kurumlarına Geçiş Yönergesi, Retrieved 21.09.2012 from: http://mevzuat.MONE.gov.tr/html/2602_1.html

Ministry of National Education (2010) Milli Eğitim İstatistikleri: Yaygın Eğitim 2009-2010, Retrieved 21.09.2012 from: <http://sgb.MONE.gov.tr/istatistik/index.htm>

Ministry of National Education (2012) Milli Eğitim İstatistikleri: Örgün Eğitim 2011-2012, Retrieved 20.09.2012 from: <http://sgb.MONE.gov.tr/istatistik/index.htm>

Ministry of National Education Strategy Development Presidency (2007) Türk Eğitim Sistemi, MONE Yayınları.

Ministry of National Education Strategy Development Presidency (2009) MONE 2010-2014 Stratejik Planı, Retrieved 21.09.2012 from: http://sgb.MONE.gov.tr/Str_yon_planlama_V2/MONESTratejikPlan.pdf

Müstakil Sanayici ve İşadamları Derneği (2006) *Türkiye Ekonomisi 2006*, İstanbul: MÜSİAD Yayınları.

Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (1996) *OECD Economic Surveys: Turkey*, Paris.

Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (2011) *Education At a Glance: 2011*, Retrieved 21.10.2012 from: <http://www.oecd.org/education/preschoolandschool/educationataglance2011oecdindicators.htm>

SOSYAL- İŞ (2010) MEB'e Bağlı Dershanelerde Çalışan Öğretmenler için 15 Soruda Sözleşme ve Temel Haklar Broşürü. Haziran. Ankara.

Ölçme Seçme ve Yerleştirme Merkezi (2000) 1999-2000 Öğretim Yılı Yüksek Öğrenim İstatistikleri Kitabı, Retrieved 23.10.2012 from:

<http://www.osym.gov.tr/belge/1-13384/1999-2000-ogretim-yili-yuksekogretim-istatistikleri-kit-.html>

Ölçme Seçme ve Yerleştirme Merkezi (2012c) 1999-2000 Öğretim Yılı Yüksek Öğrenim İstatistikleri Kitabı, Retrieved 23.10.2012 from: <http://www.osym.gov.tr/belge/1-13575/2011-2012-ogretim-yili-yuksekogretim-istatistikleri.html>

Ölçme Seçme ve Yerleştirme Merkezi (2011) 2011 Yılı Ölçme Seçme ve Yerleştirme Merkezi Başkanlığı Faaliyet Raporu, Retrieved 22.10.2012 from: <http://www.osym.gov.tr/dosya/1-60780/h/2012-yili-osym-mali-durum-ve-beklentiler-raporu.pdf>

Ölçme Seçme ve Yerleştirme Merkezi (2012a) KPSS Lisans Başvuru Kılavuzu, Retrieved 24.10.2012 from: <http://www.osym.gov.tr/dosya/1-59846/h/2012kpsslisanskilavuz-942012.pdf>

Ölçme Seçme ve Yerleştirme Merkezi (2012b) Yükseköğretim Programları ve Kontenjanları Kılavuzu, Retrieved 24.10.2012 from: <http://dokuman.osym.gov.tr/pdfdokuman/2012/OSYS/2012OSYSKONTKILAVUZ.pdf>

Ölçme Seçme ve Yerleştirme Merkezi (2012c) 1999-2000 Öğretim Yılı Yüksek Öğrenim İstatistikleri Kitabı, Retrieved 23.10.2012 from: <http://www.osym.gov.tr/belge/1-13575/2011-2012-ogretim-yili-yuksekogretim-istatistikleri.html>

Türkiye İşveren Sendikaları Konfederasyonu (1999) *Çalışma Hayatında Esneklik*, Ankara: TİSK.

Türkiye İşveren Sendikaları Konfederasyonu (2006) 17. Milli Eğitim Şurasına Sunduğu Görüş ve Öneriler, <http://www.tisk.org.tr/duyurular.asp?ayrinti=True&id=2047>

Türkiye İşveren Sendikaları Konfederasyonu (2006) TİSK ve TÜRK-İŞ Eğitim ve İstihdamda Etkinlik Artırma Projesi Sonuç Konferansı, TİSK yay. Yayın No:271

Türk Eğitim Derneği (2010) *Orta Öğretime ve Yüksek Öğretime Geçiş Sistemi*.

TÜRK-İŞ and SBF (2012) Ulusal İstihdam Stratejisi: Eleştirel Bir Bakış.Ulusal İstihdam Stratejisi Sempozyumu, 13 Nisan 2012, Ankara Türkiye İşçi Sendikaları Konfederasyonu. Retrieved 23.10.2012 from: http://spm.ku.edu.tr/wp-content/uploads/pdf/uis_elestirel.pdf

Türkiye İstatistik Kurumu (2010) Yaygın Eğitim Kurunmları Genel, Retrieved 05.11.2012 from: http://www.tuik.gov.tr/VeriBilgi.do?alt_id=14

TÜSİAD (2002) Yeni Rebabet Stratejileri ve Türk Sanayisi, Retrieved 11.12.2012 from: http://www.tusiad.org/_rsc/shared/file/yenirekabet.pdf

TÜSİAD (2002) İşgücü Piyasalarının Etkinliğinin Arttırılmasında Özel İstihdam Kurumlarının ve Esnek Çalışma Biçimlerinin Rolü, (Yayın no.Tusiad-T/2002-10/328).

TÜSİAD (2006) Eğitim ve Sürdürülebilir Büyüme: Türkiye Deneyimi, Riskler, Fırsatlar. Yay. No, TÜSİAD-T-2006-06-420

United Nations Development Programme (2006) *Human Development Report*, Retrieved 6.11.2012 from: <http://hdr.undp.org/en/reports/global/hdr2006/>

World Bank (2005) *Turkish Education Sector Study*, Retrieved 23.10.2012 from: http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTTURKEY/Resources/361616-1142415001082/ESS_Main_Report_V1.pdf

Yükseköğretim Kurulu (1998) Eğitim Fakülteleri Öğretmen Yetiştirme Programlarının Yeniden Düzenlenmesi, Mart.

Yükseköğretim Kurulu. (2007) Öğretmen Yetiştirme ve Eğitim Fakülteleri: 1982-2007, Temmuz.

APPENDIX A: SAMPLE INTERVIEW

ORIGINAL SCRIPT OF INTERVIEW WITH HAKAN, 18.04.2012, ANKARA

Seher Sađırođlu: Biraz kendinizi tanıtarak başlayalım.

Hakan Hoca: Ben normalde biyoloji öğretmeniyim. Sınıf öğretmeni olarak görev yapıyorum. Şu anda YUSOP öğretmeniyim. Yani yetiştirici sınıflar öğretmenliği. Yaşı geçmiş, sınıfının daha üst yaşında olan öğrencileri eğitime tekrar kazandırmak için sınıf atlatma yöntemine kullanan bir metod. Yetiştirici sınıf öğretmenliği yapıyorum. Şimdiye kadar sınıf öğretmenliği yaptım, branş öğretmenliği yaptım matematik, ingilizce derslerine girdim. Ücretli öğretmen olarak çalışıyorum şu anda

SS: Yetiştirici öğretmenlik ne?

HH: YUSOP, yetiştirici sınıf öğretmenliği yine ücretli öğretmen olarak yapıyorum.

SS: Haftada kaç saat dersini oluyor peki?

HH: Haftada 30 saat

SS: Biyoloji öğretmenliğine nasıl karar verdiniz peki?

HH: Lise öğretmenim biyoloji öğretmenimden etkilendim. Biraz da tıpy istiyordum. Tıpy'a yakın olduğu için biyolojiyi tercih ettim, ilgim olduğu için. Lise öğretmenimizi de örnek aldığım için, o karar vermem de etkili oldu

SS: Peki şu anda sınıf öğretmenliği yapıyorsunuz, neden?

HH: Çocukları sevdiğim için. Şimdi ücretli öğretmen olduğunuz zaman okullarda karar almada çok sosyal olamıyorsunuz, bir de ücretli öğretmenlik de sadece ek ders ücreti aldığınız için branşa girdiğinizde ne kadar girerseniz girin 30 saati tamamlayamıyorsunuz, daha az ücret alıyorsunuz yani girdiğinize değmiyor. O nedenle sınıf öğretmenliği yapmaya karar verdim. Sınıf öğretmenliğinde günde 6 saat ful ders alıyorsunuz ama branşta matematik ingilizce de mümkün değil

SS: hangi üniversiteden mezunsunuz?

HH: Harran Üniversitesi fen edebiyat fakültesi mezunuyum. Ama pedagojik formasyon standart veriyorlardı bize. 2002 mezunuyum. Bizde biyolog fen-edebiyat mezunu olanlara biyolog deniyor, eğitim fakültesinden mezun olanlara biyoloji öğretmeni deniyor. Bizim her iki ünvanımız da var.

SS: Seçerken bu önemli oldu mu?

HH: Yok yok hiç...Bunları okurken öğrendik

SS: Hangi liseden mezunsunuz?

HH: Mimar Sinan lisesi mezunuyum. Demetevler birinci cadde. Genel bir liseydi-düz liseydi. Öğretmenlerimiz genelde tecrübeliydi şehir merkezi olduğu için. Öğretmenlerimizin hepsi alanında bilgi sahibiydi, uzmanlığı vardı. O yüzden lise öğrenimi açısından kendimi şanslı buluyorum. İyi bir lise okuduğumu düşünüyorum.

SS: Peki neden Harran üniversitesi? Sınav vardı siz girdiğinizde değil mi?

HH: Tabi sınav vardı. Ben aslında Ankara'yı düşünüyordum. Gazi Üniversitesi ya da Ankara. Doğup büyüdüğüm şehirde okumayı düşünüyordum. Ama puanım yetmediği için mecburen Urfa'ya gitmek zorunda kaldım. Oranın da sosyal imkanları zayıftı kendimi tam yetiştirdiğime inanmadım. Hani sadece diploma değildir çünkü üniversite okumak.

SS: Aileniz burada mı?

HH: Ailem burada oturuyor, ankarada.

SS: Aslen nerelisiniz?

HH: Doğma büyüme Ankara'lıyım, aslen Gaziantep'li.

SS: Anne baba ne işle meşgul?

HH: Annem okuma yazma bilmiyor, babam da serbest meslek, orta okul terk. İşte araba alıp satıyordu arada emlak işi yapıyordu. O şekilde.

SS: Bu dönemde hiç özel okula gitme şansınız var mıydı?

HH: Yok özel okul yoktu. Özel okul üst kesime hitap ediyor. Bizde yoktu öyle durum. Hep devlet okullarında okudum.

SS: Harran'da aldığınız eğitimden memnun muydunuz?

HH: Yok kesinlikle memnun değildim. Türkiyede üniversite sayısı arttırılıyordu o da sayısı arttırılan üniversitelere dahildi. Ama aldığımız eğitimin hiç üniversite düzeyinde olduğuna inanmıyorum. Kredi yurtların erkek yurduymuş daha önceden. Dört duvar arasına sıra koyup öğrenim yapıyorduk. Yani labaratuara biz mezun olurken yeni yeni mikroskoplar alınıyordu. Uygulama olsun, gezi olsun, pratik bilgiler olsun, biyoloji çünkü doğa bilimidir, kesinlikle tatmin edici olduğuna inanmıyorum. Biyolojiden mezun olup da biyolojiyi bilmeyen mezunlar vardı orda. İnsanlar hani ekmek parası için okuduğunu hissettiriyordu. Hani mezun olayım bir şekilde işe gireyim felan gibi. Ama ben şuna karşıyım hani üniversiteler açıldığında masraf yok diye en başta fen-edebiyat fakülteleri açılıyor. Kara tahta, sırayı

koyuyorsunuz felan. Açılan hemen hemen her üniversitede fen-edebiyat fakültesi var. Bu yüzden tabi mezun olduktan sonra bunların sayısı arttırıldı. Tabi biz bu yüzden mağdur olduk. Ben normalde 2000 mezunuyum. 12 senedir atama bekliyorum

SS: Her sene girdiniz mi sınava?

HH: Tabi her sene giriyorum

SS: Özel olarak hazırlandığınız bir dönem oldu mu?

HH: Ekonomik durumum el vermiyordu. Ufak da olsa bir işte çalışıp hazırlandığım oluyordu. Ama son senelerde sadece sınava hazırlanmayı bıraktım. Çalışırken çünkü göze alamadım işi bırakmayı. Çünkü her sene işe giriyordum sınava 2-3 ay kala işi tekrar bırakıyordum. Sınav bitiyordu tekrar iş arıyordum. O çok yıpratıcı oluyordu

SS: Bu arada yaptığınız işler neydi?

HH: (gülüyor) Valla yaptığım işler...Okuldan mezun oldum, ilk mezun olduğumda sudan çıkmış balık gibi oluyor. Benzin istasyonunda çalıştım ön saha satış elemanı olarak, pompacı diyorlar ona. Ege-Pen de çalıştım, yani pencereyle, inşaat sektöründe. Başka, dersane deneyimim oldu 2-3 ay kadar fakat ücret çok düşüktü paramı da alamadım o yüzden dersaneciliği bıraktım.

SS: Neden vermediler paranızı?

HH: Yani parayı vermeme değil de mesela 2 ay çalıştıysam 3 ay da parayı almak için uğraştım git gel yaptım. Bir de çalışma saatleri belli değildi. Sabah 8, akşam 9 yani aldığım parayla orantısı bir çalışma vardı

SS: Benzinlikte çalışırken nasıldı?

HH: Daha iyiydi. Güvenlik sektöründe de çalıştım ben. Zaten dersanede çalıştıktan sonra okuduğum okula isyan ettim. Dedim bundan sonra diplomayla para kazanmayacağım, güvenlik sektörüne girdim ayda 800-900 lira para alıyordum, Sigortam en azından sağlam yatıyordu ve beynimi yormuyordum. Dersane çalışmak çok mantıksızdı uzun bir süre güvenlik sektöründe çalıştım özel sektörde.

SS: Nerede yaptınız bu işi?

HH: Özel bir firmada yaptım. Sürekli güvenlik görevlisi olarak çalıştım.

SS: O dönem öğretmenlik devam etti mi?

HH: Yani ücretli öğretmenlikle beraber yaptığım dönem oldu. Şu anda o durumda. Şimdi tek aldığım yetmiyor yani buradan aldığım ...Resmi bayramlarda felan bizim maaşımız kesiliyor. Sadece bire bir girdiğimiz dersin ücretini alıyoruz. Mesela 23 Nisan- 24 Nisan tatil bizim ek dersimiz gidecek. Zaten ek ders dışında gelir de yok.

Yazın artı çalışmıyorsunuz, 15 tatilde çalışmıyorsunuz o yüzden ek iş yapmak mecburi oluyor. Sigortamız da tam yatmıyor maximum 16 -17 gün yatıyor. O yüzden evliyim çocuk da var, mecbur iki iş yapıyorum.

SS: Kaç çocuk var?

HH: Bir tane

SS: Saatleri nasıl ayarlıyorsunuz peki?

HH: Saatleri işte biraz stresli oluyor ayarlamak. Mesela burda öğleciydim normalde buradan çıkıyordum oraya gidiyordum, ordan çıkıp okula geliyordum felan. Biraz dinlenme sorunu oluyor yani açıkçası.

SS: Ne zaman uyuyorsunuz? Geceleri yatabiliyor musunuz?

HH: Geceleri yatamıyoruz işte ben sürekli gece çalışıyorum güvenlik olarak. Geceleri yatamıyoruz denetim oluyor, sonra çalıştığımız yer uyumaya elverişli değil. Zaten yasak da. Biraz uyku sorunu oluyor.

SS: Eşinizi çocuğunuzu hangi arada görüyorsunuz?

HH: Eşimi çocuğumu haftada bir felan anca görebiliyorum.

SS: Ne kadardır süredir bu böyle?

HH: Yaklaşık 2 senedir bu böyle.

SS: Bir şekilde bunu değiştirmeye dönük bir beklentiniz var mı?

HH: Sınavlara girip çıkıyorum ama mevcut sistemden bir beklentim yok. Mevcut sistemin değişeceğine inanıyorum. Bir de Milli Eğitime şaşı gözle bakılıyor. Yani mezun oldunuz size iş vermek zorunda değiliz,işinize gücünüze bakın işte kendinize çözümler bulun tarzında yaklaşım var. Tabi insan kendini haksızlığa uğramış hissediyor. Yani sisteme karşı bir cephe alıyorsunuz. Eğitime karşı... Mesela ücretli öğretmenin kadrolu öğretmenden farklı olarak yaptığı bişey yok. Kadrolu öğretmenden belki çok daha fazla çalışıyor ücretli öğretmen. Ama ondan çok daha düşük maaş alıyor.Burda mesela gün oluyor hergün nöbet tutuyorsunuz. Müdür diyor ki nöbet tutacaksın tutuyorsunuz. Normalde ücretli öğretmenin nöbet tutması yasak. Ama kadrolu öğretmene nöbet tutturamazsın çünkü onun hakkı. Yeri geldiğinde masaya vurabiliyor, ben haftada bir gün nöbet tutarım iki gün tutmam diyebilir. Ama ücretli öğretmen olduğunuzda yeri geliyor her gün nöbet tutuyorsunuz. Artı veliler ücretli öğretmen olduğunuzu duyduğunda sorunlar yaşıyorsunuz, üstünüze geliyorlar. Zaten ücretli öğretmenler genelde Ankara'nın sorunlu yerlerinde çalışıyorlar. Türkiye'nin en sorunlu yerlerinde çalışıyorlar. Mesela ben şimdiye kadar hep Çinçin

de çalıştım, ve İsmet Paşada çalıştım. Buralar zaten en sorunlu bölgeler nerdeyse olay olmayan gün olmuyor burda. Ve arada siz oluyorsunuz ve hiçbir yasal hakkınız yok. Yani bir veliyi felan karşınıza alamıyorsunuz. Bir şikayet olduğunda direk işinize son veriliyor hiç bir dayanağınız yok. Yani müdür bugün git dediği zaman siz hayır diyemiyorsunuz müdür olsun müdür yardımcısı olsun. Hiçbir iş güvencesi yok.

SS: Velilerle nasıl sorunlar oluyor?

HH: Çocuk mesela, buradaki çocukların ailelerin ahlaki seviyesi biraz düşük. Alkol alışkanlığı, hap, esrar alışkanlığı var. Çocukta tabii dengesiz hareketler oluyor. Kitabı aç oku dediğinizde küfredabiliyor, küfrettiğinde öğrencilerin içinde hiç bişey yapamıyorsunuz, rencide oluyorsunuz. İdareye yansıdığına da, idare et hocam diyor... Biraz konu ileri giderse niye küfrediyorsun vs. bir zıtlama olduğu zaman da çocuk ailesini toplayıp getiriyor... Bu tarz olaylar.

SS: Okuldaki kadrolu hocalarda benzer sorunları yaşıyorlar mı?

HH: Benzer sorunları yaşıyorlar ama ücretli kadar sorunları yaşamıyorlar. Zaten onlar tayinlerini istiyorlar kazanılmış hakları var. Ama sizin başka bir okula gidip çalışma şansınız yok. Onlar gidebiliyor, ya da ne bileyim konularını kullanabiliyorlar. Ya da kafaları bozulduğunda rapor alıp gelmeyebiliyorlar, senelik izinlerini kullanıyorlar. Ücretli de böyle bişey yok tek geliri birebir derse girmek, tatil kar dolayısıyla dahi olsa ücreti kesiliyor. Ücretliler bu yükün altında daha çok kalıyor yani. Ücretliler kadrolulardan çok daha fedakar davranıyor ama ücret olarak çok daha düşük alıyor

SS: Diğer işlerde de yaşadığımız sorunlar var mıydı? Mesela pimapen işinde

HH: Tabii, çalışıyorsunuz orda sonuçta çekirdekten yetişme personel var. Siz üniversitede okurken o çocukluktan beri orda çalışmış yetişmiş, usta seviyesine gelmiş. Siz şimdi o sektöre yeni girdiğinizde çırak gibi başlıyorsunuz. Yani üniversiteyi bitirmişsiniz çırak gibi başlıyorsunuz. Tabii rahatsız edici şeyler oluyor, üniversiteyi bitirmiş buraya gelmiş gibi. Orda sistemin yanlışlığı kafanıza daha çok vuruyor. Yani bunun için mi okudum seviyesine geliyorsunuz. Aldığınız ücret de zaten tatminkar olmuyor ve sistem tarafından haksızlığa uğradığınızı hissediyorsunuz. İşte güvenlik sektöründe çalışıyorum mesela orda diyorlar niye böyle okuyosun? Ben de yüksek lisans yapıyorum mesela “okumanın sonu yok”, böyle toplumda olumsuz bir intiba oluşturunca. İşte “okuyandan bişey olmaz”,

“okuyandan adam çıkmaz” gibi bir intiba oluşturuyor. Tabi bu dile getirildiğinde karşınızda rahatsızlık uyandırıyor insanda.

SS: Bunu iş arkadaşlarınız mı dile getiriyor?

HH: İş arkadaşları, idareciler, orda çalışan diğer personel. Kendini bilen idareci konumundaki insanlar böyle bişey söylemez ama diğer personel dile getiriyor o da moral bozucu oluyor.

SS: Normalde iş dışında görüşüyor musunuz bu insanlarla?

HH: Yok iş dışında kesinlikle, yani özel hayatıma sokmuyorum öyle insanları. Yani işyerindeki insanları özel hayatıma sokmuyorum. Mesela buradaki kadrolular da aynı. Yani otururuz konuşuruz, aynı masa etrafında konuşmadığımız şey kalmaz ama okul dışına çıktığımız zaman ailevi ilişki olsun, özel hayattaki ilişki olsun kesinlikle hayatıma sokmuyorum. Çünkü bir sınıf farkı var. Hani kadrolularla aynı masaya oturduğunuz zaman onu hissediyorsunuz, hissettiriyorlar yani. Yeri geliyor okulda bir sorun oluyor. Burda benim bir sınıfım vardı ben 3. sınıflara bakıyordum. Kadrolu öğretmen geldi ve il içi tayin hakkı olmadığı halde torpille geldi. Geldiği gün benim sınıfım alındı, kendisine verildi hani benim sınıfım da zor bir sınıftı. Sınıfa daha yeni adapte olmuşum öğrenciler bana daha yeni alışmıştı. Bunu idareye söyledim tabi ve bu konuşulduğunda kadrolu öğretmen “ben kadroluyum hocam, kadroluyum” diye masaya vurdu ve sınıfı aldı, yani ben hiçbirşey yapamadım. Ve daha sonra idarecide bana soyledi yani: “Sen ücretlisin kadrolunun dediğini yapmak zorundayım yasal hakkı var” diye. Böyle şeylerle karşılaşıyoruz. Geçen sene 5 kere sınıfım değişti. Bu sene il içi tayin olmadığı için zaten milli eğitimin en takdir ettiğim yanı o, geçen sene 5 kere yer değiştirdim. Bu il içi tayinlerdir, il içi atamalardır, şehirlerarası atamalar yüzünden. Gelen öğretmen bir iki hafta kalıp gidiyordu ama bizim sınıfımız değişiyordu. Çünkü onların yasal hakkı, bizim yok. Bu sene iki kere yaşadım, çünkü iki tane kadrolu geldi iki defa sınıfım değişti. Ama bu öğrencileri çok etkiliyor tam sınıfa alışıyorsunuz sınıftaki öğretmenler size alışıyor. Her şey yolunda giderken tekrar sıfırdan alıyorsunuz, sil baştan alıyor. Aslında bu okulun biraz konumu da o. Öğretmenle öğrenci arasında sağlıklı bir bağ kurulamıyor. Çünkü kadrolular gitmek istiyor buradan ücretlilere de hak verilmiyor. Mesela bu sınıf senindir al bunu yetiştir denmiyor. Öğrenci de çok öğretmen değiştirdiği için adaptasyon sorunu oluyor.

SS: Kadrolular en fazla ne kadar kalıyor?

HH: 5- 6 yıl kalan var ama art hizmette çalışıyor. Yani öğrenciyle direk muhatap olmuyor. Mesela buranın formatör öğretmenini var bilgisayar 17 senedir burda çalışıyor. Ama öğrencinin haberi yok. Bilgisayarlara bakıyor, tamir ediyor felan filan. Seminerlere gidiyor. Yani branşta var sınıf öğretmenliğinde olan var uzun süredir çalışan bir kişi var, sadece başka hiç yok.

SS: Bunu nasıl değerlendiriyorsunuz? Yani siz böyle bir hakkınız olsa gitmek ister miydiniz?

HH: Yani şöyle yeri geliyor hani tamam şartları görüyorsunuz nasıl davranmanız gerektiğini sorunlu bir bölgede öğreniyorsunuz ama seneyi garanti edemiyorsunuz. Yani yarın ne olacak bilemiyorsunuz. Mesela veli ile tartıştınız siz haklı dahi olsanız müdür orada durumu idare etmek, veliye yaranmak için, okulun bulunduğu ortama yaranmak için yarın size gelme diyebilir. Yani bundan çekiniyorsunuz, hergün bir şey var. Bir tartışma olsa ilk gidecek olan sizsiniz. Tamam ben meslek olarak kendimi geliştirim, tamam ücretli öğretmenlik yapım ama iş garantisi yok yani

SS: Demek istediğim kadrolu olsaydınız buradan gitmek ister miydiniz?

HH: Kadrolu olsaydım burda kalmayı hiç düşünmezdim. Mesleki olarak buranın bana vereceği, bana kazandıracığı hiç bir şey yok tam tersine yıpratıcı bir yanı olduğunu düşünüyor. Bunun da sebebi öğretmenin arkasında durmaması. Mesela 13-14 yaşındaki bir çocuk sizinle tartışıyor, gidiyor elini yüzünü yırtıyor. Kendini vuruyor ve gidip sizi şikayet edebiliyor. Öğretmen beni dövdü diyebiliyor veya yanına 2-3 tane şahit alabiliyor aile çevresinden kendi öğrenci arkadaşlarından siz hiçbirşey yapamıyorsunuz. Zaten 15 yaşına kadar bir çocuğun hakim önüne çıkartılması da mümkün değil. Yani arada kalıyorsunuz işte devletin de arkanızda pek durduğunu söyleyemem. Eğitimden fedakarlık yapıyorsunuz, mesela kitap aç oku diyosunuz açmıyor, iyi açma, o zaman diyosunuz. Ya da sürekli beden istiyor ders çalışmak istemiyor kapalı ortamda durmak istemiyor. Bedene çıkartıyorsunuz bu eğitimden fedakarlıktır, yani sorun çıkmasın diye idare ediyosunuz. Öğrencinin üstüne gidemiyosunuz yani şunu öğrenmen lazım, şu kitabı açıp okuman lazım diyemiyorsunuz

SS: Öğrencilerin durumu nasıl hocam? Öğrenci profili?

HH: Öğrenci profili buradaki aileler berbat. Aileye bağlı küçük yaşta çünkü. Hani alkol bağımlısı babası olan var, çalışmıyor genelde. Burda en iyi işi olan pijama satıyor, soğan satıyor, sarımsak satıyor, seyyar satıcılık yapıyor. Aile geliri olarak

tam alt gelir. Genelde madde bağımlılığı oluyor, alkol bağımlılığı oluyor. Sinir hastalığı olanlar var, sürekli hap kullananlar var. Aile içinde dayak yaygın, şiddet yaygın işte. Mesela çocuk ailesinden dayak yiyor, kendini ifade edemiyor, burda öğretmeni görüyor öğretmene saldırıyor. Öğretmene psikolojisini yansıtıyor.

SS: Öğretmenin şiddet göstermesi gibi bir durum var mı?

HH: O şöyle oluyor, genelde tehdit şeklinde oluyor. İşte çıkışta görüşürüz amcamı çağıracam, dayımı çağıracam. İşte aileler geliyor genelde 2-3 arabayla geliyorlar daha önce de dövme olayları olmuş. Yeri geliyor zıtlıyorsunuz, mesela kızımı istismar etti diyor, hiçbir şey yapamıyorsunuz hele öyle bişey olduğunda hiç bişey yapamıyorsunuz. 2 sene önce benim başıma geldi. Yani öğrenci velisi okula geliyor, öğretmenler odasına geliyor, öğretmene hakaret ediyor, bağırıyor, çağırıyor küfrediyor hatta tekme tokat giriyor. Öğretmen karakola gidiyor, şikayetçi oluyor. Sonra kadın bir bakıyorsunuz ki ifadesine kızıma sarkıntılık etti diyor. Ve kız da polislerin yanında evet yaptım diyor, arkadaşlarındanda çünkü bunlar hep birbirleriyle gidip geliyorlar burası gecekondu semti... Sonra siz şikayetinizi geri almak zorunda kalıyorsunuz. Polisler de öyle diyor zaten. Bunlarla hiç uğraşmayın bunlardan her şey beklenir. Ve siz kanun önünde hakkınızı arayamıyorsunuz.çünkü çok farklı olaylara gidiyor. Bunlar da ne yapacaklarını çok iyi biliyorlar yani. İdare de sorun yaşamak istemiyor tabii. İlçe milli eğitime bağlı, ilçede il milli eğitimde göze batmak istemiyor. Kimse sorunlu müdür olmak istemiyor. Öğretmenler de gene aynı şekilde.bu tür şeyler genel de örtbas ediliyor

SS: Anladım, sizin dışınızda ücretli öğretmen var mı?

HH: 3 tane ücretli öğretmen, 4 tane, 5 tane ücretli öğretmen var.

SS: Kadrolu öğretmen buraya gelmek istemediği için mi bu kadar çok?

HH: Tabii ki, en sorunlu okullarda çalışır ücretli öğretmenler. En zor işi yapar en düşük ücreti alır. Mesela Çankaya'da ücretli öğretmen bulamazsınız. Sınıf öğretmenliği olsun, Çankayada kolay kolay ücretli öğretmen bulamazsınız. Altındağ'da, Mamak'ta, Doğanatepe yani sorunlu okulların olduğu yerde ücretliler çalışıyor. Çünkü kadrolular oraya gitmek istemiyor.

SS: Bu şekilde devam etmeyi düşünüyor musunuz?

HH: Yok kariyer olarak kendime kesinlikle yakıştırmıyorum. Şuan zaten ikinci üniversiteyi okuyorum. Sosyal hizmetlerde okuyorum açık öğretim fakültesi 2. Sınıf. 2 sene daha okumam gerekiyor. İşte yüksek lisans yapıyorum.

SS: Onu hangi alanda yapıyorsunuz?

HH: Felsefe alanında yapıyorum. Bir yandan çalışırken hayatı devam ettirebilmek için, bir yandan da kendime layık görmediğim için çalışılabilir bir konum olmadığı için kendimi geliştirmeye çalışıyorum.

SS: Hocam şimdi bir açıköğretim var, yüksek lisans var, akşam çalışıyorsunuz gündüz iş var. Nasıl yetiştiriyorsunuz?

HH: Yani yetiştirmek zorundasınız mecbur. İşte mümkün olduğunca... Aileme zaman ayıramıyorum, aileden kısıyorum. Çünkü geçici bir dönem yani. Yapmazsanız öyle kalıyor. Sistemin de çok aldırış ettiği yok bir sürü mezun var, benim branşında biyoloji branşında 25-30 bin civarında işsiz insan var

SS: Mesela sosyal hizmetler bittikten sonra umudunuz var mı?

HH: Biyolojiden bişey çıkacağını zannetmiyorum

SS: Öğretmenlikten de mi umudunuz yok

HH: Öğretmenlik şöyle öğretmenlik yaparım ama belki idareci ya da daha güzel bir yerde yaparım. Çünkü öğretmenliğin baya bir şeyini çektim ama sosyal hizmetler de de yaparım. Hani sorunlu çocuklara psikolojik yardıma ihtiyac duyan çocuklara. Çünkü bu bölgede daha iyi anlıyorsunuz aile kavramı. Ailelerinin mağdur ettiği çocuklar...Çünkü bunların faturası bize geliyor. Okulda bu çocuklarla biz muhattap oluyoruz onların sorunları bir şekilde bize yansıyor. Hani ben biraz daha alakalıyım. Sosyal hizmetlerde daha faydalı olacağımı düşünüyorum. Orda öğretmene nazaran sosyal hizmet uzmanına daha fazla yetki veriliyor. Orda işlerliği var yapabilme kudreti var.

SS: Peki bu çocukların hayatına dair bir şeyleri değiştirme umudunuz var mı? Mesela kadrolu olsanız?

HH: Yok yok. Burda kadrolu öğretmen hiçbir şey yapamaz, niye? Çünkü yetkileri sınırlı. Burda öğrenci gelir ders verirsiniz felan. Sosyal hizmetlerle felan yoğun bir ilişki koordinasyon gerekiyor. Öğretmen burda tek başına hiçbirsey yapamaz. İyi niyetli bir şekilde yapmaya çalışsanız da ailesi ile başınız derde girer. Yani sen ne yapamaya çalışıyorsun. Mesela burda öyle çocuklar var ailesinin yanında kalmaması gerekiyor. Çünkü baba alkolik, çocuk hele bir de kız çocuğu, annesi var sinir hapları kullanıyor çocuk sürekli dayak yiyor. O insanlarda baya bir ahlaki çöküntü de var. Yani siz ona nasıl yardım edeceksiniz. O çocuğun aileden alınıp yurda verilmesi gerekir. Çünkü yaşadığı ortam her türlü psikolojik rahatsızlığı, her türlü davranış

bozukluğunu meydana getirecek bir ortam. Bunu da yapamıyorsunuz. Öğretmenliğin verdiği yetkilerle yapamazsınız. Sosyal hizmetlerle ya da vakıflarla işbirliği yaparak olabilir.

SS: Bir öğretmen olarak idealleriniz olabiliyor mu?

HH: Ee tabi yani eğitim diye bişey, öğretim diye bişey yok yani. Matematik de bir problemi gelip burda, yani matematik de bişey öğretiyorum diyen yalan söyler. Çünkü burda davranış bozuklukları var. Buraya gelen öğrenci normal değil. Çoğunda burda davranış bozuklukları var, ahlaki çöküntü var. Yani kızlar bile erkeklerin ağzına almayacağı küfürleri ağzına alıyorlar. Burda öğretim yapmak mümkün değil. Öğretim yaparım dersiniz gene başınız derde girer.

SS: Peki yoksulluk düzeyi ne durumda?

HH: Yoksulluk şöyle gelir durumları çok zayıf, bir de giderleri genelde alkolden uyuşturucudan oluşuyor. Eve giren para çok az giren para da bu tür zararlı alışkanlıklara gidiyor mesela. Alkole gidiyor, uyuşturucu maddeye gidiyor. Yani kendini bilmemesi, parayı tutma şeyi de yok. Yoksulluk bu iki şeyden kaynaklanıyor. Birincisi bu insanlar nasıl para kazanacaklarını bilmiyorlar. Mesela eğitim kursu açıldığında da gitmiyorlar. Yeniliğe kendilerini geliştirmeye kapalılar. Bu bakımdan suçlu bulunabilir. Eğitim seviyeleri de çok düşük, okuma yazma oranı düşük. Okuma yazma bilmeyen veli sayısı çok. Okuma yazma kursu açtık burda, genelde kocaları kursa göndermek istemiyor karılarını, ya da kadınlar işte çocuğuma bakıyorum diyerek gelmek istemiyor kayıt yapsak da. O bakımdan gelişime eğitime kapalı. Ama gelir olarak alt grup yani... Kesinlikle alt grup. Zaten bunlar genelde devletten alıyorlar kömürü, her şeylerini devletten alıyorlar, elektrik kaçağı buralarda yaygın, kaçak kullanma...En alt grup diyebiliriz.

SS: Devlet yardımı dediğiniz?

HH: Belediyeden geliyor, kaymakamlıktan geliyor kömür.

SS: Şimdi buradaki insanların yoksul olmasını konuştuk, sizin hayatınızda yoksul olduğunuzu düşündüğünüz bir an var mı? Bir şeyleri yetiştirememe gibi.

HH: Ben kişisel gelişim açısından aldığım eğitimle kazandığım paranın kesinlikle orantılı olduğunu düşünmüyorum. Bir kadrolu öğretmen ben iki işte çalıştığım halde benden daha fazla para alıyor. Ben onun yaptığı işi yapıyorum belki de daha fazlasını alıyorum. Mesela bir branş öğretmeni haftada 15-16 saat derse girerken benden daha çok para alıyor. Benim toplamda iki işte çalıştığım paradan daha çok alıyor. Ama ben

ücretli öğretmenlik yapıyorum, güvenlik yapıyorum mesela ikisinin toplamı ona mukabil gelmiyor. Ve okulda yaptığım iş de onun yaptığı işten çok daha fazla. Ücretli öğretmenler okullarda daha çok eziliyor. Mesela ücretli öğretmen yalnızca ders girmek çıkmakla zorunludur. Fakat sabah mesela tören yapılıyor andımız okuluyor gelmediğiniz zaman sorun oluşturuyor. Normalde ücretli öğretmen sadece derse girer. Okulda görev verilemez. Törenlere giriyorsunuz özel gün ve haftalarda kadrolu öğretmen nasıl program hazırlıyorsa sizde hazırlıyorsunuz, öğrenci yetiştiriyorsunuz, nöbet tutuyorsunuz. Mesela gelmeyen öğretmen oluyor, hasta raporlu öğretmen oluyor onun yerine de tutuyorsunuz. Nöbet tutmak yasakken, tutturamazke hiçbir idareci, normalde siz kadrolu öğretmenden daha çok nöbet tutuyorsunuz.

SS: Peki ücretli öğretmenliği bırakıp yalnızca güvenlik sektöründe devam etmeyi düşündünüz mü? Bu işe neden devam ediyorsunuz?

HH: Burda şu var sadece maddi olarak değil, kafa olarak tatmin ediyor. Hani eğitimini almışsınız bir işin 4-5 sene okumuşsunuz yani mesleki olarak kafa olarak tatmin olmak da önemli. Buraya geldiğimde ders felan anlattığımda bir şekilde tatmin olmuş hissediyorum

SS: Öğretmenliği seviyor musunuz?

HH: Tabi öğretmenliği seviyorum. Öğretmenlik yaptırıldığı müddetçe yapabildiğim müddetçe seviyorum.

SS: Eşiniz ne iş yapıyor?

HH: Eşim huzurevinde çalışıyor, ATT (acil tıp teknisyeni) o da özel sektörde çalışıyor.

SS: Kaç sene oldu evleneli?

HH: Yaklaşık 2 sene oldu

SS: Gündüz çalışıyorsunuz akşam çalışıyorsunuz, iş dışında bir hayat var mı?

HH: Yok sosyal hayat diye birşey yok zaten. 5-6 senedir tiyatroya gidemiyorum, sinemaya gitmiyorum, sosyal hayat yok arkadaşlarla görüşemiyoruz buluşamıyoruz, görmek istediğim yerlere gidemiyorum...öyle... hiçbir şey yok ot gibi, robot gibi.

SS: Eşinizin benzer bir temposu var mı? Size kızıyor mu?

HH: Eşim şimdi tek bir işte çalıştığı için bir de çocukla uğraşıyor ama tabi aileme zaman ayırmadığım için sitem ettiği oluyor. O nedenle sorunlar yaşadığımız oluyor. Ama ben geçici bir dönem olduğunu söylüyorum, hani yapmak zorunda olduğumu.

Hani şimdi yüksek lisanstan vazgeçemiyorum. Ben mezun olalı 10 sene olmuş, yapmasam olmaz. Başka işte ikinci üniversiteyi okuyorum yapmasam olmaz çünkü biyolojiden bişey çıkmayacağını anladım, öğretmenlik kapısının kapalı olduğunu anladım. Ve yetkililer de son derece duyarsız, dört duvar arasında karar alıp onlar kendilerince uyguluyorlar ve toplumda nasıl yansımaları olduğunu görmüyorlar. Yani güvenlikten zaten vazgeçmem, çünkü ücretliden aldığım para yetmiyor. Her birine baktığınız da hiçbiri vazgeçilecek gibi değil. Bir de ben şimdi imam hatip lisesinde de okuyorum. Çünkü keseyi onlara iyi açtılar yani... Mesela Diyanete felan çok fazla şey alıyorlar. Ben yüksek lisans yaptığım halde, şimdi açıktan imam hatip lisesinde de okuyorum. Yani şunu düşünüyorum sağ olsun sol olsun herkes kendi çevresini görüyor. Onları doyuruyor zihniyetinde, üniversite mezunudur vasıflı elemandır gibi düşünmüyor. O yüzden iktidarın gördüğü kitleye dahil olmaya çalışıyoruz.

SS: Her koldan garantiye mi almak istiyorsun?

HH: Garantiye almak değil de, yaşım ilerliyor, yani 36 yaşımdayım hayatımı şu şekilde sürdüremeyeceğimi anladım. Ücretli öğretmenliğin okulda hiçbir saygınlığı hiç bir kariyeri hiçbirşeyi yok. Benim yaşımdaki insan okul müdürlüğü yapıyor. Müdür yardımcısı benden bir yaş küçük ama onun sözü daha çok geçiyor. İş garantisi var, seyi var. Yeri geliyor şunu yap, bunu yap diyor. Ve öğretmenlerle bir araya geldiğinizde bunu daha çok hissediyorsunuz. Ayrımcılık yapıldığını, sınıfsal bir ayırım olduğunu zaten hiçbirinin ailesi ile dışarıda görüşmüyorum. Öğretmenler odasına da fazla gitmem, hani kadrolularla fazla muhatap olmak istemiyorum çünkü ezildiğinizi hissediyorsunuz

SS: Öğretmen odasında bunu açıkça hissediyor musunuz?

HH: Açıkça konuşulmaz ama iş sıkıya geldiği zaman ben kadroluyum derler yani, hepsi der bunu. Mesela sınıf problemi olur, en kötü sınıf size verilir, dolabı olmayan sınıf size verilir, en alttaki okulun en kötü sınıfı size verilir. Bir kadrolu gelir en önce sizin yeriniz değişir. Sizin sınıfınız alınır, ona verilir. Yani bir sorun olur günah keçisi siz olursunuz. Yani dış kapının dış mandalı gibi ücretli öğretmen.

SS: Kendi aileniz dışında anne babanızla yeteri kadar görebiliyor musunuz?

HH: Yok yok aile hayatı diye bişey yok yani. Ancak yazın olur ben şimdi yaz tatilini bekliyorum. Haziran gelecek okullar kapanacak. Tabi o zaman da maddi problem

olacak, çünkü güvenlik sektörü de Türkiye de hani, asgari ücret civarında bir para alıyorsunuz o da bir tatile gitmek için bişeler yapmak için yeterli bir ücret değil.

SS: Felsefe yüksek lisans yapmanızın nedeni ne?

HH: Aslında şu kendi alanımda yapmak isterdim biyolojide kendi alanımı çok seviyorum. Mikrobiyoloji veya biyokimya da yapmak isterdim bilgisini aldığım konuda. Ama Ankara dışında yüksek lisans yapamıyorum, hani Gazi Üniversitesi. Ankara Hacettepe buralar artık tabu olmuş. Ve kim ne derse desin buralarda torpil var. Dışardan öğrenci almıyorlar yüksek lisansa. Not ortalaması var bence saçma bişey. Sonuçta siz mezun olalı 10 sene olmuş ortalamanızı değiştiremezsiniz ama Ales'ten yüksek puan alabilirsiniz, yabancı dilden yüksek puan alabilirsiniz. Bunun yüzdelik olarak başvuruda dikkate alınmasında sorun yok alınmalı da ama başvuru da işte transkrip ortalaması şu olacak diye başvuru koşulu olduğu için...Kendi alanımda yapamıyorum o yüzden felsefe gibi alakasız bir bölümde yapıyorum. Bazen kendime soruyorum burda ne işim var diye ama sırf yüksek lisans yapmış olmak için yapıyorum.

SS: İleriye dönük, kariyer için bir basamak mı?

HH: Kariyer olarak basamak zor ihtimal, Türkiye'de işte yüksek lisans da yaparsınız, doktora da yaparsınız belki ama iş konusunda çevreniz yoksa, tanıdığınız yoksa zor yani.

SS: Neden yapmayı tercih ettiniz?

HH: Boş durmayım, zamana karşı bir şeyler yapım çünkü yaş ilerliyor. Şimdi lisans mezunu olmak da tek başına bir şey ifade etmiyor. Yani açıköğretim fakültesi mezunları var, mesela harıl harıl bitiriyorlar. Yani üniversite bitirmenin lisans mezunu olmak artık hiçbir şey ifade etmiyor.

SS: Derslere gitme zorunluluğu var mı?

HH: Var bilimsel hazırlık görüyorum farklı bir bölüm olduğu için. Derslere devam zorunluluğu var

SS: Haftada kaç gün gidiyorsunuz?

HH: Haftada 3 gün gidiyorum. Mümkün olduğunca devam ediyorum

SS: Peki hayal kuruyor musunuz?

HH: Valla hayalim şu koşturma bitsin, adam gibi bir işim olsun aileme daha çok zaman ayırım, sosyal faaliyetlere daha çok zaman ayırım. Yani ücretli öğretmenlik felan bunlar hiç yapılacak işler de değil. İşte sağlam işim olsun, iş güvencesi olsun,

geleceğe daha kararlı bakim... Kendimi geliştirecek şeylerle daha çok uğraşayım... Ücretli öğretmenlik hayati çevirmektir felan gibi kasvetli konular değilde biraz daha geleceğe dönük, yani ilgilendiğim alanlarda yüksek lisans yapmak, kendimi geliştirmek hani böyle şeyler...

SS: Şu aşamada yüksek lisans sizi yormuyor mu?

HH: Evet, çünkü ileriye götürüyor, şimdi ne mezununuz üniversite ama orayı bitirdiğinizde yüksek lisans. Dediğim gibi zaten lisans mezunu olmak tek başına hiçbir şey ifade etmiyor. Çünkü herkes üniversite mezunu. Tabi kalitesi sorgulanır, gerçekten lisans eğitimi veriyor mu ya da her üniversite diploması olan... Zaten devlet de onun sorumluluğunu almıyor sen üniversite mezunusun seni kim aktar, git çalış iş vermek zorunda da değilim. İstediyin yeri bitir ama iş konusunda benden hiçbir şey bekleme modunda. Özel sektörde de bu konuda bir işbirliği yapılmıyor. Üniversite mezunu olmak hiçbir şey ifade etmiyor.

SS: Ailenizin ekonomik durumu nasıl peki? Anne babanızın hali daha iyi olsaydı şu anda daha iyi koşullarda olur muydunuz?

HH: Tabi tabi. Mesela 2000 senesinde ben mezun olmadan önce sınıf öğretmenliği sertifikası veriliyordu 150 liraydı o. Onu alamadım, alan arkadaşlarım atandı, şube müdürlüğü yapan var, ilçe müdürlüğü yapan var. Yani o sertifikayı almadığım için öyle oldu. Benim aldığım gelir yalnızca okumaya yetiyordu, ona yetmedi mesela birden o belge verildi. Onu alan öğretmen oldu. Mesela şimdi bizim okulda da var haybeden öğretmen olan. Adam jeoloji mühendisi öğretmen olmuş, orman mühendisi öğretmen olmuş. Bir sertifikayla ya... Tabi bunlar genelde derse girmiyorlar ders anlatma kabiliyetleri yok çünkü o pedagojik formasyon alınmamış öğretmenlik yeterliliği yok. Genelde art hizmetlerde çalışıyorlar, işte müdür yardımcılığı yapıp evrak takibi yapıyor. Ya da formatör öğretmenim diye sürekli kapalı bir yerde bilgisayarla felan uğraşılıyor. Bunlardan milli eğitimin bir faydası olduğunu da düşünmüyorum... Hani zaten kaçacak şey arıyorlar öğretmenlik yapmamak için ama tabi şeyden vazgeçemiyorlar. Öğretmenlerin sağladığı maddi olanaklardan vazgeçemiyorlar.

SS: Yani o dönem 150 lirayı veremedin diye?

HH: Tabi tabi. Bir de hani şimdiki hükümet şey gibi görüyor okuyanlar hobi için okuyor felan...Yok bence Türkiye'deki insanların çoğu ekmeğini eline almak için çalışıyor. Yani işte hobi yapım, canım sıkıldı gidip üniversite okuyayım felan değil.

Avrupa da böyle olmayabilir hani insanlar kendilerini geliştirmek için sevdiği bölümü okurlar vs. ama türkiyede sosyal güvenlik çok gelişmediği için buradaki insanlar zevk için okumuyorlar. Hobi için okumuyorlar ekmek parası için okuyorlar.

SS: Siz lisans döneminde çalıştınız mı?

HH: Çalışmak istedim yani. Yazın çalışıyordum özellikle. Benzin istasyonunda çalıştım, yemek şirketinde çalıştım sömestre tatilinde. Kültür mantarı üretim tesisinde çalıştım. İnşaat da çalıştığım oldu sömestre tatilinde yazın. O şekilde okudum

SS: Peki hiç karşılaştırıyor musunuz? Her türlü işi yapmışsınız o işlerdeki hayat standardınız ile su anki değişti mi?

HH: Yok hayır. O zaman diyorduk ki diplomayı elimize alalım bir şeyler olur heralde diye düşünüyordum. Diplomayı aldıktan sonra da değişen bişey olmadı. Bir de Türkiye’de torpil adam kayırmacılık çok. Mesela bazı okullara başvurduğum ücretli de – açık da kalma sorunu da var- mesela bana ihtiyacımı yok diyen müdür aynı yıl 2 senelik yüksek okul mezununu almış sınıf öğretmenini yapmış. Siz eğitim fakültesi mezunusunuz ya da fen-edebiyat mezunusunuz formasyon almışsınız bakıyorsunuz 2 senelik su balıkçılığı mezunu işte süt endüstrisi mezunu bakıyorsunuz müdürün yakını, akrabası dostu olduğu için gidiyor sınıf öğretmenliği yapıyor. Bunla çok karşılaştım ve AK Parti’ye dilekçe yazdım. Gene sonuç başıma patladı burda ilçe şube müdürü 2 tane şube müdürü beni çekti odaya işte sen böyle böyle dilekçe yazmışsın felan filan. Ben tabi burayla ilgili yazmadım ama burayla da ilgili aslında. Çünkü bu işler böyle yürüyor, kimse de çıkıp sen nasıl eğitim fakültesi mezunu bos gezerken sen nasıl veteriner çalıştırırsın nasıl süt ürünleri mezunu çalıştırırsın demiyor. Burda demek ki bakan da bunlardan yana. Milli Eğitim Bakanı da bu zihniyette demek ki.

SS: AKP’ye direk mi yazdınız?

HH: Tabi direk yazdım. Ücretli öğretmenlik de dahil kayırma yapılıyor, peşkeş çekiliyor, adam kayırılıyor diye yazdım. Mesela burası bana uzak. Yarım saat yürümem gerekiyor buraya gelmek için ama benim yakınımıdaki evde, evimin yakınındaki okulda mesela öğretmen ihtiyacı var ama orda çalışan sınıf öğretmenini iktisat mezunu mesela

SS: Siz torpil bulamıyor musunuz?

HH: Benim öyle şeyim yok. Torpil felan tanıdığım yok yani

SS: Olsa araya birilerini koyarmıydınız?

HH: Olsaydı ben ücretli öğretmenlik için de uğraşmazdım yani torpil konulacak bir şey olmazdı bu. Ama türkiyede işler böyle yürütülüyor bunu biliyorum. Bir insanın kendini ne kadar yetiştirdiği ne kadar bildiği çok önemli değil kimse ona da bakmıyor. Yani tanıdığınız varsa bir şeyler varsa çok vasıflı olmanız çok bilgili olmanız gerekmiyor.

SS: Şu aşamada devlet ücretli çalıştırmayı tercih ediyor. Bunu artık niye tercih ediyorlar?

HH: Ya bir bakıma haklı gördüğüm taraflar da var haksız gördüğüm taraflar da var. Bence ücretli öğretmenlik geliştirilmeli. Nasıl geliştirilmeli: Verilen haklar olarak geliştirilmeli ve eğitim fakültesi mezunlarına öncelik verilmeli. Haklı gördüğüm konu surdan kaynaklanıyor: kadrolular okadar rahat ki bakıyorsunuz o gün rapor alıyor gelmiyor. Yani okula sene içerisinde çok az gelen öğretmenler var. Mesela öğretmenler odasında oturup konuşuyorlar, çay içiyorlar okulun kapısının öğrenci diğerinin kafasını kırıyor bağırıyor çağırıyor kimsenin umurunda değil. Bunun iki kaynağı var tabii. Öğretmenin öğretmenlik mesleğini yapmamasının iki kaynağı var. 1997 yılında her bölümden öğretmenlikle alakası olmayan bütün bölümlerden öğretmen aldılar. Yani veteriner, süt endüstrisi mezunu, gıda mühendisi bunları öğretmen yaptılar. Bunlar öğretmenliğin temel bilgisinden yoksunlar. Bir iki ayda öyle bir pedagojik formasyonla olmaz. Genelde zaten sorun çıkanlar okulda duyarsız olanlarda bu tip öğretmenler. İkincisi de hani kadrolu olduğu için bir rahatlık var. Ben dersi iyi anlatsamda aynı ücreti alırım dersi iyi anlatmasam da aynı ücreti alırım. Bu açıdan bakanlar var. Ücretli öğretmenlik de haklar olarak çok zayıf. Sigortanı tam yatmıyor, bir yerde asgari ücretle çalışsanız ücretli öğretmenlikten çok daha iyi. En azından sigortanız tam yatar. Ben ücretli öğretmenlik bir fırsat olarak değerlendirilip hani eğitim fak mezunları, 5 seneden fazla yapanlar kadroya alınabilir öğretmenlik deneyimi göz önünde bulundurularak, zor şartlarda çalıştığı göz önüne alınarak. Yani ücretli öğretmenlikte iyileştirme yapılabilir. Ama ben öğretmenin tam böyle kadrolu atanmasının da sakıncalı olduğunu düşünüyorum. Hani iş güvencesi felan olsun eften püften sebeplerle işten atılamasın. Ama bir denetim mekanizması da olsun gerçekten öğretmenlik yapıyor mu, gerçekten görevini yapıyor mu?

SS: Saat ücreti uygulaması devam etsin diyosunuz yani... Çalıştığı kadarını alsın?

HH: Zaten konulma amacı o ek dersin o bakımdan iyi ama öğretmenlik yeterliliği açısından denetleyici mekanizmalar olmalı.

SS: Dediniz ya bu sene buradayım ama seneye burda çalışmamın güvencesi yok. Bu nasıl olacak?

HH: İşten çıkarma sebepleri tabii olmalı ama bir müdürün ya da bir müdür yardımcısının ağzına bakılmamalı. İhtiyacımız yok dediği zaman çekip gönderme olmamalı. Yani makul sebepler olmalı. İşte memurlar kanununda ne vardır, işyerine alkollu gelmek, mazaretsiz bir hafta üst üste gelmemek...yani bunlar makul – objektif sebepler olmalı. İşte gözünün üstünde kaşın var yarın gelme, işte kadrolu öğretmen geldi ihtiyacımız kalmadı... Bunlar makul insan onuruna yakışır davranış kuralları değil.

SS: Şu aşamada sizin güvenceli olduğunuz durumda nasıl olacaktı peki?

HH: İş güvencesi olsaydı, kendimi mesleki anlamda daha çok geliştirdim, sosyal faaliyetlere daha çok ağırlık verirdim. Mesleki anlamda kendimi geliştirecek şeyler yapardım, hani ek iş yerine kendi mesleğime yoğunlaştırdım. Belki felsefe gibi kendi bölümümle alakasız bir bölüm okumak yerine eğitim üzerine mesleğim üzerine eğitim alıp kendimi geliştirmeye çalışırdım. Bana da kişisel olarak kendime, aileme topluma daha faydalı olurum diye düşünüyorum.

SS: Ailenizin bir beklentisi var mı? eşinizin sunu yapma bunu tercih et dediği şeyler neler?

HH: Valla aileme kalsa niye bu kadar çok uğraşıyorsun felan gibi şeyler oluyor. Tabii maddi olarak beklentiler oluyor. Hani ev almaktır araba almaktır

SS: Şu anda ev ya da araba var mı?

HH: Yok şimdiye kadar yok. Ama hani beklenti oluyor, şimdi olmasa da 2 sene sonra 3 sene sonra olsun beklenti oluyor tabii zaten erkeğin konumu da ailede o'dur. Bankadır yani.

SS: Ama eşiniz de çalışıyor

HH: O da çalışıyor ama o da özelde çalışıyor ben de özelde çalışıyorum ama ailenin geçimi genelde erkek üzerinde.

SS: Biriktirebiliyor musunuz peki?

HH: Şöyle söyleyeyim biriktirme pek olmuyor. Çünkü eğitim masrafları oluyor, saga sola masraflar oluyor beklenmedik şekilde.

SS: Kira da mı oturuyosunuz.

HH: Kirada oturmuyorum. Kendi evim de değil ama kira vermiyorum

SS: Nasıl yani

HH: Babamın evi oluyor. Tapusu üzerine, benim üzerime değil ama kira vermiyorum yani.

SS: Meslek olarak deneyimlediğiniz öğretmenlik konusuna gelirse, nasıl tanımlıyorsunuz artık sizin için anlamı ne öğretmenliğin?

HH: Ya öğretmenlik aslında iyi bir meslek. Ama toplumda artık şeyi, kariyeri düşmüş bir meslek. Biraz da bilinçli olarak düşürüldü. Mezunlar çok fazla. Plan yapılması gerekir eğitim fak tekrar elden geçirilmeli. Böyle başı boş bırakılmış uzun süredir. Öğretmen kimdir nedir böyle bir şey yok yani elini sallayan öğretmen yapılmış sonra eğitim fak mezunlarına dur kadrolar doldu seni alamayız denmiş. Sonra devletin bu konuda hiçbir sorumluluğu yoktur lafına gelmiş. Adam mezun olmuş şimdi diyorlar ki eğitim fakültesi mezunusun başka iş bul, öğretmenlikte sana iş veremeyiz. Peki adam 4-5 sene eğitim fakültesi okumuş mesleğini eline almış. 2 senelik süt ürünleri mezunu, veteriner, baytar, diyetisyen gidecek öğretmenlik yapacak, bu işin eğitimini almış insan da sokakta boş mu gezecek. Ya da iş yapacaksa ne iş yapacak. Benim 15 yıldır işçi bulma kurumunda kaydım daha bir Allahın kulu aramadı, demekki eğitim fakültesi mezununa verecek devletin hiçbir işi yok öğretmenlik dışında. Bunu devletin kendisi yalanlıyor zaten. Yani bir de hani eğitim fakültesini bir yere çirak olarak mı gireceksiniz, bir berbere kuafore ya da kasaba çirak olarak mı gireceksiniz? Senelerdir o işin eğitimini almışsınız yani eğitim fak mezunu öğretmenlik yapmaz da ne iş yapar bunu sormak lazım. Öğretmenlikte böyle bir şey var, öğretmen olmayacak insan öğretmen yapılmış, sonra bu insanların davranışlarına bakılarak verdiği eğitime bakılarak böyle öğretmen mi olur denmiş. Doğru aslında o insanlar öğretmene yakışır hareketler yapmıyorlar, tam olarak ders verdikleri söylenemez zaten vermeleri mantığa zıt olurdu bir ziraat fakültesi mezunu çıkıp öğretmenlik yapamaz. O işten para kazanabilir geçimini sağlayabilir ama öğretmenlik yapamaz. Bunları yaşıyorum yan. Mesela adam gazetecilik mezunu müdür yardımcısı. Size geliyor işinizi öğretiyor. Yani sen kimsin sen bu işin eğitimini almamışsın, ben 4-5 sene almışım devlet sizi alıyor onun altına ast olarak veriyor. İş bundan öğreneceksin diyor çok yanlış...Mantığa bilime zıt politikalar... Bunların oluşturduğu yani bu ziraat fakültesidir, jeoloji mühendisidir orman mühendisidir diyetisyendir, veterinerdir bunlardan öğretmen olmaz.bunların

çıkartılıp öğretmenliğin vasıflı bir meslek alanına çevrilmesi gerekir. Öğretmenliği herkes yapamaz herkese yaptırılamaz. Zaten eğitimi bozan bunlardır yani. Bunlar çıkartılıp iş ehline verilmeli ve bunlar da ciddi bir eğitime tabi tutulmalı. Yani başıboş bırakılmamalı tamam sen atandın git ne yaparsan yap derse gir, ders anlat ya da anlatma değil...bunlar da bir mesleki gelişime tabi tutulmalı yüksek lisans doktora özendirilmeli.

SS: Bunları dert edinen bir kesim, devlet bunu yapmadı diyorsunuz bunu yapabilecek bir parti var mı?

HH: Şu andaki Milli Eğitim Bakanı'nın ciddi şeyleri var ama tam olarak eğitimi anladığını zannetmiyorum. Şaşı gözle bakıyor biraz öğretmenlere iyi bakmadığını düşünüyorum. Bir de kaynaklar sürekli hükümetin mensubu olduğu çevreye akıtılıyor. Yani imam hatip mezunlarıdır diyanet işleridir. Sonra Diyanetten Milli Eğitime geçen insanlar var binlerce. Hani diyanetteki insanın milli eğitimde ne işi var

SS: Yani hükümetin eğitim politikasına kızılıyorsun.

HH: Ben hükümetin bu sorunu tam olarak çözmek istediğine inanmıyorum. Günlük geçici çözümler işte 30 bin 50 bin atama yapamaz, 100 bin atama yapsan ne olur bu sorun çözülmez. Yani eğitimi baştan sona ele alıp, eğitim fakültelerinden itibaren. Heryere artık eğitim fakültesi açılmamalı, hatta bir kısmı tamamen kapatılmamalı. Çünkü bu kadar eğitim fakültesi enflasyonu varken 300 bin öğretmen atama bekliyor siz hala eğitim fak açılıyorsunuz. Bunlardan ayrı fen-edebiyat mezunlarına pedagojik formasyon veriyor. Yani eğitim fakültesi mezunu bos geziyor, üniversiteler bundan gelir ettiği için pedagojik formasyon vermeyi tercih ediyor

SS: Bu sorunları dillendiren siyasileri takip ediyor musunuz?

HH: Yani genelde muhalefetten çıkıyor, CHP'den felan çıkıyor. Bunlar biraz hükümeti şey yapmaya yönelik, işte bütün alanlarda olduğu gibi eğitimde de siz gereğini yapmıyorsunuz gibi kullanma amaçlı.

SS: Bunlardan bir çözüm umuyor musun?

HH: Orda çözüm tabi sorunu gündeme getirme açısından felan bir şeyi olur ama tam çözüm olacağını düşünmüyorum. Mesela Mehmet Sağlam Milli Eğitim Komisyonu Başkanı Mecliste adam yok başkanlığı yapmış Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı yapmış ama bakıyorsunuz eğitim konusunda adam hiç konuşmuyor yani halinden menun. Bu Türkiye de biraz da şeyi gösteriyor, otoriteye bağlı davranışı gösteriyor. İnsanlar menfaatlerini koruyorlar mesela Mehmet Sağlam'ın yeri sağlam hakkaten. Adam

milli eğitim komisyonu başkanı ama bu kadar insan atama beklerken adam susuyor hiçbir şey demiyor resmen yalakalık yapıyor mesela. Yani iktidarın içinden böyle sesler gelseydi bu daha faydalı olurdu. Hani surf muhalefet olsun diye bunu gündeme getirmek değil de biz bu ülke için ne yaparız, bu işin doğrusu nedir gibisinden. Evet birileri ister birileri vermez hani atama olsun sey olsun ama bunun gereği nedir yani gerçek nedir bilim nedir...bilimin söylediği aklın söylediği nedir? Türkiye bu safhaya henüz gelemedi yani

SS: Peki sizin siyasi görüşünüz var mı? Herhangi bir parti, sizi temsil ettiğini düşündüğünüz?

HH: Yok, siyasi hiçbir şey yok. Yani AKP'nin tamamen kendi yandaşlarını koruduğunu düşünüyorum, CHP'nin de ülke sorunlarından habersiz ve kopuk olduğunu düşünüyorum ve gerçek politikalar üretmiyor CHP.

SS: Onun dışındakiler?

HH: Yok yok hiç bilmiyorum. AKP'ye üyeydim bir ara. İlçede görevliydim MYK üyesiydim yani olumsuz şeyleri gördüm.zaten ilçe başkanı kendi menfaati için kullanıyordu hani nerden ne para kazanırım. Türkiyenin döngüsü bu yani, idealist olarak siyaset yapan yok, ondan sonra durumu görünce bıraktım.

SS: İçinde olmak beklentilerinizi karşılamadığı için mi?

HH: Tabi beklentilerimi karşılamıyor beklentimi karşılayacağına da inanmıyorum asla. Yani milli eğitime bakıp sorunu çözmek isteyen bir parti bir sistem sorunu çözebilir. Bu yönde akılcı mantıklı çözümler de üretilebilir. Ama ben gerçekten çözmek istediğine inanmıyorum

SS: Neden istemiyorlar?

HH: MEB

SS: Ataması yapılmayan öğretmenlerle ilgili seslerini çıkarmaya çalışan kesimler var. Bunları biliyor musunuz?

HH: Tabi haberdarım. Takip ediyorum bunların içinde çok mağdur arkadaşlar var hani senelerdir atama bekleyen, çok yüksek puan alsada. Mesela biyoloji fizik kimya tam anlamıyla berbat. Adam 85-90 alıyor atanamıyor. 10 puan alan adam atanırken 90 puan alan adama sen yetersizsin öğretmen olamazsın demek saçmalık. Bunların içinde çok mağdur olan öğretmen arkadaşlar var. Atama vasfına sahip ama atanamıyor

SS: Örgütlü olarak mücadele edenleri biliyor musunuz?

HH: AYOP var tabi, arkadaşlar var tabi orda. Sistem bişeler yapılmıyor, güçleri yetmiyor. Bir de öğretmenleri bir araya getirmek çok zor. Öğretmenlerin bir birlik, dernek bir grup oluşturması çok zor. Her kafadan ayrı ses çıkıyor. Yani AKP de sürekli inkar politikası izliyor. Bu AYOP ün şeye kaymasından korkuyorum ben, sola. Bu sefer CHP felan kucak acıyor ama bunlar kendi siyasi şeyleri için kucak açıyor sonucta, Eğitim sen kendine çekmeye çalışıyor hani. Haklı olan tarafları var ama yani ülke koşulları ile uyuşmayan gerçeğe aykırı beklentiler de var. Mesela eğitim sen diyorki öğretmen maaşları iki katına çıksın, yok ek ders ücretleri 5 katına çıksın felan, bunlar Türkiye'nin gerçekleri ile alakasız, taban tabana zıt. Mesela Eğitim-Sen diyor ki işte AYOP gelsin benim kanatlarım altına gelsin o şekilde size yardım ederiz. İşte Türk eğitim sen kendince kendi tarafına çekmeye çalışıyor. Bağımsız kalması çok zor bir de tam sistemleşemedi. Hani 300 bin öğretmen var ama bir 5 bin kişilik gösteri yapamadı mesela, yapamıyorlar yani. İşte bu da öğretmenlerin biraz da ne yapacağını bilememekten biraz da şeyden kaynaklandı: 30 binlik, 40binlik 50 binlik atamalar oldu aynı bir şişsen balon gibi onun havası alındıkça o söndü. Belki o atamalar olmasaydı bu AYOP hareketi çok daha etkili olacaktı çok daha fazla büyüyecekti.

SS: Başka bildiğiniz gruplar var mı?

HH: Ayop dışında dernek olarak kurmaya çalışanlar oldu onu biliyorum. Ama bunlar 3-5 kişi, çok fazla kitleye hitap edemedi. Bizim halkımız da duyarsız hani atamam olsun da gidim kişisel şey peşinde yani. O yüzden beklenen şeyi uyandırmadı, ilk çıktığında baya bir uyandırdı hani. Sonra devamını getiremedi.

SS: Bu ataması yapılmayan öğretmenler gibi zor koşullarda çalışan, işini yapamayan kesimler var mı?

HH: Başka meslek grubu mu?

SS: Evet

HH: Yok ücretli öğretmen kadar ezilen, ataması yapılmayan öğretmenler kadar ezilen başka bir grup yoktur Türkiye'de. Mesela 4Cliler var bunların sigortası bile tam yatıyor. Hani 4C li bunlar ama bir statusu şeyi var. Ama ücretli öğretmenlerin hiçbir statusu yok. Bugün işi bırakıp gidiyor, sigortası yatmıyor. Normalde sigortayı yatırmamak bir suctur. Çalışma Bakanlığı'na gidip şikayet ettiğiniz zaman sigortası çalıştırıyor diye yasal işlem yapılır. Ama Milli Eğitim bunu resmi olarak yapıyor, ve gidecek bir yer bulamıyorsunuz. İtiraz ettiğinizde hemen işten çıkarılıyorsunuz hic

bir yasal dayanağı yok. İşte kanuna tabiyim haklarım sunlar diyemiyorsunuz. Ücretli öğretmenlik bi hiç olmak, özellikle öğretmenlik de ücretli öğretmenlik gibi bir kavram olması öğretmenliği aşağılayıcı bir durum oluyor. Başka hiçbir meslek grubunda böyle ücretli diye bişey yok.

SS: Peki ücretli öğretmenlerin maaşını daha iyi bir konuma getirecek düzeyde mi devlet?

HH: Burda mesela yılın öğretmeni seçiliyor, yılın öğretmeni bence ücretli öğretmenlerden seçilmeli. Ücretli öğretmen varken hiçbir kadrolu öğretmen secilemez aslında.

SS: Ödül olarak para vs nedenlerden mi?

HH: Yok ücretli öğretmenlik kadar fedakarlık yapan başka hiçbir meslek grubu yoktur. Çünkü o paraya, asgari ücrete, ayda 15 gün sigortaya o işi yapıyorsa demek o insan gerçekten işini seviyor. (neden işsizleri sormadım ki?) Ama ücretli öğretmenlik dahi olsa eğitim fakültesi mezunu olmayanlara öğretmenlik yaptırılmamalı. Ve ücretli öğretmenlerden eğitim fak mezunu olanlara edindikleri deneyim çektikleri zorluk göz önüne alınarak meslek de daha iyileştirme olmalı

SS: Bu insanlar bunu fedakarlıklarından ötürü mü yoksa mecbur olduklarından mı yapıyorlar?

HH: Mecbur oldukları için yapıyorlar tabi fedakarlık biraz mistik olurda. Mecbur oluyorlar ama bunu mecbur eden de devlet o açığı gidermeli yani. O insanların deneyimlerini göze alıp, mesela öğretmenliğe başlattığında ücretli öğretmenlik de geçen süreyi de öğretmenlikten saymalı

SS: Bu konuda adalet nasıl sağlanmalı?

HH: Adalet şu olacak: ücretli öğretmenlik de bir durum belirleyecek 3 senedir öğretmenlik yapan eğitim fak mezunlarına öğretmenlik hakkı verecek. Zaten KPSS' nin geçerli olmadığını, KPSS den yüksek puan alan iyi öğretmen düşük alan kötü öğretmendir ya da öğretmenlik vasfına haiz değildir öyle bişey zaten söylenemez.

SS: Herhangi bir sınav olmalı size göre?

HH: Şimdi sınav şöyle olmalı, olursa da, bir sınırı belirlenmeli 70 puan mesela bunun üstünde alan, şimdi siz diyeceksiniz mesela 10 puan alan din kültüründen öğretmen yapılıyor ee diğer taraftan diğer branş mezunu 90 puan alıyor atamıyorsunuz. Şimdi 90 puana sen yetersizsin öğretmenlik yapamazsın diyip 10-20 puan alanı sen öğretmen yaparsan bu saçmalaktır yani. Şimdi 20 puan alan daha iyi bir öğretmen mi

olacak. Bu neden kaynaklanıyor sistemin haksızlığından kaynaklanıyor. Ne yapmış o branştan çok mezun vermiş, diğer 10 puan alan adamdan az mezun vermiş. Burada yetiştirme ile ilgili bir sorun var bu da sistemin sorunu. Şimdi eğitim fakültesi mezunları ihtiyaca ne kadar cevap veriyor, aşırı mezun mu veriyor acaba. Diğer sosyal hizmetler din kültürü öğretmenliği bunlarda da az mezun veriliyor demekki bu da neden kaynaklanıyor üniversiteyi açan kurumlardan kaynaklanıyor. MEB, YÖK Başbakanlık.

SS: Din kültürü alanından atama az mezundan mı?

HH: İşte bu iktidarın şeyinden kaynaklanıyor. Zaten bu atanalar öğretmenlik çoğu yapmıyorlar. İdari kadroya çekiliyor müdür yapılıyor müdür yard. Yapılıyor yani alakasız idari görevler verilerek boş olan kontenjan gene boş gösteriliyor. Ben çevremden biliyorum mesela stajyer öğretmenliği kalkar kalkmaz müdür yard yapanlar var. Ama diğer taraftan adama 10 senedir öğretmenlik yapmış idari görev verilmiyor. İşte bu eğitime tarafsız bilimsel bakmamaktan oluyor ben çevremi nasıl zengin ederim. Bana oy verecek insanları nasıl üst tabakalara getirebilirim

SS: Özel sektörü düşündünüz mü?

HH: Türkiye de özel sektörün alacağı daha çok yol var. Aldığınız ücrete bakılarak yaptığımız çalışmanın hakkı verilmiyor. Hele eğitim konusunda hiç mümkün değil. En son bir yerlerde görüşmüştüm bana 400 e full time çalış demişti. Dersaneydi mümkün değil böyle bir şey. Burası oradan iyi nispeten iyi.

SS: Orda tam zamanlı sigorta durumu var mı?

HH: Orda tabi bir sene sigortası çalışacaksın diyor. Sonra her zaman öğrenci haklıdır, velinimettir özel sektörde. Çalıştığınız saatler belli değil, hakkınız hukukunuz pek yok. Bu biraz da şeyden kaynaklanıyor mezun sayısının çok olmasından.

SS: Kendi arkadaş çevreniz sizinle benzer durumda olan arkadaşlarınız var mı?

HH: Ben üniversite çevresiyle pek görüşmüyorum artık. Çoğu mesela sertifikasını almış öğretmenlik yapıyor 10 senedir onlarla görüşmek pek açmıyor beni artık.

SS: Neden?

HH: Aynı muhabbeti edemiyoruz şimdi hayat seviyesiyle hayat standardı ile alakalı adam şube müdür olmuş ben ücretli öğretmenim ben adamla oturup ne konuşacağım yani. Yani insanlar bir de bütün dünyada böyle size sınıfsal konumunuza göre değer veriyor, işinize göre değer veriyor. Oturup konuşmak moral bozucu olur.

SS: Hiç bulduğunuz görüştüğünüz arkadaşlarınız var mı?

HH: Yani mesela dün arkadaş telefon etti gelim felan diye ben uykusuzdum evdeydim kusura bakma felan dedim kafayı vurup yattım yani. Öyle oluyor bazen. Sosyal birşeye zaten vakit kalmıyor bir de insan çekiniyor şimdi mesela internetten görüyorsunuz ilçe müdür olmuş şube müdürü olmuş felan filan. Açıp o insanla ne konuşacaksınız yani. İşte tebrik ederim Milli Eğitim müdür olmusun felan o da diyecek sağol kardesim sen neler yapıyorsun, işte bende ücretli öğretmenim demek olmuyor.

SS: Zengin olmaya dair bir hayaliniz var mı peki?

HH: Ya zengin olmak değilde kimseye muhtaç olmayacak bir evin bir araban olsun. Çok da zengin olmak iyi birşey değil, ama rahatlayacak geleceğe güvenle bakacak bir sabit gelir.

SS: Çocüğünüz öğretmen olmak isterse?

HH: Yani onu düşünmedim ama doktor olsun felan. Ne bileyim öğretmenlik şu anda öğretmenlik her zaman önde gelen bir meslektir ama şu anda toplum nazarında çok saygın bir meslek değil. Şu anda olsa mesela imam olmasını isterdim. Daha sayılırdı.

SS: Siz imamhatip lisesini bitirdikten sonra imam olma şansınız olacak değil mi?

HH: Yani en azında başvurma şansım olacak. Şimdi bizim bransımızdan öğretmen 100 kişi felan alınıyor sağlık bakanlığı milli eğitim bakanlığı. burda istihdam daha düşük. Onu yaptığımda şansım daha artacak yani. İmam olabilir, Diyanet olabilir, Kuran öğreticisi olabilir o biraz daha öğretmenliğe yatkın.

SS: Çocukluktan gelen bir bilgi var mı?

HH: Tabi etkisi var Kuran bilmemin bir etkisi var.

SS: Hiç tevekkül ettiğiniz, işimiz Allah'a kaldı dediğiniz oldu mu?

HH: Yani şöyle hükümetin bunu çözeceğine inanmıyorum bu iş böyle gider arada insanlar hebar olur, zaten belli bir yaş arasında yapmanız gerekiyor memuriyet yaşı var. Yukardakilerin yani toplumdan çok şey olduğunu düşünmüyorum, toplumla çok ilgili gibi gözükse de kendine oy olarak hitap edecek insanları göz önüne alıyor. Yani sorunu çözmek gerçekten topluma faydalı olmak gibi bir sorunları olduğunu sanmıyorum

SS: Hiç kader deyip kendinize kızdığınız bir dönem oldu mu?

HH: Kadere kızmam da sisteme kızdığım oldu. Mesela başbakana küfrettiğim çok olmuştur. Milli Eğitim Bakanına küfrettiğim çok olmuştur. Ölse de atansak dediğim çok olmuştur yani.

SS: Bazı kişiler ben artık tevekkül ediyorum diyor bizim işimiz Allah'a kaldı diyor.

HH: Tevekkül yani zaten kaybettiren de o. Ben geçen internette sey yaptım telefonu verdim, biyoloji mezunu arkadaşlar gidelim YÖK başkanı ile konuşalım bu bölümde fakülte açmasın. Gidelim Milli Eğitim de Talim Terbiye Kurulu'nun başkanı ile konuşalım. Bunların imzası olmadan üniversite açılmaz. Gidelim konuşalım dedim yok başkan sekreterinden randevu aldım, 4-5 kişi olun gelin kabul ederiz dedi. Telefon yazdım oraya, Allah'ın bir kulu aramadı. Bende dedim ki bu meslek grubu buna layık. Yani yukardaki insan da sonuçta haklı kendisine baskı yok bişey sen otur ağla. Yani tavşan dağa küsmüs dağın haberi olmamıs. Yani üniversite mezunu ama kendisini ifade edecek bişeyi yok, yani işte böyle tevekkül ediyor mistik şeyler yapıyor. Ama çözüm noktasında şunu yapalım beraber edelim gibi şeyler yok. Bu da ne yapar sorunu çözümünü uzatır.

APPENDIX B: LIST OF QUESTIONS

A. Görüşmeci ve Ailesi Hakkında Bilgiler

1. Nerelisiniz?
2. Anne ve babanızın mesleği nedir?
3. Kaç kardeşiniz var?
4. Nerede oturuyorsunuz?
5. Evli misiniz? Ne zaman evlendiniz? Eşiniz ne iş yapıyor?
6. Nasıl geçiniyorsunuz?
7. Ailenizin ekonomik durumunu nasıl tanımlarsın?
8. Ailenizin sizden beklentileri neler? Bulduğunuz durumu nasıl değerlendiriyorsunuz?

B.Eğitim Süreci Hakkında Bilgiler

9. Hangi okullarda okudunuz?
10. Nasıl bir öğrenciydiniz?
11. Özel okullarda okumayı tercih eder miydin?
12. Hangi üniversiteden mezun oldunuz?
13. Bu üniversiteyi ve bölümü seçme nedenleriniz nedir?
14. Okuduğu üniversite hakkında ne düşünüyorsunuz?
15. Üniversitedeki eğitim ve olanakları hakkında ne düşünüyorsunuz?
16. Üniversitedeki sosyal çevreniz nasıldı?
17. Üniversite döneminde maddi olarak zorluk yaşad mı?
18. Öğrenci iken herhangi bir işte çalıştınız mı?

C. Öğretmenlik Hakkında Bilgiler ve Görüşler

19. Neden öğretmen olmak istediniz?
20. Bir meslek olarak Türkiye’de öğretmenlik mesleğini nasıl görüyorsunuz?

D. KPSS Hakkında Bilgiler ve Görüşler

21. KPSS sınavına çalıştığınız dönem nasıldı?
22. KPSS’ye ne şekilde ve ne kadar süre çalıştınız?
23. KPSS dersanesine gittiniz mi, gittiyseniz o süreci nasıl tanımlarsınız?

24. Kendi branşınızda atanma koşulları nelerdir?
25. Öğretmenlerin sınavla atanması hakkında ne düşünüyorsunuz?
26. Size göre öğretmenlerin atanamamasının nedenleri neler?

E. Çalışma Koşulları Hakkında Bilgiler, İş ve İşsizlik Deneyimleri

27. Mezun olduktan sonra ne gibi işlerde çalıştınız?
28. Öğretmenlik dışında yaptığınız işlerin koşulları nasıldı?
29. Öğretmenlik dışında yaptığınız işlerde kendinizi nasıl hissettiniz?
30. İşsiz kaldığınız dönemler oldu mu? Bu dönemler ne kadar sürdü?
31. İşsiz kaldığınız dönemde neler hissettiniz?
32. Şu an ne iş yapıyorsunuz?
33. İşinizden memnun musunuz?
34. Belirli bir düzeni, sabit bir kazancı veya sigortası var mı?
35. Şu anda yaptığınız işle ilgili sıkıntılar veya avantajlar neler?
36. Bu işe devam etmek istiyor musunuz? Neden?
37. Evet ise ne kadar devam edeceksiniz?
38. Hayır ise başka işler bakıyor musunuz?
39. Özel sektör mü yoksa devlet sektöründe mi çalışmayı umuyordunuz? Neden?
40. Özel sektörün çalışma koşulları hakkında ne düşünüyorsunuz?
41. Kamuda çalışan öğretmenlerin çalışma koşulları hakkında ne düşünüyorsunuz?
42. İş konusunda önünüzde ne gibi seçenekler var?
43. Sizin iş konusunda beklentileriniz neler?

F. Gündelik Hayat Hakkında Bilgiler

44. Boş zamanlarında neler yapıyorsunuz?
45. Mesleğiniz dışında gönüllü yaptığınız veya yapmayı düşündüğünüz etkinlikler neler?
46. Atanan arkadaşlarınız var mı? Varsa onlarla görüşüyor musunuz?
47. Kendine dair bir hayalleriniz veya beklentileriniz var mı?
48. Mevcut ekonomik durumunuzu nasıl tanımlıyorsunuz?
49. Ailesinden maddi destek alması gerekiyor mu?
50. Size göre zengin veya yoksul bir hayat nasıl olur?
51. Maddi sıkıntı yaşıyor musunuz? Yaşıyorsanız, bu durum sizi nasıl etkiliyor?

52. Boş zamanlarımız da iş arkadaşlarımızla görüşüyor musunuz?
53. Geleceğe yönelik ne tür planlarınız var?

G.Gündeme ve Politikaya İlişkin Görüşler

54. İntihar eden öğretmenler hakkında ne düşünüyorsunuz?
55. Ataması yapılmayan öğretmenlerle ilgili siyasilerin açıklamaları hakkında ne düşünüyorsunuz?
56. Bu mesele ile ilgili olarak mücadele eden kesimler hakkında ne düşünüyorsunuz?
57. Herhangi bir siyasi oluşuma üye misiniz? Üye olmayı düşünür müsünüz? Neden?
58. Medyada veya sosyal medyada ataması yapılmayan öğretmenlerin sorunlarını ne şekilde takip ediyorsunuz?
59. Size göre ataması yapılmayan öğretmenler sorununda devlet veya hükümetin rolü nedir?
60. Size göre bu sorunun çözümü ne şekilde olmalı?
61. Ataması yapılmayan öğretmenler kolektif mücadele edebilirler mi? Bu ne şekilde olmalıdır?

APPENDIX C: INTERVIEWEES

	NAME	GENDER	AGE	HOMETOWN	UNIVERSITY	DEPARTMENT	WORK	MARITAL STATUS
1	Öznur	Female	32	Trabzon	Erzurum Atatürk Üniversitesi	Coğrafya Bölümü	Paid Teacher	Married
2	Deniz	Female	30	Artvin	Van Yüzüncüyıl Üniversitesi	Tarih Öğretmeni	Paid Teacher	Single
3	Sevim	Female	27	Kırıkkale	Eskişehir-Açıköğretim Fakültesi	Okul Öncesi Öğretmeni	Paid Teacher	Married
4	Osman	Male	32	Adıyaman	Zonguldak Karaelmas Üniversitesi	Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretmeni	Working in PECs	Single
5	Ferdi	Male	24	Ankara	Eskişehir Anadolu üniversitesi	Bilgisayar Öğretmenliği ve Teknoloji Eğitimi	Paid Teacher	Single
6	Ezgi	Female	27	Ankara	Ankara Başkent Üniversitesi	Türkçe öğretmenliği	Paid Teacher	Single
7	Erhan	Male	32	Çorum	Ankara Hacettepe Üniversitesi	Kimya Öğretmenliği	Working in PECs	Single
8	Okan	Male	36	Ankara	Şanlıurfa Harran Üniversitesi	Biyoloji Bölüm	Paid Teacher	Married
9	Sadık	Male	31	Kütahya	Ankara Gazi Meslek Eğitim Fakültesi	Teknik Makine	Freelance Graphic Designer	Single
10	Zeynep	Female	28	Aksaray	Balıkesir Üniversitesi	Türk Dili ve Edebiyatı	Working in PECs	Married
11	Emir	Male	29	Yozgat	Bolu Abant İzzet Baysal Üniversitesi	Türkçe Öğretmenliği	Office Work	Single
12	Tuğba	Female	28	Çorum	Zonguldak Karaelmas Üniversitesi	Türkçe Öğretmenliği	Paid Teacher	Single
13	Sedef	Female	35	Hatay	Kahramanmaraş Sütçü İmam Üniversitesi	Fizik Bölümü	Paid Teacher	Married
14	Engin	Male	36	Zonguldak	Trabzon Karadeniz Teknik Üniversitesi	Matematik Bölümü	Paid Teacher	Single
15	Hatice	Female	29	Ankara	Kastamonu Gazi Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi	Fen Bilgisi Öğretmenliği	Paid Teacher	Single
16	Özlem	Female	30	Ankara	Kırıkkale Üniversitesi	Tarih Bölümü	Paid Teacher	Single
17	Ali	Male	30	Hatay	Sivas Cumhuriyet Üniversitesi	Matematik Öğretmenliği	Paid Teacher	Single

18	Fikret	Male	34	Tokat	Ankara-Hacettepe Üniversitesi	Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretmeni	Working in PECs	Single
19	Hülya	Female	30	Ankara	Samsun 19 Mayıs Üniversitesi	Tarih Öğretmeni	Working in PECs	Single
20	Mikail	Male	22	Çankırı	Ankara Gazi Üniversitesi	İlköğretim Matematik	Working in PECs	Single
21	Esra	Female	32	Ankara	Ankara Gazi Üniversitesi	Tarih Bölümü	Working in PECs	Married
22	Ebru	Female	31	Adana	Ankara Gazi Üniversitesi	Sosya Bilgiler Öğretmenliği	Working in PECs	Married

TEZ FOTOKOPİSİ İZİN FORMU

ENSTİTÜ

Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü

Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü

Uygulamalı Matematik Enstitüsü

Enformatik Enstitüsü

Deniz Bilimleri Enstitüsü

YAZARIN

Soyadı :

Adı :

Bölümü :

TEZİN ADI (İngilizce) :

TEZİN TÜRÜ : Yüksek Lisans

Doktora

1. Tezimin tamamından kaynak gösterilmek şartıyla fotokopi alınabilir.

2. Tezimin içindekiler sayfası, özet, indeks sayfalarından ve/veya bir bölümünden kaynak gösterilmek şartıyla fotokopi alınabilir.

3. Tezimden bir bir (1) yıl süreyle fotokopi alınamaz.

TEZİN KÜTÜPHANEYE TESLİM TARİHİ: