

# education policy analysis archives

A peer-reviewed, independent,  
open access, multilingual journal



Arizona State University

Volume 25 Number 13

February 20, 2017

ISSN 1068-2341

## Impact of Internal Population Movements on the Schooling Process in Turkey: Supervisors' Views

*Hanife Akar*

Middle East Technical University



*Derya Şen*

Atatürk Üniversitesi

Turkey

**Citation:** Akar, H., & Şen, D. (2017). Impact of internal migration movements on the schooling process in Turkey: Supervisors' views. *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 25(13).

<http://dx.doi.org/10.14507/epaa.25.2693>

**Abstract:** This study attempted to examine the impact of interregional and urban–rural population movements on schools located in areas subjected to high in-migration and out-migration flows in Turkey based on data collected from primary school supervisors ( $N=150$ ). A cross-sectional survey design was utilized to examine the most pressing problems confronted in those schools, and possible actions that could be taken by various stakeholders were sought. Overall data suggest that those schools serve mostly disadvantaged populations with poor households. Among the main challenges revealed are lack of adequate school resources and poor facilities, problems caused due to ineffective and untimely implementation of the program, high personnel turnover and recruitment of largely inexperienced and relatively less qualified educational staff, and lower levels of parental involvement in children's schooling. Accordingly, proposed recommendations focused on measures to eliminate capacity and resource constraints, improve hiring practices, and secure adequate supervision and support for educational staff, meet academic and socio-emotional needs of students and facilitate parental involvement in the education of children.

**Keywords:** Migration; educational policy; poverty; primary schools; supervisors

### **Impacto de los movimientos de población internos en la escolarización proceso en Turquía: Las opiniones de los supervisores**

**Resumen:** En este estudio se trató de examinar el impacto de los movimientos de población interregionales y urbano-rurales en las escuelas ubicadas en zonas sometidas a altos flujos de inmigración y emigración en Turquía, sobre la base de datos recogidos de los supervisores de escuelas primarias (*número*= 150). Se utilizó un diseño de encuesta transversal para examinar los problemas más apremiantes a los que se enfrentan esas escuelas y las posibles medidas que podrían adoptar los distintos grupos de interés. Los datos globales sugieren que esas escuelas prestan servicios, en su mayoría, a poblaciones desfavorecidas de familias pobres. Entre los principales retos revelados se encuentra la falta de suficientes recursos escolares e instalaciones deficientes, problemas causados debido a la aplicación ineficaz e inoportuna del programa, a la alta rotación de personal y a la contratación de personal docente en gran medida sin experiencia y relativamente menos cualificados, así como niveles más bajos de participación de los padres en la escolarización de sus hijos. En consecuencia, las recomendaciones propuestas se centraron en medidas para eliminar las limitaciones de capacidad y recursos, mejorar las prácticas de contratación y asegurar la supervisión y apoyo adecuados para el personal educativo, satisfacer las necesidades académicas y socio-emocionales de los estudiantes y facilitar la implicación de los padres en la educación de los niños.

**Palabras clave:** Migración; política educativa; pobreza; escuelas primarias; supervisores

### **Impacto dos movimentos migratórios no processo de escolarização na Turquia: Pareceres dos supervisores**

**Resumo:** Este estudo procurou analisar o impacto dos movimentos migratórios interregionais e urbano-rurais em escolas localizadas em zonas sujeitas a elevados fluxos imigratórios e emigratórios na Turquia, com base em dados compilados por supervisores do ensino primário ( $N= 150$ ). Este estudo foi elaborado com base num inquérito transversal, que visou analisar os problemas mais prementes com que essas escolas se defrontam e estabelecer as ações passíveis de serem empreendidas pelos diversos intervenientes. Os dados globais indicam que as escolas servem principalmente populações desfavorecidas, provenientes de agregados familiares pobres. De entre os principais desafios evidenciados, figura a inexistência de recursos escolares adequados, instalações precárias, problemas decorrentes de uma aplicação ineficaz e extemporânea do programa, elevada rotatividade do pessoal, recrutamento de docentes maioritariamente inexperientes e pouco qualificados e níveis muito baixos de envolvimento dos pais na educação escolar das crianças. Por conseguinte, as recomendações propostas centram-se na implementação de medidas que eliminem os condicionalismos de capacidade e de recursos, melhorem as práticas de recrutamento e seleção do pessoal, assegurem supervisão e apoio adequados ao corpo docente, respondam às necessidades escolares e sócio emocionais dos alunos e promovam o envolvimento parental na educação dos filhos.

**Palavras-chave:** Migração; política educativa; pobreza; escolas primárias; supervisores

## **Introduction**

Migration, an international phenomena, has been a long-standing issue in Turkey at a national level, and this movement of people out of rural or disadvantaged areas is likely to have a negative effect on children's schooling that is inevitable with few exceptions, given the resources available in the receiving communities (Akar, 2010; Contreras, 2002, Rong & Brown, 2002; Schapiro, 2009). Many migrants seem to be destined to poor educational achievement and the transmission of poverty across generations makes it essential to understand migrants' ongoing exclusion from educational mechanisms, and educational outcomes of migrants can be understood through three broad criteria: access to quality education, participation in education, and academic performance (Schapiro, 2009). Some studies (Goodwin, 2002; Rong & Brown,

2002) suggest that meeting the needs of migrant children in terms of these criteria requires a reassessment of curricula, student evaluation and placement, school climate and the availability of support services for students and their families. Studies such as the current one may help practitioners, researchers, elected officials and policymakers to identify barriers to inclusion and equity resulting from internal migration and to shape policies designed to address them (Rosenthal, 2004).

A fair amount of research has been conducted with regard to the effects of international migration on educational opportunities and outcomes; however, similar research into the impact of internal migration is a relatively less researched endeavor compared to external migration, and we attempt to address this issue based on supervisors' views.

There is a common belief that the school supervisory system plays a critical role in maintaining and improving the quality of education (Nushe, 2009). Supervisor evaluations represent important sources of information regarding the provision of educational services, and feedback and suggestions provided by supervisors represent critical inputs into the policy-formation process. In this study we tried to examine the impact of internal migration on education in schools located in provinces subjected to high levels of in-migration, out-migration, or both from the perspectives of supervisors. In line with this purpose we attempted to find answers to the following research questions:

1. What are the challenges of internal migration on education associated with primary stakeholders, namely, students, teachers, school administration and parents?
2. What are the challenges associated with the characteristics of the schools and the overall quality of the services provided?
3. What are the possible measures to be taken in response to the challenges faced and the roles of the different stakeholders in this regard?

### **Impact of Migration on Schooling**

Developments in mass communication and transportation (Berker, 2009; Öztürk, 2007) and the promise of greater income and employment opportunities in industrialized areas as well as better provision of basic services such as education and health made settlement in urban centers more attractive in Turkey (Berker, 2009). In addition, demographic pressures played a key role in internal migration (Taş & Lightfoot, 2007), which, like many countries, experienced a population explosion following the end of World War II. The rate of urbanization during the 1950s was close to 25.0%, but by the end of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, it had nearly tripled to 73.2% (Taş & Lightfoot, 2007) and currently, urbanization is over 80%. In addition to the economic, social and demographic factors that played a role in migration, between 1984 and 1999, hundreds of thousands of residents of Eastern Turkey evacuated their settlements due to terrorism and security concerns (Koç & Ünalın, 2005).

The rapid changes and growth in the population led to dramatic needs and on top, educational services, including the construction of schools, were the most urgently needed for the children of internal migrants. Research provides evidence that internal migration has a negative impact on the children's cognitive and psycho-social development due to the poor conditions of the school location, these are followed with other variables such as poor language skills that negatively contributes to the children's schooling (Akbaba, 2009), and lack of knowledge for teachers, especially, to teach for culturally diverse student populations (Akar, 2010, Altınyelken, 2009a; Altınyelken, 2009b, Berker, 2009). In a study through teacher reports, Akar (2010) found that internal migrant children mostly struggled with language deficiencies which were means to stay behind in the curriculum and because of the lack of proper language skills they suffered from social adaptation problems, which could trigger misbehaviors in the school contexts.

Language deficiencies partially stem from the ethnic pluralism of the population in Turkey, especially, inadequate public pre-schooling investment in disadvantaged districts has a

negative impact on the educational attainment of children. In addition, one in every four children in the Southeast of Turkey is considered to be poor (Gürsel, Uysal, & Acar, 2013), despite the movement to more central or urban areas for economic and educational reasons (Akar, 2010), poor children are likely start to work at their early ages and earn less, are living in large households. Sadly, this poverty lingers on to their adulthood (Acar & Anil, 2015). Thus lack of parental support for to foster higher educational gains seems not to be supported by parents who come from disadvantaged backgrounds.

Similarly, Altinyelken (2009a, 2009b) found that migrant girls encounter a variety of hardships such as adaptation, language issues, low socio-economic background, unsatisfactory peer relations, discrimination as well as bullying when they attend schooling in their new settlements. In their study, Goksen and Cemalciler (2010) found that about 95% of the migrants to Istanbul dropped out from schools, while around two-thirds of migrants dropped out in other cities. The others concluded that these figures were bound to risk factors such as child labor, having an illiterate mother and no stable house income and suggested that social capital factors are critical in the educational attainment and acculturation of migrant children. In other words, migrant children are mostly from poor or deprived households and lack basic human needs such as healthy nutrition, good living standards, and love and care.

According to the Human Development Report, the inequality-adjusted Human Development Index (IHDI) rates, which indicated the magnitude of inequality in living standards, was 27.4% in Turkey – nearly three times that of the mean for European and Central Asian countries (10.5%) – with the higher rate due mainly to inequality in education in Turkey (HDR, 2013). The magnitude of inequality in living standards and low quality education makes this study crucial in a time that schools located in migrant districts become dramatically vulnerable due to external migration or influx of refugees.

Curriculum policy implemented in schools is an important indicator to meet students' educational needs. In 2005 a constructivist curriculum was introduced to primary education in order to provide flexibility to teachers in meeting the needs of students at the local level. This approach could be indicated as introducing school improvement opportunities for schools holding disadvantaged populations. Nevertheless, implementation of the curriculum has faced difficulties for various reasons (Bal & Doğanay, 2010) related to teacher educational background and professional development services (TALIS, 2008). Indicating that teachers' may not be well-equipped to teach with a constructivist approach. Beside teacher quality, underachievement in schools with low socio-economic backgrounds were associated with inequality in social capital, indicating that students lack love and care from their social environment in the school and home context (Cemalciler & Gökşen, 2014, Goksen & Cemalciler, 2010).

Altogether, the studies mentioned above relate to evidence from internal evaluation perspectives such as from school teachers, students, principals, and it is essential to obtain evaluations from external participants as well. Supervisors are referred to as crucial stakeholders for the evaluation of current school practices as well as for their implications for school improvement practices, and may become invaluable sources for school-based policy needs at micro level and nation-wide policy needs at macro levels for schools that are challenged due to migration issues.

The proceeding section provides some background on how education is organized in Turkey, and the role of supervisors and how supervision operates are explained to underscore the value of obtaining data from the perspectives of supervisors.

### **Organization of Education in Turkey**

The education system in Turkey is centralized and operates within a multi-level legal framework. The organizational structure of the Ministry of National Education (MNE) is regulated by Law Number 3397 and comprises four sections, namely: the central administration, which includes the Turkish Board of Education and its main service units, the General

Directorate of Primary Education and Secondary Education; the provincial administration (SPAs), i.e. the extension of the central administration at the local (provincial and district) level, with the governorate the local representative of the ministry; the foreign administration; and the affiliated institutions.

All schools are affiliated with the Ministry of National Education (MNE) through their provincial-level Educational Directorates (EDs) (MEB, 2014). In line with Article 5 of the MNE's Regulations on Supervisory Boards (MEB, 2011), the Ministry of National Education and the Chair of the Supervisory Board assigns Ministerial Supervisors to supervise, assess, examine and inspect the activities and transactions of all four sections of the MNE, including all schools and institutions are subject to the supervision and inspection of the MNE.

### **Provincial Directorates and Supervision in Schools**

Supervision of primary education at the local level is implemented by provincial Primary Education Supervisory Boards affiliated with the Provincial Directorates of National Education (MEB, 2011, Art. 9). These official organizations are authorized by the Ministry of National Education and play a crucial role in the selection, development, training, and placement of vice supervisors, and the appointment of supervisors who earn it through a selection and training process. Beyond those responsibilities, Provincial Directorates are accountable of ensuring that educational policies and school activities are running smoothly in schools in District Level Educational Directorates in a formative way, and examine and report any instructional or educational needs that emerge. Whereas, the former policy (Article 10 of the Regulations, Official Gazette, 1997, Feb. 18, 1998, Number 22909) states specifically that this includes “conducting supervision of schools, assessments, examinations and investigations, if necessary, associated with the activities and transactions of the Ministerial organization, taking necessary measures to remedy any deficiencies, defects and methodical interruptions identified during inspections, and in cases in which any corruption or deviation from legislation is identified during inspection and supervision, undertake prompt action related to the responsible party and notify the Ministry of the situation.”

The process of supervision and role of supervisors has gone through a policy change in 2011 after a decree was released in the Official Gazette (Official Gazette, 2011). As outlined in the Official Gazette dated June 24, 2011 (Number 27974, Article 43), the role of school supervisors in Turkey consists mainly of providing teachers with guidance and on-the job training, which includes meeting with teachers prior to the start of and again during the school year in order to identify problems teachers face and offer help and guidance to teachers and administrators in solving them. Additionally, supervisors are required to follow changes in educational policy and ensure that teachers and administrators are properly informed about these policy changes.

Moreover, based on their observations, supervisors are obliged to file written reports on teacher performance and any needs or issues beyond instructional processes they observe in schools (MNE, 2011), which may provide an essential degree of insight into the needs of schools. The supervisor fulfills the function of coordinating supervisions, assessments, examinations and investigations initiated by the Ministerial organization, the governorship and the local administrations. All related supervisory tasks, guidance, and reporting conducted, including the selection process and supervisor assignment, are examined through an internal evaluation system through the Ministry and Maarif Supervisors (Controlling Supervisors), in other words, who are supervisors in charge of evaluating the activities conducted and the reports prepared to ensure alignment with quality standards. However, the focus of this study does include those since this policy has been currently released (Official Gazette, 2014, May 24, 2014, Number 29009, Article, 62).

Briefly, change in the policy underlines that the role of supervisors is transferred into positions that require more guidance and consultancy facilities, and the institutions they are

affiliated with enable them to act as coordinating and monitoring centers to implement the policies and work toward the strategic plan set as well as monitor this process for improvement (Official Gazette, 2012, Nov. 18, 2012, Number 28471).

According to Nusche (2009) and (Rosenthal, 2004) supervisors may possess detailed knowledge of issues such as school environment, leadership, and management of physical and finance resources; curriculum; national examination results; and student backgrounds. While working closely with school administrators and teachers, supervisors, through their external vantage points, supervisors can provide us with invaluable information that goes beyond the examination of classroom teaching and learning opportunities. Ultimately, supervisors are well-placed to provide researchers with greater insight into migration-related educational matters. In line with this rationale, a cross-sectional survey design was employed.

## Method

The ultimate aim of this study was to contribute to improvements in the provision of education in schools affected by internal population movements in Turkey by providing concrete suggestions to decision-makers and practitioners through employing a cross-sectional survey design.

### Participants and Sampling Procedure

Study participants comprised a group of 150 purposefully selected supervisors who were actively involved in school supervision. Sample selection was executed in three phases. In stage one, 24 provinces with districts showing the highest in-migration ( $N=34$ ) and out-migration ( $N=18$ ) rates were identified and selected based on data obtained from the national statistical agency with the help of an urban sociology specialist (See Appendix A). In stage two, the highest in-migration and out-migration districts were identified in those provinces. Thirty-four districts were located in provinces experiencing mainly in-migration, and 18 were located in provinces experiencing mainly out-migration. In stage three, all supervisors ( $N=210$ ) who were in charge in those districts were approached to volunteer to become a participant in the study.

Following district selection, with the assistance of the MNE's Educational Research and Development Office, EARGED<sup>1</sup> and the Provincial Directorates of Education, hard copies of the questionnaire were delivered in sealed, self-addressed envelopes to the 210 primary-school supervisors responsible for the selected schools. A total of 150 supervisors voluntarily completed the surveys, for a return rate of 71.4% via mails. All surveys were unanimously received in sealed envelopes.

### Data Collection and Analysis Procedures

The questionnaire was developed based on information in the literature linking education and migration and from data obtained through informal and semi-structured interviews with school staff, parents, students, and three experienced supervisors working in the MNE Central Administration in Ankara. The content and face validity of the survey instrument was evaluated by a panel of two experts on curriculum and instruction, two experts on guidance and counseling, one professor of urban sociology and three classroom teachers employed as research experts at EARGED. Among those teacher experts, one female teacher was formerly a principal for one year and received her Ph.D. in Curriculum and Instruction at that time. A limitation is that we could not receive external opinion from an expert in educational administration and planning; however, the second author of this paper is a Ph.D. candidate in that respect.

The questionnaire consists of three parts. The first part collects demographic information about the participants. The second part consists of open-ended questions that ask

---

<sup>1</sup> EARGED was disbanded in 2011 (Decree-Law 652), after that a separate office within the MNE has been responsible for conducting in-house research.

participants to share their thoughts and perceptions regarding the most pressing problems confronted by schools located in communities subjected to in- and/or out migration. The questions are structured to elicit responses regarding specific challenges associated with primary stakeholders (students, teachers, school administration and parents), the characteristics of the schools and their immediate surroundings as well as the overall quality of the services provided. The third part of the questionnaire aimed to elicit participants' thoughts about possible measures to be taken in response to the challenges faced and the roles of the different stakeholders in this regard.

Demographic data were analyzed using descriptive statistics, whereas qualitative data was examined using content analysis performed on a set of randomly selected 15 questionnaires for checking inter and intra-coding reliability among the authors and an external Ph.D. candidate before the main coding initiated. This process included the training of researchers by the first author to practice how to treat data and reduce them into codes using the correct terms. When an alignment was observed in how every single data was coded, the rest of the data were analyzed by one external researcher and the second author of this paper. Content-analysis utilized was fit with Miles, Humberman and Saldana's (2014) data reduction technique. More explicitly, data were manually coded by the researchers and then grouped into meaningful categories by both authors, who through frequent communication and negotiation agreed on themes that presented data in meaningful condensed form and thereafter relations among the codes that emerged were made and explained. Although reporting frequencies are provided in tables and texts we did not put codes with less frequencies in tables put reported and discussed them in the text. It must be emphasized that frequency of responses should in no way be taken as indicative of either the degree of seriousness of the challenges faced or the level of benefit that might be gained by implementing a particular recommendation. In fact, less frequent responses may be reflective of more critical or careful thought and experienced-based observations and are thus included here so as to provide a more comprehensive picture of the existing situation and a wider range of feedback that may be used as input for developing solutions.

### **Limitations**

Given the challenges of internal migration trends in Turkey, this study provides crucial implications for practitioners and policy-makers to alleviate the pressing problems in schools located in migrant neighborhoods and is likely to provide crucial implications for nations who receive influxes of external migrants into their educational system. Although, there is the risk as external evaluators, supervisors may not beware of the potential flaws that teachers or students face in their daily educational practices at those schools, and their evaluations may underestimate the potential challenges that they could not observe *vis-à-vis* and take it for granted may be considered as a limitation of this study. Therefore, in our analysis we weight equal value to all views we received from supervisors and did not evaluate the findings based on the magnitude of counts of the codes that emerged in the dataset.

## **Results**

The study findings are presented in three main sections. The first section presents demographic information pertaining to the study participants. The second section presents findings regarding the challenges experienced by schools located in areas subject to high levels of in- and/or out-migration based on the themes that emerged. This section begins with a discussion of conditions and characteristics of both school contexts, then moves on to challenges experienced- and posed-by teachers, students and parents at these schools. Next, the context and practice relating to challenges of curriculum delivery in these school settings are reported. The final section focuses on proposed policy and practice measures provided by participants to address issues they have identified in these school settings.

## Demographic Data

Demographic data for the survey participants (Table 1) indicate well over 90% of the participants were male ( $N=139$ ), which reflects the male-dominated pattern observed at all administrative levels in the educational system in Turkey (Saglam, 2012).

Table 1  
*Demographic characteristics of survey respondents*

Demographic information ( $n=150$ )	<i>N</i>	%
Gender		
Female	9	6.0
Male	139	92.66
Highest degree attained		
Master degree	97	64.66
PhD degree	4	2.66
Years of experience		
Years of professional experience	146	14.50
Years of working in the same place of employment	135	10.12

More than half of the participants (61.6%;  $N = 85$ ) were responsible for supervising schools located in provinces receiving large numbers of internal migrants, 15.9% ( $N = 22$ ) for supervising schools in provinces subjected to high levels of out-migration, and 15.2% ( $N = 21$ ) for supervising schools located in provinces subjected to both intra-provincial rural-urban migration as well as inter-provincial migration (Table 2).

Table 2  
*Distribution of participants' place of work ( $n=150$ )*

Place of work	<i>N</i>	%
Provinces receiving large numbers of internal migrants	85	61.6
Provinces sending large numbers of internal migrants	22	15.9
Provinces subject to within- and between-province migration	21	15.2

## Challenges Faced by Schools

Challenges faced by schools in areas affected by internal migration have been broadly characterized as relating to school context, teachers, students, parents and curriculum delivery. A discussion of these challenges is presented below first as they apply to schools in areas subjected to high levels of inter-provincial and/or intra-provincial (rural-urban) in-migration and then to schools in areas subjected to high levels of out-migration.

### Schools in areas receiving high numbers of migrants

#### Theme 1

##### *Condition of school facilities and resources*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
School physical capacity	52
Overcrowding	29
Financial difficulties	18
Maintenance, repair and renovation needs	15
Inadequate supply of school equipment	10
Lack of educational materials	8
Operational costs	8
Space-related practices	6
Split day schedule	4

Many respondents cited the concern over the insufficient physical capacity of schools in migrant communities to accommodate increases in the student population ( $f=52$ ). A considerable number of supervisors among this group also reported that these schools suffered from severe overcrowding ( $f=29$ ). To ease overcrowding, schools were reported to use various space-related and scheduling practices ( $f=16$ ). It was stated that schools that had formerly been operating on a full-day schedule had been forced to utilize split-day schedule ( $f=4$ ). Some participants expressed their concern with the extent of the practice of re-designating physical structures as classrooms regardless of current usage. Because every available space is needed for use as a classroom, as reported, schools are unable to provide space to accommodate libraries, science laboratories, gymnasiums and music and art classrooms. It was also stated that construction of extensions to school buildings to provide additional classrooms leaves students without playgrounds in some cases ( $f=6$ ); In addition, some respondents commented on the relation between over enrollment and school condition and indicated significant wear and tear on facilities in schools overburdened by increased enrollments. Accordingly, maintenance, repair and renovation needs of existing facilities were identified as a challenge ( $f=15$ ).

The availability and adequacy of school resources was also cited as a challenge for these schools. In this regard, inadequate supply of school equipment ( $f=10$ ); a lack of educational material ( $f=8$ ). Schools were also reported to be having financial difficulties ( $f=18$ ); specifically, participants stated that high student numbers put pressure on school resources, making it difficult for schools to cover their operational costs ( $f=8$ ). As mentioned by a respondent, in contrast to schools situated in affluent communities, fundraising among parents and the local community was out of the question to address resource constraints faced by these schools:

They are trapped in economic deprivation, and it is not possible to see the parental support that is evident in schools in affluent districts. School principals are literally striving with paramount problems. Lack of teaching and non-teaching staff has made those schools transitional institutions that host students for a while.

Even in state-provided compulsory education, school quality has been found to be influenced by private financial inputs, and areas in which parents and communities are unable to contribute may suffer from inequities in education. For this reason, the MNE has developed the e-okul (literally, “electronic school”) system to track financial inputs in a transparent manner as released in the Regulation (Genelge 2007/74, 2007). By relying on this system, it is possible to determine with greater accuracy the degree to which financial input, affects school quality, and thus better evaluate the policy-practice gap. Principals are expected to act as entrepreneurs, however, poverty of the district where the school is located is a barrier to enhance private financial support.

## Theme 2

### *Administrative processes and working conditions for principals*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
New administrative staff lack necessary experience and competence to deal with the problems of these schools	7
Lack of competence to deal with specific school-based issues	7
Increase o workload due to additional clerical responsibilities	5
Failure to complete student transfer registration timely	5
Limited resources make administrative staff feel helpless	4
High turn-over rates among administrative staff	3
Lack of support from high level authorities	3
Delays in assignments of new staff	2

As reported by supervisors, the rise in the number of students has led to increases in the workload of administrative staff due to additional clerical responsibilities ( $f=5$ ). Difficulties were reported in recording and monitoring student attendance, which was blamed on the failure to complete student transfer-registration processes in a timely manner ( $f=5$ ). Supervisors highlighted a lack of support for and attention to these schools on the part of higher-level authorities ( $f=3$ ), one participant complaint:

Executives do not care much about those schools, and they pay their visits mostly to central urban schools. Most of the schools that take in internal migrant students need psychological support and morale, alas the guidance and counseling facilities are insufficient.

The combination of increased needs and expectations and limited available resources was said to leave administrative staff in a position of helplessness ( $f=4$ ), which was blamed for a lack of motivation and high turnover rates among administrative staff ( $f=3$ ). Staffing practices meant that when experienced administrators left their jobs, they were replaced by substitutes ( $f=2$ ) and administrators who lacked the necessary experience and competence to deal with the problems of these schools ( $f=7$ ). Delays in appointing replacements for departing administrators was also mentioned ( $f=2$ ).

### Theme 3

#### *Institutional culture and climate*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Adverse impact of student mobility and turn over	6
Failure to establish close cooperation between administrative and teaching staff	4
Failure to institutionalize due to lack of cooperation among staff	4

Student mobility was reported to have an adverse impact on the institutional culture and climate of schools ( $f=6$ ). Moreover, supervisors believed that high administrative turnover rates, teacher and administration dissatisfaction viewed as making the establishment of a feeling of loyalty toward these schools difficult, and failure to establish close cooperation between administrative and teaching staff made it impossible to institutionalize efforts to improve these schools ( $f=4$ ).

#### **Schools in areas sending high numbers of migrants**

### Theme 4

#### *Enrollment and efficiency*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Well-below average class sizes	18
Transitions into multi-grade classrooms	18
Inefficient schooling	9
School closures	7
Abandoned or uneased property	4
Transitions to urban central schools	2
Bussing facilities	2

Schools located in areas of high out-migration were characterized as having well-below-average class sizes ( $f=18$ ). Dramatic student outflow had, over time, led to transitions into multi-grade classrooms or complete school closures ( $f=18$ ). In the latter case, students were bussed to the nearest central school, or, if necessary, transferred to a primary school with pension or a regional boarding primary school. In some cases, school closures had reportedly led parents to

either send their children to stay with relatives in an urban area or to migrate as a family to a more central location in search of better educational opportunities ( $f=2$ ). Problems of school closure and bussing were also seen as exacerbated by teachers' tendency to prefer living in more urban areas rather than in villages. As a result of the declining numbers of students and failure of schools to achieve the desired outcome in return for their efforts, the education in these schools was judged to be inefficient ( $f=9$ ). Decreases in efficiency of the education process in areas suffering from out-migration were also attributed to the continued abandonment of school buildings following school closures ( $f=7$ ) and to parts of school property remaining unused due to decreases in student numbers ( $f=4$ ).

#### Theme 5

##### *Condition of school facilities and resources.*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Lack of maintenance, repair and renovation facilities, resources	17
Lack of financial resources	8
Commuting to and from those schools is expensive	6
Schools located in poverty-stricken areas with high unemployment rates	5

Schools affected by out-migration were reported to be located in poverty-stricken areas with high unemployment rates ( $f=5$ ). Similar to those located in migrant communities, they were said to suffer from a lack of financial resources ( $f=8$ ), and unable to meet the needs for maintenance, repair and renovation of physical facilities or for equipment and educational material ( $f=17$ ). Additionally, some schools were reported to suffer from a lack of adequate utility infrastructure (e.g. water, electricity, sanitation) due to their rural locations, and commuting to and from these schools was said to be expensive and time-consuming ( $f=6$ ).

#### Theme 6

##### *Administrative processes and staffing practices*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Failure to keep up-to-date administrative records	9
Lack of support or attention by higher level authorities	7

As reported by supervisors, due to a lack of availability of administrative and other personnel, teachers in rural schools were expected to undertake administrative and clerical tasks by themselves. Thus, as the number of teachers decreased in line with falls in enrollment, administrative records such as student attendance and transfers were not kept up-to-date ( $f=9$ ). Similar to those located in migrant communities, lack of support for and attention to these schools from higher level executives was reported for these schools. ( $f=7$ ).

#### Theme 7

##### *School culture and climate*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Negative impact of students abandoning schools	3
Lack of dynamism for school improvement	2
Loss of student population damages corporate image of schools	2

School climate was also viewed as negatively impacted by the continuous transferring out of students ( $f=3$ ) in what was considered a cycle that resulted in a loss of dynamism and, ultimately, an inability for the school to renew itself ( $f=2$ ). In this regard, the loss of students was also interpreted as damaging the corporate image of the school, which then lost its value in the eyes of the local community ( $f=2$ ).

## Challenges Experienced by and Posed by Teachers

### Schools in central rural districts receiving high numbers of migrants

#### Theme 8

##### *Profile of the teaching staff and employment practices*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Experience teacher shortages	9
Non-tenure track teachers,	6
Inexperienced teaching staff	6
Staffing practices negatively impact school quality	5
High teacher turn-over	4
Ineffective counseling and guidance services	3
Less proficient and less skilled teachers	2
Lack of teacher commitment and motivation	2
Teacher vacancies	2

The use of different types of non-tenure track teachers was reported as a common practice in these schools ( $f=6$ ). It was stated that in many cases, these substitute teachers were not licensed in the subject area and/or grade level they were assigned to teach and some of them are required to work at more than one school in order to fulfill their weekly quota of instructional delivery hours. Hiring practices in these schools coupled with experienced teacher shortages ( $f=9$ ) and high teacher turnover ( $f=4$ ). Ultimately, this resulted in staff compositions mostly limited to inexperienced ( $f=6$ ) and less proficient and less skilled ( $f=2$ ) teachers; ineffective provision of counseling and guidance services ( $f=3$ ); and a lack of teacher commitment and motivation ( $f=2$ ). Consequently, those practices indicate that it undermines the quality of education provided to students ( $f=5$ ), and leaves schools without teachers for a considerable period of time ( $f=2$ ).

#### Theme 9

##### *Teacher competencies and professional development*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Inexperienced for instructional planning for heterogeneous student groups	13
Ill-equipped teachers	10
Inadequacy and ineffectiveness for school classroom based or after-school interventions	7
Need for interpersonal relations with parents	7
Need for professional development	5
Lack of adequate in-service training	4
Lack of teacher interest in professional development	4

Teachers were perceived as ill-equipped to cope with challenges faced by these schools ( $f=10$ ). Unfortunately, this was attributed partly to the quality of pre-service courses of study at universities. As one supervisor explicitly stated, “teacher-training programs do not equip the teacher candidates with the essential knowledge and skills to address schools with diverse needs and insufficient resources.” This sentiment was echoed by another supervisor’s assertion that “Teachers are not equipped to teach in resource poor remote settings.”

Among the specific skills teachers were felt to lack planning and delivering instruction to academically heterogeneous student groups ( $f=13$ ), the inadequacy and ineffectiveness of both classroom-based and after-school interventions such as remedial courses, ability groupings and individualized instruction to address the needs of students with varying pre-knowledge and skill levels ( $f=7$ ). According to supervisors, teachers have low levels of competence in utilizing

instructional methods and techniques ( $f=3$ ) as well as in getting to know their students individually and being able to provide them with sufficient guidance ( $f=2$ ). More specifically, it was reported that teachers are more likely to lecture in class than to apply other instructional methods ( $f=3$ ), which indicates that student-centered education – i.e. hands-on and active learning approaches – are not, and perhaps could not, be implemented although the centralized curriculum suggests to be a constructive. Rather, students remain passive recipients without opportunities to interact or collaborate with their classmates. Participants suggested that this signaled a need for professional development in classroom management and student-centered learning ( $f=5$ ).

Supervisors also cited undesired outcomes of teachers' poor communication skills, including an inability to establish effective interpersonal relations with parents and students ( $f=7$ ) and an inability to help students in their school adaptation process ( $f=6$ ). Moreover, supervisors noted that teachers lack skills needed for effective values education to foster social inclusion within school communities ( $f=6$ ).

By some respondents, reported skill deficiencies among teachers were associated with a lack of adequate in-service training support ( $f=4$ ) as well as a lack of teacher interest in professional and self-development ( $f=4$ ). Unfortunately, given the high teacher mobility in these schools, conditions in which experienced teachers could mentor newcomers were absent, and teachers were considered unlikely to develop a culture of sharing and discussing instructional or educational issues.

#### Theme 10

##### *Teaching conditions*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Overcrowding	40
Heterogeneous groups	34
Large achievement gaps	34
Difficulty to implement formal curriculum schedule	20
Diversity in student demographics	18
Teacher transfers to other schools	13
Overcrowding diminished individual student attention	9
Teacher adaptation problems to new districts	6
Increased teacher workloads	5
Low student achievement decreases school quality	5
Low student achievement decreases teacher productivity, job satisfaction, motivation,	5
Anxiety to be perceived a low-performing teacher	5
Teacher burnout, fatigue	5

Participants stressed large class sizes ( $f=40$ ) and heterogeneous student groups ( $f=34$ ) as two main factors that make teaching challenging in these schools. Additionally, some of them mentioned about the physical condition and facilities of schools that they consider to have effect on teaching processes negatively ( $f=7$ ).

The classroom overcrowding was highlighted as the source of several difficulties faced by teachers ( $f=40$ ). Specific mention was made of the fact that the amount of individual attention teachers could provide to students diminished in line with increases in class size ( $f=9$ ). Other challenges reportedly faced by teachers in relation to overcrowded classrooms had to do with classroom management, especially for lower secondary teachers ( $f=6$ ), whose students could be expected to be comprised of early adolescents; increased teacher workloads ( $f=5$ ); difficulties in familiarizing themselves with new students ( $f=2$ ); inability to motivate students ( $f=2$ ); and disruption of education ( $f=1$ ).

Supervisors reported many challenges with teaching heterogeneous student groups. Majority of the cited difficulties, however, was related to additional workload brought about by planning and implementing lessons for classrooms of mixed-ability students with large achievement gaps ( $f=34$ ). Although teachers reportedly made a special effort to determine students' knowledge levels and ensure that migrant and non-migrant students received similar attention, ultimately, they faced difficulties implementing the formal curriculum in line with the academic schedule due to differences in the levels of academic performance among students ( $f=20$ ).

There were supervisors who thought that the low achievement profile of students decreased the quality of schooling ( $f=5$ ) and weakened teacher productivity ( $f=5$ ). As explained above, though many participants mentioned about the great efforts exerted by teachers to address the academic needs of migrant students in these schools, there were some respondents who argued that teachers tended to be reluctant to teach children with inadequate educational backgrounds, not only because of the extra work involved, but also due to anxiety over being perceived as a low-performing teacher ( $f=5$ ).

Regarding the student composition, the increasing diversity in student demographics was identified as a challenge for teachers ( $f=18$ ). Such finding supports other research in relation to the challenge of overcrowding classrooms. For instance, Akbaba-Altun's (2009) findings on school context also correlate with those of the present study. Classrooms were described as overcrowded, and schools were said to lack adequate resources, possess no space for social activities and to have discipline problems and an overall poor quality of education, which was attributed to teachers' monotonous, unidirectional instructional delivery and a related lack of interest towards learning and education among students. Similarly, the present study found that teachers paid little attention to students' individual needs, as they struggled to fully implement a centralized school curriculum poorly designed to cope with differences in learning among students. Here, it should be highlighted that a policy of "equality for all" does not entail providing "identical educational services" to all students, regardless of the needs of individual students and the varying contextual settings of individual schools (Villegas and Lucas, 2002). In this regard, teacher development at both pre-service and in-service levels need to ensure that educators are equipped to meet the needs of diverse student populations through alternative instructional methods.

### **Teacher Adaptation Challenges to School Environment**

Teachers were reported to experience difficulties in adapting to the districts in which they were employed ( $f=6$ ). These difficulties were attributed to teachers' non-familiarity with the local socio-cultural context ( $f=1$ ), to parent composition of the student population ( $f=1$ ) and to a lack of psychological preparedness to work under the conditions facing these schools ( $f=1$ ).

### **Schools in areas sending high numbers of migrants**

Theme 11

#### *Profile of teaching staff and employment practices*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Teacher shortages	12
Hiring non-tenured, low-paid, novice teachers	12
High teacher turnover rates	10
High turn-over affects school quality	8
Composition of inexperienced staff	6
Unavailability of counseling services	3

Supervisors stated similar concerns regarding teaching staff profile and hiring practices in schools located in areas of out-migration to those expressed for schools located in areas of in-

migration. As reported by participants, there is an urgent need to revamp teacher recruitment policies in these schools due to experienced teacher shortages ( $f=12$ ), high teacher turnover rates ( $f=10$ ) and the unavailability of counseling services ( $f=3$ ). The hiring of lower-paid, novice, non-tenured teachers were also reported to be common in these schools ( $f=12$ ) and said to impact on the quality of teacher profiles ( $f=8$ ). These were due to *as* a supervisor indicated, lack of commitment observed by substitute teachers to the teaching profession and the schools, in line with the poor conditions of service characterized by low numeration and lack of job security and perceived low professional status relative to tenured teachers. This situation was said to result in a staff composed of inexperienced ( $f=6$ ) and less proficient and less skilled ( $f=2$ ) teachers.

#### Theme 12

##### *Teacher competencies and professional development*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Ineffective instructional competency in multi-grade schools	9
Lack of professional development offerings	7
Lack of interest for professional development in multi-grade schools	6
Supervisors negative self-evaluations of supervision skills needed	6

Teachers assigned to multi-grade schools were reported to have difficulty in providing effective instruction in this kind of setting ( $f=9$ ). The poor teacher performance was to some extent attributed to a lack of knowledge and skills needed to teach in a multi-grade setting. a lack of sufficient interest for self-development and professional-development on the part of teachers ( $f=6$ ) alongside the non-availability of professional development offerings ( $f=7$ ) was considered as an impediment to compensate for skill and knowledge deficits of these teachers. As reported, supervisors were themselves unable to provide adequate professional guidance and ensure that educational delivery was provided at the expected levels in schools located in outlying rural areas. ( $f=6$ ). Thus, there is a deficiency in how teachers are getting prepared for teaching for diverse classroom environments is a consideration to be undertaken by teacher education programs.

#### Theme 13

##### *Teaching conditions*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Stress inducing factors among teachers	16
Fear of interruption in education program	2
Fear of loss of high achieving students	6
Lack of family teacher cooperation	4
Stress due to continuous outflow of students	3
Fear of school closures	3

Many supervisors indicated that teachers in these schools work under stressful conditions. Among stress-inducing factors identified ( $f=16$ ) were the continuous outflow of students ( $f=3$ ); concerns about possible interruptions to the education program due to the institution of multi-grade classrooms or transfers of students to other schools ( $f=2$ ); inadequate infrastructure, equipment and teaching materials ( $f=3$ ); and, due to the undersized student population, inadequate resources for any expansion in service provision ( $f=1$ ). Academic underachievement was also identified as a concern for teachers. One important dimension of this concern was reported *as* the tendency for higher achieving students to transfer out prior to graduation, given the positive effects that the performance of high-achievers have on the rest of the student population, ( $f=6$ ).

The family background of students was cited as another cause of concern for teachers ( $f=4$ ). The fact that students are generally from a low socioeconomic level, and are from families

with many children, existence of students who suffer from malnutrition, In this regard, existence of child labour, Need for education and training of parents undermines the student learning. While the problem of high teacher turnover rates was reported for these schools, it was also reported, conversely, that some teachers were subjected to anxiety regarding possible job loss as a result of potential school closure ( $f=3$ ) and the subsequent possibility of having to compete with many other surplus teachers to obtain a new appointment. One supervisor also argued:

Teachers in these schools are unable to relate to parents of students and lack the professional competency needed to provide for the educational needs of parents, many of whom are heads of large families that include children affected by malnutrition and child labor

Although family development and training is rare, one notable example is the School Milk Application Policy, a joint project by the MNE and the Ministry of Food and Agriculture. Implemented in July 2013 through a policy decision (Number 2013/5171, published in the Official Gazette, July 18, 2013, Number 11790), the program aims to promote the acquisition of healthy life skills among school children and contribute to their healthy development.

Stress due to difficult working conditions combined with a lack of professional competence were reported to have a negative impact on beginning teachers' perceptions regarding the profession itself ( $f=1$ ). Teachers are tended to change workplaces ( $f=11$ ) and exhibit low motivation ( $f=9$ ), low morale ( $f=5$ ), low job satisfaction ( $f=2$ ) and burnout and fatigue ( $f=1$ ).

#### Theme 14

##### *Adaptation to rural conditions of school locations*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Challenges of adapting to rural environments	22
Differences in socio-cultural norms and practices	7
Accommodation, transportation, nutrition problems	7

According to supervisors, teachers faced challenges in adapting to the rural areas to which they had been assigned ( $f=22$ ) due to differences in socio-cultural norms and practices ( $f=7$ ), limited opportunities for social interaction ( $f=2$ ), and a lack of language skills needed to communicate with local residents, which in turn resulted in a feeling of isolation ( $f=1$ ). Additionally, accommodation, transportation and nutrition problems ( $f=7$ ) were identified as factors behind teachers' difficulties in adapting to the region. With regard to accommodation, teachers reportedly chose to live in nearby towns, out of personal preferences, or because of limited housing opportunities in villages ( $f=1$ ).

### **Challenges Experienced-by and Posed-by Students**

#### **Schools in areas receiving high numbers of migrants**

#### Theme 15

##### *Student discipline and behavior management*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Varying degrees of classroom management problems	73
Physical violence and abusive language use	18
Vandalism	11
Lack of harmonious relationships among students, lack of love, respect, and tolerance	9
Student tardiness (absenteeism)	8
Bullying	8
Undesirable gang activities	4

Conflicts based on neighborhood student cliques	4
Aggression	4

Student discipline and behavior problems of varying degrees of severity were widely reported to be a source of challenge ( $f=73$ ). Among the offences listed were physical violence and use of abusive language ( $f=18$ ); vandalism ( $f=11$ ); lack of harmonious relationships resting on mutual love, respect and tolerance among students ( $f=9$ ); bullying ( $f=8$ ); undesirable gang activities ( $f=4$ ); conflicts arising from neighborhood-based student cliques ( $f=4$ ); aggression ( $f=4$ ); disruptive behavior in class ( $f=3$ ); defiance towards the teacher ( $f=2$ ); bringing dangerous objects (e.g., straight razors, knives) to school ( $f=2$ ); and theft ( $f=2$ ). One supervisor noted that severe disciplinary problems were more apparent in upper grades. Difficulties preventing student absenteeism in these schools was also reported ( $f=8$ ) as an important issue to be addressed, with absent students assumed to be working to financially support their families is an issue that raises the idea that the tracking of compulsory education and students' participation policy is malfunctioning.

#### Theme 16

##### *Teacher and school factors. / Condition of school facilities and resources*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Large school sizes	10
Teacher shortages and high teacher turnover	6
Insufficient social support, affection, and supervision	6
Failure for healthy teacher student interactions	5
Multi-age classrooms resulting from late student enrollment	3

According to supervisors, large school size and overcrowded classrooms ( $f=10$ ); teacher shortages and high teacher turnover ( $f=6$ ); failure to build healthy relations between teachers and students ( $f=5$ ); insufficient social support and supervision from schools and teachers' failure to provide adequate individual attention and affection to students ( $f=6$ ); authoritarian teaching style ( $f=2$ ); students' awareness of the low requirements needed to obtain a passing grade ( $f=1$ ), and, conversely, teachers' tendency to use grades as a tool to control student behavior ( $f=1$ ); and school rules that are ineffective in deterring student misconduct ( $f=1$ ) are associated with observed behavioral problems in these schools. Other issues thought to impact on students' emotional and academic well-being included multi-age classrooms resulting from late student enrollment ( $f=3$ ). In addition, in central rural schools, the limited teacher-student interaction time due to bussing was thought to hinder the development of more productive teacher-student relations that might help to deter student misconduct.

#### Theme 17

##### *Student factors*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Students lack of prerequisite knowledge	44
Middle schools students lack basic reading writing competencies	9
Low motivation and lack of interest in schooling, or further education	11
Student misconduct associated with poor social skills such as language skills, conflict-resolution and empathic skills	6
Little faith in education and its attributes to future	4
Education quality limits ability to benefit from further schooling	3
Migrant students need to struggle more to catch up with their peers	2
Identity confusion	2

Observed behavioral and disciplinary problems among students were attributed to various causes related to underachievement, such as students' lack of prerequisite knowledge and skills for their grade levels ( $f=44$ ) and, in the case of middle-school students, a lack of basic reading and writing competencies ( $f=9$ ) that limited their ability to benefit from further education ( $f=5$ ) and required migrant children to expend more effort to catch up with their peers ( $f=2$ ). In addition to grade-level readiness, low motivation ( $f=6$ ) and lack of interest in schooling ( $f=3$ ), presumed to stem from lack of future educational aspirations ( $f=2$ ), and lack of school bonding ( $f=1$ ). Students were assumed to possess negative ideas about the importance of education and low expectations as to how it could contribute to their future ( $f=4$ ). Student misconduct was also associated with poor social skills such as communication, conflict-resolution and empathic skills ( $f=6$ ) and to be experiencing identity confusion ( $f=2$ ).

#### Theme 18

##### *Adaptation to the poor/ suburban conditions of school locations for teachers*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Challenges to adapt to the school and its neighborhood	35
Migrant adaptation is not facilitated through behavior of non-migrant students	15
Poor adaptation may result in introversion, shyness, anxiety, inferiority complexes, lack of interest in school activities, and difficulty in peer relations	12
Adaptation problems may results in behavioral issues	11

Supervisors noted with concern the difficulties students have in adapting to the school and neighborhood social environment ( $f=35$ ). Adaptation problems were attributed to various factors, including socio-cultural and geographical differences between migrant students' original and new environments; previous life experiences, behaviors and routines and the tendency to maintain them; and poor social and communication skills. Supervisors also pointed out that migrant students' adaptation was not facilitated by the behavior of non-migrant students, who had difficulty accepting the new students into their peer groups ( $f=15$ ).

Adaptation problems were reported to have resulted in behavioral issues ( $f=11$ ) including introversion, shyness, anxiety, inferiority complexes, lack of interest in school activities and difficulties in establishing peer relations ( $f=12$ ).

#### Theme 19

##### *Household characteristics*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Socio-economic deprivation of households	10
Inadequate language competency in the official language	5
Student obliged to work outside of school to help family financially	5
Students malnourished	4
Student poverty, and low household standards affect school performance negatively	4
Students poorly dressed	3

Supervisors reported on socio-economic deprivation of households ( $f=10$ ) impact on students' emotional and academic well-being. As a result of socio-economic deprivation, students were said to be malnourished ( $f=4$ ), poorly dressed ( $f=3$ ), and obliged to work outside of school to help contribute to their family incomes ( $f=5$ ). Supervisors also stated their belief that poverty was negatively impacting the school performance of these students ( $f=4$ ). Participants also stated their belief that household living standards was negatively impacting the school performance of these students ( $f=4$ ). Students were also said to have unhappy home lives ( $f=4$ ) and to have no quiet place at home where they could concentrate on studying ( $f=1$ ). Inadequate language

competency in the official language was also reported ( $f=5$ ) and was suggested as a source of communication problems between students and their peers.

Özbaş and Badavan (2009) showed that developing partnerships with families, who have often been neglected, may support the successful implementation of training activities that will not only improve parents' perceptions regarding the value of education, but will also help contribute to behavioral changes among parents and thus healthier lifestyles for their children. Nevertheless, supervisors' observations match with that of research in which the author found that the migrant children were reluctant to approach and communicate with their teachers about their cognitive or social problems Altinyelken (2009a, 2009b). Such finding may be related to teachers' unpreparedness in dealing with multicultural issues or they hold low efficacy beliefs about migrant children (Akar, 2010). Attitude toward the adaptation and socialization process of migrant children is connected with students' urban-rural settlements, and in countries like in China it was found that student shyness, tended to be associated with social and school difficulties in the urban group, and those children were likely to be rejected by peers and perceived as incompetent by teachers and to perform poorly in academic areas (Chen, Wang, & Wang, 2009). We suggest further research to shed light on if the perceived incompetency of migrant student populations is related to shyness or other variables such as the language spoken at home.

Studies with international migrant students such as that of Hamilton's study (2013) support the current study with internal migrants. Findings reveal how children, when entering a new school setting, identified their main anxieties as establishing positive peer and teacher relations and also falling academically back because of their poor language skills (Akar, 2010; Akbaba-Altun, 2009). Whilst focusing on developing the children's command of Turkish language skills properly is crucial to access the official curriculum, it is also equally as important to attend to their socio-emotional well-being, in order to create an optimal state for learning (Hamilton, 2013).

In the current study, poor language skills of parents and children were revealed by the supervisors as obstacles for achievement and socio-emotional well-being. Further research seems to be essential in exploring if the families of migrant students in those school hold different language backgrounds, and if they do so, how families undertake family language planning issues if they do not speak the formal language. Family language planning is a complex phenomena and involves multiple home and school-dominated, political, and socioeconomic forces (Leung & Uchikoshi, 2012).

The findings of the present study emphasize that parental training can have an important effect on the education of children who attend schools in migrant districts, especially for parents who little or no academic educational backgrounds. In that sense, both for the well-being of students and engaging migrant parents in the schooling of their children, we call for including more well-trained school counselors as research indicates that they play a vital role in the improvement of adaptation to new school contexts and in the implementation of a more inclusive and equitable education system as research indicates that migrant students showed less cultural bias and higher levels of intercultural competence compared to that of teachers (Lanfranchi, 2014).

### **Schools in areas sending high numbers of migrants**

Theme 20

*Social and emotional conditions of learning*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Shrinking student body has a negative impact on classroom dynamics	22
Students developed emotional challenges	9
Students find little opportunity to develop social skills	6
Lack of motivation and interest in schooling	5

Lack of constructive motivation for achievement	3
Possibility of school closure causes anxiety	3
Lack of school attachment/bonding	3
Sense of abandonment	2

The shrinking student body was believed to have a negative impact on classroom dynamics that resulted in limited opportunities for peer learning, discussion and social interactions ( $f=22$ ). Thus, students had little opportunity to develop social skills ( $f=6$ ), and there was a lack of constructive competition to motivate them ( $f=3$ ).

According to supervisors, as a result of being left behind by friends, students faced emotional challenges ( $f=9$ ) and developed a sense of abandonment ( $f=2$ ). Moreover, the possibility of school closure and transferring to another school was thought to cause anxiety ( $f=3$ ) and a fear of underachievement ( $f=1$ ). Students also showed little motivation ( $f=2$ ) or interest in their schooling ( $f=3$ ), which was thought to prevent them from developing any sense of attachment towards their current schools ( $f=3$ ).

#### Theme 21

##### *School attendance*

<b>Codes</b>	<b><i>f</i></b>
Chronic absenteeism of children contributing to households	13
Students' lack of interest towards schooling as part of work life	2

Seasonal migration and the need for children to contribute to their households were reported to reveal themselves in chronic absenteeism, with fairly large numbers of students not attending for a significant portion of the academic year ( $f=13$ ). Supervisors seemed to consider students' lack of interest towards school ( $f=2$ ) as related to their efforts to prepare for working life, which students seemed eager to enter upon completion of compulsory education.

Similarly, research conducted with BETAM (Gürsel et al., 2009), a research center on economics and social issues at Bahçeşehir University, gathered data that literally provided evidence that there is a big schooling levels gap in communities whose first language is Kurdish compared to the ones whose first language is Turkish in favor of the latter. This trend is also observed in the rural-urban comparison as well as between genders. In both cases males are higher educated than females are. On the other hand, there is also research that shows that females are better schooled when the migration trend is to developed cities, where the boys become breadwinners, and girls go to school (Smits & Hoşgör, 2006). The focus in our study did not include delving into the issue of the linguistic backgrounds and profiles of students in the schools that were located in migrant neighborhoods per se, but rather we highlighted the relation between internal migration and poverty as a reason for being disadvantaged. Therefore, we recommend further research to shed light on the magnitude of mother tongue difference and student academic outputs.

### **Challenges Experienced and Posed-by Parents**

In this section we use the total count of codes under the given theme to highlight the magnitude of the themes that emerged.

#### **Schools in areas receiving high numbers of migrants.**

#### Theme 22

##### *Challenges experienced and posed by parents*

<b>Codes</b>	<b><i>f</i></b>
Socio-economic conditions	42
Interest in children's education	22
Attitude towards schooling	19

Parent-school relations	17
Perceptions of parents on the quality of education	12
Student transfers and registration	11

---

Low socio-economic conditions of parents ( $f=42$ ) were related to unemployment and economic hardship; unable to allocate sufficient funds for their children's developmental, social and educational needs; difficulties providing for children's needs in terms of school supplies, travel to and from school and pocket money creates additional stress on parents. Parents' lack of interest in their children's education and development was seen as a significant challenge ( $f=22$ ). This indifference was attributed to the above-mentioned unemployment, household poverty and adaptation problems as well as to parents' low levels of education and large family size.

Many supervisors suggested that migrant parents had negative social and cultural perceptions about formal education ( $f=19$ ). With regard to the benefits of education, supervisors believed that parents had low expectations as to how education could contribute positively to their children's lives ( $f=5$ ), remained distanced from school ( $f=3$ ), and a wider social issue, they were reluctant to send their daughters to school ( $f=1$ ).

Supervisors also reported concerns about educational quality to be an issue among parents of non-immigrant students ( $f=12$ ), some of whom were said to believe that the rapid expansion of enrollment and the presence of immigrants negatively affected the quality of education. Although not solely associated with parents, the lack of effective communication and cooperation between families and schools and the lack of a strong bond between the school and the community was mentioned as a challenge by numerous supervisors ( $f=17$ ). Specific barriers reported to healthy relations between schools and parents and the larger community included the low cultural and educational capital of families in the neighborhood in which the schools were located, low family income, parental indifference and security issues.

**Student transfers and registration.** Enrolling children in school and transferring them between schools was said to create difficulties for migrant parents ( $f=11$ ). Problems associated with student placement were partly explained by swollen enrollments in schools within the catchment area. Besides, parents employed as seasonal migrant labor was mentioned encountering difficulties when attempting to register children at schools in the areas where they are employed in the midst of the academic year/migration season ( $f=1$ ).

### **Schools in areas sending high numbers of migrants**

**Interest in children's education.** Supervisors expressed concern about the lack of parental interest in schools and in their children's learning and development ( $f=16$ ). Parents were reported to have negative perceptions about the quality of education provided in aborted schools ( $f=12$ ), partly due to a reduced level of trust brought about by factors such as poor school physical infrastructure and inadequate staffing, underachievement of students transferring to or graduating from these schools at upper grades or at another school. In addition, parents were said to believe that official interest and investment in these schools had decreased due to the continuous outflow of students. Given the concerns over quality, more interested parents reportedly tended to move to better-off neighborhoods in order to register their children in better schools. Consequently, given schools are abandoned, the officials seem to pay less attention to the needs of those schools, and prioritize urban schools more.

**Parent-school relations.** Problems at these resource-poor schools were said to be exacerbated due to lower than expected levels of parental support and contribution to schools as a result of the small student population ( $f=6$ ). Establishing and maintaining effective school-parent associations and securing assistance and support to meet school needs were said to be challenging. Poor communication among parents themselves and between parents and teachers was also cited as a disadvantage, with teachers' lack of knowledge of the language spoken by parents mentioned as an impediment to effective communication. According to supervisors,

parents worried that schools would be closed due to an insufficient number of students ( $f=9$ ), and were, as a result, concerned about untimely transfers of students during the academic year and the safety of transportation and school nutrition services. Akbaba-Altun (2009) similarly found that lack of parental interest was the most significant factor in student underachievement. Children's home environments were found to be unstable, and, given that parents were shown to possess little or no education themselves and little regard for the importance of education *per se*, it is unsurprising that they were found to pay little attention to their children's educational development.

## Curriculum Implementation and outcomes

### Schools in areas receiving high numbers of migrants

Theme 23

*Challenges of curriculum delivery*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Lack of prerequisite knowledge, and effective and timely implementation of the program	49
Inability to adapt the national curriculum to local realities	18
Overcrowding of classrooms and lack of resources	13
Incoming students come from multi-grade classrooms with limited readiness	12
Curriculum designed for homogeneous student populations	11
Remedial hours during regular school hours hinders curriculum implementation	5

Supervisors reported effective and timely implementation of the educational program to be a challenge for these schools. This was widely attributed to students' lack of prerequisite knowledge and skills expected for their grade levels ( $f=49$ ). The lack of cognitive and affective readiness of incoming students was associated with the poor implementation of educational programs in multi-grade classes in the rural schools that most of these students had previously attended ( $f=12$ ). The need to conduct remedial activities during regular school hours was also thought to hinder progression through the curriculum ( $f=5$ ). On the other hand, it was noted that despite the existence of after-school literacy and math classes offered by central schools receiving bussed-in migrant students, these facilities and services were considered unsatisfactory ( $f=4$ ), and the level of student participation much lower than expected ( $f=1$ ).

The realization of program goals was also reported to be hindered by overcrowded classrooms and lack of resources ( $f=13$ ). Additionally, the implementation of the curriculum in the classroom context, according to some participants, is inhibited by excessive emphasis on academic learning at the expense of personal development and further ( $f=3$ ).

Other factors reported to prevent the scheduled implementation of the mandated curriculum were related to classroom management issues, including the need to address student diversity ( $f=3$ ), lack of motivation ( $f=2$ ), poor language skills ( $f=2$ ), social adaptation problems ( $f=1$ ), deprivation ( $f=1$ ) and misbehavior ( $f=1$ ). Finally, supervisors noted that due to recent changes in MNE regulations, they are no longer responsible for evaluating teacher performance, and their diminished authority has had the effect of inhibiting their ability to ensure effective implementation of the curriculum ( $f=2$ ).

***Curriculum flexibility and relevance.*** The existing curriculum itself was considered a source of problems for schools receiving migrants, given that it was designed for schools with optimal conditions and a context of student homogeneity ( $f=11$ ). As stated by one supervisor, "These schools encounter such various and complex problems that there is a huge gap in terms of reaching the goals of the curriculum when compared with schools in affluent communities." According to another supervisor, neither students nor their parents were convinced that the

curriculum imparted knowledge with any relevance to real life. In this regard, the inability to adapt the national curriculum to local realities ( $f=18$ ) was stated as an issue requiring attention.

### Schools in areas sending high numbers of migrants

Theme 24

*Curriculum implementation and outcomes*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
High-turnover rates, multi-grade teaching, student mobility resulted in reductions in class size	46
Poor implementation of program is barrier for success in upper classes	30
Student unequipped with basic competencies, including language skills	13
Failure to adjust academic calendar to local needs (domestic labor needs)	9

According to supervisors, these schools experienced untimely and ineffective implementation of the curriculum due to teacher shortages, high teacher turnover rates, multi-grade teaching and high rates of student mobility that resulted in reductions in class size ( $f=46$ ). As a result of poor implementation of the educational program, students were unequipped with basic competencies, including basic language skills ( $f=13$ ), which had an effect on their success in upper grades ( $f=30$ ). Some supervisors also pointed out that low numbers of students made it impossible to effectively organize social and cultural activities, including national-day ceremonies ( $f=2$ ). In this regard, the failure to adjust the school curriculum and calendar to local realities was also stressed ( $f=9$ ).

### Recommendations Related to the Education System

An analysis of the survey data yielded various possibilities for addressing issues confronting schools affected by internal migration. The section below presents recommendations related to actions that could be implemented at the local and central levels of the school administration system. It is followed by a discussion of possible interventions focusing on economic and social issues related to internal migration at the macro level.

**Administrative Approaches and Practices.** Given cross-cutting nature of migration related challenges that the education system in Turkey faces, supervisors stressed the importance of devising and adopting an integrated and multiscale (system-level) strategy to deal effectively with them. Accordingly, they indicated that priority should be given to ensuring collaboration and coordination among central units of the Ministry, EDs and individual schools ( $f=27$ ) to support the development and implementation of such a strategy. In the process, securing stakeholder participation and commitment ( $f=15$ ) and raising public awareness about issues related to internal migration and education ( $f=13$ ) were deemed necessary

At the local level, supervisors drew attention to the need to ensure administrative support and attention from EDs to schools overwhelmed by migration-induced challenges. According to participants, through conducting regular visits to local schools ( $f=18$ ), senior level officials of EDs could offer encouragement and moral support to educational staff. As reported by supervisors, such visits, considered a promising way for EDs to maintain contact and communication with school personnel, would also provide opportunities for direct observation and evaluation of school-based issues in context ( $f=6$ ). Additionally, for EDs to reinforce efforts to improve education delivery at the school level ( $f=12$ ) was also deemed essential. In this regard, participants suggested providing financial and professional support to school-level initiatives, including research-based project proposals ( $f=4$ ), and recognizing efforts and accomplishments ( $f=1$ ).

## Theme 25

*Administrative approaches and practices*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Ensure collaboration and coordination among central units of the Ministry, EDs and individual schools to devise and implement an integrated and multiscale strategy (MNE)	27
Arrange regular on-site visits to schools to offer encouragement and moral support to the educational staff and to be in touch with the realities of schools (EDs)	18
Adopt inclusive, participatory, and collaborative approach to school management	18
Secure stakeholder participation and commitment (MNE)	15
Raise public awareness about issues related to internal migration and education (MNE)	13
Reinforce efforts to improve education delivery through supporting school-level initiatives and recognizing efforts and accomplishments (EDs)	12

*Note:* In parentheses stakeholder(s) to which a recommendation is directed are added.

At the school level, adopting inclusive, participatory, and collaborative approach to school management was deemed necessary for dealing effectively with migration-related educational challenges ( $f=18$ ). More specifically, this was understood to require the institution of a democratic administration ( $f=8$ ) and effective communication among principals, teachers and parents ( $f=2$ ); Additionally such an approach involves seeking professional support from outside organizations including universities, NGOs and experts ( $f=4$ ); taking into account suggestions for improvement made by teachers, students and supervisors ( $f=3$ ); facilitating a common understanding of educational needs and challenges and developing joint action ( $f=1$ ) and lastly, working in partnership with teachers' unions to foster teacher ownership of school development initiatives ( $f=1$ ).

**Staffing Policies and Practices.** According to supervisors, improving school staff compositions in disadvantaged areas requires the following recruitment, selection and retention strategies: In selecting applicants for pre-service training, giving priority to those who are familiar with conditions in disadvantaged areas and are willing to work in specified provinces ( $f=5$ ), selecting teachers and school administrators from among the most highly-qualified and experienced candidates ( $f=9$ ); attracting and retaining highly qualified teachers by offering incentives such as improved working conditions, differential salaries and housing options in rural and remote areas ( $f=17$ ); awarding tenure to qualified teachers ( $f=3$ ); ensuring fairness and ethical conduct in teacher employment processes ( $f=6$ ); and introducing mandatory workplace rotation for teachers ( $f=1$ ). It was also stated that ensuring effective implementation of existing staffing norms practice would contribute to resolve teacher shortages and the employment of qualified teachers in schools serving disadvantaged communities( $f=1$ ). Besides, according a supervisor, revitalizing the MNE's established teacher career system could create incentives for effective teaching and promote the professional development of educational staff. Participants also stressed that the MNE, EDs and SPAs should make greater effort to ensure that the appointment of administrators at all levels of the education system, including school principals, is based on merit, not on political favoritism ( $f=12$ ).In addition,, it was suggested that improvements in staffing MNE units could be achieved by replacing personnel whose educational qualifications were unsuited to the requirements of their positions ( $f=1$ ).Also noted was the need for EDs to ensure that permanent staffing is made a priority at schools with high teacher turnover, a growing trend, which, it was feared, might become officially sanctioned ( $f=3$ ).

## Theme 26

*Staffing policies and practices*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Attract and retain highly-qualified teachers through incentives (such as housing)	17
Ensure appointment of administrators at all levels of the education system based on merit	12
Select teachers/school administrators from among highly-qualified and experienced candidates	9
Ensure fairness and ethical behavior in teacher employment processes	6
Select applicants for initial teacher training from among those who are familiar with conditions in disadvantaged areas and are willing to work in specified locations.	5
Require competency in teaching for awarding tenure	3
Cease the practice of hiring teachers on temporary contracts (EDs)	3
Ensure effective implementation of staffing norms practice and career ladder program	2
Introduce workplace rotation for teachers	1

**Training Policies and Practices**

According to respondents, to enhance professional skills of the MNE teaching staff, in the long term, there is necessity to improve the practicality of initial training programs ( $f=5$ ). In this regard, the need for programs to provide experiences for teacher candidates to become familiar with the realities in the public schools and the challenges confronting public education was stressed. Additionally, selecting schools in squatter settlements and rural areas for student internship placements was proposed. With regard to in-service training, participants highlighted the need to enhance the role of supervisors in providing professional guidance and on-the-job training to school staff ( $f=37$ ) as well as the need to improve the quality and quantity of in-service training programs ( $f=15$ ). Additionally, participants recommended the MNE and EDs to offer targeted in-service training for school principals, teachers and supervisors to enable them to cope with challenges brought upon by internal migration ( $f=11$ ).

## Theme 27

*Training policies and practices*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Ensure supervisors play a more influential role in providing professional guidance and on the job training for school staff	37
Improve the quality and quantity of in-service training programs	15
Provide targeted in-service training for school principals, teachers and supervisors who work with immigrant students	11
Improve practicality of in-service training programs	5

**School facilities and resources.** Supervisors mentioned the importance of providing schools with sufficient instructional materials and equipment, the current lack of which was considered a serious impediment to the teaching and learning process ( $f=16$ ). In this regard, it was noted that by conducting inventories of schools that had been closed, equipment and materials could be identified and transferred to schools in need ( $f=1$ ). Supervisors also suggested that, given the pressures on the public budget, schools seek financial contributions from local governments ( $f=12$ ) and civil society organizations ( $f=17$ ) to meet their resource needs. Increased government support to eliminate financial constraints facing these educational institutions was also noted ( $f=7$ ). As for staff shortages, it was regarded as crucial that the MNE assigns teachers, counselors and staff to fill vacancies ( $f=14$ ) in schools.

The necessity of constructing new schools and expanding or upgrading existing facilities was widely acknowledged by participants ( $f=45$ ) to put an end to double-shift schooling and bring class sizes down to reasonable levels in schools struggling to accommodate additional capacity needs. According to participants, the construction of new schools could be funded through contributions collected in fundraising campaigns organized by NGOs and through the proceeds of sales of abandoned village school buildings; alternatively, empty buildings owned by local governments could be converted for use as schools ( $f=5$ ).

#### Theme 28

##### *School facilities and resources*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Resolve capacity problems to cease the practices of multi-grade teaching and split-day schedule and to reduce overcrowding in schools. (MNE)	45
Civil society organizations to meet resource needs of schools (School administrations)	17
Improve instructional materials and equipment in schools (MNE, EDs)	16
Assign teaching and non-teaching staff to vacancies in schools (MNE, EDs)	14
Seek financial contributions from local government	12
Provide the necessary government support to eliminate financial constraints for schools (MNE)	7
To create additional school capacity, consider the use of former government buildings and alternative sources of funding (MNE, EDs, local governments)	5

Also mentioned was the need to increase physical capacity in rural areas to put an end to the practice of multi-grade teaching, which has raised quality and efficiency concerns ( $f=7$ ). Given the budgetary implications of such an effort, gradual extension of the program of boarding schools and centralized rural schools was proposed. Reducing the number of multi-grade classrooms was considered a goal that the MNE could work towards and which could be accomplished in part by bussing out students above Grade 5 ( $f=1$ ), making sure that schools to which students transferred have the adequate capacity ( $f=1$ ).

**Planning for school infrastructure and resource allocation.** As reported in several parts of the result section, internal migration flows have negatively affected disadvantaged students' access to equal educational opportunities. To redress this situation, respondents also emphasized the need to improve system-wide and institutional planning processes. More specifically, supervisors expressed the importance of effective planning by the MNE to improve service provision ( $f=8$ ) and secure equal access to quality education on a regular, uninterrupted basis ( $f=7$ ). Also emphasized was the need for EDs to take timely and effective decisions regarding investments, personnel assignments and the equitable allocation of resources among schools ( $f=20$ ). Besides, it was expected that the MNE, EDs and local governments take into consideration trends in internal migration and the population structure in determining school construction and distribution policies ( $f=23$ ). Furthermore, participants proposed that schools faced with migration-based challenges receive favorable treatment in terms of resource allocation ( $f=11$ ), with provincial and district-level resources directed to disadvantaged schools over the short term ( $f=5$ ).

## Theme 29

*Planning for school infrastructure and resource allocation*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
In determining school construction and distribution policies, take into consideration trends in internal migration and the population structure (MNE, EDs, local governments)	23
Take timely and effective decisions regarding investments, personnel assignments and the equitable allocation of resources among schools (EDs)	20
Improve school level planning and resource management through undertaking needs analysis and exploring practices to improve efficiency in resource utilization	16
Ensure effective system-wide planning to improve service provision and secure access to quality education on a regular, uninterrupted basis (MNE)	15
Refine school assignment plans and the scope of transportation services in rural areas	14
Accord favorable treatment to schools faced with migration-based challenges in terms of resource allocation (MNE, EDs and local governments)	11

To complement these efforts, at the school level, the need to improve planning and resource management was emphasized by respondents ( $f=16$ ). Accordingly, school level planning was suggested to be based on a realistic assessment of needs regarding facilities, equipment and other resources ( $f=9$ ) and make explicit the situation in the school in terms of current enrollments, existing capacity and shifting students in and out of the school ( $f=4$ ). As reported by participants, through increased access to school-level information, upper level management could direct its efforts to enhance equity in the distribution of resources and facilities more efficiently ( $f=3$ ). It was also recommended that a needs analysis be conducted at the school level in order to identify the current status of schools so that those school requiring specific resources could apply to and be supplied by the relevant institution ( $f=9$ ). The planning process should make explicit school physical capacity, student numbers and continuity ( $f=4$ ) to ensure that financial, human and material resources are utilized as effectively as possible ( $f=3$ ).

For the central rural schools that offer education to students from neighboring villages, respondents perceived a need for the MNE to refine school assignment plans and the scope of transportation services ( $f=14$ ), ensuring provision of safe transportation services as well as extracurricular social and cultural activities for rural students attending these schools ( $f=3$ ). Supervisors also stated that when planning the distribution of bussed-in students, their basic physiological needs, i.e. sleeping and meal times ( $f=3$ ), must be take into consideration.

**School Adaptation and Academic Achievement.** According to participants, student support programs and services are needed to be considered as an option to facilitate adaptation and academic achievement of migrant students. In this regard, organization of orientation ( $f=11$ ) and remedial education programs, including social skills development ( $f=7$ ) was recommended at the school level, with, in the words of one participant, “the active participation of the school administration.” It was also suggested that EDs provide preparatory and remedial classes for schools receiving migrant students ( $f=1$ ) and implement a monitoring system to facilitate the early integration of students into the local education system, with schools required to provide mandatory progress reports on a regular basis ( $f=3$ ). At the central level, it was recommended that the MNE offer student adaptation services to all schools subjected to migrant student flows ( $f=3$ ) and to establish separate classrooms for children undergoing adaptation ( $f=1$ ).

Respondents also underlined the importance of social activities to promote integration of migrant students in schools. In this regard, more emphasis on conducting social activities at the local school level ( $f=7$ ) and encouraging student participation in these activities were recommended ( $f=8$ ). In addition, it was suggested that EDs could organize provincial and district-level social, cultural and sports events in order to facilitate social interaction among

students from different schools ( $f=1$ ), and local governments could sponsor organized social and cultural activities and school trips for students ( $f=2$ ).

The need for effective guidance and counseling services to be provided in schools was noted ( $f=17$ ). Specific recommendations in this regard included obtaining support from guidance and research centers of the MNE operating within districts/provinces ( $f=5$ ); ensuring collaboration between classroom teachers and school counselors ( $f=2$ ); and organizing counselor-parent meetings ( $f=1$ ). Not only was it noted that at least one guidance teacher or psychological counselor should be assigned to the school guidance centers that the MNE requires to be established at each school ( $f=8$ ), it was also pointed out that supervisors themselves need to increase their active participation in the provision of information and guidance through these counseling centers ( $f=1$ ).

### Theme 30

#### *School adaptation and academic achievement*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Give the necessary attention and support to children in their learning and development at home and at school (Parents)	56
Organize student support services and programs to facilitate adaptation and academic achievement of migrant students (MNE, EDs, schools)	26
Use social activities to promote integration of migrant students in schools (EDs, local governments and schools)	18
Ensure effective provision of guidance and counseling services (MNE, EDs, schools, guidance and research centers of the MNE)	17

A number of suggestions were also raised with regard to how parents could contribute to the academic development and successful integration of their children in school. On the one hand, supervisors stated that parents could provide financial support to schools ( $f=13$ ). More frequently, supervisors stated that parents needed to cooperate with school administration and educational staff ( $f=16$ ) and maintain regular communication with them ( $f=12$ ). This could be achieved through regular participation in parent-teacher meetings ( $f=3$ ) and more frequent visits to school to follow their children's progress ( $f=3$ ). Supervisors also suggested that parents needed to devote more time and attention to their children ( $f=11$ ), assisting migrant children in the process of adapting to their schools ( $f=6$ ) and providing opportunities for them to study at home ( $f=1$ ). Moreover, supervisors stated that parents needed to fulfill their responsibilities in ensuring the regular attendance of their children ( $f=2$ ), not withdraw them to accompany them to seasonal agricultural work ( $f=1$ ), and keep them from engaging in child labor ( $f=1$ ). It was mentioned as well that parents could also benefit from school counseling and guidance services.

**Educational Equity and Accountability.** Supervisors stated that in order to guarantee disadvantaged students had equal access to quality education, it was necessary to ensure regular supervision and monitoring of schools ( $f=12$ ). Moreover, the MNE would need to establish school standards ( $f=7$ ), and both the MNE and the SPAs would need to apply sanctions for breaches of official duty in a consistent manner ( $f=4$ ). To ensure quality education, according to some participants, school principals need to be committed to continuous improvement ( $f=2$ ) and should exercise educational leadership ( $f=3$ ). Finally, it was suggested that NGOs could contribute to school level development efforts; in this regard, it was suggested that NGO representatives attend meetings of school development teams ( $f=1$ ) and provide expert support for training activities organized at school level for teachers, students and parents.

## Theme 31

## Educational quality and accountability

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Ensure regular supervision and monitoring of schools (EDs)	12
Establish school standards (MNE)	7
Demonstrate educational leadership and commitment to continuous improvement (School administration)	5

**Curriculum Delivery.** Several strategies were mentioned for addressing challenges related to curriculum implementation, namely, allowing schools the flexibility to adjust the school calendar ( $f=9$ ) developing alternative educational programs for schools in areas affected by migration, and allowing for flexible curriculum implementation ( $f=7$ ) that suits the needs and conditions of individual school contexts ( $f=3$ ).

## Theme 32

*Curriculum Delivery*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Allow local flexibility in the school calendar	9
Introduce flexibility in curriculum implementation for schools	7
Develop alternative educational programs for schools in areas affected by migration	3

Supervisors suggested that the MNE tackle the issue of student absenteeism by enforcing existing attendance policies. Additionally, according to participants, special arrangements targeting children of migrant/seasonal agricultural workers could include the widespread implementation of mobile schooling programs and institution of a non-permanent registration status that would allow children of these workers to temporarily attend schools in the host region.

## Theme 33

*School Attendance*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Expand the scope of the implementation of mobile schooling for children of migrant/seasonal agricultural workers	3
Ensure consistent enforcement of existing attendance policies (MNE, EDs)	2
Ensure children of migrant farm workers to attend schools in their host residencies through granting them temporary registration status.	2

**School Parent and School-Community Relations.** Supervisors emphasized the need to establish close communication and cooperation with parents at the school level ( $f=18$ ). Among the specific actions proposed to promote positive parent-school relations were establishing more frequent teacher-parent meetings ( $f=1$ ), conducting home visits ( $f=1$ ) and organizing social and cultural activities for students and parents ( $f=1$ ). Besides, establishing communication via telephone, email, or other channels in order to inform parents about student progress and status ( $f=1$ ) and holding parent-teacher meetings at more convenient times for parents ( $f=1$ ) were noted as important.

Supervisors also stressed the necessity for schools to gain the support and cooperation of local communities to effectively meet learning needs of disadvantaged students ( $f=19$ ). More specifically, according to participants, improving community relations could help in terms of securing financial support for families in need ( $f=1$ ) improving educational opportunities that schools offer ( $f=1$ ) and securing inter-school cooperation for the provision of student services

( $f=1$ ). To that end, participants underlined the need for schools to ensure continuous communication with local officials involved in education, including neighborhood administrators and representatives of district-level EDs and provincial governorates ( $f=5$ ). Other suggestions included informing the community about school activities and accomplishments ( $f=2$ ) and seeking out professional support from universities, EDs and other stakeholders in terms of public relations activities ( $f=2$ ).

Parental education was considered essential for improving school-community relations as well as school-community relations. In this regard, it was suggested that training programs for families be offered at schools ( $f=12$ ) with the collaboration of various stakeholders ( $f=3$ ). According to participants, such training could help foster parental involvement in their child's education ( $f=2$ ), raise parental awareness about the importance of regular school attendance ( $f=1$ ), facilitate school adaptation of migrant students ( $f=1$ ) and even provide parents with information on family planning ( $f=1$ ).

EDs were thought to be able to play a role in raising awareness and communicating with internal migrant parents regarding their children's educational development ( $f=2$ ) and, in collaboration with other stakeholders, help parents to build a positive attitude towards schooling ( $f=2$ ). For example, EDs could develop partnerships with universities to provide training programs designed to strengthen communication among parents, teachers and students ( $f=1$ ). Participants also suggested establishing platforms through which parents and students could voice their problems, needs and expectations to the educational authorities ( $f=3$ ). In this regard, a supervisor underlined the need for strengthening the role of established student councils at school and provincial levels.

The MNE's role in enhancing educational goals through partnerships with parents was also highlighted. Success in this regard was said to require the Ministry to prioritize adult education programs ( $f=7$ ), gain the support from key religious figures and/or community leaders ( $f=1$ ) as well as provide expert support in fields including sociology, psychology, counseling and public relations etc. for trainings organized for students, parents and neighborhood residents at schools ( $f=1$ ). Additionally, a number of supervisors stressed the need for local administrations to organize and support activities addressing training and adaptation needs of migrant families ( $f=5$ ). As expressed by a supervisor, families are also expected to actively participate in the training and education provided by the MNE's adult education centers.

Supervisors also suggested that NGOs have a crucial mission with regard to raising the level of educational and cultural development among society ( $f=23$ ) and with regard to molding public opinion ( $f=5$ ). Thus, this stakeholder group is expected to support migrant parents and children experiencing problems related to cultural adaptation and in need of educational support ( $f=5$ ). The role of NGOs was envisioned to include organizing training activities for parents and children ( $f=7$ ), raising awareness about the importance of education ( $f=2$ ) and providing guidance to support students in their transition to further education or employment ( $f=1$ ).

#### Theme 34

##### *School-parent and school-community relations*

<i>Codes</i>	<i>f</i>
Raising the level of educational and cultural development among society	23
Ensure the support and cooperation of local communities to effectively meet learning needs of disadvantaged students	19
Strive to establish close communication and cooperation with parents (School administration and teaching staff)	18
Provide education and awareness raising activities for parents (MNE, EDs, NGOs, local governments, schools)	13
Provide platforms for parents and students to voice their problems, needs and expectations to the educational authorities	5

## Conclusions and Policy Implications

Migration is a current hot topic that yields urgent improvement needs in the field of education and social policy to satisfy the educational needs of children of poverty and, especially who come from diverse backgrounds. The study findings indicated that the most pressing problems confronted by schools in both contexts, namely schools located in in-migration districts and out-migration districts, were similar with those reported in the literature on international migration (Goodwin, 2002; Rong & Brown, 2002; Thompson, 2004). Given the findings, they can also be transferrable to schools who receive international migrant students.

### School Quality

First of all, we found that the quality of education has been shown to be affected by the quality of resources available in the immediate school context (Akar, 2010; Goodwin, 2002, Rong & Brown, 2002), with schools surrounded by poverty dominating the bottom rankings of educational achievement (Thompson, 2004). This may likely be attributed to poor language skills, which is related to poverty and low cultural-capital. In the case of internal migrants, children have been found to be subjected to malnutrition, poverty and child labor. They may also have social adaptation problems, and may find that their socioeconomic circumstances lead to unavoidable problems regarding school attendance.

Given low school quality we argue it could be associated with poverty overall. UNICEF Report (2015) indicates that among all OECD countries, child poverty for children is the highest in Turkey. In addition, the children who are the highest risk level of deprivation include those children who come from large families, who have parents with little or no education, who have most recently migrated to the urban, or whose parents are unemployed or work in unregistered jobs with no regular income and reside in rural and mostly eastern and southeastern regions of the country (Gürses, 2009). Ultimately, it is no coincidence that the main driver for internal migration is economic reasons, especially, for the regions mentioned above (Metem & Özbaş, 2015), and the supervisors' evaluations of school quality in schools located in out-migration or in in-migration contexts should be evaluated in line with this reality and enable local authorities to introduce incremental policies and ad hoc solutions to unique school needs.

The poor physical conditions comparative to other schools, although public, located in non-migrant neighborhoods. Unfortunately, when using comparative achievement data, the underlying issue of school poverty tends to be underestimated and thus dismissed in Turkey, despite international research providing evidence that differences in the achievement gap at the national level does not differ much except in the case of differences caused by school type and school-quality indicators.

### Teacher Quality

Teacher quality is the most essential component in the schooling of migrant students. We argue that investment in teacher education and appointment of qualified teachers in schools challenged with disadvantaged student groups may create a difference. Nevertheless, the status of educational achievement at the regional level is an issue currently under heavy debate based on data from national and international research. One significant difference in achievement stems from the absence of full-time teachers. Teachers were reported to have low efficacy beliefs or low perceptions about student achievement and to fail to encourage students to maximize their potential, and students' academic abilities. Teachers also were found to be challenged with the compulsory curriculum implementation as students lacked prerequisite knowledge and skills and were reluctant to implement in a constructivist learning environment. Consequently, in schools located in areas receiving or sending significant migrant populations to experience high levels of turnover in teaching and administrative staff lacked school bonding and, therefore, teachers are not motivated to invest in school improvement activities or professional

development. Therefore, urgent policies that attract well-qualified teachers to these schools can be enhanced through allocation of incentives such as housing. Similarly lack of student school bonding and belongingness emerged as a challenge alongside drop in attention and disruption of class order and became obstacles for enhancing higher student achievement (Berberoğlu, 2005).

### **Curricular Issues**

In both schools located in districts, either receiving or and sending student populations, the centralized curriculum emerged as an additional challenge. Due to student movements, the migrant students either lacked prerequisite knowledge or they need to spend more efforts to catch up with the program the schools had been implementing. Although the curriculum provides flexibility in implementation, findings indicated that this is regarded as a barrier for students' future academic aspirations. Also, since there is a tendency to drop out, as students and parents did not find schools beneficial for the lives, the curriculum is suggested to include employability skills. Consequently, it is urgent that the schools operate on a full-day schedule for both situations and abandon multi-grade classrooms for schools sending student populations.

### **Administrative Assignments**

Beyond the deficiencies in terms of quality and learning environment in schools located in migrant neighborhoods noted in a World Bank study (2005), the findings of the present study also suggest a deficiency in terms of effective leadership. Previous studies have demonstrated the importance of assigning experienced and qualified principals to disadvantaged schools (Tonbul & Sağiroğlu, 2012) and ensuring that they remain in place, however this was not found to be the case at the schools examined in the present study. In fact, supervisors complained that regulations stipulating career- and merit-based appointments of school principals are not uniformly implemented and that political considerations may affect administrative assignments (Aslanargun, 2012), and this policy needs to be reconsidered at national level. Also, in schools that are sending students and teachers, administrative staff also seem to lack the motivation to invest in school improvement.

### **Impact of supervisor evaluations**

In the current study it was found that supervisors' average experience in the schools assigned was around 10 years. Their close contacts with schools plays a crucial role in that respect, especially lengthy employment within the same district can provide supervisors with the opportunity not only to become familiar with the specific challenges faced by particular schools, but also to witness the positive changes schools undergo over time; however, despite the potential benefits, the MNE has introduced a policy of mandatory workplace rotation whereby supervisors are routinely assigned to new districts every five, four, or three years depending on the area they are assigned (Official Gazette, 2011, dated 24.06.2011, Number 27974, Act. 28). Given that the nation has been divided in five educational zones, the provinces that are included in the fourth and fifth zone are located in most vulnerable areas in which internal migration is huge and are located in the east or southeast areas of Turkey. Consequently, the policy change may lead to new challenges for the schools located in districts with internal migration trends. Therefore, it is crucial to conduct further research on whether decreased period of employment of supervisors in disadvantaged provinces will have an impact on the effectiveness of supervision procedures, and use the evaluation works reported by supervisors to give decisions for rotations of supervisors with fewer years of experiences in their service zones.

### **Teacher Recruitment**

Despite the fact that the educational system in Turkey is highly centralized, the difference in public school quality varies according to location. Given the large numbers of unemployed educated young citizens –250,000 teachers are currently reported to be unemployed (Kamuajans, 2013) – the vacancies in disadvantaged schools does not make sense, given the imbalance in

supply and demand. Although this study as well as others indicate that teachers do not want to work at disadvantaged schools located in poor areas, the large numbers of unemployed teachers waiting to be recruited also need to be taken into account.

The findings of this study revealed that problems related to teacher vacancies tended to be resolved by the supplemental hiring of part-time teachers paid on an hourly basis, which provides a certain amount of relief from overall budgetary pressures. However, the misapplication and overuse of this strategy may pose a risk to the overall quality of education in disadvantaged regions. The development and implementation of recruitment policies that guarantee full-time positions to teachers in disadvantaged areas is crucial. There is a new policy announcement by the Minister of Education that has not been released officially yet (Kamu Haber, 21.08.2016) indicating that the number of teachers to be recruited in the new academic year will be assigned as contracted teachers, and we fear that it will be a short term solution only, and in the long term it will negatively impact on the educational quality in schools, especially for the ones that are exposed to high mobility processes with their teaching and administrative staff, as well as their students.

### **Parent-Student-School Triangle**

Özbaş and Badavan (2009) have emphasized that despite policies designed to build school-parent partnerships in the Turkish Educational System, the current level of parental involvement is lower than desired, which has had an adverse effect on educational planning and implementation. The findings of the present study are in line with this assessment. Nevertheless, in order to ensure sustainability, promotion of life skills of students needs to begin in the home through the training of families initially.

### **Policy Implications**

Based on the information provided by participating school supervisors as well as the overall data included in the literature, the following policy imperatives were identified in order to improve the quality of education received by children attending schools that serve communities sending and receiving large migrant populations:

**Revise in-service training delivery.** A cohort group of qualified experts should be constituted and charged with planning, implementing and evaluating in-service training at the district or provincial level on the basis of needs analyses beyond the formal curriculum. Well-equipped trainers may be recruited from among teaching staff possessing post-graduate degrees. Instituting such a system can build new incentives for teachers seeking professional development through new career pathways.

**Revise centralized curriculum:** The formal curriculum that includes mainly academic topics seems to be a barrier for disadvantaged students' future professional aspirations as they tend to dropout early due to financial constraints. We suggest that the curriculum for schools located in migrant neighborhoods needs to educate the migrant students with employability skills, especially, to avoid early dropouts and continue with the twelve-year compulsory education. More investment in vocational and technical education in those neighborhoods should be prioritized.

**Institute a flexible academic calendar and remedy classes.** Individual schools, especially those serving migrant populations, should be given a certain degree of flexibility in terms of academic calendar and scheduling that will allow schools to implement the centralized curriculum while avoiding underachievement and early drop-out. It may also be effective, if these schools would organize remedy courses to catch up with centralized formal program so that students can attend the nation-wide standardized examinations with their counterparts beyond the policies introduced in the Regulation for Migrant or Partial Migrant and Seasonal Workers' Children (Genelge/Regulation 2016/5), which suggests that educational programs be proposed

for those children in the contexts they are to catch up with the formal curriculum, or through bussing them to the nearest schools in the urban.

**Construct new school facilities in areas receiving migrants.** Urgent priority should be given to investing in the construction of new schools, rather than attempting to relieve overcrowding by relying on annexes installed at existing facilities. School Development initiatives can be undertaken at the local level by the Special Provincial Administrations (SPAs), which can provide resources such as land for school construction as well as the actual construction and/or renovation of school buildings. In fulfilling these and other major needs of the schools, SPAs can allocate financing from their own budgets to supplement budget allocations by the MNE.

**Conduct research in different areas.** Policy decisions may be informed by additional data on educational equity, teacher recruitment and school administration policies, and the insecure effects of private investment on educational achievement. Research-driven educational policies that invest on the quality of education for all children as a social right can make a difference for the poor.

**Focus on pre-school language instruction.** Language development at the pre-school level is of utmost importance to ensure that children from families whose mother tongue differs from the official language become fully competent in the official medium of instruction, namely the Turkish language. Hiring of multilingual counselors and teachers in schools located in migrant neighborhoods may alleviate the adaptation process of migrant children and most likely impact on the children's educational success and social well-being, especially, for the children at pre-school level and primary school level. In that way multilingualism can be capitalized and children with different language backgrounds can become bilinguals and overcome the language barrier in having equal access to education.

**Transition away from double shift education.** Although the magnitude of findings on double shift education can be argued to be at bottom levels, we highlight its importance. Education needs to be delivered according to a full-day system to ensure better educational delivery and allow time for extracurricular activities. These should include supplementary tutoring as well as social, cultural and physical education activities in order to contribute to children's multicultural understanding and socio-cultural adaptation. Time spend in the school will impact on the standard of life of poor children and develop school bonding. Therefore, we suggest a whole-day school policy for all children for social justice.

**Differentiated applications of policies for disadvantaged schools:** Poverty, deprivation, lack of family school partnership are few of a need to discriminate policies as implemented for all schools. Provision of incentives such as School Milk Application Policy (Official Gazette, 2013) promoted through macro policies, are especially welcome in deprived areas and disadvantaged schools. Macro policies to support disadvantaged schools with financial inputs such as school household facilities or school gate guardian facilities need to be revised and financed by the central or local authorities. Provision of a more active role for Provincial and District Level Educational Directorates (EDs) to implement incremental policies and ad hoc solutions to unique school needs to act as a bridge to build capacity among schools, universities, and SPAs.

## Acknowledgements

First of all we would like to express our gratitude to Prof. Erol Demir for his guidance on the sampling procedures of this study regarding the selection of immigration and outmigration districts. Next, we would like to express our thanks to participants for their invaluable contributions to this study with their views and suggestions. We are also grateful to all the blind reviewers and other contributors who enabled us to improve the paper.

## References

- Acar, A., & Anil, B. (2015). How does childhood poverty affect future outcomes of children? BETAM, Working paper 0161, Retrieved January 2017. <http://betam.bahcesehir.edu.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/WorkingPaper0161.pdf>
- Akar, H. (2010). Challenges for schools in communities with internal migration flows: Evidence from Turkey. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 30, 263-276.
- Akbaba-Altun, S. (2009). An investigation of teachers', parents', and students' opinions on elementary students' academic failure. *Elementary Education Online*, 8(2), 567-586.
- Aksoy, N. (2008). Multigrade schooling in Turkey: An overview. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 28, 218-228. doi:10.1016/j.ijedudev.2007.05.002
- Altinyelken, H. K. (2009a). Coping strategies among internal migrant students in Turkey. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 48, 174-183. doi: 10.101016/j.ijer.2009.07.001
- Altinyelken, H. K. (2009b). Migration and self-esteem: A qualitative study among internal migrant girls in Turkey. *Adolescence*, 44(173), 149-163.
- Aslanargun, E. (2012). Administrative judicial decisions on the process of principals' appointment and emerging values. *Educational Administration: Theory and Practice*, 18(3), 347-376.
- Bal, A. P., & Doğanay, A. (2010). An analysis of problems encountered in the process of measurement and evaluation in teaching mathematics at primary school 5<sup>th</sup> grade. *Educational administration: Theory and practice*, 16(3), 373-398.
- Berberoğlu, B. (2005). *Türk bakış açısından Pisa araştırma sonuçları [PISA survey results: A Turkish perspective]*. Paper presented at the the Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung seminar on Educational Reform in Turkey and Germany, Ankara, Turkey.
- Berker, A., (2009). The impact of internal migration on educational attainment: Evidence from Turkey. *Economics of Education Review*, 28(6), 739-749.
- Cemalciler, Z., & Gökşen, F. (2014). Inequality in social capital: Social capital, social risk and drop-out in the Turkish education system. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 35(1), 94-114.
- Chen, X., Wang, L., & Wang, Z. (2009). Shyness-sensitivity and social, school, and psychological adjustment in rural migrant and urban children in China. *Child Development*, 80(5), 1499-1513.
- Contreras, A. R. (2002). The impact of immigration policy on education reform: Implications for the new millenium. *Education and Urban Society*, 34(2), 134-155.
- Erdönmez, C., & Özden, S. (2009). Relations between rural development projects and urban migration: The Köykent Project in Turkey. *Ciencia Rural*, 39(6), 1873-1879.
- Genelge 2007/74, 2007. E-okul uygulaması, 02/05/2006 6602 sayılı Bakanlık onayı [E-school implementation, [Regulation approved by Ministry 02/05/2006 6602] Regulation Retrieved July, 2014 from [www.mevzuat.gov.tr/html/15709-0.html](http://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/html/15709-0.html)
- Genelge 2016/5, 2016. Mevsimlik tarım işçileri ile göçer ve yarı göçer ailelerin çocuklarının eğitime erişimi, 2 [Regulation for Migrant or Partial Migrant and Seasonal Workers' Children]. Dated 21.03.2016, Number: 45512797-10.06-E.3243629, Retrieved April, 2016 from [http://mevzuat.meb.gov.tr/html/mevgococuk/mevgococuk\\_0.html](http://mevzuat.meb.gov.tr/html/mevgococuk/mevgococuk_0.html)
- Goksen, F., & Cemalciler, Z. (2010). Social capital and cultural distance as predictors of early school dropout: *Implications for community action for Turkish internal migrants*, 34, 163-175. doi: 10.1016/ijintrel.2009.11.006
- Goodwin, A. L. (2002). Teacher preparation and the education of immigrant children. *Education and Urban Society*, 34 (2), 156-172.
- Gürsel, S., Uysal, G., & Acar, A. (2013). One in every four children is poor. Research Brief, 13/147, Retrieved January 2017, <http://betam.bahcesehir.edu.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/06/ResearchBrief147.pdf>

- Gürsel, S., Uysal-Kolasin, G., & Altındag, O. (2009). *Education attainment gap between native speakers of Turkish and Kurdish* (BETAM Research Brief No. 49). Retrieved from <http://betam.bahcesehir.edu.tr/en/2009/11/18/>
- Hamilton, P. L. (2013). It's not all about academic achievement: supporting the social and emotional needs of migrant worker children. *Pastoral Care in Education, 31*(2), 173–190. doi: 10.1080/02643944.012.747555
- HDR (2013). Human development report 2013: *The rise of the South*: United Nations Development Programme. Retrieved July 15, 2015 from [http://hdr.undp.org/sites/default/files/reports/14/hdr2013\\_en\\_complete.pdf](http://hdr.undp.org/sites/default/files/reports/14/hdr2013_en_complete.pdf)
- Kamuajans (2013, March 5). Atanmayan öğretmenler. [Teachers not appointed]. Article retrieved July 15, 2015, from <http://www.kamuajans.com/atanmayanogretmenler/haber/brans-brans-issiz-ogretmen-sayilari-427402.html>
- Kamuhaber (2016, August 11). Milli Eğitim Bakanı'ndan sözleşmeli öğretmen açıklaması [Announcement of the Education Minister on the new contracted teacher assignments]. Retrieved 12 August, 2016, from <http://www.kamuhaber.com/Milli-Egitim-Bakanindan-sozlesmeli-ogretmen-aciklamasi-40986h.htm>
- Koç, İ., & Ünalın, T. (2005, July). *The extent of internal displacement in Turkey and its consequences on the child educational attainment and health in Turkey*. Paper presented at the XXVth IUSSP International Population Conference, Tours, France.
- Lanfranchi, A. (2014). The significance of the interculturally competent school psychologist for achieving equitable education outcomes for migrant students. *School Psychology International, 35*(5), 544-558. doi:10.1177/0143034314525501
- Leung, G., & Uchikoshi, Y. (2012). Relationships among language ideologies, family language policies, and children's language achievement: A look at Cantonese-English bilinguals in the US. *Bilingual Research Journal, 35*, 294–313. doi 10.1080/15235882.2012.731588
- Mete, M. & Özbaş, H. (2015). The impact of economic development on regional migration in Turkey. *Zeitschrift Für Die Welt Der Türken, Journal Of World Of Turks, 7*(3), 119-135.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods source book*. (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.) Los Angeles: SAGE.
- Ministry of National Education, Republic of Turkey [MNE] (2011). Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı: Basmüfettişleri Başkanları Yönetmeliği. [Ministry of National Education Regulation on Supervisory Board]. Article 53, Retrieved, June 2014. <http://mevzuat.basbakanlik.gov.tr/Metin.aspx?MevzuatKod=7.5.15067&MevzuatIliski=0&sourceXmlSearch=mpercentC3percentBCfettipercentC5percent9F>.
- Ministry of National Education, Republic of Turkey [MNE] (2014). Milli Eğitim İstatistikleri: Örgün eğitim istatistikler 2013/'14. [National Education Statistics: Formal education statistis 2013/'14]. Retrieved from [http://sgb.meb.gov.tr/istatistik/meb\\_istatistikleri\\_orgun\\_egitim\\_2013\\_2014.pdf](http://sgb.meb.gov.tr/istatistik/meb_istatistikleri_orgun_egitim_2013_2014.pdf).
- Nusche, D. (2009). *What works in migrant education? A review of evidence and policy options* (No.22). OECD Education Working Paper. Retrieved from [http://www.oecd.org/officialdocuments/publicdisplaydocumentpdf/?cote=EDU/WKP\(2009\)1&doclanguage=en](http://www.oecd.org/officialdocuments/publicdisplaydocumentpdf/?cote=EDU/WKP(2009)1&doclanguage=en)
- Official Gazette. (2011). Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı Eğitim Müfettişleri Başkanlıkları Yönetmeliği [Ministry of National Education: Directory of Educational Supervisors. [Number 2011/27974, Article 53. Retrieved 9 March, 2015. <http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/main.aspx?home=http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/eskiler/2011/06/20110624.htm&main=http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/eskiler/2011/06/20110624.htm>.
- Official Gazette. (2012). Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı İl ve İlçe Eğitim Müdürlükleri Yönetmeliği [Ministry of National Education, Provincial and District Educational Directorates

- Regulation], Nov., 18, 2012, Number, 28471. Retrieved 8 February, 2015.  
<http://mevzuat.meb.gov.tr/html/ilveil%C3%A7ey%C3%B6net/ilveilce.html>
- Official Gazette. (2013). Food and Agriculture, Released School Milk Application Policy to Promote and Acquire Healthy Life Skills Among School Children and Contribute to their Healthy Development, through policy Number 2013/5171. July 18, 2013 Number 11790.
- Özbaş, M., & Badavan, Y. (2009). The school-family relationship duties that primary school administrators actually perform and are supposed to perform. *Education and Science*, 34 (154), 69-81.
- Öztürk, M. (2007). İç göçlerin İstanbul kent ve çalışma hayatına etkileri [The impact of internal migrations on urban and labor life of Istanbul]. *Amme İdaresi Dergisi*, 40(1), 85–106.
- Rong, X., & Brown, F., (2002). Immigration and urban education in the new millennium: The diversity and the challenges. *Education and Urban Society*, 34(2), 123–133.
- Rosenthal, L. (2004). Do school inspections improve school quality? Ofsted inspections and school examination results in the UK. *Economics of Education Review*, 23(2), 143-151.  
[http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0272-7757\(03\)00081-5](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0272-7757(03)00081-5)
- Saglam, A. Ç. (2012). Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı Merkez ve Taşra Örgütleri Yönetim Pozisyonlarında Kadınların Temsil Edilme Düzeyine Yönelik Yönetici Görüşleri [ Administrators' Views Regarding the Level Of Women Being Represented in Administrative Positions in Central and Provincial Organizations of Ministry of Education] *Uşak Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 5(2), 140-155.
- Schapiro, K. A. (2009). *Migration and educational outcomes of children* (No. 57). Human Development Research Paper. Retrieved from United Nations Development Programme website:  
[http://hdr.undp.org/sites/default/files/hdrp\\_2009\\_57.pdf](http://hdr.undp.org/sites/default/files/hdrp_2009_57.pdf)
- Smits, J., & Gunduz-Hoşgor, A. ( 2006). Effects of family background characteristics on educational participation in Turkey. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 26, 545–560.
- TALIS. (2008). Technical Report. Teaching and Learning International Survey. In Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development 2010. France: OECD Publishing. OECD Publishing, Paris. doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/9789264079861-en>
- Taş, H. I., & Lightfoot, D. R. (2005). Gecekondu settlements in Turkey: Rural-urban migration in the developing European periphery. *The Journal of Geography*, 104(6), 263-271.
- Thompson, B. R. (2004). Equitable measurement of school effectiveness. *Urban Education*, 39(2), 200–229.
- Tonbul, Y., & Sagiroglu, S. (2012). A research regarding obligatory displacement of school administrators. *Educational Administration: Theory and Practice*, 18(2), 313-339.
- Villegas, A. M., & Lucas, T. (2002). Preparing culturally responsive teachers: Rethinking the curriculum. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 53(1), 22-32.
- UNICEF (2015). Child poverty: Indicators to measure progress for the sustainable development goals. Retrieved May August 2016, from  
[https://www.unicef.org/agenda2030/files/Child\\_povety\\_SDG\\_indicators\\_brief\\_March\\_2015.pdf](https://www.unicef.org/agenda2030/files/Child_povety_SDG_indicators_brief_March_2015.pdf)
- World Bank. (2005). *Turkey-Education sector study: Sustainable pathways to an effective, equitable and efficient education system for preschool through secondary school education*. (32450). Retrieved from  
<http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/715361468779160193/Main-report>

## Appendix A

**Table:**

Participating Provinces in all regions based on in-migration and out-migration figures above or below 10 in population growth

Geographical Area and provinces included	Province	Population	Urbanization (%)	Annual population growth (%)	Highest immigration district	Highest out-migration districts
<b>The Marmara Region</b>						
Inmigration	İstanbul	10 018 735	90.7	33.1	Central districts, Büyükçekmece,	
Inmigration	Bursa	2 125 140	76.8	28.6	Sultanbeyli, Central districts, İnegöl	
Outmigration	Edirne	402 606	57.4	-0.5		Meriç, Havsa, Uzunköprü
<b>The Aegean Region</b>						
Inmigration	İzmir	3 370 866	81.1	22.4	Central districts, Aliğa	
Inmigration	Muğla	715 328	37.5	24.0	Center,	
Inmigration	Denizli	850 029	48.7	12.4	Marmaris Center	
Outmigration	Afyon*	812.416	45.8	9.5		Kızılören, Emirdağ
<b>The Mediatarranean</b>						
Inmigration	Antalya	1 719 751	54.5	41.8	Center, Alanya	
Inmigration	Mersin	1 651 400	60.5	26.5	Center, Silifke	
Inmigration	Adana	1 849 478	75.6	17.7	Center, Ceyhan	
Outmigration	Burdur*	256.803	54.5	0.7		Çeltikçi, Tefenni, Yeşilova
<b>Mid Anatolia</b>						
Inmigration	Ankara	4 007 860	88.3	21.4	Central districts, Çubuk	
Inmigration	Konya	2 192 166	59.1	22.4	Center, Çumra	
Outmigration	Sivas		55.9	-1.5		Divriği, İmranlı, Hafik
<b>The Blacksea Region</b>						
Inmigration	Trabzon	975 137	49.1	20.3	Center, Beşköprü	
Inmigration	Düzce	314 266	41.6	13.8	Center, Akçakoca	
Outmigration	Sinop	225 574	44.9	-16.2		Dikmen, Erfelek, Ayancık
<b>East Anatolia</b>						
Inmigration	Van	877 524	50.9	32.0	Center, Erciş	
Inmigration	Malatya	853 658	58.5	19.2	Center, Kuluncak	
Outmigration	Tunceli	93 584	58.2	-35.6		Center, Ovacık, Pülümür
<b>SouthEast Anatolia</b>						
Inmigration	Şanlıurfa	1 443 422	58.3	36.6	Center, Viranşehir	
Inmigration	Şırnak	353 197	59.8	29.9	Center, Silopi	
Inmigration	Diyarbakır	1 362 708	60.0	21.7		
Outmigration	Kilis	114 724	65.4	-12.7	Center, Bismil	Center

Source: TUIK. 2005. National Statistics Foundation. Devlet İstatistiksel Yıllık Elkitabı [Annual handbook of National Statistics Poll].

Note: When central province is excluded in the sample there is outmigration.

## About the Authors

### Hanife Akar

Middle East Technical University, Department of Educational Sciences

[hanif@metu.edu.tr](mailto:hanif@metu.edu.tr)

Dr. Hanife Akar (F) is an associate professor at Middle East Technical University, Department of Educational Sciences. Akar is specialized in the Field of Curriculum and Research. Her research interests focus on educational policy, internationalization of education, equity issues in education, civic education, and migration.

### Derya Şen

Atatürk University; Department of Educational Sciences

[deryasn@yahoo.com](mailto:deryasn@yahoo.com)

Derya Şen (F) is a Ph.D. Candidate at Middle East Technical University, Department of Educational Sciences, and a research assistant at Atatürk University in the Field of Educational Administration and Planning. Şen's research interest focus on educational policy and school administration.

---

## education policy analysis archives

Volume 25 Number 13

February 20, 2017

ISSN 1068-2341

---



Readers are free to copy, display, and distribute this article, as long as the work is attributed to the author(s) and **Education Policy Analysis Archives**, it is distributed for non-commercial purposes only, and no alteration or transformation is made in the work. More details of this Creative Commons license are available at <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/>. All other uses must be approved by the author(s) or **EPAA**. **EPAA** is published by the Mary Lou Fulton Institute and Graduate School of Education at Arizona State University. Articles are indexed in CIRC (Clasificación Integrada de Revistas Científicas, Spain), DIALNET (Spain), [Directory of Open Access Journals](#), EBSCO Education Research Complete, ERIC, Education Full Text (H.W. Wilson), QUALIS A2 (Brazil), SCImago Journal Rank; SCOPUS, SOCOLAR (China).

Please send errata notes to Audrey Amrein-Beardsley at [audrey.beardsley@asu.edu](mailto:audrey.beardsley@asu.edu)

Join EPAA's Facebook community at <https://www.facebook.com/EPAAAPE> and Twitter feed @epaa\_aape.

---

education policy analysis archives  
editorial board

Lead Editor: **Audrey Amrein-Beardsley** (Arizona State University)

Editor Consultant: **Gustavo E. Fischman** (Arizona State University)

Associate Editors: **David Carlson, Margarita Jimenez-Silva, Eugene Judson, Mirka Koro-Ljungberg, Scott Marley, Jeanne M. Powers, Iveta Silova, Maria Teresea Tatto** (Arizona State University)

**Cristina Alfaro** San Diego State University

**Gary Anderson** New York University

**Michael W. Apple** University of Wisconsin, Madison

**Jeff Bale** OISE, University of Toronto, Canada

**Aaron Bevanot** SUNY Albany

**David C. Berliner** Arizona State University

**Henry Braun** Boston College

**Casey Cobb** University of Connecticut

**Arnold Danzig** San Jose State University

**Linda Darling-Hammond** Stanford University

**Elizabeth H. DeBray** University of Georgia

**Chad d'Entremont** Rennie Center for Education Research & Policy

**John Diamond** University of Wisconsin, Madison

**Matthew Di Carlo** Albert Shanker Institute

**Michael J. Dumas** University of California, Berkeley

**Kathy Escamilla** University of Colorado, Boulder

**Melissa Lynn Freeman** Adams State College

**Rachael Gabriel** University of Connecticut

**Amy Garrett Dikkers** University of North Carolina, Wilmington

**Gene V Glass** Arizona State University

**Ronald Glass** University of California, Santa Cruz

**Jacob P. K. Gross** University of Louisville

**Eric M. Haas** WestEd

**Julian Vasquez Heilig** California State University, Sacramento

**Kimberly Kappler Hewitt** University of North Carolina Greensboro

**Aimee Howley** Ohio University

**Steve Klees** University of Maryland

**Jaekyung Lee** SUNY Buffalo

**Jessica Nina Lester** Indiana University

**Amanda E. Lewis** University of Illinois, Chicago

**Chad R. Lochmiller** Indiana University

**Christopher Lubienski** University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign

**Sarah Lubienski** University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign

**William J. Mathis** University of Colorado, Boulder

**Michele S. Moses** University of Colorado, Boulder

**Julianne Moss** Deakin University, Australia

**Sharon Nichols** University of Texas, San Antonio

**Eric Parsons** University of Missouri-Columbia

**Susan L. Robertson** Bristol University, UK

**Gloria M. Rodriguez** University of California, Davis

**R. Anthony Rolle** University of Houston

**A. G. Rud** Washington State University

**Patricia Sánchez** University of University of Texas, San Antonio

**Janelle Scott** University of California, Berkeley

**Jack Schneider** College of the Holy Cross

**Noah Sobe** Loyola University

**Nelly P. Stromquist** University of Maryland

**Benjamin Superfine** University of Illinois, Chicago

**Adai Tefera** Virginia Commonwealth University

**Tina Trujillo** University of California, Berkeley

**Federico R. Waitoller** University of Illinois, Chicago

**Larisa Warhol** University of Connecticut

**John Weathers** University of Colorado, Colorado Springs

**Kevin Welner** University of Colorado, Boulder

**Terrence G. Wiley** Center for Applied Linguistics

**John Willinsky** Stanford University

**Jennifer R. Wolgemuth** University of South Florida

**Kyo Yamashiro** Claremont Graduate University

**Kyo Yamashiro** Claremont Graduate University

## archivos analíticos de políticas educativas consejo editorial

Editor Consultor: **Gustavo E. Fischman** (Arizona State University)

Editores Asociados: **Armando Alcántara Santuario** (Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México), **Jason Beech**, (Universidad de San Andrés), **Ezequiel Gomez Caride**, (Pontificia Universidad Católica Argentina), **Antonio Luzon**, (Universidad de Granada)

**Claudio Almonacid**

Universidad Metropolitana de Ciencias de la Educación, Chile

**Miguel Ángel Arias Ortega**

Universidad Autónoma de la Ciudad de México

**Xavier Besalú Costa**

Universitat de Girona, España

**Xavier Bonal Sarro** Universidad Autónoma de Barcelona, España

**Antonio Bolívar Boitia**

Universidad de Granada, España

**José Joaquín Brunner**

Universidad Diego Portales, Chile

**Damián Canales Sánchez**

Instituto Nacional para la Evaluación de la Educación, México

**Gabriela de la Cruz Flores**

Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México

**Marco Antonio Delgado Fuentes**

Universidad Iberoamericana, México

**Inés Dussel**, DIE-CINVESTAV, México

**Pedro Flores Crespo**

Universidad Iberoamericana, México

**Ana María García de Fanelli**

Centro de Estudios de Estado y Sociedad (CEDES) CONICET, Argentina

**Juan Carlos González Faraco**

Universidad de Huelva, España

**María Clemente Linuesa**

Universidad de Salamanca, España

**Jaume Martínez Bonafé**

Universitat de València, España

**Alejandro Márquez Jiménez**

Instituto de Investigaciones sobre la Universidad y la Educación, UNAM, México

**María Guadalupe Olivier**

**Tellez**, Universidad Pedagógica Nacional, México

**Miguel Pereyra**

Universidad de Granada, España

**Mónica Pini**

Universidad Nacional de San Martín, Argentina

**Omar Orlando Pulido Chaves**

Instituto para la Investigación Educativa y el Desarrollo Pedagógico (IDEP)

**José Luis Ramírez Romero**

Universidad Autónoma de Sonora, México

**Paula Razquin** Universidad de San Andrés, Argentina

**José Ignacio Rivas Flores**

Universidad de Málaga, España

**Miriam Rodríguez Vargas**

Universidad Autónoma de Tamaulipas, México

**José Gregorio Rodríguez**

Universidad Nacional de Colombia, Colombia

**Mario Rueda Beltrán**

Instituto de Investigaciones sobre la Universidad y la Educación, UNAM, México

**José Luis San Fabián Maroto**

Universidad de Oviedo, España

**Jurjo Torres Santomé**,

Universidad de la Coruña, España

**Yengny Marisol Silva Laya**

Universidad Iberoamericana, México

**Juan Carlos Tedesco**

Universidad Nacional de San Martín, Argentina

**Ernesto Treviño Ronzón**

Universidad Veracruzana, México

**Ernesto Treviño Villarreal**

Universidad Diego Portales Santiago, Chile

**Antoni Verger Planells**

Universidad Autónoma de Barcelona, España

**Catalina Wainerman**

Universidad de San Andrés, Argentina

**Juan Carlos Yáñez Velazco**

Universidad de Colima, México

arquivos analíticos de políticas educativas  
conselho editorial

Editor Consultor: **Gustavo E. Fischman** (Arizona State University)

Editoras Associadas: **Geovana Mendonça Lunardi Mendes** (Universidade do Estado de Santa Catarina),

**Marcia Pletsch, Sandra Regina Sales** (Universidade Federal Rural do Rio de Janeiro)

**Almerindo Afonso**

Universidade do Minho  
Portugal

**Alexandre Fernandez Vaz**

Universidade Federal de Santa  
Catarina, Brasil

**José Augusto Pacheco**

Universidade do Minho, Portugal

**Rosanna Maria Barros Sá**

Universidade do Algarve  
Portugal

**Regina Célia Linhares Hostins**

Universidade do Vale do Itajaí,  
Brasil

**Jane Paiva**

Universidade do Estado do Rio de  
Janeiro, Brasil

**Maria Helena Bonilla**

Universidade Federal da Bahia  
Brasil

**Alfredo Macedo Gomes**

Universidade Federal de Pernambuco  
Brasil

**Paulo Alberto Santos Vieira**

Universidade do Estado de Mato  
Grosso, Brasil

**Rosa Maria Bueno Fischer**

Universidade Federal do Rio Grande  
do Sul, Brasil

**Jefferson Mainardes**

Universidade Estadual de Ponta  
Grossa, Brasil

**Fabiany de Cássia Tavares Silva**

Universidade Federal do Mato  
Grosso do Sul, Brasil

**Alice Casimiro Lopes**

Universidade do Estado do Rio de  
Janeiro, Brasil

**Jader Janer Moreira Lopes**

Universidade Federal Fluminense e  
Universidade Federal de Juiz de Fora,  
Brasil

**António Teodoro**

Universidade Lusófona  
Portugal

**Suzana Feldens Schwertner**

Centro Universitário Univates  
Brasil

**Debora Nunes**

Universidade Federal do Rio Grande  
do Norte, Brasil

**Lílian do Valle**

Universidade do Estado do Rio de  
Janeiro, Brasil

**Flávia Miller Naethe Motta**

Universidade Federal Rural do Rio de  
Janeiro, Brasil

**Alda Junqueira Marin**

Pontifícia Universidade Católica de  
São Paulo, Brasil

**Alfredo Veiga-Neto**

Universidade Federal do Rio Grande  
do Sul, Brasil

**Dalila Andrade Oliveira**

Universidade Federal de Minas  
Gerais, Brasil