

CORPOREAL BODIES BEYOND BORDERS: EXPERIENCES OF  
MIGRANT FILIPINA NANNIES IN TURKEY

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO  
THE GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES  
OF  
MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY

BY

MİNA ALARA GÜRSON

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS  
FOR  
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF SCIENCE  
IN  
THE DEPARTMENT OF MEDIA AND CULTURAL STUDIES

OCTOBER 2021



Approval of the thesis:

**CORPOREAL BODIES BEYOND BORDERS: EXPERIENCES OF  
MIGRANT FILIPINA NANNIES IN TURKEY**

submitted by **MİNA ALARA GÜRSON** in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of **Master of Science in Media and Cultural Studies, the Graduate School of Social Sciences of Middle East Technical University** by,

Prof. Dr. Yaşar KONDAKÇI  
Dean  
Graduate School of Social Sciences

---

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Barış ÇAKMUR  
Middle East Technical University  
Department of Media and Cultural Studies

---

Assist. Prof. Dr. Özgür AVCI  
Supervisor  
Department of Political Science and Public Administration

---

**Examining Committee Members:**

Dr. Ayşegül Gökalp KUTLU (Head of the Examining Committee)  
Kocaeli University  
Department of International Relations

---

Assist. Prof. Dr. Özgür AVCI (Supervisor)  
Middle East Technical University  
Department of Political Science and Public Administration

---

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Barış ÇAKMUR  
Middle East Technical University  
Department of Media and Cultural Studies

---



**I hereby declare that all information in this document has been obtained and presented in accordance with academic rules and ethical conduct. I also declare that, as required by these rules and conduct, I have fully cited and referenced all material and results that are not original to this work.**

**Name, Last Name:** Mina Alara GÜRSON

**Signature:**

## ABSTRACT

### CORPOREAL BODIES BEYOND BORDERS: EXPERIENCES OF MIGRANT FILIPINA NANNIES IN TURKEY

GÜRSON, Mina Alara

M.S., The Department of Media and Cultural Studies

Supervisor: Assist. Prof. Dr. ÖZGÜR AVCI

October 2021, 210 pages

Hiring migrant Filipina nannies has become a trend among upper-class employers in Turkey within the last decade. This thesis explores the experiences and working conditions of migrant Filipina nannies while working for Turkish employers. The main goal of this research is to discover tactics and coping mechanisms of Filipina nannies and also the strategies that Turkish employers use in setting the boundaries in the household. The physical, psychological and social wellbeing of the nannies are also investigated. The study relies on qualitative methods particularly in-depth interviews with Filipina nannies and Turkish employers. The results point out that the employers have certain attitudes towards nannies and expectations from them which create psychological and physical difficulties for the nannies. The thesis also focuses on the impact of COVID-19 pandemic on the dynamics of the employment relationship, working conditions and the overall experiences of the Filipina domestic workers in Turkey.

**Keywords:** Migrant Women, Paid Domestic Labor, Filipina Nannies, Globalization, Philippines

## ÖZ

### SINIRLARIN ÖTESİNDE BEDENLER: FİLİPİNLİ BAKICILARIN TÜRKİYE'DEKİ DENEYİMLERİ

GÜRSON, Mina Alara

Yüksek Lisans, Medya ve Kültürel Çalışmalar Bölümü

Tez Yöneticisi: Assist. Prof. Dr. ÖZGÜR AVCI

Ekim 2021, 210 sayfa

Filipinli bakıcılar, son on yılda Türkiye'deki üst sınıf işverenler arasında bir trend haline gelmiştir. Bu çalışma Filipinli bakıcıların Türk işverenlerin evlerinde çalışırken ki deneyimlerini ve koşullarını incelemektedir. Araştırmanın asıl amacı, ev içinde sınırları belirlemek için bakıcılar tarafından kullanılan taktikleri ve başa çıkma yöntemlerini aynı zamanda da işverenler tarafından başvuru stratejileri keşfetmektir. Çalışma sırasında, Filipinli bakıcıların fiziksel, psikolojik ve sosyal durumları da araştırılacaktır. Filipinli bakıcılar ve Türk işverenler ile derinlemesine mülakatlar yapılarak niteliksel araştırma yöntemleri kullanılmıştır. Araştırmanın bulguları işverenlerin değişen tutum ve beklentilerine göre bakıcıların farklı koşullar altında ve dolayısı ile çeşitli psikolojik ve fiziksel durumlarda olduğunu göstermektedir. Aynı zamanda COVID-19 pandemisinin istihdam ilişkisi, çalışma koşulları ve Türkiye'deki Filipinli bakıcıların deneyimi üzerindeki etkisine de odaklanılacaktır.

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** Göçmen Kadınlar, Ücretli Ev İşçiliği, Filipinli Bakıcı, Küreselleşme, Filipinler, Türkiye

*To my mum*



## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First of all, I would like to start with expressing my gratitude to my supervisor Asst. Prof. Dr. Özgür Avcı for his constant support, patience, valuable suggestions and guidance. I am also thankful to my examining committee members Dr. Ayşegül Gökalp Kutlu and Assoc. Prof. Dr. Barış Çakmur for their reading and encouraging comments.

I would like to sincerely thank Prof. Yıldız Ecevit who increased my awareness on employment of women, gender equality and migration studies. I also want to thank my boss Col. Benedict Balaba for always supporting and helping me when I was trying to catch up my classes after work.

I dedicate this study to my dear mother Feryal Inanç and I want to thank her for the patience, continuous support and trust in me. I have a very special thanks to Can Danışman for being always by my side whenever I need. I also would like to thank Prof. Ali Poyraz Gürson for his motivational speeches and support.

A massive thank you to all the migrant Filipina women who have accepted interviewing with me. I admire their power, persistence and bravery.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

PLAGIARISM.....	iii
ABSTRACT .....	iv
ÖZ.....	v
DEDICATION .....	vi
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	vii
TABLE OF CONTENTS .....	viii
LIST OF TABLES .....	x
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS .....	xi
CHAPTERS	
1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
2. DISCUSSIONS ON DOMESTIC LABOR, GLOBALIZATION AND MIGRANT WORKERS.....	7
2.1. Domestic Labor .....	7
2.2. Globalization of Domestic and Care Work .....	13
2.3. Global Domestic and Care Work: A Case of Philippines .....	20
2.3.1. Filipina Domestic and Care Workers .....	24
2.3.2. Filipina Identity and Survival Tactics .....	27
2.3.3. Employing a Filipina Domestic Worker .....	32
2.4. Paid Domestic Labor Market in Turkey.....	36
2.4.1. Working Conditions for Migrant Domestic Workers in Turkey .....	41
2.4.2. Filipina Domestic and Care Workers in Turkey .....	46
2.4.3. Conditions of Work after COVID-19.....	53
2.5. Conclusion.....	55
3. METHODOLOGICAL STRUCTURE OF RESEARCH .....	59
3.1. General Profile of the Interviewees.....	66
4. MIGRATION EXPERIENCES AND CONDITIONS OF FILIPINA NANNIES IN TURKEY .....	73
4.1.Reasons of Migration and Choosing Turkey as a Destination Point.....	73

4.2. Arranging Migration to Turkey through Agencies.....	79
4.3 Working Conditions in Turkey.....	81
4.3.1. Contracts and Job Description.....	82
4.3.2. Working Hours and Leaves.....	86
4.3.3. Wages and Weekly Allowances.....	89
4.3.4. Work Permits and Irregular Migrants.....	91
4.3.5. Conditions after COVID-19.....	94
4.4. Concluding Remarks on Migration Experiences and Working Conditions.....	96
5. EMPLOYMENT OF FILIPINA NANNIES IN TURKISH HOUSEHOLDS	99
5.1. Why Filipinas?.....	99
5.2. Setting the Boundaries in the Household.....	108
5.2.1. Boundary Work.....	110
5.2.2. One of the Family Discourse.....	123
5.2.3. Purchasing Deference and Labour Control.....	134
5.3. Filipina Experiences in Turkey.....	139
5.3.1. Identity Management and Coping Mechanisms.....	139
5.3.2. Workplace Abuses: Sexual Harassment, Violence, Passport Deprivation and Run Away.....	147
5.3.3. Mental Health.....	153
5.3.4. Turkish Employers and Others.....	157
5.3.5. Boarding Houses and Day-Offs.....	160
5.3.6. Work Satisfaction and Future Plans.....	163
5.4. Concluding Remarks on Employment of Filipina Nannies in Turkish Households.....	165
6. CONCLUSION.....	170
REFERENCES.....	179
APPENDICES	
A. APPROVAL FORM BY THE METU HUMAN SUBJECTS ETHICS COMITTEE.....	197
B. TURKISH SUMMARY / TÜRKÇE ÖZET.....	198
C. THESIS PERMISSION FORM / TEZ İZİN FORMU.....	210

## LIST OF TABLES

<b>Table 1.</b> Age, Marital Status, Number of Children and Legal Status .....	67
<b>Table 2.</b> Education, Former Occupation and Current Wages in Turkey .....	68
<b>Table 3.</b> Employers' Demographic Profile .....	71
<b>Table 4.</b> Typology of Boundary Work (Lan, 2000, p.192).....	113
<b>Table 5.</b> Employers' Boundary Work.....	114

## **LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS**

<b>COVID-19</b>	: Coronavirus Disease of 2019
<b>EVID-SEN</b>	: Trade Union of Domestic Worker’s Solidarity
<b>FILCOM</b>	: Filipino Community
<b>ILO</b>	: International Labor Organization
<b>IMF</b>	: International Monetary Fund
<b>IOM</b>	: International Organization for Migration
<b>OFWs</b>	: Overseas Filipino Workers
<b>OWWA</b>	: Overseas Workers Welfare Administration
<b>POEA</b>	: Philippine Overseas Employment Administration
<b>SAP</b>	: Structural Adjustment Policies

## CHAPTER 1

### INTRODUCTION

*I was expected to work 16 hours, prohibited to go out for 7 months, beaten by my employers when I wanted to leave my job. When I was talking to my daughter, I did not say anything, or I could not cry because I do not want her to get upset. Instead, I always tell her I am here for them. To give them a good education and after maybe a good job. So, I tell her 'study harder' because I put up with everything here for you.*

*(Ms. A., 40 years old).*

Ms. A. has been working in Turkey for more than four years as a domestic helper without a permit. She was exposed to physical violence by her former Turkish employer when she wanted to leave her job due to heavy workload. She tried running away many times but could not achieve it because her employer cut her connection with the outside world while seizing her phone. She found a way to text her friend and asked for help. She said she could die in that house if she was not saved. Her friend reached to the authorities and the Embassy saved her with the help of Turkish police.

This study aims to explore and investigate migrant Filipina women's experiences as domestic workers and nannies in Turkey. There is a rise in the number of Filipina nannies in Turkey in recent years as a result of increasing demand from the Turkish employers particularly for domestic workers from the Philippines. The question that has driven my research is this: How do Filipina domestic workers cope with the physical, psychological and social difficulty of working too far from home and too near to their boss? The main goal of this research is to discover tactics and coping mechanisms of Filipina nannies and also the strategies of Turkish employers while setting the boundaries in the household. Accordingly, I ask questions related to this the general concern including: How does class-based expectations and aspirations of employers influence their

attitude towards the domestic workers? What kind of tactics are developed by Filipina nannies in order to negotiate the conditions in the household and to challenge the control mechanisms? How do the migrant nannies manage their former identity while they experience conflicting class identities?

In this context, I will not only analyze the unknown relationship of Turkish employers and Filipina nannies, but I will also examine working conditions of Filipina nannies in Turkey while also pointing out how COVID-19 pandemic affected the terms and conditions of domestic labor in Turkey.

What Ms. A. went through may not be a typical example of Filipina domestic workers' experiences in Turkey, but it reveals how hard these women's life can get. Ms. A. is among many others who have migrated Turkey to provide a better future for their families left behind. Many women like Ms. A. see migration as the best option for the economic survival of their families. They escape from poverty, unemployment, and the other hardships in their country to create their own destiny. Although a lot of them are well-educated people, these women face less valued, not 'decent' and insecure jobs all around the world. They suffer but still try to survive against the harsh conditions of the jobs that are offered to them. Most of them prefer domestic work as it does not necessitate any technical skill and easier than the other jobs the migrants can do. Moreover, there is a growing demand for the migrant labor in the First World countries where middle class women freed themselves from the unpaid household chores while competing with male dominated job patterns (Dinçer, 2014). Although this growing demand partially stems from the entrance of middle-class women to labor force, restrictions on welfare state practices, change in the demographic structures i.e., aging population, and global reconstructing of the economy are also effective factors increasing the need for migrant work.

When it comes to supply side of migrant domestic workers, problems arising due to globalization, high unemployment rates, wage differentials between sending and host countries, and promotion of overseas work had huge impacts on

international migration flow, as well. As a result of global reconstructing and export-oriented production, countries with foreign debts and high unemployment rates found the solution in exporting labor force. Among those countries who promote migration to cope with “unemployment and external imbalance” (Rosewarne, 2012, p.64), Philippines has institutionalized the migration industry with a “manpower export policy” (Paul, 2011, p. 1846). Today, the country deploys more than 10 million of their citizens (Redfern, 2021), one in ten Filipinos, to 200 countries and generates over 34 billion dollars of remittance income each year (Solomon, 2009, p. 290; World Bank, 2019). Thus, it is the largest (Peng, 2017) labor exporting country and remittances of migrants are the biggest sources that bring foreign exchange to economy.

Overseas Filipino Workers (OFWs), mostly composed of women, leave their homes to reenter the domestic field by working internationally in domestic services. Due to the domestic and care deficit in the world, they find it more profitable to work as care workers and housekeepers than any other job in their home country, regardless of their level of education. As a result, more than 10 million Filipinas<sup>1</sup> (Redfern, 2021) are employed as global docile workers in the global houses of developed countries. Today, these migrant women are marketed to the world as “Mercedes Benz” of nannies (Guevarra, 2014, p.140) because their distinct qualifications and fluent English skills lead them to be perceived as ideal and desirable workers for foreign employers.

Filipinas have been working in Turkey as domestic workers since the 1990s (Özbay, 2019). Although their presence in the country “predates all post-socialist flows” (Akalın, 2014), the quite incremental nature of migration flow from the Philippines to Turkey is not acknowledged and does not have a presence in Turkish literature. Therefore, the main quest that led me to research Filipina nannies Turkey is their rising popularity among middle and upper-class families in Turkey especially in recent years. This popularity of Filipina nannies develops

---

<sup>1</sup> A female native or inhabitant of the Philippines, a female Filipino.



out of the expansion of live-in migrant workers in the country. Owing to the emergence of specialization according to nationality in care services (Deniz, 2018), migrant workers coming from Post-Soviet countries are preferred in sick or elderly care while Filipinas meet the demand for childcare. So, Filipinas are associated automatically with nanny duties in Turkey. Besides, Turkish employers benefit from the prestige of hiring a Filipina nanny that accounts for the high cost of this service, known by all, which also testifies to the family's economic capital to afford. In other words, the higher social standing can be reiterated while employing "scarce and luxurious" (Redlova, 2013, p. 204) nannies and the sense of the class distinction can be indicated with the intimacy in the employment relationship.

The domestic work literature of Turkey can be categorized into two groups. The first group of studies is generally about Turkish domestic workers who perform live-out performance-oriented jobs (Bora, 2005; Kalaycıoğlu & Rittersberger-Tılıç, 2001; Yıldırım alp, 2014; Özyeğin, 2001). The second group analyzes the migrant domestic and care workers who are from Moldova, Bulgaria, Ukraine, Azerbaijan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan (Dinçer, 2014; Ünal, 2006; Çelik, 2005; Kaşka, 2006; Koyuncu, 2018; Asanbekova, 2020). While variances exist with regard to study, most of the studies in the second group assesses the working conditions of live-in workers and exploitative features of the profession. Although these studies provide insight for domestic work and elderly care, there is a gap in the literature about migrant women who also perform childcare. Considering that Filipinas comprise most of the Turkish market on childcare, few studies have found on migrant Filipina domestic and care workers. These studies (Çeltikçi, 2019; Akalın, 2014) address the issue mainly based on the data provided by nannies or agencies, without contacting Turkish employers.

In order to understand both parts of this employment relationship, this research adds the much-needed layer of employer perception by sharing their experiences with Filipina nannies. It is important to focus on the relationship between employer and migrant domestic or care worker because this employment is

composed of complex set of dynamics at work around the world. This mainly stems from the informal nature of the work, the absence of social security, unclear job descriptions, and the coexistence of private and public spaces in the same setting. The live-in format of the job requires migrant workers to be locked up in global home prisons but at the same time embrace it as their homes. On the other hand, employers have no choice but to live and share their most private space with a stranger. Therefore, this employment has unique characteristics that force both employers and workers to make a deal for setting the boundaries and developing defense mechanisms.

This thesis consists of four main chapters other than introductory and concluding chapters. This introduction presents the objective and the question of the study. Besides, it sheds light on the position of migrant Filipina workers in the academic studies about domestic workers in Turkey.

The second chapter aims to reveal more in detail the existing topics in the relevant literature. I believe it is very essential to explore the framework of international migration and the impact of migrant work on cultural dynamics. Because global reconstructing affects each culture differently. In this context, the discussions on domestic labor, globalization, and international migration will be examined. Later, approaches to the case of Philippines, domestic work in the country, the identity and tactics of Filipina domestic workers, and strategic motivations of employers hiring Filipina nannies will be analyzed. In order to interlink the debates in the literature, the Turkish domestic labor market will also be reviewed and the position of Filipina migrant domestic workers in Turkey will be evaluated. Lastly, I will elaborate on the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic in light of the findings in the literature.

The third chapter seeks to explain the methodology and background of the study while pointing out the strengths and limitations of conducting interviews during the pandemic. The interviews with sixteen migrant Filipina domestic workers and nannies and nine Turkish employers will be presented. In addition, the

demographic profile of both migrant Filipina nannies and Turkish employers will be provided.

In the fourth chapter, the findings of the study related to the migration experiences and living conditions of Filipina nannies in Turkey. Starting with the reasons of migration, particularly to Turkey; the role of intermediary agencies, contracts and job description, working hours and leaves, wages and weekly allowance, work permits, and conditions after covid-19 will be discussed.

The fifth chapter aims to reflect the dynamics of the relationship between Turkish employers and Filipina nannies in the household. Employers' criteria to choose Filipina nannies and their priorities while hiring a nanny will be presented. Later, the strategies of employers in order to set the boundaries in the household will be discussed. Lastly, the experiences of Filipina nannies in Turkish households will be elaborated focusing on the identity management issues, tactics and coping mechanisms, workplaces abuses, and mental health.

In the last chapter, conclusions will be presented as a result of the debates in the previous chapters. Besides, what more could have been done in this study and what kind of new research is needed in this field will be reflected.

## **CHAPTER 2**

### **DISCUSSIONS ON DOMESTIC LABOR, GLOBALIZATION AND MIGRANT WORKERS**

Although the trend of hiring Filipina migrant workers is revealed in the world literature, the quite incremental nature of migration flow from the Philippines to Turkey has not been acknowledged and does not have a presence in Turkish literature. For this reason, it is crucial to shed light on Filipina migrant domestic workers' situations, experiences, and coping mechanisms in Turkey. Therefore, the purpose of the following literature review is to reveal firstly the existing topics in literature, regarding the cultural assets that make Filipinas the labor aristocracy of the domestic market, their multiple identities, and identity management issues in a different country and to investigate employers' distinction mechanisms and strategies. Thereby, the review will provide a framework to understand why it is important to find out and expand on the demand for, supply of, and experiences by Filipina domestic workers in Turkey. In order to interlink, the theoretical debates paid domestic work, globalization and international migration will be explained in the review.

#### **2.1. Domestic Labor**

I will start with the discussions in the literature regarding the unpaid nature of domestic work and its theorization as reproductive labor and continue with factors that fueled the demand for domestic workers globally, the care work's emotional and personal necessities, and secondary position of women in the service sector.

Domestic labor debate is discussed in literature firstly focusing on the unpaid nature of the job. Unpaid domestic work has always been seen as the natural duty of women who are caregivers and mothers. It is associated with the “cult of true womanhood” (Giles, Preston, & Romero, 2014, p. 119). ‘The Feminine Mystique (Friedan, 1963), also known as the idea that all women should be happy caring for their children and their household, which was imposed on society so much that the invisible work at home is accepted as a naturalized and uncompensated form of labor. Reviewing the literature, it is also seen that a feminist approach with an emphasis on the exploitation of women inside the household as a result of patriarchy is implemented (Walby, 1990; Hartmann, 1981). The discussions argue that patriarchal social structure allocates women to housework and men to outside jobs. Although women staying at home and providing free services to reduce subsistence expenses, it is men that are accepted as breadwinners and paired with productive labor. Therefore, the labor done in the private sphere by women is devalued while the one performed by men is valued (Lutz, 2016). As a result, this category of labor, which is not considered to produce value because it is not transformed into exchange value, remains invisible.

In this regard, theorizing the relationship of domestic labor to the capitalist economy became a major concern of feminist economists in the 1970s. According to Gardiner, “this potential within Marxism to explore the social relations underpinning economic activity, combined with its failure to acknowledge the role of domestic labor in the reproduction and maintenance of labor power” (2000, p. 82) encouraged feminists to apply Marxist economic theory to domestic labor. With the support of the women’s liberation movement and radical socialists in the new left, the 1970s domestic labor debate started to re-examine Marx’s economic theory. Although there were major disagreements on whether and how unwaged domestic labor contributed to capitalist profits, it is concluded that domestic labor at home gives capitalists bargaining power to lower wages than it could have been if the working-class purchase this service from the market (Gardiner, 2000). As an outcome of the debate Marxist concept

of the ‘reproduction of the laboring population’ or social reproduction is sought to be the solution to theorize domestic labor (Gardiner, 2000). What is meant by social reproduction for domestic labor is that households produce and sustain their members; if the income is high, they purchase this labor power for domestic work and household members reduce their domestic labor. This also includes care work as childcare or nursing care. Glenn explains the reproductive labor saying,

Reproductive labor includes activities such as purchasing household goods, preparing and serving food, laundering and repairing clothing, maintaining furnishings and appliances, socializing children, providing care and emotional support for adults, and maintaining kin and community ties (1992, p. 1).

Therefore, by using the concept of reproductive labor to describe domestic work, the debate achieved to lift the veil of the marginalized nature of domestic work.

While this made women’s unpaid work much more visible, it, unfortunately, hasn’t changed the problematic nature of the professionalization of domestic work. The informal nature of the domestic work, absence of social security, unclear job description, the use of private and public spaces in the same setting, and the people belonging to different races, backgrounds, classes, and cultures living under the same roof are the components that make this occupation problematic all around the world. According to Lutz, the employment relationship of domestic work is problematic since employers do not perceive this type of employment as a business relationship because it is generally performed in the private area and this makes workers “an invisible helper” (2016, p. 157). Moreover, she argues neither the low status nor the wages change when it is performed in a company or private household because housework is always attached to negative feelings like “disgust, shame and pain” (Lutz, 2016, p. 49). Furthermore, Parrenas believes reproductive work is like a commodity, which always remains low status, bought and sold in the market by class-privileged women (2000). Therefore, no matter what alters in the domestic work,

paid or unpaid, it is still considered devalued and the women who perform it are degraded (Anderson, 1990).

The commodification of household services has resulted in the expansion of the sector and an increase in the demand for labor. The question of “why domestic workers become essential in the middle-class households?” is one of the most debated issues in the literature (Momsen, 1999; Hondagneu-Sotelo, 1999; Lindio-McGovern, 2007). There are several answers to that question as in the twenty-first century, a new demand has arisen for domestic duties at home. The first reason for this demand is the restrictions on welfare state practices, especially in Europe. It can be shown that many services provided are covered by market conditions. The most important of these services is called the care service including the care of children, patients, elderly and disabled people, which is covered by paid labor (Yılmaz & Ulukan, 2010). The second reason for the demand for paid domestic work is the change in demographic structures. Here, especially the aging population of Western countries affected the need for care workers in the households (Anderson, 2000). Thirdly, the rise in women’s employment participation rate in developing and developed countries has had a substantial impact on the rise in demand for paid domestic labor. Arlie Hochschild explains this burden on women with the term “second shift” (1989) which refers to unpaid housework of the women who return from paid work. According to her, childcare and unpaid household labor such as cleaning and food preparation is traditionally expected to be performed by women. Nannies take over the burden of this second shift while the mother of the household participating in paid labor market. Although this burden of the housework is still performed by women, it allows working mothers to free themselves from unpaid housework (Gothoskar, 2013, p. 63).

Oishi argues that the global restructuring of the economy led to more middle-class women entering the labor market and so the income of the household has been doubled (Oishi, 2005). Besides many families have become “time-starved” (Oishi, 2005, p. 2-3) because of night shifts and competition in the market; the

global economy created “a new rich” (Oishi, 2005, p .2-3) class which finds the solution in hiring a migrant domestic worker who can both take care of the children and perform domestic duties. Lastly, although very few women work outside the home, there is also a demand in Middle Eastern countries where having a "domestic worker" is considered a status symbol. For all these reasons, middle- and upper-class families need caregivers / domestic workers who can work full-time or even as live-in (Kaşka, 2006).

The “personal and idiosyncratic nature” (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2007, p. 33) of this job when it includes the care of children and the elderly, becomes problematic in the definition. The reason for this problem is both the informal nature of the job and dealing with emotionally charged things. According to ILO, domestic work is defined as “the work performed for the household or inside a house”, and a domestic worker as “a person that does domestic work in respect of employment.” (ILO, 2011; ILO, 2013b, p. 7 - 10). However, when these duties include care of others, the *emotional labor* becomes active. Arlie Russel Hochschild’s concept of *emotional labor* suggests that in an intimate space like home, employers request some other performances from the worker like deference and obedience (Hochschild, 2003). Parrenas also defines as follows:

Emotional labor refers to the expectations of the employers to produce an emotional state in another person through face-to-face interactions and it is indicative of the employers’ control over the emotional activities of employees (2001, p. 171).

Furthermore, Hochschild emphasizes that employees can act in two ways as part of *emotional labor*; these are “surface acting” and “deep acting” (Hochschild, 2003, 35-36). Surface acting involves presenting appropriate facial expressions or postures that are not a result of genuine feelings but should be put on while working. Deep acting, on the other hand, is when working individuals try to feel the emotion that they should express as a part of 'themselves' (Hochschild, 2003, p. 35-36). As a result of these two types of acting, the employer that naturally has the upper hand comes up with more expectations with a heavier workload,



being unable to observe the true mental state of the workers. So, domestic workers who perform care duties out of necessity, also experience an intimate and much more personal bond with employers and this causes them to work with an emotional mask on their faces.

In addition, women rather than men constitute the majority of those who will be facing both physical and emotional work. An emphasis on the feminization of the service sector has also been pointed by many feminist authors as occupational gender segregation becomes more rigid (Walby & Bagguley, 1990; Treiman & Hartmann, 1981; Hakim, 1994). Authors criticize the horizontal and vertical segregations in the capitalist market as they reject the idea that women have less 'human capital' than men which restrain them from reaching occupations up in the hierarchy and perform duties that necessitate less skill and experience. Moreover, some theorists (Beechey, 1977; Bruegel, 1979) have applied Marx's concept of the reserve army of labor to explain women's secondary position in this market. According to them, women are an integral part of the reserve army of labor as they prefer part-time and informal jobs in order to balance their work and duties at home. So, the service sector and duties like domestic and care work have become feminized as a result of the double burden that women have to balance. Ecevit touches on this point:

Working informally is not a choice but an obligation for women. Unregistered employment in the industry and service sector is a way especially for small businesses to survive. When women cannot find regular, secure jobs, they have to accept these informal jobs. They cannot negotiate wages, can be fired in times of economic crisis, and are completely deprived of pension rights (2011, p. 31).

Thus, segregated in the market, women do not choose but become obliged to work in the domestic service sector. The low status of these service jobs results in physical, economic, and ideological invisibility of women (Bora, 2005) and strengthens the idea that they can only perform devalued and ignored jobs.

This section has first highlighted, the discussions regarding the unpaid nature of domestic work and its theorization as reproductive labor. Domestic labor is theorized and accepted as productive both through the notion of social reproduction and due to the rise in demand for paid domestic labor by middle-class families has been explained by changing demographic structures and privatization of care services. The personal and intimate relationship of care work led employers to expect not only physical but also emotional labor from domestic workers. Lastly, I have emphasized the feminization of the service sector due to the part-time and informal nature of the jobs. Keeping these points in mind, the scholarly attention is given then the question; why is there a trend to hire migrant workers when countries have their own nationals as paid domestic workers? To further investigate the answers to this question and the international reproductive labor flow from Third World countries to First World, the following section will examine the integral parts of globalization and international migration.

## **2.2. Globalization of Domestic and Care Work**

I will now attempt to make an overall assessment of the studies that analyze globalization, neo-liberalization, international debt crisis, and structural adjustment policies because these phenomena are essential to understand the overseas paid domestic labor market in the Philippines and how and why it started. Economic globalization has changed the employment patterns of migrant workers, especially domestic workers, therefore, it is a crucial term that leads us to the process of integration to the global market. Since this migration flow is highly gendered, the feminization of the migrant labor force will also be examined.

Creating a notable impact for the developing countries, the phenomenon of globalization is examined primarily on economic grounds within the context of international migration. The literature on the globalization of paid domestic work

generally addresses its economic side. For example, while defining globalization, Moghadam says,

The increasingly integrated and interdependent system of capital-labor flows across regions, between states, and through transnational corporations and international financial institutions, in the form of capital investment, technology transfer, financial exchanges, and increased trade, as well as the various forms of deployment of labor, by which global accumulation takes place. (Moghadam, 1999, p. 130)

She focuses on all the economic global activities which include the mobility of capital and therefore, people. For Joseph Stiglitz (2006), economic globalization refers to the “closer economic integration of the countries of the world through the increased flow of goods and services, capital, and even labor” (Stiglitz, 2006, p. 4). Likewise, Thorin argues that this process results in “greater economic interdependence among countries through international trade, capital flows, and international production” (Thorin, 2001, p. 11). Thus, serious changes in the economy, the flow of goods significantly under the name of market competition have mostly affected the developing countries which try to integrate themselves into the global market.

The international debt crisis can be thought of as the cornerstone of economic globalization as it resulted in huge unemployment rates for the developing countries and Structural Adjustment Programs (SAPs) became a primary condition for integration to global economics. After the crisis in 1973, new and flexible production systems and neoliberal economics were needed to solve the economic problems (Atatimur, 2008). SAPs, implemented by the countries with low-income levels, were seen as a savior to cope with international competitiveness. The new neoliberal economic programs applied in this period were based on the reduction of public expenditures, privatization, and the low unit labor costs brought about by excessive mechanization that did not require much labor. Although the aim of these policies was cutting expenditures, liberalization of the labor market, opening new markets to foreign direct investment, privatization of enterprises, elimination of state subsidies (Chang,

2000), the results were not enough to cope with growing international debts. As Pyle and Ward state in their article regarding SAPs, most of the developing countries shifted to more open “export-oriented” production rather than “import substitution” (2003, p. 464). Hence, rather than solving the crisis problem, these policies have created big costs for the economy and have not reduced the debt while actually creating a big growth in unemployment because of export-oriented production (Sassen, 2000).

The nations implementing SAPs; Mexico, Turkey, Philippines, Pakistan, Nigeria, Ghana, Sudan, Zimbabwe, Argentina, Tunisia, Kenya, etc. (Sandford, 1997), suffered a lot from external debt, rising unemployment, and deteriorating conditions. Being one of the ineffective examples of SAPs, Mexico increased the foreign investment after SAPs, however, the country is left with more debt, unemployment, and fewer wages (Kefferstan, 2017). The severe cut in public expenditure especially in health, education, and welfare programs also affected Mexican people who live in poverty. Similarly, in Ghana poverty rates increased post adjustment as the cutbacks in government expenditures replicated similar negative impacts across Latin America (Kefferstan, 2017). Other studies reflect the devastating impacts of SAPS in Africa (Musa & Mohammed, 2021; Kawewe & Dibie, 2000). For example, in Zimbabwe, external and internal contradictions resulting from SAPs led to falling incomes, unemployment, increase in external debt, falling export, and rising refugee problems (Kawewe & Dibie, 2000). Similarly in Sudan, the increased imports, rapid rise in prices of consumer goods, lower production, and reduced investments hurt economic growth as well as unemployment rates (Musa & Mohammed, 2021). In Turkey, export-oriented policies adopted after SAPs and the promotion of direct foreign investment worsened the income inequality in the country (Şenses, 1991). Lastly in the Philippines, the foreign debt and stagnation after SAPs created half of the society living under the poverty line because of unemployment that further changes the migration patterns all over the world (Bello, 1999).

Neoliberalism “created new freedoms for capital and new restrictions on labor” (O’Connor, 2010, p.697). Although the structure of capital accumulation prevents the free circulation of labor and neoliberal reordering of capitalism made capital more mobile than labor, there are some special cases especially in the Third World countries that high unemployment rates as a result of export-oriented production is only solved by promoting migration of the service sector to the First World countries. These countries made bilateral labor agreements to facilitate safe and legal migration routes to their citizens and it was “a most promising way to promote economic development” (Chilton & Woda, 2021, p.1). Therefore, as cheap and flexible labor force in service sector, women’s labor regarded as valuable for this new economy. Hofman & Buckley summarizes it as follows:

As women’s migration incentives increase, destination countries are undergoing complementary economic, demographic, and social changes that expand opportunities for female migrant workers. Employment opportunities are shifting from male-dominated heavy industries toward traditionally female areas: services, hospitality, entertainment, and light manufacturing (Pettman, 1998; Cheng, 1999). Population aging and the entry of native women into the professional workforce create demand in female-dominated employment sectors (healthcare, eldercare, and domestic work sectors) that native workers are reluctant to fill (Ehrenreich and Hochschild, 2002), generating highly feminized and ethnically segregated occupational niches (del Rio and Alonso-Villar, 2012) (2013, p. 510).

As a result of the commodification of migration in the 1990s, Asian and Latin American women from economically underdeveloped Third World countries had to work in-home services, sex tourism, and entertainment sectors in the First World. As Lingham states “with loss and decline in employment opportunities, in general, the physical body is becoming the site of work for women and young girls” (2005, p. 4-5).

To support their family and themselves, women are forced to migrate somewhere else to work, and this increasing migration flow dominated by women is called the “feminization of migration” (Castles & Miller, 1998, p.16). Initial research on the feminization of migration demonstrates that this forced migration is an act

of sacrifice for women who see migrant work as an opportunity to fulfill their motherly responsibilities for their family (Hondagneu-Sotelo and Avila, 1997; Keough, 2006). On the other hand, for capitalists, it means a contribution to specific needs of industrial economies with a cheaper, docile, and flexible labor force, therefore, contribute to the globalization of capital and reproduction of capitalism (Cohen, 2006 cited in Cooper, 2011). Sassen also talks about these migrant women within her notion of “counter-geographies of globalization” arguing that the role of these women in cross-borders is important and she calls it “feminization of survival” (2000, p. 511) as societies, governments, and many others dependent on the earnings and taxes of these migrant women. Thus, jobs regarded as “3D” category (dirty, difficult, and dangerous) in literature are performed by migrant women who are sought for their labor power in advanced economies (Michel, 2010; Kaşka, 2006). These 3D jobs are generally informal and necessitate women to work “in poor working conditions, low wages, lack of security and a decrease in bargaining power” (Avcı, 2019, p.44). So, taking on these low-status jobs, women fill the gap of cheap labor force arising from globalization all around the world and migration becomes feminized.

The demand for domestic work increased the feminization of migration more than any other field of work (Lutz, 2008). After the alterations in the structure of the global economy and the international division of labor, this new demand has arisen, and it is supplied by more and more women joining the global labor migration mainly in the care sector (Cooper, 2011). The literature on the impact of globalization in caregiving and domestic work shows that there is concern towards migrant women who belong to Third World countries in Southeast Asia. The majority of the studies focus on migrants from the Philippines, Indonesia, and Vietnam to reflect their experiences, ideals, and motivations (Asis et al., 2004; Ueno, 2010; Arnado, 2010; Phuong et al., 2015).

I will now turn to examine the studies on which factors fuel the demand to employ migrant domestic workers and, on the issues, related to working as a migrant domestic worker as a result of globalization.

Discussions on outsourcing migrant domestic work highlight that both family and state rely on the free market to compensate for three deficits- “time deficit”, “job deficit” and “care deficit” (Estevez-Abe & Hobson, 2015). Globalization leads states to a global competition to which they try to adjust themselves under the conditions of the new economic order. As a result of policies that decrease the support for social services such as child and elderly care, the forms of service and service providers have changed. Firstly, women in the age of globalization have freed themselves from unpaid daily house tasks as they have also started to participate in an educated labor force. Bora states that the presence of housekeepers makes it possible for middle-class women to avoid confrontation with the traditional division of labor and to perceive themselves as "equals" with men (2005, p. 124). In order to fit in managerial jobs and compete with male-dominated job patterns (Dinçer, 2014), they have become, as we mentioned earlier, “time-starved” (Oishi,2005, p. 2-3). Therefore, a “time deficit” occurred for them not having time for the care of children and the elderly. Secondly, higher value-added technologies and a knowledge-based economy (Estevez-Abe & Hobson, 2015, p.135) have intensified the need for skilled human capital so for the unskilled jobs in wealthy countries a ‘job deficit’ has occurred. Thirdly, demographic aging and increasing labor force participation of women (Ehrenreich and Hochschild, 2003) have led people to seek private live-in migrant domestic and care workers so that the ‘care deficit’ problem might be eliminated. To sum up, as a result of the changes led by globalization, the form of service transformed into live-in and service providers has become the women of the Third World.

As Yeoh & Huang states “new geographies produced by globalization and, in particular, the creation of a hierarchy of global cities, have reconfigured and multiplied the ‘lines of flight’ open to migrant women” (2010, p. 220). Since mobilities become easier all around the world, those who try to integrate themselves into new economic order become obliged to migrate as a result of poverty (Ehrenreich & Hochschild, 2003) and diminished market conditions. However, it should also be pointed out that other people in the country of origin

are too poor to migrate (Parrenas, 2000). So, we can say that relative poverty is a push factor for these women to migrate but it is not totally the reason. It is actually the unemployment and reserve army of labor that is caused by economic globalization and SAPs according to Chang (2000) that lead migrants to work in domestic and caregiving jobs. Sarti and Lutz suggest that these migrants are usually educated and middle-class women who are qualified but cannot find suitable jobs for themselves and become obliged to migrate and perform less prestigious jobs in order to earn higher salaries and thus, support their families left behind (Lutz, 2016 as cited in Avci, 2019, p. 45).

Furthermore, it is also highlighted in the literature that globalization of domestic work has increased precarious and devalued working conditions for migrant domestic workers while constraining them to work without a written contract and social protection. Since migrant women usually work as live-in, this leads them to work in a way that is available to their employers around the clock (Yılmaz &Ulukan, 2010). Living-in option also threatens the security and wellness of these domestic women as they face malnutrition, maltreatment, physical and mental brutality, low wages, passport deprivation, and sometimes non-payment of salary (Constable, 2007; Parrenas, 2000; Tyner, 1999, van der Ham, 2014; Kennelly, 2008). Governments benefit as a result of the improvement that migration brings to their nations and the number of women involved in paid work has increased thanks to globalization, but this increase has not prevented women from being concentrated in low income and risky jobs (Ecevit, 2007). In short, as a result of globalization migrant domestic workers are preferred as a cheap and flexible labor force for employers in the First World and they leave their families, occupations, and educational background behind to become domestic workers in a global household.

Economic globalization that countries experienced led many of them to adopt export-oriented production strategies and the physical body has become the one that is exported in the end. The new migration flow from Third World countries to First World increased women's participation rate in the labor market but they



have had to concentrate on part-time, informal, or insecure jobs mostly in-service sector. This has led many of them to work without a contract, illegal, low-paid, and low-status jobs (Etiler & Lordoğlu, 2012). Feminization of transnational domestic labor has also accelerated after globalization as employers of the First World sought to ease their burden “by hiring a recent immigrant, a working-class woman, a woman of color, or all three” and created “a racial division of reproductive labor” (Glenn, 1992, p. 7). Following this racial division, the next section will examine the Philippines to understand the world’s biggest labor export-oriented country and its government policies.

### **2.3. Global Domestic and Care Work: A Case of Philippines**

I now turn to the state-led industrialization of the migrant workforce in the Philippines while focusing on the policies, criticisms, and migrant categories. I will also try to shed light on the literature about migrant Filipina domestic workers, their assets, and types of capital. Besides, Filipino identity management in a different country, multiple identity issues and tactics to cope with employers will be discussed. Lastly, to highlight both parties of this relationship as discussed in the literature, employers’ reasons and perceptions while hiring Filipina domestic workers will also be examined.

The Philippines is one of three nations in Asia – with Indonesia and Sri Lanka – that promotes labor migration most to cope with ‘unemployment and external imbalance’ (Rosewarne, 2012, p.64). Adopting a “manpower export policy” (Paul, 2011, p. 1846) as a solution for excess labor force in the country, the Philippines institutionalized the migration industry with more than 10 million citizens working in over 200 countries (Asis, 2006). Today, the country deploys the largest export of government-sponsored short-term contracts for workers around the world. Most of these short-term/temporary jobs taken on by the migrant domestic workers do not necessitate any technical skill, and the national

markets accept Filipinos<sup>2</sup> as a result of bilateral relations with Western countries. Between 60-80% of these migrants are women (Asis et al., 2004) and it is fair to say that Filipinas have assimilated migration into their culture (Asis, 2006) and the Filipino diaspora keeps spreading throughout the world. How did this state-led export of domestic workers become the most important policy of a country?

The Philippine state has a prominent role in the promotion of overseas labor force as it uses direct initiatives to supply government-sponsored contract labor. One of the essentials of this policy is the discursive marketing of a “globally desirable workforce “in other words, inexpensive and docile labor (Tyner, 1999). In the early 1970s, the Philippines started to deploy labor to oil-rich Gulf countries. In 1973, the oil crises took place in the countries like UAE, Kuwait, Saudi Arabia, Iran, Iraq, and Bahrain (Gueverra 2009). President Marcos “attempted to reincorporate Filipino immigrants into the Philippine economy through the ‘Balikbayan’ (nation returnee) Program in 1973” (Rodriguez, 2002, p. 345-346). This program gave the returnees a unique public status as long as the cash (typically US dollars because of increasing oil prices) was transferred to or spent in the Philippines to strengthen the Philippine economy. In 1974, Ferdinand Marcos launched the Labor Code to comply with export-oriented industrialization. The Labor Code was a measure against increasing unemployment in the country and encouraged overseas agreement work (Guevarra, 2014). With the promotion of the new establishment Philippines Overseas Employment Administration (POEA), the Labor Code institutionalized the labor export policy of the Philippines. POEA was responsible to monitor the supply and the demand of countries for Filipina domestic workers on a global scale (Santos, 2005).

Philippines invested in signing bilateral labor agreements more than any other nation in the world (Chilton & Woda, 2021) as these agreements are the safe and legal ways to promote migration and at the same time a way to control

---

<sup>2</sup> A native or inhabitant of the Philippines, or a person of Filipino descent.

conditions in the host countries. Philippines signed bilateral labor agreements with Qatar in 1997, Norway in 2001, Indonesia and Bahrain in 2003, Spain in 2006 and the United Arab Emirates in 2007 (Chilton & Woda, p. 36). These treaties protect the rights of migrant workers. By having bilateral agreements, both parties mutually recognize the agreement on human resources (Wickramasekara, 2015). For example, the bilateral agreement with Saudi Arabia on domestic worker recruitment states that:

The Parties shall work towards a mutually acceptable recruitment and deployment system for Filipino domestic workers for employment in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, pursuant to the applicable laws, rules and regulations. 2. Adopt a standard employment contract for domestic workers, the text of which shall have been accepted by the competent authorities of the two countries, which shall be binding among the contracting parties (Employer, Domestic Worker, Saudi Recruitment Office and Philippine Recruitment Agency) (Wickramasekara, 2018).

So, these agreements direct the flow of migrant workers, promote new migration routes and protect the rights in the host countries.

All these arrangements and export-oriented economic regulations led authors to criticize the Philippine government and the state. For instance, Solomon calls the Philippine state a “reterritorialized state” (Solomon, 2009, p. 279) as he argues most of the economic and political activities of the Philippines occur outside the territories of the state. Furthermore, Guevarra argues that the Philippines is a “labor brokerage state”:

By labor brokering, I am referring to not only how Filipinos are marketed as global labor but also how the Philippine state, through its connections with the private employment agencies, enacts its ruling power through this process. This is at the core of a Foucauldian understanding of political power whereby “government” is the ‘domain of strategies, techniques, and procedures’ (Rose and Miller 1992, 183) through which ruling bodies can fulfill their goals and interests (2009, p. 7)

Thus, the Philippines, in need of foreign exchange, maximizes its profit mainly on Overseas Filipino Workers through private employment agencies and

bilateral agreements with developed countries with the help of their innovative form of labor export. Besides, as a technique to encourage overseas contract workers, the government declared, in 1988, that Overseas Filipino Workers (OFW) are Modern-Day National Heroes. By doing that, they gave migrants welfare rights, health benefits and encouraged them to take pride in being migrant. So, this heroism of migrant workers, while honoring them for their sacrifices for the nation, was used deliberately by the state to create and guarantee remittances (Solomon, 2009). It is also stated that National Heroes promote friendly relations with foreign countries and develop the image of the Philippines as a respected source of labor (Guevarra, 2009). To sum up, government strategies to promote overseas employment result in “over 14 billion dollars of remittance income generated” (Solomon, 2009, p. 290) each year to the economy of the Philippines but at the same time, it creates millions of unskilled workers who leave their countries and families to work as inexpensive and docile workers.

With the support of the government, the labor export process from the Philippines to the world started, and gradually the routes have extended. At first, the government controlled the recruitment processes with the Philippines Overseas Employment Administration (POEA) and Overseas Workers Welfare Administration (OWWA) (Asis, 2006). However, after 1976, POEA regulated the private sector and recruitment agencies took control of the bureaucratic necessities of migration processes (Solomon, 2009). However, recruitment agencies have caused “illegal recruitment, contract substitution, illegal placement fees, long working hours and no days off” (Asis, 2017). POEA puts more measures to regulate the illegal means of migration and categorizes migrants into three categories in order to organize Overseas Filipino Workers. The first group is Temporary/Contract Labor who are the temporary migrant OFWs that will return to the country after their expiration. The second one is permanent residents who do not have work contracts therefore not necessary to go back to the country of origin. Lastly, the third one is irregular migrants that exceed their work permits or residence and are not documented (Akalin, 2014).

POEA aimed to deploy a million overseas workers in 2001 (Asis, 2006) and bilateral labor agreements (with USA, UK, Spain, UAE, Qatar, etc.) (POEA Annual Report, 2003) made this target easier to reach. So, with the help of government and private recruitment agencies, Overseas Filipino Workers have been exported to the countries where they are mostly demanded.

Hence, the Philippines represents an example of state-supported temporary contract labor in Asia to sustain remittance income for the economy of the country. Studies reflect that (Peng, 2017; Solomon, 2009; Oishi, 2005) the country started this labor program as a temporary solution for the economic problems and unemployment, however, it turned out as a permanent part of the economy of the Philippines. Right now, deploying unskilled, especially female domestic workers, the Philippines is the largest (Peng, 2017) labor exporting country, and the institutionalized migration policies are one of the biggest sources of acquiring foreign exchange to economy. Filipinas outnumbered Filipinos in labor migration and this prevailing flow of feminized migration has drawn the attention of scholars who want to understand what makes these women more desirable than their counterparts from other countries.

### **2.3.1. Filipina Domestic and Care Workers**

With the assumption of low wages and the limited number of job opportunities in their home country, many Filipina see working abroad as a better option than staying in the Philippines (Dolaman, 2010). So, Filipinas leave their homes to reenter the domestic field by working internationally in domestic and caregiving jobs. The scholarly attention regarding Filipinas shows that they are educated labor force who choose domestic work to transform the unpaid labor in their own home into wage labor internationally (Tolentino, 1996). This section aims to introduce Filipina domestic labor, their image in the international labor market, and cultural capital and demonstrate the commodification of linguistic capital discussion occurring with the marketing of language as a result of Filipina nanny migration.

Represented in literature as the labor aristocracy of the domestic labor market (Akalin, 2014) or “Mercedes Benz” of nannies (Guevarra, 2014, p.140), Filipinas have distinct qualifications that lead them to be perceived as ideal and desirable workers for foreign employers. First of all, they are marketed to the world as “docile, dexterous, always-ready, and cheap woman worker” (Salzinger, 2003, p.10). Identified with certain characteristics in Asian culture, kind, helpful, the easygoing attitude of Filipinas, and their obedient at the same time tolerant nature is their first asset (Ayaydin, 2020) for global employers. Besides, they are also represented as well-educated laborers as “80 percent of Filipinas are college graduates and the remaining 20 percent were high school graduates” (Ayaydin, 2020, p.177). The education in the Philippines had been restructured by the government after the export-oriented industrialization applied. “A bilingual education policy was set in motion... English was to be used as the medium of instruction even in science and mathematics” (Lorente, 2007, p. 92). Today, being a high school graduate is a precondition for these women to migrate from the Philippines. So educated labor force has been raised in the Philippines after the 1970s. Most importantly, their privileged position as proficient English speakers doubled their desirability around the world, especially in the Middle Eastern and Gulf countries where there is a firm belief in the privilege of speaking English. The government of the Philippines reconstructed their curriculum according to “work-oriented” programs and “a renewed emphasis on English and a shift towards vocational and technical English training. The Marcos government’s strong support of English was due primarily to its crucial role in meeting the labor requirements of the Philippine economy” (Tollefson, 1991, p. 150). Thus, Filipinas, with the help of their government on educational reforms have become ideal nannies and domestic helpers for the globalized world.

Pierre Bourdieu’s conceptualization of capital is significant to understand the Filipina domestic workers’ value in the market. According to him not only the mode of production or material goods but also the stratified social world and social practices such as immaterial forms of exchange, cultural aspects of class,

are essential to analyze the power relations among classes and inequalities. He mentions four types of capital that lead people to acquire power. These are; economic, cultural, social, and symbolic capitals (1986). The one who owns the economic capital does not necessarily have the cultural or social one and this leads to the need for practices that can bring, as Bourdieu describes, ‘symbolic power’ (Swartz, 2015, p. 129). This symbolic power is unequally distributed in society and it can be cultural (titles, language, education), social (resources and networks), or symbolic (authority, respect, status). Especially the cultural capital becomes a tool that guarantees upward mobility (Swartz, 2015). Linguistic capital (1991) for Bourdieu is an important part of cultural capital as it necessitates fluency and being comfortable with the language that is spoken. English can be a perfect example of this. Since people who know English as a second language all around the world can be considered to have linguistic capital, it is usually associated with the dominant group in the society (Lorente, 2007) and it has become a high-status symbol for many others. However, as in other capitals, linguistic capital is unevenly distributed and Bourdieu asserts that; “The unequal distribution of linguistic capital...provides this struggle with its object, its weapons, and its framework” (Jenkins, 2002, p. 154). So, considering that Filipina domestic workers and nannies speak fluently in English, the language capital becomes a *sign of wealth* and at the same time *sign of authority* (Bourdieu, 1991) for employers who believe in the power of this capital.

While Filipinas use their linguistic capital as a source of income, it is criticized in the literature that commodification of linguistic capital occurs once “monetary, instrumental and symbolic values” (Ruanni & Tupas, 2008, p. 98) are attached to language by the market. According to Tupas, commodification of linguistic capital applies primarily to how many local languages have become prized commodities in cultures that historically used them exclusively as identification markers (Ruanni & Tupas, 2008). So, rather than being a source of identity, languages can become a source of profit. The Philippines protect their national identity by speaking Filipino but they promote commodification of linguistic capital with English as a second official language of the country. Yet,

while capitalizing on commodification of linguistic capital the state policies cause “brain waste” as commodified Filipinas take on jobs that do not match with their skill sets (Battistella & Liao, 2013). Filipinas who are college or high school graduates and experienced workers become obliged to migrate as a result of unemployment in the country and they become overqualified workers who perform unskilled jobs in the First World. Certain problems later arise regarding their self-perceptions as a result of this brain waste. Thus, the prominence of English for Filipinas presents more than a linguistic capital and it is highly related to past, present, and future issues of the country that the language becomes a solution to the conflict between clashing economic interests (Tollefson, 1991).

The main point made in the literature regarding Filipinas is that they are ‘always-ready kind, submissive and obedient workers who fill up the demand for care workers with their educational background and fluent English skills. Their cultural capital, bilingual education, and efficient working programs lead them to be perceived as ideal commodities that are undoubtedly better than any other nationals for the domestic and care work around the world. It is also reflected by authors (Ueno,2010; Liao & Gan, 2020) that they create “global competitiveness” (Lorente and Tupas, 2002) wherever they go and become models to countries that want to coordinate similar migration models. Yet still, marketed to the world as ideal migrant nannies, Filipina domestic workers have to manage and create survival methods to cope with challenges in their new global houses, which is the topic of discussion in the next section.

### **2.3.2. Filipina Identity and Survival Tactics**

Filipinas become obliged to work as domestic workers abroad as a result of lack of employment opportunities in their country and their psychologies are affected by the split and separation from their families together with a culture shock while getting used to a new country and joining a new family. Within this conflict of assimilation, they experience paradoxes regarding their new positions



and face confinement in the global houses (Arnado, 2010). All these leads them to reconstruct and manage their identities while using coping mechanisms, “social dramas” (Turner, 1975) or “performances” (Goffman, 1956).

First of all, Filipina identities are reconstructed in the countries that they work as domestic workers or nannies which help them to cope with their daily life disruptions and vulnerable conditions. From the very beginning of this journey, these migrant women know that this will be a self-sacrificial process but actually they take all risks to provide themselves upward economic mobility (Bolante, 2014). Unfortunately, they feel devalued as a result of having not ‘decent’ or insecure jobs although they are college graduates or experienced people in some other occupations in their own country. This leads them to develop self-identity management systems by which they differentiate themselves from other domestic workers from other nationalities by focusing on their strengths like higher educational level or better English skills (Vargas & Garabiles & Halls, 2019). So, Filipinas while disassociating themselves from “maids” and drawing a hierarchical line to distinguish themselves, look for reconciliation to their conflicting class identities. In Arnado’s study (2010) about Filipinas in Singapore, she discusses the contradictory roles at home and destination countries that lead women to perform what Turner calls “social dramas” that consist of the breach, crisis, redressive action, the reintegration or schism phases (1975). In the breach phase, women split from their country and they try to get used to the new one; in the crisis phase they experience contradictory realities and separation nervousness; to solve and ease the problems in the crisis, in the redressive action phase emotional persistence and decisiveness are needed and lastly, in the reintegration phase they either redefine their identities while creating bonds with the employers and the country so they integrate themselves to society in “time-performance continuum loop” (Arnado, 2010, p. 134) or “legitimation of irreparable schism between contesting parties” occurs (Turner, 1975, p. 42) which means disintegration in the social group. Besides, according to Ueno’s study of Filipina domestic workers in Singapore, domestic workers obtain a new “identity kit” to compensate for their damaged identity, they recall

their previous social and family roles, foresee a future identity when they have good life retiring, acquiring additional skills to value their current status as a maid, creating new titles and meaning to the domestic work (2010, 84). Hereby, they try to identify themselves not as “modern-day slaves” or inadequate mothers but as fighters and devoted nationals so that “they can inhabit the self-sacrificing identity and dispose of an inadequate identity which just reinforces feelings of being unappreciated” (Vargas & Garabiles & Halls, 2019, p. 990).

Furthermore, Filipina migrant domestic workers maintain multiple identities in segregated social spaces (Lan, 2003) especially in their relationship with employers. Goffman explains this by arguing that individuals have more than one identity and he can select their identities according to their repertoire to behave in certain ways (Goffman, 1956). Thus, they can demonstrate their ideal self to the social world through what Goffman calls “performances”. Arnado explains Filipina domestics in light of Goffman’s performance theory stating that if she is a neophyte, she can behave inattentive or contrived and it might result in a “slip performance” or, on the other hand, if she is experienced, she can act with sincerity, lie or seem like happy to the employer as her performance is mastered in time (Arnado, 2010). Moreover, Lan researching the formation of identity for Filipinas working in Taiwan discusses Goffman’s self-presentation (1956) through the front/backstage distinction and finds out that Filipinas perform behaviors that manifest deference and acquiescence in front of employers, however, in contrast on Sundays they perform off-stage identity while wearing miniskirts and exchanging the secrets of their employers in a bad manner (Lan, 2003, p. 153-154). Similarly, Akalın shows in her research about Filipinas in Turkey that they rent houses to gather on Sundays after going to church to reflect their true identities while making their own foods, karaoke singing, drinking alcohol (Akalın, 2007). However, when they return to the global home prisons, they are forced to suppress their identities reflecting a new form of it. Then, while maintaining more than one identity and switching it once it is necessary, through performances and self-presentation techniques, Filipinas cope with their employers in the global households.

In their working habitats, Filipinas also have to utilize some tactics to subvert the control of employers. These tactics can be analyzed in Scott's and De Certeau's conceptualization of everyday resistance. James Scott in his book *Weapons of the Weak: Everyday Forms of Peasant Resistance* (1985) mentions the act of resistance of Malaysian peasants to mitigate domination of the elite. He says workers use ordinary weapons to resist such as "foot-dragging, dissimulation, false compliance, pilfering, feigned ignorance, slander, arson, sabotage and so forth" (1985, p. 30). According to him, these are acts of powerless groups and the "art of resistance" when they face the actions of dominant ideologies. Scott's main focus is the societal, everyday interactions between people (hegemony vs. the subordinate), claiming that there are two layers in this constant process of resistance, which appear in the form of public and hidden transcripts (1990, p.18). Public transcripts shed light on the basic, power-oriented dynamic between the powerful and the subordinate and can be witnessed in several forms such as verbal interactions between the two sides. Scott's introduction of an additional layer, in the form of a hidden transcript, suggests that there is also an unconscious realm of the power relationships and the resistance towards the hegemony. In other words, a reaction towards the dominant side can be performed in disguise, with anonymous messengers (individuals) beyond the everyday interactions, with the core motivation of avoiding suppression as much as possible (1990). While analyzing domestic workers, Scott (1990) asserts that domestic workers earn the trust of their employers and reduce their control over them. They pretend unaware of surveillance cameras, say "yes ma'am" to any harsh demands while disguising their true feelings, consuming the food prepared for employers, and talking behind them (Scott, 1990). He also mentions criminal acts like petty theft or pilfering suggesting these are acts of self-interested weapons of the weak (1985). De Certeau's ideas have many parallels with Scott's conceptualization of power relationships. However, unlike Scott, the main focus for de Certeau is the actions of the oppressed as he calls "the art of the weak" (1984, p. 97). In his claims, de Certeau is not primarily interested in the motives of the previously mentioned everyday resistance. Instead, he portrays the landscape with the key concepts of "strategy" and "tactic", also

providing information about their dynamic (1984, p. 36-37). De Certeau directly associates strategy with the actors having the hegemonic presence against the oppressed, mainly for control and maintaining order. On the other hand, the tactic is the tool of resistance for the oppressed which can be conducted based on the gaps and blind spots of a strategy. Both ideas claimed by Scott & de Certeau suggest that the power relationships between the parties of hegemony and the oppressed can be seen on a daily, societal basis invisible and more subtle ways. Moreover, it is also possible to formulate the maneuvers both sides apply towards one another in order to maintain and improve their specific positioning within the power relationship.

For Filipinas, an effective method to avoid the authority of employers and an opportunity to create a time of their own, lying becomes an undeniable tactic (Akalin, 2016). In her study regarding Filipinas in Turkey, Akalin draws on Virno (2013a) in stating that:

Lying is not just a tactic against power. As it inserts itself into the locus of contention between abstract and living labor, it not only protects the identity of the worker but renegotiates the value of the labor power in its biopolitical composition as rendered by a migrant body (Akalin, 2016, p.206).

Thus, tactics as the *incorporation of subversive activities* (Parrenas, 2001) allow Filipina domestic workers to draw some boundary lines in their working schedules or rearrange their duties especially in the countries where verbal contracts are made. It at the same time helps domestic workers to shape up employers' emotions. As they are expected to be deferent and obedient, any deviation from this passive behavior by crying, becoming very quiet or unresponsive to employers' lead employers to apologize or feel guilty and get manipulated by the emotional script (Parrenas, 2001, p.152-153)

Hence, traveling for upward mobility, Filipina women cope with their new downward status while distinguishing themselves from other domestic workers, using identity management tools and tactics. Dramatic conditions that they

encounter are overcome in time and they become a different person than they arrive in destination countries. Multiple identities, front and backstage performances, lies, and tactics are all coping mechanisms that they need to survive. Otherwise, they could not handle the emotional burden of their mission.

### **2.3.3. Employing a Filipina Domestic Worker**

The hiring of Filipina nannies and domestic workers by employers in the First World has two main advantages, living with a global ideal worker and a multi-prestige element. Regarding employers, Redlova states that they see Filipinas not only as “all round house keepers who can speak English and become a governess to children” (2013, p.199) but also “scarce and luxurious” (2013, p. 204) helpers that can bring prestige to the family they work for. Besides, if migrant workers do not know the language of the destination country, it makes them desirable for employers who consider their privacy. Researches (Lan, 2003; Redlova, 2013; Yeoh & Huang, 1999) about employers hiring Filipinas clearly shows status reproduction, habitus embodiment, and boundary work approach in the employment of Filipina domestic and care workers.

In order to enhance the social recognition and distinction among their own class, employers consider the symbolic gain that they are likely to attain thanks to the image of their domestic helpers and nannies. Researches about the employment of Filipina domestic and care workers (Lan, 2003; Redlova, 2013; Yeoh & Huang, 1999) shows that employers hire them not only for the purposes of labor production but also for status reproduction. Anderson (2000) explains this with her term “status reproducers” and argues that middle classes reproduce their lifestyles and status while looking more modern thanks to their domestic workers. For Filipinas in Turkey, “perfection in the performance of housekeeping, proficiency in the English language, ‘modern’ clothing, and around-the-clock presence in the household” (Weyland, 1994, p. 85) are preferred as these all are indicators of status. Moreover, for Bourdieu, agents seek not difference but the distinction and their social identities are made

through distinction (2015). Besides, this symbolic gain for distinction can be explained in relation to habitus, an important sociological concept by Bourdieu which is a system of durable, transposable dispositions of production (Wacquant, 1998, p. 6). Lan (2006, p. 204) explains the habitus of employers stating:

The employment of housemaids and the purchase of their deferential performance constitute a status marker and a means of “conspicuous consumption” (Veblen 1912/1994). But this status attribution by domestic employers is not necessarily an intentional process...Like Veblen, Bourdieu pinpoints the significance of consumption in the reproduction of class distinctions, but he emphasizes processes beyond the reach of individual intentions or consciousness: ‘status signals are mostly sent unconsciously, via the habitus, or unintentionally, because of the classificatory effects of cultural codes’ (Lamont and Lareaur 1988, p. 164).

Therefore, according to Bourdieu agents act and react in certain ways according to their practices and representations, and habitus unintentionally determines these perceptions of individuals. So, upper-class employers who are born into a life with domestic helpers are apt to embody class habitus via seeing the race or ethnicity of their helpers as a status marker. This motivation behind hiring Filipina domestic workers becomes more than handling home requirements but rather an empowerment tool that the employer uses unintentionally and also by some intentional strategies.

Employers can protect and maintain their status distinction through several ways in their personal contact with employees. Aksu Bora argues that “no power relationship is one-sided, and both sides try to increase their power by using various strategies and tools” (2005, p. 155). The power dynamics between the two parties can demonstrate different characteristics, mainly depending on the approach of the employer towards the relationship. The possible set of relationship types can be described by Pei-Chia Lan’s concept of “boundary work” which refers to “the strategies, principles, and practices we use to create, maintain and modify cultural categories” (2003, p. 526). The employer can choose to have a close relationship with the domestic worker, diminishing the class differences significantly or they can easily set a line between the two. No

matter what the decision is, the relationship is usually formed based on certain strategies. According to Lan, some people wish their employees understand the class differences clearly by holding a distant attitude physically and emotionally, and in return, they expect to ensure the quality of work by subordination (Lan, 2003). Some other employers would rather prefer business-like relationships as they want to create a status disparity and minimize personal interactions to abstain from having personal ties (Lan, 2003). According to Bora, these types of people are generally young professionals, and they wish an invisible hand to get things done (Bora, 2005). While some of them, especially the employers who belong to the middle class, build sincere relationships without focusing on their roles or different social classes and relate strategies. As this type of employer is not expecting any strategic returns to enhance their social status, their warm and human attitude towards the domestic workers is mainly a reflection of their uneasiness towards assigning tasks to a lower class. Others pursue a maternalistic approach clearly showing that they consider the employee as a family member even giving gifts on certain occasions or second-hand clothes leading to a younger older sister or mother-daughter kind of relationship (Lan, 2000, p. 9). This attitude is important for Filipinas who believe family is the most important unit in their traditions (Kau & Yang, 1991) and the maternalistic approach might make them feel closer to the employer family. The strategic motivation behind a maternalistic attitude is to ensure the quality of work such as commitment to the employer and duties. Aksu Bora states in her book that the employers who pursue a maternalistic approach are relatively old housewives in Turkey (2005, p.167). Besides, she mentions two features of the maternalistic attitude that makes this relationship “redundant” (2005, p. 117). One of them is to give something from the food items or clothes to the worker on special occasions, in addition to the fee. The other is to listen, give advice and share the problems of the working woman, which can be summarized as “intimacy work” in Özyeğin's words (2004, p. 180), about home and family life. Maternalist employers see this redundancy as a way of help and guidance but Bora also states the paid housekeeper always remains the "other woman" in the house

(2005, p. 80). Therefore, even if they are treated like ‘family members’ by employers, these relationships are built upon class differences.

Employers have various expectations from their Filipina domestic helpers in terms of their appearance, personality traits, and work ethic. Many of them mind the physical appearance of migrant domestic workers; they associate dark skin with a lack of civilization and sees plumpness as a symbol of laziness (Lan,2000) so they prefer somebody who can be both good-looking and hardworking. Sedef Arat-Koc argues that “the display of deference, obedience, and submissiveness can sometimes be as important or more important than the actual physical work. The domestic worker, therefore, is hired not only for her labor but also for her personality traits” (Arat-Koc, 1990, p. 90). Akalın (2007) is against this idea that workers are expected to be submissive and obedient and argues that employers desire to hire somebody who they can transform according to their needs. In her research in Turkey, she observes that Turkish employers do not prefer those who are passive and naïve but rather would like to hire somebody showing initiative or taking on different tasks. She states:

Migrant domestic workers are not hired as having a particular type of personality fit for what the work requires. They, too, like the workers on the assembly line, are imagined and made into what their employers desire them to be, which may happen in different forms, creating different kinds of relationships (2007, p. 211).

Thus, it is disputable whether employers look for people with passive personal traits or they just expect their employees to become somebody whatever they wish them to be. Nonetheless, one thing is certain for Filipinas is that employers want them to be young (younger than 45), hardworking, and reliable (Deniz, 2018).

Various studies further elaborate on the existing dynamics of this relationship. Constable’s book *Maid to Order in Hong Kong* (2007) highlights the dynamics of control in the life and experiences of Filipinos in Hong Kong and points out that the attire of the domestics, time schedule and day-off arrangements, their



hygiene before sleeping, and the quantity of the food they eat, all are controlled by their employers. Momsen's book *Gender, Migration and Domestic Service* discusses the Filipina domestic workers and their deferent nature in their relationship with employers, reporting the following quote:

Filipina girls are all being treated more like a little sister, a family members. They just say, 'yes and amen', and that's it. They never say 'no', they work for low wages, which is bad for us European nannies because they will undermine everything (1999, p. 51).

Parrenas' famous book *Servants of Globalization* (2001) also highlights the vulnerability of underemployment of Filipina domestics in Rome, and Los Angeles and argues that the supervising attitude of employers and their disregard of the skills and experiences of Filipinas lead these domestic ladies to consider themselves in a subordinate status. She highlights on the other hand that employers meet the demands of Filipinas for higher wages as they believe they receive a higher quality of service (Parrenas, 2001).

Therefore, the employment of Filipina migrant workers among upper-class employers is a source of distinction among their own class that is a sign of possessing higher economic and symbolic capital. Their status is reproduced through distinction and they take comfort in thinking that they consume a distinguished luxury service indicated befitting their own class habitus. They either protect the sense of distinction through their verbal expressions and gestures while communicating with their employees or create a familial bond with them to sustain trust and commitment.

#### **2.4. Paid Domestic Labor Market in Turkey**

I will now turn to the paid domestic labor market in Turkey while focusing on both Turkish live-out domestics and migrant live-in domestic and care workers. The scholarly works regarding the issue point out that there is a division of labor in the paid domestic market in Turkey. Indeed, migrant workers fill the gap of

caregiving jobs in the country while Turkish domestic workers perform live-out physical domestic house jobs. I will discuss the visa regime of Turkey, living conditions for migrant workers, wages, health issues, and irregular migrants in this part. Additionally, the literature on Filipina domestic and care workers will be reviewed while focusing on the way they are perceived, desirability, and cultural features that differentiate them from other nationalities in Turkey.

Turkey has a traditional domestic labor market and having a domestic lady is a common phenomenon among the middle and upper-middle classes since Ottoman Empire. Özbay (2019) categorizes the historical transformation of domestic work as; slaves, foster children, charwomen, and foreign workers. She emphasizes that until the 1960s the use of slaves and foster children were different than paid domestic workers as they were not waged laborers but rather working for peanuts either voluntarily or compulsory for a small stipend (2019, p. 293). She also discusses that in the late Ottoman and nation formation period, western governesses from Europe and Russia were hired and became the most important status symbols for the children of the elite. At the same time, they added a status to the household members and were not devalued like other home workers (Özbay, 2019, p. 301). Furthermore, towards the 1960s, foster children who were taken for home and care services at an early age became a burden on boarding and a new and cheap alternative in domestic services has arisen, charwomen (Özbay, 2019, p. 310). Migrant Turkish women who came to the city from urban poor classes in 1965, popularized the use of domestic labor among the middle classes. These charwomen [gündelikçi] who are uneducated and inexperienced in the cities have supported their family income while participating in the labor market. They are generally hired for live-out performance-oriented tasks (cooking, cleaning, washing, ironing, etc.) as the care-giving niche, which necessitates face-to-face interaction and exceeds the boundaries of intimacy, is against the conservative approach settled in the sector (Akalin, 2007). Özyeğin also emphasizes that the popularization of charwomen is related to doorkeepers in Turkey, who share the same space with the upper-middle classes, let their wives work in the apartment where they live so that they

can control their safety (2001). The local workers' safety is an important issue for their husbands and brothers; therefore, they work mostly in the jobs that their relatives allow. Özbay also takes attention to the difference between the charwomen and maids arguing they are not the employer's personal servicemen who can perform the household chores (2019, p. 314). Indeed, in the research of Kalaycıoğlu and Rittersberger-Tılıç (2001), it is shown that most of the live-out domestic workers are self-employed and they work for more than one household. Unlike migrant domestic women who are demanded as live-in caregivers, Turkish domestic workers prefer live-out performance-oriented tasks as they abstain from the emotional integration that care work requires. Thus, Turkish domestic workers who perceive caregiving jobs as "culturally unsuitable" (Akalin, 2007, p. 214) for themselves, recruited mostly in live-out domestic labor jobs that are not unscheduled or do not require additional tasks.

In the 1980s, when the expansion of market relations gained new momentum, paid domestic labor was also affected by this development and intermediary companies emerged in large cities (Bora, 2005). Apart from companies, doorkeeper wives and urban poor classes coming to cities as a result of migration flow beginning in the 1950s constitute the majority of Turkish domestic workers (Akalin, 2007). These women who are uneducated and inexperienced in the cities support their family income while participating in the labor market. They generally perform live-out performance-oriented tasks (cooking, cleaning, washing, ironing, etc.) as the care-giving niche, which necessitates face-to-face interaction and exceeds the boundaries of intimacy, is against the conservative approach settled in the sector (Akalin, 2007). Unlike migrant domestic women who are demanded as live-in caregivers, Turkish women prefer the live-out option as they abstain from the emotional integration that care work requires. The native workers' safety is an important issue for their husbands and brothers; therefore, they work mostly in the jobs that their relatives allow. Besides, they care about their insurance and prefer jobs with social security and a stable income (Kalaycıoğlu & Rittersberger- Tılıç, 2000). Thus, Turkish domestic workers who perceive caregiving jobs as "culturally unsuitable" (Akalin, 2007,

p. 214) for themselves, recruited mostly in live-out domestic labor jobs that are not unscheduled or do not require additional tasks.

Creating a division of labor in the market, migrant domestic workers filled the gap between live-in caregiving and domestic work in Turkey. Starting in the mid-1990s, the country became a hot spot for women who had economic difficulties and low standards of living in the post-socialist nation-states after the dissolution of the USSR, which led to a migration flow from Moldova, Bulgaria, Ukraine, Azerbaijan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan. Considering that Turkish women prioritize their families and do not want to work as live-in workers, migrant workers saw this as an opportunity for not paying extra rent for accommodation. Furthermore, they are suitable with flexible labor that Turkish families demand their children and do not complain about the conditions, unlike Turkish domestic helpers, by accepting all circumstances absolutely (Akalin, 2007). Thus, studies show that higher wages, the geographical proximity of Turkey, inexpensive and convenient trips, earning more money than they do in their own countries, and most importantly flexible visa policies of Turkey attracted many women to migrate (A.E. Akalin, 2014; Dinçer, 2014; Yılmaz & Özaydın, 2020). So, as a result of the Turkish state's desire to transfer the responsibility of being a welfare state to the free market, the demand for migrant women has arisen in Turkey. Childcare, elderly and sick care, as well as stewardship in middle-upper class families with residences of “secure site” type houses, have become the most needed services provided by migrant workers (Toksöz & Erdoğan, 2013; Yalçın 2015).

From the side of Turkish employers, migrants were praised for being educated, hardworking and obedient (Özbay, 2019). They are highly preferred because they accept working as live-in, cleaning or caring all day and they cannot easily leave the work. While explaining the insistence on migrant workers, Yılmaz and Özaydın (2020) argue that Turkish employers' demand for migrant workers can be explained by the dual labor market theory. According to them, Turkish domestic workers do not want to work as live-in because of the patriarchal

family structure of the society, or when they accept live-in jobs, they demand higher wages than migrants, this leads migrant work to be perceived as cheaper and flexible work force (Yılmaz, Özaydın, 2020, p. 71). Furthermore, hiring domestic workers to mean more than service work to employers and explained by Erdoğan & Toksöz with the following quote:

This form of employment not only responds to their service needs but also consolidates the identity and lifestyle that they want to demonstrate. Many employers justified their preference for migrant women on the basis of their “European” and “civilized” status compared to the lower class, uneducated, and essentially rural nature of domestic women. (Erdoğan & Toksöz, 2013, p. 6).

The status that live-out domestic work gives to employers is related to how many times in a week they come to your house (Özbay, 2019) so, live-in migrant domestic workers can be considered as a specific measure of wealth.

In order to understand the domestic labor market, we should know the visa regime of Turkey which is regarded as “loose” (Coskun, 2016). Indeed, it was loose at the beginning and it led many women to come in. The common practice among migrant women was having a tourist visa valid for 90 days and staying afterward without sometimes residence permit. However, this changed in 2012 with a new law to track these overstay migrants and after 90 days, in order to reenter to Turkey migrants should wait 90 days more, which caused many women to lose their job (Yalçın, 2015). Furthermore, the government introduced an amnesty program in 2012 to pull back the irregular migrants to the system which led irregular migrants to apply for work permits (Akalın, 2016). “Employers who do not want to lose their employees must pay insurance premiums of 56.5% of the minimum wage to the state in order to obtain a work permit” (Yalçın, 2015, p.16). Thus, the new law has partially protected and provided women to get at least a minimum wage. While this has provided women with better conditions of work, it has at the same time lead them to continue with the same employers. However, if there is no one to pay insurance premiums, women become obliged to work as irregular migrants. So, the current visa regime of Turkey does not entirely protect migrant domestic workers, their

conditions, and status, but it is nonetheless a developed version of what preceded coming to Turkey with a tourist visa and staying illegally after it expired. In order to understand migrant workers' conditions better, the next section will focus more in detail, on the migrant domestic worker literature in Turkey.

#### **2.4.1. Working Conditions for Migrant Domestic Workers in Turkey**

In assessing the working conditions of migrant women in domestic services, housing is an important determinant for women to choose Turkey. In their research for ILO, Toksöz and Erdoğan relate the employment of migrant domestics in Turkey with the emergence of new living spaces i.e., villa-typed houses, and their popularity in metropolitan cities (2013). Akalın argues that even in the design of these modern villas the room for an employee is added to the plan, and this room gives domestics to be both present and absent in the same house with the employer (Akalın, 2010). For domestic workers, having a separate room, compared with the small houses in European cities, is an advantage, but there are also occasions that they have to share the same room with the elderly or sick dependents (Yılmaz & Özyayın, 2020). Moreover, having a separate private area is not enough, as it should have electrical components inside or a washbasin of its own (Erdem & Şahin, 2009). Accordingly, a recent study held by Yılmaz & Özyayın shows that four of the participants who had their own separate rooms had a TV in their room, and three had a separate bathroom and toilet, while the others stated that they could easily use the bathroom and toilet, they had no problem watching TV (2020, p. 82). So, we conclude that although there are some exceptions, most of the migrant domestic workers have their private area for resting in Turkey.

Wages paid to migrant workers vary according to their nationalities in Turkey, but it is generally around 400 to 800 USD (Yılmaz & Özyayın, 2020). Whether women can speak Turkish is important in determining the salaries as, the ones who are new and cannot speak Turkish receive lower wages while experienced and Turkish-speaking migrant women are paid higher (Akalın, 2014). The

salaries might differ from one city to another and even in different districts of the same city. Kaşka states that employers also give pocket money for religious holidays (2006, p. 53), and some of the workers receive a weekly stipend of 20-30 TL (Yılmaz & Özeydin, 2020; Akalın, 2014,) on their day-offs. The vast majority of domestic workers are citizens of low-wage countries such as Ukraine and Moldova so compared to the salaries in their country of origin, the amounts paid in Turkey are attractive for migrant workers.

Because of the excessive oral agreement rate in Turkey, domestic workers have no clear job description or annual leave, which makes them more vulnerable to exploitation. The living-in option generally secures work, accommodation, and often food, so it is preferred by migrant domestics. However, since the place of work is the same as the place of rest, the terms of employment are likely not to be clearly defined and the domestic worker is liable to be on-call day and night, seven days a week. Yılmaz & Özeydin (2020) report that 47 % of migrant women who participated in their study, work for 24 hours, and out of this 47%, 17 of them said they had less than 12 hours weekly leave. Initially, live-in domestic workers agree to work for six days and rest for one day or 12 hours which is usually on Sundays. Erdoğan and Toksöz comment on this schedule saying “Employers and domestic workers do have an oral agreement at the very beginning concerning what work is to be done and how they will be supervised, but these tend to be set aside later by employers” (2013, p. 13). So, although they perform heavy workload for long hours, migrant domestics are usually left to employers’ mercy and their days off, annual or sick leaves depend on the employer that they work for.

Since domestic work takes place in the private domestic area, most of the migrant women experience social and cultural isolation and they need to come together to socialize during their one-day weekly leave. Migrants usually choose Sunday as their day-off as they prefer going to church, meeting their own people and enjoying together the same culture that they used to. While migrants in Istanbul usually meet in Laleli, the ones in Ankara prefer meeting around Kızılay

(Yılmaz & Özaydın, 2020). Asanbekova's study (2020) on Kirghiz domestic workers in Turkey demonstrates that "on their day-off, women want to get rid of everything 'Turkish' and to be isolated" (p.118) and they meet in Kirghiz restaurants. Similarly, in Koyuncu's study on Georgian women, it is reported that they meet in Kurtuluş Park in Ankara which is not closer to any of Georgian migrant women's houses on purpose (2018). Çelik also points out, in her study regarding irregular migrant domestics in Ankara, that in her interviews, some of the women said that their employers did not let them have a resting day, one of them did not even go out of the house for two months, and most of them preferred staying at home as a result of their irregular migrant status and fear of being caught by the police (2005, p. 156). So, migrant women try to be united as a community out of sight and if their status is not regular, they experience the double burden of being migrant and irregular at the same time.

Furthermore, the employment of illegal or irregular migrant domestic workers is a major point of concern in the literature as unregistered employment in the informal economy (Ekin, 2001). Most of these migrants are brought to the country via agencies. These agencies generally use the network of immigrant women who are already working. The agencies help these women they provide them to bring their siblings or friends to Turkey, which brings about an expansion in both formal and informal network systems (Deniz, 2018, p. 292). Some of these migrants are unregistered and therefore unprotected. They are used as a cheap and temporary workforce but they cannot claim any rights as most of these migrant women do not have a residence permit and they fear because employers threaten them to inform the police and they might get deported. Kümbetoğlu discusses the negative impacts of informality for these irregular migrants including "dying hair black to look Turkish, rare meetings with friends in order not to be spotted by security, preference of private homes rather than public places in such meetings, feeling of loneliness, missing children back home, abstinence in order to save as much as possible, and undertaking even the most disrespected work in spite of a good educational background" (Kümbetoğlu, 2005 as cited in Toksöz& Ulutaş, 2012, p. 96). Besides, as a result



of irregular status, some women are exposed to sexual violence and they are forced into prostitution and some of them are trafficked into prostitution after their arrival (Ege, 2002; Coşkun, 2016). Thus, irregular migrants are incorporated into the informal economy and they mostly do not have any insurance or security to protect their rights.

Due to unfavorable working conditions, most of these women experience occupational health-related problems and they generally do not have any health insurance or security. These health problems stem from the heavy workload, longer hours of work, no distinction between work and home, insufficient rest, mental and physical abuse (Etiler & Lordoğlu, 2012). Moreover, most of the workers have health insurance only if it is supported by their employers and it is not compulsory in the country and employers prefer not to do. This means migrant women are in unregistered employment without being affiliated with any social security. Thus, exhausted and placed beyond the periphery of this system, the labor-intensive problems like headaches, backaches, sleeplessness, and other stress-related illnesses are mostly solved by traditional medicines that they brought from their country of origin (Toksöz & Ulutaş, 2012) or given by employers. Regarding their mental health, Etiler and Lordoğlu argue that women seem physically healthy but their mental health is critically affected in various degrees (2012). Arriving in a new country, not being able to do anything free, living under the same roof with employers, and having no personal space, most of these women come up against chronic stress. Besides, they change their diet, sometimes lose weight and that reinforces psychological problems like depression. Even if they have access to food, it is generally different from what they are used to and employers do not let them cook their own traditional foods. For instance, many employers in Doğan's study "underlined with a humiliating tone how the meals of the migrant workers were different when compared to the Turkish meals" (Doğan, 2011). In Çelik's study, it is stated that many women use different plates and utensils than their employers and they eat the leftovers (2005). Also, in Avcı's work, all her respondents said even if they were hungry, they had to stand up because they were not there to eat or sit at the table, but to

serve (2019, p. 68). Thus, the absence of health insurance or failure to seek healthcare forces women to face their problems by themselves, and the fear of losing their job often makes them hide any work-related abuse and problem.

As a result of highly personal relationships within the household with employers, the domestic workers are vulnerable to different kinds of abuse and they tend to tolerate the hardships they encounter. There are physical, verbal, psychological, and sexual types of abuse against domestic workers. Violation of rights is the most common one in Turkey as lots of women's passports are withheld by their employers as soon as they arrive in the country. In Yılmaz & Özaydın's study (2020), it is stated by the respondents that the abused women do not complain about the harassers as they do not exactly know about the laws and their legal status is irregular. As a result, they either leave the country because of not having any other choice or stay to try and find another job (p. 84). Other than that, migrant domestic workers might be called derogatory names, being yelled at or beaten and sexually harassed (Ege, 2002). Kaşka (2006) also mentions that most of the women's employers perceive migrant domestics as a threat at home, therefore, they make these women's life worse than ever. Especially women coming from Eastern Bloc countries such as Moldova, Ukraine, and Georgia are stigmatized as 'natashas'<sup>3</sup> and this perception increases the harassment outside the work setting (Toksöz & Ulutaş, 2012). Feeling insecure at home and outside, these women have nowhere else to go and no one to trust other than their people from their own country.

Clearly, migrant domestic workers in Turkey are fragile as there are not many policies protecting their rights and guaranteeing their security. Informal employment, lack of social security, vague job descriptions, heavy workload, and ill-treatment of employers are the components of these precarious and

---

<sup>3</sup> Women from the former Soviet Bloc countries had become equated with the term "prostitute," regardless of whether they were sex workers or not and had been given a special name: Natasha. In the Turkish language, "Natasha has come to mean a sex worker from the former Soviet Union and is often used as a generic name for all women from these countries" (Gülçür & İlkaracan, 2002:414).

exhausting conditions. Many of them face chronic stress or occupational physical pains but only a few of them get the chance to consult a doctor to discuss their situation. Their unending harassment and abuse make them more vulnerable, and Covid-19 has exacerbated further the precarious conditions that they work under. Therefore, the next section will take a look at the findings on the conditions of migrant workers during the COVID-19 pandemic in Turkey.

#### **2.4.2. Filipina Domestic and Care Workers in Turkey**

After the demand for migrant domestic workers has increased in Turkey, Filipinas started to be employed in rich families' houses especially in Istanbul since the 1990s (Özbay, 2019). Due to the fact that women coming from Post-Soviet countries mostly preferred in sick or elderly care, Filipinas meet the demand for childcare, and therefore, an emergence of specialization according to nationality in care services occurs (Deniz, 2018). Although the young population in Turkey has risen rapidly, Filipina migration to Turkey has increased in a steady manner and their registered number is 3036 as of 2020<sup>4</sup>, but there are many more in unregistered status. This part of the review will answer respectively the questions; Why do Filipinas choose Turkey as a destination point? Why is there a demand for Filipinas in Turkey? How is the workload of Filipinas in Turkey? What is FilCom and what does it mean for Filipinas?

There are some reasons and ways that make Filipina women be interested in the domestic and care market in the Republic of Turkey. As a matter of fact, the government of the Philippines does not have any labor agreement with Turkey, which makes this country not the women's first choice while migrating. Therefore, for Akalin personal attempts of previous migrants or invitations of close relatives and friends are the real drives that attract Filipina women to Turkey (2014). She categorizes three modes of the arrival of Filipinas to Turkey stating; earlier arrivals of Filipinas escorting diplomats in the 1990s, the ones

---

<sup>4</sup> Embassy of the Republic of Philippines Records, 2020

escaping from Gulf War and ending up in Turkey and the others helped by recruitment agencies in the Philippines to arrive in Turkey (2014, p. 12). Regarding the first arrivals 1990s, Özbay (2019) and Weyland (1997) 's studies show that employees of multinational companies began to bring together their Filipina helpers to Turkey. Özbay also takes attention that while coming to Turkey, Filipinas aim to go to Europe as soon as possible and to find a higher wage, a freer working and living environment (2019, p. 315). Considering that Turkey is a bridge to Europe, especially Italy where most of the Catholics live, it might be safer than Arab countries and the working conditions can be relatively better than countries like Kuwait, UAE, or Qatar (Paul, 2011; Sabban 2004). Besides, in her research Akalın argues some of these Filipina women working in Turkey come from the countries that nearby either because they get deported from that country or escape the exploitation or abuse, which leads them to end their journey in Turkey, sometimes via smugglers through Lebanon or Syria (Akalın, 2014). Filipinas who come to Turkey can legally get a work permit via their employers and generally agencies support this service, otherwise, they may get a tourist visa from the Turkish Embassy in Manila which is valid for a few weeks and if they stay without a work permit afterward, they are called as "irregulars" (Akalın, 2014).

The literature on Filipina nannies and domestic workers in Turkey focuses mostly on their image as having a calm, easygoing, disciplined, docile, diligent, task-oriented, and obedient nature (Ayaydın, 2020; Weyland, 1997; Deniz, 2018). For some researchers, the most important feature that makes them sought-after is their proficiency in English as the opportunity for their children to be bilingual attracts families. Aside from that Çeltikçi (2019) asserts in her study about Filipina women in Turkey that it is cheaper to learn English from Filipinos than native speakers. On the other hand, Ayaydın believes the knowledge of English is not enough reason to place these women higher in the domestic labor market hierarchy; she argues, rather, that the representations and social images of Filipinas like "ideal nannies" and "pricier global commodities" make them a status symbol for families who consider their reputation and social class (2020).

A Filipina caregiver is a multi-prestige element, as the high cost of this service is known by all, and that the family which has the economic capital to afford is aware of this value. Being one of the first persons researching Filipinas in Turkey, Petra Weyland (1997) also highlights this point by arguing that Turkish employers benefit from Filipinas' cultural features, modern clothing, language capital, and the symbolic value that they carry. Such an image then that the Filipina nannies are associated with helps them earn more than other nationalities and creates a demand for these workers who are fashionable among upper-class female employers. Akalın categorizes the employers of Filipina domestic and cares helpers in Turkey into three (2014). In her research, she states that the first group is expat executives and diplomats working for shorter periods in Turkey hiring them here or bringing their own helpers considering the fluent English skills of these women. The second group is affluent Turkish families or CEOs of big companies. The third group is working Turkish mothers who believe they hire the best nannies for their children while also hiring employees from other nationalities for domestic duties (2014, p.18).

Researching the role of intermediary agencies hiring Filipina domestic workers, Deniz lists the representations of Filipinas who are sought after in the labor market of Turkey. Two of the very first elements of representation that the brokerage agency adds to a worker's profile on their website are her age and the number of children she has (Deniz, 2018). Most of the families want their nannies to be a mother although they do not consider much about the children left behind in the Philippines. The second element is their knowledge of English as well as Turkish since families want women to be informed about life, meals, childcare habits, etc. The third element is their appearance such as their posture, clothing, and make-up in photographs which are among the features that families pay attention to while choosing the ideal candidate. The fourth element in women's representation by the agencies is their health status as they should look healthy for the families not to doubt that the women may be carrying various diseases. The last element is their "morality" as the alleged weaker moral image of the female migrants from Turkey the former Soviet Republics is

counterbalanced by the trustworthy, moral image of Filipina nannies (Deniz,2018).

Filipina domestic workers or nannies have no clear job description, which results in their being more vulnerable to exploitation due to heavy workload. They generally work in six-plus one format i.e., working six full days and taking one day off as holiday, but work hours and this schedule might alter according to the employers' needs. The oral agreement rate of live-in Filipina domestics in Turkey is 60% (Zailon,2019). While the absence of a written contract does not necessarily mean gross exploitation by employers, it nonetheless puts these domestics at their employers' mercy. Zailon, in his study (2019) on the health status of Filipina domestics in Turkey, suggests that employers and their domestic workers give different figures on how long domestic workers actually spend working each day. Generally, the majority of domestic workers report that they work longer hours than what is agreed on but they seldom complain about not receiving overtime pay they should do (2019). Zailon also sheds light on the effects of long working hours, lack of leaves, verbal contracts, and behaviors of employers that cause decreases in emotional role functioning (limitations due to emotional problems), mental health problems, and bodily pain (2019). According to him, migrant Filipina domestic workers in Istanbul have an overall health status score of 65.70 which is lower than the Filipinas in the Philippines (70.55). So, the overall health of the Filipinas in the Philippines is better than that of Filipina domestic workers in Istanbul (Zailon, 2019).

Moreover, Turkish employers expect and restrict Filipinas more than other employers from other nationalities. Most of these women coming to Turkey, tend to perform care duties and are hired as nannies, but Turkish families expect them to perform as Akalin puts forward, "daily chores" (2007, p. 216) which include duties like ironing, doing the laundry, dusting, making beds, etc. So, they perform more than one job because this is the usual expectation from any domestic worker in Turkey. Çeltikçi's study (2019) on Filipina nannies in Turkey also touches on this point stating that live-in Filipina nannies provide

home services (gardening, cleaning, ironing, dinner organizations, cooking, walking the dog, babysitting the children of employers' friends) and they are not paid extra for these jobs. It is also pointed out that Filipinas would rather not work for Turkish families but for expats or diplomats in Turkey as these people are more likely to appreciate and understand their workers' heavy workload, therefore, would be more respectful to the working and resting hours as compared to Turkish ones (Akalın, 2014). Other than that, while researching Filipinas in Turkey, Weyland expresses her opinions to Ferhunde Özbay stating that Filipinas are under more strict control than the Turkish charwomen. They are particularly complaining about Turkish families as they are not even allowed to look from the window, and their going out is always discussed with the concept of pudicity (Özbay, 2019, p. 315). So, while handling more than their job requirement, Filipinas face strict control in the houses of Turkish employers.

When they are allowed, Filipinas prefer having their day-offs on Sundays in order to participate in Sunday Mass of Church and socialize there with their own people. If the employers do not allow the day-off as Sunday, this even might be a deal-breaker for them (Akalın, 2014). Sunday meetings are both an opportunity to regain strength and resistance for the week ahead (Weyland, 1997) and also a perfect ground for socializing (Kumral, 2007). As Catholics, Filipinas feel relieved after church attendance as their spiritual activity becomes a therapy session (Akalın, 2014). A major part of the literature on Filipinas in Turkey relies on the data collected mostly in churches. Kumral's interviews (2007) with Filipinas in Beşiktaş, İstanbul show that Saint Esprit Church becomes a place where (textile worker, gardener, nanny, hotel personnel etc.) Filipinas from various jobs in Turkey gathers. Aside from that, every church community has a Legio Mariae Praesidium (Legion of Mary) which is an association of the Catholic people and Filipinas fulfill their baptismal promises and get support from this community also in Turkey (Akalın, 2014).

FilCom, the abbreviation of the Filipino Community in Turkey, acts as the biggest network platform for Filipinas to gather and socialize as a diaspora in

Turkey since the 1990s. Arguing that Filipinas live an organized life while getting support from their networks in Turkey, Akalın believes that FilCom builds up the unification of Filipinas in a cohesive and organized way (2014). She summarizes the duties and roles of FilCom as follows:

FilCom is an umbrella organization that works above all the congregations to oversee the activities of the groups and the problems of individuals in the community. While almost all Filipinas in Istanbul are rather religious, they have a tendency to feel distant, if not hostile, towards other denominations and congregations within the community. While contention among congregations and denominations or other kinds of groups is an innate aspect of the community, FilCom retains an umbrella position above the groups partly to prevent a possible fragmentation of the community. In pursuance of this aim, FilCom organizes a series of social events that are open to all congregations and denominations. These events help to keep the idea of shared fate vivid in the minds of the Filipinas, making the community a tangible aspect of the lives of all (2014, p. 21).

FilCom arranges events like Filipino night, basketball and bowling tournaments, Independence Day feasts, karaoke nights but at the same time, it acts as a support network that all personal problems are shared and discussed. Nobody feels like an outsider and the community integrates values of patriotism, integrity, and solidarity to ease the burden of living and working overseas. On the other hand, FICASCA (Philippines International Arts, Social Culture and Charity Association) arranges baptism dinners, birthday parties, prayer meetings where all kinds of Filipino food are cooked, Tagalog is spoken freely, usually Filipino and American pop music is played and dance and karaoke sessions are regularly attended by mostly Filipino women (Çeltikçi, 2019). FICASCA started its activities in İstanbul in 2018 and it became an area where Filipino Community enjoys freely. Embassy of the Philippines and Consulate General of Philippines in Istanbul attends most of these unofficial events organized by FilCom but it does not become the host (Akalın, 2014). When it becomes the host for official events, FilCom participates as well. So, there is a strong unity among Filipinos in Turkey.



Filipinas who spend their Sundays freely also meet in boarding houses that they rent for their day-offs and stay together as groups of four to ten if their employers allow them. This activity is generally preferred after the Sunday Mass and it becomes their venue where they talk and behave freely (Akalin,2014). Weyland also mentions that they sometimes meet at their employers' home when it is empty or if they are allowed their maids to get more private than that in their home (1997). These friends should be female as employers do not want to see the private life of their employees in their homes. These meetings on Sundays, which they rarely hold, are not just an opportunity to socialize, make friends with other Filipinos, and have fun but at the same time to discuss the employers' private lives, their oddities, and quarrels (Weyland, 1997). They inform each other about the bad employers so that any Filipina coming to Turkey could avoid working for these people.

The rising demand for Filipina domestic workers makes them seem to be the labor aristocracy of the domestic market. They also distinguish themselves from other workers. For instance, they do not let other Asian female workers mix into their community and they treat the Turkish ones similarly as well. The participants in Kumral's research state that although they are employed without insurance and work under bad conditions, they are not liked by Turkish workers as Filipinas cause their wages to decrease (2007). Some researchers also believe that Filipinas are the labor aristocracy of the domestic market in Turkey (Akalin, 2014; Ayaydin, 2020) as their monthly wages are between \$ 700-1500 depending on their education, experience level, and legal status. The increase in their salaries has occurred in a quite steady manner once the perception of Filipinas as the best nannies for Turkish children has spread in the market. As Akalin argues:

The Filipina domestic worker is already in global circulation as a worker who is not only promoted as possessing more cultural capital than the workers of other nationalities but also one who is so well-disciplined into being a good domestic worker that she is always ready to figure out what is expected of her and give exactly that back, whatever it may be, in any context (2014, p. 25)

Their image is promoted among the mothers in Turkey which stimulate the demand for their services and encourages many other women from the Philippines to migrate to Turkey, legally or not, to fill the perfect nanny gap.

As the last point, the Embassy of the Republic of Philippines in Ankara and the Consulate General in Istanbul support Filipinos in any abuse or violation of human rights situation. Nihal Çelik's study (2005) reports based on the interview with the ambassador of the Philippine Embassy that most of the Filipinas prefer working in Ankara, İstanbul, Mersin, and İzmir. Ambassador also states if Filipinas are treated badly, they can immediately call the embassy and ask for help. Even if their situation is an irregular migrant in Turkey, they can still call the embassy for support and the embassy would help them with their repatriation procedure supported financially by the Philippines government which watches out for their citizens working abroad and the legal mechanism always protects and supports them through legal mechanisms (Çelik, 2005).

#### **2.4.3. Conditions of Work after COVID-19**

COVID-19 pandemic has severely imperiled migrant domestic workers in Turkey who are already working informally and irregularly in precarious conditions. Curfews, lockdowns and quarantines, all have worsened the situation of migrant women while imprisoning them in employers' house, working long hours and making more vulnerable to any kind of abuse (Daragahi &Trew, 2020). Employers who are afraid that migrants can bring the virus to the household prohibit them from going out and meeting in boarding houses as a result of which domestic workers get trapped in their workplaces 24/7. This section aims to reflect the literature on the working conditions of migrant domestic workers after the COVID-19 pandemic has started focusing on the problems in extra workload, reduced wages, loss of home any form of violence, and access to healthcare.

Under lockdown, together with their employer families, migrant women try to put up with exacerbated conditions in order to keep their jobs. Since there are no limits on their working hours, employers expect them to cook and clean more and also take care of their children who do not go to school anymore. This extra workload also includes washing groceries and bleaching every time an item comes from outside (Daragahi & Trew, 2020). As Turkish families try to become more hygienic, they request longer hours of disinfecting the house but they also complain about the hygiene of the domestic workers. In the Trade Union of Domestic Workers' Solidarity (EVID-SEN)'s 2020 report, an Uzbek migrant domestic worker states that she is locked up in her room and her food is left at her door (Güler & Benli, 2020). Moreover, an Azerbaijani worker says she does not know what to do if she gets the virus, as the employers immediately fire her but if they got sick, they would want her to look after them (Güler & Benli, 2020). Although employers request extra workload including the care of a corona patient, they mostly do not compensate for the extra hours (IOM, 2020). In Dragahi & Trew's article, a Filipina working in Istanbul states that her employer found it too dangerous to go to a bank during covid and she could not get paid for this reason (2020). In other cases, employers could not afford to pay their wages as a result of the economy's freefall or because they believe that live-in workers do not need money as there is nothing, they can spend their money on (ILO, 2020). In these cases, domestic workers may leave but since they usually have nowhere else to go, they would probably keep working without payment in order to provide themselves with accommodation. The loss of job for migrant domestics means the loss of access to their basic needs because, without a job as live-in, they would have to pay rent, buy food and spend for other expenses, or alternatively, they would have to live overcrowdedly in small houses under unhealthy conditions (Verbruggen, 2020; Ella Parry-Davies, 2020).

Aside from exacerbated conditions, the lack of social security and citizenship rights lead migrant women in Turkey to become more vulnerable amidst the pandemic. A recent report held by the Trade Union of Domestic Workers'

Solidarity (EVID-SEN) in 2021 entirely reflects right violations and problems of domestic workers both live-in and live-out during pandemic (Güler & Benli, 2021). The respondents of the survey attended from Istanbul, Ankara, Izmir, Bursa, Antalya, and Adana, in other words mostly populated cities of Turkey. According to the results, 83.7 percent of the participants do not have any social security and they are unable to access any health services. Besides, 77% of them said they face all forms of violence (physical, psychological, economic, and sexual) as live-in domestic workers. The Independent's article also highlights that in Istanbul, six or seven calls are reported to domestic laborers' associations to seek help against abuse (Daragahi & Trew, 2020). The head of the Association says formerly it was one call a day (2020). Thus, it has been observed by associations that live-in domestic workers are employed without complying with occupational health and safety measures while conflicting with any type of abuse.

This section tried to reflect the severe effects of the COVID-19 pandemic on the working conditions of migrant domestic workers in Turkey. Since the pandemic is a new subject to discuss the situation of migrants, there is a gap in literature found regarding domestic workers. The ones we have are only limited sources to reflect the situation in Turkey. However, it is still important to highlight the changing working conditions for migrant domestic workers while assessing their experiences in Turkey.

## **2.5. Conclusion**

The literature review is conducted to address the supply-demand-centric experiences of Filipina domestic workers in Turkey. To understand this dynamic, our discussion firstly focuses on the unpaid and invisible nature of domestic work inside the private household. A considerable body of literature, mostly consisting of feminists, aimed to make this unpaid labor visible while developing theories to integrate domestic labor into the capitalist economy. Theorization as reproductive labor has produced an intellectual framework in addition to the set

of approaches and ideas for the analysis of unpaid and paid housework. Although theorization made it much more visible, housework has always remained devalued and ignored. With the rise of globalization, the demand for a cheap and flexible labor force has arisen and women filled the gap in the caregiving sector all around the world. They performed dirty, difficult, and dangerous jobs as societies, governments, and families depended on them to survive and continue getting earnings and taxes. Since the 1980s, a vast amount of literature has tried to understand the rise in the demand for domestic services in global households. They found that changing state policies that decrease the support for social services most importantly in the care sector led to a change in the forms and providers of this service. Changing demographic structures and rising women's participation in employment are also among the reasons creating care deficit problems in the First World.

The literature until the 2000s focuses mostly on the demanding and supplier countries as a result of globalization. However, with the rise of women in developed countries, topics on discussion have transformed into experiences, problems, and rights of domestic workers as migrants from Third world countries. Therefore, our discussion attempts to understand a major country known as the state-led industrialization of the migrant workforce, the Philippines. Studies reported that the Philippines adopted a manpower export policy and institutionalized the migration industry as a result of export-oriented production, lower economic growth, and unemployment in the country. Therefore, the country became a pioneer as the largest exporter of labor to the international economy. Opening work-oriented schools, changing curriculum, and making educational reforms, the Philippines has raised highly skilled human capital and increased the rate of migrants each year while leading the country's economy to become heavily reliant on migrants and their remittances. Due to the care deficit in the world, the Filipinos found it more profitable to work as care workers and housekeepers than any other job in their home country, regardless of their graduation. As a result, more than 10 million Filipinos are employed as inexpensive and docile workers in the global houses of developed countries.

While scholarly attention is given to the issue to try to understand how the Philippines achieved being the largest exporter of migrant labor, there are also studies discussing why there is a demand for Filipinas more than any other nation. This has been explained by the distinct qualifications and linguistic capital of Filipinas such as fluent English skills, well-education, and work discipline which lead them to be perceived as ideal and desirable workers. Bourdieu's conceptualization of capital has been used in the review to interlink the assets of Filipinas. Aside from that, many authors highlighted the prestige that families gain thanks to their Filipina domestic workers arguing they are an indispensable part of global households all around the world. The source of status stems from the high cost of this service and the family's economic capital to afford. Other than that, Filipina identity management, identity shifts, and tactics against employers in global households are the topic of interest to various studies. Turner's social dramas (1975), Goffman's front/ backstage distinctions in other words performances (1959), and Scott's tactics are used to explain identity management, shifts, and tactics of Filipinas. Moreover, to explain distinction-seeking employers hiring Filipinas, Anderson's status reproduction, Bourdieu's habitus, and Lan's boundary work have been utilized and found out that they take comfort in consuming a distinguished luxury service.

To understand the Turkish domestic labor market, we related our discussion to the history of domestic service in Turkey and found out that the literature of domestic service dates back to Ottoman Empire and starting with slaves, foster children, charwomen, and lastly, migrant workers made the service a tradition in the country. Most of the studies point out that Turkish charwomen prefer live-out performance-oriented tasks and abstain from care work's emotional integration. Therefore, the gap of the caregiving niche has been filled by migrant domestic workers since the 1990s. Although these two women groups performing similar tasks seem opponents to each other, the racial division of labor serves the purposes of both sides. Turkish women prefer jobs that they can prioritize their own family while migrants seek accommodation where they work and the live-in format works both ways. Studies in Turkey give attention mostly

to women coming from post-Soviet countries such as Ukraine, Moldova, Bulgaria, and Uzbekistan. These studies produced an intellectual framework of a set of approaches and ideas for the analysis of their weaker moral images of these women and how they stay in the country in illegal ways. Besides, working conditions such as accommodation, salary, oral agreements, cultural isolation, and health-related problems are also topics that scholars in Turkey take attention to.

As the last point of discussion about Filipina migrants in Turkey, there is a gap in literature found because the quiet and consistent rise of Filipina numbers in the country has remained unnoticed. When Filipinas first entered the country in the 1990s, Petra Weyland's study (1994) reflected the group, demand towards them, and their experiences. However, Filipinos were not seen as a permanent community in Turkey, as they were not overwhelmingly outnumbered in the country. This comes out due to the lack of bilateral relations between Turkey and the Philippines and migrants' perception of Turkey as a bridge to Europe. Thus, their moderately rising numbers in the last ten years have only become topics to some articles and research. These works generally reflected their representations in the agency websites, differences from other domestic workers from other nationalities, and overall cultural features. According to the data that we have collected for our discussion, the demand side of this service can be categorized into three groups: diplomats, wealthy families i.e. CEOs, and working Turkish mothers. They especially prefer hiring Filipinas thanks to their fluent English skills and hardworking cultural features. Other than that, as the supply side of this relationship, Filipinas are a legion that has strong bonds in Turkey as they mostly have friends and relatives living in Turkey, performing similar jobs and meeting on Sundays. After COVID-19, a lot has changed in terms of the living conditions of Filipinas in Turkey but there is almost no study held during this period about the situation of these migrants. By looking at the discussions and review in this chapter, the next section will give us more tangible data about Filipina domestic workers and nannies in Turkey with the fieldwork during the global pandemic.

## **CHAPTER 3**

### **METHODOLOGICAL STRUCTURE OF RESEARCH**

Before analyzing the details of the methodology in this research, I would like to explain my relationship with Filipinas and how I found myself in this quest to research Filipinas in Turkey. I have been working in the Embassy of the Republic of Philippines as a translator and researcher since January 2019. I get to know the Filipino, their culture, language and habits every single day during my daily encounters with them. I have attended various cultural events, parties and support activities arranged by the Embassy that Filipino Community members also participated. I helped the ones who were in need during the coronavirus pandemic and also tried to support them when they experienced undesirable treatments. I observed their fragile position as a domestic worker or nanny in this country that has no labor agreement with Philippines. Then I decided to research about this people whom I see every single day. I personally knew some Filipino Community leaders and contacted them when I decided to make more research about the conditions and experiences of Filipinas who work in Turkey as live-in nannies. This network among Filipino Community helped me a lot during my research as they trusted me while sharing their personal stories, experiences and secrets. Since I was planning to do an ethnographic study about Filipinas, I started to learn more about the history of Philippines, to focus more on the places they go, what they do in their day-offs, and to watch them once they come to the Embassy. My initial plan was to meet Filipina nannies in their day-offs and interview them separately or maybe as a focus group discussion. However, COVID-19 interfered with my initial plans, and I had no other choice to interview Filipinas in Turkey than Zoom meetings and Facetime calls because of curfews and lockdowns in the country.



Once I understood the differences of Filipinas from other nannies in terms of education, profile, and globally famous representation as ideal nannies, I wondered not only about their experiences from their own perspective relationships, but also, employers' opinions about them. Pei-Chia Lan (2000) argues that most of the studies only reflect the opinions of domestic workers and it creates a theoretical gap in the literature. She believes that employers and employees are "the two categories on a structural continuum rather than dichotomous entities" (Lan, 2000, p.21). Then, I decided to include Turkish employers in my attempt to study the experiences of Filipinas in Turkey, as they were an integral part of this process. To include employers in the research, my plan was to either request, from some Filipinas that I interviewed, to ask their employers whether they would be willing to participate, or to use my personal network. From my own experiences in the embassy and in light of the literature, I knew that it was not that easy to reach out to Turkish employers of Filipina nannies. That was what I expected because these employers were either Turkish politicians, CEOs, celebrities or affluent mothers who seek the best for their children (Akalın, 2014). Therefore, I knew that I could not conduct as many employer interviews as much as interviews with workers. After interviewing three Filipinas, I realized that Filipinas were unwilling to make their employers a part of my study. They were hesitant to talk about themselves if they thought their employers might learn what they said when it was employer's turn to talk to me. So, I decided to use my own networks. It was not easy for me to find employers as I did not have anybody in my immediate circle who ever hired Filipina workers. By asking friends of my friends and also calling and requesting help from recruitment agencies, I managed to get in touch with nine employers. I was lucky to have employers from different backgrounds and occupations, I will give details later according to which, their expectations from, hence, their relationship with Filipinas changed.

The main goal of this research is to discover the strategies and coping mechanisms used by Filipina nannies in the face of living conditions in Turkey, and in their relationship with Turkish employers. I collected data from these two

groups about their shared experiences, thoughts, and perceptions. Qualitative methods of social research are applied in this study by in-depth interviews and ethnographic research techniques. Qualitative methods provide more flexibility to researchers with respect to sampling and data collection, than quantitative methods. Therefore, they were more suitable for my study aiming to understand experiences of migrant workers. In a qualitative study about a group of people, you try to know about their culture as much as possible. Qualitative research gave me a chance to develop a knowledge of common beliefs and attitudes among migrant Filipinas. At the same time, it helped me to develop empathy and to break down any possible sense of hierarchy while observing and interacting with the participant group. Besides, conducting in-depth face-to-face interviews helped me take a closer look at migrant workers' lives, observe and inquire them. Fedyuk and Zentai believe that "the interview as a method helps not only to access migrant populations (mostly women) working in the shadows of private homes and closed care-institutions, but also, importantly, helps to untangle the meaning and practice of love and caring mix with power and agency in the labour-for-money exchange" (2018, p.176). The interview as a method guided me in my attempt to reflect their experiences in as much detail as possible and made the study more personal. When there were that the participants found inadequate, follow-up questions were asked, breaking up the main questions of the interview into specific ones to collect data in the most accurate way. As in the other qualitative studies, this study does not aim to generalize or represent all the migrant Filipinas in Turkey but rather focuses on personal and particular experiences of a group of Filipina nannies in terms of their tactics, coping mechanisms and experiences in Turkey.

The in-depth interviews were conducted in April and May 2021 with sixteen migrant live-in Filipina nannies who also do domestic duties, and nine Turkish employers who currently hire or formerly hired Filipina nannies. The major field site was planned to be Ankara but, COVID-19 conditions caused all interviews to be held via Zoom Meetings and Facetime calls. This enabled me to interview participants from Istanbul, Ankara, İzmir, Kocaeli and Mersin. Snowball

sampling, a method frequently used while studying minorities, is what I preferred in the study as well. My position in the Embassy of the Philippines enabled me to access the network of FilCom (Filipino Community). First, I interviewed a Filipina nanny whom I already knew from Filcom. This pilot interview helped me to modify my questions and elaborate them. Then, I interviewed the Filipino community leaders who manage and arrange all the activities in the community who at the same time live-in workers themselves. I asked the women I interviewed whether their Filipina friends would like to participate in my study. Some of them talked to their friends and in this way, I got the chance to interview seventeen Filipina nannies living in various cities in Turkey including the pilot interview.

At the second step, I tried to interview the employers of the Filipina nannies that I already contacted. However, none of them accepted their employers to be included in this study. As I explained before, they feared that their answers could be told to their employers. So, I used my own personal network and found some employers who also referred me to their friends hiring Filipina nannies. Unfortunately, I could not reach out to as many employers as I wanted in this way. Therefore, I also contacted some Filipino nanny agencies in Ankara and Istanbul to ask whether their clients might be willing to participate in my study. Two of their clients accepted my invitation, and I interviewed them as well. None of the employers let their helpers talk to me arguing that they were too busy with taking care of babies. My identity as the personal contact of their employer would probably affect the answers of the Filipina workers anyway. So, all the employers in this study are independent from the migrant Filipina women group.

Interviews with migrant Filipina workers lasted 45 to 75 minutes depending on their availability and eagerness to share their experiences. I deliberately wanted to interview them in their day-offs because they were much freer while talking and expressing their honest opinions. Since I had attended various activities and sessions of FilCom beforehand, I knew about some Tagalog words, Filipino

cuisine, gestures, etc. which helped, me to build a mutual trust relationship, leading them to relax and share their feelings more explicitly. However, I had to interview seven of them while they were working in their employers' houses because of lockdown, and they had no day-off during that period of time. These seven women shared their experiences with former employers more in detail than their current employers as some of them feared they have been heard by their employers. I asked these women to be at their rooms and inform me about the time when they would feel themselves free from the housework. Most of them wanted to be interviewed by nighttime around 23.00.

Out of seventeen women that I interviewed, six of did not have work or resident permit and their status was irregular migrant. I deliberately use the word 'irregular' instead of 'illegal' or 'undocumented' here because, IOM refers to the migrants who are unauthorized to enter countries, whose visa has expired or who lack legal permit to live or work, as irregular migrants (IOM, 2019). It was not easy for me to reach out to these irregular migrants because they were hesitant and shy to speak about their current migrant status, and at first, they feared that I might deport them or inform police about their situation. However, I gave them a consent form before conducting the interviews that follows the rules of the Middle East Technical University's Applied Ethics Research Center and assured them that all their names would be kept confidential and not be shared with any other person or institution. Then, they agreed to talk by having a complete trust in me. I recorded their voices once participants gave me their consent; all of them but one agreed to voice recording. Later, I transcribed the recordings by also adding my notes about their gestures and mimics and used all these data in thematic analysis.

The interviews with nine employers lasted approximately 20-30 minutes. Initially, my aim was to interview with female employers who generally have much more contact with Filipina nannies, make their work schedules, decide about the rules and deal with problems at home. However, two of nine female employers wanted their husbands to speak with me instead of them arguing that

their husbands had much more knowledge about their workers. Employers were also hesitant about the confidentiality of this research as some of them were known artists and businesspeople. I followed the same procedure as I did with Filipina workers and gave employers a consent form and informed them that their identities would not be made public in any way. The profiles, (age, marital status, and occupation etc.) of both groups will be reported in the next parts.

To do a qualitative study like this one, first I felt the need to know about the Filipino culture and I even needed to go further and be a part of it to fully understand their experiences. I tasted their cuisine for two years, I observed how they worked, behaved and how important the family values were for them. I also had enough knowledge about the importance of religion for the Filipino people and how they shaped their lives according to religious feelings. I had prior knowledge about the importance of marriage, divorce and other problematic issues for them; I knew for instance, that although divorce is not allowed in their country, some of them living abroad to work had boyfriends while still being married in Philippines. All these issues were familiar to me.

My position in the embassy helped me a lot while trying to draw a sample and collecting data about the experiences of these women and employers. Some of the Filipinas already knew me from the support activities, and others trusted me considering that I was not just a regular person to them. Regarding the employers, it would not have been that easy for them to accept interviewing with me if I had not been working at the embassy because they would not have taken the study seriously if it was not for my Embassy profile. Most of them rejected to participate when they heard this was a study by a university student saying that they did not have time for such an interview, or they were too busy. The ones who accepted, are those who took my study seriously thanks to my job.

This study was held amid COVID-19 pandemic and for this reason the fieldwork was conducted via online meetings instead of face-to-face interviews as I had planned it initially. Online interviews removed the physical limitations of

conducting face to face interviews, enabling to reach out to the interviewees faster. In addition, this helped me to interview Filipinas and employers from all over Turkey, my original plan was limiting myself to Ankara. The virtual meetings also increased the probability of conducting an interview with Filipina workers who were working longer hours without day-offs, as it became possible for them to arrange a meeting with me late at night. Moreover, I suspect that Filipina nannies would not have been as honest as they were if we had interviewed face to face at their employers' house during daytime. Also, they might now have been willing to spare their valuable time and meet me face to face during their 24-hour leave. One last benefit that my study derived from the ongoing pandemic is that there is not much data and research about the working conditions and changing experiences of migrant domestic workers during COVID-19 pandemic, and this may make a contribution to the literature in that respect as well.

As for the limitations that I came across, the language barrier was an important one. All the interviews with Filipinas were held in English but this language was neither theirs nor my mother tongue. It was our second language, therefore, some of what I asked were understood differently than the intention of my question and I needed to clarify these parts again. The participants were also choosing similar words describing their emotions as they were translating it in their minds from Tagalog to English and sometimes having a hard time defining their emotions. Filipinas generally speak fluently in English, but they make lots of grammatical mistakes while speaking. Once transcribing these interviews, I tried to correct them when necessary, to make the sentence comprehensible without letting my correction change the meaning; otherwise, I quoted their words as they were.

Besides, COVID-19 pandemic increased the workload of migrant Filipina workers, and at least four of them promised me a few times but could not make it to the meeting. The ones who spared their time during the nights in their employers' house answered my questions by whispering because they did not

want to be heard by the household. Sometimes, interviews were interrupted as they were answering my questions while cooking or ironing. There were five who tried to present themselves to me as the most hardworking, trustable, and decent workers questions as if they were in a job interview. This led me asking them more questions to learn their true feelings because they were giving automatic and superficial answers like they were ideal workers who did not complain even if they worked for 24/7. The ones who did not have work permit did not want to interview with me first and asked many questions although I gave them the consent form. It took a while for them to believe me that I would not deport them. One of them also thought I could help her get her permit because she had applied already two times and got rejected. They asked me to arrange their permits to get rid of the irregular status. I explained to them my position as a translator at the embassy and told them that I did not have anything to do with consular affairs. Regarding the employers, the first limitation was that I wanted to reach out to as many employers as possible, but it was hard to find employers with Filipina nannies who would like to speak about their personal lives. Secondly, they did not want to make Facetime call, and two of them offered me to send them questions and then to write me back or to call them instead of a video call. I explained that this study has to be face to face and they were not allowed to see the questions beforehand.

### **3.1. General Profile of the Interviewees**

I will give below the details of the socio-demographic characteristics of the Filipina nannies and employer interviewees for a better understanding of their experiences. The research was originally planned to include 20 migrant Filipina nannies or domestic workers working as live-ins. However, the heavy workload because of the pandemic and working conditions without day-offs led four women to postpone the meetings a few times, and they eventually canceled despite their interest to participate. In depth interviews are the main data collection tools of this study, 16 migrant Filipinas along with 9 employers participated in this study as interviewees. In order to protect the confidentiality

of the participants, I will mention Filipina migrant nannies as “Ms. A or Ms. B.” and employers as “Madam 1 or Sir 2”.

**Table 1.** Age, Marital Status, Number of Children and Legal Status

<b>Name</b>	<b>Age</b>	<b>Marital Status</b>	<b>Number of Children</b>	<b>Legal Status in Turkey</b>
<b>Ms. A.</b>	40	Married	3	No Work Permit
<b>Ms. B.</b>	33	Single	-	Work Permit
<b>Ms. C.</b>	33	Married	2	No Work permit
<b>Ms. D.</b>	43	Married	1	Work Permit
<b>Ms. E.</b>	47	Married but Separated	3	Work Permit
<b>Ms. F.</b>	40	Widowed	3	Work Permit
<b>Ms. G.</b>	47	Married	3	Work Permit
<b>Ms. H.</b>	41	Married	2	No Work Permit
<b>Ms. I.</b>	52	Married	3	No Work Permit
<b>Ms. J.</b>	48	Married	3	Work Permit
<b>Ms. K.</b>	37	Single	1	No Work Permit
<b>Ms. L.</b>	46	Married	1	No Work Permit
<b>Ms. M.</b>	35	Married	3	Work Permit
<b>Ms. N.</b>	31	Single	-	Work Permit
<b>Ms. O.</b>	39	Single	1	Work Permit
<b>Ms. P.</b>	39	Single	-	Work Permit

All the migrant Filipina women interviewed work as live-in nannies who also perform domestic duties. The age range of the women interviewed is from 31 to 52. Most of them stated they started working abroad in their thirties. Out of sixteen women nine of them are married in the country of origin, five of them are single, one of them seems married on paper but separated and one of them is widowed. Among the single ones three of them are mothers who choose not to marry because there is no law for divorce in the Philippines. The children of Filipinas are either looked after by their grandparents or husbands in the country



of origin. Most of them state that their children are grown-up. All of them send remittances to support their families in the Philippines. The ones who are single send money for their siblings or others who are in need. While ten of them have work permit and are authorized to work in Turkey, six of them work without it. These six workers state that it is hard to get a permit again once they lose it because there are so many procedures that they need to follow.

**Table 2.** Education, Former Occupation and Current Wages in Turkey

<b>Name</b>	<b>Education</b>	<b>Profession in the Country of Origin</b>	<b>Countries other than Turkey</b>	<b>Wage in other Countries</b>	<b>Wage in Turkey</b>
<b>Ms. A.</b>	High School	Small Business Owner	Kuwait	400 USD	900USD
<b>Ms. B.</b>	Quit University	Office Assistant	Hong Kong	600 USD	1000USD
<b>Ms. C.</b>	High School	-	Cyprus	360 EUR	800USD
<b>Ms. D.</b>	Quit University	-	Hong Kong, Cyprus	500 USD 600 USD	800USD
<b>Ms. E.</b>	High School	Caregiver	Saudi Arabia, Dubai	350 USD 400 USD	1200 USD
<b>Ms. F.</b>	Quit University	Secretary	Kuwait	250USD	900 USD
<b>Ms. G.</b>	University	Pawnshop Assistant	-	-	800 USD
<b>Ms. H.</b>	High School	Coffee Shop Helper	Malaysia, Singapore	500 USD, 600 USD	900USD

**Table 2.** (Continued)

<b>Ms. I.</b>	University	-	Taiwan, Hong Kong, Makau	800-1000 USD	900USD
<b>Ms. J.</b>	High School	Department Store Assistant	Singapore	600USD	950USD
<b>Ms. K.</b>	University	Cashier	Dubai, Singapore, Hong Kong	300 USD, 500 USD, 600 USD	900USD
<b>Ms. L.</b>	Quit University	Small Business Owner	Cyprus, Hong Kong	450 EUR, 600USD	800 USD
<b>Ms. M.</b>	University	Community Coordinator	Hong Kong	600 USD	800 USD
<b>Ms. N.</b>	University	Nurse	Hong Kong	600 USD	800 USD
<b>Ms. O.</b>	University	-	Hong Kong	600 USD	1000 USD
<b>Ms. P.</b>	University	-	Kuwait Hong Kong	200 USD, 400 USD	800USD

The Filipinas who would like to work abroad need to be at least high school graduates. So, my group has a high education level. High school graduates have certificates of cleaning, and babysitting given by government which trained them for being a nanny or domestic helper abroad. Most of my interviewees are either university graduates or they quit college to get married. Three of my participants were graduated from education departments and others from vocational schools, nursing colleges, school of computer science or information technology sciences.

After graduation, most of them could not find jobs related to their education and they chose migration to earn more.

When I asked them about their former jobs, none of them said they were happy in Philippines because they were either unemployed or working for jobs that they could earn around 100 USD a month. Two of my participants said they had small businesses, but these businesses were small shops that all other family members also worked, and it was not profitable enough for them to meet the basic needs of their children. The ones who wanted to earn more generally migrated to countries like Hong Kong, Singapore, Dubai, Saudi Arabia, Cyprus, and Kuwait thanks to labor agreements of these countries with Philippines. Especially Hong Kong is a popular destination for Filipinas because 8 participants in my study stated that they came from Hong Kong. Çeltikçi explains that the most important reason why Filipinas choose Hong Kong is the belief that it will be easier to go to Canada from Hong Kong (2019, p.29).

Since Turkey is not among the countries which have a labor agreement with the Philippines, Filipinas come to Turkey mostly from other countries. This has changed with the latest regulations in 2018, about the third country deployment by the cooperation of the Embassy of the Philippines in Ankara and the Turkish Ministry of Foreign Affairs. As I was told by the embassy personnel, since there were many Filipinas who were brought to Turkey through agencies from countries like Hong Kong and Dubai, the government of the Philippines could not keep the statistical record of regular and irregular migrants. There were many Filipinas in Turkey who seemed to be on the system, working in Hong Kong but in reality, ended up in Turkey without security and work permits. Hence, it is decided that the Turkish Consulate in Hong Kong will not give any work permits to Filipinas. The only place to get their authorized permits is the Turkish Embassy in Manila. The goal here is to make Filipinas come to Turkey directly from their country of origin, ideally through the Turkish Embassy in Manila.

Except for one Filipina who came to Turkey in 2019, all my participants came here from other countries knowing that Turkey was among the countries which offered the highest wages to Filipinas and they chose here for that reason. These 15 women who worked in countries other than Turkey before stated that they were also nannies and domestic helpers in their previous destinations, but their conditions were different. Therefore, they were able to compare Turkish employers to the others, a detailed analysis of which will be provided in the following sections. Apparently, wages in Turkey vary between \$ 800 to \$ 1200 depending on experience and legal status. Irregular migrants who do not have written contracts generally earn around \$ 800 to \$ 900 as they cannot demand a rise in their wages.

**Table 3.** Employers' Demographic Profile

<b>Name</b>	<b>Education</b>	<b>Sex</b>	<b>Age</b>	<b>Profession</b>	<b>City</b>	<b>Marital Status</b>
<b>Madam 1</b>	University	Female	37	Does not work	İstanbul	Married
<b>Sir 2</b>	University	Male	38	Lawyer	Kocaeli	Married
<b>Sir 3</b>	University	Male	49	Officer	İzmir	Married
<b>Madam 4</b>	Master's Degree	Female	44	Senior Legal Expert	Guatemala (Ankara)	Married
<b>Madam 5</b>	University	Female	30	Housewife	Ankara	Married
<b>Madam 6</b>	University	Female	43	Does not work	İstanbul	Married
<b>Madam 7</b>	Master's Degree	Female	46	Life Coach	Kıbrıs Magusa	Married
<b>Madam 8</b>	Master's Degree	Female	36	Financial Consultant	İstanbul	Married
<b>Madam 9</b>	University	Female	35	Does not work	İstanbul	Married

In the second phase of this research, I interviewed with nine employers who were currently hiring live-in migrant Filipina nannies or hired them before. Sir 3., Madam 6 and 7 stated they were formerly working with Filipinas but not at the time of our interview. Employers stated that they wanted to have Filipina for

their children, but they also pointed out that they were looking for someone to tidy up the house. Hence, Madam 1. for instance, stated that she had three Filipinas in her house, two of them taking care of kids and one of them mostly for cleaning. Employers' ages vary between 30 and 49, and most of them being in in their late thirties. All nine participants of this group are college graduates, however, only four of them are currently working. Those who do not work are married to husbands who are ambassador, factory owner also having auto gallery, owner of private foundation schools, or social media agent. All the employers, except Madam 7, stated that they found all her their employees through recruitment agencies. Madam 7 found the previous two of her employees through her personal networks, who had to hire three different Filipinas as all of them run away to their boyfriends. Madam 6 also said that she replaced a Filipina worker with another one because the first one was not getting well with her other domestic workers. Except for two employers, all participants stated that they formerly hired both Turkish and migrant domestic workers from Georgia, Uzbekistan or Kyrgyzstan. So, this led them to compare and contrast Filipinas with other employees from other nationalities during interviews. The rest of these interviewees were belonging to upper and upper-middle class families.

## **CHAPTER 4**

### **MIGRATION EXPERIENCES AND CONDITIONS OF FILIPINA NANNIES IN TURKEY**

The results of sixteen interviews with migrant Filipina domestic and care workers regarding their migration and work experiences are presented in this chapter. The main concern in this section is to investigate what drives migrants to leave their home country, why migrant Filipinas choose Turkey as a destination point, and how and from which routes immigrant women reach Turkey. Their working conditions in terms of contracts, job description, working hours, annual and weekly leaves, wages, weekly allowances, work permits and conditions after COVID-19 pandemic will also be explored.

#### **4.1.Reasons of Migration and Choosing Turkey as a Destination Point**

Philippines adopted a “manpower exchange policy” (Paul, 2011, p. 1846) as an economic strategy to cope with rising unemployment and external imbalance in the country. Adopting Structural Adjustment Policies to cope with international competitiveness, Philippines became heavily dependent on export-oriented production while especially institutionalizing the export of labor by the promotion of the government. Excessive number of workers in the country created a reserve army of labor which led to lower wages and more unemployment. Rising unemployment rates, low-wage jobs, and the need for survival among all these difficulties led many Filipinas to migrate. Aside from these factors, in her research about Filipinas in Turkey, Çeltikçi argues that “Focusing solely on economic reasons is risky and dangerous as it prevents us from seeing other causes of migration.” (2019, p.20). She mentions that Filipinas see migration as an escape from their violent, drunken, abusive, unemployed,

and cheating husbands (Çeltikçi, 2019, p.180). Then, there are multiple reasons behind the migration of Filipinas.

When they are asked about their reasons of migration, all my participants supported the economic difficulties was their main motivation and they stated that the wages were too low, not enough to feed their family and they were needed to earn more. For example, leaving her three children behind Ms. M. said:

Working in the Philippines is good. You are together with your family, but salaries are too low, and almost half of my salary was going to the benefits like paying my medical Philippine Health and social benefits. The rest is not enough for my family. I have my husband's support, but it is still not enough. (Ms, M.,35 years old).

The rest of the Filipinas like Ms. M stated that it is hard to earn money in Philippines. Ehrenreich & Hoschschild argues that global inequalities in wages are one of the main motivations for migration (2003). While working abroad as nannies, Filipinas earn three times more than the doctors in their country. Similarly, Ms. F. explained that her husband died in 2009, she was earning minimum wage which was 8000 pesos at that time (approximately \$ 150) and there was no option other than migrating for her to provide her three children a better life.

Furthermore, except for three of my participants, all the Filipina migrant workers in my study are mothers and they believe that they need to make sacrifices with their own life to help with the education of their children by sending remittances to their family. Leaving her country 18 years ago Ms. E. said:

Philippines... it is hard to leave especially when you have three kids who are small. They were just 7,6 and 4 years old when I left them. In my mind, I wanted to give them a good life. Especially my youngest, she was sick, she needed food, money. So, I needed to suffer for this, I needed to earn more for my children's school fees. (Ms. E., 47 years old)

So, providing for the education their children is among the dominant factors behind the decision to migrate. For the rest of mothers like Ms. E., the decision to seek work abroad is a real challenge as they choose not being together with their own children to give them a better life. An important determinant for them in this migration decision is their trust to extended families who will look after their children once they send remittances and provide the expenses working abroad. All my mother participants stated that they either left their children to husbands or their own mothers. One of the single participants in the research group also stated that her main motivation was her family:

I came from a poor family and I saw my parents can't really afford to give us the life that we want, and I also thought I need to help them back after they fed me, and I became grown up. I have a lot of siblings younger than me. So, I needed to work and earn more. So, the motivation was actually my family. I love them so much. (Ms. K., 37 years old)

On the other hand, the other single informants in the research group, Ms. B. and Ms. N had other reasons than the economic conditions in Philippines. They stated that they wanted to visit some other countries and experience the life outside of Philippines. Particularly Ms. B explained that she did not choose an easy life, but it is not good either to be in the comfort zone always and forever.

Other participants explained their motivation to migrate by the unemployment in the country. Braverman, a Marxist scholar, claims that in the era of monopoly capitalism, jobs are being made deskilled or degraded, and most of them are done by women (Previtali & Fagiani, 2015). He argues that by employing women, employers reduce the value of skilled worker's labor and thus wages (Previtali & Fagiani, 2015). Filipina migrants have received higher education, but their labor is considered "deskilled" in the international labor market as they are employed in the service sector. For example, Ms.O. stated that she never had the chance to work in the Philippines because wages were too low, and she could not find a well-paid job although she got a bachelor's degree from elementary education and her main motivation was to find a job abroad in which she could use her teaching skills. Similarly, Ms. P. said that it was hard for her to find a



good job as a university graduate because there were many others like her, and her academic credentials did not make any difference in finding a job in the country. So, the brain drain phenomenon, a term used for skilled labor migration from developing countries, affects the Philippines while triggering deskilled labor migration to the world (Alburo & Abella, 2002). University graduate Filipinas, like Ms. O. and Ms. P, cannot use their educational capital in countries experiencing brain drain where their skills, qualifications, and professional experiences are not valued in the labor market while these women are, at the same time, overqualified for domestic duties.

Another reason for migration, aside from, economic difficulties, is broken up or cheating families. As suggested by Çeltikçi (2019) the traditional family institution in the Philippines is at risk of falling apart, due to transnational "broken up" families and a large number of unofficially divorced couples. Only one of my participants stated that she left the country for this kind of family-related reasons:

My husband was cheating on me. I was sure that he had a relationship, but I had nowhere to go with my children. So, I decided to go abroad. My husband takes care of my children now. I have a boyfriend here. I will go back to Philippines in two years, and I don't know how it is going to be (Ms. C., 33 years old).

Ms. C. was shy telling me she is also cheating her husband, but it is clear that the lack of divorce law in the country creates problems for families while creating married but separate couples.

Choosing Turkey as a destination point was not planned for most of my participants. All but one migrant women in this study preferred countries like UAE, Qatar, and Hong Kong but they later realized Turkey as a good option. In the literature, it is stated that most of the foreign domestic workers prefer Turkey because of geographical proximity, visa-regime between Turkey and their country of origin, and cheaper travel expenses (Dinçer, 2014; Atatimur, 2008). However, the Philippines and Turkey are not geographically close, there is no

bilateral labor agreement between these two countries, and it is really expensive for my participants to come here. So, for Filipinas, there must be other reasons for their decision of Turkey.

When they are asked about their decision to choose Turkey as a destination point, my participants stated that the wages are two times higher here than any other places they have worked. Therefore, their main motivation to come Turkey is earning more.

I chose Turkey because I have friends here who told me Turkey is better in terms of salary, people are nice, and the country is good to live. (Ms. D., 43 years old)

When I was in Hong Kong, I was working together with my sister. She is younger than me. She thinks that Turkey is better than Hong Kong because of the salaries. When she came here, after three months I decided to come here to follow her. We have been living here for almost 4 years already. (Ms. L, 46 years old)

Of course, the big difference in terms of salary (Ms. A., 40 years old).

In addition, twelve of them said that they had friends or relatives working in Turkey who invited them to come here and that was the second influential reason in the decision to choose Turkey as a destination point. Twelve women talked to Filipino community leaders and other friends who have experience of working Turkey to get advice, an invitation or sometimes help while finding the perfect employer makes their decision to come to Turkey easier.

My sister was in Turkey. She said Turkey is better, come here. Then I came. (Ms. O., 39 years old)

Because my friend said that Turkey is so good, people are so good, foods are so good, the place is good, I was encouraged to come here, for the experience, it is different, rather than staying in Hong-Kong. (Ms. N. 31 years old)

I am a Filipino Muslim, and I knew Turkey is a Muslim country and it attracted me. Filipino people encouraged me as well, they said it's good to live here. (Ms. B., 33 years old)

The common point of these twelve women that they have social networks and friends in Turkey and this both encouraged them to come here and created a secure feeling that they would not be alone in the country. Furthermore, there are

also others like Ms. B. above who also had the religious reasons while coming here. Related to this, Ms. G. said the following regarding how she decided about:

The agency had other Middle Eastern countries like UAE, Kuwait, Qatar, and Turkey. I searched about Turkey and saw that it's an open country. For example, Saudi Arabia is not an open country. I mean the hijab thing. That's why I came here. (Ms. G., 47).

Two of my participants also highlighted the proximity of Turkey to Europe. They saw Turkey as a bridge to Europe while deciding to come.

There is a great opportunity in Turkey, and it is closer to Europe, so I used the privilege to work here. Why not? Right (Ms.P., 39 years old).

My friend said Turkey is good. After that you come here, you can go to Europe. Salaries are higher in Europe but going there is hard. You do not need to work only as nanny in Europe. You can work in café or restaurant as well... (Ms. I., 52 years old).

Therefore, higher wages, invitation of friends and family members, religious status of the country and its geographical location for those who would like to work in Europe, make Turkey a desirable destination point for Filipina workers.

The interviews suggest that, there are multiple driving forces behind Filipinas' migration decision. The main motivations that make them leave their country are high unemployment rates, lower wages, worsening living conditions, and the desire to provide a better future for their children and family. This forced migration, as an act of sacrifice, is performed by women to compensate for their motherly duties by giving their children the chance for a better future than the conditions in Philippines offer. "Feminization of migration" (Parrenas, 2015, p. 30) rises with these dedicated lives who carry the burden of whole family and "feminization of survival" (Sassen, 2000, p. 511) determines the future of these families, societies, and governments. They choose Turkey as a destination point mostly for higher salaries, recommendations from their friends or family members, religious reasons and/ or geographical proximity of country to Europe.

## **4.2. Arranging Migration to Turkey through Agencies**

Arranging migration to Turkey is a challenging and at the same time expensive option when it is considered the average income in the Philippines. In her study, Atatimur lists that there are four ways to obtain travel and work permits for migrant women coming to Turkey (2008). They can provide it from their savings, their employer pays the expenses, when they can't afford it, they borrow from some other people and finally through recruitment agencies (Atatimur, 2008, p.113). Fifteen of my participants preferred recruitment agencies either to get help for processing papers and permits or finding employers.

Recruitment agencies play a crucial role in this migration flow of Filipinas to Turkey because, except for one, all my participants stated that they came to Turkey through these agencies. The agencies that they applied in their previous country have contacts with Turkish agencies. So, they have to work with two agencies to find their perfect job in Turkey. These agencies work together to supply Turkish employers with Filipinas. When Filipinas decide to migrate they generally apply for agencies in the Philippines. These agencies helps nannies to prepare the necessary documents and contact with Turkish agencies to find the employer in Turkey. The agencies in Philippines generally take \$ 1500 to \$ 2000 for this service according to my participants.

Contrary to the belief and statements in other migrant studies (Dinçer, 2014) that Turkey is among the cheapest alternative for migrants, and it is easier to come here, my participants think it is hard and expensive to come to Turkey.

I paid a lot of money. \$ 1700 for placement fee, visa expenses, and other paperwork to my agency. Then I paid my ticket one way only \$ 700. I paid to my employer some of it and it is deducted from my salary (Ms. I.,52 years old).

It is so expensive to come here. I lost my half year salary in Singapore (Ms.H.,41 years old).

I found a recruitment agency and paid \$ 1600 in Hong Kong including travel tickets, placement fee and everything. It was too much for me, but I thought I would earn a lot more than I spent (Ms. D.,43 years old).

These expenses for Filipina women are also crucial determinants in their decision of destination country. Because coming to Turkey is more costly than going to some other places, only the ones who can afford to come here usually those, who worked in other places and saved up money for coming to Turkey, chooses this country as a destination point.

Recruitment agencies in Turkey receive a commission from both Filipina workers and employers. Employers who would like to hire Filipina nannies should pay one month salary of a Filipina to the agency prior to the arrival of the nanny from Philippines. Filipinas pay the commission to agencies in Philippines and two agencies agree on the amount they get. The agencies in Turkey agencies are established under the Turkish Employment Organization (İŞKUR) and their responsibilities are finding jobs for Filipina women, helping them change their employer once their terms are done, or with any problems in the household. When they get a demand from employers who would like to employ Filipinas, these agencies try to contact agencies in other countries who help them find appropriate Filipina candidates and after the interview, they assist in bringing the Filipinas to Turkey. They also help employers to get a work permit for their Filipina employee or Apostille<sup>5</sup> (Red Ribbon) certificate.

There are many illegal agencies, whose exact numbers not known by officials, which bring Filipina workers from other countries with tourist visas valid for three months and try to find them jobs in this period and provide them a work permit later. They might not always guarantee the permit and Filipinas accept these insecure jobs without any written contract or authorization. According to my observations, the problem with both illegal and legal agencies is that they might abuse the rights of Filipinas and sometimes do not help them once their employers terminate the work permit. So, they do not give workers a chance to

---

<sup>5</sup> Apostille Contract (Red Ribbon) means that the contract confirming that an employer in Turkey has hired a Filipino employee is approved by the Turkish and Philippines authorities. Thanks to this contract, an employer residing in Turkey and a Filipino employee will be able to seek their rights both in Turkey and in the Philippines. (Pinoy Nanny Agency, Apostil Kontrat Red Ribbon, <https://www.pinoynanny.com/site-content/red-ribbon-apostil-kontrat>)

end their own job because workers are afraid that they might lose their work permit if they leave the job and cannot get it back again.

I am illegal now. I have no work permit because of my agency. When I came here to work in Ankara, I worked for a family for two months and they did not give my day-off and I said I wanted to leave but my agency said they will cut my work permit and will not give it to me back again... You know the agencies they only care about money, money, money... (Ms. I., 52 years old)

After I left my job in Antalya, I came to Istanbul. I learned that my former employers cut my working permit. When I was in Istanbul, I found my own job. My agency was telling me, if you don't mind, you're always interviewing but you can't get the job. Of course, for me madam, I always try to get the job. Then I found my own job myself. They do not help you if decide to leave your employer. (Ms. C., 33years old)

The owner of my agency brought me from the airport directly to her house and she wanted me to clean her house first. I was tired of flight, but I did it anyway. Later, she did not pay me anything and the next day we went to my employer's house together! I was shocked at first because I didn't like this behavior of her, but I didn't say anything. (Ms. D., 43 years old)

These examples from my own participant group show that these women are open to exploitation by their agencies. Although they pay a lot to come here and need the assistance to find Turkish employers, agencies might leave them to their own fates after providing one employer. Their only role in this recruitment process is collaborating with agencies in Hong Kong, Dubai, Singapore, or Qatar, requesting ideal candidates, and bringing them together with Turkish employers. Therefore, they do not care much about the conditions, situations, and relationships in the Turkish household. Agencies act as intermediary contacts, but they mostly consider their own benefit in this employment process.

### **4.3 Working Conditions in Turkey**

In this part of the research, I will reflect on the working conditions in Turkey for the participants of this study by focusing on the job description, contracts, leaves, wages, work permits, the fragile conditions of irregular migrants, and what has changed for them after COVID-19. All the interviewed Filipina women in this study, work as live-ins because it minimizes their cost of living and helps

them to send remittances to their home country. I particularly wanted to interview the ones who worked as live-ins as this format requires a closer employer-employee relationship, especially during a pandemic. Turkish employers particularly prefer live-in nannies, and this demand is only covered by migrant workers including Filipinas.

Glenn (1986) argues that live-in format blurs the line between job space and private space because,

Live-in nanny/housekeepers are at once socially isolated and surrounded by other people's territory; during the hours they remain on the employers' premises, their space, like their time, belongs to another. The sensation of being among others while remaining invisible, unknown, and apart, of never being able to leave the margins, makes many live-in employees sad, lonely, and depressed. (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2007, p.54).

The participants of this study reflected the heavy burden of live-in arrangements, making these women put up with less freedom and personal space in the house of their employers. The following section will discuss the contracts and heavy burden of living-in by analyzing the job description of Filipina workers in Turkey.

#### **4.3.1. Contracts and Job Description**

Written contracts, documented papers, and notary approval are necessary when an employer in Turkey decides to hire a Filipina. These are at the same time protective measures that can secure both workers' and employers' rights. Out of sixteen participants, ten of them have written contracts and they also have their work permits. These women stated that their job description, wages, rights, annual leaves, and other benefits are all stated in written contracts. Except for one, eight of them have also social security and health insurance. However, six of my interviewees are irregular migrants who do not have a work permit and therefore employers prefer doing verbal contracts. These women either came to Turkey with a tourist visa and stayed afterward or they lost their work permit

once they wanted to leave their current jobs in Turkey. None of them have any insurance or social security and they are also afraid to go to a hospital because they can be caught by the police. In the absence of a written contract, migrants are much more insecure as they have no job definition or document to protect their rights. For example, an irregular migrant Ms. L. (46) stated that her employer wanted her to work 24 hours without any leaves. Ms. K. also said that “If you don’t have any contract, you have no insurance in any case at all.” (37 years old). Informality makes domestic workers more open to exploitation (Hochschild, 2003, p. 101) and the absence of a contract leaves the Filipina women to employers’ mercy.

Regardless of the contract being written or oral, Turkish employers do not strictly follow the job description. Due to the invisibility of domestic and care work as well as the unclear line between working and nonworking time, the scope of the job description is extended, leading to the exploitation of Filipinas who are ready to do whatever their employer demands from them. In her article, Akalin (2007) focuses on live-in caregivers and argues that they also perform daily chores. She distinguishes the line between ‘heavy cleaning’ and ‘daily chores’ while describing the duties of migrant workers. According to her, “duties like ironing, doing the laundry, dusting, making beds are under the description of daily chores” and more physical tasks like “washing the windows, vacuuming the apartments and scrubbing the floors” are considered as heavy cleaning (Akalin, 2007, p. 217). She also argues that employers do not see daily chores as real work because they also do these tasks themselves. Furthermore, care work requires an intimate and much more personal relationship which necessitates emotional labor addition to original job description.

Çelik (2004) avers that live-in workers in her study are supposed to manage other works than their primary responsibilities. Similarly, although all my participants but one were hired as nannies to look after the children, most of them perform daily chores such as ironing, vacuuming, washing the dishes, or tidy up the house as well. According to my participants, Turkish employers, in



parallel to Akalın's (2007) observation above, expect them to do "daily chores" which are regarded as 'light work' or 'simple tidy-up' in addition to their nanny duties. These women state that they had interviewed with their employers before coming to Turkey and learned their employers' expectations from them, but some employers actually demanded more than they have offered in the interview.

While interviewing, they gave details about your work. In Istanbul, I was taking care of two kids only. It was not hard because they were in the school. While they are there, I was cleaning the house, cooking, tidying up, just simple. (Ms. A., 40 years old)

We did an interview when I was in Singapore. They told me I was going to be just a nanny but when I came here as usual do the light work... Ironing for baby, cleaning baby's room, feeding baby. Sometimes when I am free, I help my coworker. She is Kirghiz. I cook in the morning for the baby. (Ms. J., 48 years old)

During the interview, they gave me a description. When I came here, I already know what I am going to do. Taking care of the children, a little bit of tidying up, that's it. I don't do heavy cleaning (Ms. M., 35 years old)

Other than that, three Filipinas stated they were not given any job description in detail which led them to work more than regular hours.

They didn't tell me anything. They just wanted me to take care of the baby mostly. I mean I cannot say they exploited me but there are times especially last year they wanted me to do more than I could ever do. Before the pandemic, my boss was working outside but when the pandemic started, we became together always, and she wanted me to bring tea three times a day. Do more cleaning, more handwashing. So, I can say she became a bit demanding. Before she wasn't like that. (Ms. D., 43 years old)

Two of my interviewees also state that although they are hired as 'nannies', employers give them the responsibility of walking the dog and watering the plants. Besides, five of them help with the shopping for the house and six of them also babysit to the children of employers' friends.

Filipinas are hardworking people and they generally do not complain about additional tasks. For some of them, helping with daily chores is already a part of

their duty as they believe that it is the nature of their job. In the next chapter it is also reflected that they state that they feel like a family member and they should assist with the things to do in the house.

When they say you are a nanny, you cannot expect that you are just a nanny. You have to do everything... you know how to do cooking, cleaning, how to iron because even they say they do not expect it, you are the one who needs to organize the house. (Ms. E. 47 years old)

It's up to you if you have free time, you can do a household chore. It comes from your heart. It's not just like an employer forcing you to do some things. You do it yourself because you also live in that house. We share cooking, cleaning sometimes. If you live with your parents, that's the same thing (Ms.B.,33 years old)

They don't expect me to do heavy cleaning, but I do some cleaning. In my job, this is like a commonsense you know. If you are free, you can do some daily cleaning for example I just tidy up and help cleaning sometimes (Ms.O.39 years old).

Most of my participants have accepted the fact that their employers would broaden boundaries their job description. Touching upon this nature of the job, Lin and Belanger state that:

When the boundaries between work and helping were unclear, the employer-employee relationship became blurred. Additional tasks included childcare, laundry, meal preparation, and assisting in the employer's own business. Although workers might have felt that they were being exploited, they nonetheless passively accepted the requests to avoid any potential conflict and to secure their job. Such subtle exploitation increased the worker's vulnerability (2012, p. 310).

So, it is obvious that Filipina nannies accept their passivity and they do not even mention daily chores as a separate duty from their jobs. When I asked them two or three times, I get the exact definition of their duty, which they otherwise describe as "all-around", meaning that doing nanny duties and all household chores at the same time. They perceive doing jobs other than their duties as commonsense and argue that it mostly comes from their heart, but they do not mention that they are exploited these by additional tasks.

The interviews suggest that the job description of Filipina nannies in Turkey is employer centered as it requires these women to perform other duties than their own, which makes their job highly flexible. The ones who do not have written contracts, are not informed at all about their duties face a vague work schedule and tend to physically work more than others. For the rest of my participants, gratitude and happiness in the workplace are expressed through words like “common sense” and “helping out” as they believe they do not do additional tasks as a necessity, but it comes from their heart because they are part of that family. Moreover, they do not care too much about their daily work hours but rather focus on having full day-offs and annual leaves and this will be discussed in the next part.

#### **4.3.2. Working Hours and Leaves**

The uncertainty in the definition of care work means uncertain working hours: women should be ready to fulfill the demands and needs of the employers night and day. As it is mentioned in other studies as well (Colen,1995; Ege, 2002; Çelik,2004), because of the live-in nature of the work, the daily work hours of the migrant women are flexible, unregulated, and generally shaped up by the schedule of the employer. The common problem of most of these women is extra working hours as it is not reflected in workers’ wages. Filipina women in Turkey are no different than other migrants who work in live-in format because their schedule depends on employers’ needs and they are not paid extra for their services. Ten of my participants state that they do not count hours; but, the average daily working hours of migrant Filipina women vary between 13 and 16 hours as they generally wake up around 07.00 and finish their work around 21.00.

There are no specific hours. Whenever kids sleep, I rest, they are awake I work. My work starts at 08.00 and ends around 12.00. I have 2 hours break and I work until 21.00 at night. (Ms. O.,39 years old)

No working hours arranged. If kids do not sleep, I work, if everybody in the house sleeps, I rest. (Ms.P.,39 years old)

I don't count my hours because I am a stay-in. I wake up around 7 o'clock and then until 9 o'clock I work. (Ms.C.,33 years old)

For the first employer 24 hours of work. No rest. Even sleeping in the night, you can't sleep if the baby cries, you need to wake up. You cannot say I sleep. (Ms.L.46 years old)

The problem of nannies like Ms. L., who look after newborn babies (sometimes twins, or triplets) is that they take on 'the duties of a mother' like waking up at nighttime, and feeding the baby, then get ready for a daytime to prepare breakfast or do daily chores. They cannot decide on the work hours or they cannot say that they need to rest after being awake the whole night. Ms. O., for instance, waits for the arrival of her employers sometimes, which is tiring yet she has no choice:

Sometimes they come home so late, the kids sleep, and I wait for them. I can't say something like 'when are you coming?' I just wait and it can be tiring as I have a headache if I wait for them until 3 a.m. and wake up at 7 o'clock to prepare the kids' breakfast (Ms. O., 39 years old).

These words suggest that unclear work hours restrict the resting time of nannies while leading to further health-related problems like headaches and fatigue.

Fourteen nannies say that during daytime, if they get tired, they can have some rest in their rooms. However, two of my participants do not have a room for themselves:

In Izmir, we were 10 people working for the family. We don't have enough room to sleep. We were sleeping on the floor, the other ones sleeping in the coaches. The two sleep on the sofa. I was sleeping on the floor. (Ms.L.,46 years old)

I don't have my room, but the baby is little, so she stays with her mother and I stay in the baby's room. No toilet, just wardrobe and an extra bed that's all (Ms. P., 39 years old)

The daytime rest of nannies depends on employers and the age group that they generally deal with. The ones who look after newborn babies consider themselves lucky because they can rest when the baby sleeps. For the others,

who take care of older children, they either rest for 10-15 minutes at their rooms or use lunch or dinner time of the family as resting opportunity.

I start at 7 o'clock and I work until 9 p.m. If my baby sleeps, I rest or at lunch or dinner time. (Ms. D., 43 years old)

We have free time if the kids are sleeping. We cannot say I will rest now. Because you know a lot of work to do. You have to fix something, clean bathrooms, fold their clothes and you will prepare food for the child or employer like that. So, if you are clever enough to fix things earlier, you will finish earlier. In the midday, you can have your coffee or snacks for 15 minutes like that. (Ms.F.,40 years old)

Four of my participants laughed at me when I asked if they had free time in a working day and said that they did not have any time to rest as they were not paid for this.

Free time? What free time? Sometimes you can go to your room and sit down but not always. It depends on the employer and work. (Ms.I.,52 years old)

Other than that, weekly leave of my participant group is generally one day after working for six days. Fourteen of them stated that they used to have their off-days on Sundays earlier, however, new pandemic circumstances required them to have their off-days on weekdays to go to the bank and find some open shopping malls to spend their time. Five interviewees do not have 24 hours' leave or any leave at all during the pandemic. Rather, they stay in their own room for one full day to rest. This is mostly because employers order them to have it like that but there were two nannies stated that they also concerned with their own health.

6 days working 1 day off day starts at 9 o'clock and ends around 17.00 in the afternoon. Not a 24-hour leave. (Ms. J., 48 years old)

At first, it was fine. It has been a year now. My last out was last March, do you believe that? After that, August. October and after October, January. It is true. My friends are getting crazy with me. I am protecting myself, at the same time, I am protecting the family I work with. (Ms. G. 47 years old))

Every week I have an off day, but I stay in my room because of coronavirus. I never take my 24 hours holiday because it was my decision as I needed to save money. They gave me extra if I do not use my holiday. (Ms. P., 39 years old)

Last year, when COVID came out, we couldn't leave the house for 2 months. It was quite stressful but eventually, I started to go out. I adjusted. When it's lockdown I don't have my day off but after that, I will have. In a lockdown, they let me have a day off in my room. (Ms. K.,37 years old)

I work 6 days and 1 day off. Sometimes this changes. In pandemic time I haven't go to the street starting March to July. Right now, she is a bit strict but sometimes I have my off day on Saturdays. (Ms.D.,43 years old)

During the first hit of the corona, I was with my employer in Istanbul, 6 months no go out. I was at home. That's why I cannot live anymore like this. So, I need to leave (Ms.L.46 years old)

Some of these nannies, then can be seen as imprisoned in their employers' house under the conditions of heavy workload 7/24 without any weekly leaves. Before coronavirus, fourteen of them were using their weekly leaves but pandemic restricted them from this right. Moreover, the irregular status of some nannies makes it difficult for them to have their day off because there are lots of police controls due to lockdown and curfew measures.

#### **4.3.3. Wages and Weekly Allowances**

Filipinas in Turkey earn a lot more than the domestic workers from other countries and they are known for their expensive service in the Turkish market (Akalin, 2014; Ayaydin, 2020). In 2021, according to the work agreement approved by the Embassy of Philippines in Ankara, the minimum monthly Filipina wage is \$ 800. Accordingly, the interviewees in this study state that their wages vary between \$ 800 to \$ 1200 depending on experience, legal status, and dollar's value against the Turkish lira. Comparing with other migrant studies which state that Kyrgyz, Uzbek, Turkmen, and Kazakh women earn around \$ 400 to \$ 600 a month (Yilmaz& Özaydin, 2020, p.81), the wages of Filipinas are two and even three times higher.

Weekly leave allowances are given to domestic workers or nannies to cover their activities and meals for the day that they spend outside. Except for one participant who receives a monthly allowance of 50TL, the other participants stated that they are all given a weekly leave allowance of 50 TL for nine people,

75 TL for three people, and 100 TL for three. On the occasion that they cannot use their weekly leaves because of lockdowns and curfews, six of them stated they are not given any supplementary wage and the rest receive it while staying at home. Besides, two of the participants stated that they were adversely affected by the increase in the exchange rate and their monthly wages decreased.

I can be patient; I can stay if they give my salary on time and I send it to my family on time, but the thing is you know dollars' situation at that time and now. That was the problem we separated ways. My salary was \$ 1200 a month and they offered me to pay \$ 600. This made me really sad. I really suffered. Nobody could stay with that family especially with that madam. You know I was with them for 8 years! Oh, God! And then they offered me half of it. I told them this is the best time for us to leave because the baby was sleeping. It was sad but I had to do it. (Ms. E. 47 years old)

I was working in Istanbul for a one-child family, and I was earning \$ 900. I worked there for almost one year then I left them because the dollar went higher, and they offered me to decrease my salary. (Ms. C., 33 years old)

Turkish employers who generally earn in Turkish Lira might tend to decrease the wages considering the amount they pay in lira. One participant among Turkish employers also stated that she was paying \$ 900 and then when the dollar increased, she decreased the wage to \$ 800 because she earns in TL and \$ 100 makes a lot of difference for her (Madam 8). The late payment of the wages is also highlighted by two Filipina workers. One of them stated that:

I do not get my salary on time... No. Sometimes, she forgets my salary for two months... I have a family and children to feed in the Philippines I keep reminding her. (Ms. D., 43 years old)

In the meantime, eight participants state that they have not seen any increase in their wages for three years as a result of the rise in exchange rate.

In sum, Filipina wages in 2021 are among the highest wages when it is compared to the wages of workers from other countries. As is it is stated in the literature, Filipinas keep their name “aristocrats of the domestic labor market” (Akalın, 2014, p. 17) even in pandemic conditions. They mostly get their salaries on time

and their weekly allowances vary between 50TL to 100 TL depending on employers' will.

#### **4.3.4. Work Permits and Irregular Migrants**

Work Permits are compulsory documents that are required by the Turkish government for migrants to work legally in Turkey. For Filipinas, if a work permit application is to be made abroad (first application), applicant must contact the Republic of Turkey's Embassy for permanent residence by submitting the employment contract or assignment letter signed by the employer in Turkey<sup>6</sup>. If the work permit application is to be made within the country, it is not necessary to apply to the Turkish Embassy for this. When Filipina has previously obtained a residence permit for at least 6 months and this permit has not expired, the relevant employer can apply through the Ministry of Labor and Social Security.

So, employers are responsible for their Filipina worker's work permits. Out of sixteen women in my study, only ten have work permits; the rest are among thousands of unregistered Filipinas in Turkey. Lack of bilateral labor agreements between the two countries, put the Filipina workers into a fragile position because if they do not like the work environment, conditions, or experience any type of abuse, they cannot easily quit their jobs. Once they quit, they know they will lose their permits and maybe cannot get back again. When they are asked about their unregistered conditions, irregular Filipina migrants in this study said that they were most afraid of the police and they were really careful not to go out during lockdown hours. Although it is not solely employers' wish to keep them at home, unregistered Filipinas are afraid to go out even curfew is lifted. In her article, Kümbetoğlu states that illegal migrant Filipinas in Istanbul are scared to be caught by the police when they leave the house (2005). Her assessment about Filipinas is quite parallel to my participants say:

---

<sup>6</sup> For further details see: <http://www.filipinonanny.agency/tr/yabancilarin-calisma-izin-basvurusu-nasil-yapilir>



It is too hard being without a permit. When I went to Şişli one day, the police controlled me. And then saw my passport. I already told them I don't have a passport, but they checked my bag. They saw my passport and then I called my sir. Then the police talked to my sir. Women police already told me sorry I already deported you, but I accepted already I told them yes ma'am I accept because I am already illegal here. Then my boss told me calm down, I will pick you up. Then I stood up there for around one hour. Then my sir came, police told me "gel". She asked me do you want to go to the Philippines? I told her if you want, I can go ma'am I told her... I was lucky. Police said it's okay and we went back home. Nothing happened. (Ms. I, 52 years old).

My employers are the one who is bringing me to my boarding house for 24 hours, they are the ones taking me as they don't want me to be caught by police. It is dangerous for me to go out alone especially after corona. (Ms. H., 41 years old).

I worked in Istanbul for two years as illegal. It was really hard. When you are illegal, it is easier for you to change the job because you don't have responsibilities, you are not committed to work with same employers but when you have paper you are committed with your work and you learn how to be patient (Ms.E., 47 years old).

Formerly, I was going back to the Philippines and come back here because I had my permit. Now I lost it, I am scared. Scared of the police, I can't go anywhere. (Ms. A, 40 years old).

Migrant Filipina nannies who participated in this research stated that they were uncomfortable with not knowing about their legal rights, working informally, and being in an illegal position, they are afraid of going out and they want to work without fear. Responses of my interviewees support the idea that they are more open to exploitation and abuse so "foreign migrants work and live under "doubled informal conditions" (Dağdelen, 2008, p. 255).

Health insurance is also a problem for irregular migrant women. While three of them stated that they brought their medicines from the Philippines, others ask their employers for medicine or buy themselves. Some of these irregular migrants state that they expect their employers to pay the expenses if something happens to them, but this is not necessarily the case:

Formerly I had insurance when I had a permit, but my permit is terminated, and my boss didn't renew it saying she is a single mom. She hardly pays my salary. You know I had surgery last year... What she told me is that oh good luck with your surgery... She didn't pay anything. She didn't offer. I paid surgery,

consultation, medicines everything and I became angry to her (Ms. C., 33 years old)

The rest of the irregular Filipinas think that their employers should pay for the expenses if they want to get health insurance or contract COVID-19. Only, one of them (Ms. F.) said that her swab tests were paid by her employer, but she paid for her own medicines.

Migrant women not only have physical problems, but they also face mental health issues. In their article which reflects the health problems of migrant women, Etiler & Lordoğlu point out that migrant women in domestic services have also mental health problems resulting from the heavy workload and homesickness feeling. They state that on top of the constant stress created by the fear of being deported, not being able to walk freely on the street causes women to not be able to relax mentally (Etiler & Lordoğlu, 2012, p. 114). One irregular migrant in my study says that she has a headache when she thinks about her family while working here because it is too hard not taking care of her children but looking after somebody else's child here (Ms. K., 37 years old). The psychological problems that my participants mentioned will be discussed in the next chapter more detailed way.

According to these narratives, migrant Filipina nannies who do not have work permits live with a constant fear of getting deported or caught by the police. Their freedom is limited to the house of the employer and wherever the employer takes them. They are generally brought to restaurants and holiday resorts only if their employer accompanies them. Moreover, they have limited access to health facilities or medicines as they depend on their employers to pay for their health-related problems.

#### 4.3.5. Conditions after COVID-19

Having started in Turkey on 11 March 2020, the COVID-19 pandemic has imperiled live-in workers more than many others because they were already among insecure and vulnerable groups who have become even more open to exploitation with this pandemic. Some studies suggest that during lockdowns and quarantines, live-in workers have worked longer hours, doing the cleaning without having any weekly leaves, facing a higher risk of contagion and maltreatment (Daragahi &Trew, 2020). Another research done in Turkey reports that migrant women are locked up in their rooms, and they are afraid of contracting the virus, because they might lose their jobs (Güler &Benli,2020). The findings in my study suggest that out of sixteen Filipina nannies, eight thinks that nothing has changed for them except for weekly leaves. Surprised by the answers, I asked these eight women probing questions and they stated that they were working 14-15 hours before coronavirus and their workload was already tiring and employers were demanding. Therefore, nothing changed for them in terms of workload, except that they started having their weekly leaves one day at home, while staying in their rooms.

The rest of the participant group stated that they were trapped in their workplaces and it was quite stressful for them.

Last year, when COVID came out, we couldn't leave the house for two months. It was quite stressful but eventually, I started to go out. I adjusted. When it's lockdown I don't have my day off but after that, I will have. In a lockdown, they let me have a day off in my room. (Ms. K.,37 years old)

It's really hard. It's the reality. We cannot go out, we cannot socialize. My boss offered me you can rest or sleep in your own room. That's it. I really appreciate them most. Because they see that I'm tired. Before pandemic I was going to boarding house<sup>7</sup>, but right now virus increases I will rest at home, no choice maybe for two three months. (Ms. B., 33years old)

---

<sup>7</sup> Boarding Houses are apartments that migrant workers rent. They generally share it with their friends and spend their weekly leaves in these houses.

When the pandemic started, I no longer have any more off-day around seven months. I just only stayed-in her house because of pandemic I was not allowed to go out. It was hard (Ms. A., 40 years old)

Yes, firstly, you know, the going out. At first it was fine. It has been a year. My last out is March, do you believe? After that, August. October and after October, January. It is true. My friends are getting crazy with me. I am protecting myself, at the same time, I am protecting the family I work with. I really want to go out, speak with my friends, eat our native food. What can I do? It is really stressful. At the same time, you are calling your family back home. They have the same dilemma. I cry sometimes, it's free. So that you can smile again. It is life. It is the new normal life. (Ms. G., 47 years old)

In pandemic time I haven't go to street starting March to July. Right now, she is a bit strict but sometimes I have my off day on Wednesdays. (Ms. D., 43 years old)

During the first hit of corona, I was with my employer in Istanbul, 6 months no go out. I was at home. That's why I cannot live anymore like this. So, I need to leave. They didn't allow me to go my boarding house for six months. I was not going, and I was paying. It was really difficult for me to send money. Because they don't let me to go out. I was calling somebody to come and pick the money to send for me. Even the payment of boarding house, they were coming to my door to take the money. (Ms. L., 46 years old)

These narratives suggest that the COVID-19 pandemic has severely affected the freedom of migrant Filipina nannies who need their off day to recharge, socialize, eat their own food and speak their own language. Besides, long working hours together with long weekly lockdowns have worsened the informal working conditions for migrant workers.

There was one Filipina in the research group, Ms. E. who is a live-in nanny but at the same time a Filipino Community leader. She mentioned to me that she rented all three floors of a big apartment for Filipinas in Turkey to have a boarding house. She helps the ones in need during the pandemic and when the COVID-19 quarantines started, her employers let her go to her own house and she told me how she helped out other Filipinas in Ankara:

Actually, I can say that I am so blessed with this COVID thing especially last year. I am really thankful because even though in the long quarantines when I was not working, my employers were paying my salary considering that I need to send money to my children. If there were no long quarantines, I was going back to employers' house. However, the thing in my mind was how to help

others. Other Filipina who works in Turkey. Half of my salary was going to my family and half I keep myself. What I did is, I packed a lot of stuff for Filipinas, and organized a day that everything they will need I put there for them. Not every Filipina is lucky like me. Lots of them lost their jobs, live-out ones are not accepted. Some employers say you cannot go out to live-ins, some say if you catch COVID you will bring the virus to us. The thing is employers can go out which the same thing. The problem is nanny can't go out to rest for one day, but they can go out every day. What is the difference? My friends need help.... I always tell the ones who try to ask me how am I doing here? I am okay but my friends need money, food, groceries etc. (Ms. E.,47 years old).

Ms. E. both highlights employers' hypocrisy while giving a weekly leave to their employees and sheds light on how Filipino Community helps each other in a bonded unity. Her words show that Turkish employers are restricting when it comes to giving permission to their nannies to go out, but they themselves freely go out and come back, which shows the authoritarian attitude towards Filipina workers.

Under exacerbated conditions that COVID 19 pandemic brought about, Filipina nannies perform their duties intermittently. They try to get through the difficulties by staying silent in their rooms when they are allowed. The narratives by the interviewees suggest that half of them accept the reality stating their conditions have already been difficult even before pandemic. However, the answers of the rest of the group show that already difficult conditions got worse due to pandemic. Particularly those who find less chance to rest, groan about long periods of work and not being able to go out. Eventually, the pandemic has rendered helpless most of the migrant workers imprisoned in the house of the employers.

#### **4.4. Concluding Remarks on Migration Experiences and Working Conditions**

The narratives of the migrant Filipina nannies suggest that economic difficulties and unemployment, desire to explore other countries, and also get of cheating husbands are the main motivations that lead them to seek a better future for

themselves and their families that they leave behind. Having social networks, higher wages, invitation from family members, the religious status of the country, and its geographical proximity to Europe make Turkey a desirable destination point for Filipina nannies and domestic workers. Recruitment agencies play a crucial role in arranging migration to Turkey because they cooperate and partner with other agencies all around the world and bring the ideal candidates to Turkey. Both migrant Filipinas and Turkish employers get assistance from recruitment agencies as the paperwork of legal procedures is complicated.

Although written contracts are necessary for all legal workers in Turkey, it is observed that there are also many migrant Filipina women in Turkey, whose exact number is not even known by authorities. Such workers mostly have verbal contracts with their employers. Regardless of having written or verbal contracts, the informal, flexible, and unregulated nature of live-in work cause migrant Filipinas to work more than what is required in their job description. Turkish employers expect their Filipina nannies to give priority to their children but also perform daily chores such as ironing, vacuuming, washing the dishes, or tidying up the house. These extended duties are perceived by some of my participants as ‘commonsense’ and ‘helping out’ who choose not to complain about additional tasks arguing that it comes from their hearts. According to my observations, this so-called commonsense is a necessary choice for Filipinas to have good relations with their employers. They either perceive additional duties as part of their jobs or associate it to their original houses where they naturally perform domestic duties. So, they embrace duties without questioning. Related to this, Constable states in her research that “The burden of patience and flexibility is placed entirely on the domestic worker. She is expected to adjust to her employer, not vice versa” (2007, p. 93). As Constable says, Filipina workers also adjust their working hours and leaves according to their employers. The daily working hours of migrant Filipina women in my sample vary between 13 and 16 hours. Other than that, after six working days, majority of them rest for one day. However,

five interviewees have no weekly leaves because of the pandemic and the rest of the group are allowed to use their leaves on weekdays.

It is also seen that monthly Filipina wages vary between \$ 800 to \$ 1200 which is almost three times more than the pay in other countries that my participants have previously worked in. Weekly allowance of 50 to 100 TL is given to Filipina nannies when they have day-off. However, six of them do not have any work permit, therefore their day-offs are mostly spent at home away from police control. These six irregular migrant women have difficulty accessing health services and medicine because they do not have any health insurance provided by their employers. So, irregular migrants are left to their employers' mercy. Additionally, the COVID-19 pandemic has worsened the conditions for some Filipinas. Six Filipina state that they feel trapped in employers' house, and without socializing or having a rest, they keep working under quite a lot of stress. They say that nothing has changed due to the pandemic except for weekly leaves because they had already been working hard for long hours. In the next chapter, I will focus on hierarchy, boundary setting, labor control, strategies, and tactics to investigate the relationship between Filipina nannies/ domestic workers and Turkish employers.

## CHAPTER 5

### EMPLOYMENT OF FILIPINA NANNIES IN TURKISH HOUSEHOLDS

#### 5.1. Why Filipinas?

There is an increasing demand for Filipinas in the domestic and care work market of Turkey. The first reason for the demand is that Turkish domestic workers abstain from live-in jobs and they prefer live-out physical domestic work. Hence, Filipinas fill the gap in the live-in caregiving jobs. Secondly, because other migrants from Post-Soviet countries are usually preferred in sick or elderly care, Filipinas meet the demand for childcare. This specialization according to nationality in care services (Deniz,2018) develops out of Filipina nannies' proficient English, and their image as calm, easygoing, disciplined, docile, diligent, task-oriented, and obedient helpers (Ayaydn, 2020; Weyland,1994; Deniz,2018). Besides, Filipina nannies are "valuable items of consumption linked to privilege" (Ayaydn, 2020, p.181) because the high cost of this service is known by all and hiring one shows the family's economic capital to afford. Therefore, as Redlova states, Filipinas are all-around helpers who can be both English tutors to children and they are also "scarce and luxurious" (2013, p. 204) employees who bring prestige to the family that they work for.

I asked the Turkish employers in my study why they chose Filipina nannies. The common response from all nine employers is that they hire Filipina nannies considering first these migrant women's proficient English skills. In addition, they mention how hardworking, reliable, and debonair Filipinas are. Anderson, in her research about migrant domestic workers in the UK, states that employers associate their preferences and dislikes about migrant workers such as "caring,



warm and docile” (2007, p.253) with these people’s nationality and national characteristics. Similarly, Turkish employers in my study had previous work experiences with the domestic helpers of various nationalities, and they explain the choice of Filipinas by comparing them with Georgian, Uzbek, Kyrgyz, Turkmen, and Turkish women.

We worked with Uzbeks and Georgians, but it did not bring many benefits to me. The priority for me while choosing a nanny was the language for our children, and we saw that the Filipinas were the best. In addition, they are very reliable, respectful, and hardworking. I know from other caregivers from other nationalities; they either interfere with your private life or oppose you and say ‘I will not do this or do that, they are disrespectful, but I have never seen such things with Filipina nannies. (Madam. 5, 30 years old)

Now there are two reasons. First, Filipinas are very reliable. If you look at the other nannies, Filipinas have a lot of advantages compared to them, at least they do not steal anything from your house, they are obedient, which is also very important. Plus, when the child reaches the age of speaking, you know that the children's brains are like sponges, Filipinas directly contact the children in English, so the children will be prone to English. Also, instead of giving that money to an Uzbek or a Kyrgyz, I will give it to a Filipina, at least they can help with English in the future. We hired the Filipina nanny because both my wife and I were working, there was no one to take care of our child. I think the most important feature that distinguishes them is that they are very friendly. They are very positive. That is why it's as if God gave them the ability to babysit (Sir 3,49 years old)

Employing a Filipina for almost five years, Madam 8. highlights both what Guevarra calls having a “maid and a tutor for the price of one” (2014, p. 143) and points out the specialization in care services in Turkey according to nationality:

I was looking for a live-in worker. Turks do not stay in, there is no such market. So, I decided to hire a Filipina as a live-in. She could both help me with household chores and babysitting, I did not want to pay separately. At the same time, my friends had Filipinas and I heard that they were hardworking. The Filipina nanny is a model that mommies are looking for. I can give a Georgian example for comparability. My grandparents had Georgians at the time. She was reliable and a good cook. I could consider Georgians if it were elderly care.... Turkmen nannies have some kind of problems. Their Turkish is not bad, but their care is not as famous as Filipinas. There is no Turkish in Filipinos either, but for example, my son did not know the Turkish of certain words when he was little, but that gap is closed after a while. He's 5 years old and he has very good English right now. I can say that other nationalities are more inclined to

take care of the house and the elderly and Filipinos are more inclined to take care of children (Madam 8,36 years old)

Additionally, two employers argue that Filipinas are more focused on their work than the nannies of other nationalities:

I chose Filipina because they speak English fluently, and they focus only on their work. In addition, I never felt the presence of a stranger in the house. For example, Turkish domestic workers chime in everything. Filipinas just do their job. They came here focused on work. I always compare it to Turks, but Turkish helpers are always present in the middle of your life, they are always on the phone texting, they check what you bought for yourself and after a while, they compete with you. Turkish nannies do not come to work on holidays; they miss the minibus two days a week. When they have a problem with their husband and they come and tell you about it, so it gets so tiring. If you want peace of mind, you will work with a Filipina. They are here to work; they left their most precious children behind. So, she works, does her job, that's it. They do not have their families here. They do not bring you, their problems. They only serve you which is what I need (Madam 1, 37 years old).

The most important reason for my decision to hire Filipinas was their English skills. When my first child was born, there were these Uzbeks and Turkmen. While working with them, they were not following any job description that is given to them. They did not fit the job description I gave them, and their mentality was just like 'come to Turkey, earn money, and fill their time and go back'. Then, when I had my second child, my friends directed me to Filipina nannies because they were disciplined and unselfish and they spoke English fluently. We paid a lot more, but Filipinas were worth it. Because they do this as a profession. They are like; this is my job, I earn money from this job, so they run their business with the mentality that I should deserve the money I receive. (Madam 6,43 years old)

In their responses, Turkish employers are inclined to compare nationalities and national characteristics through stereotypes of nannies. They describe Filipinas as robots or handmaids who are born to serve and can or should yield to the needs of employers whenever and wherever it is necessary. They expect Filipina nannies to be submissive and invisible in order to fit in the quintessential domestic worker image. Therefore, they tend to criticize Turkish nannies that prioritize their own families and ask for a holiday. Besides, they look down on migrant women from Third World countries while analyzing the differences of Filipinas from other migrants.

In her research about Filipina domestic workers, Guevarra points out that migrant Filipina nannies are portrayed as “super maids” and “touted as ‘more than usual employees’ who exemplify an exceptionally high quality of service” (Guevarra, 2014, p.143). Therefore, these super maids become attractive to the wealthy elite and function as a status symbol. Believing that God created Filipinas to babysit all around the world, Sir 2. states:

First of all, we did a lot of research with my wife. The Philippines is an American colony, so Filipinos speak English very well. They are very disciplined, calm, emotional people. Our relatives also had Filipinas and they were also satisfied, happy. That is why we wanted our children to speak English like their mother tongue. Now, if you hire Turkish domestic helpers, they work for 2000-2500TL. Uzbeks and Georgians are a little more costly than Turks, but as the saying goes, cheap meat yields dilute soup [ucuz etin yahnisi yavan olur]. That’s it. You can't even compare Filipinas with them. The Turk has demands, she wants a holiday, she has a family, she has a husband... Georgians and Uzbeks are after their money, children are not their priority. Filipinas... Active, devoted people who know how to communicate with the child. Let me tell you, I think God created Filipinas to be caregivers and to provide such a service to the world. There is no other race that is so perfect and patient. This is valid for the whole world, in America, in Canada, etc., all the caregivers are Filipina because everyone knows that when it comes to caregiving, Filipinas come to mind (Sir 2, 38 years old).

By comparing the salaries of Filipinas to other nationalities and referring to the image of Filipinas in the world, Sir 2 suggests what Ayaydın calls “valuable items of consumption linked to privilege” (2020, p. 181). In other words, Sir 2 is aware of the high cost of this service and higher social standing attached to it so, his consumption is not solely based on the need for a nanny but also associated with social distinction.

These narratives of the employers suggest that they choose Filipinas primarily for their English skills. For Bourdieu (1991), linguistic capital necessitates fluency with the language spoken and it is clear that the linguistic capital of Filipina nannies is considered as *a sign of wealth* (Bourdieu, 1991) by Turkish employers. This capital can bring their children as Bourdieu describes ‘symbolic power’ (Swartz, 2015, p. 129), and therefore, they can be culturally powerful among their class. Through sayings like ‘cheap meat yields dilute soup and

Filipinas are worth the money’, employers both point out the high cost of this service and also reproduce their status (Anderson, 2000) among their class members. Six employers stated that their close networks, friends, or family members also had Filipinas, which led them to seek a Filipina nanny. Obviously, the renowned image of Filipinas as modern, calm, easygoing, reliable, and hardworking global nannies is quite effective in the decision of Turkish employers to hire Filipina nannies. Lamont and Lareau argue that “status signals are mostly sent unconsciously, via the *habitus*, or unintentionally, because of the classificatory effects of cultural codes” (1988, p. 164). As people who grew up in wealthy families and having rich networks, the class habitus of these Turkish employers leads them to perceive the race or ethnicity of their helpers as a status marker. Therefore, while doing things similar or popular among their class members, employers recognize the privilege of status signals. Indeed, besides fulfilling their practical needs, hiring Filipina is a symbolic act of proving themselves to their class by hiring modern-looking, quiet, work-oriented, and disciplined migrant women.

For Foucault, service is composed of “a constant, total, massive, non-analytical, unlimited relation of domination, established in the form of the individual will of the master” (1979, p. 137). Having a Filipina nanny gives the Turkish employers the opportunity to experience a service similar to Foucault’s description as they tend to look for migrant nannies that can devote themselves to the family they work for, provide flexible and limitless service. Although I do not agree the totalizing views regarding the Filipina nannies such as ‘it is in their nature to babysit’, I believe Filipinas are among the most favorable migrant workers in the domestic labor market because they are at employers’ beck and call. This can also be a marketing tool that is created by the government of Philippines to promote Filipinas. I believe that the programs designed for educating nannies together with the kindness of Asian culture lead Filipinas to be perceived as among the best nannies in the world.

The literature reveals that while searching for Filipinas, employers check for the desired features in their minds. These are age, the number of children the nanny has, knowledge of English, appearance and posture, health status, and morality (Deniz, 2018). The employers participating in my study mostly comply with this checklist. Two employers stated they were expecting to find a young nanny. Three of the employers stated they wanted her to be married or to have children. Except for one, all the employers stated they gave priority to the knowledge of English and accent. Apart from the subjects of Deniz's checklist, five of the employers in my study checked their previous job experiences and how long they have worked for that family. Apart from the subjects of Deniz's checklist, five of the employers in my study checked their previous job experiences and how long they have worked for that family.

First, I checked her previous job experiences and whether she took care of two children. Her education and knowledge of English were also important. We looked at her appearance, of course, we wanted someone at our ages, clean-faced, calm, and smiling. Her care and hygiene were also important. Of course, we also looked at how her teeth and how she smelled. It was my choice for her to be an obedient lady rather than a bullheaded person (Madam 9, 35 years old).

I first checked how she looked after children. Was she compassionate, prudent, or merciful? Because one of my children is disabled and whether she was smiling, or a patient person was important for me. Was she clean, did she smell clean, how was her care, were her nails clean? These were the things I checked. After all, she was washing and feeding my child. I also checked her English, how was her accent. Some of them have very good English, some are terrible. And I have no business with those who were greedy. There are many humane ones, but if you come across an evil heart, you are in trouble (Madam 7, 46 years old).

Checking the smell and teeth of nannies, both of Madam 9 and 7 describe the process as if nannies were dog breeds that they were trying to select in a pet shop. Paradoxically, in such an inhumane manner Madam 7 mentions the humaneness of Filipinas. The strict expectations of the employers and the passive attitudes of the nannies as a result of their obedient nature also show the imbalance within the employer-employee relationship of the domestic work market. Madam 7's answer prove that employers can approach the nannies as products, similar to pets in a pet shop, expecting the maximum efficiency in

multiple dimensions from the nannies. The irony is, however, making comments about a nanny “with an evil heart”, employers have a tendency to forget about humane behavior and turn into an “evil heart” themselves when it comes to the relationship with a Filipina. Madam 9’s criteria of being married and having children add a new layer beyond the physical expectations of the employers, making an impression as if maternal skills could be learned and fully embraced only after having a child. The employer’s perfectionist expectations and associating skills of childcare on maternal experience in the nanny’s own family if there is any, are some of the many reasons which put additional pressure on the Filipinas and create an imbalance of justice in terms of the relationship and communication within the household. Additionally, looking for nannies who themselves are mothers on purpose because of their supposedly superior traits, some employers reveal how they internalize and rationalize the logic of capitalism:

When we decided to hire a Filipina nanny, we went to an agency in Istanbul with my wife. We interviewed a few candidates there. We have twins. We checked the candidates’ experience with twins and her level of English. We wanted her to be young, not older than us. Also, we wanted her to be a mother. After all, motherhood experience was essential for her to be able to take care of our children. But if she leaves her new baby, now she will be worried too. Will she run away? Will she cry because she misses her child? We did not know. So, we wanted her child to be a little older. Then her appearance was important for us. We wanted someone shy, who was affectionate with children. We did not want her to have glasses. We also stated that our child is afraid of glasses, he might have a phobia, etc. We never judge anyone's appearance, of course, but we thought it would be nice if she was someone who is thin and could run after our boys (Sir 2, 38 years old).

Sir 2’s response is consistent with the previous comments and further proves that contemporary employers are highly selective about their expectations, almost forgetting that nannies are actually people with feelings, instead of being machines designed for the ultimate service. The stony attitude of the employers, starting from the selection phase of the employment relationship, is also a reflection of today’s capitalist societies and the consumer culture. While the employers as consumers believe that they have a right to be fully vocal with their expectations to get the best out of their spending, Filipinas also mostly have no

choice but remain silent about these expectations, which further rationalize the inhumane approach of the employers in the market. On the other hand, reporting that she did not consider age, appearance, or experience as the key priority but the ability to do household chores, Madam 4 states:

We told the woman who was the intermediary agency that we looked for somebody who could stay with us permanently and would not leave after three days. She should be focused on her work and also could do housework while I was at work. So, we did not expect too much, but she needed to organize the house. I was taking care of the child while I was at home, but I wanted her to be someone who could take care of the laundry and stuff while I was looking after the child. It's luck. Maybe some people are not satisfied with their Filipinas, but maybe it's the best decision I've ever made in my life. (Madam 4, 44 years old).

Aside from the ordinary expectations, having three Filipinas working in her house, one employer considered the private life of Filipinas as a priority during decision making.

It was very important her to be always smiling at me. A person who makes faces is among the things I could never tolerate at home. Also, I never accepted the nannies to have a boyfriend in Turkey. Never! Because they either find waiters or construction workers, which is not something I approve of. They might bring their boyfriends to my house when I am not at home. These are my biggest criteria (Madam 1, 37 years old).

Her answer shows that the work contract between Madam 1 and the nanny also gives right to Madam 1 to regulate the private life of the nanny due to the nature of domestic work where public and private got mixed. It is clear that while hiring Filipina nannies, the participants of this study took into consideration not only age, experience, marital status, motherhood, knowledge of English, physical appearance, and hygiene of migrant workers but also private life and capability of helping with household chores. Moreover, employers also check the proper use of English, so the symbolic concerns are as much important as material needs. The strategic motivations behind the choice of nannies having kids demonstrate that employers want to use the motherly knowledge for the wellbeing of their own children and unfortunately, they show no sign of worry or concern for the children of the nanny left in the Philippines. This insensitivity



gets rationalized in the global market of capitalism since all parties benefit from this act.

I also asked the question why Turkish employers prefer the Filipina nannies to Filipinas themselves. Ten of the nannies stated that their English skills lead Turkish employers to look for a Filipina. Most of them also stated that Filipinas are patient, silent, hardworking, honest, diligent, and they have good relations with kids and do not hurt them.

Filipinas are very smart and have commonsense. We are number one. Even you don't say do this one, do that one, we do by own. We are not the same as Uzbek, the Turkish because they are always on the telephone. Filipinas number one because we don't hurt children. Other Uzbek can hurt children (Ms. I., 52 years old).

The difference is when we look after the kids, we are very diligent, we give our heart to work. We take initiative. The family doesn't have to tell what we need to do. We made it our mind that this is our responsibility. We need to do it. That's the main reason, and of course English language (Ms.K.,37 years old).

Because I think although we are expensive and our salaries are high, Filipinas are hardworking, and we speak English. That makes us number one. Instead of Rather than two Turkish women, one is the nanny and the other one does cleaning, they just prefer us. Only one person does anything (Ms. C., 33 years old).

Because we are patient, hardworking, and dedicated people. We speak English. We work from our hearts; others just spend the time waiting for their money. We take care of children as if he is our own child and employers know it (Ms. D., 43 years old).

The answers of nannies reveal that they also accept and internalize the stereotypical representations. Even sometimes they strategically use these stereotypes to their advantage. They are aware of their cultural capital and other skills that make them desirable for Turkish employers. Moreover, family is an important concept in Filipino culture and children are precious. Nannies with children in my study answered this question arguing that they got attached to the children they looked after as if they were their own children. This shows that they practice their motherly duties with the children of Turkish employers, which is what employers exactly want. Contrary to the belief that it is impossible to



take care of someone else's children without feeling any remorse or anger, this total positive and devoted attitude of Filipina nannies is an act of love coming from the cultural values. When it comes to the cultural representations, the nannies know that embracing the positive traits of their stereotype provides advantage for them as a nanny, starting from the selection process, also during their employment in a Turkish household.

Turkish employers hire Filipinas both for their English skills and they find them reliable, hardworking, obedient, respectful, and professional. They are aware of the high cost of this service and tend to compare them with other migrant workers in the market, and come to the conclusion that Filipinas are worth their higher salaries. In the next section, I will discuss more in detail the ideal nannies for Turkish employers and what they were looking for while searching for a nanny to understand the Turkish employers' demands.

## **5.2. Setting the Boundaries in the Household**

Live-in work arrangement necessitates a continuous employer-employee relationship, and it is highly complex one because both groups struggle to maintain two different lifestyles at an ideal distance. Therefore, while setting the boundaries in the household, employers and migrant workers negotiate the intimacy in the place of employment. The employers, who have obvious advantages between the two, might stand in the dominant position within the power balance. Although they retain the authority and control the employer-employee relationship, various studies indicate that domestic workers also obtain a certain degree of power and autonomy thanks to tactics and daily strategies of resistance (Lan, 2000; Doğan, 2012; Parrenas, 2001). As Constable states, "Nor do employers have a monopoly on power and workers a monopoly on resistance. Rather, power and resistance coexist and constantly reassert themselves against each other" (1997, p. 11). Thus, in this nonegalitarian relationship, both parties perform different levels of power and resistance.

The concept of ‘boundary work’ is useful to examine the employer employee relationships and their negotiation of setting the boundaries, we will examine this interaction through this concept. Pei Chai Lan defines boundary work as “strategies, principles, and practices we use to create, maintain and modify cultural categories” (2003, p.526). In her study about Taiwanese employers and Filipina domestic workers, she argues that both groups enforce and resist power by developing and rearranging symbolic boundaries. The first set of boundaries is ‘socio-categorical boundaries’ that constitute class, ethnicity, or nationality. These might be ethnic stereotypes created by employers to describe Filipina women. The other boundaries are ‘spatial boundaries’ that comprise the private/domestic and public spheres (Lan, 2000, p. 189). Spatial boundaries determine whether employers want to include domestic workers in or exclude from the family and if they want to highlight or downplay hierarchical inequalities (2003, p.530). Lan divides employers’ boundary work into four typologies: maternalism, personalism, distant hierarchy, and business relationship (Lan, 2003).

In this part of the chapter, I will first reflect on the boundary work of Turkish employers in their relationship with Filipina nannies and use these typologies of boundary work in my analysis. Then, I will investigate one of the commonly debated topics in the literature while discussing live-in domestic workers, being like ‘one of the family’. Both employers and migrant workers use this family rhetoric to describe the intimacy of their relationship. Romero states that:

Workers who identify (or are identified) as especially close to their employers are therefore asked to stay extra hours or provide additional services ‘for love and not money. Their loyalty is both created and continuously reinforced, through expressions of their membership in the family unit (Romero et al., 2014, p.181).

Thus, being like one of the family takes it beyond a standard contract relationship. Thanks to this family rhetoric, employers guarantee the quality of the service provided while migrants perceive it as equal treatment, respect and worth.

Lastly, by purchasing the labor power of the migrant workers, employers expect deference and obedience from Filipinas to more easily control the work and private life of Filipinas. Linguistic deference is emphasized by employers who call employees by their names while expecting to be addressed by them, as ‘Madam’ or ‘Sir’ (Lan, 2000). As Hondagneu-Sotelo (2007, p. 139) states, employers who desire to receive their money’s worth of service exercise control through time management skills such as expecting the nannies to focus on one task at a time rather than random integration while supervising the work and making output assessments or maternalistic gestures and giving written or oral orders. Besides, they expect migrant helpers to remain invisible and continue doing their duties without disrupting the family’s private life (Romero, 2016). Hence, there are rules and control mechanisms in the household decided by employers and I will discuss these rules and expectations in the last part of this section.

### **5.2.1. Boundary Work**

Boundary work refers to “strategies, principles and practices” (Lan, 2003, p. 526) that are created by both employers and live-in workers to develop and rearrange symbolic boundaries in the household. First, I will focus on the employers’ boundary work. Lan (2003, p. 526), in her academic study about migrant Filipina workers and Taiwanese employers, argues that employers tend to highlight ethnic or national differences by creating ‘socio-categorical boundaries’ which constitute class, ethnicity, or nationality. Similarly, the employers in my study tend to categorize migrant workers according to their class and nationality. For example, Madam 6 (43 years old) thinks that Uzbek and Turkmen women come here to earn money, they fill their time and go back, because they are not as professional as Filipinas. According to, Madam 1 (37 years old), Turkish domestic workers chime in everything and they compete with their employers. On the other hand, Filipina nannies, according to most of my participant Turkish employers, are hardworking, patient, obedient, respectful, and professional workers. Conversely, two employers stated that the cleaning

work of Filipinas was not as professional and detailed as in how the Turkish domestic workers do it. Moreover, three of them said even the married Filipinas were fond of their Turkish boyfriends. Working with three Filipinas, Madam 1 also states:

I am experienced with Filipinas. I know how they work but I also know their attachment to boyfriends. Even they are married they find somebody here. They spend their money to these Turkish men and later ask more from you. That is why my rule for boyfriends never change (Madam 1, 37 years old).

Thus, employers categorize their employees according to their ethnic and national differences.

The second type of social boundaries is 'spatial boundaries' that indicate the lines between public and private (Lan, 2003). In order to understand the dynamics within the household, the different perceptions of the employers and the nannies about the locations can be used as a strong reference point, especially because of its subjective nature. The entire house is actually the private space of the employer, while for the nanny, the assigned room at best is the only private space within the household. The contrasting perception between the public and private spaces is mostly visible when drawing a line between the nanny's room and the rest of the house. What is private for one side always becomes public for the other one in this scenario. During the interviews, Madams 5 and 6 confirmed the existence of visible spatial boundaries in their working relationship by saying:

Especially after pandemic, we wanted her to spend most of her free time at her own floor. I mean she has bath and toilet for herself downstairs a small living room like a space that they can watch TV with the other Turkish domestic helper. My husband does not like them to wander when he arrives home after job. He prefers silence so we said our nanny that she should not go up if it is not necessary (Madam 6, 43 years old).

Madam 6's response regarding the off-work habits of the nanny and their expectations as employers illustrate the importance of spatial boundaries. While

the nanny also prefers occupying her own private space during her free time, Madam 6 shows that she and her husband are sensitive about not sharing their own private space with the nanny.

She has her own room including TV and even Netflix. She uses her own bathroom. She has her own area there. Until 21.00 she takes care of our baby then she rests in her own room. She does not come and watch TV with us. (Madam 5, 30 years old).

Similarly, Madam 5 expresses the existence and importance of separate spatial arrangements within the household. Moreover, she also points out the importance of embracing the private space for the nanny, especially outside of working hours in order to recharge and get prepared for the next workday.

Acknowledging the social boundaries also provides an opportunity for employers to express their superior class position to the nannies. By having the decision-making abilities regarding the private spaces within the household, the employers have the power to distance themselves from the domestic workers. While employers aim to protect the status-quo in this relationship through social boundaries, migrant workers can tend to create alternative boundaries as a counterforce for their own benefits such as reducing the workload, stress management, and mental or physical healing. Regarding the boundaries, Lan argues the following:

Employers are negotiating two primary sets of boundaries during their interactions with domestic workers: they determine to what extent they want to include or exclude domestic workers in the family, and they also consider whether to highlight or downplay the hierarchical difference between themselves and the workers. Based on these two characteristics, I create a typology for employers' boundary work that consists of four different subtypes: *maternalism*, *personalism*, *distant hierarchy*, and *business relationship* (2003, p. 530).

Hence, employers may maintain and preserve their class distinctions through different types of interactions with migrant workers. Now we will use these four different subtypes of boundary work to understand the levels of hierarchy and intimacy in Turkish households with Filipina domestic workers.

**Table 4.** Typology of Boundary Work (Lan, 2000, p.192)

		<i>Family Boundary</i>	
		Inclusion	Exclusion
Highlighting	<i>Class/Ethnic Divides</i>	Maternalism	Distant Hierarchy
Downplaying		Personalism	Business Relationship

The Table 4 represents the conception of Lan’s Boundary Work (2000), which is applicable to better understand the relationship between the Turkish employers and the Filipina nannies. By sharing the same roof during the employment period, the employers show one of the four subtypes dominantly towards the nannies. Determining a certain dominant subtype for employers mainly obtained by two criteria. First one is, observing the level of acceptance of the nanny as a family member. The second criteria is the employer’s expression of the distinctions between them and the nannies in terms of class and ethnicity. Lan’s Boundary Work plays a key role for the findings of this research as it enables the data obtained from the responses of the employers to be structured and addressed systematically, with respect to the framework of this research. Moreover, it provides more logical room of interpretation of the responses from the nannies focusing on their experiences as domestic workers in Turkey.

The Table 5 (see below) shows the dominant positioning of each employer in Lan’s conception of Boundary Work. The grouping is associated with the relevant information obtained from the responses of the interviews with the employers. Apart from attaining the employers to different subtypes of Boundary Work, the table also supports the analysis of the interviews, showing typical traits and background of employers belonging to a certain dominant subtype. The grouping also helps the research by giving relatable explanations of varying experiences of Filipina nannies, working for employers belonging to different subtypes of Lan’s boundary work.

**Table 5. Employers' Boundary Work**

<b>Maternalism</b>	<b>Personalism</b>	<b>Distant Hierarchy</b>	<b>Business Relationship</b>
Madam1, Madam 5	Madam 4, 7,8	Madam 6	Madam 9, Sir 2 and 3
<p>Madam 1 and Madam 5 are both university graduate ladies who do not work. Their husbands own private foundation schools and auto gallery, respectively. Madam 1 pays \$3000 a month to all her three Filipinas and Madam 5 pays \$1000 to one nanny. They both build close relationships with nannies to ensure good service to their children. They have a nurturing and attentive attitude towards the needs of nannies. Although both of the employers point out the family ties and their intimate relationship with nannies, they place nannies to a subordinate status while highlighting the class differences.</p>	<p>Madam 4,7 and 8 are all university graduate ladies who either have worked or have still been working. Their choice of Filipinas stem from the necessity rather than luxury as all three pointed out that they had no one else to assist with taking care of their babies. They define themselves as middle-class workers in their statements, highlighting that they are disturbed by the differences of upper-class employers towards nannies. They do not discriminate their workers rather treat them as equal human beings. Madam 4 was paying 400€ in 2017, Madam 4 and Madam 8 still pay \$800 and \$900, respectively. All three employers stated the amount they pay to Filipinas is very high and they are aware of the high cost of this service and it also makes it valuable for them.</p>	<p>Madam 6 is a university graduate lady who does not work, and she points out her husband is a factory owner. As an upper-class employer, she has worked with three different Filipinas. She was paying \$1200 to her last nanny. She has always abstained from having too close relationships with her employees. She had one Filipina nanny and one Turkish domestic helper in her house. She points out she treated them equal but also wanted them to know their place. She highlights class differences by pointing out that employers and employees should absolutely eat separately.</p>	<p>Sir 2 is a lawyer; Sir 3 is an officer and Madam 9 does not work, all being university graduates. While Madam 9 pays \$1000 as salary to her nanny, Sir 2 and 3 pay \$800. The employers stated that they generally make small talks about the children and the schedule of nannies. They do not share their private life and do not ask them much. So, they exclude workers from the family like in the distant attitude, but they do not highlight class differences. When they are asked, Sir 2 and 3 says they are like a family, but they do not actually possess the mind state and interaction of a family. Moreover, when compared with Madam 9's communication, Sir 2 and 3 do not go into additional details with the nanny, mainly because their wives undertake this duty. On the other hand, Madam 9 has more detail-oriented and multidimensional business relationship.</p>

Maternalism is commonly known as the “protective and nurturing” (Parrenas, 2001, p. 134) treatment of the domestic worker by the employer, which operates as a power mechanism that perpetuates the position of the employer as the benefactor gaining personal appreciation, acknowledgment, and affirmation from the domestic worker (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2007). Lan conceptualizes maternalism as a kind of boundary work highlighting class and ethnic divisions while inclusion within the family (2003). In other words, the relationship of these employers and migrant workers develops based on family ties but at the same time unsurpassable class differences. A maternalistic attitude is motivated by a strategic desire to assure the quality of work, dedication to the employer, and responsibilities. Besides, it extends the definition of duty:

Maternalism often imposes heavy quid pro quo obligations on paid domestic workers, blurring the distinction between paid work and unpaid favors. Employers may require from their employees deference, gratitude, and perhaps extra hours on duty. In the process, they gain not only unpaid services but also a sense of superiority and enhanced racial, class, and gender status. (Hondagneu-Sotelo 2007, p. 179).

Employers either give gifts and secondhand clothes on certain occasions to create a sisterly relationship or to listen, give advice and share the problems of the working woman (Bora, 2005). Two employers in my study show maternal attitudes towards their nannies. For example, Madam 1 buys gifts, order Chinese food to make them happy, and listen to their problems about their family:

I even think about and buy their sanitary napkins and tampons. I have to do it. If you become ungenerous to them, you break this bond. When this bond is broken, this place becomes a company building, not a family. For example, we are currently in a pandemic time, we shop online. I buy something for them in one of three or five packages. There are 10 restaurants when I order food, I give them the menu, they choose what they want. I never said, ‘this is left over’, ‘here eat these’. Sometimes, I take them out so they can get fresh air. Really, this is like a trade, if am better to them, they are better to my kids. They tell me (Madam 1, 37 years old).

The maternal attitude of Madam 1 clearly reveals that her kindness is not genuine as there is a rational, practical necessity governing this relationship.



Similarly, Madam 5 expresses inclusive tendencies towards her nanny. However, her behavior is also beneficial for the perception about her own identity and social positioning as highlighting their differences and still being welcoming to their employee, positively boosts the employer's confidence and make her picture herself as a moral guardian.

For example, I always ask her after she eats her breakfast or dinner, 'are you full? Eat more...' or if she leaves her plate full, I tell her, where are you going? Don't you like your food? Should I order you something else? I always check her. If we eat snacks, we tell her to go get some for herself. If we drink tea, we also give tea to her. We do not separate her from us. If we exclude her, she might be unhappy, and this directly affects the happiness of my child. So, she is like my third child, she has to be (Madam 5, 30 years old).

Belonging to the upper-class, within a similar age group and without the need of work, both Madam 1 and Madam 5's maternalism is a strategic move. Two employers in the study quoted above have a utilitarian approach while showing on maternalistic attitude towards their employees. They deliberately behave in a manipulative way to guarantee, on the part of the nanny, a dedicated service and affection to the children. Bora argues that employers who pursue a maternalistic approach are relatively old housewives in Turkey (2005, p.167). Hondagneu-Sotelo states that maternalism is mostly absent among contemporary employers (2007, p.34). However, the age group of my participants and their maternalist attitudes do not fit these arguments in the literature. This further proves that regardless of the age group, maternalism is a possible trait of employers. However, unlike the traditional examples consisting of pure intentions, contemporary maternalism acts as an additional tool of quality and assurance for the employer.

When it comes to the second type of boundary work in Lan's classification, personalism, some employers include their workers in the family, by also downplaying class and ethnic differences (Lan, 2003). According to Hondagneu-Sotelo, personalism is "a bilateral relationship that involves two individuals recognizing each other not solely in terms of their role or office (such as clerk or

cleaner) but rather as persons embedded in a unique set of social relations, and with particular aspirations.” (2007, p. 180). Different than maternalist employers, in personalism, employers do not highlight hierarchal differences or pity the workers. On the contrary, they include workers to family and respect them as individuals without any affection. In my study, three employers would like to blur class differences and accept their workers and also themselves as equal human beings because they feel uneasy when they are seen as superior individuals to their workers.

She never eats with us. She says nannies should not eat at the same table with the family. I cannot get this. She is our nanny, of course, our table is open to everyone, but she says I cannot... For example, she says I cannot sit on the coach while you sit there. I feel really bad. We do not discriminate against her. We see her as a part of our family, but she sees herself as inferior to us and behaves like this. I feel sorry for her (Madam 4, 44 years old).

Madam 4’s discomfort in her explanation does not have a nurturing attitude like maternalist employers. Her willingness to include the nanny at the family table shows that she just wants the nanny not to feel subordinate while eating alone. Thus, she does not highlight class differences but rather tries to obscure them. Similarly, two employers expressed their discomfort in this hierarchical relationship and pointed out “their middle-class-hood” (Lan, 2000, p.202):

We give her \$900, but we are not the type of super-rich, company owner people. We earn our own money. Therefore, we do not exclude her. I mean, we are on the same level. We say thank you, we show our gratitude, and she feels like one of us (Madam 8, 36 years old).

I see it here too, for example, employers make them work 24/7. Duty starts at 6 in the morning. Guests come for dinner; they stay until 2-3 am in the morning. The employer sleeps until midnight the next morning, the poor Filipinas get up at 6 a.m. even if they work after midnight. For example, they put up with verbal abuse and insult. Why? Because employers give them a little more money. They work like slaves. I have seen people who make them paint their shoes, wash their car, give massage after work. This is cruel. I cannot stand this type of employer. She is a human being, they forget this. Rich employers tend to use them as a slave. We are not rich. My husband and I just needed somebody to take care of our children, that is it (Madam 7, 46 years old).

Three employers stated above are all working mothers who need the assistance of a helper while they are not at home. Different than maternalist employers, they do not seek benefits while including nannies in their families. Instead, they try to obscure class differences. While talking about their nannies, they need an explanation about their class status and income levels and compare themselves with super-rich employers and how they behave their Filipinas. In other words, they want to point out that they are merciful and egalitarian employers who need the assistance of a Filipina not as a luxury but as a necessity.

The third subtype of boundary work is distant hierarchy. Employers might also tend to build distant relationships with their employees. Hondagneu-Sotelo states that those who have distant relationships would rather have more formal conversations with their domestic workers because personalism compels them to concern about their employees (2007). Indeed, a distant hierarchy in the household requires some employers to have less conversation while obligating domestic workers to accept their role and status. In my study, only one participant has a distant relationship with her employee.

No. We eat as a family. She eats separately. We are not fluent English speakers. My husband knows better than me. We do not talk too much. Only things about my son and his problems. She is here to take care of my child, so we treat her like we treat other workers in our house (Madam 6, 43 years old).

As an upper-class employer, Madam 6 builds a distant relationship with her Filipina nanny and the language barrier between the two is not the only reason for this distant hierarchy. Later on, she points out that she is also in a distant relationship with her Turkish domestic worker. She prefers her employees to respect the status of the employer and has a certain positioning independent of the nationality of her employees. Madam 6 also believes that Filipinas and domestic workers, in general, have to be obedient when it comes to the terms and expectations of the employers. In her answers, Madam 6 also explains how Filipinas try to use their rarity in the domestic worker market as an advantage by saying:

Filipinas are rare in numbers compared to domestic workers from other countries. They are also aware of their rarity. Therefore, they believe that they have a right to be selective while chose a job, becoming snobbish, in the process. In the past, only my terms were being talked about. They could not have any terms at all. Now they stipulate their terms. Formerly, their only demand could be money oriented but now I hear that they come with a lot of terms and conditions because they are being limited in numbers (Madam 6,43 years old)

Madam 6's response mainly reflects a stereotypical example of distant hierarchy in an employer-employee relationship. As someone belonging to the upper class of the society without being actively employed, Madam 6 lacks empathy towards the domestic workers and their expectations in general. First of all, thanks to her purchasing power, she believes that money should be the only focus of domestic workers, including Filipinas. When the nannies show some personality and come up with expectations to offer some counter conditions apart from their salary, Madam 6 perceives this as an opportunistic and snobbish attempt from the nannies. The distant and unemphatic relationship is also visible from the salary of the nannies of Madam 6 as she is paying approximately \$200 more than the average salary of a Filipina in the Turkish market, believing that the supposedly money-oriented focus of a nanny will eventually make them less snobbish and more obedient unconditionally, with respect to the expectations of the employer. Based on this example, it is possible to state that distant hierarchy can be seen from the upper-class employers with little price sensitivity in life, also having no concrete job experience to fully understand the motives and conditions of actual employment. Distant hierarchy may also cause the employers to consider the nannies as machines without emotions, expectations, and physical limitations, resulting in additional problems such as the ones mentioned throughout this thesis for the domestic workers, in the process.

The fourth boundary work type is a business relationship. Some employers strategically perceive this relationship as a business or sort of a trade-off (Lan, 2003; Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2007). These employers downplay class and ethnic divides and exclude their employees from the family. They want their employees to respect their private space while avoiding personal interactions as much as

possible (Lan, 2003, p. 537). Romero states that domestic workers define this type of relationship as spelled out and restricted to housework tasks (2016, p.188). She also adds that conversational interactions are confined to brief chats, phone conversations, or note-taking. Aside from brief small talk in the morning and afternoon, employer-employee interaction revolves around labor: timetables, tasks to be completed, the need for equipment, or alterations in plans. When compared with the distant hierarchy, business relationship has certain similarities and notable differences. At the first glance, the distance between the employer and the nannies can appear similar. However, distant hierarchy is mainly seen from the upper-class employers who tend to openly admit their class and racial differences with the nannies. A business relationship, on the other hand, is mostly between the middle-class employers and the nannies as the employers are more hesitant to stress out any form of difference between them and the Filipinas, while still expecting to have a distant and formal relationship as possible. Moreover, this relationship is described as contractual by the workers (Romero, 2016, p. 188). Three participants in my study expressed that their relationship is like a business:

Ours is more like a business relationship, so neither she disturbs our privacy, nor we interfere with her. We usually talk about what time she will go out on her leaves, what children will eat, how much television they watched today, or they played with the iPad... When you become very close with them, she sees herself as having a say over your child. It is better like this; everyone knows their limit (Madam 9,35 years old).

My wife and I work full time during weekdays. We come back from work around 19.00 and we only see her during nighttime and weekends. She spends her time in our son's room. We are mostly in the living room. We speak Turkish with my wife, she does not understand, and we do not want to force ourselves to talk to her after a long tiring day. Sometimes she talks to us if she wants something from the supermarket otherwise, we do not talk much (Sir 3, 49 years old).

When the babies cry in the middle of the night, I expect our nanny to make a move rather than relying on us as the parents, and she does exactly that. I admire that she is treating our children as her children and we do our best to treat her like a human with emotions, not a machine. I also believe balancing our interaction is important, whenever there is nothing to do, we rarely see the nanny around. She also admits that being on her room in these situations is something she prefers, as well (Sir 2, 38 years old).

So, the business relationship can be thought of as a strategy for employers who want to minimize personal interaction and guarantee the perfect service. As members of the middle-class, these employers do not show any attempts of portraying the class difference between the nannies. Moreover, two of the three employers showing business relationship tendencies are men, meaning that sex is also a determinant leading up to business relationships. The interviews show that apart from the females, male employers have a more limited relationship with the nanny and the responsibilities compared to the mother employers and their enhanced awareness. Rather than monitoring and interfering the daily tasks of the nannies similar to female employers, especially in situations related to childcare, male employers choose not to interact with the nannies about how they do their tasks. This tendency inevitably results in a business relationship as male employers respect the identity of the nannies, while still aiming for limited interaction with the nanny in terms of their duties and physical exposure.

Even though the distinctions between the four sub-types of boundary work are clear, it is still possible to observe multiple tendencies in some employers, one or more sub-types showing some traces next to a dominant sub-type. Still, for the sake of providing a systematic analysis, this research associates the employers with the dominant sub-type characteristics as explained above. While being suitable for the personalist type in the big picture, two of the participants also show signs of business relationship type, mainly as a result of their willingness to perform minimal interaction with the nannies. In her study on mostly young and working Turkish employers, Aksu Bora points out that employers prefer housework to be done in invisibility (2005, p .119). Two participant employers in my study confirm this fact as they point out:

I love that side of the Filipinas; they disappear inside the house. They do not stick their noses into anything, if the husband and wife eat privately, they leave them alone. They somehow become like shadows in the house, they never bother us. When a guest comes, they serve in the kitchen and do what is necessary, but they do not sit with us. They never interfere with our private space and I think they really know their boundaries (Madam 7, 46 years old).

For example, I experienced this thing with Turkish caregivers. Whenever a guest comes to our house, she sits next to us and talks informally with guests. You know, okay, she can talk to them, but our nanny, for example, never leaves her room. She is with you whenever you need her, but apart from that she is always in her room and it should be like that (Madam 8, 36 years old)

As seen in these examples, being invisible is a plus for a domestic worker which has been part of a quintessential image of domestics. Employers may prefer less conversation with migrant workers to set the boundaries and create a more private area for themselves. This distant attitude might deepen inequality by depriving Filipinas of even the most basic kinds of social respect, honor, and emotional support (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2007). Even though these examples suit the sub-type of business relationship with the wish of pursuing a more utilitarian communication, the overall comments of the participants in the interview show that they actually belong to the personalist category based on their dominant traits, mainly thanks to their openness to considering the nannies like a family member, being welcoming towards them in terms of family activities such as dinners.

To sum up, most of the employers in my study want to find a balance in accordance with their social class, sex, and personality. Some put more emphasis on maintaining a more reliable personal relationship that is trouble-free while some others choose to forget about their differences and act as a family. On the contrary, others believe that there needs to be a drawn line between the employer and the employee. The responses by the employers in my study suggest that they choose boundary work as a strategy to protect their status, guarantee the service provided, feel the superiority in the relationship, and create the hierarchy that they need to ensure deferential behavior. In the next section, I will discuss one of the commonly debated topics in literature while discussing live-in domestic workers, being like ‘one of the family.

### **5.2.2. One of the Family Discourse**

The level of intimacy between employers and live-in workers is generally expressed in literature as “she is just like one of the family” (Romero, 1988, p. 329). Employers use this “family analogy” (Romero, 2016, p. 184) to guarantee maximized labor, extended work definition, and longer hours of service. This analogy is not only used by employers with maternal attitudes as either personalist employers or the ones having business relationships are also consider their workers as one of the family. Besides, in literature, it is also expressed that domestic workers also desire to be treated as one of the families (Parrenas, 2001; Romero, 2016; Constable, 1997). Being like a family member for them is equated with being a ‘human being’ and treatment with respect and dignity (Romero, 2016, p. 187). The domestic workers who are not regarded as one of the family consider themselves as non-person “because they are treated more coldly by their employers” (Parrenas, 2001, p.144). If they are not treated as a family member, they interpret this as an indication of their inferior social status.

Researching the Turkish employers and domestic workers, Kalaycıoğlu and Tiliç conceptualize this relationship as “pseudo-kinship” (2001). They argue that workers desire to be trusted and to be acknowledged as family members while employers expect to be perceived as generous in this personalized relationship. To understand the details of this pseudo kinship, I asked both migrant Filipinas and Turkish employers, how their personal relationship is, what they share and how they perceive being a member of the family. The major sign for both employers and migrant Filipinas, of being like a family is to eat altogether, sharing the same table. Still, for some employers, claiming that they see the nannies as family members does not translate into relational outcomes, such as sharing the table. This in-between positioning is the result of the previously mentioned “business relationship” in which employers express a certain amount of connection towards the nannies but remain distant when it comes to household activities and rituals. In addition, these three employers also believe that seeing them as family members set up the necessary conditions for good service.



I asked employers, ‘Do you see your employee as a family member?’. Eight of them reported that they saw nannies like a member of their family. Only one employer, Madam 6, said that their helper was not a part of their family. Out of eight employers, five of them have maternalist and personalist attitudes, share the same table during meals and talk about personal and private issues with their nannies. The rest of the group, ones with a business relationship attitude, declare that they accept their Filipina nanny to be part of the family but usually abstain from usual familial duties.

Apart from the four types of boundary work, the employers in this research position themselves inside different categories under the family discourse. In this categorization, it is possible to see joint tendencies from different boundary work examples. For example, two employers, one from maternalist and one from personalist attitudes, have built what Lan calls “strategic intimacy” as a tool to assure the impact of emotional labor (2000, p.204).

Yes, we considered her a member of our family. We had to do it like that. She came from her homeland to work for us. For her to provide good care to my child, we had to make her feel like that. I was leaving my child and going to work. She could do something bad; she could do anything. After a while, you, too, become very close. You know her family issues; she knows your own family issues. You do not see her separate from your family. When you go somewhere outside, you go to a restaurant together. When you go on a visit to a friend, you take her with you as well. She is a part of your family. You cannot see her as anybody (Madam 4, 44 years old).

In this example, the strategic intimacy between the employer and the nanny can be observed as a result of their inevitable physical proximity. Mainly knowing that they will be together most of the time, inside and outside the household, the employer believes that she has no choice but to form a friendly relationship with the nanny. Madam 4 also thinks that having an attitude like this prevents her to face potential unfortunate outcomes which may be caused if the nanny has been treated badly. When looking at the professional background of Madam 4, it is possible to form a connection between her household relationship with her corporate life. As someone accustomed to hierarchical and peer relationships

within an office environment, the corporate tendency of forming a strong relationship with a positive attitude has been a common norm, mainly for professional reasons as well as the similarly seen physical proximity in the office. Among the interviewees, Madam 1 also has a similar attitude towards the nanny as she perceives their relationship based on a trade-off. Seeing the nanny as a family member and accepting them to the dining tables, Madam 1's core motivation is still based on ensuring quality service as a result of her familial approach to the nanny. Apart from sharing the same household and career habits, strategic intimacy can be seen from other employers having different backgrounds and approaches towards the nannies, such as Madam 5.

Trust is very important in a relationship. I have always believed this. You get what you give. I gave her trust, love, and respect, I think she is happy. I told her you will be a part of our family when we first met. In fact, she was very surprised at our first dinner. I put a plate for everyone, and I put one for her. She did not sit in her chair. She said I will eat somewhere else. I said no, sit down, please. You will eat here, too. She became delighted (Madam 5, 30 years old).

In this example, as an employer showing maternalist tendencies, Madam 5's intimacy mainly arises from the hierarchical differences she and the nanny have, also from her desire to express it as an employer. She mentions the importance of trust, indicating that in the given employer-employee relationship, her emphasis on trust is mostly pragmatic. Similar to Madam 4, she also considers seeing the nanny as one of the family can ensure trust, loyalty, and quality service from the nanny. Moreover, with respect to her maternalist tendencies, the welcoming attitude of Madam 5 towards the nanny in situations such as sharing the same table and the nanny's surprise and appreciation also feed the ego of the employer, making the hierarchical distinctions more visible. The excerpts from the interviews with Madam 4 and 5 indicate that they include the migrant Filipina nannies in their families because they want to guarantee the good care and nurture by the nannies for their children, as well as the tendencies they express with respect to their backgrounds. Both of them point out the reciprocal nature of this interaction and highlight the trade-off in this relationship.

Apart from the examples given above, “one of the family discourse” does not always have to be centered on beneficial and strategic roots. In certain cases, the interviewees expressed their genuine thoughts about the nannies in terms of their physical and mental health, as well as their perceived positioning as a member of the family. An accurate example of it can be seen from Madam 8:

She shares everything with us. She has children and she always talks about her future plans with me. You can say that she is like a friend to me. If I’m not happy or crying, I tell her about it. She also shares her problems with me in similar situations. We are in the same house when you think of it, we are like a family so I don’t see any problem about sharing these mutually (Madam 8, 36 years old).

The comments of Madam 8 indicate that it is possible to accept a nanny as a family member naturally, without binding behaviors and attitudes to complex strategies. Similar to the previous interviewees who claimed that the inevitable physical proximity within the household leads them to have a positive attitude towards the nannies, Madam 8 also talks about the importance of sharing the same house when it comes to the mutual relationship. However, her acceptance of the nanny as a family member does not have a benefit-oriented background. She manages to acknowledge the nanny as a person with feelings, and form a natural, mutual connection like a family member. Another example can be Madam 7, among the three nannies she has worked with, she claims that she managed to form a strong family relationship with one of them, similar to a mother-daughter dynamic. In the previous section, Madam 7’s high standard expectations and even treating the nannies like products rather than human beings during the selection phase were criticized. Still, beyond her selective and perfectionist attitude, Madam 7’s relationship with the mentioned nanny is another suitable example of bonding between the employer and the employee independent of necessity or benefits.

Three employers, Madam 9, Sir 2, and 3, state that they see their nanny as part of their family, however, they do not share the same table while eating meals. In addition, they neither talk about their personal issues nor ask about her private

life or family. So, some employers prefer this familial inclusion to “disguise the exploitative side of the relationship” (Constable, 1997, p.111). These three employers apparently want to look like to be willing to show that they include their workers in the family while abstaining from the redundancy of this “intimacy work” (Özyeğin, 2004, p. 180). Özyegin’s intimacy work is simply described as the additional knowledge that comes with oversharing within the household between the employer and the nanny. This dynamic and mutual knowledge about privacy and also the backstories of both sides is beyond what we can see in a standard employer-employee relationship. Even though it is an act of intimacy, it is also likely to cause additional responsibilities and issues for the employer such as being overly sensitive about the nanny, possibly leading up to problems of authority. Therefore, employers like Madam 9, Sir 2, and 3 try to balance their relationship with the nanny to a point in which they can achieve to avoid intimacy work, still openly admitting that they see the nannies as a family due to sharing the same household. Having been living with a Filipina nanny for more than four years, Sir 3 says the following:

We were worried actually. We saw her as part of our family of course but we did not ask so many questions about her children or husband. We thought that she could miss them, we should not remind them while asking questions. What would we do if she told us, ‘I miss my child I want to go back to the Philippines?’ So, we just had small talks. Could you bring me tea? How was your day... That is it. (Sir 3, 49 years old).

This excerpt from Sir 3 reveals that employers can remain distant towards the nanny, especially in terms of topics and situations involving the past of the domestic worker in the Philippines. In this example, even seeing the nannies from the family, their decision not to ask a personal question can be because of respect and inexperience about this kind of employer-employee relationship. Moreover, the employer’s decision is also related to avoiding the potential intimacy work. As seen from the answer, the employer does not know how to act and maintain authority, especially on the long run, if the nanny becomes too comfortable with sharing her personal life with the employer, possibly coming up with additional demands like going back to the Philippines. In Madam 9’s

excerpt, the perceived threat of intimacy work is more visible as she answers that:

I really like the work of our nanny and the effort she puts in for the children and the house in general. She is definitely a member of the family and of this house thanks to her contributions. Still, there should be a point in which both sides should limit themselves. I say it in terms of sharing, especially the personal stories. We should not forget that this is a business relationship. The more our nanny becomes comfortable, and we get to know her past, the more problems we may have to maintain our authority and come up with demands (Madam 9).

In this example, the answer of Madam 9 shows that some employers are fully aware of the possible outcomes of the intimacy work. In order to avoid the negative sides of it, employers like Madam 9 try to draw a line with their nannies, especially in terms of over-sharing their personal lives. From Madam 9's previous comments, it is known that she is one of the employers who show inconsistencies when it comes to actions and words as she says they see the nanny as one of the family while still maintaining a distance positioning which can be seen in having dinners separately or intentionally avoiding the intimacy work. Examples of Sir 3 and Madam 9 indicate that in some situations, the claims of the employers and their attitude towards the nanny may not be accurate. Employers like Sir 3 and Madam 9 also consider the potential drawbacks of forming an intimate bonding with a nanny, such as loss of authority. Still, sharing the same house and being exposed to the physical presence of the nanny leads them to claim that she is a member of their family.

A common problem with including their nannies in the family for employers is that their children become fond of the nanny so much so that employers get jealous of this intimacy. While feeding the baby, spending the time whole day, playing games with her or him, the nanny becomes emotionally attached and builds stronger ties than the original mother (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2007, p. 159). Constable states that in these situations, mothers inform the child that a nanny or domestic helper is just a maid (1997, p.114). Two employers in this study show examples of jealousy towards the bonding of the children with the nanny. One of

the two, who formerly stated not having an intimate relationship with her current nanny said that she had hired another Filipina nanny for her son, but because the child attached to that one so much, they found a new nanny as it was not easy for them to manage this ‘over-attachment’ problem:

She comes from a different country. Different beliefs, cultures, upbringing. She thinks she has a lot of say over my children. Frankly, this bothers me. For example, our previous babysitter behaved to my child as if her own son, Thank God. However, she was so stubborn and self-opinionated. She was sometimes criticizing us for letting him watch TV or play an iPad. We were arguing about what was wrong and what was right for my child. She was thinking she had a say over how to raise my child. This was bothering me, and I did not want my child to have an attachment problem, so we changed our nanny now (Madam 9, 35 years old).

From the response of Madam 9, who is known to have a very strategic and relatively distant relationship with the nanny based on her previous responses involving sharing different tables during dinner or attempting to avoid intimacy work to maintain her authority, her emphasis on thinking the well-being of her children is actually an excuse. She may not want her children to over-attach himself to a nanny, still, Madam 9’s main concern is to protect her authority within the household, especially her parental authority. It is more of a sensitive issue, also open to jealousy for a mother, compared to the fundamentals of a straightforward employer-employee relationship. In some cases, nannies are also seen exceeding the boundaries which should be sacred for the mother and children because of spending more time with the children than the mother herself:

When she wants something and believes that it is true, she does some things which make me crazy. For example, she says to my child I will go if you do not do this or do that. I do not like this at all. I told her beforehand. I do not like lies; I am an honest person. One day, I got really angry because my child was crying at the door saying please do not go. She threatens my son when he does not do what she wants. This is wrong. I told her, if you want to go, just go now. If you do not go anywhere, do not ever do this to my child. After that she understood that he is my son, these are my rules. She cannot treat him like that (Madam 8, 36 years old).

Thus, the level of intimacy in the household when it comes to motherhood becomes a source of conflict between Filipina nannies and Turkish employers. Performing motherly duties to children, nannies might internalize their jobs and they become overly attached to each other. As a reaction, the mother of the house also has an employer identity, may get jealous of the intimacy between their children and the nanny. In these situations, employers can express their authority both as a parent and employer to solve the conflict with solutions such as changing the nanny.

As Parrenas states, Filipina nannies seek to be included in the family as a member (2001, p.144). One reason for this desire is the importance of family in Filipino culture. Besides, educated and qualified nannies want to be respected and well-behaved. They seek to be distinguished from the domestic workers of other nationalities. According to Parrenas Filipina nannies who are treated like 'human beings' generally point out that their skills and intelligence are acknowledged, they are not discriminated against by wearing uniforms, their social and physical needs are respected, and their presence is accepted in the household (2001, p.143). Out of sixteen, twelve Filipina nannies in my study feel like a member of the family they work for. Three others stated they had a distant relationship, and one nanny was unsure. Paradoxically, three of the mentioned twelve stated they did not eat meals together as a family and four of them said they did not share their private life or talk about other things. For these women, the standard of considering the employer as the family has a low ceiling, that is why it is easy for them to do so. The findings suggest that as long as the nannies manage to form a connection based on mutual respect and do not misbehave after all of their efforts by the employers, the household members turn out to be a family for them.

While describing what makes them feel like a part of the family, nannies generally assert that they are treated well, and they eat what employers eat. So, they associate equal treatment with being included in the family:

They treat me well. They eat what I eat. We always talk about family things. I already met their parents and friends, and I can always interact with their children however I want (Ms. M., 35 years old).

We eat together at one table because they do not want me to eat alone. For example, if they eat, and I say I am gonna eat later, no. They wait for me until I got to sit on the chair (Ms. N., 31 years old).

They treat me well. Like, I can eat what they eat. They do not demand any work. I can do whatever I want. I have freedom in the house. They do not care about what I do (Ms.H., 41 years old).

I mean from everything they do here. Especially when we go out eating in a restaurant. They do not say she is our nanny while introducing me to people. They just say, she is with us, it has been this much time like that (Ms. B., 33 years old).

These excerpts suggest that “food and meals underline the boundaries between the nannies and the families for whom they work” (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2007, p. 55). Besides, Ms. B. presents that she is pleased not to be introduced as ‘our nanny’ because she seeks equal treatment from others as well.

The rest of the participants, who state that they feel like a family member, but do not share anything personal, abstain from the emotional burden of this closeness:

The good thing is they don’t ask. I don’t have to say how’s my day going on or details who I am with etc. (Ms. O., 39 years old).

No. I do not. If they ask, I tell them but no they do not share theirs with me. (Ms. K., 37 years old)

Not too much because I am a private person, and I do not want to share everything. I do not want them to judge me or control me. (Ms. N., 31 years old).

The narratives show that some nannies would like to keep their private life to themselves to balance the intimacy of family and work. Furthermore, five participants state that being very close to the family they work for increases the workload and limits their freedom:



In general, I have my boundaries. So, I can say no. But when you feel closer, you might not say no easily. You cannot claim any raise to your salary or accept what they say because you cannot argue with them. (Ms. O., 39 years old).

Sometimes yes because we become so close to each other I cannot say no to her (Ms. D., 41 years old).

If you always say yes, they add more. Sometimes, she says the child wants you to do this or do that, but she tells me what she wants. I don't like that. (Ms. J., 48 years old).

Thus, the narratives of the nannies also approve the argument that intimacy blurs the line between paid work and unpaid favors (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2007, p. 179). Lastly, one participant states that she was feeling like a family member, but she understood her value for her employers while leaving her job:

I felt like a family member. I worked for them for eight years. I ate with them, I shared my private life but when I think about those days right now, I think I was not that much worth for them. Because they offered me half of my salary. It is not about the money you know if they offered me from 1200 to 800 USD I could understand, I could accept it. I could understand the dollar's value in Turkey and everything. But it is 1200 to 600USD. How could I raise 3 kids who are all going to college? It was really hard for me (Ms. E, 47 years old).

So, she assesses her value in her employers' eyes with the payment she receives. According to Ms. E., if she were valuable enough for the family, she would not have been offered half of her salary when the dollar increased against the Turkish lira.

Among the sixteen nannies, three of them said that they do not consider their employers as family. When asked about what lies behind this way of thinking, even though they do not provide a clear explanation, it is possible to obtain certain patterns causing their attitude. According to the interviews, two out of the mentioned three have faced several forms of abuse, Ms. A. physically and Ms. K. sexually, during their previous employments as nannies. These unfortunate experiences inevitably lead the nannies to be hesitant to form a real connection with their employers in the long run, also making them over-protective and cautious about their mental and physical well-being. Moreover, one of the three

nannies, Ms. J. who does not consider her employer as a family has a notable experience as a domestic worker, for fourteen years. Throughout this period, seeing many employers and switching from one to another regularly have clearly made her relatively numb about the affection element of the live-in domestic work and see it as a purely professional relationship, compared to an average nanny. Therefore, it is also possible for the nannies not to consider the household as a family environment as a result of their experience level as a live-in domestic worker.

Hence, employers use ‘one of the family’ discourse as a strategy to maximize the work, guarantee the caring and nurturing attitude of the nanny, and request unpaid favors when they need. Beyond the pragmatic roots of considering the nannies as a member of the family, employers also show signs of familial behavior because of sharing the same living space with the nannies regularly. They consider having a mutually positive attitude as an inevitable necessity under the given circumstances, similar to the code of an office environment of the business life. The results of the research have also shown that, even though it is rare, employers can really embrace the nannies as one of their family, independent of any benefit-oriented or physical proximity-related reasoning, as well. On the other hand, for Filipinas, family membership has a low ceiling in terms of expectations as it simply requires equal treatment, respect, and worth. Seeing nannies as family and the actual relationship within the household can appear paradoxical, especially considering that some portion of the employers do not even share the same table with the nanny or expect privacy from them. However, as mentioned in the previous sentence, most nannies do not have complex and in-depth standards to say that employers are like a family to them. In some cases, the nannies even prefer the distancing they face in the house as it means more private space and free time for them, as well as potentially fewer additional tasks within a single day. Moreover, due to unfortunate incidents such as facing mental or sexual abuse or fully embracing the professional side of their duties, nannies can also show a protective and distant attitude towards their employers, claiming that they are not like a family. Even though bonding and

mutual acceptance are positive factors for the nannies, they are also aware that familial inclusion increases the workloads and violates privacy, trying their best to find the perfect balance based on their past experiences and expectations.

### **5.2.3. Purchasing Deference and Labour Control**

According to Rollins, deference is “something the subordinate owes to his superordinate” (1985, p. 157). Although it is obvious that the relationship of employers and domestic helpers is nonegalitarian, Rollins (1985) highlights that the superiority of the former is attached to the deferential behavior of the latter. If the inferior does not acknowledge this superiority and perform expected behaviors, she can lose her job (Rollins, 1985). Therefore, it is designated essential for domestic helpers and nannies to be submissive to the needs of the employer. While deferential behavior strengthens the position of the employer in terms of class hierarchy, it at the same time gives them a chance to confirm the privilege of status signals.

Employers purchase deferential behavior by setting the rules in the house, exercising control, checking through the camera, supervising, and giving orders. In linguistic deference, employers call the domestic workers by their names and expect to be called sir or madam (Rollins, 1985). Similarly in my study, thirteen nannies pointed out that they call their employers ‘Ma’am’ or ‘Sir’. Three participants who have close relations with their employers say ‘Abla’ or ‘Ağabey’<sup>8</sup> while calling them. Besides, all nannies stated that they would like to be called by their first names. On the other hand, spatial deference refers to unequal rights for employers and employees in the household and checking nannies’ use of house space (Rollins, 1985).

Six employers in my study accept the fact that they set the rules in the house, supervise how the work should be done, and control their workers when

---

<sup>8</sup> Abla means big sister and Ağabey means big brother in Turkish but these phrases are also used to address other seniors to show respect.

necessary. They state that they set rules in the house to organize the duties of the nanny:

My condition is, as soon as you arrive home, the clothes should be changed, the nanny should take a shower and put the clothes that she wore outside to laundry. I also wanted her to take the tests for AIDS and Hepatitis. I could not be sure whether she was sick or not (Madam 6., 43 years old).

I am very strict about this phone thing. Not the phone but the children should be the priority for her; I say this to her from the first day. I am also very strict about giving a bath to children every day. We start the day early. She should prepare breakfast directly at 07.30. She should keep up with our pace, so she should not be slow (Madam 9., 35 years old).

They are addicted to their phones. I do not want her to text all the time. I told her you are only allowed to talk on the phone when you are free (Madam 8., 36 years old).

For example, if we cook something for dinner, I tell her to cut onions, cut parsley, boil water. I give her the directions and of course, I check her because she cooks something that is not in her cuisine. Sometimes I check after she cleaned the rooms whether it is still dusty or if she used the same duster for the bathroom and other rooms (Madam 7., 46 years old)

The remaining three participants point out that they did not set out any rules because Filipinas already knew what to do and how to take care of children. Furthermore, five employers control their nannies while watching through the camera and four of them say that they trust and do not control their employees:

We had our camera inspecting what she was doing. She told me she did not smoke, but I caught her smoking at nighttime in our summer house. I did not mind, and she did not repeat it again (Madam 6, 43 years old).

We had a camera, but I was not looking that much. If you hire somebody to your house and want her to take care of your child, you have to trust her. But after a certain period of time, when we saw a serious decrease in performance and insomnia, it turned out that she took his boyfriend to our home, then we ended the contract anyway. She started to complain all the time saying I get very little money for this job. She was sleeping during the day for two hours. When she was taking care of children for example, she was sleeping. I saw her on the camera. She was sleeping and children were in front of the television. I asked her, 'why are you sleeping?' She said 'she could not sleep last night'. I said, 'why didn't you sleep?' She said, 'she missed her children'. However, she was complaining at the same time. When I checked her in the camera, I saw that she was getting her boyfriend into my house. We were sleeping upstairs, and her room was downstairs. She was getting him in through the window. I was shocked (Madam 7, 46 years old).

Thus, Turkish employers in this study tend to supervise, direct and control the work to make sure the quality of the service and compliance with deference. These examples show that several incidents cause the employers to claim that the nannies actually show unprofessional acts of working behavior, such as sleeping during work hours, instead of taking care of the children or secretly inviting their boyfriends to the house of the employers at night. Therefore, arranging additional quality ensuring measures such as cameras appears as a necessity for the employers to implement. The employers sometimes take measures without being sensitive about the privacy of the nannies, as in some cases, they do not even know about the existence of a surveillance camera. Moreover, even though they know about it, some of them are forced to live with a camera settled in their bedroom.

Stating that employers generally want them to be submissive, eight Filipina nannies point out that their employers set rules in the household. Most of these participants refer to restrictions about the use of the phone. Others mention rules about drinking alcohol and smoking during work hours.

In Bursa, my former boss was a perfectionist. You must fold this nicely. You must iron even the bra, underwear, and socks. Toys must be a proper line. Everything. Even very little things. She notices everything. (Ms. L., 46 years old).

She is so disciplined. She has rules about baby care, my speaking tone to her. Ironing day, mopping day she arranges my schedule. Now she puts some rules about my phone. I want to facetime with my child, my family but she does not allow it. There's a time difference when I want to call them it's nighttime. I am here in order to support my family but if my child cries there, something happens to him, I need to know and help him. I am also a mother (Ms. D., 43 years old).

It is really hard to get along with the people here. I think they are not that open-minded. Some of the people here, they want you to go on their way. After living in Turkey for almost 4 years, I understood that this is how it goes things here. When I was in Tuzla, the women there, even when it is cutting some salad, she wanted to be in her way, even the small pieces. You need to cut it very small, this size. Things like that. Why do you give me instructions? Leave it to my own, why even the sizes matter? It is like... what?! They are perfectionist in all time. I do the cleaning even I was thinking I had already done my best, it is not

enough for her. Nothing is enough for her. So, it is very stressful. Some people really cannot understand we are human too. (Ms. K., 37 years old)

The answers of the nannies about the rules within the household shed light on the psychology of the nannies while they work for and live with an employer. In any working relationship, it is usual to have certain rules and regulations that define the employment, the expectations of the employers from the nannies in terms of the rules in the household are no different. However, the nannies' honest expressions about their feelings towards the rules highlight an important detail that employers can ignore which is the fact that these nannies are human with feelings and expectations, also having their own families. To give an example, Ms. D.'s response shows that her employer is not sensitive about the time zone difference between Turkey and the Philippines, which is eventually leading up to problems for the nanny while she is trying to talk with her family back home. Moreover, Ms. K. emphasizes the stress that these excessive rules bring, negatively influencing her mental health, in the process. The answers of the nannies clearly show that there is a lack of empathy from the point of view of the employers towards the nannies. Moreover, both sides have an issue of miscommunication, mainly due to the respect and submissive nature of the nannies, who in most cases, cannot find the courage to be vocal about their actual emotions and expectations.

Other than that, twelve nannies state that they have a security camera in the house watching them while working. Out of these twelve nannies, three of them are disturbed by the presence of the camera as it violates their privacy.

The one in Bursa, they put camera in my room. They were watching me! They did not tell me anything during the interview about camera. When I arrived to my room, I saw it and asked is this working? They said yes. I asked where am I going to change my clothes? They said in the bathroom. (Ms. L., 46 years old).

She watches me from time to time. I do not like being watched all the time... but what can I say... (Ms. D., 43 years old)

She watches whether I am happy while playing in the baby's room. If my mood is not okay that day she notices and directly asks me what is wrong. Sometimes

I do not want to explain but she insists. During the presence of a camera in the room, I cannot even cry when I need to cry. This is bad. (Ms. J., 48 years old).

The answers of the nannies provide additional insight into the previously mentioned problems regarding the privacy of the nannies within the household. Even though most employers believe that adding these surveillance cameras is a necessity to get maximum efficiency from the nannies as well as guarantee loyalty to them, the privacy of the nannies and their feelings according to this issue play an important role in this research. These answers above enable the nannies to be vocal about their true feelings and psychological effects of the endless surveillance as they openly express their thoughts that they sometimes cannot share with the employers. Although their numbers are less, these nannies cannot say to their employers that they are disturbed by the presence of a camera. The workplace restrictions and the inability of the nannies to verbalize what they need shape up the relationship structure, eventually leading up to deference. Paradoxically, the more privacy of the nannies are being invaded by the employers, the more emotional and psychological pressure the nannies would feel, negatively influencing their work performance. It is known that the employers want to get the most of from the service of a nanny, sometimes even forgetting that they are not a machine. Still, the excessive use of cameras, especially in the personal spaces of the nannies, can decrease the efforts of a nanny significantly.

To sum up, nannies perform emotional labor under the provision of their employers, and they are supposed to wear the “mask of deference as a protective disguise” (Cock, 1980, p.8). This mask helps them to comply with the employers' demands whilst suppressing their actual emotions. In the next section, I will explain how Filipina nannies adapt to a new environment, cope with challenges, and manage their feelings.

### **5.3. Filipina Experiences in Turkey**

In this section, I will reflect on the experiences of Filipina nannies in Turkey by focusing on identity management, survival tactics, workplace abuses, and mental health. I will also discuss, more in detail, their opinions about Turkish employers, day-off activities in boarding houses, and future plans.

#### **5.3.1. Identity Management and Coping Mechanisms**

When Filipinas decide to migrate and work in the First World countries as domestic workers and nannies, they experience downward class mobility to achieve upward economic mobility (Parrenas, 2001). The separation anxiety and inclusion in a new culture create conflict that causes many of them to reconstruct their identities. As stated earlier in the literature review section, Turner calls this reconstruction process ‘social dramas’ and argues that it consists of the breach, crisis, redressive action, and the reintegration or schism phases (1975). While analyzing the ongoing employer-employee relationship within the household, it is also important to approach the mental state of the nannies from a wider perspective. Before being employed, these nannies may have little experience about being and living abroad as a nanny or they may have more experience by seeing several countries and having many employers, as well. Therefore, while talking about identity management and the mechanisms they use to cope up with daily issues, the certain phase that the nannies are in within the reconstruction process is also important.

When I asked what they were feeling when they left the Philippines and arrived in a new country with a different culture, nine nannies in my study stated that they experienced excitement together with separation nervousness.

I cried every day for almost two months. Because when I left from the Philippines to Singapore, my youngest son was eight years old. And it was the first time I left them. It was so hard for me to adapt but I got used to it now. In



time, I learned the culture, how to cope with Turkish people, and no more crying. (Ms. J., 48 years old).

Yeah, I felt like I lost confidence. I felt like why I cannot make it work. Is there something wrong with me? At the time when I just started everything was going wrong and I wanted to go back to Hong Kong but when I still think that maybe I can find a better family, I tried until my last chance. Finally, I got used to it. (Ms. K., 37 years old).

Of course, I felt nervous. Not in Turkey, but in my first job in Hong Kong after the departure from my family. My first night in the employers' house was not good. As I always cried and prayed for strength. In Turkey, I already got used to living with strangers. I felt something like excitement and curiosity. I was shy because Madam was like observing me all the time. (Ms. D., 43 years old).

Three of the nine women mentioned above experience 'social dramas' (1975) and manage to cope with the separation nervousness thanks to emotional persistence and decisiveness. They point out that in the "time-performance continuum loop" (Arnado, 2010, p. 134), i.e., in the process of time, they have adapted themselves to Turkish culture. However, it is important to note that this adaptation and even the slight reconstruction of their identity are not solely about the culture of the country, it is more integrated. This act of readjustment also involves the employment characteristics and expectations of the employers in accordance with their traits. Therefore, these nannies would have different cultural adaptations if they were to arrive in Turkey differently than being a nanny. The phases that nannies go through are specific to their occupational status and roles, while the culture of the country playing a key role, as well. Six others also come up with similar responses, saying that it is natural to experience these feelings, especially during the first time they are leaving their homeland and getting separated from the family. They also say that people get used to these feelings in time, eventually. The rest of the group asserted that they felt nothing because they had already been prepared emotion-wise for their duty, and technology helped them ease the feeling of homesickness.

In her study of Filipina domestic workers in Singapore, Ueno (2010) argues that domestic workers obtain a new "identity kit" to compensate for their damaged identity in the migration process. Similarly, experiencing downward mobility,

Filipina domestic workers in my study embrace a self-sacrificing identity to reject the feelings of insufficiency. Pointing out that they devote themselves to their work, the participants in my study define Filipina nannies as strong, independent, and brave enough to fight with anything. Especially one of them likens Filipina nannies to ‘eagles’ because eagles can fly long hours to different lands, and it is a powerful animal that can survive no matter how harsh the conditions are (Ms. N.). Furthermore, as part of their identity kit, most of them keep reminding themselves of the purpose of their migration and dream about their future plans to stay strong in this adaptation process.

When I talk to my daughter, I cannot cry because I do not want her to get upset. Instead, I tell her I am here for them. To give them a good education and after maybe a good job. So, I tell her ‘study harder’ because I put up with everything here for them (Ms. A., 40years old)

I just think about the time when I open my café in the Philippines. Something like Starbucks maybe. A coffee shop and some desserts. That is my plan. I know it is too early to think about it, but it gives me strength because I feel like I have a purpose (Ms. N., 31 years old).

So, Filipina domestic workers and nannies find comfort in identifying themselves as strong individuals who overcome any difficulty. They also keep reminding themselves their purpose in here and the life that waits for them in the future. Moreover, the nannies can also use identity kits to prevent their identity and mental well-being from further damage by trying to position themselves according to their wishes:

When I first arrived to the house of my employer in Turkey, she told me that she is familiar with having maids in the house. To set things clear from the beginning, I told my madam that than I am not a maid, but an educated, university graduate nanny for her children. I am here to take care after their children, teach English and other stuff, and so on. If I don’t say these from day one, things may get exhausting for me. They may give different responsibilities to me that I should not be doing as a nanny, as well as I may not get the respect I deserve with my efforts (Ms. G., 47 years old).

The answer of Ms. G. reveals that in some cases, the identity kit is being used as a protective measure. The interviews in this research show that nannies can tend

to reposition their domestic worker identity, mainly by being sensitive about their job title and description, also believing that it is important for them to be acknowledged by the employers in a way the nannies expect.

To get the best outcome depending on the circumstances, Filipina nannies switch between multiple identities depending on the environment they are in. Domestic workers have to embrace dual identities, leading to a front/backstage distinction (Goffman, 1956), one for their daily working hours within the house of employment and, one for their leisure time away from their employment duties. The latter is an “off-stage” (Lan, 2003, p. 153-154) identity in which they do not have to perform according to the occupational expectations from them. Within these identities, a notable difference can be seen in their choice of clothing as they have the opportunity to express themselves freely without any constraints. Thirteen of the migrant domestic workers in this study state that their behavior and appearance are noticeably different at home and during their leisure time:

When we go out, of course, we wear the good ones. To feel that we are not always a worker. To feel also we are free that day. We can put on lipstick, dress well, wear high heels. Inside the house, you cannot do these things. We are simple, we are working. Madam might get jealous. Our hair at home always ponytail, wearing clothes with not open cleavage, loose clothes (Ms. L. 46 years old).

I am practical in the house. I wear jogging pants, t-shirts. When I am outside, I wear my favorite shirts, polo shirts and then skirts. In the house of the employer, they have rules, we prefer not to talk about our private life. We prefer being quiet. They might not understand us. For example, I talk with my best friends differently than my employer. Inside the employers' house I prefer to be quiet (Ms. F., 40 years old).

Yes, of course. For example, in my working place, I wear very simple things. Pants and t-shirt are enough for me, I need to be comfortable for the baby because it is so active. For outside that is my holiday, I wear different things, dresses, make up like that. (Ms. N., 31 years old).

Yes, of course madam. For six days inside employers' house, we wear normal clothes (Ms. L., 46 years old).

Filipina domestic workers consider the only off day they have within a week as a very valuable one. They look forward to it because of reasons such as speaking

their own language, cooking and eating their local food, and even drinking alcohol, dancing and singing while wearing nice dresses. The answers of participants also support the idea that the backstage identity of the Filipinos represents their personality while their frontstage identity during working hours is a performance, aligned with employers' expectations. The opportunity to embrace an offstage personality provides Filipinos much-needed energy for the upcoming work week, reminds these women that life is not all about work, and helps them to maintain a healthy work-life balance as much as possible.

Switching between these dual identities every week is not an easy task, however. Thirteen respondents express their difficulties during adaptation to a new working week after a day in which they can enjoy leisure time as themselves:

When I go out, it is stress-free and then I am happy. When I have little time to go back, I feel like I do not want to go back, I feel tired. I feel like a real life Cinderella (Ms. J., 48 years old).

It feels like why again... It is too hard, but we got used to it (Ms. K., 37 years old).

You have to take energy from outside. When you go back, you feel sad again. That's why in order to keep our mood up before we leave, we plan next week what are we going to do, and we look forward to the day we have day off. We go skiing or somewhere else. It is a really big help. Because of this routine, we keep alive (Ms. E., 47 years old).

Stress within the work environment causes anxiety, feeling like being imprisoned. Therefore, these women's leisure time is an opportunity to escape from these negative feelings they build up during a workweek.

During some points of the week, the pressure on us turns home to a prison. I love my job and my employers, but it can be like a prison. So, the weekends are so valuable to me (Ms. C., 33 years old).

Ms. C.'s answer further supports the responses from the other nannies. One of the most significant features of the day-offs is being a motivational target for the nannies, as well as, providing leisure time for a recharge. Psychologically, the contrast between the workdays and day-offs, especially in terms of the responsibilities, activities, appearance, and the expressed identity of the nannies,

can also provide adaptation issues for these women. These answers show that even though they enjoy the arrival of the day-off after even starting to see the household as a prison due to their intense working schedule, going back to the work once again after their leisure time becomes a struggle for the nannies. As mentioned above, the identity kits they are deploying show their differences, making the sacrifices they have to make by being a nanny more visible for them. Their day off each week is very valuable for the domestic workers, especially for balancing stress at work with their social life. Still, the working week of the women consists of intense responsibilities hence mental and physical distress inside the employer's house. Along with the benefits that come with the relaxation of an off-day, Filipinas also implement certain techniques to decrease the pressure they face during the workweek. Through boundary work in the household, not only employers but also Filipina nannies utilize some coping mechanisms or tactics. These tactics help them to survive and resist unending demands and to subvert the control by employers. According to De Certeau (1984), tactics are the counterforce against the strategies, which are deployed by the employers of the domestic workers. In this framework, tactics refer to the tools of the suppressed against the more resourced employers. Out of sixteen participants in my study, eight of them state that they use tactics such as skipping a duty, providing a sketchy output, and pretending to be ill for less work.

Hahaha... Of course, I have. I sing! She knows if I sing, I am tired, I got angry about something or I cannot tolerate her anymore. She says oh canim you can rest in your room if you do not feel okay. I do not need to say anything to her. I just sing... (Ms. D., 43 years old).

Ms. D.'s association of singing with her tiredness is something that naturally comes for her. However, the employer's awareness of this connection, allows Ms. D. to have more rest, as she knows that singing can now be deployed as a tactic to decrease her daily workload. The other examples of tactics are:

Sometimes I have tactics in terms of cleaning. Sometimes I skip because it's hard to do. I cannot handle it anymore (Ms. A., 40 years old).

Sometimes I feel tired. If she is not helping me with the baby, feeding, or taking shower, I say I am in my period to have an early rest (Ms. N., 31 years old).

These answers are examples of how domestic workers can utilize some habits as tactics against their employers. In some cases, these tactics can have natural and unintentional roots such as singing. Starting as an instinctual behavior, then using this intentionally as an effective tactic to take a break whenever they are exhausted. In some cases, the tactics are purely intentional behind health and body capacity. These answers also reveal that it is unlikely to expect the nannies to operate in their maximum performance throughout the workweek. Tactics play an explanatory role, revealing that the weekly expectations of the employers are excessively demanding for the nannies. In order to reduce the pressure, the nannies are using tactics as much as they can.

Lying is also an effective and common tactic deployed by the participants of this research, and not always used indirectly by, such as singing or pretending to be on period to avoid extra work. Even though eight of the participants admit that they do not rely on any tactics against their employers, they still accept that they find themselves lying from time to time. Ten participants in total express their lying tendencies:

Yes, if you have to, you can lie. For example, I have my own house to maintain here, I tell them there is some gas man or electric man, water man will come, I need to go. That's it. Cargo will come sometimes. I have to give a reason. They will let me (Ms. F., 40 years old).

Sometimes, if I need to go somewhere, meet up my friends or just relax outside, I say I need to go to the bank because I will send money to the Philippines and she lets me. (Ms. D., 43 years old).

Sometimes, if it necessary to do. I have my relationship here. They don't know, I didn't tell them. When I go out in the nighttime, they wonder. They wait me to come back. My man boss asking me how did you find a taxi at that time of the night? I don't want them to think about me like this like that. It is necessary (Ms. C., 33 years old).

Lies are sin you know. God watches us even when we lie. I do not want to lie for this reason but what can I do? Sometimes I find no other way than lying.

They want so many things and if I try to do each one of them, I can die. So, I don't like lies but sometimes I have to. (Ms. I., 52 years old).

I have judo class on my day- off. Before the class, we drink coffee with my friends and chat. If I arrive late, I miss that part and find myself directly in the judo class. In order to chat with my friends, I tell my bosses my judo classes start one hour earlier so I leave job earlier (Ms. B., 33 years old).

These responses about their lying tendencies, even after rejecting to perform any tactics towards their employers, show that lying is a common and possibly an inevitable part of this employer-employee relationship. It is inevitable because of a similar reason of the strategy and tactic dynamic. In order to soften their work schedule and protect themselves from the ever-increasing demands of employers, the nannies will always utilize lies as support. In other words, as long as the expectations of the employers remain the same, lies will be a reality of this employment relationship. The findings point to the operation of lies, as a coping mechanism, to protect the domestic workers against the employer's demands. The responses also indicate the possibility that tactics may have roots based on actions the nannies take without being aware, which we can relate to Scott's conception of "hidden transcript" (1990, p.18). This concept refers to the 'behind-the-scenes' personalities and ways of communication and action that the domestic workers embrace, even unconsciously, while they inevitably are in perform a continuous power struggle with their employers throughout their employment.

The tactics of the nannies to encounter the employer's strategies in order to soften the suppression and coping mechanisms, in general, are not the only reflections of a hidden transcript. To ease their pressure and heal themselves, domestic workers adopt relief methods, as well.

I put music on my ears. Music helps me (Ms. F.,40 years old).

I take shower every day and it feels like you refresh yourself. Kids are noisy and you just find time to listen yourself (Ms. K., 37 years old).

You know, crying helps you to feel better. You release your emotion. You feel alone. Because, before, you have a problem, your family is there, friends are there. But now, you are being tied up because of corona (Ms. G., 47 years old).

Singing comes first. Sometimes, I cry in my room. It relieves me because I am also a human. I miss my family. I take a shower, try to sleep, talk to myself (Ms. D., 43 years old).

There are multiple ways when it comes to getting relief. Each domestic worker needs to do something, such as listening to music or crying, for a mental and physical boost. These relief methods work hand-in-hand with tactics to ease the pressure on the Filipinos.

The weekly work cycle of a Filipina consists of a more complex set of dynamics than it initially appears. The employer-employee relationship inside the household creates a clash of identities, both between the employer and the domestic worker and also inside the Filipina, causing a duality in terms of their personality. The off day of the week provides a visible reference point to observe the contrasting front and backstage identities. These women's opportunity to express themselves freely during leisure time may lead to exhaustion as adapting to a new week can be challenging after an off day. Still, these breaks every week are the most valuable source for mental and physical recharge. The employer-employee relationship shows traces similar to a chess game as Filipinas also come up with certain tactics to face the strategies of their employers and decrease the exerted pressure on themselves as much as possible.

### **5.3.2. Workplace Abuses: Sexual Harassment, Violence, Passport Deprivation and Run Away**

The intimate and invisible characteristics of the live-in domestic work put some Filipinas in a fragile position facing abuse in Turkey. All the Georgian domestic workers in Dinçer's study (2014) study reported that they experienced either sexual or verbal harassment by Turkish employers. Similarly, seven respondents in my study have reported that they were abused by their employers and six



expressed having been exposed to physical and verbal violence from the employer's children. Furthermore, three of them ran away from the families they worked for, and two of them were sexually abused. The participants Ms. I. and Ms. A. stated that they encountered physical violence when they wanted to leave their jobs and their passports were confiscated by their employers:

One day I had my day off. I messaged them maybe after this week, I would like to leave. I found another job. I am so tired. Then I came back to the house. The lady of the house first pushed me then slapped me while kicking. She was very tall, Ukrainian. I started crying. My male boss took my wallet and my passport. I did not know what to do. I packed my things but without my wallet. I went to my boarding house in Gultepe. I called the officer in the Consulate. The officer took me to the hospital. I was feeling nervous, I did not have any energy. Later I learned that even the previous nanny before me had been abused like me, she was an Uzbek lady (Ms. I., 52 years old).

Bad treatment started with pandemic. She fired the Turkish couple coworkers. I did all the job. I could not handle anymore. I start work around 7 o'clock. Mopping... It was hand mopping! Vacuum... Vacuum with a rainbow! You know rainbow? It has water inside; it was too heavy for me! And then, I finish my work around 11 or 12 p.m. Because I need to wait for them to sleep to go to my room. It was hard, really hard because it was only me in huge house. She did not let me have my off day for seven months... and then I felt tired. When I told her, I want to leave my job. She said no no. If I plan to quit my job, I end in a bad way. It is as if she was threatening me. I know she is one of the wealthiest families in Turkey. I know her capabilities. I am scared so I told to my friends I need a person to get out of that place because that is not healthy. Then they called embassy and embassy called the police. The security called my employer there is police over here from coming from the embassy. She was really angry, yelling at me and then she wanted to grab my hair and then I ran to my room. She wanted to get in, but I locked the door of the toilet. She was shouting to me, threatening me. I do not want to argue anymore, I just wanted to get out of that house. She told me shouting, did you call the embassy? I said no madam. She said you are a liar. I told her I only texted to a friend. You know my friend called embassy (Ms. A., 40 years old).

Two other informants also said that facing verbal violence has always been an unfortunate yet common part of their duty. These statements from the Filipinas support the claim that employers exert pressure on domestic workers also by the use of physical and verbal violence. In some cases, even when Filipinas are fully aware that they do not want to continue working in a household due to unhealthy conditions, the employers manage to keep pulling the strings by further limiting the Filipinas through acts of financial and legal restriction. The physical violence

that the domestic workers encounter combined with the sense of threat caused by the wealth and social status of an employer family, increases the sense of being in a disadvantaged position to new heights for the domestic workers, also negatively influencing their psychological well-being, in the process.

Exerting physical violence is not only something adult employers do. Six of the respondents said that they faced this type of abuse by the children of the employers, as well. Defining the children of the Turkish families as hyperactive and undisciplined, nannies share their experiences of having been bitten and punched by the children as well as dealing with yelling and shouting directed to them regularly:

The children in Turkey are how can I say... so hyperactive. They shout you, bite you but they are child, I understand and tolerate (Ms. D., 43 years old).

Last Sunday, the child told her mother 'Abla is not playing me well, she is always biting me'. Of course, there is a camera I did not do such thing. I just want them to discipline their children. Last night, he was kicking me here (her neck). I know they watch their children and how he behaves to me. I was just silent but when the lady becomes angry, it is very terrible (Ms. C. 33 years old).

When the children are 3-4 years old, they just hit you, scream to you but I can control on it. I can handle. I just ask what is the problem? What do you want? (Ms. B., 33 years old).

Here the baby always shouts me. She got used to me but sometimes. When I cannot understand what she wants, she shouts. I used to it already. Children here are very energetic, hyper (Ms. J., 48 years old).

The answers of the nannies show that dealing with the children can be a challenging task, especially for the employer-nanny relationship in the household. As seen in Ms. C.'s answer, parents tend to ignore the violence that their children apply over the nannies, even witnessing it with their eyes or from the surveillance camera. After these answers, I also asked the nannies how they feel when they are abused by the children. While some of them stated they feel humiliated and physically exhausted, the others reported that they tolerate it because children do not aim to hurt them on purpose. With all their experience in taking care of children for many years in different countries, the answers of the

Filipina's clearly indicate that when it comes to the attitude of the Turkish children, they are facing a new and quite challenging task, also due to the lack of empathy from their adult employers regarding the children's relationship with the nanny.

Apart from the physical and verbal violence that the domestic workers face, two of the interviewees confessed that they had been exposed to sexual harassment by their employers. Enduring sexual harassment for two years, Ms. E, has admitted that she put up with the abuse of her employer to send remittances for her children and protect her work permit:

It was really hard to stay there because when my male boss was giving baby boy to me, he was touching my body, my boobs, my butt. For two years and a half, I moved my bed from windows to the door. I pulled it every night. Just to be sure, he will not do anything about me. It was really hard (Ms. E., 47 years old).

Similarly, Ms. K. expressed that she was under additional pressure due to the sexual harassment she was facing:

In Tuzla, when sometimes my madam is not around, I was doing some stuff in the kitchen, my sir was just standing behind me and hug behind me and it was not normal for a boss to treat an employee like that, and I do not get used to that. I was surprised... I said what are you doing... are you crazy... there is a camera everywhere. I said do not do that again if your wife sees it in the camera, she will kill me. He was laughing like crazy. He does not say anything, laugh and go. He was always slapping my butt when his wife is not around. One time, he wanted me to bring some snacks to cinema room. It was downstairs. When he went there, he was wearing normal pants. It was summer and then when I went inside, he was just wearing boxers and laying in the coach... I told him what are you doing? Then I thought this is not a healthy place to work anymore. Harmful for me. I just told them I want to leave... (Ms. K., 37 years old)

The disturbing attitude of the male employer towards Ms. K causes her to put her physical and mental well-being aside for the sake of protecting her job. Even though she is the innocent one in these incidents, the nanny is still afraid of the possibility that the female employer may blame her for the actions of her husband or choose to believe him if he happens to accuse Ms. K.

Three participants stated that they ran away from the houses they worked for:

Everything was okay, but the child was hard. My boss told me no you cannot leave because Ali got used to living with you. Do you know what I did? They gave my salary; my employer went out. I did not plan anything. Babaanne is not at home, I had my own key. I ran away. I packed my stuff, left a letter to them saying I am sorry, but I can't handle their child. They kept calling me, babaanne and anneanne calling me. I did not answer phone calls, I did not want to hear anything. It is finished. (Ms. C., 33 years old).

This quote is an example of the ways employers attempt to have control over the decisions of the nannies, even including their right to quit the job. The second respondent also provides the details of the evaluation and decision-making process before running away from the employers. By forming a sense of community, the Filipinos in Turkey give valuable advice to one another for incidents like running away based on their knowledge and past experiences.

My salary was 400USD and I was not getting it on time. I was working without a paper so running away was the best option. My friends said if you run away, you can earn 1500 a month even without paper. So, I ran away. I packed my things, got help from gardener, to put the bag backside, it was really hard to get away because I was in Beykoz at that time. They were drinking tea in the garden; I told the little girl I love you, but I have to. Then I took a taxi, they did not see me. I just went out like I was going somewhere. I planned it for one month and I prayed to God, please help me. I tried it three times and I failed. On the third time, I did it. On the first time, they saw my bag and asked. I said I will give my old dresses to my friend. In the third time, that is it happened. The problem is that my passport was not with me since I reached Istanbul. They did not give it to me, they took it. I ran away with an instruction of Filipina. She told me how to run away. She said you have to tell your passport is lost. After one year, I came here in Ankara. Then I said I lost my passport to Embassy... They changed it. After running away, I went to Marmaris, Bursa because I did not want them to find me. (Ms. E., 47 years old).

We were 3 Filipinas in the same house. It was very difficult for us. We were taking care of triplets and the kids were drinking milk in every 4 hours at night, every day. The problem was, when they start to sleep at 11, in the night, after 2 hours, one child wakes up, they sleep in one bedroom. One wakes up, the other one wakes up and other one wakes up. (Laughs) So, we cannot sleep. So, around 6 o'clock we were waking up, in the morning and we were sleeping almost 2-3 hours. I ran away after 2 or 3 months because of that grandma. She was shouting at me when the employers are not at home. We were not sleeping regularly, and she did not think about it that much. One time, she bit me. I already talked to my boss. I said I cannot work here anymore so, please let me go. But they liked me and wanted me to stay. I tried talking to them seven times. They still did not understand. So, when I get my salary, I ran away, I did not go back to work. (Ms. H. 41 years old).

These answers show that while working under pressure, especially suffering psychological and physical violence, nannies see no option but to run away. This is particularly common among irregular migrants who do not have a legal obligation to work with a single employer that obtains the work permit for the nanny. The common choice of making a verbal agreement among irregular migrants and nannies makes it much easier to run away as the employers also do not possess any legal rights in these scenarios. The suggestion given by the friend to claim to the Embassy that the passport had been lost can be considered as an example of the tactics that the nannies implement to overcome the strategies of the employers. Although the embassy supports both regular and irregular migrants when they encounter passport deprivation, those who do not have legal documents hesitate to apply for legal support from the embassy. Moreover, making the decision to run away and really achieving to do so is not the end for the nannies as in some cases, the psychological pressure of the decision to run away can follow them like a burden. During their employment, the nannies are exposed to the economic superiority of the families and their potential capabilities and networks. The answer of the nannies also shows that the nannies are reminded about the power of their employers, causing the employers to be more scared and cautious about making an escape decision, fearing that they may get harmed later on.

This section sheds light on the fact that there is more to handle for the nannies beyond neatly completing their weekly responsibilities. As an existing and unfortunate part of the life of a domestic worker, these nannies also try to protect themselves, physically and mentally, from violence, including sexual harassment. In this research, these incidents reaching to a point of running away have only been observed on three nannies out of sixteen. From this ratio, reaching a point in which the nanny sees no option but to run away due to the physical and mental abuse within the household is rare. Still, it is important to observe the psychological buildup phases behind these serious decisions. Without any attempt of running away, some of the nannies still face abuse from the employer, or even the children of the employer on a regular basis during their

employment and try to ignore or suppress it by using certain coping mechanisms. Even though the treatment of the employers is unfair, and they are the ones to blame, the nannies still get afraid to lose their jobs after incidents like these. Moreover, if the nannies find themselves in a position that they cannot endure their existing conditions anymore, the decision to quit the job is also not up to the nanny herself but is a decision of the employer. In these situations, the domestic workers have no other choice but to find and implement tactics to run away.

### **5.3.3. Mental Health**

The exhausting work schedule, violence and harassment in different forms and intensity, and being away from the family in a different country with a foreign culture are among the many factors causing mental problems for the nannies. There are several existing cross-sectional studies (Terrighena & Barron, 2020; Chung & Mak, 2020) about the mental state and the psychological issues of domestic workers conducted in certain countries. Similarly, Zailon's research (2019) about life quality and health conditions of Filipina domestic workers in Turkey reveals that nannies who are subject to economical abuse like payment cut off or late wages, forced to work when they are ill, not being able to talk about their feelings openly and not allowed to take leaves face mental health problems. Zailon also reports that the mental health score of Filipinas in Turkey is 58.60 and he states this is a very low score compared to Filipinas living in the Philippines (2019, p. 90). With the help of the interviews, this study aims to contribute to this literature, by collecting some data about the psychological side of being a nanny in Turkey. The responses given in this study indicate that dealing with psychological problems is common, mainly due to the continuous tension between nannies and employers, the household environment, and being far away from the family in the Philippines.

One of the respondents expressed their difficulty in understanding and adapting to the detailed and complex expectations of the Turkish employers as follows:

It is stressful to satisfy somebody all the time. Sometimes, I have headaches when I go back to my room. You need to be careful about even the place of knife and fork. This gives me anxiety because I don't want to hear how things should be all the time. I try my best but sometimes this can't be enough. (Ms. D., 43 years old).

Generally attached with feelings like relaxation and comfort, home as a workplace for Ms. D. evokes constant stress and anxiety which further induces headache and discomfort even in her private space. Thus, restrictive employment conditions and constant control are one of the factors affecting the mental health of the nannies. Furthermore, having been exposed to sexual harassment for two years, Ms. E. suffers some of the negative psychological consequences of sexual harassment and physical abuse:

In that two years, he touched my boobs and butt, I was silently crying in my room at night. I was trying not to think about it, but it was giving me so much stress that I was shaking when he approaches me again and again. It felt like I was trapped. If I quit, I would lose my permit, I had to go back to the Philippines. So, I chose to remain silent but it gave me so much pain and I took some antidepressants from eczane and try not to think about him. (Ms. E., 47 years old).

Ms. E. is a case showing that the nannies may even choose to accept sexual harassment to protect their permits and keep being employed in Turkey. Being alone, without your voice being heard, also adds additional stress for the nanny, giving a sense of helplessness within the existing situation in the household. As the only remaining solution, nannies choose to get help from some medical pills, ignore the stressful and uncomfortable incidents at work and try their best to keep going, but with an unstable psychological state.

Ms. J points out that the heavy pressure that comes with being homesick and having a responsibility towards the family in the Philippines can also be a factor behind psychological problems:

In my former employer, especially when she was paying my salary late, I was feeling bad, and it was so difficult to sleep. They were not thinking about the children who depend on my salary to survive. They were thinking that I spend it

for myself. I could tolerate it. So, whenever I insisted and explained to my children, they were given promises, but I was getting it late. So, I quit my job. (Ms. J., 48 years old).

Ms. J.'s answer shows the lack of empathy that some Turkish employers have, especially when it comes to fully understand the situation of a nanny. In some cases, employers do not think about the importance of the salary for a nanny and to their family, missing out on the big picture in terms of the sacrifices a foreign domestic worker makes by being miles away from their home country. This respondent's decision to quit her job also supports the priority of a constant salary which is being paid on time, mainly thinking about her children.

Apart from the issue of empathy from the employers, the feeling of homesickness, and problems related to sexual or physical abuse of the nannies, there are also other crucial factors that affect the mental health of Filipina workers. For example, some employers put excessive amounts of pressure on them believing that they have a right to do so in this employment relationship. The previously mentioned use of surveillance cameras in order to supervise the nannies and their passive attitude towards the employers or the cautious behaviors and clothing preferences in order not to make the female employer of the house jealous are concrete examples. Therefore, the intensity level of the abuse varies from one nanny to another, with different types and origins.

To compare the mental health status among nannies, it is also better to mention the ones who have relatively fewer problems. Among the respondents of the research, two of the nannies say that they are pleased with the treatment they received from their Turkish employers. This positively influences their mental state and work performance.

I work a lot during the workdays, which is normal. I am here to work. Children are fast. You need to know how to deal with both of them at the same time. Sometimes this can be exhausting, but I guess it is normal. My employers see my efforts and treat me with respect, allow me to rest sometimes, even during working hours. I appreciate it (Ms. B., 33 years old).



The answer of Ms. B. shows that from the examples of abuse with varying intensity levels, it is also possible to see nannies having healthy relationships. Therefore, it is important not to make an overgeneralization by stating that facing some form of abuse is an inevitable part of the employer-employee relationship of the nannies. Yet, various answers of the sixteen respondents of the research reflect that abuse can appear in different forms and intensity levels. To make an even more accurate comparison, the response of Ms. N. can be useful:

In my previous employment before coming to Turkey, in Hong Kong. I was not happy with my employers, both of them. The husband was so rude, not appreciating my work at all. The mother of the children was always shouting me and sometimes pushing me if I don't clean well or the baby suddenly cries, the blame was on me. I was feeling so tired at that time. Thankfully in Turkey, I don't have these kinds of problems anymore. The house is bigger, and the weekly work is a lot more actually, but I love my employers and their behavior towards me. Even I get exhausted, their attitude makes me keep going (Ms. N., 31 years old).

Ms. N. clearly compares the different employer attitudes and their effect on her mental state while stating this. Her previous experience was problematic, showing examples of both physical and verbal abuse from the employers. Even though she did not state any concrete effects of the abuse other than the tiredness she faced back in Hong Kong, her response about the Turkish employment provides some data to make implications. Considering that the notable difference between the two employment experiences is the abuse factor, the positive attitude of the Turkish employers resulted in positive consequences, influencing both ends of the employer-employee relationship. Surprisingly, even though she claimed that she works a lot more in Turkey, the respectful and family-like dynamic she has in the household act as a huge motivational factor for the nanny, apart from the salary. The responses of Ms. N. indicate that eliminating the abuse from the household can provide notable positives for the psychological state of the nannies, also turning into a new coping method for the nanny to avoid exhaustion during the working week, being a motivational boost for them, in the process.

This section addresses the layer of psychological state on the experiences of the nannies in Turkey. The findings mainly indicate that although there might be exceptions, abuse is an existing and common side of the employment relationship. It can be seen in different forms such as physical, including sexual, and verbal, and also having mental consequences. In some cases, the mental state of the nannies can also be negatively influenced just by being homesick or having a heavy workload. Apart from the origins of abuse, the consequences may differ, as well. The answers from the nannies showed that in certain cases, nannies can feel alone and helpless against the abuse, using the previously mentioned coping mechanisms as protection or a possible solution to keep going. The lack of empathy from the employers is also another factor making the nannies depressed, giving an impression as if they are alone within the household while facing the psychological pressures they have. The answers of the two nannies who are pleased with the abuse-free relationship with their Turkish employers provide a possible comparison of the consequences of the abuse, making it possible to state that facing abuse brings a huge mental burden for the nannies while avoiding it acts as a motivational boost.

#### **5.3.4. Turkish Employers and Others**

In most cases, Turkey is not the first destination for Filipinas. Fifteen of the participant nannies in my study stated that they previously worked with employers in different countries. When I asked them their opinions about Turkish employers, they automatically answered me while making comparison with employers from other countries. Their responses indicate that when it comes to work expectations, Turkish employers are more demanding with a strict approach towards the nannies, compared to an average foreign employer of another nationality. Moreover, five of my respondents worked with foreign diplomats living in Turkey. Hence, they compare and contrast while explaining their opinions about Turkish employers:

Turkish families want to control everything. Diplomats just say, you have to do this thing and they do not check. Turkish ones always like, I want this, I want that. They are very demanding. (Ms. F., 40 years old).

I can say that Turkish employers are very demanding. Yes, it is different from foreign employers. They are like do this, do that. They are thinking about what you do, how you clean. It is different than foreign employers, for foreign employers, what you can do, they are like satisfied. But Turkish, it is different (Ms. H., 41 years old).

When you have day off, Turkish employers count your seconds. You only have one day off, sometimes it is Monday or whatever day they prefer. We are humans, we need to rest also. They don't give you Sunday. Why? Because the lady says, Sundays are family days, and you need to prepare their meals for that day. When Filipina has her day off on weekdays, nobody. No friends to talk to. When you are with diplomats, it is different. They respect you. If it is 8 hours in your contract, they do not ask you more. In Turkish, as long as their eyes are open you are working (Ms. E., 47 years old).

According to Filipina nannies, Turkish employers do not respect the employment contract, concerning working hours, leaves, and work definition. Nannies' comparison of Turkish and foreign employers also reveals that while non-Turkish employers approach the relationship professionally by acknowledging that in-house activities like cleaning and cooking are the expertise of the nannies, Turkish employers tend to keep Filipinos under surveillance during their working hours constantly giving orders on what do to and how to do it.

Moreover, the demanding and detail-oriented nature of Turkish employers eventually influences the psychological well-being of the nannies. With the high standard expectations of the employers, the Filipina nannies constantly face stress and also the unexpected working environment:

Before coming to Turkey, I had almost ten years of experience as a nanny. When I came here, my Turkish employer and also the grandmother behaved as if I don't know anything about taking care of children, cooking, or cleaning. The grandmother sets all the rules and watches me while I do my regular tasks. It is a bit annoying and tiring. Before Turkey, my employers knew that I am a professional, these tasks are my job and let me do them (Ms. K., 37 years old).

The response of Ms. K. clearly draws out the difference between the Turkish employers with the ones from other countries. Her answer also shows that

Turkish employers get the assistance of grandmothers to check whether the work is done properly. Grandmothers who do not acknowledge the fact that these nannies are professionals try to regulate and determine how the work should be done, leading to constant interaction with the nanny. The psychological consequences of the employer surveillance and high expectation can be an annoyance, exhaustion, and stress, all eventually leading to loss of performance or willingness to remain underemployment, similar to the mental conflicts the nannies can face during their employer-employee relationship.

Stating she faced abuse and maltreatment by her former employers in Hong Kong, Ms. N. who makes comparisons with Turkish and Chinese employers in the previous section also believes that Turks are demanding employers. Still, she stated that the positive and respectful attitude of the employers led her to ignore the high expectations and provide the best outcome that she can. Even though the daily chores within the household can be intense, detailed, and even complex, the family-like or respectful approach towards the nannies fuels them to complete the task at hand neatly as possible.

Migrants tend to compare employers if they have previous experience with different nationalities. The existing literature in Turkey about migrant domestic workers generally revolves around women coming from Post-Soviet countries. In these studies, Turkey is generally the first destination of migrant women for domestic work. So, they don't go much into detail and make comparisons like Filipinas. Therefore, it is better to check the migrant Filipina literature in Turkey that can provide alternative findings compared to the findings of this research. For example, Çeltikçi's study (2019) about Filipina migrant workers in Turkey shows that nannies generally criticize the Turkish employers about their discipline towards children and especially arguing that parents raise their children overly attached to themselves. According to nannies in her study, Turkish employers can't say 'no' to their children and this makes the children even more spoiled (Çeltikçi, 2019, p. 157). Nannies state that Turkish children listen to them in the absence of parents, but they cannot control them once father

or mother appears. On the other hand, together with foreign employers, nannies create a better authority over children as employers respect the discipline that nanny implements. Moreover, Filipina nannies argue that Turkish employers want their children to be fed or showered even if they arrive to the age, children can do it themselves. However, foreign employers want their children to learn the ability to eat even when they are one year old. So, these differences and the parental attitude of Turkish employers is criticized in the study.

This section provides a comparison between Turkish employers and employers from other countries, mainly from the eyes of the Filipinas. Additional sources from the existing literature were also added to bring a new perspective to the discussion. The notable difference between the Turkish and foreign employers is their emphasis on detail, high standard expectations, and tendency to interfere with the daily chores of the nannies. Unlike the employers from other countries, Turkish employers get involved and put the nannies under surveillance about what to do or not. Moreover, the findings of Çeltikçi's research show that Turkish employers also raise their children very sensitive, leading to children become spoiled. This attitude results with both the children and the parents get extra demanding towards the nanny, compared to employers from other countries. In this comparison, the most notable difference is that employment in a Turkish household is more challenging for a Filipina due to the overly demanding expectations and regular interference of the Turkish employers, as well as the spoiled and also demanding personality of their children, than being a nanny in other countries.

### **5.3.5. Boarding Houses and Day-Offs**

Boarding houses are apartments that Filipina nannies, commonly four to ten, rent to spend their weekly leaves all together (Akalın, 2014). Apart from being a hub for relaxation and socialization after an exhausting week of work, it also acts as a shelter for newcomer nannies to Turkey. Nannies in my study pointed out that they generally rent their houses in Gultepe in Istanbul, or Birlik in Ankara as the

other members of the community are highly populated in these areas and they are near the high-end neighborhood in which most of the employers live. When they are asked about, how they spend their day-offs, Filipina nannies give the following responses:

We sing, do karaoke, cook, eating together. We do not have families here, but we try to support each other. We are happy, we rest, we sleep 8 hours. That is enough rest for us. We are well when we go back because we are more energetic. That is not gossip but we share our opinions there, some of my friends making advice, simple advice also help us. (Ms. D., 43 years old)

We have one day. We dance, drink alcohol. Right now, it is Ramadan we do not drink that much but I will be honest with you. We drink, that is the only day for us to enjoy. We cook our own foods. We share what happened to us in that week, we support each other... Gossip... (Ms. C. 33 years old).

Eating, first thing. Sometimes drinking alcohol occasionally, party, like that. Karaoke. What else, the same (Ms. N., 31 years old).

Responses show that the boarding house is very essential for the Filipinas as it provides the opportunity for a much-needed break, as well as a free space for socialization. Their cultural activities such as dancing and karaoke serve as sources of motivation while mentally and physically preparing themselves for the week ahead, and also help them keep their sense of community alive, which they need to support each other. Turning her house to a shelter as a leader of the Filipino community, Ms. E. mentions she assists the Filipinos in Turkey who are in need by welcoming them to her house to stay rent-free:

We stay in my house with 7 other Filipinas. We have 3 floors in an apartment. My landlord is also our lawyer for association. I pay the rent for other Filipinas. My home is open to everyone. My landlord is married to a Filipina as well. (Ms. E., 47 years old).

Her rent is 2000TL which is around \$220 as of June 2021 while her monthly income is approximately \$1300. She sends half of her salary to the family in the Philippines, while trying to help the Filipinas in Turkey who are in need with the remaining amount.

Before the pandemic, nannies generally had their day-offs on Sundays together with other friends attending Sunday Mass and other community activities. However, the pandemic restricted the weekly leaves of nannies as most of the employers did not want the nannies to spend their off day in boarding houses, interacting with other people. Yet, five of the nannies stated that they still kept on paying the rent of the boarding houses, even without being able to go out. This implies that the nannies are hesitant about losing the possibility of going to the boarding houses regularly when the restrictions related to the pandemic or the employers ends. Even though it causes an additional cost, they keep paying it in order not to change their leisure time routines for the future, once again proving the actual value of the boarding houses for them. Other nannies who are allowed to spend their times going out in their day-offs, expressed that they tried to help their friends who lost their jobs during the pandemic by attending supporting activities of the Filipino Community:

We prepare some help packages, money or other needs when someone in need. So, it is a good relief that we have Filcom. If we lose our job during pandemic, we know that we are not alone. (Ms. D., 43 years old).

We help them goods, groceries and money sometimes. Thanks to Filcom if somebody leaves a job, they find another one easily. (Ms. O., 39 years old).

Even though the notion of a day-off for the nannies has been out of commission for some time due to the pandemic, it is still a bit of relief for nannies to get the support of the Filipino community during rough times. On a psychological point of view, the hub-like function of the boarding houses and the active support and network of Filcom reflect that the challenges faced by the nannies are not only about factors such as adapting to a new culture away from your homeland and family or problems with the employer or work conditions within a household. After all the sacrifices and expressed courage to pursue domestic work in other countries, these nannies are also under the threat of losing their job while the aftermath of unemployment shown with these answers from the interviews. The empathy of the Filipinas among their group and the efforts of the employed ones leads the leisure time activities to be more help oriented rather than pure

relaxation and going back to their natural selves. Even though there is no direct answer about the psychological impact about this orientation, it can be implied that the employed Filipinas manage to find an alternative recharging method as it is a relief to know that they have each other's backs during rough times. Still, under these conditions, boarding houses have turned into a place for the ones in need, pushing its role as a place of socialization and relaxation into a secondary position.

### **5.3.6. Work Satisfaction and Future Plans**

There are three dimensions of work satisfaction for domestic workers: the treatment by the employer, the salary, and the workload. As nannies who have had the experience of working in many other countries before coming to Turkey, thirteen of the participants in my study are content with the salary they receive and also their relationship with the employer. There are many issues and complaints that they have expressed throughout the research, but these thirteen participants imply that also with respect to their future plans, the balance between the salary, work expectations, and the treatment by the employer is manageable overall. Still, being one of the important dimensions of work satisfaction, the weekly workload and intense expectations of the employers can be problematic for the nannies, negatively influencing their overall satisfaction.

Before Turkey, I worked in Hong Kong for almost three years. My employers were nice to me, they were respecting my needs and expectations. However, in Turkey, I earn a lot more compared to Hong Kong. I work a lot harder too, but I am happy with my salary and satisfied with working in Turkey (Ms. D., 43 years old)

As a teaching graduate in the Philippines, I really enjoy spending time with babies and children, but I do not like household chores especially mopping and vacuuming. I just want to do my job and spend more time with the babies (Ms. O., 39 years old).

These responses show that there is a correlation between the education level and salary-oriented job satisfaction. While university graduate nannies prioritize job



roles when it comes to their satisfaction, high school graduates tend to consider their salary as the biggest driving force. Apart from these two answers, other nannies also make parallel comments regarding that the more educated a nanny is, the more likely her focus will be on job satisfaction and assigned tasks, other than salary. On the contrary, nannies with lower education levels mostly prioritize their salary rather than job satisfaction. When all these factors are considered, the future plans are aligned with the salary of the nannies. As salary is the key factor that ensures achieving the future goals while they are also sensitive about their daily conditions in terms of the tasks and satisfaction, mainly varying depending on the education level.

Ten Filipinas talked about that they have future plans regarding their occupational status and the country where they would like to live. The one with children generally have plans of saving up money and eventually going back to the homeland to reunite with their families:

If I have enough money, I will go back to my country. My children need me. (Ms. A., 40 years old)

Save money and have a business living in Philippines with my children (Ms. J., 48 years old).

Going to Philippines being with my family, having a different job. (Ms. K., 37 years old).

On the other hand, single nannies have other plans like visiting Europe, starting their own business, and/ or find jobs more suitable to their educational backgrounds:

My dream country is Germany. I would like to go there (Ms. O., 39 years old).

I want to stay here in Turkey for now. If I get the chance, I can go to Europe. (Ms. P., 39 years old).

I will open maybe a coffee shop something like Starbucks (Ms. N., 31 years old).

Yes, I do have. I am planning to take courses online, for like IELTS, TESOL so when I return, I can do online teaching (Ms. B. 33 years old)

Two nannies want to stay in Turkey and have a plan to bring their children over to help them get a good education. Six participants who do not have any plans for the future mostly point out that they do not know how long they will stay in Turkey, but they want to go back to their home country in the future.

It is seen that willingness of the nannies to shape up their future is complimentary with social standards, education, expectations, and passions. Even though they are not satisfied with the job title and its requirements, they still devote themselves as much as possible so that one day they hope to have the financial freedom to accomplish their future plans.

#### **5.4. Concluding Remarks on Employment of Filipina Nannies in Turkish Households**

In this chapter, I aimed to reflect on the interaction between Turkish employers and Filipina nannies in the household. The significant feature of this chapter is the wide focus on the topic as I address the household life starting from the selection process and motives, moving to the daily interactions and psychology behind each decision and their consequences on both employers and the Filipina nannies. The beginning of the chapter shows that Turkish employers are selective and have high standards while deciding to employ a nanny. The aforementioned motivations behind finding Filipinas suitable for them actually indicate that Turkish employers do not just want someone to assist themselves with the daily chores and taking care of their children. The findings also show that there are reasons beyond basic assistance which are both functional and symbolic. Functionally, Turkish employer's expectation is highly integrated. They expect the nannies to be like a mother to the children when needed, or a pre-school English teacher with their language capabilities. Symbolically, Turkish employers state that having a Filipina nanny reflects their higher-class status, leading them to consider the nannies as luxurious items, as well.

Turkish employers choose Filipinas from many nationalities for multiple reasons. Their integrated approach and expectations are attempts to justify the money's worth. Moreover, this justification is also supported by the class sensitivity of the Turkish employers as they find it necessary to position themselves to a higher class within the society by having a Filipina in their house, apart from all the previously mentioned benefits that come with the nanny. These findings reflect that it is no surprise Turkish employers have constant high expectations, also causing the nannies to get exhausted with the demands and work schedule, as it is a common tendency of Turkish employers to maximize their benefits as much as possible in these situations. Furthermore, the answers of the nannies about their awareness of being a high-value asset for the Turkish employers also indicate that the Filipinas actually know their worth. The perception of the Turkish employers towards the Filipinas mainly centered on their support for childcare as well as presenting a higher social status. The responses from both the employers and the nannies are important to explore as they provide the groundwork for the constant power struggle within the household during the employment of Filipinas.

I have analyzed here the strategies and practices deployed by the employers under the name of boundary work. The four subtype of employer boundary work is important because the concept enables this research to formulate the employer behavior in the household towards the nannies based on certain criteria such as class, ethnicity and family inclusion. This categorization and the related observations are important as they focus on the process of building the relationship in the household in a more detailed way than the existing literature. The findings show that even the employers of the maternalist type which show the most sincere and intimate relationship with the Filipinas, actually still consider their own benefits as a priority. The responses of the employers reveal that family-like relationship with the nannies are mostly to ensure high quality of the work, safe care for their children or satisfy their egos by being a moral guardian to the Filipinas. Moreover, while accepting the nannies for the reasons above as one of the family is possible, strategies deployed by the employers

constantly change during the relationship within the household. This is mostly because of pragmatic necessities rather than pure sincerity.

The findings about the employer's boundary work are important as they provide valuable information about the employer side of the power struggle between the Turkish employers and the nannies. Moreover, under the name of purchasing deference, the employers try to cement their authority by setting the rules and regulations. The labor control attempts of the employer play a key role in this research as these are the visible examples of the employer's exerted pressure in the power struggle. Hence, the applied power results in various effects over the Filipina nannies. Some nannies find it common and acceptable to have rules decided by the employers while some others face troubles adapting to the high expectations and masking their true identity and desires due to the pressure coming from the employers.

Focusing on the Filipina nannies' side of the relationship, I tried to shed light on their opinions and feelings about working in Turkey. The details of the Filipina experiences show that the nannies are not simply people to be suppressed by the power of the employers in the power struggle between the two sides. Even though they are vulnerable due to their position as an employee, the nannies actually have many coping mechanisms and perform identity management to soften the pressure and also to protect their mental health. Their continuous attempts to embrace an off-stage identity when possible and other coping mechanisms show that, similar to the employers, Filipinas are also sensitive about class and their positioning. Having a different life in Turkey as compared to the Philippines, with many restrictions from an employer apparently becomes exhausting for the nannies, especially considering some of these women are highly educated. Therefore, the social change while switching countries certainly adds additional exhaustion and problems of adaptation over the nannies who try to preserve their actual identity during leisure times or in boarding houses where they have a strong network of nannies who try to help and support each other.

The coping mechanisms, the power relationship between the employers and the nannies, and different class sensitivities of both sides, cause nannies to use several tactics behind a hidden transcript, as a necessary counteraction to the strategies of the employers. The clash between tactics and strategies show that power relationship is not one sided. Filipinas are actually very aware of their limited strengths and advantages in the employment relationship as they know that apart from their detail-oriented and controlling personalities, Turkish employers are also very sensitive towards their children. This soft spot of the employers guide nannies about ways to ease the pressure on them, such as forming a strong relationship with the children based on the expectations of the employers. Moreover, some employers fear that harsh treatment of the nanny can potentially give harm to the household, or even to their children, which makes them hesitate while making excessive demands. The nannies also use several other tactics mainly by lying just to reduce their workload. They also use some relief methods in their breaks or leisure time to recharge. The answers from both sides and related observation show that the employer-employee relationship is not a simple one. There is a two-way power relationship which changes continuously based on the advantages of the sides having several class sensitivities.

The interviews also provide data about the psychology of the Filipinas, who feel alone and helpless most of the time, especially due to abuse in the workplace. A certain amount of tension and pressure from an employer is expected in any occupation, but in the case of the Filipina nannies, the pressure and expression of power can reach unacceptable heights. It can be verbal, physical, and sexual or by actions such as taking the passport of the nanny. The responses from the nannies show how cruel that the employers can get through dehumanizing actions towards the nannies. Even when the nannies do not want to continue working in a household because of the abuse and constant surveillance, most of them are hesitant about running away. The section analyzing the mental health of the nannies also show that beyond all these problems the nannies encounter, there is also an obvious miscommunication between the employers and the

nannies. Employers have certain attitudes towards the nanny, which can cause exhaustion and even reach unacceptable heights in the form of abuse. Still, the nannies cannot express themselves openly due to the characteristics of the relationship and the established class consciousness between the two sides. They only attempt to protect themselves as much as they can by using relief methods, coping mechanisms, off-stage identity and tactics, they face the threat of being unheard, when it comes to their actual thoughts.

By comparing Turkish employers with employers from other nations, this research provides an analysis in order to make the traits of Turkish employers more visible. The Filipinas' knowledge about employers from many countries show that there are several traits specific for the Turkish employers such as being over demanding, interfering the work of the nanny or having spoiled children as a result of being too sensitive towards them. This section is important because the comparison of the Turkish employers with others actually highlights the reasons behind all the previously mentioned problems the nannies face in Turkey. In other words, the traits of the Turkish employers have psychological consequences over the Filipinas. Even against all these problems, the interviews with the Filipina nannies show that they have to keep working in Turkey to achieve their future plans as they try their best to protect their mental and physical health. They believe that with a bearable balance between satisfactory salary and work conditions, things should be manageable. The nannies put up with all the difficulties because they have goals. They have motivations behind being a nanny, which is mainly, providing a better future for their family. Their expectation about the future obviously adds more meaning to the sacrifices they make, reflecting that in most cases, they are inside a serious trade-off. They are forced to give away their dignity and true identity, hoping that in return, they will get the future they dream of.

## **CHAPTER 6**

### **CONCLUSION**

The number of migrant Filipina nannies in Turkey is on the rise. In this research, I have examined the migrant Filipina nannies' working conditions and experiences with Turkish employers. I did not only aim to reflect the exploitative features of the profession and harsh conditions under which they work but I also investigated tactics and coping mechanisms of migrant women to empower themselves against the employers. To uncover this employment relationship, I conducted interviews with both the employers and the nannies. In the light of interviews, it is revealed that the relationship between the two sides is actually more complex than it might initially appear, mainly because of the existence of different employer types and various tactics the nannies use in the face of difficulties. Although changes in the employers' attitude according to different expectations shape up the dynamics of the whole relationship, migrant Filipinas also set their own boundaries, use coping mechanisms and apply tactics to achieve their long-term plans, which require keeping their jobs in Turkey.

The point made in literature on the relationship between capital and labor has been the free movement of capital and the locality of labor. In today's conditions, where capital is rapidly globalizing, but labor mobility is limited, labor costs have become a very important factor in terms of attracting capital to a certain place. As a result of these processes, we see that there has been a shift towards cheap labor force. The shift of production to countries with cheap labor has been experienced with subcontracting and informalization in production processes. This flexibility and informalization in global production have made women who already work as docile and cheap labor force an important part of migrant workforce. Especially, the demand towards domestic and care workers increased

the feminization of migration as more and more women are joining the global labor migration mainly in the service sector.

Intersectionality of being woman, migrant, and domestic worker has long been discussed. That is because the invisible and private environment of domestic work makes migrant domestic workers, who are already docile and obedient, more vulnerable and easier to exploit. Since the domestic work itself is also undervalued, migrant domestic workers are marginalized and sometimes discriminated by their employers. Therefore, it is important to understand their experiences and shed light on working conditions in the houses of global employers.

It is known for a long time that Turkey has been the subject of female labor migration. However, it is not known how much more Filipina are involved in this and how high the demand is in the Turkish market. As discussed in the studies from different contexts, hiring a Filipina nanny is a trend aroused after the dissolution of the USSR and globalization of migrant women work. The demand for somebody who can perform both daily chores and care services for children increased the number of Filipina workers, resulting in an expansion of the sector. Besides, mothers who started to participate in the labor force in the developing and developed countries significantly influenced the growth of Filipina demand. When it comes to the supply side, unemployment and foreign debts in the Philippines are sought to be solved by the promotion of labor export. While sustaining remittance income for the economy of the country, the Philippines has become the leading exporter of government-sponsored short-term contracts. Accordingly, Filipinas have started to be known as ideal nannies and domestic workers in the globalized world, thanks to their government's educational reforms. Since English is used as the medium of instruction, the country has raised an educated labor force and it preconditioned high school graduates to migrate abroad. So, Filipinas' competent education and English skills enhanced their popularity worldwide, particularly in the Middle East and



Gulf countries where the privilege of speaking English has been widely acknowledged.

Filipina nannies' arrival to Turkey is closely linked with the migration patterns in the country. Because neither Philippines is geographically close to Turkey nor do these countries have a bilateral labor agreement. Since migrants from the former Soviet Bloc countries fill the gap of live-in domestic work for sick and elderly care, the demand of Turkish employers to Filipina nannies has arisen from the gap in the educated and qualified labor force specialized in childcare. It should be noted that this demand towards Filipinas has never resulted in as many migrants as migrating from Post-Soviet countries. Their number in Turkey has increased slowly because they become appealing to the families only who can afford the high cost of this service. So, Filipina nannies are scarce, which makes the Turkish families with Filipina nannies also consider the symbolic value that Filipinas carry.

The current literature on migrant domestic labor market in Turkey highlights the importance of bad working conditions, long working hours, malnutrition, maltreatment, physical and mental brutality, low wages, passport deprivation, non-payment of salary to live-in migrant women workers. All these studies analyze the migrant workers' working conditions in detail. However, they do not give much detail on the employers' hiring experience or relationship with the worker. Moreover, most of these studies are about migrants coming to Turkey from Post-Soviet countries. The studies who give us details about Filipina nannies all focus on the general experience but there is a gap in literature about their working relationship with Turkish employers. For example, these studies do not give much detail on how and why Filipinas come to Turkey or why Turkish employers especially prefer a Filipina. Therefore, I aimed to make a contribution towards filling the gap in the literature by conducting in-depth interviews with both Filipina nannies and Turkish employers to go into the details of this employment relationship.

My work experience in the Embassy of the Philippines also played an important role in structuring the methodology of this research. The opportunity to observe the culture of the Philippines thanks to my daily interaction in the embassy gave me a much deeper knowledge about their way of life. Therefore, instead of being an inexperienced researcher who is trying to collect data and make research about Filipina domestic workers, I was in an advantageous position about how to break the ice and make them feel comfortable while listening to their experiences as domestic workers in Turkey. Another advantage of mine was the fact that I knew some FilCom leaders who could help me with their networks about who to contact. Given my main purpose of ‘exploration’ as a basic motive behind ethnographic research, I have decided to conduct in-depth interviews with the Filipina nannies in order to explore more about their employment in Turkey. Even though I was in contact with the FilCom leaders, I have also used snowball sampling as an important method of increasing the number of relevant participants for the interviews. The nannies were very helpful in this regard as they suggested some of their friends also working as nannies in Turkey, further proving that I had their trust during the interviews. As for employers, I used my own personal network, and again these employers mentioned my study to their friends who also hired Filipina nannies. So, snowball sampling helped me a lot in the process.

I believe choosing in-depth interviews as the research method was also complimentary with the qualitative nature of the research question and the topic. Furthermore, the chat-like nature of the interview questions and open-ended answers, coupled with my prior knowledge about the topic, created a more organic environment for detailed answers from both nannies and employers. Being able to conduct interviews with nannies with various backgrounds of employment, education and from different age groups, as well as interviewing employers belonging to different demographic groups were factors that are consistent with the purpose of this research. The data collected from the interviews were aligned with the qualitative nature of my research topic,

enabling me to come up with accurate interpretations by analyzing the rich and versatile data that I have obtained.

In Chapter 4, I have explored the migration experience of the nannies with the help of the interviews, revealing key findings related to the process of migration, touching mainly on the driving forces behind nannies' leaving their home country, the process of choosing a destination point, and the route of their journey. The chapter also discovers the contractual specifications of the jobs they took and their casual working conditions during their employment in Turkey.

The findings from the interviews show that deciding to leave the home country is no easy task for the nannies, also a decision that is not being given randomly. Economic reasons, family problems, and desire to explore new places are the driving forces behind this migration decision. Turkey appears as an attractive destination for the nannies mainly because of the higher salaries, as well as being a potential bridge for those who pursue employment in Europe. Moreover, agencies play a coordinating role in forming the employment relationship between the nannies and the Turkish employers, easing the potential complexities of the contractual and legal procedures.

This chapter has also revealed that regardless of the contract being written or oral, Turkish employers do not strictly follow the job description. My participants stated that they were hired as nannies but most of them perform daily chores such as ironing, vacuuming, washing the dishes, or tidy up the house. Besides, apart from the contractual business relationship, a verbal contract is common in organizing the employer-employee relationship. Based on this verbal contract, the employers can demand too much work from the nannies, even extending the job description and working hours. This type of employment totally depends on the mutual trust of employer and employee, but it is too risky for the nannies who work without an insurance and security because they become open to any kind of exploitation.

The interviews also provide valuable data about the variety of conditions the nannies work under, in terms of their salary, allowance, and day-offs. These conditions, and existing limitations related to pandemic, can result in problems for the nannies such as being prone to health problems due to not having health insurance or negative psychological outcomes of being locked in the house working without a day off. Even though the pandemic has not really changed the already busy work schedule of the nannies, it has often prevented them from having day away from the household to relax and recharge for the upcoming working week.

In Chapter 5, I have mainly focused on the relationship between the Filipina nannies and Turkish employers in the household. In order to provide a systematic analysis, I have shared the responses from the interviews with the two groups as the main material for this chapter's discussion. The first part of the chapter is about the selection process of a nanny in Turkey and the primary traits that the Turkish employers are looking for in a Filipina nanny. The high standards of the employers take the expected role of the nannies within the household beyond simple assistance, to a point in which they can act as a full-time mother substitute, or an English teacher to their children, depending on the situation. Moreover, Turkish employers also perceive the nannies as a symbol reflecting a higher-class status.

Apart from the functional and symbolic benefits that come with a Filipina, Turkish employers are also very sensitive about getting their money's worth. They try to achieve this by loading up the daily schedule of the nannies with tasks, always expecting to receive quality service in return. The responses from the nannies show that these continuous demanding attitudes of Turkish employers can sometimes be exhausting for them, both physically and mentally. Moreover, the nannies they are very aware of their worth for the Turkish employers, in terms of their capabilities as nannies, as well as their symbolic worth for the Turkish employers belonging to the high class of the society.

The responses of both the employers and Filipina nannies also reveal that there is an ongoing power struggle within the household, shaped by various factors. The four subtypes of the process called 'boundary work' provide a systematic way to formulate the possible strategies that an employer can embrace towards nannies. The key details observed from the responses of the employers reveal behaviors related to class, ethnicity, and family-based factors influencing their attitudes towards nannies.

Even when some level of sincerity is present in the relationship between the nannies and Turkish employers, the responses also show that having a family-like relationship with the nannies is also a strategy itself, mainly to ensure the high quality of work and childcare. Moreover, in order to maintain their dominant positioning within the power relationship, employers set certain rules and regulations within the household, in the form of purchasing deference. The in-depth interviews with the nannies and employers contain many examples of employer pressure over the nannies, with varying consequences. Some nannies find it bearable and acceptable in their employment relationship, while in some cases, the pressure causes negative physical and psychological effects on the nannies.

Chapter 5 has also discussed the responses of the Filipina nannies, to reveal, from their side, their experiences in Turkey as domestic workers. The responses show that employment in Turkey is not a simple process for them. Due to the pressure of the employers, they have adapted certain coping mechanisms, also managing different identity issues depending on the circumstances to ease the pressure, as much as possible. One of the important examples of these mechanisms is the way switch between off-stage and on-stage identities from their day-offs to the working days. Having two identities for these occasions shows that Turkish employers do not leave much room for the nannies to express themselves as they wish while working. It also reveals that it is important to the nannies express who they feel they are as much as possible. However, these processes bring additional problems to the nannies as it is not easy to adapt from one identity to

another easily, especially considering that they are going through these changes on a weekly basis.

As a counter to the strategies of the employers, nannies use certain tactics which show that the power relationship between the two groups is not one-sided and the nannies can also utilize certain methods to their own advantage. The responses from the interviews provide various examples such as, Turkish employers' having a soft spot for being very sensitive towards their children, sometimes making them to be hesitant about giving excessive workload to the nannies in order to maintain the quality of childcare.

The relationship between the employers and the nannies inevitably has psychological impacts on the nannies. Especially due to the endless power struggle, the nannies can sometimes feel helpless. The abuse in the workplace, excessive demands, violating privacy, or appropriating the passport of the nanny are some examples of how the Turkish employers use their power any consideration for the psychology of the nannies. In such cases, Filipina nannies use certain relief methods as part of their coping mechanisms.

I also compare Turkish employers with the employers from other countries to further understand the employment experiences of the nannies in Turkey. The findings show that Turkish employers are more likely to be highly demanding and interfering with the daily tasks of the nannies as compared to their counterparts in other countries.

Finally, chapter 5 also covered the long-term plans and expectations of the nannies. Most of them see employment in Turkey as having a reasonable and bearable balance between satisfactory salaries and demanding work conditions. Their motivation for their future also acts as a driving force during rough situations, hoping that their sacrifices pay off positively for themselves and also for their family waiting in the Philippines.

Migrant Filipina nannies and Turkish employers who participated in this study have no connection. It would have been very informative if I could talk to the nannies as the employers who I interviewed with. It could be illuminating if I had the chance to get the opinions of both parties living under the same roof. However, neither employers nor nannies participating in my study wanted their own employer or nanny to be a participant as well. Employers were worried about the confidentiality of the information that they were giving to me because they were sharing their private life. Also, they were concerned that their nannies might contradict what they previously said. On the other hand, some nannies requested me not to share the identity of the employer and I promised all of them that all the data would be kept confidential. It is an ethical decision whether to interview employers and employees living under the same roof as it has disadvantages as much as advantages. I might not have honest opinions and experiences if I preconditioned nannies to include their employers in the study. Hence, I ended up with the current design of the study.

Further study on migrant Filipina nannies and Turkish employers would be fruitful if it focused on integrating the methods of qualitative research even further. This study analyzed data based on in-depth interviews conducted by phone or video calls. More detailed case studies can be used, in order to fully turn this research into a field work. In this way, relationship between the nannies and the employers can be observed in their natural setting. Moreover, the sample size of both the employers and nannies can be increased by using several sampling methods, similar to snowball sampling used in this research for both sample groups. Apart from having larger samples, the purpose of the qualitative research can be more concentrated on certain topics, such as the migrant domestic work and employment relationship in the world of COVID and the recent economic crisis. Designing the methodology based on these issues and asking questions to both of the groups accordingly can provide more rich and diverse data to analyze.

## REFERENCES

- Alburo, F. A., & Abella, D. I. (2002). *Skilled Labour Migration from Developing Countries: Study on the Philippines*. Geneva: ILO.  
[https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/labour-migration/publications/WCMS\\_201780/lang--en/index.htm](https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/labour-migration/publications/WCMS_201780/lang--en/index.htm)
- Akalın, A. (2007). Hired as a Caregiver, Demanded as a Housewife Becoming a Migrant Domestic Worker in Turkey. *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 14(3). 209-225
- Akalın, A. (2010). Yukarıdakiler-Aşağıdakiler: İstanbul'daki Güvenlikli Sitelerde Göçmen Ev Hizmetlisi İstihdamı. *Türkiye'ye Uluslararası Göç, Kitap Yayınevi, İstanbul*.
- Akalın, A. (2014). Mapping the Migrant Domestic Workers Market in Turkey: The Filipina Community. *Waves of Diversity: Socio-Political Implications of International Migration in Turkey*
- Akalın, A. (2014). We are the Legionaries!: Filipina Domestic Workers in İstanbul, in *Whose City is That? Culture, Design, Spectacle and Capital in İstanbul*, eds D. Ö. Koçak and O. K. Koçak. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Akalın, A. (2016). The Lie Which Is Not One: Biopolitics in the Migrant Domestic Workers' Market in Turkey. In *the Post-Fordist Sexual Contract* (pp. 195-211). Palgrave Macmillan, London.
- Akalın, A. E. (2014). *Türkiye'de Ev Hizmetlerinde Çalışan Göçmen Kadınların Toplumsal ve İktisadi Varoluş Stratejileri Üzerine Sosyolojik Bir Analiz* (Doktora Tezi). Hacettepe Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Ankara.
- Anderson, B. (2000). *Doing the Dirty Work? The Global Politics of Domestic Labor*. Palgrave Macmillan.



- Anderson, B. (2007). A Very Private Business: Exploring the Demand for Migrant Domestic Workers. *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 14(3), 247–264. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1350506807079013>
- Anderson, E. (1990). Is Women's Labor a Commodity? *Philosophy & Public Affairs*, 19(1), 71-92. Retrieved March 7, 2021, from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2265363>
- Arat-Koc., Sedef (1990) 'Importing Housewives: Non-Citizen Domestic Workers and the Crisis of the Domestic Sphere in Canada', pp. 81–103 in Meg Luxton, Harriet Rosenberg and Sedef Arat-Koc (eds) *Through the Kitchen Window: The Politics of Home and Family*. Toronto: Garamond Press.
- Arnado, J. M. (2010). Performances Across Time and Space: Drama in the Global Households of Filipina Transmigrant Workers. *International Migration*, 48(6), 132-154.
- Asanbekova, S. (2020). *Emotional Labor in Household Care Services: The Case of Kyrgyz Migrant Women Workers in Ankara*. (Master's Thesis)
- Asis, M. M. B., Huang, S., & Yeoh, B. S. (2004). When the Light of the Home is Abroad: Unskilled Female Migration and the Filipino Family. *Singapore Journal of Tropical Geography*, 25(2), 198-215.
- Asis, M. M. (2006). The Philippines' Culture of Migration. *Migration information source*.
- Asis, M. M. (2017). The Philippines: Beyond Labor Migration, Toward Development and (Possibly) Return. *Migration Information Source*, 12.
- Atatimur, N. (2008). *Reasons and Consequences of International Labor Migration of Women into Turkey*. (Master's Thesis).
- Avci, S. G. (2019). *Domestic Workers and Poverty: A Comparative Approach on Turkish and Migrant Women*. (Master's Thesis).

- Ayaydin, D. B. (2020). Found a Nanny and Lived Happily Ever After: The Representations of Filipino Nannies on Human Resources Agency Websites in Turkey. *Migration at Work*, 171.
- Battistella, G., & Liao, K. A. S. (2013). *Youth Migration from the Philippines: Brain Drain and Brain Waste*. UNICEF Philippines.
- Beechey, V. (1977). Some Notes on Female Wage Labor in Capitalist Production. *Capital & Class*, 1(3), 45-66.
- Bello, W. (1999). *Is the Structural Adjustment Approach Really and Truly Dead?* Transnational Institute. <https://www.tni.org/en/article/is-the-structural-adjustment-approach-really-and-trully-dead>
- Bolante, M. (2014). Master and Servant: Contradictory Roles of Migrant Filipina Domestic Workers. *Asia-Pacific Social Science Review*, 14(2), 162-167.
- Bora, A. (2005). *Kadınların Sınıfı*. İletişim Yayınları.
- Bourdieu, P. (1977). *Outline of a Theory of Practice*. Cambridge, Mass.: Cambridge University Press.
- Bourdieu, P. (1986). *The Forms of Capital*. (pp. 78-92). Routledge.
- Bourdieu, P. (1991). *The Love of Art: European Art Museums and Their Public*, translated by C. Beattie and N. Merriman, Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Bourdieu, P. (2015). *Ayırım: Beğeni Yargısının Toplumsal Eleştirisi*, translated by D. Fırat and G. Berkkut, Ankara: Heretik.
- Bruegel, I. (1979). Women as a Reserve Army of Labor: A Note on Recent British Experience. *Feminist Review*, 3(1), 12-23.
- Chang, G. (2000). *Disposable Domestics: Immigrant Women Workers in the Global Economy*. Massachusetts: South End Press.

- Chilton, A., & Woda, B. (2021). The Effects of Bilateral Labor Agreements: Evidence from the Philippines. *Available at SSRN*.
- Chung, R. Y. N., & Mak, J. K. L. (2020). Physical and Mental Health of Live-In Female Migrant Domestic Workers: A Randomly Sampled Survey in Hong Kong. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 64(6), 802–822. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0002764220910215>
- Cock, Jacklyn. 1980. *Maids and Madams: A Study in the Politics of Exploitation*. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.
- Colen, S. (1995). Like a Mother to Them?: Stratified Reproduction and West Indian Childcare Workers and Employers in New York. In *Conceiving the New World Order: The Global Politics of Reproduction* (pp. 78–102). Berkeley.
- Constable, N. (2007). *Filipina Workers in Hong Kong Homes: household rules and relations*. Metropolitan Books.
- Cooper, A. (2011). *Disempowered “Heroes”:* Political Agency of Foreign Domestic Workers in East and Southeast Asia. E-International Relations. <https://www.e-ir.info/2011/07/06/disempowered-%E2%80%9Cheroes%E2%80%9D-political-agency-of-foreign-domestic-workers-in-east-and-southeast-asia/>
- Coskun, E. (2016). Gender Factor in Turkey’s Migration Regime: A Case of Ugandan Migrant Women. *Fe Dergi* 8, 91-104.
- Coulson, M., Magas, B., & Wainwright, H. (1975). The Housewife and Her Labour Under Capitalism: A Critique. *New Left Review*, 89 (1), 59-71.
- Cox, R. (2010). Some Problems and Possibilities of Caring. *Ethics, Place and Environment*, 13(2), 113-130.
- Çelik, N. (2005). *Immigrant Domestic Women Workers in Ankara and İstanbul*. (Master's thesis).

- Çeltikçi, M. (2019). *Global 'Little Brown' Women Labor: Filipina Workers in Turkey* (Master's Thesis).
- Dağdelen, G. (2008). *Changing Labour Market Positions and Workplace Interactions of Irregular Moldovan Migrants* (Master's thesis).
- Dalla Costa (1975). *The Power of Women and the Subversion of the Community* (p. 11). Bristol: Falling Wall Press.
- Daragahi, B., & Trew, B. (2020). Coronavirus Trapping Domestic Workers in Virtual 'Slavery'. *The Independent*, Independent Digital News and Media, [www.independent.co.uk/news/world/middle-east/coronavirus-turkey-migrant-workers-lebanon-human-rights-a9489616.html](http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/middle-east/coronavirus-turkey-migrant-workers-lebanon-human-rights-a9489616.html).
- de Certeau, M. (1984). *The Practice of Everyday Life*. Trans. Steven Rendall. Berkeley, California: University of California Press.
- Deniz, A. (2018). Filipina Nanny Migration to Turkey: Understanding the Role of Intermediary Agencies. *Coğrafi Bilimler Dergisi* 16(2), 289- 301.
- Dinçer, C. G. (2014). *In Between Countries: Experiences of Women Migrant Domestic Workers from Georgia in Turkey* (Master's Thesis).
- Doğan, S. (2012). *Symbolic Boundaries, Imagined Hierarchies: A Case Sstudy of Women from Post-Socialist Countries Working as Domestic Workers in Istanbul* (Master's Thesis).
- Dolaman, W. (2010). *Migrant Labor & The Moral Imperative: Filipino Workers in Qatar and the United Arab Emirates in the 21st century* (Doctoral dissertation, Georgetown University).
- Ecevit, Y. (2011). "Toplumsal Cinsiyet Sosyolojisine Başlangıç", *Toplumsal Cinsiyet Sosyolojisi*, Ed.: Yıldız Ecevit & Nadide Karkıner, Eskişehir: Anadolu Üniversitesi Yayınları.
- Ecevit, Y. (2007). Poverty Against Feminist Strategy. *Amargi*. s. 6: 14-17.

- Ege, G. (2002). *Foreign Domestic Workers in Turkey: A New Form of Trafficking in Turkey?* (Unpublished Master's Thesis, Ankara).
- Ehrenreich, B., Hochschild, A. R., & Kay, S. (Eds.). (2003). *Global Woman: Nannies, Maids, and Sex Workers in the New Economy*. Macmillan.
- Ekin, N. (2001). Türkiye'de İş Piyasasının Yeniden Yapılanması: Özel İstihdam Büroları. *İstanbul Ticaret Odası, Yayın, 30*.
- Erdem, Z., & Şahin, L. (2009). Ülkemizde Ev Hizmetlerinde İstihdam Edilen Yabancı Uyruklu İşgücünün Çalışma Koşulları: İstanbul İli Üzerine Bir Alan Araştırması. In *Journal of Social Policy Conferences* (No. 57, pp. 281-325).
- Erdoğan, S., & Toksöz, G. (2013). *The Visible Face of Women's Invisible Labor: Domestic Workers in Turkey*.
- Estévez-Abe, M., & Hobson, B. (2015). Outsourcing Domestic (Care) Work: The Politics, Policies, and Political Economy. *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State & Society*, 22(2), 133-146.
- Etiler, N., & Lordoglu, K. (2012). Health Issues of Immigrant Women: A Qualitative Study of Domestic Services in Turkey. *SEER: Journal for Labor and Social Affairs in Eastern Europe*, 109-121. Extent of Legal Protection, ILO Office, Geneva.
- Fedyuk, O., & Zentai, V. (2018). The Interview in Migration Studies: A Step Towards A Dialogue and Knowledge Co-production? In *Qualitative Research in European Migration Studies* (pp. 171-188). Springer, Cham.
- Foucault, M. (1979). *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. New York: Vintage Books. French edition 1975.
- Güneş, F. (2015). Toplumsal Yeniden Üretim ve Karşılığı Ödenmeyen Emek. *TTB Mesleki Sağlık ve Güvenlik Dergisi*, 15(57), 2-9.
- Friedan, B. (1963). *The Feminist Mystique*. London: Penguin.

- Gardiner, J. (2000). Domestic Labor Revisited: A Feminist Critique of Marxist Economics. *Inside the Household from Labor to Care*, London: Macmillan.
- Giles, W., Preston, V., & Romero, M. (Eds.). (2014). *When care work goes global: Locating the social relations of domestic work*. Ashgate Publishing, Ltd.
- Glenn, E. N. (1992). From Servitude to Service Work: Historical Continuities in the Racial Division of Paid Reproductive Labor. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 18(1), 1-43.
- Glenn, E. N. (1986). *Issei, Nisei, Warbride*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Goffman, E. (1956). The Nature of Deference and Demeanor. *American Anthropologist*, 58 (3), 473-502.
- Gothoskar, S. (2013). The plight of domestic workers: Confluence of gender, class and caste hierarchies. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 63-75.
- Guevarra A. R. (2009). *Marketing Dreams, Manufacturing Heroes: The Transnational Labor Brokering of Filipino Workers*. Rutgers University Press.
- Guevarra, A. R. (2014). Supermaids: The Racial Branding of Global Filipino Care Labour. *Migration and Care Labour*, 130–150.  
[https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137319708\\_8](https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137319708_8)
- Gülçür, L., İlkaracan, P. (2002): The ‘Natasha’ Experience: Migrant Sex Workers from the Former Soviet Union and Eastern Europe in Turkey, *Women’s Studies International Forum* 25.
- Güler, C., & Benli, G. (2020). Ev İşçileri Dayanışma Sendikası Şiddet ve Korona Dönemi Çalışma İlişkileri Raporu: *Toz Bezi Değiliz Ev İşçisiyiz*.

- Güler, C., & Benli, G. (2021). *Toz Bezi Değiliz Ev İşçisiyiz: Küresel Salgın Döneminde Çalışma Hakkı ve Diğer İnsan Hakları İhlalleri Bağlamında Ev İşçilerinin Karşılaştıkları Sorunlar Raporu*.
- Hakim, C. (1994). A Century of Change in Occupational Segregation 1891–1991. *Journal of Historical Sociology*, 7(4), 435-454.
- Hochschild, A. (1989). *The Second Shift*. Viking Adult; First Printing edition.
- Hochschild, A., R., (2003), *The Managed Heart Commercialization of Human Feeling*, University of California Press Berkeley and Los Angeles, California.
- Hofmann, E. T., & Buckley, C. J. (2013). Global Changes and Gendered Responses: The Feminization of Migration from Georgia. *International Migration Review*, 47(3), 508–538. <https://doi.org/10.1111/imre.12035>
- Hondagneu-Sotelo, P. (1999). Introduction. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 42(4), 565–576. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00027649921954363>
- Hondagneu-Sotelo, P. (2007). *Doméstica: Immigrant Workers Cleaning and Caring in the Shadows of Affluence, with a New Preface*. Univ of California Press.
- Hondagneu-Sotelo, P., and E. Avila 1997. I'm Here, But I'm There: The Meanings of Latina Transnational Motherhood. *Gender & Society*, 11(5):548–571.
- ILO . (2011). Domestic Workers Convention (no. 189). [https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100\\_ILO\\_CODE:C189](https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100_ILO_CODE:C189)
- ILO. (2013b). *Domestic Workers Across the World: Global and Regional Statistics and The Extent of Legal Protection*. [https://www.ilo.org/travail/Whatsnew/WCMS\\_173363/lang--en/index.htm](https://www.ilo.org/travail/Whatsnew/WCMS_173363/lang--en/index.htm).

- ILO. (2020). Impact of the COVID-19 Crisis on Loss of Jobs and Hours ...  
retrieved from [https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_protect/---protrav/---travail/documents/publication/wcms\\_747961.pdf](https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_protect/---protrav/---travail/documents/publication/wcms_747961.pdf)
- I.O.M. (2019). *International Migration Law N°34 - Glossary on Migration / IOM Publications Platform. IOM.*  
<https://publications.iom.int/books/international-migration-law-ndeg34-glossary-migration>.
- Jenkins, R. (2002). *Pierre Bourdieu*. Routledge.
- Kalaycıoğlu, S., & Rittersberger-Tılıç, H. (2001). Evlerimizdeki Gündelikçi Kadınlar (Daily Cleaners in Our Houses). *İstanbul: Su Yayınları*.
- Kaşka, S. (2006). *The New International Migration and Migrant Women in Turkey: The Case of Moldovan Domestic Workers* (Mirekoç Research Projects), İstanbul. Retrieved on 29.08.2021 from:  
[http://portal.ku.edu.tr/~mirekoc/reports/2005\\_2006\\_selmin\\_kaska.pdf](http://portal.ku.edu.tr/~mirekoc/reports/2005_2006_selmin_kaska.pdf)
- Kau, A. K., & Yang, C. (1991). *Values and Lifestyles of Singaporeans*. Singapore: National University of Singapore.
- Kawewe, S. M., & Dibie, R. (2000). The Impact of Economic Structural Adjustment Programs [ESAPs] on Women and Children: Implications for Social Welfare in Zimbabwe. *J. Soc. & Soc. Welfare*, 27, 79.
- Kefferstan, S. (2017). *The Perfect Storm: Lasting Impacts of Structural Adjustment Programs and Pressures of Climate Change in Latin America and Ghana, Africa*.
- Kennelly, E. M. (2008). *Culture of Indifference: Dilemmas of the Filipina Domestic Helpers in Hong Kong* (Doctoral Dissertation, University of St Andrews).
- Keough, L. J. (2006). Globalizing'Postsocialism:'Mobile Mothers and Neoliberalism on the Margins of Europe. *Anthropological Quarterly*, 431-461.



- Koşar, A. (2018). Marx'ta Maddi Olmayan Emek Kavramının Bağlamı. *Koşar, A.(der.) Maddi Olmayan Emek Teorisi içinde, İstanbul: Kor Kitap, 97-113.*
- Koyuncu, Ç. (2018). *Evdeki Yabancı: Ankara'daki Gürcü Bakıcı Kadınların Gündelik Hayat Mücadeleleri ve Taktikleri.* (Master's Thesis).
- Kümbetoğlu, B. (2005): Enformelleşme Süreçlerinde Genç Göçmen Kadınlar ve Dayanışma Ağları, *Folklor/Edebiyat 41*, pp. 7–25.
- Kumral E. 2007. Filipinliyim, Göçmenim, Çalışkanım: Filipinlerden Beşiktaş'a 'Göçmen Hikayeler'. İstanbul. 61. *İstanbul: Tarih Vakfı Yayınları*
- Lamont, M., & Lareau, A. (1988). Cultural Capital: Allusions, Gaps and Glissandos in Recent Theoretical Developments. *Sociological Theory*, 153-168.
- Lan, P. C. (2000). *Global Divisions, Local Identities: Filipina Migrant Domestic workers and Taiwanese employers.* (Doctoral dissertation, Northwestern University).
- Lan, P. C. (2003). Maid or Madam? Filipina Migrant Workers and the Continuity of Domestic Labor. *Gender & Society*, 17(2), 187-208.
- Lan, P. C. (2006). *Global Cinderellas: Migrant Domestic and Newly Rich Employers in Taiwan.* Duke University Press.
- Liao, T. F., & Gan, R. Y. (2020). Filipino and Indonesian Migrant Domestic Workers in Hong Kong: Their Life Courses in Migration. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 64(6), 740–764. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0002764220910229>.
- Lin, S., & Bélanger, D. (2012). Negotiating the Social Family: Migrant Live-in Elder Care-Workers in Taiwan. *Asian Journal of Social Science*, 40(3), 295-320.

- Lindio-McGovern, L. (2007). Neo-liberal Globalization in the Philippines: Its Impact on Filipino Women and Their Forms of Resistance. *Journal of Developing Societies*, 23(1-2), 15-35.
- Lingam, L. (2005). Structural Adjustment, Gender and Household Survival Strategies: Review of Evidence and Concerns. *CEW Center for the Education of Women, University of Michigan*.
- Lorente, B. P. (2007). *Mapping English Linguistic Capital: The Case of Filipino Domestic Workers in Singapore* (Doctoral dissertation).
- Lorente, B. P., & Tupas, T. R. F. (2002). Demythologizing English As an Economic Asset: The Case of Filipina Domestic Workers in Singapore. *ACELT Journal*, 6(2), 20-32.
- Lutz, H. (Ed.). (2016). *Migration and Domestic Work: A European Perspective on a Global Theme*. Routledge.
- Marx, K. (1863). Theories of Productive and Unproductive Labor. *Economic Manuscripts: Theories of Surplus-Value*, Chapter 4. <https://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1863/theories-surplus-value/ch04.htm>.
- Michel, S. (2010, October 20). *Beyond the Global Brain Drain: The Global Care Drain*. The Globalist. <https://www.theglobalist.com/beyond-the-global-brain-drain-the-global-care-drain/>.
- Moghadam, V. (1999). Gender and the global economy. In M.M. Ferree et al. (eds.), *Revisioning Gender* (pp. 128-160). London: Sage Publication.
- Momsen, J. H. (1999). Maids on the Move. *Gender, Migration and Domestic service*, 1-20.
- Musa, A. M. A., & Mohammed, O. A. (2021). Assessment the Structural Adjustment Policies in Sudan via (VECM) Model Through the Period 1989-2019. *International Journal of Innovative Science and Research Technology*, 6 (1).

- Nusret, E. (2001). Küreselleşmenin İki Yüzü. İstenmeyen Kaçak Göçmenler-Davetli Bilgi İşçileri, TÜHİS, *İş Hukuku ve İktisat Dergisi*, 17(2).
- O'Connor, J. (2010). Marxism and the Three Movements of Neoliberalism. *Critical Sociology*, 36(5), 691-715.
- Oishi, N. (2005). *Women in Motion: Globalization, State Policies, and Labor Migration in Asia*. Stanford University Press.
- Özbay, F. (2019). *Kadın Emeği: Seçme Yazılar* (Vol. 454). İletişim Yayınları.
- Özyegin, G. (2001). *Untidy Gender: Domestic Service in Turkey*. Temple University Press. Retrieved July 29, 2021, from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt14bt058>.
- Özyegin, G. (2004). Calling the Tune: Domestic Worker's Earnings and Intra-Household Gender Relations in Turkey. *Fauve-Chamoux, Domestic Service*, 317-350.
- Parry-Davies, E. (2020). A Chance to Feel Safe: Precarious Filipino Migrants Amid the UK's Coronavirus Outbreak. *Kanlungan Filipino Consortium and RAPAR*, London.
- Parrenas, R. S. (2000). Migrant Filipina Domestic Workers and the International Division of Reproductive Labor. *Gender & Society*, 14(4), 560-580.
- Parrenas, R. S. (2001). *Servants of Globalization: Migration and Domestic Work*. Stanford University Press.
- Paul, A. M. (2011). Stepwise International Migration: A Multistage Migration Pattern for the Aspiring Migrant. *American Journal of Sociology*, 116(6), 1842-86.
- Peng, I. (2017). Transnational Migration of Domestic and Care Workers in Asia Pacific. *International Labour Organization*. Published.

- P.O.E.A. (2003). *Philippine Overseas Employment Administration Annual Report*. <https://www.poea.gov.ph/ar/AR2003.pdf>.
- Phuong, N. Q., & Venkatesh, S. (2015). Does Migration Make Financial Sense? The Case of Domestic Workers from Vietnam to Taiwan. *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*.
- Previtali, & Fagiani. (2015). Deskillling and Degradation of Labour in Contemporary Capitalism: the Continuing Relevance of Braverman. *Work Organisation, Labour & Globalisation*, 9(1), 76. <https://doi.org/10.13169/workorgalaboglob.9.1.0076>
- Pyle, J. L., & Ward, K. B. (2003). Recasting Our Understanding of Gender and Work During Global Restructuring. *International Sociology*, 18(3), 461-489.
- Redfern, C. (2021). "I Want to Go Home": *Filipina Domestic Workers Face W Exploitative Conditions*. The Guardian. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2021/jan/27/domestic-workers-philippines-coronavirus-conditions>.
- Redlová, P. (2013). Employment of Filipinas as Nannies in the Context of Post-Socialist Czech Republic. *Lidé města*, 15(2), 185-215.
- Rodriguez. (2002). Migrant Heroes: Nationalism, Citizenship and the Politics of Filipino Migrant Labor, *Citizenship Studies*, 6:3, 341-356, DOI: 10.1080/1362102022000011658.
- Rollins, J. (1985). *Between Women: Domestic and Their Employers* (Vol. 71). Temple University Press.
- Romero, M. (1988). Sisterhood and Domestic Service: Race, Class and Gender in the Mistress-maid Relationship. *Humanity & Society*, 12(4), 318-346.
- Romero, M. (2016). *Maid in the USA*. Routledge.

- Rosewarne, S. (2012). Temporary International Labor Migration and Development in South and Southeast Asia. *Feminist Economics*, 18(2), 63-90.
- Sabban, R. (2004). Women Migrant Domestic Workers in the United Arab Emirates. *Gender and Migration in Arab States*, 86.
- Salzinger, L. (2003). *Genders in Production: Making Workers in Mexico's Global Factories*. Univ of California Press.
- Sandford, R. (1997). *The Robinson Rojas Archive: Notes on Structural Adjustment Programmes*. <https://Rrojasdatabank.info/Stradj1.htm>.
- Santos, M. D. P. (2005). *Human Rights and Migrant Domestic Work: A Comparative Analysis of the Socio-Legal Status of Filipina Migrant Domestic Workers in Canada and Hong Kong*. Brill Nijhoff.
- Sassen, S. (2000). *Women's Burden: Counter-Geographies of Globalization and the Feminization of Survival*. *Journal of International Affairs*, 53 (2), 503-524.
- Scott, J. C. (1985). *Weapons of the Weak: Everyday Forms of Peasant Resistance*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Scott, J. C. (1990). *Domination and the Arts of Resistance: Hidden Transcripts*. Yale University Press.
- Secombe, W. (1974). *The Housewife and Her Labour Under Capitalism*. *New Left Review*. <https://newleftreview.org/issues/i83/articles/wally-secombe-the-housewife-and-her-labour-under-capitalism>.
- Solomon, M. S. (2009). State-led Migration, Democratic Legitimacy, and Deterritorialization: the Philippines' Labor Export Model. *European Journal of East Asian Studies*, 8(2), 275-300.
- Stiglitz, J. E. (2006). *Making Globalisation Work*. Esri.

- Swartz, D. (2015b). *Kültür ve İktidar: Pierre Bourdieu'nun Sosyolojisi*, translated by. E. Gen, 3rd Ed. İstanbul: İletişim.
- Şenses, F. (1991). Turkey's Stabilization and Structural Adjustment Program in Retrospect and Prospect. *The Developing Economies*, 29(3), 210-234.
- Terrighena, E., & Barron, D. (2020). Filipina Migrant Domestic Workers in Asia: Mental Health and Resilience. *Psychology in Southeast Asia*, 51–68.
- Thorin, M. (2001). The Gender Dimension of Globalisation: A Review of the Literature with a Focus on Latin America and the Caribbean. *United Nations Publications*. Published.
- Toksöz, G., & Ulutaş, Ç. Ü. (2012). Is Migration Feminized? *Turkey, Migration and the EU: Potentials, Challenges and Opportunities*, 5, 85-112.
- Tolentino, R. B. (1996). Bodies, Letters, Catalogs: Filipinas in Transnational Space. *Social Text*, (48), 49-76.
- Tollefson, James W. (1991), *Planning Language, Planning Inequality – Language Policy in the Community* (London and New York: Longman).
- Treiman, D. J., & Hartmann, H. I. (1981). *Women, Work, and Wages: Equal Pay for Jobs of Equal Value*. The National Academies Press. <https://www.nap.edu/catalog/91/women-work-and-wages-equal-pay-for-jobs-of-equal>.
- Tupas, R., & Ruanni, F. (2008). Anatomies of Linguistic Commodification: The Case of English in the Philippines vis-à-vis other Languages in the Linguistic Marketplace. *Language as Commodity: Global Structures, Local Marketplaces*, 90-105.
- Turner, V.W. (1975). *Drama, Fields, and Metaphors*, Cornell University Press, Ithaca, New York.

- Tyner, J. A. (1999). The Global Context of Gendered Labor Migration from the Philippines to the United States. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 42, 671–689.
- Ueno, K. (2010). Identity Management Among Indonesian and Filipina Migrant Domestic Workers in Singapore. *International Journal of Japanese Sociology*, 19(1), 82-97.
- Ünal, R. A. (2006). *Transformations in Transit: Reconstitution of Gender Identity among Moldovan Domestic Workers in Istanbul Households*. (Unpublished Master Thesis), Istanbul: Bogazici University.
- Van der Ham, A. J., Ujano-Batangan, M. T., Ignacio, R., & Wolffers, I. (2014). Toward Healthy Migration: An Exploratory Study on the Resilience of Migrant Domestic Workers from the Philippines. *Transcultural Psychiatry*, 51(4), 545–568. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1363461514539028>.
- Vargas, M. C., Garabiles, M. R., & Hall, B. J. (2020). Narrative Identities of Overseas Filipino Domestic Worker Community in Macao (SAR) China. *Journal of community psychology*, 48(3), 977-993.
- Verbruggen, Y. (2020). *Domestic Workers Are on the Frontline of This Pandemic, and At Risk*. WIEGO. <https://www.wiego.org/blog/domestic-workers-are-frontline-pandemic-and-risk>.
- Virno, P. (2013). An Equivocal Concept: Biopolitics. In T. Campbell & A. Sitez (Eds.), *Biopolitics: A Reader* (pp. 269–273). Duke University Press.
- Wacquant, L. (1998). Pierre Bourdieu. R. Stones (Ed.), *Key Sociological Thinkers* ( 215-230). London: Macmillan Press.
- Walby, S. (1990). *Theorizing Patriarchy*. Blackwell Publishers.
- Walby, S., & Bagguley, P. (1990). Sex Segregation in Local Labor Markets. *Work, Employment and Society*, 4(1), 59-81.

- W.B. (2019b, April 8). *Record High Remittances Sent Globally in 2018*. World Bank. <https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2019/04/08/record-high-remittances-sent-globally-in-2018>.
- Weyland, P. (1994). Gendered Lives in Global Spaces. In A. Öncü and P. Weyland (eds.), *Space, Culture, and Power* (pp. 82-97). London: Zed Books
- Wickramasekara, P. (2015). Bilateral agreements and memoranda of understanding on migration of low skilled workers: a review. *Available at SSRN 2636289*.
- Wickramasekara, P. (2018). Good Practices and Provisions in Multilateral and Bilateral Labor Agreements and Memoranda of Understanding. *Assisted by LK Ruhunage, International Labour Organization, Dhaka*.
- Yalçın Ç. (2015). Türkiye’de, Ev Hizmetlerinde Çalışan Göçmen Kadınlar ve Ekonomik Şiddet. *Fe Dergi*, 7(1), 49-60.
- Yeoh, B. S., & Huang, S. (2010). Transnational Domestic Workers and The Negotiation of Mobility and Work Practices in Singapore’s Home-Spaces. *Mobilities*, 5(2), 219-236.
- Yeoh, B. S., Huang, S., & Gonzalez III, J. (1999). Migrant Female Domestic Workers: Debating the Economic, Social and Political Impacts in Singapore. *International Migration Review*, 33(1), 114-136.
- Yildirimalp, S. (2014). Türkiye’de Ev Hizmetinde Çalışanların Sorunları. *Karabük Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 4(1), 45-59.
- Yılmaz, B., & Özaydın, M. (2020). Evde Bakım Hizmeti Veren Yabancı İşçilerin Çalışma Koşullarından Kaynaklanan Sorunlar ve Çözüm Arayışları. *Çalışma İlişkileri Dergisi*, 1, 59-99.
- Yılmaz, D. Ö., & Ulukan, N. C. (2010). Migration and Woman Labour in The Process of Globalization: The Example of Domestic Migrant Woman Worker in Turkey. *Toplum ve Hekim*.



Zailon II, D. A. (2019). *Assessing Work and Health Conditions of Filipino Domestic Workers in Istanbul*. (Masters's Thesis)

## APPENDICES

### A. APPROVAL FORM BY THE METU HUMAN SUBJECTS ETHICS COMITTEE

UYGULAMALI ETİK ARAŞTIRMA MERKEZİ  
APPLIED ETHICS RESEARCH CENTER



ORTA DOĞU TEKNİK ÜNİVERSİTESİ  
MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY

DUMLUPINAR BULVARI 06800  
ÇANKAYA ANKARA/TURKEY  
T: +90 312 210 22 91  
F: +90 312 210 79 59  
ueam@metu.edu.tr  
www.ueam.metu.edu.tr

Sayı: 28620816 /

15 NİSAN 2021

Konu : Değerlendirme Sonucu

Gönderen: ODTÜ İnsan Araştırmaları Etik Kurulu (İAEK)

İlgi : İnsan Araştırmaları Etik Kurulu Başvurusu

**Sayın Özgür AVCI**

Danışmanlığınızı yaptığımız Mina Alara GÜRSON'un "Sınırların Ötesinde Bedenler: Filipinli Ev İşçilerinin Ankara'daki Deneyimleri" başlıklı araştırması İnsan Araştırmaları Etik Kurulu tarafından uygun görülmüş ve **131-ODTU-2021** protokol numarası ile onaylanmıştır.

Saygılarımızla bilgilerinize sunarız.

Dr.Öğretim Üyesi Ali Emre TURGUT  
İAEK Başkan Vekili

## B. TURKISH SUMMARY / TÜRKEÖZET

Bu alıřma Trkiye'deki Filipinli bakıcıların deneyimlerini ve alıřma kořullarını arařtırmaktadır. Son yıllarda Trk iřverenlerin talebi, Filipinli bakıcıların sayısında artıřa neden olmuřtur. Trk iřverenlerin evlerinde zellikle ev hizmetlisi ve bakıcı olarak yatılı řekilde hizmet veren Filipinliler, orta-st sınıf iřverenler arasında yalnızca bir hizmetli olmanın tesinde bir stat simbol haline gelmiřtir. Arařtırmamı ynlendiren soru ise: "Filipinli ev iřileri, evlerinden uzakta ve patronlarına ok yakın yařamanın fiziksel, psikolojik ve sosyal zorluklarıyla nasıl bařa ıkmaktadır?" olmuřtur. Bu dođrultuda yatılı olarak alıřan Filipinli bakıcıların, Trk iřverenlerle olan iliřkisini, iřverenlerin statleri, kurdukları yakınlıklar ve kullandıkları stratejiler de etkilemektedir. Bu konuyu daha detaylı anlayabilmek iin "İřverenlerin sınıf temelli beklenti ve isteklerinin onların ev iřilerine tutumlarını nasıl etkiliyor?" sorusu sorulmuřtur. İřverenlerin stratejilerine karřılık olarak, Filipinli bakıcıların ev iinde sınırları belirlemek iin kullandıkları taktikler, bařa ıkma yntemleri ve kimlik karmařaları da sorgulanmıřtır.

cretsiz ev emeđinin, cretli bir forma dnřmesi, sektrn geniřlemesine ve kreselleřme sonucu dođan iřgc talebinde bir artıřa neden olmuřtur. Ev iřilerinin orta-st sınıf hanelerde neden vazgeilmez bir para haline geldiđi ise literatrde en ok tartıřılan konulardan biridir. Bu talebin ilk nedeni, zellikle geliřmiř lkelerde refah devletleri uygulamalarına gelen kısıtlamalardır. nk sunulan birok hizmetin piyasa kořulları tarafından karřılanması beklenmektedir. Bu hizmetlerden en nemlisi cretli iřilik kapsamına giren ocuk, hasta ve yařlıların bakım hizmetidir. cretli ev iřisi talebinin ikinci nedeni ise demografik yapıların deđiřmesidir. zellikle Batı lkelerinin yařlanan nfusu, hanelerde bakım iřisi ihtiyacını etkilemiřtir. ncs, geliřmekte olan ve geliřmiř lkelerde kadınların istihdama katılım oranındaki artıř, cretli ev ii iřgc talebindeki artıřta nemli bir etkiye sahiptir. Arlie Hochschild, cretli iřten dnen kadınların cretsiz ev iřlerini "ikinci vardiya" (1989) terimiyle

açıklamaktadır. Ona göre çocuk bakımı, temizlik ve yemek hazırlama gibi ücretsiz ev işlerinin geleneksel olarak kadınlar tarafından yapılması beklenmektedir. Bakıcılar ikinci vardiyanın yükünü alırken, evin annesi ücretli işgücü piyasasına katılır. Ev işlerinin bu yükü halen kadınların omuzunda olsa da ücretli bakıcı ve ev işçileri çalışan annelerin ücretsiz ev işlerinden kurtulmalarına olanak sağlamaktadır.

Yapısal Uyum Politikaları, refah devletinin çöküşü ve ekonomik değişikliklerin uygulanması, nüfusların göç hareketlerini hızlandırmıştır ve uluslararası göç akışı üzerinde büyük etkileri olmuştur. İhracata yönelik üretim sonucunda yüksek işsizlik oranlarına sahip olan ülkeler çareyi Birinci Dünya ülkelerine hizmet sektöründe işçi sağlayarak bulmuş ve kadın emeği bu yeni ekonomi için değerli görülmüştür. Bunun temel nedeni kadınların düşük statüsü ve düşük ücretli işlerde yoğunlaşmasıdır. Pek çok kadın ailelerini ve kendilerini geçindirmek için çalışmak üzere başka bir yere göç etmek zorunda kalmıştır. Kadınların egemen olduğu bu göç akımı, göçün kadınlaşmasına neden olmuştur. Bu alanda yapılan çalışmalar göçün kadınlar için annelik sorumluluklarını yerine getirmek adına bir fırsat olduğunu, aynı zamanda da bir fedakârlık eylemi olduğunu belirtmektedir. Öte yandan, kapitalistler için göçün kadınlaşması daha ucuz, uysal ve esnek bir işgücü ile endüstriyel ekonomilerin belirli ihtiyaçlarına katkı sağlamak, dolayısıyla sermayenin küreselleşmesine ve kapitalizmin yeniden üretimine katkıda bulunmak anlamına gelmektedir. Bu yüzden de kirli, zor ve tehlikeli olarak görülen işler, gelişmiş ekonomilerde işgücü için aranan göçmen kadınlar tarafından yapılmaktadır. Bu işler genellikle kayıt dışıdır ve kadınlar kötü çalışma koşulları, düşük ücretler, güvencesizlik ve pazarlık gücü azalmış işlere girerek tüm dünyada küreselleşmenin yarattığı ucuz işgücü açığını doldurmakta ve göç kadınlaşmaktadır.

Göçün kadınlaşmasının en iyi örneklerinden biri olan Filipinler, küresel yapılanma ve ihracata yönelik üretimin bir sonucu olarak ortaya çıkan işsizlik ve dış borç problemlerini, işgücü ihraç ederek çözmeye çalışmıştır. Filipinler ülke çapında göçü teşvik ederek göç endüstrisini bir insan gücü ihracat politikası

haline getirmiştir. Bugün dünya çapında 10 milyondan fazla Filipinli, göçmen işçi olarak çalışmaktadır ve Filipinler göçmenler sayesinde her yıl 34 milyar doların üzerinde gelir elde etmektedir. Göçmenlerin döviz olarak kazandığı maaşları ailelerine göndermeleri, ekonomiye en çok döviz kazandıran kaynaklardan biridir. 1973'teki petrol krizinden sonra Filipinli göçmenleri, ülke ekonomisine yeniden dahil etmek için Ulusa Geri Dönme Programı başlatılmıştır. Bu program, ülkeye nakit döviz aktarımı sağladığı için, göç edip geri dönenlere ülkede benzersiz bir vatandaşlık statüsü verilmiştir. Daha sonra İş Kanunu'nun ortaya çıkmasıyla Filipinler Denizaşırı İstihdam İdaresi kurulmuştur. Bu kuruluş ülkelerin Filipinli ev işçilerine yönelik arz ve talebini küresel ölçekte izlemekten sorumludur. Ayrıca, göçmenliği teşvik etmek adına bir teknik olarak, hükümet 1988'de Denizaşırı Filipinli İşçileri (OFW) Modern Zamanın Ulusal Kahramanları ilan etmiştir. Böylelikle göçmenlere sosyal haklar, sağlık yararları sağlamış ve göçmen olmaktan gurur duymaları için onları teşvik etmişlerdir. Dolayısıyla, göçmen işçilerin bu kahramanlıkları, millet için yaptıkları fedakarlıklardan dolayı onurlandırılırken, devlet tarafından kasıtlı olarak işçi dövizlerini garanti almak için kullanılmıştır.

Kendi ülkelerindeki düşük ücretler ve sınırlı sayıda iş fırsatı varsayımıyla, birçok Filipinli yurtdışında çalışmayı Filipinler'de kalmaktan daha iyi bir seçenek olarak görmektedir. Bu yüzden Filipinliler, yurt dışında ev işçisi ve bakıcı olarak çalışarak ailelerinin geçimini sağlamaktadır. Filipinlilerle ilgili çalışmalar, onların kendi evlerindeki ücretsiz emeği uluslararası düzeyde ücretli emeğe dönüştürmek için ev içi çalışmayı seçen eğitilmiş işgücü olduklarını göstermektedir. Aynı zamanda literatürde bakıcıların Mercedes Benz'i olarak anılmaktalar çünkü ev işçiliği piyasasında ideal ve en çok arzu edilen bakıcılar olarak yer almaktadırlar. Uysal, hünerli, her zaman hazır ve ucuz işgücü olarak temsil edilen Filipinli kadınlar, Asya kültürünün verdiği itaatkarlık, kibarlık ve hoşgörülerıyla dünya çapında işverenler tarafından talep edilen çalışanlar olmuşlardır. Bunun temel nedenlerinden biri Filipinlilerin oldukça eğitilmiş olmasıdır. Filipinler'de eğitim, ihracata yönelik sanayileşmenin uygulanmasının ardından hükümet tarafından yeniden yapılandırılmış, iki dilli bir eğitim

politikası izlenmiştir. Bugün bakıcı ve ev işçisi olarak Filipinler'den göç eden bu kadınların lise mezunu olmaları ön koşuldur. Aynı zamanda hükümet tarafından ev işçiliği, temizlik, bebek bakıcılığı sertifikaları verilmekte ve ev işçileri alanlarında uzmanlaşmaktadır. En önemlisi, akıcı İngilizce konuşan bu bakıcılar Orta Doğu ve Körfez ülkelerinde yoğun talep görmüştür. Böylelikle Filipinliler, hükümetlerinin eğitim reformları konusundaki yardımıyla küreselleşen dünya için ideal bakıcılar ve ev hizmetlileri haline gelmişlerdir.

Filipinli bakıcıların ve ev işçilerinin Birinci Dünya'daki işverenler tarafından işe alınmasının iki temel nedeni vardır: Filipinliler küresel olarak ideal işçiler ve bir prestij unsurudur. İşverenler, kendi sınıfları arasındaki toplumsal tanınırlığı ve üstünlüğü artırmak için, evdeki yardımcıları ve bakıcıların imajı sayesinde elde edebilecekleri sembolik kazanımı göz önünde bulundururlar. Filipinlilerin modern giyimleri, temizlik ve çocuk bakımını aynı anda yürütebilmeleri, İngilizceleri ve günün her saatinde çalışmaya hazır birer iş gücü olmaları, işverenleri toplumsal olarak imtiyazlı kılar. Toplumsal statüleri bu yolla yeniden üretilir ve kendi sınıflarına uygun olarak gösterilen seçkin bir hizmeti tükettiklerine güvenirlir.

Türkiye'de göçmen ev işçileriyle ilgili yapılan çalışmaların çoğu eski Sovyetler Birliği ülkelerinden gelen Moldovyalı, Gürcü, Özbek kadınların çalışma ve yaşam deneyimlerinden oluşmaktadır. Daha çok çocuk bakımında tercih edilen Filipinli bakıcılarla ilgili oldukça az literatür bulunmakta ve var olan çalışmalar yalnızca Filipinli kadınlara odaklanmaktadır. Bu yüzden Filipinli kadınların ev içinde işverenleriyle ilişkileri, işverenlerin de neden özellikle Filipinli tercih ettiği bilinmemektedir. Bu çalışma Filipinli bakıcıların ve ev işçilerinin ev içindeki görünmeyen emeklerini yansıtmak, duygusal emeğin bakıcılar üzerindeki etkilerini anlamak ve fiziksel aktivitenin ötesinde pandemi sırasında çalışma koşullarını anlamak adına önemlidir.

Bu çalışmayı yapmamdaki temel motivasyon Ocak 2019'dan beri Filipinler Cumhuriyeti Büyükelçiliği'nde çevirmen ve araştırmacı olarak çalışmam,

Filipinlileri, kültürlerini ve alışkanlıklarını her gün onlarla görüşerek daha da yakından tanımamdır. Filipinliler Topluluğu'nda aktif bir parçası olarak Türkiye'deki Filipinli kadınların yaşadığı zorlukları ve kırılğan konumlarını gözlemlemem onlar hakkında daha fazla araştırma yapmamı tetiklemiş ve topluluk liderlerinin de yardımıyla bu kadınların kişisel deneyimlerini daha yakından öğrenmemi sağlamıştır.

Bu araştırmanın temel amacı, Filipinli bakıcıların Türkiye'deki yaşam koşulları ve Türk işverenlerle ilişkilerinde kullandıkları strateji ve başa çıkma mekanizmalarını keşfetmektir. Bu doğrultuda iki gruptan deneyimleri, düşünceleri ve algıları hakkında veri toplanmıştır. Bu çalışmada nitel araştırma yöntemleri kullanılmış ve derinlemesine mülakatlar yapılmıştır. İlk başta yüzyüze planlanan mülakatlar, COVID-19 ve sokağa çıkma yasakları nedeniyle Zoom toplantıları ve Facetime yapılarak gerçekleştirilmiştir. Nisan ve Mayıs 2021'de ev işçisi olarak çalışan on yedi göçmen Filipinli bakıcı (bir tanesi pilot görüşme) ve dokuz işverenle derinlemesine mülakatlar yapılmıştır. İlk başta Ankara olarak düşünülen saha çalışması, COVID-19 ve görüşmelerin çevrim içi olması nedeniyle tüm Türkiye'den katılımcılarla görüşmeme olanak vermiştir. Azınlıkları incelerken sıklıkla kullanılan bir yöntem olan kartopu örnekleme kullanılmış, Filipinliler Topluluğu'ndan tanıdığım bakıcı kadınların birbirilerine çalışmamdan bahsetmesi ve Türk işverenlerin arkadaşlarını da gönüllü olarak araştırmama katılmaya davet etmesiyle çalışmadaki katılımcı sayısı artmıştır. Katılımcıların gizliliğini korumak adına çalışma boyunca Filipinli göçmen bakıcılardan Bayan A veya Bayan B; işverenlerden Hanımefendi 1 veya Beyefendi 2 olarak bahsedilmiştir.

Öncelikle Filipinli kadınların göç deneyimlerini ve Türkiye'deki çalışma koşullarını anlamak adına sorular sorulmuş, ayrıca nasıl göç etmeye karar verdikleri, Türkiye'yi neden seçtikleri ve buradaki deneyimleri sorgulanmıştır. Filipinli göçmen bakıcıların anlatıları, ekonomik zorluklar ve işsizliğin geride bıraktıkları aileleri için daha iyi bir gelecek aramaya iten temel motivasyonlar olduğunu göstermiştir. Türkiye'de sosyal bir çevreye sahip olmak, yüksek

maaşlar, aile bireylerinin davetleri, ülkenin Avrupa'ya coğrafi yakınlığı, Türkiye'nin Filipinli bakıcılar ve ev işçileri için arzu edilen bir varış noktası haline getirmiştir. Bu göç sürecinde aracı şirketler ve işe alım ajansları dünyanın her yerindeki diğer ajanslarla iş birliği yaparak ideal adayları Türkiye'ye getirmekte, belgelerinin düzenlenmesine yardım etmekte ve yasal prosedürlerin gerçekleşmesini sağlamaktadır. Filipinliler Türkiye'ye gelebilmek için kendi ülkelerinde ve Türkiye'de iki farklı ajansla çalışıp, yaklaşık 1500-2000 Dolar ödeyerek burada iş bulabilmektedir. Yani göç süreci sanılanın aksine Filipinliler için kolay veya ucuz değildir. Çoğu Filipinli ülkesinin ikili ticaret anlaşmalarının olduğu Kuwait, Qatar, Birleşik Arap Emirlikleri, Singapur ve Hong Kong gibi ülkelerden gelmektedir. Türkiye onlar için bir başlangıç noktası değil, daha yüksek maaşlar alabilecekleri ve belki Avrupa'ya gitme şansı bulabilecekleri bir geçiş noktasıdır.

Türkiye'de de sayısı yetkililer tarafından tam olarak bilinmeyen çok sayıda göçmen Filipinli kadın olduğu bilinmektedir. Bu tür işçilerin çoğunlukla işverenleriyle sözlü anlaşmaları vardır. Yazılı veya sözlü anlaşmaları olmasına bakılmaksızın, yatılı çalışmanın gayri resmi, esnek ve düzensiz doğası göçmen Filipinlilerin iş tanımlarında gerekli olandan daha fazla çalışmasına neden olmaktadır. Türk işverenler, Filipinli bakıcılarından çocuklarına öncelik vermelerini beklerken aynı zamanda ütü, ev süpürme, bulaşık yıkama, evi toplama gibi günlük işleri de yapmasını beklemektedir. Bu geniş iş tanımı bazı Filipinliler olarak işlerinin bir parçası olarak görülse de bazıları uzun saatler çalışmaktan şikayet etmektedir. Katılımcıların çoğu 13-16 saat arasında çalıştıklarını, günlerinin erken başlayıp geç bittiğini ve oldukça yorulduklarını belirtmektedir. Bunun haricinde altı iş gününden sonra bir iş günü genellikle izin günüdür. Ancak pandemi şartlarında izin koşulları değişmekte, bazı Filipinliler izinlerini evden ayrılmadan odalarında değerlendirmektedir.

Türkiye'de Filipinli maaşlarının 800\$ ile 1200\$ arasında değiştiği görülmektedir ve bu da katılımların daha önceden çalıştığı ülkelerin neredeyse üç katı daha fazladır. Aynı zamanda cep harçlığı olarak 50-100TL günlük bir ücrette mutlaka



verilmektedir. Çalışmaya katılan on altı Filipinli kadının, altısı ülkede çalışma izni olmadan çalışmaktadır bu da onların sağlık hizmetlerine erişimini zorlaştırmakta ve hastalandıklarında ilaçları kendi imkanlarıyla temin etmelerine yol açmaktadır. Düzensiz göçmen olarak çalışan bu altı kadın diğer Filipinlilere göre daha zor koşullarda çalışmakta ve sürekli polisten gizlenme ihtiyacının yarattığı bir stresle yaşamaktadır. Ek olarak, COVID-19 salgını çoğu Filipinli bakıcının çalışma koşullarını kötüleştirmiş, eve kapanarak, sosyalleşmeden ve dinlenmeden çalışmaya devam etmek pek çoğunda ruhsal problemlere ve fiziksel yorgunluğa neden olmuştur. Aynı zamanda pandemiden önce de uzun saatler çalıştığını ve pandeminin işverenlerin sürekli evde olması dışında pek bir şeyi değiştirmedığını söyleyen katılımcılar vardır.

Bu çalışma ayrıca Filipinli bakıcıların Türk işverenlerin hanesinde yaşadıkları iş deneyimlerini de ele almaktadır. İlk olarak Türk işverenlerin neden Filipinli tercih ettiği sorusu cevaplanmaya çalışılmıştır. Gündelik gelmeyi tercih eden Türk bakıcılara kıyasla Filipinli bakıcıların yatılı kalması, talep olan bir boşluğu doldurmalarını sağlamıştır. Katılımcılara göre, bakıcı olarak Filipinlilerin sakin, güvenilir, disiplinli ve çalışkan kişiler olarak bilinmesinin yanında İngilizce konusundaki yetkinlikleri onları çocuk bakıcılığı alanında özel bir yere koymaktadır. Araştırmam ayrıca işverenlerin Filipinli bakıcıları diğer ülkelerden olan bakıcılarla kıyasladığında Filipinlilerin ev içinde daha çok alanda, adeta bir bakıcı fiyatına birden çok bakıcı çalıştırmak gibi, yetkinliklerinin olduğunu göstermektedir. Görüşmeler esnasında Türk işverenler çalıştıkları bakıcıları stereotipik olarak Filipinli bakıcıları robot veya hizmet için yaratılmış uşaklar gibi örneklerle tanımlamıştır. Bu özellikler doğrultusunda Türk işverenlerin Filipinli bakıcılardan itaatkar olmasını ve gerekmedikçe gündelik ev hayatında görünmez olmalarını beklediğini göstermektedir.

Genel olarak bakıldığında Türk işverenler Filipinli bakıcıları paralarının tam karşılığını alabileceklerine inandıkları için tercih etmektedir. Yine de bu beklentiyle gelen aşırı talepkar tavırlar ve sınıf farkının işverenler tarafından sürekli olarak yansıtılması Filipinli bakıcıları çalışma hayatları sırasında

bunaltmaktadır. Filipinli bakıcıların yaşadığı baskı beklenen bir durumdur çünkü bu araştırma Türk işverenlerin diğer ülkelere kıyasla fazlasıyla talepkar olarak bilindiğini göstermektedir. Bunun yanı sıra Filipinli bakıcılar da daha önce de belirtildiği gibi işverenleri için değerli olduklarının farkındadırlar. İşverenlerin kendi çevrelerinden Filipinli bakıcı modelini bir örnek olarak duymaları ve maaşlarının yüksek olduğunun yaygınca bilinmesi bakıcıların işverenlerin gözünde ayrıcalıklı hayata özgü değerli bir tüketim aracı olmasını sağlamaktadır. Genel olarak Filipinliler hanedeki çocuğa İngilizce eğitimi ve baştan aşağıya kaliteli bir bakıcılık yapması dışında nadir bulunan ve değerli konularıyla ailenin güçlü finansal durumunun bir sembolü olmaktadır.

Hem işverenlerden hem de bakıcılardan gelen yanıtlar, Filipinlilerin istihdamı sırasında hane içindeki sürekli bir güç mücadelesi olduğunu ve iki tarafında sınırlarını belirlemek için farklı taktik ve stratejikere başvurduğunu göstermektedir. Bu güç mücadelesini anlamak için ‘sınır çalışması’ olarak adlandırılan bir konseptle işverenlerin Filipinli bakıcılara uyguladığı stratejiler analiz edilmiştir. Bu konseptte göre, işverenler kurdukları yakınlık ve sınıfsal kriterlerine göre dört farklı kategoride incelenmiştir. Bulgular, Filipinlilerle en samimi ve yakın ilişki gösteren anne rolündeki işverenlerin bile aslında kendi çıkarlarını bir öncelik olarak gördüğünü ve ikili ilişkilerinde sınıf ayrımını vurguladıklarını göstermektedir. İşverenlerin yanıtları, bakıcılarla aile benzeri ilişkilerin çoğunlukla işin yüksek kalitesini sağlamak, çocuklarına güvenli bakım sağlamak veya Filipinlilere bir koruyucu olarak egolarını tatmin etmek için olduğunu ortaya koymaktadır. Ayrıca bakıcıları yukarıdaki nedenlerle aileden biri olarak kabul etmek mümkün olmakla birlikte, hane içi ilişkiler sırasında işverenlerin uyguladıkları stratejiler sürekli değişmektedir. Bu çoğunlukla saf samimiyetten ziyade pragmatik gerekliliklerden kaynaklanmaktadır. İkinci tür işverenler kişiselcidir ve sınıf farklılıklarını göz ardı ederek ev işçilerini aileye dahil etme taraftarıdırlar. Anne rolündekilerden farklı olarak, kişiselci işverenler ev işçilerine acımaz ve onlarla samimi bir yakınlık kurar. Üçüncü tür işverenler ise uzak hiyerarşi kuranlardır ve mesafeli ilişkiyi, resmi konuşmaları tercih ederler. Bu tür işverenler ise hiyerarşiyi sağlamak için çalışanlarıyla daha az

konusur ve sınıfsal rollerin anlaşmasını sağlar. Dördüncü tür işverenler ise, iş ilişkisi kuranlardır. Bu tür işverenler uzak tavırlarına rağmen sınıf ve etnik farklılıkları görmezden gelir. Konuşma etkileşimlerini kısa tutarak, iletişimi daha çok emek etrafında şekillendirerek ve tamamlanacak görevlerden bahsederek gerçekleştirir. İşçi-çalışan ilişkisinde yakınlık yoktur ve mahremiyetin yükünden kaçınılmıştır. Bu dört tür işverenin sınıf çalışması stratejik olarak işi bir çeşit takas olarak algılamalarını sağlamaktadır ve bazıları daha güvenilir, sorunsuz ilişkiler kurarken diğerleri daha kişisel ve aile gibi bir yakınlık kurmaktadır.

İşverenler ve yatılı işçiler arasındaki yakınlık düzeyi genellikle aileden biri gibi şeklinde ifade edilmektedir. İşverenler bu aile analogisini maksimum iş gücü, genişletilmiş iş tanımı ve daha uzun hizmet saatleri garanti etmek için kullanmaktadır. Sanılanın aksine, bu benzetme sadece anne tutumlu işverenler tarafından kullanılmamakta, gerek kişiselci işverenler gerekse iş ilişkisi içinde olanlar çalışanlarını aileden biri olarak görmektedirler. Hem işverenler hem de göçmen Filipinliler için bir aile gibi olmanın en önemli işareti, aynı masayı paylaşarak birlikte yemek yemektir. Yine de bazı işverenler için bakıcılarını aile üyesi gibi olarak gördüğünü söylese de birlikte yemek yememektedir. Bu, daha önce de bahsedilen, iş ilişkisine sahip işverenlerin tutumudur. Ayrıca, bu üç işveren de onları aile bireyleri olarak görmenin iyi hizmet için gerekli koşulları oluşturduğuna inanmaktadır.

Ayrıca, pahalı bir hizmet satın aldığını düşünen işverenler, ev içerisinde kurallar koyup, denetlemeler yaparak verdikleri ücretin karşılığını almayı bekleme eğilimindediler. Bu iktidar mücadelesinde işverenlerin uyguladıkları sıkı kurallar, kameradan yapılan her işi kontrol etme davranışı ve emir vererek konuşma, Filipinli kadınlarda stres ve kaygıya aynı zamanda da yüksek beklentilere uyum sağlamada güçlük gibi problemler ortaya çıkarmaktadır. Telefonla konuşmaya getirilen kısıtlamalar, izin günlerinin verilmemesi, işi yaptırdıktan sonra denetleyerek beğenmeyip tekrar yaptırma ve kameradan çalışanın o günkü ruh halini izledikten sonra özel hayatıyla ilgili sorular sorma, Türk işverenlerin başvurduğu denetleme yollarıdır.

Filipinliler göç etmeye ve Birinci Dünya ülkelerinde ev işçisi ve dadı olarak çalışmaya karar verdiklerinde, yukarı doğru ekonomik hareketlilik elde etmek için aşağı sınıf hareketliliği yaşarlar. Bu da kimlik bunalımı ve kültürel adaptasyonda problemler yaratmaktadır. Çalışmamda aşağı doğru hareketlilik yaşayan Filipinli ev işçileri, yetersizlik duygularını reddetmek için özverili bir kimliğe bürünmektedir. Katılımcılar kendilerini işlerine adadıklarını belirterek, Filipinli dadıları güçlü, bağımsız ve her şeye göğüs gerebilecek kadar cesur olarak tanımlamaktadırlar. Aynı zamanda çoklu kimlikler yaratarak öz benliklerini korumaya çalışmaktadırlar. Çalışma saatleri içinde onlardan beklendiği gibi performans sergilerken, izin günlerinde özgürce giyinerek ve olduklarından daha farklı davranarak iki farklı kimlikle yaşamaktadırlar. Katılımcıların yanıtları, bu 'sahne arkasında' gösterdikleri kimliklerinin aslında gerçek kişiliklerini temsil ettiğini ve çalışma saatleri içindeki kimliklerinin ise işverenlerin beklentilerine uyumlu bir performans olduğunu desteklemektedir. Sahne dışı bir kişiliği benimseme fırsatı, Filipinlilere yaklaşan çalışma haftası için çok ihtiyaç duydukları enerjiyi sağlamakta, bu kadınlara hayatın sadece işten ibaret olmadığını hatırlatmakta ve mümkün olduğunca sağlıklı bir iş-yaşam dengesini korumalarına yardımcı olmaktadır.

Ev içindeki sınır çalışmasını yalnızca işverenler değil Filipinli bakıcılar da uygulamaktadır. Çalışma saatleri içindeki baskıyı azaltmak ve işverenlerle iktidar mücadelesinde kendilerini güçlü kılmak için Filipinli bakıcılar taktikler uygulamakta ve başa çıkma yöntemlerine başvurmaktadır. Bu taktikler onların hayatta kalmalarına, bitmeyen taleplere direnmelerine ve işverenlerin kontrolünü yıkmalarına yardımcı olur. Katılımcılar işi yarım yapma, yaptığını söyleyerek hiç yapmama ve yalan söyleme gibi taktiklere başvurarak günlük iş yüklerini hafifletmektedir. Aynı zamanda şarkı söyleyerek yorulduğunu anlatmaya çalışan, bankaya gideceğim deyip arkadaşlarıyla buluşan, kendi evimde elektrikler gitti diyip yarım gün de olsa izin kullanmaya çalışan bakıcılar vardır. Ev içerisinde rahatlatma yöntemi olarak duş alma, müzik dinleme, aileyle konuşma gibi yöntemler de Filipinli bakıcılara yardımcı olmaktadır.

Bu çalışma aynı zamanda, özellikle işyerinde istismar nedeniyle çoğu zaman yalnız ve çaresiz hissedilen Filipinlilerin psikolojisi hakkında da veri sağlamaktadır. Sözlü, fiziksel ve cinsel istismara maruz kadınların psikolojileri işverenlerin ne kadar acımasız olabileceğini de göstermekte ve özellikle çalışma izni olmadan çalışana bakıcılar için çaresizliği yansıtmaktadır. Çoğu bakıcı taciz ve sürekli gözetim nedeniyle çalıştıkları evde kalmaya devam etmek istemese bile kaçmaktan çekinmektedir. Çünkü evden ayrılmak çalışma izinlerini kaybetmek anlamına gelebilir. İstismara maruz kalmanın bazı bakıcılara büyük bir zihinsel yük getirdiğini görülmektedir. İşveren gözetiminde ve yüksek beklentilerle çalışmanın psikolojik sonuçları, bakıcılarda performans kaybına, bitkinliğe ve strese neden olmaktadır. İşverenlerin empati kurmaması da dadıları depresyona sokan, psikolojik baskılarla karşı karşıya kalırken hane içinde yalnızlanmış gibi bir izlenim uyandıran bir diğer faktördür.

Bu araştırma, Türk işverenleri diğer uluslardan işverenlerle karşılaştırarak, Türk işverenlerin farklarına ışık tutmaktadır. Katılımcıların cevapları Türk işverenlerin talepkar, çok bilmiş, işe karışan ve çocuklarını şımarık yetiştiren işverenler olduğunu göstermektedir. Filipinlilerin Türk işverenleri tüm bu özelliklerle anlatması, yaptıkları işin zorluğunun anlaşılması adına önemlidir. Çünkü bahsettikleri bu problemler aslında psikolojileri üzerinde sonuçlar doğurmakta ve ruh/beden sağlıklarına etki etmektedir. Tatmin edici maaşlar ise Türkiye'yi onlar için katlanılabilir kılan en önemli unsurdur. Çünkü gelecek planlarını buradaki özverileri belirlemektedir.

Sonuç olarak bu tez çalışması literatürde neredeyse eksik olan Türkiye'deki Filipinli bakıcılara ve onların çalışma deneyimlerine ışık tutmaktadır. Filipinli bakıcılar ve Türk işverenlerle yapılan derinlemesine görüşmeler bu ikili ilişkinin stratejilere ve taktiklere dayalı olduğunu, ev içerisinde sınırların çizilmesi için her iki tarafında çaba harcadığını göstermektedir. Çalışma boyunca, Filipinli bakıcıların göç süreçlerine, kimlik algılarına, psikolojik problemlerine, sosyal yaşantısına, topluluk içerisindeki rollerine, istismarına ve gelecek planlarına ışık tutulmuştur. Filipinli bakıcılar için Türkiye'nin ulaşılması zor ve pahalı olduğu

fakat maaşların çalışanları tatmin ettiği anlaşılmıştır. Türk işverenlerin ise sınıfsal rollerine, kendi sınıflarına göre bakıcılarla kurdukları yakınlık ve uzaklık stratejilerine, ev içerisinde belirledikleri kurallara ve düşüncelerine yer verilmiştir. Çalışma sonucunda, işverenlerinin tutumunun bakıcıların Türkiye'deki deneyimini tümüyle etkilese bile, Filipinlilerin kendilerini güçlü kılabilmek ve kimliklerini koruyabilmek adına her zaman bir yol bulunduğunu göstermektedir.

## C. THESIS PERMISSION FORM / TEZ İZİN FORMU

### ENSTİTÜ / INSTITUTE

- Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü** / Graduate School of Natural and Applied Sciences
- Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü** / Graduate School of Social Sciences
- Uygulamalı Matematik Enstitüsü** / Graduate School of Applied Mathematics
- Enformatik Enstitüsü** / Graduate School of Informatics
- Deniz Bilimleri Enstitüsü** / Graduate School of Marine Sciences

### YAZARIN / AUTHOR

**Soyadı / Surname** : GÜRSON  
**Adı / Name** : Mina Alara  
**Bölümü / Department** : Medya ve Kültürel Çalışmalar

**TEZİN ADI / TITLE OF THE THESIS (İngilizce / English)** : CORPOREAL BODIES  
BEYOND BORDERS: EXPERIENCES OF MIGRANT FILIPINA NANNIES IN TURKEY

**TEZİN TÜRÜ / DEGREE:** **Yüksek Lisans / Master**  **Doktora / PhD**

1. **Tezin tamamı dünya çapında erişime açılacaktır.** / Release the entire work immediately for access worldwide.
2. **Tez iki yıl süreyle erişime kapalı olacaktır.** / Secure the entire work for patent and/or proprietary purposes for a period of **two years**. \*
3. **Tez altı ay süreyle erişime kapalı olacaktır.** / Secure the entire work for period of **six months**. \*

\* Enstitü Yönetim Kurulu kararının basılı kopyası tezle birlikte kütüphaneye teslim edilecektir.

*A copy of the decision of the Institute Administrative Committee will be delivered to the library together with the printed thesis.*

**Yazarın imzası / Signature** .....

**Tarih / Date** .....